August 23, 2017 / Calendar No. 14

C 170382 ZSM

**IN THE MATTER OF** an application submitted by Broome Property Owner JV, LLC pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for additional parking spaces) and Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution to allow an automated accessory parking garage with a maximum capacity of 42 spaces on portions of the ground floor, third floor and the fourth floor of a proposed mixed use building on property located at 100 Varick Street (Block 477, Lots 35, 42, 44, 46, 71-76 and 1001-1005), in an M1-6 District, within the Special Hudson Square District, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 2.

The application for a special permit was filed by Broome Property Owner JV, LLC on April 27, 2017. The requested special permit would facilitate the provision of 42 residential parking spaces within a mixed-use development at 100 Varick Street in the Hudson Square neighborhood of Manhattan, Community District 2.

# **BACKGROUND**

100 Varick Street is an "L"-shaped, 36,697-square-foot zoning which occupies the block bounded by Broome Street to the north, Varick Street to the west, Watts Street to the south, and Avenue of the Americas to the east, (Block 477, Lots 35, 42, 44, 46, 71-76 and 1001-1005) in the Hudson Square neighborhood of Manhattan. A six-story commercial condominium building containing Use Group 6 offices and Use Group 9 adult training facilities is located on Lot 1001-1005, and will be retained on the zoning lot. All other structures formerly occupying portions of the zoning lot, including several residential row houses and a low-rise non-residential building, have recently been demolished in anticipation of the construction of the proposed mixed-use building.

The project site is located in an M1-6 district in the Special Hudson Square District ("special district") and is within an Inclusionary Housing Designated Area. The special district was established in 2013 to accommodate new residential development while strengthening the area's role as an office market and enhancing the neighborhood's unique built character. The special district permits a wide range of residential, commercial and light manufacturing uses. Residential use is permitted largely as-of-right. However, special floor area preservation provisions stipulate that residential use on zoning lots occupied by buildings containing 70,000 square feet or more

commercial or manufacturing floor area as of the date of the rezoning shall only be permitted if such non-residential floor area is preserved on site.

The applicant is currently constructing a 25-story mixed-use building on vacant portions of the zoning lot (Block 477, Lots 35, 42, 44, 46, 71-76), facilitated by a previously granted Chairperson certification (N 150332 ZCM) that ensures the retention of the existing six-story commercial condominium building occupying the rest of the lot. As proposed, the development will contain 240,350 square feet of residential floor area (115 market-rate units), 17,134 square feet of retail floor area, approximately 756 square feet of community facility floor area, and a 42-space automated accessory off-street parking facility. The proposed parking facility would be abovegrade and occupy portions of the ground, third and fourth floors of the mixed-use building.

Access to and from the parking facility will be provided on Broome Street by a new, 21'-6" wide curb cut leading to a two-way driveway through an inner court. Vehicles would be parked and retrieved at the transfer bin located at the end of the driveway on the ground floor, where a car lift would transport vehicles to and from the storage area located on the third and fourth stories. The proposed 42 parking spaces would be distributed across two layers of storage trays, with 24 trays on the lower level and 18 trays on the upper level.

Under the Manhattan Core parking regulations, the development is permitted to have an accessory parking facility with an as-of-right capacity of 29 parking spaces, including 23 accessory residential spaces and six retail spaces. The requested special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 (Special Permits for Additional Parking Spaces) and 13-451 (Additional Parking Spaces for Residential Growth) of the Zoning Resolution (ZR) would allow the applicant to increase the capacity of the parking facility to a total of 42 residential spaces.

Additionally, the application will be accompanied by a Chairperson certification (N 170383 ZCM) pursuant to ZR Section 13-432 that floor space in the accessory automated parking facility located within the building, above 23 feet above curb level and below 40 feet above curb level, is exempt from the definition of floor area.

#### ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 170382 ZSM) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA), and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The lead agency is the City Planning Commission. This application was determined to be a Type II action which requires no further environmental review.

# UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW PROCEDURE (ULURP)

This application (C 170382 ZSM) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on May 8, 2017, and was duly referred to Community Board 2 and the Borough President in accordance Title 62 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b).

# **Community Board Public Hearing**

Community Board 2 held a public hearing on this application (C 170382 ZSM) on June 14, 2017, and on June 22, 2017, by a vote of 37 in favor, none opposed and with no abstentions, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the application.

## **Borough President Recommendation**

This application (C 170382 ZSM) was considered by the Borough President, who issued a recommendation on July 20, 2017 supporting approval of the application.

# **City Planning Commission Public Hearing**

On July 12, 2017 (Calendar No. 3), the City Planning Commission scheduled July 26, 2017 for a public hearing on this application (C 170382 ZSM). The hearing was duly held on July 26, 2017 (Calendar No. 35). There were two speakers in favor of the application and none in opposition.

The applicant's land use attorney and the project architect presented as a team, describing the proposed development and the automated parking facility's operations, and stated that the

proposed increase in the number parking spaces met the conditions and findings of the special permit. There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

#### CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this application for a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the Zoning Resolution is appropriate.

The requested special permit would allow the applicant to increase the capacity of the proposed automated accessory parking facility to by 13 to a total of 42 parking spaces.

The entrance and exit to the parking facility on Broome Street will be located midblock, an ample distance away from nearby street intersections. Broome Street is not a designated bus or truck route and does not allow for direct access to the Holland Tunnel. The direction of traffic on Broome Street is one-way, and thus vehicles will not cross oncoming traffic when entering or exiting the parking facility. Additionally, there will be auditory and visual pedestrian safety elements at the entrance to the garage driveway to alert pedestrians and cyclists when a vehicle is entering and exiting. The Commission therefore believes that the location of the vehicular entrance and exit to the automated parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic, result in undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, or interfere with the efficient functioning of streets.

The Commission notes that, while only two reservoir spaces are required, access to the automated parking system (i.e. the transfer bin/car lift) is located over 90 feet away from the street line, beyond an inner court that provides ample space for vehicles to get off the street. Additionally, the automated parking system can process a vehicle within 165 seconds on average. Moreover, because the parking garage, including the additional 13 spaces requested by the special permit application, is intended for use only by residential occupants of the building, vehicles accessing the garage will be less frequent than transient users. The Commission therefore believes that the configuration and operation of the proposed parking garage will allow for efficient movement of

vehicles off the street, and that the use of the parking facility will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow.

The Commission notes that the development has an as-of-right curb cut, and also observes that other curb cuts, loading and parking entrances currently exist near the development site along Broome Street between Varick Street and Avenue of the Americas. The Commission therefore believes that the location of the entrance and exit would not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape.

The applicant documented the new and eliminated residential units and off-street parking spaces within one-third of a mile from the development site between 2006 and 2018 (the project's expected build year), to demonstrate that the request for 42 residential parking spaces is reasonable and not excessive in regard to recent trends in residential development and the provision of parking. Using data from the Department of Buildings, the Department of Consumer Affairs, and additional research performed by the applicant, the study found that between 2006 and 2018, the ratio of the change in off-street parking spaces to the change in residential units without the proposed 42 parking spaces and 115 residential units, that ratio would increase to negative 3.3 percent, well below the residential growth parking ratio maximum, which is 20 percent for Manhattan Community District 2. The Commission therefore believes that the ratio of new off-street parking spaces to new residential units with the proposed project demonstrates that the request for 42 residential parking spaces is reasonable and not excessive in regard to recent trends in residential development and the provision of parking.

#### **FINDINGS**

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for Additional Parking Spaces) of the Zoning Resolution:

(1) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with #uses# or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue

- conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (2) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of #streets#, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (3) such #use# will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;
- (4) [This finding is inapplicable; no public parking garages is being proposed]; and
- (5) such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape.

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution:

- (a) the number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:
  - (1) the increase in the number of #dwelling units#; and
  - (2) the number of both public and #accessory# off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities. In making this determination, the Commission may take into account off-street parking facilities for which building permits have been granted, or which have obtained City Planning Commission special permits pursuant to Section 13-45.

# RESOLUTION

**RESOLVED,** that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and be it further

**RESOLVED,** by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination, and the consideration and findings described in this report, the application submitted by Broome Property Owner JV, LLC

pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for additional parking spaces) and Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution to allow an automated accessory parking garage with a maximum capacity of 42 spaces on portions of the ground floor, third floor and the fourth floor of a proposed mixed use building on property located at 100 Varick Street (Block 477, Lots 35, 42, 44, 46, 71-76 and 1001-1005), in an M1-6 District, within the Special Hudson Square District, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 2, is approved, subject to the following terms and conditions:

1. The property that is the subject of this application (C 170382 ZSM) shall be developed in size and arrangement substantially in accordance with the dimensions, specifications and zoning computations indicated on the following approved plans, prepared by SLCEArchitects, filed with this application and incorporated in this resolution:

<u>Drawing No.</u>	<u>Title</u>	Last Date Revised
Z-110	1st Floor Plan	4/18/17
Z-120	2 <sup>nd</sup> Floor Plan	4/18/17
Z-130B	3 <sup>rd</sup> Floor Plan Special Permit	4/18/17
Z-140B	4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Plan Special Permit	4/18/17

- 2. Such development shall conform to all applicable provisions of the Zoning Resolution, except for the modifications specifically granted in this resolution and shown on the plans listed above which have been filed with this application. All zoning computations are subject to verification and approval by the New York City Department of Buildings.
- 3. Such development shall conform to all applicable laws and regulations relating to its construction, operation and maintenance.
- 4. All leases, subleases, or other agreements for use or occupancy of space at the subject property shall give actual notice of this special permit to the lessee, sublessee or occupant.

- 5. Upon failure of any party having any right, title or interest in the property that is the subject of this application, or the failure of any heir, successor, assign, or legal representative of such party, to observe any of the covenants, restrictions, agreements, terms or conditions of this resolution whose provisions shall constitute conditions of the special permit hereby granted, the City Planning Commission may, without the consent of any other party, revoke any portion of or all of said special permit. Such power of revocation shall be in addition to and not limited to any other powers of the City Planning Commission, or of any other agency of government, or any private person or entity. Any such failure as stated above, or any alteration in the development that is the subject of this application that departs from any of the conditions listed above, is grounds for the City Planning Commission or the City Council, as applicable, to disapprove any application for modification, cancellation or amendment of the special permit hereby granted.
- 6. Neither the City of New York nor its employees or agents shall have any liability for money damages by reason of the city's or such employee's or agent's failure to act in accordance with the provisions of this special permit.

The above resolution (C 170382 ZSM), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on August 23, 2017 (Calendar No. 14), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough

President together with a copy of the plans of the development, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

MARISA LAGO, Chair
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, Esq., Vice Chair
RAYANN BESSER, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ALFRED C. CERULLO, III,
MICHELLE R. DE LA UZ, JOSEPH I. DOUEK, CHERYL COHEN EFFRON,
HOPE KNIGHT, ANNA HAYES LEVIN, ORLANDO MARIN, Commissioners

Terri Cude, Chair Dan Miller, First Vice Chair Susan Kent, Second Vice Chair Bob Gormley, District Manager



Antony Wong, Treasurer Keen Berger, Secretary Erik Coler, Assistant Secretary

# COMMUNITY BOARD NO. 2, MANHATTAN

3 Washington Square Village New York, NY 10012-1899

www.cb2manhattan.org
P: 212-979-2272 F: 212-254-5102 E: info@cb2manhattan.org

Greenwich Village \* Little Italy \* SoHo \* NoHo \* Hudson Square \* Chinatown \* Gansevoort Market

June 23, 2017

Marisa Lago, Chair City Planning Commission 22 Reade Street New York, NY 10007

Dear Ms. Lago:

At its Full Board meeting on June 22, 2017, CB#2, Manhattan (CB2, Man.), adopted the following resolution:

100 Varick Street (between Sixth Avenue, Broome and Watts Streets) CPC #C170382ZSM and CEQR #17DCP168M. Applicant is requesting a special permit from the City Planning Commission pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the Zoning Resolution to (i) increase permitted capacity of an automated parking facility from a total of 29 permitted spaces to a total of 42 residential accessory off-street parking spaces and (ii) certification that floor space used for such off-street parking in the accessory automated parking facility above a height of 23' above curb level and below the height of 40'-0" above curb level is exempt from the definition of floor area.

#### Whereas:

- 1. The parking facility will be located in a new, 25-story predominantly mixed use building within the Special Hudson Square District. Hudson Square is zoned M1-6.
- 2. On June 6, 2016, an application was approved by the CPC Chairperson pursuant to ZR13-432, certifying that floor space located below a height of 40' above curb level within the proposed automated facility with a capacity of 29 as-of-right spaces is exempt from floor area.
- 3. The City established the Special Hudson Square District to encourage the targeted introduction of residential uses on underutilized sites in a neighborhood with unique built character.
- 4. The applicant meets the findings for a special permit for additional parking spaces.
- 5. The applicant stated all of the 42 spaces are reserved specifically for residential occupants of this building.

**Therefore**, be it resolved that CB2, Man. recommends approval of this application.

Vote: Unanimous, with 37 Board members in favor.

Please advise us of any decision or action taken in response to this resolution.

Sincerely,

Terri Cude, Chair

Community Board #2, Manhattan

Anita Brandt, Co-Chair

Land Use & Business Development Committee

Community Board #2, Manhattan

Frederica Sigel, Co-Chair

Land Use & Business Development Committee

Community Board #2, Manhattan

Fiederies Sigel

# TC/fa

c: Hon. Jerrold L. Nadler, Congressman

Hon. Deborah Glick, Assembly Member

Hon. Daniel Squadron, NY State Senator

Hon. Gale A. Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Hon. Corey Johnson, Council Member

Sylvia Li, Dept. of City Planning



1 Centre Street, 19th floor, New York, NY 10007 (212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f 431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027 (212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov

Gale A. Brewer, Borough President

July 20, 2017

Recommendation on ULURP Application C 170382 ZSM, N 170383 ZCM – SoHo Tower By Broome Property Owner JV, LLC.

# PROPOSED ACTION

Broome Property Owner JV, LLC¹ ("the applicant") seeks: 1) a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the Zoning Resolution ("ZR") to allow an automated accessory parking garage with a maximum capacity of 42 spaces on portions of the ground floor, third floor, and fourth floor; and 2) a certification from the Chairperson of the City Planning Commission ("CPC") that floor space for such off-street parking in the accessory automated parking facility above a height of 23 feet above curb level and below the height of 40 feet above curb level is exempt from the definition of floor area of a proposed mixed-use building located at 100 Varick Street (Block 477, Lots 35, 42, 44, 46, 71-76 and 1001-1005), in an M1-6 district within the Special Hudson Square District, in Community Board 2, Manhattan.

Pursuant to ZR § 13-45 the City Planning Commission ("CPC") must find that:

- The location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with uses or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- 2) The location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of streets, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- 3) Such use will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;
- 4) For public parking garages, where any floor space is exempted from the definition of floor area, such additional floor space is needed in order to prevent excessive on-street parking demand and relieve traffic congestion; and
- 5) Such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape

Pursuant to § 13-451, the CPC may permit a parking facility listed in Section 13-45(a), where such parking facility serves the parking needs of a predominately residential development or enlargement, provided that, in addition to the conditions and findings set forth in Section 13-45, the Commission shall find that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Broome Property Owner JV LLC was established in 2013 and is represented by Steven DellaSalla.

- a) The number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:
  - 1) The increase in the number of dwelling units; and
  - 2) The numbers of both public and accessory off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities. In making this determination, the Commission may take into account off-street parking facilities for which building permits have been granted, or which have obtained CPC special permits pursuant to Section 13-45; ....

The CPC may also prescribe appropriate conditions and safeguards to minimize adverse effects on the character of the surrounding area under the special permit. The chairperson certification is not subject to review by the Borough President.

# PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant seeks a special permit pursuant to ZR § 13-45 and 13-451 to increase the permitted capacity of an automated parking facility from 29 spaces to 42 residential accessory off-street parking spaces. The applicant also seeks a Chairperson's certification to exempt the floor space used for the automated parking facility from the definition of floor area. The project site's lot area is 28,375 square feet with frontage along Broome Street, Varick Street and Watts Street to the south.

The development site is currently vacant but will contain a 25-story mixed-use residential building consisting of 260,240 square feet of floor area. The building will contain 240,350 square feet for 115 residential units, 17,134 square feet of retail floor area, 756 square feet of community facility floor area, and 11, 380 square feet of floor area for an automated accessory parking facility for 42 parking spaces.

The site will have two curb cuts: one on the south side of Broome Street for vehicular access and one on the north side of Watts Street to accommodate loading. The curb cut on Broome Street will measure 21 feet and 6 inches with access to a two-way driveway for entry and egress that cuts through the first two stories of the building into an inner court unobstructed to the sky. Within this inner court, the entrance lane splits into two: one to accommodate vehicles dropping off passengers at the inner court second residential entrance and the other as a bypass lane. The entrance and exit to the automated facility will be via a transfer cabin at the ground level where users can drop off their vehicle on a lift that takes their vehicle to the storage unit located two levels above (30 feet and 8 inches above grade) to one of the 24 trays on the lower level or 18 trays on the upper level. All parking is located on floors above the curb level at 23 feet and below the height of 40 feet above curb level. Additionally, reservoir spaces at grade would be provided for users waiting to drop off their vehicle outside of the automated parking facility.

Access to the driveway will only be for tenants of the building. Residents will be given a RFID transmitter and card to operate the mechanical gate, which will open inward and is just beyond

the speed bump in in the entry way. There will also be pedestrian visual and auditory safety measures in place to alert passersby of approaching vehicles.

The project site is located within an M1-6 zoning district within the Special Hudson Square District. M1-6 zoning districts permits Use Groups (UG) 1-14 and UG 16. The total permitted Floor Area Ratio (FAR) for residential use is 9.0 and 0.25 times the non-residential FAR to not exceed an FAR of 10 and permits an FAR of 12 with inclusionary housing. Within the Special Hudson Square District accessory off-street parking is permitted for no more than 20 percent of the total new dwelling units and for retail space, the maximum permitted is 1 space per 4,000 square feet of floor area or no more than 10 parking spaces.

# **Background**

The development site is utilizing transferred development rights from the property at 555 Broome Street, which is occupied by The Door, an organization that provides educational, development and empowerment services for youth, to construct the 25 story condominium building. Prior to this application, the applicant received two Chairperson's certifications for floor area exemptions: 84,517.38 square feet of existing non-residential floor area for non-residential use; and the floor space located below 40 feet above curb level within the proposed automated facility with a capacity of 29 spaces. The site is currently under construction.

# **Area Context**

The project site is within the Special Hudson Square District, which was adopted in 2013, and is comprised of 18 blocks bounded by West Houston Street, Canal Street, Greenwich Street and Sixth Avenue as an effort to preserve a former warehouse and manufacturing district and encourage residential and commercial development. The Special Hudson Square District has contextual bulk regulations including maximum building heights of 290 feet on wide streets and 185 on narrow streets. Street walls are also required at the street line at 60 to 125 feet on narrow streets and 125 to 150 feet on wide streets.

The project site is also adjacent to Freeman Plaza and the entrance to the Holland Tunnel located one block west at Broome Street between Hudson Street and Varick Street. Southwest of the site is the Tribeca Mixed Use District, originally designated in 1976 as an effort to limit residential development in a formerly industrial area and has been revised over the years to encourage a more mixed-used community. East of the development site at Avenue of the Americas is an M1-5B zoning district which extends for one and half blocks east. There are also two green spaces: SoHo Square located one block north of the site and Duarte Square two blocks south of the site. The primary use in the surrounding area is commercial and multi-family residential.

The area is well served by public transportation. The No. 1 subway line is one block south at Canal Street and Varick Street and the C/E subway lines are located along 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue three blocks south and north of the site. The M21, M55, X27, and X28 bus lines are also along 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue including a BoltBus stop to destinations such as Washington DC and Philadelphia just one block southeast of the site. Additionally, the nearest Citibike bicycle stations are located one block northeast of the site at 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Broome Street and one block southeast of the site at Canal Street and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

# **Proposed Actions**

In order to facilitate the construction of the 25-story mixed-use residential building with a 42-space parking garage, the applicant seeks A Parking Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 13-45 and 13-451 to allow additional accessory parking spaces for residential growth in order to construct a 42-space residential accessory off-street parking garage. Only 29 spaces would be permitted as-of-right for the building, with 23 spaces for the 115 residential units and 6 spaces for the commercial retail use.

The applicant also seeks a related action to this proposal, CPC Chairperson certification pursuant to ZR § 13-432 that the floor space in the accessory automated parking facility which is located 23 feet above curb level and below 40 feet above curb level, is exempt from the definition of floor area. This action is not subject to the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP).

## COMMUNITY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

At its Full Board meeting on June 22, 2017, Manhattan Community Board 2 (CB2) voted unanimously, by a vote of 37 in the affirmative, 0 in the negative, in favor of a resolution recommending approval of the application with no conditions. The resolution states the applicant met the findings for the special permit.

#### **BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S COMMENTS**

Recommendations from this office on prior parking special permits have requested that the Department of City Planning and the City Planning Commission consider a more robust set of factors aside from the parking methodology analysis. These factors include the absolute availability of parking, the supply of parking prior to the ten-year look-back and the current capacity and utilization rate of parking facilities in the neighborhood, as well as access to mass transit. These factors should be considered where applicable.

In this case, the supply of parking in the vicinity of this location at the start of the ten-year look back period is not an issue. This site is located in an area that has long been more developed than were the areas on the far West Side of Midtown, where the garages that were the subject of prior applications were located. There was no oversaturation of parking in the area at that time. Nor is there an overabundance of parking capacity now; parking is at a significant premium. The neighborhood is well served by mass transit, but does not serve as the type of transit hub we encountered in previous applications (e.g. adjacent to Penn Station) that would warrant exclusion of a modest private residential garage.

The applicant is proposing an automated garage with 42-parking space accessory to a 115-unit luxury residential building. Twenty-nine of these spaces are as-of-right. Given the amount of residential construction and loss of parking spaces in the area, the approval of this project would lead to a residential growth parking ratio of -3.3 percent, which is well below the 20 percent residential growth parking ratio maximum for the Manhattan Core.

Although the Manhattan Core text was designed to minimize public parking, the applicant has stated that the parking spaces will be used exclusively by the building's residential tenants. Due to the advertised price of the condominiums, I believe that the proposed parking spaces will be true accessory parking spaces for destination travel. Vehicle usage predominantly on weekends, should not exacerbate existing traffic congestion on adjacent streets leading to the Holland Tunnel. I hope that there would be no adverse impact on pedestrians because there is sufficient space provided for queued vehicles within the garage vestibule, in addition to the required reservoir parking spaces. I am also pleased that a feature of the automated garage, the pallet, allows for electric charging of vehicles at every space. This applicant also recognizes the other transit modes available and is not demanding a one for one ratio of parking spaces to dwelling units.

Therefore, I believe the granting of the additional 13 parking spaces for residential use is appropriate at this site as it will not have an adverse effect on the character of the surrounding area.

# BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

Therefore, the Manhattan Borough President recommends approval of the parking special permit C 170382 ZSM and the related chairperson certification N 170383 ZCM.

Gale A. Brewer

Manhattan Borough President