

Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

Marie Giraud, Esq. Agency Attorney/ Director of Compliance Monitoring

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

## April 8, 2016

## BY MAIL AND E-MAIL

Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP Commissioner Department of Parks & Recreation 830 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10065

Re: Preliminary Determination: Audit, Evaluation, Monitoring of the Department of Parks & Recreation's Employment Practices and Procedures from January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015.

Dear Commissioner Silver:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you and your agency for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit. This letter contains the Commission's findings and preliminary determinations pursuant to our audit and analysis of your agency's Employment Practices and Procedures for the period covering January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015.

The New York City Charter, Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(5), empowers this Commission to audit and evaluate city agencies' employment practices, programs, policies and procedures, and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for employees and applicants seeking employment with city agencies. Section 832.c provides that this Commission may, pursuant to an audit, make a preliminary determination that any plan, program or procedure utilized by any city agency does not provide equal employment opportunity and recommend all necessary and appropriate procedures, approaches, measures, standards and programs to be utilized by agencies in these efforts.

The Department of Parks & Recreation, which may herein be referred to as "the agency," falls within the Commission's purview under Chapter 36, Section 831(a) of the New York City Charter, which delineates city agency as any "city, county, borough or other office, administration, board, department, division, commission, bureau, corporation, authority, or other agency of government where the majority of the board members of such agency are appointed by the mayor or serve by virtue of being city officers or the expenses of which are paid in whole or in part from the city treasury..."



The purpose of this audit and analysis is to evaluate the agency's Employment Practices and Procedures, not to issue findings of discrimination pursuant to the New York City Human Rights Law. This Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits*<sup>1</sup> and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. These standards are founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; the New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code §§8-107(1)(a) and (d), 8-107.13, and 8-107.1); the New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; the Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7); the Americans with Disabilities Act; and its Accessibility Guidelines, and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter. Prescribed corrective actions are consistent with the aforementioned parameters.

Since this Commission is empowered to review and recommend actions which each agency should consider including in its annual plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity (Annual EEO Plan), the audited agency should incorporate required corrective actions in its current EEO Program and prospective Annual EEO Plans.

# Scope and Methodology

This Commission's audit methodology includes collection and analysis of the documents, records and data the agency provides in response to the *EEPC Document and Information Request Form;* responses to the *EEPC Interview Questionnaires* for EEO professionals and others involved in EEO program administration; and, if applicable, review of the agency's *Annual EEO Plans* and *Quarterly EEO Reports* and analysis of workforce and utilization data from the *Citywide Equal Employment Database System* (CEEDS).

This Commission reviews the workforce statistics and utilization analysis information available via CEEDS to understand the concentrations of race and gender groups within an agency's workforce. (CEEDS may be unavailable for certain non-mayoral agencies. In such cases, the EEPC requests that the agency submit similar statistics and analysis.) EEO Program Analysts examine imbalances between the number of employees in a particular job category and the number that would reasonably be expected when compared to their availability in the relevant labor market. Personnel transactions are reviewed in order to ascertain the agency's employment practices. Where underutilization is revealed within an agency's workforce, EEO Program Analysts assess whether the agency has undertaken reasonable measures to address it.

EEO professionals (including, but not limited to, past or current EEO Officers, Deputy or Co-EEO Officers, EEO Counselors, EEO Trainers, EEO Investigators, Disability Rights Coordinators, Career Counselors, 55-a Program Coordinators) and others involved in EEO program administration such as the Principal Human Resources Professional are given a two-week deadline to complete and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Corresponding audit/analysis standards are numbered throughout the document.



return their individual questionnaires. The Commission's EEO Program Analysts also conduct additional research and follow-up discussions or interviews with EEO professionals, when appropriate.

To encourage response, the EEPC requests that the head or deputy of each agency send emails to employees and to supervisors/managers that provide links to our questionnaires.

## Description of the Agency

The New York City Department of Parks and Recreation is the chief steward of the City's parkland – about 29,000 acres of land including more than 5,000 individual properties ranging from Coney Island Beach and Central Park to community gardens and Greenstreets. The agency operates over 800 athletic fields and nearly 1,000 playgrounds, 550 tennis courts, 66 public pools 48 recreational facilities, 17 nature centers, 13 golf courses, and 14 miles of beaches. The agency also cares for 1,200 monuments and 23 historic house museums, and looks after 600,000 street trees, and two million more in parks. It is New York City's principal provider of recreational and athletic facilities and programs and home to free concerts, world-class sports events, and cultural festivals.

## PRELIMINARY DETERMINATIONS AFTER AUDIT AND ANALYSIS

Following are the corresponding audit standards for each subject area along with the EEPC's findings and required corrective actions, where appropriate:

# I. <u>ISSUANCE, DISTRIBUTION AND POSTING OF EEO POLICIES</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.
- ✓ The Commissioner issued general EEO Policy statements in May 2013, May 2014, and August 2015. The policy statements were emailed to EEO Counselors to disseminate throughout the agency's borough offices, park districts, park houses, recreation centers, and garages. The Commissioner's May 2013 EEO Policy statement expressed that the agency "is strongly committed to maintaining an environment in which all employees can be free from mistreatment and discrimination, including sexual harassment. Moreover, I want to remind you that discrimination is illegal and will not be tolerated." The EEO policy statements provided the name and contact information of the principal EEO Professional and stated that the agency adhered to the City's EEO Policy, Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies. In addition, the EEO policy statement also included sections titled "Sexual Harassment Policy, Reasonable Accommodation Policy, and Anti-Retaliation Policy," and stated "[a]dditional information on EEO complaint procedures, reasonable accommodation procedures, and complaint forms can also be obtained directly from an EEO Counselor."



- 2. Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies – or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws – for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: a policy against sexual harassment; uniform and responsive procedures for investigating discrimination complaints and providing reasonable accommodations; an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for the agency's EEO professionals, as well as federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.
- ✓ The agency's aforementioned EEO policy statement included a link to the City's EEO Policy, Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies. The City's EEO Policy (which was posted on the agency's intranet site during the period in review); included sections on sexual harassment, request for reasonable accommodations, and discrimination compliant investigations, and linked to "The Guidelines for the Implementation of the City's Discrimination Complaint Procedures" and the City's "Reasonable Accommodation Policy and Procedure." In September 2014 all employees received the EEO handbook, About EEO: What You Need to Know, which included sections on sexual harassment, reasonable accommodations, and the EEO complaint process (which included a procedural chart for employees who believe they have been discriminated against); an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination. The EEO policy statement included contact information for the agency's principal EEO Professional and a link to contact information for the agency's EEO Counselors.

## II. EEO TRAINING FOR AGENCY:

# Determination: The agency is in <u>compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 3. Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.
- ✓ The agency provided documentation that EEO Counselors conducted agency wide EEO training in 2014. For the period in review, the agency reported in its Agency Quarterly Report on EEO Activity that EEO and Diversity & Inclusion training was conducted for 6021 employees in fiscal year 2013, 7712 employees in fiscal year 2014, 8040 employees in fiscal year 2015, and 2027 employees in the 1st and 2nd quarters of fiscal year 2016 (approximately 87%, 112%, 116%, and 29% of the workforce<sup>2</sup> respectively).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Based on workforce headcount at the end of the period in review, December 31, 2015 (See Appendix 2).



# III. <u>EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES (Recruitment, Hiring & Promotion)</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 4. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
- ✓ During the period in review, the agency maintained a list of recruitment outreach sources serving women, minorities, and other protected groups, including Nontraditional Employment for Women, Association for Women in Architecture, National Society of Black Engineers, Society of Hispanic Professional Engineers, Society of Women Engineers, American Indian Science and Engineering Society, Association for Latin Professionals in Finance and Accounting, National Association of Black Accountants, and National Black MBA Association.
- The agency did not assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impacted any particular group. The 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2013 CEEDs Report Work Force Compared with Internal and External Pools (the first quarter of the audit period) and the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2016 CEEDs Report Work Force Compared with Internal and External Pools (the last quarter of the audit period) indicated underutilization of protected classes in twelve (12) job groups (See Appendices 3 & 4). Corrective Action Required.

<u>Corrective Action #1</u>: Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

- 5. The principal EEO Professional, HR Professional, and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required to correct deficiencies.
- ✓ During the period in review, the principal HR Professional discussed the agency's employment practices and policies via email regularly with the General Counsel and Deputy General Counsel, and as needed with the principal EEO professional. Since August 2015, the principal EEO Professional, the principal HR Professional, Deputy EEO Officer, Advocate, Assistant Commissioner for Budget, Director of Labor Relations, and Senior Labor Relations Analyst met biweekly to discuss the agency's EEO mediation and employment practices, programs, and policies. In their November 20, 2015 meeting, the principal EEO Professional shared the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2016 CEEDs Report - Work Force Compared with Internal and External Pools.



The principal EEO professional, principal Human Resources Professional and General Counsel did not meet on an annual basis to review statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), EEO complaints, or identify whether there were barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions were required to correct deficiencies. <u>Corrective Action Required</u>.

<u>Corrective Action #2</u>: Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

- 6. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
- The agency did not assess the manner in which candidates were selected for employment to determine whether agency selection criteria adversely impacted any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. <u>Corrective Action Required</u>.

<u>Corrective Action #3</u>: Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

- 7. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- The 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2016 CEEDs Report Work Force Compared with Internal and External Pools (the last quarter of the audit period) indicated underutilization of females in six (6) job groups, Blacks in seven (7) job groups, Hispanics in one (1) job group, and Asians in three (3) job groups, which may include discretionary titles (See Appendix 4). Corrective Action Required.

<u>Corrective Action #4</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in



career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- 8. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- The 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2016 CEEDs Report Work Force Compared with Internal and External Pools (the last quarter of the audit period) indicated underutilization of females in six (6) job groups, Blacks in seven (7) job groups, Hispanics in one (1) job group, and Asians in three (3) job groups, which may include civil service titles (See Appendix 4). Corrective Action Required.

<u>Corrective Action #5</u> If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).
- ✓ During the period in review the agency provided structured interview training to 335 employees and developed a body of structured interview questions that were reviewed by an EEO professional prior to being used to interview candidates.
- 10. Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for promotion and transfer within the agency, and ensure that employees are considered for such opportunities.
- ✓ The Human Resources Department promoted employees' awareness of opportunities for promotion and transfer within the agency via monthly emails titled "Job and Promotional Opportunities at Parks & Recreation." The emails directed employees to the intranet site "[t]o see the detailed descriptions, how to apply and for other opportunities to grow at Park."

11. At minimum, indicate the agency is an equal opportunity employer in recruitment literature.



- ✓ The agency advertised several job vacancies during the period in review, including Investigator (Discipline), Recreation Supervisor, Community Coordinator, and Agency Chief Contracting Officer. Each job vacancy notice stated "[t]he City of New York and The City of New York/ Parks & Recreation are Equal Opportunity Employers M/F/D/V." The agency also advertised five vacancies in print, including Architect, Auditor, Data Analytics Specialist, ACCO for Capital Division, and Environment, all contained the equal opportunity employer acronym, "EOE."
- 12. Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the hiring manager.
- ✓ During the period in review the agency exclusively used eHire, which captured the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability status, veteran status, and recruitment source of each applicant; and had the ability to capture candidate information such as interview date, interviewers' names, result, and reason selected/not selected (or disposition).

## IV. CAREER COUNSELING:

## Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 13.Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.
- ✓ During the period in review, a list of the agency's five (5) Career Counselors and their phone numbers were posted to the intranet site under the Equal Employment Opportunity section. The Career Counselors list stated "[t]he Counselors are available to meet with all year-round regarding their career paths at Parks & Recreation. The services include, but are not limited to: information on how job vacancies filled, schedule of upcoming civil service exams and training opportunities." In addition, the agency formed an internal Career Counseling working group in response to a 2014 employee satisfaction survey. The working group recommended the adoption of six (6) Career Coaches to guide and mentor non-supervisory staff in their career development and to provide information on civil service opportunities. The Career Counseling working group's findings were presented to the Commissioner in December 2015.

<u>NOTE</u>: Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.

14. The Human Resources Professional distributes the identity of the agency Career Counselor and ensures that all employees have access to information regarding job responsibilities, performance evaluation standards, examinations, training opportunities and job postings;



ensures that all new employees are advised of the EEO policies, their rights and responsibilities under such policies and the discrimination complaint procedures; informs the principal EEO Professional of the number of 55-a program participants and efforts the agency has made to employ, promote or accommodate qualified individuals with disabilities; involves the principal EEO Professional in EEO-related matters; and promptly consults with the principal EEO Professional if informed of, or suspects that a violation of the EEO Policy has occurred.

✓ During the period in review, the principal Human Resources Professional met bi-weekly with the principal EEO Professional to discuss EEO related matters; directed supervisors via email to provide employees with copies of their job responsibilities and performance evaluation standards; and informed the principal EEO Professional of efforts the agency made to accommodate qualified individuals with disabilities. The Human Resources Department notified employees via email of job postings monthly and civil service examinations annually. The EEO Office processed requests for reasonable accommodation and new employees were advised of the EEO policies, EEO complaint procedures, and their rights and responsibilities under such policies via the About EEO: What You May Not Know booklet that was distributed during new-employee orientation.

<u>NOTE</u>: The agency stated that cross-training could occur within individual departments as determined by supervisors but documentation was not provided that any such training occurred during the period in review.

# V. <u>EEO AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS FOR EMPLOYEES/</u> <u>APPLICANTS FOR EMPLOYMENT WITH DISABILITIES:</u> Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 15. Ensure that information regarding employee rights and obligations, and the complaint, investigation and reasonable accommodation procedures is made available in appropriate alternative formats (i.e., large print, audio tape and/or Braille) upon request to employees and applicants for employment with disabilities.
- ✓ During the period in review, the agency provided its EEO policies in large print upon request. In addition, the agency's internal/external job vacancy notices, provided telephone numbers for applicants to call to make reasonable accommodation requests, and specified "if you … require a reasonable accommodation during the application process, please call the Personnel Division" and "M/F/D/V Telecommunications Devices for the Deaf."

16. Document reasonable accommodation requests and their outcomes.

✓ All reasonable accommodation requests were documented via a reasonable accommodation request form, and the EEO Office maintained all requests through an electronic tracking log. During the period in review the agency documented 140 requests for accommodation via its reasonable accommodation requests log.



# VI. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION - EEO PROFESSIONALS:</u> Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 17.Appoint a principal EEO Professional to implement EEO policies and standards within the agency. The principal EEO Professional is trained and knowledgeable regarding city, federal and state EEO laws; the requirements of the agency's EEO policies, standards and procedures; and the prevention, investigation, and resolution of discrimination complaints.
- ✓ The principal EEO Professional completed DCAS' trainings, "EEO Basic Training" in 2012 and "EEOC's ADA and Reasonable Accommodation Training" in 2013. In August 2015, all employees were notified via email of the appointment of a new principal EEO Professional, who formerly was a Deputy EEO Officer at the agency. The principal EEO Professional received Unconscious Bias training through DCAS in 2015, and completed various continuing legal education courses, including Title XI Training for CUNY Campuses, 2014 NYSBA Annual Meeting: Labor & Employment Law Section Meeting, 2014 Labor & Employment Year In Review, Employment Discrimination Law & Litigation 2014, Spring 2014 Labor & Employment Law Update, 2015 NYSBA Annual Meeting: Labor & Employment Law Section Meeting, Court-Annexed Mediation: Preparing for the Inevitable, Understanding Employment Law 2015, Spring 2015 Labor & Employment Law Update, Employment Discrimination Law & Litigation 2015, International Employment Law 2015, and Employment Law Institute 2015.
- 18. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.
- ✓ The agency's EEO Office consisted of an Attorney, Investigator, Policy Analyst, Administrative Assistant, Deputy EEO Officer, and the principal EEO Professional. In addition to the EEO Office, the agency had 21 EEO Counselors, six (6) of which received DCAS's EEO Basic Training during the period in review. The agency reported that the principal EEO Professional provided internal training to its EEO Counselors on February 3, 2013. Training topics included "What Is My Role as an EEO Counselor; Overview of Federal Laws; Overview of NY State Human Rights Law; Overview of NY City Human Rights Law; Employment Decisions Covered by Discrimination Laws; Harassment; Anti-discrimination Protections; Drug Dependency and Alcoholism; Domestic Violence, Sex Offenses or Stalking; Interacting with Interviewees; [and] Assessing the Credibility Rule from EEO"
- The agency did not provide documentation that <u>all</u> EEO Professionals were trained in EEO laws and procedures and knew how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy. <u>Corrective Action Required</u>.

<u>Corrective Action #6</u>: Ensure that all EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.



- 19. The principal EEO Professional reports directly to the agency head (or an approved direct report other than the General Counsel) in order to exercise the necessary authority and independent judgment to fulfill EEO responsibilities.
- ✓ During the period in review, the principal EEO Professional reported directly to the Commissioner. This reporting relationship was reflected in the agency's organizational chart dated August 2015.
- 20.To ensure the integrity and continuity of the EEO Program, maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
- ✓ From the date of appointment in August 2015, the principal EEO Professional met bi-weekly with the Commissioner to discuss the administration and operation of the agency's EEO program. The principal EEO Professional's notes from these meetings included the following discussion topics, "EEO Plan basic components, Orientation for [EEO] Investigators, EEO Book, EEO Policy Statement, EEO Training, DCAS Training EEO[, and] EEO slogans."

<u>NOTE</u>: To ensure the integrity and continuity of the EEO Program, maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications (i.e. memos to file, electronic word processed notes, meeting agendas, meeting minutes).

VII. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION – SUPERVISORS/MANAGERS</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 21. Establish and administer an annual managerial/non-managerial performance evaluation program to be used for probationary periods, promotions, assignments, incentives and training.
- ✓ In 2013, 2014, and 2015, the principal Human Resources Professional directed supervisors via email to complete annual performance evaluations for their employees. In advance of the evaluation period, supervisors provided employees with copies of their job responsibilities and performance evaluation standards. Employees reviewed their responsibilities and performance expectations and signed their performance evaluations. Signed copies of the evaluations were provided to employees and maintained by the Human Resources Department.
- 22. The managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).
- ✓ The EEO section of the agency's managerial performance evaluation form contained three (3) checkboxes, Violated EEO Policy; Failure to cooperate with EEO Office, or (if supervisor/manager) failed to promptly report any allegations of discriminatory conduct; and Provided exceptional service in support of EEO Office.



# VIII. <u>REPORTING STANDARD FOR AGENCY HEAD</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 23.Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports<sup>3</sup> (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.
- ✓ The agency provided all Annual Plans and quarterly reports for all years in review.

# After implementation of the EEPC's corrective actions, if any:

1. The agency head distributes a memorandum informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and re-emphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

<u>Final Action</u>: Distribute a memorandum signed by the agency head informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and re-emphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

## Conclusion

The agency has <u>6</u> required corrective action(s) at this time.

Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter, your agency has the *option* to respond to this *preliminary determination*, but must respond to our Final Determination if corrective action is required.

Optional Response to preliminary determination: If submitted, your optional response should indicate, with attached documentation, what steps your agency has taken or will take to implement the prescribed corrective actions, and must be received in our office within 14 days from the date of this letter. No extensions will be granted for the option to respond to the preliminary determination.

(Optional Conference) During the Optional Conference, we will discuss the immediate steps your agency should take and address questions regarding your agency's implementation of the prescribed corrective action(s).

(*No Response Option*) If your agency does not respond to this preliminary determination within 14 days, it will become the EEPC's Final Determination.

Mandatory Response to Final Determination: Following this preliminary determination, the EEPC will issue a Final Determination where we may modify or eliminate the corrective actions based on verified information; identify remaining action which requires further monitoring in order to ensure implementation; and assign a mandatory compliance-monitoring period of up to 6 months for this

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Submission of Quarterly Reports on EEO Activity is *optional* for non-Mayoral agencies.



purpose. Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter your agency must respond to our Final Determination within 30 days. Your response to the Final Determination will initiate the compliance monitoring period.

In closing, we want to thank you and your staff for the cooperation extended to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's EEO Program Analysts during the course of our audit and analysis.

Respectfully Submitted by,

William Peterson

William Peterson, EEO Program Analyst

Approved by,

Marie & Drisud For

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

c: Iyana Titus, Principal EEO Professional

# Appendix - 1

Department of Parks & Recreation EEO Job Group Descriptions

## DESCRIPTION OF CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) JOB GROUP CATEGORIES

Administrators: Occupations in which employees set broad policies and exercise overall responsibility for the execution of these policies. This category includes: elected officials, commissioners, executive directors, deputy commissioners, chairpersons, general counsels, controllers, chiefs of department, inspector generals and kindred workers.

**Managers:** Occupations in which employees direct individual departments or special phases of the agency's operations, or provide specialized consultation on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: assistant commissioners, deputy directors, assistant directors, project managers, special assistants, superintendents, deputy counsels and kindred workers.

**Management Specialists:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of management, finance or personnel, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: accountants, underwriters, financial analysts, personnel analysts, staff analysts, program analysts, buyers, purchasing specialists, inspectors, research analysts, program officers, project coordinators and kindred workers.

**Science Professionals:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of various scientific or mathematical fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: architects, engineers (chemical, nuclear, civil, electrical, industrial, mechanical, marine), computer specialists, telecommunications specialists, actuaries, statisticians, physicists, chemists, geologists, biologists, foresters and kindred workers.

**005 Health Professionals:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the medical or health fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: physicians, dentists, veterinarians, optometrists, podiatrists, registered nurses, pharmacists, dieticians, occupational therapists, physical therapists, speech therapists, physician's assistants and kindred workers.

**Social Scientists:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the social sciences, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: librarians, archivists, economists, psychologists, sociologists, urban planners and kindred workers.

**Social Workers:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of social work, youth and family counseling, addiction treatment and casework, which is usually acquired through college or training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: caseworkers, probation officers, correctional counselors, juvenile counselors, addiction treatment counselors, eligibility specialists, human rights specialists, community liaison workers, clergy and kindred workers.

Lawyers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the law and the judicial process, which is usually acquired through college training. This category includes: attorneys, assistant district attorneys, counsels, assistant counsels, deputy counsels, law judges, and kindred workers.

**Public Relations:** Occupations which require special knowledge or skills in public relations, journalism, modern language or the fine arts, which are usually acquired through college training, specialized post-secondary school education, or work experience or training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: technical writers, graphic designers, musicians, actors, directors, announcers, painters, illustrators, photographers, artists, editors, press officers, public relations specialists, public relations advisors, interpreters, customer service specialists and kindred workers.

**Technicians:** Occupations which require a combination of basic scientific or technical knowledge and manual skill which can be obtained through specialized post-secondary school education or through equivalent on-the-job training. This category includes: health technicians (clinical laboratory, dental hygienists, health records, radiologic

and licensed practical nurses), electrical and electronic technicians, engineering technicians (electrical, electronic, industrial, and mechanical), drafting occupations, surveying and mapping technicians, science technicians, airline pilots and navigators, air traffic controllers, broadcast equipment operators, computer programmers, legal assistants, investigators, and kindred workers.

011 Sales: Not applicable.

**012 Clerical Supervisors:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for overseeing and supervising the duties of clerical staff. This category includes: chief clerks, supervising clerks, principal administrative associates, supervising cashiers, telegraph superintendents, supervising stenographers and kindred workers.

**013 Clerical:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for internal and external communication, recording and retrieval of data and/or information and other paperwork required in an office. This category includes: cashiers, computer operators, word processors, secretaries, stenographers, typists, ticket agents, receptionists, clerks (information, personnel, file, library, records), bookkeepers, office machine operators, telephone operators, messengers, dispatchers, stock clerks, meter readers, office aides, general office clerks, bank tellers and kindred workers.

014 Household Services: Not applicable.

**015 Police Supervisors:** Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officers status set broad policies in the area of public safety and security, exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies, direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations, or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: sergeants, captains, lieutenants, inspectors, captains (correction), wardens and kindred workers.

**016 Fire Supervisors:** Occupations in which uniformed employees set broad policies in the area of public safety and protection; exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies; direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations; or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: lieutenants, captains, battalion chiefs, deputy chiefs, supervising fire marshals, supervising fire prevention inspectors and kindred workers.

**017** Firefighters: Occupations in which uniformed employees are entrusted with public safety, security and protection from destructive forces. This category includes: firefighters, marine engineers (uniformed), fire prevention inspectors, fire protection inspectors and kindred workers.

**018 Police and Detectives:** Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officer status are entrusted with public safety, security and protection. This category includes: police officer, detectives, correction officers, bridge and tunnel officers, sheriffs, special officers, enforcement agents (traffic, sanitation) and kindred workers.

**019 Guards:** Occupations in which employees are entrusted with public safety and security. This category includes: school crossing guards, housing guards, watch persons, lifeguards, park rangers, school guards and kindred workers.

**020** Food Preparation: Occupations in which employees are responsible for the preparation and distribution of food, or management of food services, in City facilities (e.g. schools, correctional institutions, and concessions). This category includes: cooks, school lunch helpers, school lunch managers, food service managers, commissary managers and kindred workers.

**021 Health Services:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for assisting health professionals in maintaining and promoting the health, hygiene and safety of the general public. This category includes: dental assistants, dietary aides, public health assistants, nurse's aides, institutional aides, health aides, orderlies, and kindred workers.

**022** Building Services: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. This category includes: custodians, cleaners, caretakers, maintainers, elevator operators and starters, exterminators, pest control aides and kindred workers.

**Personal Services:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort or convenience of the general public. This category includes: housekeepers, barbers, attendants, railroad porters, homemakers, matrons and kindred workers.

Farming: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of agricultural/botanical/zoological facilities or grounds of public property. This category includes: herbarium aides, aquarium technicians, botanical gardening aides, gardeners, groundskeepers, pruners, hostlers, menagerie keepers, horseshoers and kindred workers.

**Craft:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which require special manual skill and a thorough and comprehensive knowledge of the processes involved in the work in which is acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: mechanics, equipment repairers, telephone line installers, small instrument repairers, brick masons, carpenters, electricians, plumbers, mining occupations, tool and die makers, sheet metal workers, tailors, butchers, bakers, machine operators, locksmiths, precision handworking occupations and kindred workers.

**Operators:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which require specialized machine skills which are required through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: printing press operators, high pressure boiler operators, laundry workers and kindred workers.

**Transportation:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which require motor vehicle, bus, train, or other transportation operation skills which are acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through other formal training programs. This category includes: bus drivers, chauffeurs, motor vehicle operators, trainmasters, ferry terminal supervisors and kindred workers.

Laborers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort, convenience, hygiene or safety of the general public, or which contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. There are no job qualification requirements for titles in this category. This category includes: skilled craft helpers and apprentices, construction laborers, stock handlers, garage and service station related occupations, car cleaners, seasonal park helpers, track workers, assistant highway repairers and kindred workers.

**Sanitation Workers:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the cleanliness, hygiene and safety of the public domain. Qualification requirements, which include civil service examinations, exist for titles in this category. This category includes: sanitation workers, debris removers and kindred workers.

**Teachers:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of education and instructional methods, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: teachers, instructors, professors, lecturers, fitness instructors, graduate assistants, fellows, adjunct professors, substitute teachers, trade instructors, education/vocational counselors, education analysts, education officers, institutional instructors and kindred workers.

**Paraprofessionals:** Occupations in which employees perform some of the duties of a professional or technician in a supportive role, which usually requires less formal training and/or experience normally required for professional or technical status. Such positions may fall within an identified pattern of staff development and promotion. This category includes: administrative assistants, project associates, coordinators, community associates and assistants, community service aides, research associates, welfare service workers, child care workers and kindred workers.

# Appendix - 2

Department of Parks & Recreation Workforce Composition Summary 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2016 End of Audit Period

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 20					RVICES	PAGE: REPORT: EB	213 EPR210
EEO JOB GROUP : 001 ADMIN		MALE	N AM IND UN S ALASK KNO	WN WHITE BLA	FEMALE ASIAN ACK HISPN PACIS	AM IND UN- ALASK KNOWN	TOTAL OTHER EMP
94312 COMMISSIONER OF PARKS AND 95833 COUNSEL (DEPARTMENT OF PAR 95861 DEPUTY COMMISSIONER (PARKS	0 1 1 0 2 0	0 0 0		0 0 0 0 0 1	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0	0 1 0 1 0 3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	60.00 20.00	0.00 0.0	0 0.00 0.	0 20.00 0.	.00 0.00 0.00	0.00 0.00	$\begin{smallmatrix}&&0\\0.00&100.00\end{smallmatrix}$
EEO JOB GROUP : 002 MANAG		MATE			FEMALE		
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION		ASIA HISPN PACI	N AM IND UN S ALASK KNO	WN WHITE BL	ASIAN ACK HISPN PACIS	AM IND UN- ALASK KNOWN	TOTAL OTHER EMP
05146 DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL JOINT 05306 PARK BOROUGH COMMISSIONER 05387 DEPUTY BOROUGH COMMISSIONE 06179 DIRECTOR OF NEIGHBORHOOD P 06362 BOROUGH DIRECTOR OF RECREA 06364 DEPUTY CHIEF OF OPERATIONS 10004 ADMINISTRATIVE ARCHITECT 10015 ADMINISTRATIVE ENGINEER 10027 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMUNITY R 10023 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMUNITY R 10026 ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGER 10026 ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGER 10026 ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 10033 ADMINISTRATIVE SUPERVISOR 10050 COMPUTER SYSTEMS MANAGER 10053 ADMINISTRATIVE CITY PLANNE 10071 ADMINISTRATIVE HORTICULTUR 10072 ADMINISTRATIVE HORTICULTUR 10074 COMPUTER OPERATIONS MANAGE 13200 ASSISTANT TO THE COMMISSIO 34201 CONSTRUCTION PROJECT MANAG 13200 ASSISTANT TO THE COMMISSIO 34202 CONSTRUCTION PROJECT MANAG 60416 DIRECTOR OF PUPPETRY 81660 SUPERVISING DOCKMASTER 81665 CHIEF DOCKMASTER 81665 CHIEF DOCKMASTER 81665 CHIEF DOCKMASTER 81665 CHIEF DOCKMASTER 82950 AGENCY CHIEF CONTRACTING O 82991 ADMINISTRATIVE PROJECT MANA 95005 EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL 95827 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER (PA 95828 ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER (PA	0 1 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 2 0 0 1 2 0 0 1 2 0 0 1 2 0 1 2 0 1 2 0 1 1 2 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0		1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	0 9 0 2 0 1 0 2 0 0 1 0 2 0 0 1 0 2 0 0 1 0 0 1 0 0 1 0 0 1 0 0 2 0 0 0 1 0 0 2 0 0 0 1 0 0 2 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0	1 0 0 0 0 1 0		0 33 0 4 0 1

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 20	CITYWID	WORK FOR	NT OF CITYWII PLOYMENT DATA CE COMPOSITIC ARTMENT OF PA	BASE SYST N SUMMARY	CEEDS)	VICES		PAGE: REPORT:		214 PR210
95834 DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY INVO 95836 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT TO THE 95838 DIRECTOR OF URBAN PARK RAN	1 0 0	0 0 0 0 1 0		000	0 0 1 0 0 0		000	0 0 0	000	0 1 0 1 0 1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	131 41.07 12.0	1 23 5 7.21	16 5.02 0.63	0.00	67 18 21.00 5.64	3 13 4 4.08	2.19	0.31 0	.00	$\begin{smallmatrix}&&&&319\\0.00&100.00\end{smallmatrix}$

#### AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTMENT OF PARKS & RECREATION EEO JOB GROUP : 003 MANAGEMENT SPECIALISTS

			MAL						FEM					
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	AM IND ALASK		WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK		OTHER	TOTAL EMP
06316 INVESTIGATOR (DISCIPLINE) 1002A ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 1002C ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 1002C ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 1002E ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 1202E ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 12626 STAFF ANALYST 12627 ASSOCIATE STAFF ANALYST 13368 LABOR RELATIONS ANALYST 13368 LABOR RELATIONS ANALYST 13368 LABOR RELATIONS ANALYST 1368 LABOR RELATIONS ANALYST 1368 SASOCIATE LABOR RELATIONS 22426 PROJECT MANAGER 22427 ASSOCIATE PROJECT MANAGER 31622 INSPECTOR (CONSTRUCTION) 34172 QUALITY ASSURANCE SPECIALI 34190 ASSOCIATE QUALITY ASSURANC 40510 ACCOUNTANT 60216 PUBLIC RECORDS OFFICER	19 219 3322 17 02 17 01 012	11410124105711101	1 7 1 0 3 1 0 1 0 0 7 0 0 1 0 0 0	0 19 12 33 0 10 22 12 0 10 00	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	0 45 7 3 2 7 1 0 1 0 0 1 0 0	2 4 19 4 0 8 4 3 0 0 2 1 0 0 1 0 0	1 3 18 2 0 5 0 1 0 1 0 3 0 0 1 0 0	0 393 0 10 0 0 0 4 0 10 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0			6 288 1322 288 277 144 222 51 122 644 12 644 12 53 12 12 64 13 3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	76 21.05	8.59	23 6.37	35 9.70	0.00	0.55	86 23.82		35 9.70	23 6.37	0.55	0.00	0.00	361 100.00

#### AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTMENT OF PARKS & RECREATION EEO JOB GROUP : 004 SCIENCE PROFESSIONALS

				MAI	E					FEM	ALE				
	TITLE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS		UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
	ADMINISTRATIVE ENGINEER (N	1	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
	ADMINISTRATIVE LANDSCAPE A	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
13611	COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (TECHNI	0	2	2	1	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	7
13621	COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (OPERAT	4	2	3	3	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	14
13631	COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (SOFTWA	12	3	4	6	0	0	5	1	2	0	0	0	0	33
13632	COMPUTER SPECIALIST (SOFTW	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
13643	CERTIFIED IT DEVELOPER (AP	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
13644	CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	3
13651	COMPUTER PROGRAMMER ANALYS	2	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	4
20202	CIVIL ENGINEERING INTERN	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1
20210	ASSISTANT CIVIL ENGINEER	3	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	5
20215	CIVIL ENGINEER	1	0	0	1	Ō	0	0	0	0	1	0	Ō	Ō	3

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 N RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 201	IEW YORK CITY CITYWIDE .6 AGENCY	DEPARTME EQUAL EM WORK FOR 846 DEP	NT OF C PLOYMEN CE COMP( ARTMENT	ITYWIDE F DATABA DSITION OF PARK	ADMINI SE SYS SUMMAR (S & RE)	STRATIVI TEM (CEI Y CREATION	E SERVI( EDS) 1	CES		PAG REPOR	E: T: EBI	215 SPR210	
20247 TELECOMMUNICATIONS ASSOCIA 20310 ASSISTANT ELECTRICAL ENGIN 20410 ASSISTANT MECHANICAL ENGIN 20415 MECHANICAL ENGINEER 20616 ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEERING 20617 ASSISTANT ENVIRONMENTAL EN 20618 ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEER 21015 SURVEYOR 21210 ASSISTANT ARCHITECT 21306 LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURAL IN 21310 ASSISTANT LANDSCAPE ARCHIT 21315 LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT 21744 CITY RESEARCH SCIENTIST (A 60910 RESEARCH ASSISTANT 81361 FORESTER	3 1 2 3 11 39 0 1 31	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	2	1		4	000000000000000000000000000000000000000		0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	12 463211846710639 59
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	125 28 41.67 9.33	15 5.00	31 10.33	0.67	0.33	69 23.00	8 2.67	2.33 <sup>7</sup>	4.67	0.00	0.00	0.00	300 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 005 HEALT	H PROFESSIONA	S						FFM	7 T E				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLAC	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
50410 NUTRITIONIST	0	0 (	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	0.00 0.0	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 006 SOCIA	L SCIENTISTS							FFM	ALE				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION													
1003A ADMINISTRATIVE LANDMARKS P 1005A ADMINISTRATIVE CITY PLANNE 22092 ASSISTANT URBAN DESIGNER 22122 CITY PLANNER 22124 ASSOCIATE URBAN DESIGNER 92237 LANDMARKS PRESERVATIONIST	1 1 6 4 1	0 0 0 0 0 0 1 1 0 1 0 0	0 1 0 1 1 0	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	0 0 0 0 0	0 0 7 3 1	0 0 1 0 0	0 0 0 0 0 0	0 0 1 0 2	0 0 0 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0	1 2 1 18 9 4
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	40.00 2.8					31.43			3	0	0	0	35 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 007 SOCIA	L WORKERS												
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLAC	K HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 N RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 201	EW YORK CITY CITYWIDE .6 AGENCY	WORK FOR	CE COMP	OSTITION	SUMMAR	Ŷ		CES		PAG REPOR	E: T: EB	216 EPR210	
06070 RECREATION SPECIALIST (DPR 60430 RECREATION DIRECTOR 60440 RECREATION SUPERVISOR	$     18 40 \\     7 12 \\     16 26 $	22 1 9	10 0 2	000	2 0 0	18 1 17	25 7 31	17 1 14	5 0 1	000	5 0 0	0000	162 30 116
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	41 79 13.31 25.69	32 10.39	12 3.90	0.00	0.65	36 11.69	63 20.45	32 10.39	6 1.95	0.00	1.62 5	0.00	308 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPART EEO JOB GROUP : 008 LAWYEF	0.0							FEM	ALE				
CODE DESCRIPTION		HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
30087 AGENCY ATTORNEY	4	0 0	1	0	1	5	2	0	1	0	0	0	14
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	28.58 0.0	0.00	7.14	0.00	7.14	5 35.71	2 14.29	0.00	7.14	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 009 PUBLIC	PELATIONS							DEM					
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLAC	K HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
60414 PUPPETEER 90635 SENIOR PHOTOGRAPHER	2 0	0 0 1 1	0	0	0	l	0	0	0	0	0	0	3 2
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	40.00 20.0	1 20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 010 TECHN	TCTANE							EPM	17 F				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLAC	K HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	OTHER	
13615 COMPUTER SERVICE TECHNICIA 13616 SUPERVISING COMPUTER SERVI 13620 COMPUTER AIDE 20113 ENGINEERING TECHNICIAN 22121 CITY PLANNING TECHNICIAN	0 3 3 1 0	0 0 0 1 3 1 1 0 0 0	1 0 1 0 0	0 0 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0	0 0 1 0 0	0	0	0	0 0 0 0 0	0 0 0 0 0	00000	1 4 11 2
FEO JOB GROUP TOTAL	7 35.00 20.0	4 2	2	0.00	0.00	5.00	10.00 <sup>2</sup>	5.00	5.00	0.00	0.00		100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 012 CLERI	CAL SUPERVISO	RS											
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLAC	K HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM INI ALASK	UN - KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM INE ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 NEW RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 2016		ORN FORC	E COME	DITION	DOLUNUTO'	L :		CES		PAG REPOR	E: T: EB	217 EPR210	
10124 PRINCIPAL ADMINISTRATIVE A	12 3	2	2	0	0	24	15	6	1	0	0	0	65
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL: 1	$     \begin{array}{ccc}       12 & 3 \\       8.45 & 4.62     \end{array}   $	2 3.08	2 3.08	0.00	0.00	24 36.92	15 23.08	6 9.23	1.54	0.00	0.00	0.00	65 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTME EEO JOB GROUP : 013 CLERICAL	NT OF PARKS	& RECREA	TION					(December 1)					
EEO JOB GROUP : 013 CLERICAL TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION W	HITE BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ALE ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
10250 CLERICAL AIDE 10251 CLERICAL ASSOCIATE 10252 SECRETARY 12200 STOCK WORKER 12202 SUPERVISOR OF STOCK WORKER	$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	0 5 0 1 0	01000	000000	000000	0 16 0 0	2 44 1 0	15 0 0 0	03000	010000	00	000000	3 97 1 1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:		6 5.83	0.97				45.63		2.91	1	0.00	0.00	103 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTME EEO JOB GROUP : 018 POLICE								TOTOM	ATP				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
60421 URBAN PARK RANGER 60422 ASSOCIATE URBAN PARK RANGE	38 44 11 7	41 9	11 1	1 0	2 0	21 8	31 9	23 10	4 0	0 0	1	0	217 55
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	49 51 18.01 18.75	50 18.38	12 4.41	0.37	0.74	29 10.66	40 14.71	33 12.13	1.47	0.00	0.37	0.00	
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTM EEO JOB GROUP : 019 GUARDS	ENT OF PARKS	& RECRE.	ATION										
EEO JOB GROUP : 019 GUARDS TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
71205 LIFEGUARD 71210 CHIEF LIFEGUARD	5 6 4 4	20 15	1	0	0	1	0 0	3	0 0	0 0	0 0	0	36 28
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	9 10 14.05 15.63	35 54.69	1.56	0.00	3.13 <sup>2</sup>	3.13 <sup>2</sup>	0.00	7.81	0.00	0.00	0.00		
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTM EEO JOB GROUP : 022 BUILDING	C SERVICES												
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 NE RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 2016	The second se	OUV LOUC	E COMPC	TYWIDE DATABA SITION OF PARK	SOUMAU	a construction of the second		CES		PAG REPOR	E: T: EBH	218 SPR210	
90510 EXTERMINATOR	0 1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	$\begin{smallmatrix}&&0\\0.00&100.00\end{smallmatrix}$	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
EEO JOB GROUP : 023 PERSONA	MENT OF PARKS												
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL
	14 33	19	1	0	0	9	24	17	1	1	2	0	121
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	$11.57 \begin{array}{c} 14 \\ 27.27 \end{array}$	19 15.70	0.83	0.00	0.00	9 7.44	24 19.83	17 14.05	0.83	0.83	2 1.65	0.00	121 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTM EEO JOB GROUP : 024 FARMING	3												
CODE DESCRIPTION		HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN					AM IND ALASK			TOTAL EMP
81105 *PARK SERVICE WORKER 81106 ASSOCIATE PARK SERVICE WOR 81111 PARK SUPERVISOR 81112 *PRINCIPAL PARK SUPERVISOR 81303 CLIMBER AND PRUNER 81307 COOP ED TRAINEE SEASONAL P 81310 GARDENER 90641 CITY PARK WORKER	$ \begin{array}{cccc} 0 & 0 \\ 83 & 129 \\ 112 & 53 \\ 2 & 0 \\ 66 & 200 \end{array} $	1 69 39 0 17 0 33	0 8 4 0	01100001	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	0 20 0 1 0 16 25	0 36 18 0 1 0 19 105	0 12 12 0 0 16 63	0020020	0 1 0 0 0 0 1 1	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	1 342 261 2 117 1 48 784
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	413 515 24.95 31.10	322 19.44	37 2.23	0.18	9 0.54	65 3.93	179 10.81	103 6.22	0.24	0.18	3 0.18	0.00	1656 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPARTY EEO JOB GROUP : 025 CRAFT													
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN-					AM IND ALASK		OTHER	TOTAL EMP
90698 MAINTENANCE WORKER 90774 SUPERVISOR OF MECHANICS 91638 SENIOR STATIONARY ENGINEER 91644 STATIONARY ENGINEER 9177 ELECTRICIAN 91830 PAINTER 91873 SUPERVISOR PAINTER 91915 PLUMBER 91925 STEAM FITTER 91972 SUPERVISOR PLUMBER 92005 CARPENTER		19 0 0 3 2 0 1 0	3 0 1 2 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0			1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0							81 6 2 45 30 17 26 5 3 25

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 N RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR 201	IEW YORK CITY I CITYWIDE I .6 AGENCY	DEPARTMENT C EQUAL EMPLOY WORK FORCE C 346 DEPARTM	F CITYWIDE MENT DATAB OMPOSITION ENT OF PAR	ADMINI ASE SYS SUMMAR KS & RE	STRATIVE FEM (CEE Y CREATION	E SERVIC EDS) N	CES		PAG REPOR	E: T: EBI	219 SPR210	
92071 SUPERVISOR CARPENTER 92210 CEMENT MASON 92235 PLASTERER 92305 BLACKSMITH 92340 SHEET METAL WORKER 92508 AUTOMOTIVE SERVICE WORKER 92510 AUTO MECHANIC 92511 AUTO MECHANIC (DIESEL) 92575 SUPERVISOR OF MECHANICS (M 92587 MARINE MAINTENANCE MECHANI 92590 TELEPHONE SERVICE TECHNICI 92610 MACHINIST	3 0 7 0 12 0 4 0 7 1 1 3 3 0 1 0 3 3 0 3 0	001113111000	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0			000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000		000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000		3 72 13 6 8 10 6 4 25 3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	243 27 75.70 8.41	37 11.53 3	11 1 43 0.31	0.00	0.31	0.31	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	321 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 026 OPERA	TORS											
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	HISPN PAG	AN AM INE CIS ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
91825 LETTERER AND SIGN PAINTER	1 0	0	0 0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	100.00 0.00	0.00 0	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 028 LABOR	TMENT OF PARKS ERS	& RECREATI	N				DEM	ALE				
EEO JOB GROUP : 028 LABOR TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACK	AS HISDN DA	IAN AM INI	UN-	WHITE	BLACK	HTSPN	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	OTHER	TOTAL
80633 JOB TRAINING PARTICIPANT_( 91406 CITY SEASONAL AIDE 91916 PLUMBER'S HELPER 91926 STEAM FITTER'S HELPER	27 466 1 39 3 1 0 2	111 13 0 1	11 5 0 0 0 0 0 0	38 0 0 0	34 2 0 0	1221 46 0	305 20 0	16 2 0	10 10 0 0	57 1 0 0	6 0 0	2307 125 4 3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	31 508 1.24 20.83	125 5.13 0	11 5 .45 0.21	38 1.56	36 1.48	1267 51.95	325 13.33	0.18	0.45	58 2.38	6 0.25	2439 100.00
AGENCY CODE : 846 DEPAR EEO JOB GROUP : 031 PARA	TMENT OF PARKS PROFESSIONAL C	& RECREATI	NC				PPM	ALE				
EEO JOB GROUP : 031 PARA TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE BLACH	AS HISPN PA	IAN AM IN CIS ALASK	D UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN - KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
52406 COMMUNITY SERVICE AIDE 56056 COMMUNITY ASSISTANT 56057 COMMUNITY ASSOCIATE 56058 COMMUNITY COORDINATOR	0 ( 1 35 25 51 28	0 0 1 13 23	0 0 0 0 6 0 6 0	0000	0 0 43 45	1 4 56 49	1 1 40 35	0 1 8 13	0 0 1 0	0 0 2 0	0 0 0 0	2 11 235 250

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 08:37:43.4 QUARTER 2 YEAR		EQUAL EMPL WORK FORCE	OYMENT DATABA	ADMINISTRATIV ASE SYSTEM (CE SUMMARY KS & RECREATIC	EDS)		PAGE: REPORT: EI	220 BEPR210
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	87 5 17.48 11.2	6 37 4 7.43	$\begin{smallmatrix}&12\\2.41&0.00\end{smallmatrix}$	6 88 1.20 17.67	110 77 22.09 15.46	22 4.42	0.20 0.40	$\begin{smallmatrix}&&&&&\\0.00&100.00\end{smallmatrix}$
AGENCY TOTAL:	1264 140 18.30 20.2	1 731 8 10.58	188 14 2.72 0.20	63 548 0.91 7.93	1825 670 26.41 9.70	108 1.56	20 71 0.29 1.03	6 6909 0.09 100.00

# Appendix - 3

Department of Parks & Recreation Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2013 Start of Audit Period

RUN DATE: 04/01/13 RUN TIME: 8:19:42 FY2013 Q3 AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:	846 DEPARTI ETH ETHNIC			AT TH	IE AGENCY,	DEPARTME S S Y O WITH IN JOBGROUP	NT OF PE S T E M TERNAL & LEVEL	PERSONS	WITH MI	EX SSING EE -OFF FOR	DATA I	NCLUDED	IN CNTS
JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	WHITE OBSRV	EXPCT I	BLACK OBSRV	EXPCT I	HISPANI OBSRV E	C XPCT I	ASIAN / OBSRV E	XPCT I	NATIVE A OBSRV E	A XPCT I	ETH UNK OBSRV E	
001 ADMINISTRATORS 002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 005 HEALTH PROFNS 006 SOCIAL SCI 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 019 GUARDS 022 BUILD SERV 023 PERSONAL SERV 024 FARMING 025 CRAFT 026 OPERATORS 028 LABORERS 031 FARA PROFESSION	6 285 277 204 2 399 354 10 7 27 85 136 199 48 2 128 1778 312 2 3186 N 305	$\begin{array}{c} 5\\ 183\\ 132\\ 27\\ 95\\ 5\\ 11\\ 40\\ 28\\ 63\\ 10\\ 0\\ 15\\ 528\\ 234\\ 234\\ 116\\ 114\\ \end{array}$	4 N 146 O 115 O 94 O 1 N 23 66 O 7 U 4 N 10 21 O 31 0 N 39 U 609 N 118 N 986 U 110	1 50 72 17 0 3 153 1 5 3 15 3 1 5 7 7 6 6 7 2 6 3 7 39 34 0 2262 106	1 N 60 86 <b>38</b> U <b>7 U</b> <b>211 U</b> 1 N <b>211 U</b> 9 <b>43</b> U 67 <b>25</b> U 1 N 37 O <b>999 U</b> 1005 O 87 O	0 29 27 21 62 0 13 34 62 26 0 439 33 0 616 70	1 N 38 N 36 N 21 N 40 50 1 D 50 1 D 13 21 O 43 O 447 39 N 715 N 69	0 20 45 26 0 7 30 5 5 1 7 1 0 8 44 10 0 29 14	0 N 24 33 N 43 U 0 N 4 1 N 2 9 U 8 0 N 1 N 69 N 20 N 245 U 25 N	0 1 0 2 0 0 1 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 1 7 0 0 1 4 0	0 N 1 N 10 N 00 N 10 N 00 N 10 N 00 N 10 N 00 N 10 N 1	0 2 1 0 13 2 0 0 0 2 1 4 0 2 1 4 0 1 49 1	0 N 17 U 8 N 0 N 1 N 4 N 0 N 1 N 4 0 0 N 3 N 7 N 2 N 2 N 34 U 34 U 202 N 11 N

RUN DATE:	04/01/13
RUN TIME:	8:19:42
FY2013 Q3	

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL C E E D S S Y S T E M WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS PAGE: 104 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/30/13

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050

AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:	846 DEPARTN GEN GENDER	MENT OF	PARKS & I	AT THI RECREATIO	E AGENCY/ DN	JOBGROUP LEVEL
JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	MALE OBSRV	EXPCT I	FEMALE OBSRV J	EXPCT I	GENDER U OBSRV EXPCT I
001 ADMINISTRATORS 002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 005 HEALTH PROFNS 006 SOCIAL SCI 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 018 POLICE 019 GUARDS 022 BUILD SERV 023 PERSONAL SERV 024 FARMING 025 CRAFT 026 OPERATORS 028 LABORERS 031 PARA PROFESSIO	6 285 277 204 2 39 <b>354</b> 10 7 27 85 136 199 48 2 128 1778 1778 312 2 3186 N 305	$\begin{array}{c} & 4\\ 193\\ 144\\ 135\\ 0\\ 22\\ 181\\ 5\\ 4\\ 20\\ 29\\ 28\\ 110\\ 44\\ 42\\ 68\\ 1401\\ 309\\ 22\\ 1176\\ 6112\\ 119\end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 4 & N \\ 157 & O \\ 159 \\ 135 \\ 0 & N \\ 19 \\ 119 & O \\ 5 \\ 4 & N \\ 16 \\ 19 & O \\ 40 & U \\ 146 & U \\ 22 & O \\ 1 & N \\ 72 \\ 1291 & O \\ 253 & O \\ 253 & O \\ 253 & O \\ 2195 & U \\ 120 \\ \end{array}$	2 92 133 69 2 17 173 5 5 108 89 4 0 60 375 3 0 2005 186	2 N 119 U 114 O 64 20 234 U 5 3 N 11 U 65 U 91 O 52 O 24 U 1 N 56 469 U 30 U 846 O 183	$ \begin{smallmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 9 & N \\ 0 & 4 & N \\ 0 & 5 & N \\ 0 & 0 & N \\ 0 & 1 & N \\ 0 & 4 & N \\ 0 & 1 & N \\ 0 & 2 & N \\ 0 & 0 & N \\ 0 & 1 & N \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & N \\ 0 & 1 & 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & N \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & N \\ 0 & 2 & 0 & N \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & N \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & N \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 1 & N$

# Appendix - 4

Department of Parks & Recreation Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2016 End of Audit Period

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 8:35:10 FY2016 Q2 AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:	846 DEPART ETH ETHNIC			K FORCE	ORK CITY C E E D COMPARED E AGENCY/ ON	S S Y WITH IN	STEM TERNAL &	EXTERNA PERSON	AL POOLS S WITH MI	EX SSING EE -OFF FOR	PROGE TRACT DATA 1		P961 1/15 IN CNTS
JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	WHITE OBSRV	EXPCT I	BLACK OBSRV 1	EXPCT I	HISPANI OBSRV H	IC EXPCT I	ASIAN OBSRV	/ EXPCT I	NATIVE A OBSRV EX	A KPCT I	ETH UNK OBSRV E	
001 ADMINISTRATORS 002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 005 HEALTH PROFNS 006 SOCIAL SCI 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 008 LAWYERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 018 POLICE 019 GUARDS 022 BUILD SERV 023 PERSONAL SERV 024 FARMING 025 CRAFT 026 OPERATORS 028 LABORERS 031 PARA PROFESSIO	5 319 361 300 1 35 308 14 5 20 65 103 272 272 64 1 121 1656 321 1656 321 1656 321 1859 N 498	4 198 162 194 1 25 77 9 3 8 36 18 78 11 0 23 478 244 478 244 1 67	3 N 164 O 148 137 O 22 49 O 8 N 7 15 O 19 113 U 13 U 13 U 533 N 119 O 641 U 162	1 59 79 36 2 142 2 1 6 58 91 57 694 28 0 1775 166	1 N 60 107 U 53 U 0 N 6 U 193 U 2 1 N 77 37 U 55 83 31 U 0 N 524 0 103 U 0 N 524 0 103 U 0 N 531 0 103 0 10 103 0 10 103 0 10 10 10 1	0 36 58 22 0 2 64 61 3 82 83 40 36 425 37 0 450 114	1 N 41 47 31 N 3 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 47 1 N 553 N 553 N	0 23 58 45 0 6 18 2 0 3 3 4 16 1 0 2 41 11 11 11 29 34	1 N 32 N 47 68 U 0 N 3 16 1 N 2 N 13 3 N 11 U 82 N 220 U 48 N	0 32 20 00 00 00 11 10 00 16 10	0 N 1 N 0 N 1 N 0	0 2 1 0 0 7 1 0 0 0 3 2 0 0 2 12 0 0 102 8	0 N 13 N 7 N 9 N 0 N 1 N 2 N 0 N 2 N 2 N 2 N 2 N 32 U 32 U 32 U 32 U 1 30 N 13 N

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 8:35:10 FY2016 Q2 AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:	846 DEPARTM GEN GENDER	IENT OF	WO PARKS &	NEW YC RK FORCE AT THE RECREATIC	DRK CITY C E E D COMPARED AGENCY/ DN	DEPARTME S S Y WITH IN JOBGROUP	NT OF PE S T E M TERNAL & LEVEL	RSONNEL EXTERNAL POOLS PERSONS WITH MI PROBABILITY CUT
JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	MALE OBSRV	EXPCT I	FEMALE OBSRV H	EXPCT I	GENDER OBSRV E	U XPCT I	
JOB GROUP 001 ADMINISTRATORS 002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 005 HEALTH PROFNS 006 SOCIAL SCI 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 008 LAWYERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL SUPS 014 POLICE 019 GUARDS 022 BUILD SERV 023 PERSONAL SERV 023 PERSONAL SERV 024 FARMING 025 CRAFT 026 OPERATORS 028 LABORERS 031 PARA PROFESSION	5 319 361 300 1 35 308 14 5 20 65 103 272 64 1 121 1656 321 124 39 498	4 213 167 202 0 200 166 4 15 57 19 200 165 57 17 1299 319 1718 198	3 N 171 O 206 U 198 N 17 O 99 O 3 N 12 14 U 202 U 29 O 154 O 260 O 1654 O 1654 O 1654 U 260 O 1616 U 189	106 194 98 15 142 8 1 5 46 83 107 7 0 54 357 20 1715 300	2 N 134 U 146 0 94 1 N 17 U 7 U 7 U 70 0 70 0 70 0 70 0 33 U 0 N 490 U 32 U 0 N 575 0 289	OBSRV E 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	0 N 6 N 5 N 6 N 1 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0	

 PAGE:
 104

 PROGRAM:
 EBPPP961

 ERNAL POOLS
 EXTRACT DATE:
 12/31/15

 GONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS

 BABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE:
 .050



lyana Y. Titus, Esq. Assistant Commissioner Equal Employment Opportunity

T 212.360.2707 F 917.849,6657 Eiyana.titus@parks.nyc.gov

#### City of New York Parks & Recreation

Arsenal North 1234 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10029 www.nyc.gov/parks

April 22, 2016

Charise Terry Executive Director, Equal Employment Practices Commission 253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, New York 10007

Dear Ms. Terry:

This letter is in response to your letter dated April 8, 2016 concerning your agency's preliminary determination of the Department of Parks & Recreation's (DPR) employment practices and procedures. In your letter, six areas of corrective action were identified. Below is DPR's response to those six areas of correction.

## Corrective Action #1

Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, review and update listing of recruitment outreach sources and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may other wise use discretion in hiring.

### Parks Response

Parks has begun to conduct adverse impact analyses (please see attached) and will continue to use the CEEDs report to identify underutilized groups. Further analyses will be conducted as positions become available in titles that have been identified as underutilized. It should also be noted that the Agency has taken measures to update and identify new recruitment sources.

#### Corrective Action #2

Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions and separations by race/ethnicity and gender) the annual number of EEO complaints and identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

### Parks Response

The agency has scheduled a meeting with the General Counsel, the HR Professional and the EEO Professional for April 28, 2016 to discuss the agency's workforce data and review EEO complaints from the last three quarters.

### Corrective Action #3

Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

#### Parks Response

Parks has begun to conduct adverse impact analyses (please see attached) and will continue to use the CEEDs report to identify underutilized groups. When adverse impact is identified, selection criteria will be examined and modified if necessary.

## Corrective Action #4

If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

#### Parks Response

Parks has already identified a wide variety of recruitment sources to attract women, minorities and other protected groups. Adverse impact studies, such as the one attached, will be used to direct recruitment to underutilized groups when identified.

#### Corrective Action #5

If women and minorities or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority or female oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

#### Parks Response

Parks will conduct an adverse impact study for the Park Supervisor civil service list, which is currently in use, to determine if the agency needs to work with DCAS on strategies to address any adverse impact that is discovered. Park Supervisor is part of the Farming job group, in which an underutilization of females was indicated in a recent CEEDs report.

## Corrective Action #6

Ensure that all EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

## Parks Response

The EEO Office has scheduled its next meeting with its EEO counselors for June 9, 2016. During that meeting, DPR will provide in house training on anti- discrimination laws and the EEO counselor's role and responsibilities.

**Respectfully Submitted** 

Iyana Ý. Titus, Esq. Assistant Commissioner for EEO

CC: Mitchell Silver, FAICP



Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

Marie Giraud, Esq. Agency Attorney/ Director of Compliance Monitoring

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

## BY MAIL AND EMAIL

May 5, 2016

Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP Commissioner Department of Parks & Recreation 830 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10065

RE: Final Determination **#2016/846**: Pursuant to the Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Department of Parks & Recreation's Employment Practices and Procedures from January 1, 2013 to December 31, 2015.

Dear Commissioner Silver:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you for your April 22, 2016 response to our April 8, 2016 Preliminary Determination and for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit.

As indicated in our Preliminary Determination, this Commission has adopted uniform standards<sup>1</sup> to assess agencies' employment practices and programs for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. The attached Determination contains the Commission's findings and required corrective actions pertaining to the referenced review, evaluation and monitoring of your agency's employment practices and procedures.

Chapter 36, Section 832.c of the New York City Charter requires that: 1) the EEPC assign a 6-month compliance period to monitor your agency's efforts to eliminate remaining required corrective actions; and 2) the agency provide a written response within 30 days from the date of this letter indicating corrective action taken.

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code, §§8-107.1(a) and 8-107.13(d)); New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7) and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter.



## The assigned compliance-monitoring period is: June 2016 to November 2016.

If corrective actions remain: Your agency's response should indicate what steps your agency has taken, or will take, to implement the corrective actions during the designated period. Documentation which supports the implementation of each corrective action shall be uploaded to TeamCentral, the EEPC's Automated Compliance-Monitoring System. Your agency will be monitored monthly until all corrective actions have been implemented. Instruction on how to access and navigate TeamCentral is attached. Upon your agency's completion of the final corrective action, this Commission requires that your agency upload a final memorandum signed by the agency head which informs employees of the changes implemented pursuant to our audit and re-emphasizes commitment to the EEO program. Upon receipt of the final memorandum, the EEPC will issue a *Determination of Compliance*.

If no corrective actions remain: Your agency is exempt from the aforementioned monitoring period. However, this Commission requires a final memorandum signed by the agency head which informs employees of the changes implemented pursuant to our audit and re-emphasizes commitment to the EEO program. This will be considered your agency's final action. Upon receipt of the memo, a *Determination of Compliance* will be issued.

If there are further questions regarding this Final Determination or the compliance-monitoring process, please have the Principal EEO Professional call Marie Giraud, Esq., Agency Attorney/Director of Compliance Monitoring at 212-615-8942.

Thank you and your staff for your continued cooperation.

Sincerely,

Charise Arerry, PHR Executive Director

c: Iyana Titus, Principal EEO Professional



Agency: Department of Parks & Recreation Compliance-Monitoring Period: June 2016 – November 2016

## FINAL DETERMINATION

Agency response indicating corrective action taken with documentation is due within 30 days.

The Equal Employment Practices Commission's findings and required corrective actions are based on the audit methodology which includes collection and analysis of the documents, records and data the agency provided in response to the *EEPC Document and Information Request Form*; the *EEPC Interview Questionnaires* for EEO professionals and others involved in EEO program administration; and, if applicable, the *EEPC Employee Survey*; the *EEPC Supervisor/Manager Survey*; the agency's *Annual EEO Plans* and *Quarterly EEO Reports*; and workforce and utilization data from the *Citywide Equal Employment Database System*. Additional research and follow-up discussions or interviews were conducted as appropriate.

After reviewing the agency's optional response (if applicable) to the EEPC's preliminary Determination, our Final Determination is as follows:

## **Monitoring Required**

The agency's implementation of the following required corrective actions will be monitored during the assigned compliance monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #1

Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

<u>Agency Response:</u> Parks has begun to conduct adverse impact analyses (please see attached) and will continue to use the CEEDs report to identify underutilized groups. Further analyses will be conducted as positions become available in titles that have been identified as underutilized. It should also be noted that the Agency has taken measures to update and identify new recruitment sources. (Response, Pg. 1)

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's efforts to implement corrective action **#1**. An agency assessment of its recruitment efforts will be required during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

## Corrective Action #2

Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

**Final Determination** 



<u>Agency Response</u>: The agency has scheduled a meeting with the General Counsel, the HR Professional and the EEO Professional for April 28, 2016 to discuss the agency's workforce data and review EEO complaints from the last three quarters. (Response, Pg. 1)

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement corrective action **#2**. A review of the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs will be required during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

## Corrective Action #3

Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

<u>Agency Response</u>: Parks has begun to conduct adverse impact analyses [...] and will continue to use the CEEDs report to identify underutilized groups. When adverse impact is identified, selection criteria will be examined and modified if necessary. (Response, Pg. 2)

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's efforts to implement corrective action **#3**. An agency assessment of the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group will be required during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

## Corrective Action #4

If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

<u>Agency Response</u>: Parks has already identified a wide variety of recruitment sources to attract women, minorities and other protected groups. Adverse impact studies, such as the one attached, will be used to direct recruitment to underutilized groups when identified. (Response, Pg. 2)

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's efforts to address corrective action **#4**. The agency's efforts to address the underrepresentation of protected groups in titles where there is discretion in hiring will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

## Corrective Action #5

If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and



notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, jobrelated and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

<u>Agency Response</u>: Parks will conduct an adverse impact study for the Park Supervisor civil service list, which is currently in use, to determine if the agency needs to work with DCAS on strategies to address any adverse impact that is discovered. Park Supervisor is part of the Farming job group, in which an underutilization of females was indicated in a recent CEEDs report. (Response, Pg. 2)

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement corrective action **#5**. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

## Corrective Action #6

Ensure that all EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

<u>Agency Response</u>: The EEO Office has scheduled its next meeting with its EEO counselors for June 9, 2016. During that meeting, DPR will provide in house training on anti-discrimination laws and the EEO counselor's role and responsibilities. (Response, Pg. 3)

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement corrective action **#6**. Documentation which verifies implementation will be reviewed during the compliancemonitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliancemonitoring period.

Thank you and your staff for your continued cooperation.

## EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES COMMISSION CITY OF NEW YORK

**RESOLUTION #2016/846:** Final Determination pursuant to the Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Department of Parks & Recreation's Employment Practices and Procedures from January 1, 2013 through December 31, 2015.

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2) and (5) of the New York City Charter, the Equal Employment Practices Commission is authorized to audit and evaluate the employment practices, programs, policies, and procedures of city agencies and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women, and to make recommendations to city agencies to insure equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women; and

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2), this Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits* and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; and

Whereas, pursuant to its audit of the Department of Parks & Recreation (DPR) EEO Program, the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) issued a Preliminary Determination letter, dated April 8, 2016, setting forth findings and the following required corrective actions:

- Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
- 2. Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.
- 3. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

- 4. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 5. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- Ensure that all EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

Whereas, the agency submitted its response to the EEPC's Preliminary Determination letter, on April 22, 2016; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC considered the agency's response and issued a Final Determination on May 5, 2016 which agreed and indicated that corrective action(s) nos., 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6 require compliance monitoring; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832 (c) of the City Charter, the EEPC is required to monitor the agency for a period not to exceed six months, from June 2016 through November 2016, to determine whether it implemented remaining required corrective actions; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832 (c) of the City Charter, the agency is required to respond in 30 days and make monthly reports thereafter to the Commission on the progress of implementation of such corrective actions; and

Whereas, all of the EEPC's corrective actions are required by, or are consistent with, federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; Now Therefore,

Be It Resolved, that the Commission will forward this Final Determination to the Commissioner of the Department of Parks & Recreation.

Approved unanimously on May 5, 2016.

Angela Cabrera Commissioner Absent Malini Cadambi Daniel Commissioner Arva Rice Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Commissioner Commissioner



T 212.360.2707 F 917.849.6657 City of New York Parks & Recreation

Arsenal North 1234 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10029 www.nyc.gov/parks

May 31, 2016

Ms. Charise Terry, PHR Executive Director Equal Employment Practices Commission 253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, New York 10007

Dear Ms. Terry:

This letter is in response to your letter dated May 5, 2016 concerning your agency's final determination of the Department of Parks & Recreation's (DPR) employment practices and procedures. In your letter, monitoring was required and six areas of corrective action were identified. Below is DPR's updated response to those six areas of correction.

#### **Corrective Action #1**

Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, review and update listing of recruitment outreach sources and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may other wise use discretion in hiring.

#### Parks Response

DPR will continue to conduct adverse impact analyses and it will utilize the CEEDs report to identify underutilized groups. In addition, DPR will continue to identify and update new recruitment sources. Recently DPR identified new recruitment sources for senior management positions recently posted.

#### **Corrective Action #2**

Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions and separations by race/ethnicity and gender) the annual number of EEO complaints and identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

#### Parks Response

The General Counsel, the HR Professional and the EEO Professional met on April 28, 2016. Topics addressed in that meeting included the following: an overview of the EEPC's findings, an overview of discriminations complaints during the fiscal year, utilization data/ adverse impact analysis and strategies to address sexual harassment issues. In addition, the General Counsel has begun attending the EEO/Personnel/Labor Relations/Disciplinary meetings on a bi-weekly basis.

1

## Corrective Action #3

Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

## Parks Response

Parks has begun conducting adverse impact analyses and will continue to use the CEEDs report to identify underutilized groups. When adverse impact is identified, selection criteria will be examined and modified if necessary.

## **Corrective Action #4**

If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

## Parks Response

DPR will continue to identify and update recruitment sources to attract women, minorities and other protected groups. Recently, DPR's EEO Office worked with Personnel to identify new recruitment sources for senior management positions that were posted.

In addition to the above, adverse impact analysis will be used to direct recruitment towards underutilized groups when identified.

## Corrective Action #5

If women and minorities or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority or female oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

## Parks Response

Parks will conduct an adverse impact study for the Park Supervisor civil service list, which is currently in use, to determine if the agency needs to work with DCAS on strategies to address any adverse impact that is discovered. Park Supervisor is part of the Farming job group, in which an underutilization of females was indicated in a recent CEEDs report.

## Corrective Action #6

Ensure that all EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

## Parks Response

The EEO Office has scheduled its next meeting with its EEO counselors for June 9, 2016. During that meeting, DPR will provide an in-house training on anti-discrimination laws and explain the EEO counselor's role and responsibilities.

**Respectfully Submitted,** 

Iyana Y. Titus, Esq. Assistant Commissioner for EEO

CC: Mitchell Silver, FAICP



Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP Commissioner

City of New York Parks & Recreation

The Arsenal Central Park New York, NY 10065 www.nyc.gov/parks

То:	All Parks Employees
From:	Commissioner Mitchell Silver
Date:	December 13, 2016
Re:	Equal Employment Practices Commission's (EEPC) Audit Recommendations

The Parks Department recently engaged in a routine compliance audit with the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) about our Agency's compliance with the City, State, and Federal Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) laws, policies, and regulations. While the EEPC found Parks to be in compliance in many areas, the EEPC did make recommendations that will help further the Agency's efforts to diversify and broaden recruitment, and I'd like to share with you actions we've already taken.

- We have assessed our recruitment efforts and determined that it does not adversely
  impact any particular group. In addition, we have reviewed and updated our listing of
  recruitment outreach sources. When provisional positions become available or when the
  agency may otherwise use its discretion in hiring, we will contact these organizations.
- The Assistant Commissioner for EEO, Chief of Personnel and the General Counsel have reviewed the agency's statistical information, the annual number of EEO complaints, and identified whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency. They will continue to meet on an annual basis concerning these matters.
- We have reviewed the manner in which candidates are selected for employment and conducted adverse impact analysis. Although adverse impact of a particular group was not discovered, we have nevertheless reviewed the selection criteria being utilized for certain jobs and determined whether the criteria was still job related.
- When women, minorities or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, we have expanded our outreach and advertised in minority or female oriented publications. We will continue to do this in the future and to the extent possible, participate in career fairs/open houses and use internships to attract interested persons to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- When women, minorities or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service titles we have reviewed the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in the job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for certain positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job related and required by business necessity. When vacancies become available and to the extent possible, we will expand our recruitment



- and advertise in minority or female oriented publications, participate in career fairs or open houses or use internships to attract interested persons to develop and hire interested and gualified candidates.
- We have ensured that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.

Finally, I also wish to reaffirm my commitment to maintaining fair employment practices for all our employees. We are firmly committed to preventing discrimination by ensuring that all employees are aware of their rights and obligations under the EEO policy and by encouraging a work environment that tolerates and appreciates differences among employees. Thank you for your continued hard work and dedication to New York City's open space and public

If you have any questions about EEO policies and regulations or this memo, please contact the EEO Office at (212) 360-2782.

Sincerely,

programming.

und

Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP

# EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES COMMISSION CITY OF NEW YORK

**RESOLUTION #2016/846C-19:** Determination of **Compliance** (Monitoring Period Required) by the Department of Parks and Recreation with the Equal Employment Practices Commission's required corrective actions pursuant to the Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the agency's Employment Practices and Procedures from January 1, 2013 through December 31, 2015.

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2) and (5) of the New York City Charter, the Equal Employment Practices Commission is authorized to audit and evaluate the employment practices, programs, policies, and procedures of city agencies and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women, and to make recommendations to city agencies to insure equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women; and

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2), this Commission has adopted Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits and Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; and

Whereas, pursuant to its audit and analysis of the Department of Parks and Recreation's (DPR) Employment Practices and Procedures, the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) issued a Preliminary Determination letter, dated April 8, 2016, setting forth findings and the following required corrective actions:

- Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
- 2. Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.
- 3. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
- 4. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- 5. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 6. Ensure that all EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

Whereas, DPR submitted its response to the EEPC's Preliminary Determination letter, on April 22, 2016; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC considered the agency's response and issued a Final Determination on May 5, 2016 which indicated that corrective actions Nos. 1 - 6 require compliance monitoring; and

Whereas, DPR submitted its response to the EEPC's Final Determination letter, on May 31, 2016; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC monitored the agency's implementation of the remaining corrective actions from June 2016 – November 2016, with no extension of the monitoring period; and

Whereas, at the EEPC's request pursuant to Section 815.a.(15) of the New York City Charter, DPR submitted a copy of the agency head's memorandum to staff, which outlined the corrective actions implemented in response to the EEPC's audit and reiterated his commitment to the agency's EEO Program; and

Whereas, all of the EEPC's corrective actions are required by, or are consistent with, federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; Now Therefore,

Be It Resolved, that the Department of Parks and Recreation has implemented the required corrective actions deemed necessary to ensure compliance with the equal employment opportunity standards of this Commission and requirements of Chapters 35 and 36 of the City Charter.

**Be It Resolved**, that the Commission will forward this Final Determination to Commissioner Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP of the Department of Parks and Recreation.

Approved unanimously on December 15, 2016.

Commissioner

Angela Cabrera wya Malini Cadambi Daniel Commissioner Commissioner 0 1110 0 0 Arva Rice Elaine S. Reiss, Esq.

Commissioner



Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

## BY MAIL AND EMAIL

December 15, 2016

Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP Commissioner Department of Parks and Recreation 830 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10065

Re: Resolution #2016/846C-19: Determination of Agency Compliance

Dear Commissioner Silver:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC or Commission), I want to inform you that the Commission has issued the attached Determination of Compliance to the Department of Parks and Recreation. This Commission has determined that the Department of Parks and Recreation has implemented the required corrective actions deemed necessary by this Commission for ensuring a fair and effective affirmative employment program of equal opportunity as required by the equal employment opportunity standards of this Commission and Chapters 35 and 36 of the New York City Charter.

On behalf of this Commission, I want to thank you and Principal EEO Professional Iyana Y. Titus, Esq. for the cooperation extended to the EEPC during the compliance-monitoring period.

Sincerely, Etaine S. Reiss, Esa

Commissioner

c: Iyana Y. Titus, Esq., Principal EEO Professional

EEPC EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES

This **Determination of Compliance** 

is issued to the

# Department of Parks and Recreation

for successfully implementing 6 of 6 required corrective actions pursuant to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's Employment Practice and Procedures Audit From January 1, 2013 to this date.

On this 15th day of December in the year 2016,

Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Commissioner

ha

Charise L. Terry, PHR, Executive Director

In care of Commissioner Mitchell J. Silver, FAICP and Principal EEO Professional Iyana Y. Titus, Esq.