



CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

February 7, 2006/Calendar No. 17

C 070082 ZSQ

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by Dermot QFC LLC and New York City Economic Development Corporation pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to:

- 1) Section 74-743(a)(2) of the Zoning Resolution to modify the minimum base height, street wall location and setback regulations of Section 35-24 (Special Street Wall Location and Height and Setback Regulations in Certain Districts);
- 2) Section 74-743(a)(3) of the Zoning Resolution to modify the location of primary business entrances and show windows regulations of Section 32-512 (Limitations on Business Entrances, Show Windows or Signs for corner lots);
- 3) Section 74-744(b) of the Zoning Resolution to permit residential and nonresidential uses to be located within a building without regard for the regulations of Section 32-422 (Location of floors occupied by non-residential uses); and
- 4) Section 74-744(c) of the Zoning Resolution to modify the location of signs regulations of Section 32-512 (Limitations on Business Entrances, Show Windows or Signs for corner lots);

in connection with a proposed mixed use building on property located at 89-14 Parsons Boulevard (Block 9755, Lots 31 and 59), in a C4-5X District, Community District 12, Borough of Queens.

The application for a special permit (C 070082 ZSQ) was filed by New York City Economic Development Corporation (EDC) and Dermot QFC, LLC on August 25, 2006 pursuant to Section 74-743(a)(2) to modify the minimum base height, street wall location and setback regulations of Section 35-24, pursuant to Section 74-743(a)(3) to modify the location of primary business entrances and show windows regulations of Section 32-512, pursuant to Section 74-744(b) to permit residential and nonresidential uses to be located within a building without regard for the regulations of Section 32-422, and pursuant to Section 74-744(c) to modify the

location of signs regulations of Section 32-512 to facilitate the development of a 12-story, mixed-use building in Jamaica, Queens.

RELATED ACTIONS

In addition to the Special Permit which is the subject of this report, implementation of the proposed development also requires action by the City Planning Commission on the following applications which are being considered concurrently with this application:

1. C 070079 ZMQ Amendment to the Zoning Map changing C4-2 and R6 districts to a C4-5X district.
2. C 070080 PPQ Disposition of 2 city owned properties pursuant to zoning.
3. C 070081 ZSQ Special permit pursuant to Section 74-52 to allow for a 500-space, below grade public parking garage.

BACKGROUND

Site and Area Description

The project site contains approximately 71,159 square feet of lot area. It occupies the southwest corner of Parsons Boulevard and 89th Avenue (Block 9755, Lots 31 and 59), extending 226 feet along Parsons Boulevard to a depth of about 138 feet and 372 feet along 89th Avenue, with the westernmost 50 feet of this length extending southward to 90th Avenue.

The project site is presently occupied by the Queens Family Courthouse and Court Annex Building, both of which have been vacant since 2002. The main building is an approximately 75,104 square foot, four-story building separated from the street and street activity by a below-grade recess. Originally home to the Queens Central Library, it underwent an extensive renovation in 1966 and housed the Family Court until its replacement by the new court facility at 151-20 Jamaica Avenue in 2002. The existing Court Annex building is an approximately 32,252 square foot three-story building. Both buildings are functionally and physically obsolete.

The area surrounding the project site contains a mix of residential, commercial, industrial, educational and governmental uses. Located to the south of and adjacent to the project site, on Block 9755, are the seven-story Shelton Hall Apartments, which is included in the proposed rezoning, and the First Baptist Church, a portion of which is included in the proposed rezoning. To the immediate west of the project site on Block 9755, is a small, vacant residential building and the six-story Park House Apartments and Park View Apartments. Located directly east of the project site, on Block 9758, across Parsons Boulevard, are a set of 14-story residential buildings and the similarly tall, Central Queens YMCA. On Block 9762, directly north across 89th Avenue, is a one-story commercial building, a vacant parcel, and some residential buildings, including a three-story multifamily house and a six-story apartment building. King Park is located further west across 153rd Street and Mary Immaculate Hospital is located on 89th Avenue just north of the park. Across 90th Avenue are a church, an eight-story apartment building and an ashram.

Downtown Jamaica contains a number of educational, governmental and institutional facilities

including Mary Immaculate Hospital, the Federal Drug Administration Building, the Social Security Building, numerous courthouses, the Department of Finance, St. John's University and York College. These office uses are complemented by a wide variety of retail establishments. The broader neighborhood features a strong cultural foundation including facilities such as the Jamaica Arts Center, the Valenzia Theatre, the King Manor and Museum, and the Queens Library, as well as jazz festivals, ethnic restaurants and hip-hop recording studios.

The Jamaica Plan, developed by the Department of City Planning (DCP) , the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) and the Economic Development Corporation (EDC), encompasses an approximately 451-block area, including the site which is the subject of this application. The Plan seeks to encourage appropriately scaled development and to strengthen retail and commercial areas by promoting higher densities on wide streets with good transit access. Land use applications necessary to implement the Jamaica Plan including zoning map and text changes were certified by DCP on February 5, 2007 to begin the formal public review process.

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

The proposed development would replace the vacant and obsolete courthouse and annex on the project site with a new mixed-use, primarily residential development in keeping with the revitalization goals expressed in the Jamaica Plan. The development will involve the construction of a new building that incorporates the primary façade of the Courthouse. The development would be comprised of approximately 295,465 square feet of residential space

containing up to 360 residential cooperative and rental units, 41,510 square feet of commercial use including local retail and a possible restaurant use, and 18,820 square feet of community facility use. In addition, the proposed development will include approximately 1,500 square feet of open space on Parsons Boulevard. The developer intends to utilize financing from the New York City Housing Development Corporation, which would require the development to include an affordable housing component.

There are four principal physical elements in the proposed development: (i) a new nine-story wing running the length of the Parsons Boulevard frontage, set back from and providing a backdrop for the existing Courthouse façade, with community facility and commercial spaces occupying the lower levels and residential above, and new one-story commercial elements extending out to the street; (ii) a 12-story structure fronting on 89th Avenue with a commercial ground floor and residential above; (iii) a one-story mechanical and service wing at the western end of the building with an access drive from 90th Avenue; and (iv) a two-level sub-grade public parking garage with a maximum of 500 spaces, including the Project's 180 required accessory spaces.

The Parsons Boulevard component will have two, new one-level commercial sections that extend out from the existing facade over the existing, moat-like perimeter to create true street frontage and activate the streetscape. These elements will have a minimum 15-foot street wall and will frame an open plaza along Parsons Boulevard. The existing Courthouse entry will highlight the retained Courthouse façade, which is setback more than 20 feet. It is expected that cafe and

retail uses will activate the streetscape of this portion of Parsons Boulevard. Second-story commercial spaces will be accessed from these Parsons Boulevard frontage commercial spaces. The existing courthouse entry will provide direct access to dedicated community facility space occupying portions of floors two, three and four along Parsons Boulevard. These spaces, totaling approximately 18,820 square feet, are suitable for community facility uses such as a daycare center, and public uses such as a branch library. The project developer will seek to lease the space to tenants who will best serve the needs of the area. The residential component would be accessed from an entry on 89th Avenue, making this street the focus of residential activity. The residential lobby would be located on the ground floor with access to rooftop recreational spaces on the second floor. The commercial base would establish a streetscape by coming to the property line with a minimum 15-foot high street wall. The facade of the ground floor would include materials such as glazing, and metal panels.

Above the minimum 15-foot height, the 12-story portion of the residential component sets back a minimum of ten feet with recesses of up to 15 feet. The building steps down to nine stories as it nears Parsons Boulevard and the existing façade. The nine story component rises to 105 feet without a setback along 89th Avenue, but is setback substantially from Parsons Boulevard (from 37 feet to 72 feet).

All of the commercial, community and residential spaces will be serviced through a service corridor that connects to the loading dock, which will be accessed via an existing, slightly enlarged, 30 foot curb cut on 90th Avenue. Two enclosed loading berths will be provided to

keep trucks off of the street and to allow a staging area for garbage collection. All residential move-ins and move-outs, as well as commercial and community facility deliveries will be accommodated in the berths, minimizing the activity on the access drive.

A public parking garage will be located below grade and will be accessed via an existing, slightly enlarged, 24 foot wide curb cut on Parsons Boulevard. A maximum of 500 attended parking spaces would accommodate the required 180 accessory spaces for the residential units.

REQUESTED ACTIONS

Zoning Map Amendment (C 070079 ZMQ)

The proposed rezoning area includes the project site (Lots 31 and 59), the seven story residential Shelton Hall (Lot 50), a portion of a two story residential building (Lot 48) and a portion of the First Baptist Church (Lot 42). A portion of the project site (Lot 59) and a portion of the seven story residential Shelton Hall (Lot 50) are located in an R6 district. A portion of the project site (Lot 31), a portion of the seven story residential Shelton Hall (Lot 50), a portion of a two story residential building (Lot 48) and a portion of the First Baptist Church (Lot 42) are located in a C4-2 district.

The existing R6 zone permits residential use with a maximum 2.43 FAR and community facility uses with a maximum 4.80 FAR. While the project's proposed uses are permitted in the C4-2 district that covers most of the project site, the proposed project's FAR 5.0 exceeds what is currently permitted. In addition, commercial uses are not permitted in the existing R6 district,

where the proposed commercial service wing of the building would be located.

The proposed C4-5X zone permits residential and community facility use to a maximum 5.0 FAR and 4.0 FAR for commercial, with a maximum height of 125 feet. The proposed action would also rezone approximately 29,597 square feet of the adjoining property to C4-5X, including portions of lot 50, 42 and 48, and would not affect the conformance or compliance of the existing buildings.

Disposition of City-Owned Property (C 070080 PPQ)

As the project site is City-owned, the project requires disposition of the site (Block 9755, Lots 31 and 59). The Department of City-wide Administrative Services (DCAS) intends to dispose to EDC, who intends to convey the property to a developer selected by EDC. Dermot QFC LLC has been conditionally designated as developer of the site by EDC.

Special Permit for a Public Parking Garage (C070081 ZSQ)

The proposed attended public parking garage would have a maximum of 500 spaces, including the 180 spaces accessory to the residential portion of the project. Traffic would enter and exit through an existing curb cut on Parsons Boulevard, which will be widened from 10 to 24 foot wide. Northbound traffic on Parsons Boulevard will be prevented with restrictive signage from turning left into the garage, avoiding conflicts between turning and southbound traffic.

Special Permit for modifications in a General Large Scale Development (C 070082 ZSQ)

The proposed development has an area larger than 1.5 acres and will be developed as a unit; therefore, it qualifies as a "general large-scale development" under ZR Sections 12-10 and 74-74.

Four modifications to the street wall height and setback regulations are required. First, the minimum base height would need to be reduced to accommodate a 15-foot, rather than 60-foot, minimum street wall within eight feet of the street line along 89th Avenue. Second, in order to allow for a rational residential layout, the setback above the commercial street wall would be a minimum of ten feet for the 12-story portion of the residential component along 89th Avenue, a narrow street, rather than the 15 feet required above a height of 85 feet under zoning. Third, the required setback above the maximum street wall height of 85 feet is also being requested to be modified for a short segment of the 89th Avenue frontage (no more than 60 feet) to accommodate the up to 105-foot height of the nine story component. Fourth, a modification to the minimum base height is being requested to allow for two one-story commercial elements to form a new street frontage at a minimum height of 15 feet, rather than 60 feet, on the Parsons Boulevard frontage at the northern and southern portions of the existing Courthouse facade.

A modification to the business entry and show window regulations is required because the project site abuts a residential district at the western property line. In order to locate retail functions on the ground floor of 89th Avenue, a waiver of the 75 foot distance required between the district boundary and show windows and principal business entries will be required. In addition, modification to the limitations on the locations of commercial uses is required because the commercial uses along Parsons Boulevard are proposed for the second floor of the Parsons Boulevard frontage in double height space, while residential uses are proposed to begin at the

second floor and extend from that point to the top of the development. Zoning Resolution Section 32-42 (Location within Buildings) requires that any commercial uses above the first story must be located below any residential use. Finally, modification to the limitations on the locations of signs is required because the project site abuts a Residential District at the western property line. Signs for ground-floor retail uses will be located less than the 75-foot required distance from the R6 district boundary.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 070082 ZSQ), in conjunction with the applications for the related actions (C 070079 ZMQ), (C 070080 PPQ) and (C 070081 ZSQ), was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA), and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 06DME014Q. The lead agency is The Office of the Deputy Mayor for Economic Development and Rebuilding.

After a study of the potential environmental impact of the proposed action, a Negative Declaration was issued on September 19, 2006.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 070082 ZSQ), in conjunction with the applications for the related actions (C 070079 ZMQ), (C 070080 PPQ) and (C 070081 ZSQ), was certified as complete by the

Department of City Planning on September 25, 2006, and was duly referred to Community Board 12 and the Borough President, in accordance with Article 3 of the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP) rules.

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 12 held a public hearing on this application on November 15, 2006, and on that date, by a vote of 30 to none with 3 abstentions, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the application with the following conditions:

Parking and Transportation

1. Retail deliveries to the loading dock which is located on 90th Ave, between Parsons Blvd and 153rd St be conducted between the hours of 7:00 A.M. and 9:00 A.M
2. Moving vans must be restricted within a three hour allotment, between 8:00 A.M. and 9:00 P.M.
3. Moving trucks on Sunday (Sabbath) forbidden.
4. Forbid truck idling

Traffic Signaling

1. No left turns out of garage onto Parson's Blvd.
2. One-year trial period be attached to bus lane entering lane into the garage in front of development on Parson's Blvd.
3. A partnership team be established to monitor traffic flow for at least 1 year- hold quarterly meetings for that year.
4. New York City Department of Transportation look into residential parking permits for the residents.
5. Parking remains on both sides of 90th Ave with new signs expected to prohibit parking near the loading dock between hours of retail deliveries.

Employment

1. 5% of local NWBE must be maintained during construction and 50% of the locals must be hired full time from community board 12.
2. Conversations / negotiations with AFL-CIO Union – minorities are not hired significant time periods because of stringent rules and procedures. Fairness and some measure of equity is to be guaranteed.
3. Sites to be set up for application pick up:
 - a. Dermot's employment location
 - b. Community Board 12, Queens

Borough President Recommendation

This application was considered by the Borough President, who issued a recommendation approving the application on January 9, 2007.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On December 20, 2007 (Calendar No. 6), the City Planning Commission scheduled January 10, 2007, for a public hearing on this application (C 070082 ZSQ). The hearing was duly held on January 10, 2007 (Calendar No. 25), in conjunction with the public hearing on the applications for the related actions (C 070079 ZMQ), (C 070080 PPQ) and (C 070081 ZSQ).

There were four speakers in favor of the applications and no speakers in opposition. The speakers in favor of the applications included four representatives of the applicant including a Senior Vice President from EDC, an attorney and a vice-president representing the developer and the project architect. The speaker from the EDC stated that this proposal was the result of a Request for Proposals (RFP) issued by the EDC in 2004. The attorney for the developer described in detail the approvals that are necessary to allow the project as designed. The developer described the details of the public outreach efforts and meeting held with the Community Board, and described the affordable housing aspect of the project. The developer stated they would fund a traffic study to monitor traffic flow after the construction of the project as requested by the Community Board. The project architect briefly discussed the massing and architectural treatment of the proposed building.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that the grant of the special permit, in conjunction with the related actions, are appropriate.

Special Permit for modifications in a General Large Scale Development (C 070082 ZSQ)

The requested waivers would facilitate a development that better relates to the surrounding neighborhood, a better distribution of bulk on the site, and a better site plan.

The Commission notes that the modification of height and setback of the regulations are necessary to meet the project's objective of preserving the Parsons Boulevard façade of the former Jamaica Family Courthouse. By moving the main mass of the building away towards the western portion of the site, the existing façade on Parsons Boulevard would be reused and incorporated into the proposed project, preserving a significant asset to the existing character of Jamaica.

Along Parsons Boulevard the required street wall would not be provided to the full 60' required height, instead two commercial wings are proposed to be built to the street line and rise to a height of 15 feet. The Commission believes that these commercial uses would activate the streetscape and provide a better connection between the building and the street, without obstructing the existing courthouse façade from public view. The Commission also notes that the additional modifications of the street wall height and setback regulations would allow the project

to better relate to the surrounding context. The proposed street wall locations along 89th Avenue would be consistent with the location of the existing courthouse façade on 89th Avenue, and similar to the street wall location of the 13-story residential building on 89th Avenue to the East. The Commission also notes that, although along 89th Avenue the project would not provide a 15 foot setback of the street wall above 85 feet, access to light and air has been provided by locating the street wall at a depth varying between ten feet and 17 feet away from the street line above a height of ten feet, and therefore the intention of the maximum street wall height before setback requirement has been met. The Commission also notes that the bulk of the project is evenly distributed on the site and that the height of the project is consistent with the surrounding buildings, which provides adjacent buildings with access to light and air.

According to the environmental assessment statement prepared for the project, the incremental increase in traffic resulting from the project would not significantly alter traffic conditions on the local street network.

Special Permit for Public Parking Garage (C 070081 ZSQ)

The Commission notes that the surrounding area contains many medium to high-density commercial and residential buildings that provide limited parking. The proposed garage would serve current, work day parking demand within the area and accommodate the demand generated by new residents of the building on the site undergoing conversion.

The Commission notes that the subject site is located in an area of the City that is predominately commercial in character. The Commission further notes that the garage-related traffic would

access the garage from Parsons Boulevard which is not a local street.

According to the environmental assessment statement prepared for the project, the incremental increase in traffic would not significantly alter traffic conditions on the local street network. In addition, the Commission notes that the garage provides the required 25 reservoir spaces.

Disposition of City Owned Property (C 07080 PPQ)

The property proposed for disposition is located at 89-14 Parsons Boulevard and 153-15 90th Avenue (Block 9755, Lots 31 and 59). It is presently occupied by the Queens Family Courthouse and Court Annex Building, both of which have been vacant since 2002.

The Commission believes that this disposition, pursuant to zoning, is appropriate and will return this vacant parcel of land to productive use.

Amendment to the Zoning Map (C 07079 ZMQ)

The Commission notes that the proposed C4-5X zoning district is consistent with a zoning application that was approved in 2002 on a midblock parcel located southeast of the project site between 161st and 162nd streets. The Commission further notes that the proposed C4-5X zoning district would be consistent with the recently certified zoning applications related to the Jamaica Plan, and would support the policy of directing residential growth and redevelopment of underutilized properties in downtown Jamaica, where access to transit infrastructure can best support a growing population.

FINDINGS

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 74-743

(Special provisions for bulk modifications) of the Zoning Resolution:

- (1) that the distribution of floor area and the location of primary business entrances and show windows will result in a better site plan and a better relationship among buildings and open areas to adjacent streets, surrounding development and adjacent open areas than would be possible without such distribution and will thus benefit both the occupants of the general large-scale development, the neighborhood, and the city as a whole;
- (2) that the distribution of floor area and location of buildings will not unduly increase the bulk of buildings in any one block or unduly obstruct access of light and air to the detriment of the occupants or users of buildings in the block or nearby blocks or of people using the public streets;
- (3) not applicable;
- (4) that the streets providing access to such use will be adequate to handle the traffic generated thereby;
- (5) not applicable; and
- (6) that a declaration with regards to ownership requirements in paragraph (b) of the general large-scale development in section 12-10 (Definitions) of the Zoning Resolution has been filed.

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 74-744

(c) (Modification of use regulations) of the Zoning Resolution:

That such modification will result in a better site plan.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination, and the consideration and findings described in this report, the application of the New York City Economic Development Corporation and Dermot QFC LLC and pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to:

- 1) Section 74-743(a)(2) of the Zoning Resolution to modify the minimum base height, street wall location and setback regulations of Section 35-24 (Special Street Wall Location and Height and Setback Regulations in Certain Districts);
- 2) Section 74-743(a)(3) of the Zoning Resolution to modify the location of primary business entrances and show windows regulations of Section 32-512 (Limitations on Business Entrances, Show Windows or Signs for corner lots);
- 3) Section 74-744(b) of the Zoning Resolution to permit residential and nonresidential uses to be located within a building without regard for the regulations of Section 32-422 (Location of floors occupied by non-residential uses); and
- 4) Section 74-744(c) of the Zoning Resolution to modify the location of signs regulations of Section 32-512 (Limitations on Business Entrances, Show Windows or Signs for corner lots);

in connection with a proposed mixed use building on property located at 89-14 Parsons Boulevard (Block 9755, Lots 31 and 59), in a C4-5X District, Community District 12, Borough of Queens, is approved, subject to the following terms and conditions:

1. The property that is the subject of this application (C 070082 ZSQ) shall be developed in size and arrangement substantially in accordance with the dimensions, specification, and zoning computations indicated in the following plans, prepared by FXFOXLE Architects, PC, filed with this application and

incorporated in this resolution:

Drawing	Title	Last Date Revised
Z-202	Roof Plan – Development Envelope	8/23/06
Z-203	Zoning Analysis	8/23/06
Z-301	Average Curb Level / Base Plane	8/23/06
Z-401	Building Envelope Controls – Plans	8/23/06
Z-402	Building Envelope Controls – Plans	8/23/06
Z-403	Height & Setback Encroachment Diagrams – Sections	8/23/06
Z-404	Height & Setback Encroachment Diagrams – Sections	8/23/06
Z-405	Storefront Details	8/23/06
Z-406	Building Use Diagrams	8/23/06

2. Such development shall conform to all applicable provisions of the Zoning Resolution, except for the modifications specifically granted in this resolution and shown on the plans listed above which have been filed with this application. All zoning computations are subject to verification and approval by the New York City Department of Buildings.
3. Such development shall conform to all applicable laws and regulations relating to its construction, operation and maintenance.
4. Development pursuant to this resolution shall be allowed only after the attached Restrictive Declaration marked as Exhibit 1 hereto, together with any necessary

administrative and technical changes acceptable to counsel the City Planning Commission, is executed by Dermot QFC, LLC.

5. All leases, subleases, or other agreements for use or occupancy of space at the subject property shall give actual notice of this special permit to the lessee, sublessee or occupant.
6. Upon the failure of any party having any right, title or interest in the property that is the subject of this application, or the failure of any heir, successor, assign, or legal representative of such party, to observe any of the covenants, restrictions, agreements, terms or conditions of this resolution whose provisions shall constitute conditions of the special permit hereby granted, the City Planning Commission may, without the consent of any other party, revoke any portion of or all of said special permit. Such power of revocation shall be in addition to and not limited to any other powers of the City Planning Commission, or of any other agency of government, or any private person or entity. Any such failure as stated above, or any alteration in the development that is the subject of this application that departs from any of the conditions listed above, is grounds for the City Planning Commission or the City Council, as applicable, to disapprove any application for modification, cancellation or amendment of the special permit hereby granted.
7. Neither the City of New York nor its employees or agents shall have any liability for money damages by reason of the city's or such employee's or agent's failure to act in accordance with the provisions of this special permit.

The above resolution (C 070082 ZSQ), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on February 7, 2007 (Calendar No. 17), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough President together with a copy of the plans of the development, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

AMANDA M. BURDEN, AICP, Chair

KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, ESQ., Vice Chairman

ANGELA M. BATTAGLIA, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ANGELA R. CAVALUZZI, R.A.,

ALFRED C. CERULLO, III, RICHARD W. EADDY, JANE D. GOL, LISA A. GOMEZ,

CHRISTOPHER KUI, JOHN MEROLO, KAREN A. PHILLIPS, DOLLY WILLIAMS Commissioners