

Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

**Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq.** Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

Marie Giraud, Esq. Agency Attorney/ Director of Compliance Monitoring

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

### BY MAIL AND EMAIL

June 10, 2016

Michael E. McMahon District Attorney Office of the Richmond County District Attorney 130 Stuyvesant Place, 7th Floor Staten Island, NY 10201

Re: Preliminary Determination for Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2015.

Dear District Attorney McMahon:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you and your agency for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit. This letter contains the Commission's findings and preliminary determinations pursuant to our audit and analysis of your agency's Employment Practices and Procedures for the period covering July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2015.

The New York City Charter, Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(5), empowers this Commission to audit and evaluate city agencies' employment practices, programs, policies and procedures, and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for employees and applicants seeking employment with city agencies. Section 832.c provides that this Commission may, pursuant to an audit, make a preliminary determination that any plan, program or procedure utilized by any city agency does not provide equal employment opportunity and recommend all necessary and appropriate procedures, approaches, measures, standards and programs to be utilized by agencies in these efforts.

The Office of the Richmond County District Attorney, which may herein be referred to as "the agency," falls within the Commission's purview under Chapter 36, Section 831(a) of the New York City Charter, which delineates city agency as any "city, county, borough or other office, administration, board, department, division, commission, bureau, corporation, authority, or other agency of government where the majority of the board members of such agency are appointed by the mayor or serve by virtue of being city officers or the expenses of which are paid in whole or in part from the city treasury..."



The purpose of this audit and analysis is to evaluate the agency's Employment Practices and Procedures, not to issue findings of discrimination pursuant to the New York City Human Rights Law. This Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits*<sup>1</sup> and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. These standards are founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; the New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code §§8-107(1)(a) and (d), 8-107.13, and 8-107.1); the New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; the Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7); the Americans with Disabilities Act and its Accessibility Guidelines; and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter. Prescribed corrective actions are consistent with the aforementioned parameters.

Since this Commission is empowered to review and recommend actions which each agency should consider including in its annual plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity (Annual EEO Plan), the audited agency should incorporate required corrective actions in its current EEO Program and prospective Annual EEO Plans.

### Scope and Methodology

This Commission's audit methodology includes collection and analysis of the documents, records and data the agency provides in response to the *EEPC Document and Information Request Form;* responses to the *EEPC Interview Questionnaires* for EEO professionals and others involved in EEO program administration; and, if applicable, review of the agency's *Annual EEO Plans* and *Quarterly EEO Reports* and analysis of workforce and utilization data from the *Citywide Equal Employment Database System* (CEEDS).

This Commission reviews the workforce statistics and utilization analysis information available via CEEDS to understand the concentrations of race and gender groups within an agency's workforce. (CEEDS may be unavailable for certain non-mayoral agencies. In such cases, the EEPC requests that the agency submit similar statistics and analysis.) EEO Program Analysts examine imbalances between the number of employees in a particular job category and the number that would reasonably be expected when compared to their availability in the relevant labor market. Personnel transactions are reviewed in order to ascertain the agency's employment practices. Where underutilization is revealed within an agency's workforce, EEO Program Analysts assess whether the agency has undertaken reasonable measures to address it.

EEO professionals (including, but not limited to, past or current EEO Officers, Deputy or Co-EEO Officers, EEO Counselors, EEO Trainers, EEO Investigators, Disability Rights Coordinators, Career Counselors, 55-a Program Coordinators) and others involved in EEO program administration such as the Principal Human Resources Professional are given a two-week deadline to complete and return their individual questionnaires. The Commission's EEO Program Analysts also conduct

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Corresponding audit/analysis standards are numbered throughout the document.



additional research and follow-up discussions or interviews with EEO professionals, when appropriate.

### **Description of the Agency**

Pursuant to Article 13, Section 13 of the State Constitution, District Attorneys are constitutional officers elected every four years. Section 927 of the County Law imposes upon District Attorneys the duty to protect the public by investigating and prosecuting criminal conduct in the counties in which they hold office. The agency headcount at the end of the audit period was 107 (workforce composition summary attached - **Appendix 5**).

### PRELIMINARY DETERMINATIONS AFTER AUDIT AND ANALYSIS

Following are the corresponding audit standards for each subject area along with the EEPC's findings and required corrective actions, where appropriate:

### I. <u>ISSUANCE</u>, <u>DISTRIBUTION AND POSTING OF EEO POLICIES</u>:

Determination: The agency is in partial compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 1. Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.
  - > The agency did not demonstrate that an EEO policy statement was issued during the period in review.

NOTE: On March 31, 2016, the newly appointed District Attorney issued an EEO Policy statement which affirmed "dedication to maintaining a work environment that recognizes and appreciates the diversity of its workforce." The statement further asserted that the District Attorney's Office intend[s] to promote equal employment opportunity by continuing effective measures or implementing new strategies and programs, when necessary, that prevent, diminish, or eliminate barriers to equal opportunity." The EEO Policy statement included a list of protected classes, the names and contact information for the agency's principal EEO professionals, and a link to the agency's intranet site where the agency's EEO policy, discrimination complaint procedures guidelines, and reasonable accommodations policy were posted.

2. Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies — or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws — for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: a policy against sexual harassment; uniform and responsive procedures for investigating discrimination complaints and providing reasonable accommodations; an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for the agency's EEO



professionals, as well as federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.

- ✓ During the period in review, the agency's Equal Employment Opportunity Policy was posted on its intranet site accessible to all employees. The Equal Employment Opportunity Policy included sections on: Types of prohibited conduct; Specific protections; Protected classes (Age (18 years and over), Citizenship Status, Color, Creed, Disability, Gender (including Gender Identity), Predisposing Genetic Characteristics, Partnership Status, Military Status, National Origin, Race, Religion, Sexual Harassment, Sexual Orientation, Status as a Victim or Witness of Domestic Violence, Sex Offenses, or Stalking); Sexual Harassment; 55-a Program; Procedures for Reporting Violations; Conducting the Complaint Investigation; Mediation; Requests for Reasonable Accommodations; and an Anti-Retaliation Policy. The policy also included current contact information for the agency's EEO professionals, as well as a list of federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination. The agency's Discrimination Complaint Procedures Guidelines, 2015, and a Reasonable Accommodation Policy & Procedure were also posted on its website. New employees received (as part of the agency's New Hire Processing Package) a copy of the agency's Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, and the City's EEO policy handbook: About EEO: What You May Not Know.
  - Although the agency's Equal Employment Opportunity Policy included a list of federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination, it did not include the contact information (i.e. telephone number or address) for these agencies. The policy directed employees to obtain further information by clicking the following web links: <a href="http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/pdf/abouteeo.pdf">http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/pdf/abouteeo.pdf</a> and <a href="http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/html/k2eeo.html">http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/pdf/abouteeo.pdf</a> and <a href="http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/html/k2eeo.html">http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/pdf/abouteeo.pdf</a> and <a href="http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/html/k2eeo.html">http://nyc.gov/html/dcas/html/k2eeo.html</a>. The web links connected to webpages that were "no longer available." In addition, the agency's EEO policy did not include "prior record of arrest or conviction", "marital status", "consumer credit history" and "unemployment status" as protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws. Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #1</u>: Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the <u>Equal Employment</u> Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies — or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws — for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.

NOTE ON POLICY UPDATES: Subsequent to the audit period, the following protected categories were added to the New York City's Human Rights Law: "caregiver status" (effective May 4, 2016); and "pregnancy" (enforcement guidance released May 16, 2016). All EEO policies/flyers and related documents must reflect these updates.



### II. EEO TRAINING FOR AGENCY:

Determination: The agency is in <u>non-compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 3. Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.
  - The agency did not conduct EEO training, at minimum for new employees, during the period in review. Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #2</u>: Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.

# III. <u>EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES (Recruitment, Hiring & Promotion)</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 4. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
  - ➤ The agency did not conduct an assessment of recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. In addition, CEEDS Reports: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools during the period in review indicated underutilization of protected classes in three (3) job groups (see Appendices 2-4). Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #3</u>: Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.



- 5. The principal EEO Professional, HR Professional, and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required to correct deficiencies.
- ✓ During the period in review, the Director of Human Resources (the agency's principal HR Professional) also functioned as the principal EEO professional. The agency reported that the Director of Human Resources/principal EEO professional compiled the agency's workforce statistics by gender, ethnicity and job category for the agency's biennial *EEOP Utilization Report* submission to the Department of Justice.

NOTE: The agency reported no EEO complaints were filed during the period in review.

➤ The agency did not identify whether there were barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions were required to correct deficiencies. Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #4</u>: Ensure that the Director of Human Resources/principal EEO professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

- 6. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it conducted an analysis of the manner in which candidates were selected for employment, to determine if there was adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. In addition, CEEDs Reports Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools during the period in review indicated underutilization of protected classes in three (3) job groups: Blacks, Hispanics and Asians in the Managers and the Clerical job groups; and Blacks and Asians in the Para Professionals job group (see Appendices 2-4). Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #5</u>: Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.



- 7. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
  - The agency did not demonstrate that it reviewed relevant utilization data to determine if underrepresentation existed in titles where the agency had discretion in hiring (i.e. discretionary titles). In addition, CEEDS Reports Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools indicated underutilization of protected classes in 3 job groups which may contain discretionary titles. (See § III.4 and Appendices 2-4) Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #6</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- 8. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil* service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
  - The agency did not demonstrate that it reviewed relevant utilization data to determine if civil service (list) titles were among those where underrepresentation was indicated. In addition, CEEDS Reports Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools indicated underutilization of protected classes in 3 job groups which may contain civil service titles. (See § III.4 and Appendices 2-4) Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #7</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

9. Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).



- ✓ The agency reported that either an interview panel or interview stages were used for every position: each candidate was interviewed by more than one person either via a panel or by returning for second or third interviews. "Interviews were conducted by a Bureau Chief (or a panel thereof), then Chief Assistant District Attorney, and, if successful, the District Attorney."
  - The agency did not provide documentation that all personnel involved in recruiting and hiring were trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates or received a guide on structured interviewing techniques. Corrective action is required.

<u>NOTE</u>: Subsequent to the period in review, the agency reported that it is in the process of establishing a Structured Interview Guide.

<u>Corrective Action #8</u>: Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).

- 10. Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for promotion and transfer within the agency, and ensure that employees are considered for such opportunities.
- ✓ The agency reported that job vacancy notices were posted on its website and nyc.gov/jobs and
  job flyers were sent (citywide) to Agency Personnel Officers to be shared with their respective
  agencies. In addition, the agency reported that it also participated in job transfers, and cross
  training, wherein staff members were occasionally assigned tasks in other bureaus in order to
  acquaint them with the functions of that bureau.
- 11. At minimum, indicate the agency is an equal opportunity employer in recruitment literature.
- ✓ During the period in review, the agency advertised several vacant positions including: Investigator, Community Associate (2 positions), and Assistant District Attorney (3 positions). Each job vacancy notice posted on the agency's website and nyc.gov/jobs included the EEO tagline: "The Richmond County District Attorney's Office is an Equal Opportunity Employer." The Investigator positions were also advertised in the Chief Leader and New York Post newspapers each advertisement included an EEO tagline: "RCDA is an Equal Opportunity Employer" or "RCDA is an EOE".
- 12.Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the hiring manager.



✓ The agency utilized Richmond County District Attorney's Discretionary Applicant Log which captured, position (title and posting transmittal number), applicants'/candidates' names, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. The form also included submitted by, date and signature lines.

### IV. CAREER COUNSELING:

Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 13. Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.
- ✓ During the period in review, Director of Human Resources also served as the agency's Career Counselor. The Career Counselor advised employees of scheduled citywide examinations, and career opportunities, and processed certifications for employees to be appointed from civil service lists as appropriate. The Career Counselor notified employees, via email, of the annual [citywide] *Examination Schedule*; and met with employees upon request to provide guidance on applying for a civil service exam.
- 14. The Human Resources Professional distributes the identity of the agency Career Counselor and ensures that all employees have access to information regarding job responsibilities, performance evaluation standards, examinations, training opportunities and job postings; ensures that all new employees are advised of the EEO policies, their rights and responsibilities under such policies and the discrimination complaint procedures; informs the principal EEO professional of the number of 55-a program participants and efforts the agency has made to employ, promote or accommodate qualified individuals with disabilities; involves the principal EEO professional in EEO-related matters; and promptly consults with the principal EEO professional if informed of, or suspects that a violation of the EEO Policy has occurred.
- ✓ During the period in review, the Director of Human Resources (the agency's principal HR Professional) also functioned as the agency's principal EEO professional and Career Counselor. The Director of Human Resources ensured that all employees had access to information regarding performance evaluation standards, examinations, training opportunities and job postings. The Director of Human Resources also ensured that new employees were advised of the EEO policies, their rights and responsibilities under such policies and the discrimination complaint procedures by ensuring that policies were posted in the pantry a common area accessible to all employees and distributed to all new employees.

NOTE: The agency reported no 55-a program participants.



# V. <u>EEO AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS FOR EMPLOYEES/</u> <u>APPLICANTS FOR EMPLOYMENT WITH DISABILITIES:</u>

Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 15.Ensure that information regarding employee rights and obligations, and the complaint, investigation and reasonable accommodation procedures is made available in appropriate alternative formats (i.e., large print, audio tape and/or Braille) upon request to employees and applicants for employment with disabilities.
- ✓ The agency's information regarding employee rights and obligations, and the complaint, investigation and reasonable accommodation procedures was immediately available in large print and audio. During the period in review, the agency provided a copy of the agency's EEO policy in large print upon request.
- 16. Document reasonable accommodation requests and their outcomes.
- ✓ The agency's reasonable accommodation policy included a Request for Reasonable Accommodation form for the purpose of documenting requests. No requests for reasonable accommodation were filed during the period in review.
  - VI. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION EEO PROFESSIONALS:</u>
    Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.
- 17. Appoint a principal EEO Professional to implement EEO policies and standards within the agency. The principal EEO Professional is trained and knowledgeable regarding city, state, and federal EEO laws; the requirements of the agency's EEO policies, standards and procedures; and the prevention, investigation, and resolution of discrimination complaints.
- ✓ A principal EEO professional (the Director of Human Resources) was appointed to implement EEO policies and standards within the agency. The principal EEO professional completed Diversity and EEO Basic Training in July 2015 and EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines Launch in March 2016 both conducted by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services.
- 18. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.
- ✓ During the period in review, in addition to the principal EEO professional, the agency appointed an EEO Counselor to conduct EEO complaint intake and investigations. The EEO Counselor completed *Diversity and EEO Basic Training* conducted by the Department of Citywide Administrative Services in June 2011.
  - ➤ Subsequently in January 2016, the agency appointed a new EEO Counselor to conduct EEO complaint intake and investigations. The agency reported that the EEO Counselor had not yet completed training for EEO Professionals. Corrective action is required.



<u>Corrective Action #9</u>: Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

- 19. The principal EEO Professional reports directly to the agency head (or an approved direct report other than the General Counsel) in order to exercise the necessary authority and independent judgment to fulfill EEO responsibilities.
- ✓ During the period in review, the principal EEO professional reported directly to the District Attorney; this reporting relationship was reflected in the agency's organization chart.
- 20.To ensure the integrity and continuity of the EEO Program, maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that during the period in review, meetings and communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO professional regarding decisions which impacted the administration and operation of the EEO program were memorialized. Corrective action is required.

<u>Corrective Action #10</u>: Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.

# VII. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION – SUPERVISORS/MANAGERS:</u> Determination: The agency is in <u>compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 21. Establish and administer an annual managerial/non-managerial performance evaluation program to be used for probationary periods, promotions, assignments, incentives and training.
- ✓ The agency conducted performance evaluations for managerial and non-managerial employees in 2014 and 2015 (for the respective prior years). The Director Human Resources emailed reminders to bureau managers to facilitate completion of evaluations and maintained a tracking system to ensure that performance evaluations were completed by the end of February each year.
- 22. The managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).



✓ The Managerial Performance Evaluation form contained a standard for EEO which states: "Performing supervisory responsibilities in a non-discriminatory manner; taking appropriate action to address EEO issues in the work place; annually ensuring that the agency EEO Policy is reviewed with subordinate staff; cooperating with the EEO Officer in the implementation of EEO policies and standards."

### VIII. REPORTING STANDARD FOR AGENCY HEAD:

Determination: The agency is <u>non-compliance</u> with the standard for this subject area.

- 23. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports<sup>2</sup> (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.
  - ➤ During the period in review, the agency did not submit to the EEPC Annual Plans of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, or quarterly reports on efforts to implement those plans. <u>Corrective action required</u>.

<u>Corrective Action #11</u>: Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports<sup>2</sup> (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

### After implementation of the EEPC's corrective actions, if any:

1. The agency head distributes a memorandum informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and re-emphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

<u>Final Action</u>: Distribute a memorandum signed by the agency head informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and reemphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

### Conclusion

The agency has <u>11</u> required corrective action(s) at this time.

Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter, your agency has the *option* to respond to this *preliminary determination*, but must respond to our Final Determination if corrective action is required.

Optional Response to preliminary determination: If submitted, your optional response should indicate, with attached documentation, what steps your agency has taken or will take to implement the prescribed corrective actions, and must be received in our office within 14 days

12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Submission of *Quarterly Reports on EEO Activity* is optional for non-Mayoral agencies.



from the date of this letter. No extensions will be granted for the *option* to respond to the *preliminary determination*.

(Optional Conference) During the Optional Conference, we will discuss the immediate steps your agency should take and address questions regarding your agency's implementation of the prescribed corrective action(s).

(*No Response Option*) If your agency does not respond to this preliminary determination within 14 days, it will become the EEPC's Final Determination.

Mandatory Response to Final Determination: Following this preliminary determination, the EEPC will issue a Final Determination where we may modify or eliminate the corrective actions based on verified information; identify remaining action which requires further monitoring in order to ensure implementation; and assign a mandatory compliance-monitoring period of up to 6 months for this purpose. Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter your agency must respond to our Final Determination within 30 days. Your response to the Final Determination will initiate the compliance monitoring period.

In closing, we want to thank you and your staff for the cooperation extended to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's EEO Program Analysts during the course of our audit and analysis.

Respectfully Submitted by,

Ilacia Zuell

Supervisory EEO Program Analyst

Administrator of Electronic Audit Management

Approved by,

Charise L. Terry, PHR

**Executive Director** 

c: Taiwo Onabanjo, Principal EEO Professional

# Appendix - 1

**EEO Job Group Descriptions** 

# DESCRIPTION OF CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) JOB GROUP CATEGORIES

- **OO1 Administrators:** Occupations in which employees set broad policies and exercise overall responsibility for the execution of these policies. This category includes: elected officials, commissioners, executive directors, deputy commissioners, chairpersons, general counsels, controllers, chiefs of department, inspector generals and kindred workers.
- **Managers:** Occupations in which employees direct individual departments or special phases of the agency's operations, or provide specialized consultation on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: assistant commissioners, deputy directors, assistant directors, project managers, special assistants, superintendents, deputy counsels and kindred workers.
- **003 Management Specialists:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of management, finance or personnel, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: accountants, underwriters, financial analysts, personnel analysts, staff analysts, program analysts, buyers, purchasing specialists, inspectors, research analysts, program officers, project coordinators and kindred workers.
- **OO4 Science Professionals:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of various scientific or mathematical fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: architects, engineers (chemical, nuclear, civil, electrical, industrial, mechanical, marine), computer specialists, telecommunications specialists, actuaries, statisticians, physicists, chemists, geologists, biologists, foresters and kindred workers.
- **O05 Health Professionals:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the medical or health fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: physicians, dentists, veterinarians, optometrists, podiatrists, registered nurses, pharmacists, dieticians, occupational therapists, physical therapists, speech therapists, physician's assistants and kindred workers.
- **Oo6 Social Scientists:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the social sciences, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: librarians, archivists, economists, psychologists, sociologists, urban planners and kindred workers.
- **Social Workers:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of social work, youth and family counseling, addiction treatment and casework, which is usually acquired through college or training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: caseworkers, probation officers, correctional counselors, juvenile counselors, addiction treatment counselors, eligibility specialists, human rights specialists, community liaison workers, clergy and kindred workers.
- **008** Lawyers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the law and the judicial process, which is usually acquired through college training. This category includes: attorneys, assistant district attorneys, counsels, assistant counsels, deputy counsels, law judges, and kindred workers.
- **O09 Public Relations:** Occupations which require special knowledge or skills in public relations, journalism, modern language or the fine arts, which are usually acquired through college training, specialized post-secondary school education, or work experience or training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: technical writers, graphic designers, musicians, actors, directors, announcers, painters, illustrators, photographers, artists, editors, press officers, public relations specialists, public relations advisors, interpreters, customer service specialists and kindred workers.
- **O10 Technicians:** Occupations which require a combination of basic scientific or technical knowledge and manual skill which can be obtained through specialized post-secondary school education or through equivalent on-the-job training. This category includes: health technicians (clinical laboratory, dental hygienists, health records, radiologic

and licensed practical nurses), electrical and electronic technicians, engineering technicians (electrical, electronic, industrial, and mechanical), drafting occupations, surveying and mapping technicians, science technicians, airline pilots and navigators, air traffic controllers, broadcast equipment operators, computer programmers, legal assistants, investigators, and kindred workers.

- **011** Sales: Not applicable.
- **O12 Clerical Supervisors:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for overseeing and supervising the duties of clerical staff. This category includes: chief clerks, supervising clerks, principal administrative associates, supervising cashiers, telegraph superintendents, supervising stenographers and kindred workers.
- **O13 Clerical:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for internal and external communication, recording and retrieval of data and/or information and other paperwork required in an office. This category includes: cashiers, computer operators, word processors, secretaries, stenographers, typists, ticket agents, receptionists, clerks (information, personnel, file, library, records), bookkeepers, office machine operators, telephone operators, messengers, dispatchers, stock clerks, meter readers, office aides, general office clerks, bank tellers and kindred workers.
- **014** Household Services: Not applicable.
- **O15 Police Supervisors:** Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officers status set broad policies in the area of public safety and security, exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies, direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations, or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: sergeants, captains, lieutenants, inspectors, captains (correction), wardens and kindred workers.
- **O16** Fire Supervisors: Occupations in which uniformed employees set broad policies in the area of public safety and protection; exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies; direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations; or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: lieutenants, captains, battalion chiefs, deputy chiefs, supervising fire marshals, supervising fire prevention inspectors and kindred workers.
- **017 Firefighters:** Occupations in which uniformed employees are entrusted with public safety, security and protection from destructive forces. This category includes: firefighters, marine engineers (uniformed), fire prevention inspectors, fire protection inspectors and kindred workers.
- **O18 Police and Detectives:** Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officer status are entrusted with public safety, security and protection. This category includes: police officer, detectives, correction officers, bridge and tunnel officers, sheriffs, special officers, enforcement agents (traffic, sanitation) and kindred workers.
- **019 Guards:** Occupations in which employees are entrusted with public safety and security. This category includes: school crossing guards, housing guards, watch persons, lifeguards, park rangers, school guards and kindred workers.
- **O20 Food Preparation:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for the preparation and distribution of food, or management of food services, in City facilities (e.g. schools, correctional institutions, and concessions). This category includes: cooks, school lunch helpers, school lunch managers, food service managers, commissary managers and kindred workers.
- **O21 Health Services:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for assisting health professionals in maintaining and promoting the health, hygiene and safety of the general public. This category includes: dental assistants, dietary aides, public health assistants, nurse's aides, institutional aides, health aides, orderlies, and kindred workers.
- **O22 Building Services:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. This category includes: custodians, cleaners, caretakers, maintainers, elevator operators and starters, exterminators, pest control aides and kindred workers.

- **O23 Personal Services:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort or convenience of the general public. This category includes: housekeepers, barbers, attendants, railroad porters, homemakers, matrons and kindred workers.
- **O24 Farming:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of agricultural/botanical/zoological facilities or grounds of public property. This category includes: herbarium aides, aquarium technicians, botanical gardening aides, gardeners, groundskeepers, pruners, hostlers, menagerie keepers, horseshoers and kindred workers.
- **O25 Craft:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which require special manual skill and a thorough and comprehensive knowledge of the processes involved in the work in which is acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: mechanics, equipment repairers, telephone line installers, small instrument repairers, brick masons, carpenters, electricians, plumbers, mining occupations, tool and die makers, sheet metal workers, tailors, butchers, bakers, machine operators, locksmiths, precision handworking occupations and kindred workers.
- **O26 Operators:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which require specialized machine skills which are required through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: printing press operators, high pressure boiler operators, laundry workers and kindred workers.
- **O27 Transportation:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which require motor vehicle, bus, train, or other transportation operation skills which are acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through other formal training programs. This category includes: bus drivers, chauffeurs, motor vehicle operators, trainmasters, ferry terminal supervisors and kindred workers.
- **O28** Laborers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort, convenience, hygiene or safety of the general public, or which contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. There are no job qualification requirements for titles in this category. This category includes: skilled craft helpers and apprentices, construction laborers, stock handlers, garage and service station related occupations, car cleaners, seasonal park helpers, track workers, assistant highway repairers and kindred workers.
- **O29** Sanitation Workers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the cleanliness, hygiene and safety of the public domain. Qualification requirements, which include civil service examinations, exist for titles in this category. This category includes: sanitation workers, debris removers and kindred workers.
- **O30 Teachers:** Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of education and instructional methods, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: teachers, instructors, professors, lecturers, fitness instructors, graduate assistants, fellows, adjunct professors, substitute teachers, trade instructors, education/vocational counselors, education analysts, education officers, institutional instructors and kindred workers.
- **O31 Paraprofessionals:** Occupations in which employees perform some of the duties of a professional or technician in a supportive role, which usually requires less formal training and/or experience normally required for professional or technical status. Such positions may fall within an identified pattern of staff development and promotion. This category includes: administrative assistants, project associates, coordinators, community associates and assistants, community service aides, research associates, welfare service workers, child care workers and kindred workers.

# Appendix - 2

CEEDS: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools

1<sup>st</sup> Quarters of Fiscal Year 2015

(Beginning of audit period)

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

ETH ETHNICITY RUN DATE: 10/03/14 RUN TIME: 7:50:43 FY2015 Q1

PAGE: 123 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050 AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:

JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	WHITE OBSRV E	EXPCT I	BLACK OBSRV E	XPCT I	HISPANIC OBSRV EX		ASIAN / OBSRV EX	KPCT I	NATIVE A		ETH UNKI OBSRV EX	
002 MANAGERS	49	33	25 Q	3	9 U	<u>0</u>	<mark>б                                    </mark>	5	5	0	0 N	8	2 0
003 MNGMNT SPECS 007 SOCIAL WORKERS	3	3 2	0 N	0	1 N   2 N	U 1	0 M	0	N U	0	0 N	0	O N
008 LAWYERS	ĭ	ĺ	1 N	ŏ	0 N	Ö	0 N	Ŏ	0 N	Ŏ	0 N	Ŏ	0 N
009 PUBLIC REL	1	1	1 N	0	0 N	0	0 N	0	0 N	0	0 N	0	0 N
010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS	4	3	1 N	0	1 N	1	1 N	0	0 N	0	0 N	0	0 N
013 CLERICAL SUPS	13	12	2 N	l <mark>ŏ</mark>	7 II	1	2 11	o o	1 II	0	0 N	0	0 N 1 N
018 POLICE	<del>- 3</del>	5	3 N	Ŏ	2 N	i	2 N	ĭ	0 N	ŏ	0 N	ŏ	ŌN
031 PARA PROFESSION	20	15	6 0	0	5 U	4	5	0	2 U	Ō	0 N	1	1

RUN DATE: 10/03/14 RUN TIME: 7:50:43 FY2015 Q1

AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

GEN GENDER

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050

PAGE: 124 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	MALE OBSRV	EXPCT I	FEMALE OBSRV EXP	CT I	GENDER U OBSRV EX	
002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 008 LAWYERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 018 POLICE 031 PARA PROFESSION	49 3 1 1 4 4 13 7 20	30 2 1 1 2 1 0 6	26 2 N 1 N 0 N 2 N 1 N 4 U 5 N 8 U	19 1 2 0 0 2 3 13 14	21 1 N 2 N 0 N 1 N 3 O 1 N 9 N	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	1 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N

# Appendix - 3

CEEDS: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2016 (End of the audit period)

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

ETH ETHNICITY RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 8:35:10 FY2016 Q2 PAGE: 123
PROGRAM: EBPPP961
EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/15

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050 AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:

JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	WHITE OBSRV E	EXPCT I	BLACK OBSRV I	EXPCT I	HISPANIC OBSRV EX		ASIAN / OBSRV E	XPCT I	NATIVE A		ETH UNKN	
002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 018 POLICE	51 2 1 3 1 5 3 14	36 2 0 2 1 4 3	26 O   1 N O N 1 N 2 N 1 N 3 O	5 0 0 0 0	10 U 1 N 0 N 2 N 0 N 2 N 2 N 7 U	0 0 1 1 0 1 0	7 U 0 N 0 N 0 N 1 N 0 N 2 U	2 0 0 0 0 0	5 U 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 1 N 0 N 1 U	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N	800000000000000000000000000000000000000	2 O 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N
031 PARA PROFESSION	19	13	6 0	Ö	5 11	5	5 1	<u></u>	2 11	Õ	0 N	1 1	1

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 8:35:10 FY2016 Q2

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

GEN GENDER

AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050

PAGE: 124 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/15

JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	MALE OBSRV 1	EXPCT I	FEMALE OBSRV E	XPCT I	GENDER U OBSRV EX	
002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 018 POLICE 031 PARA PROFESSION	51 1 3 1 5 3 14 8 19	28 1 1 1 3 0 0 7	27 1 N 1 N 1 N 1 N 1 N 4 U 6 N	23 1 0 2 0 2 3 14 12	21 1 N 0 N 2 N 0 N 2 N 2 N 2 N 2 N	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	1 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 1 N 0 N

## Appendix - 4

CEEDS: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2016 (Most recent quarter available)

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

ETH ETHNICITY RUN DATE: 04/04/16 RUN TIME: 9:59:29 FY2016 Q3 PAGE: 123 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/16

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050 AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:

JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	WHITE OBSRV E	EXPCT I	BLACK OBSRV EX	KPCT I	HISPANIC OBSRV EX		ASIAN / OBSRV E	XPCT I	NATIVE A		ETH UNK OBSRV E	
002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 008 LAWYERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL	46 2 1 3 1 5 2	34 2 0 2 1 1 4 2	24 O 1 N 0 N 1 N 1 N 2 N 0 N	5 0 0 0 0	9 U 1 N 0 N 2 N 0 N 2 N 2 N	0 0 1 1 0 0 1	6 U 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 1 N	1 0 0 0 0 0	5 U   0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 1 N 0 N	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N	6 0 0 0 0 0	2 O 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N
018 POLICE 031 PARA PROFESSION	8	6	3 N 7 O		2 N	1 5	2 N	1	0 N	0	0 N	0	0 N

RUN DATE: 04/04/16 RUN TIME: 9:59:29 FY2016 Q3

AGENCY: EEO VARIABLE:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

PERSONS WITH MIS

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: .050

PAGE: 124 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/16

JOB GROUP	INCMB TOTAL	MALE OBSRV I	EXPCT I	FEMALE OBSRV E	XPCT I	GENDER U OBSRV EX	
002 MANAGERS 003 MNGMNT SPECS 004 SCIENCE PROFNS 007 SOCIAL WORKERS 008 LAWYERS 009 PUBLIC REL 010 TECHNICIANS 012 CLERICAL SUPS 013 CLERICAL 018 POLICE 031 PARA PROFESSION	46 2 1 3 1 5 2 13 8 22	25 1 1 1 1 3 0 7 7	25 1 N 1 N 1 N 0 N 1 N 3 N 0 U 4 U 8	21 1 0 2 0 0 2 2 2 13 1	19 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	1 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N 0 N

GEN GENDER

# Appendix - 5

CEEDS: Workforce Composition Summary 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2016 (End of the audit period) RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 08:37:43.6 NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS)
WORK FORCE COMPOSITION SUMMARY
016 AGENCY 905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

QUARTER 2 YEAR 2016

AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY  EEO JOB GROUP : 002 MANAGERS  TITLE TITLE  ASIAN AM IND UN- AND UN- A														
TITLE TITLE			MAL	E					FEM	IALE	AM IND			TOTAL
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN	OTHER	EMP
10026 ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY	2	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
10033 ADMINISTRATIVE PUBLIC INFO	2 1 1	Ō	0 0 0	Ŏ	Ŏ	Ŏ	0	Ŏ	Ŏ	Ŏ	Ŏ	Ŏ	Ŏ	1
10050 COMPUTER SYSTEMS MANAGER 30114 ASSISTANT DISTRICT ATTORNE	18	0	0	2	0	0	14	0	0	0	0	0 6	0	46
		_	-		· ·	_			-	-	-	_	-	
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	22 43.15	$\frac{2}{3.92}$	0.00	2 3.92	0.00	$\frac{2}{3.92}$	$\begin{array}{c} 14 \\ 27.45 \end{array}$	3 5.88	0.00	0.00	0.00	6 11.76	0	51 100.00
	13.13	3.94	0.00	3.92	0.00	3.94	27.43	3.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	11.70	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTRI EEO JOB GROUP : 003 MANAGE	CT ATTO	RNEY-RI	CHMOND											
			3 6 3 T	E					FEM	ALE	AM IND			
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WILLUD	DIACK	IIT CDNI	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	WILLUD	DIACK	IIT CDM	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	OTTED	TOTAL
			HISPN	PACIS	ALASK			BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK		OTHER	
1002A ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
	50.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	50.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	$100.0\overline{0}$
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTRI EEO JOB GROUP : 004 SCIENC	יד סס∩דד	CCTONTAT	C											
TITLE TITLE			MAL	E	AM TND	TINI_			F.F.W	IALE	AM IND	TINI_		TOTAL
CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN	OTHER	
13651 COMPUTER PROGRAMMER ANALYS		0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
HEO OOD GROOT TOTTEL	0.00		100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTRI			CHMOND	COUNTY										
EEO JOB GROUP : 007 SOCIAI			MAT	ਯ					EEM	יא ד גי				
TITLE TITLE			MAL	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-			FEM	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-		TOTAL
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	ALASK	KNOWN	OTHER	EMP
52613 SOCIAL WORKER	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	3
	$33.3\overline{4}$	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	33.33	0.00	33.33	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00

PAGE: 258 REPORT: EBEPR210

AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY EEO JOB GROUP : 009 PUBLIC RELATIONS

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 08:37:43.6

# NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) WORK FORCE COMPOSITION SUMMARY 016 AGENCY 905 DISTRICT ATTORNEY-RICHMOND COUNTY

PAGE: 259 REPORT: EBEPR210

QUARTER 2 YEAR 2016

			MAI	Æ					FEM	IALE				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	
60621 PROGRAM PRODUCER	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTREEO JOB GROUP : 010 TECHNE	ICT ATTO ICIANS								EEM	יאו ה				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
06606 CHIEF INVESTIGATOR (STATEN 30080 PARALEGAL AIDE 31105 INVESTIGATOR	1 0 1	0 0 0	0 1 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 2 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	1 3 1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	40.00	0.00	20.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	40.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTREEO JOB GROUP : 012 CLERIO	CAL SUPE	RVISORS							EEN	17 17				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	$\mathtt{WHITE}$	BLACK	HISPN	PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	
10124 PRINCIPAL ADMINISTRATIVE A	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTR. EEO JOB GROUP : 013 CLERIO	CAL			To.					TT TO N	17 1. 12				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
10212 REPORTER/STENOGRAPHER (DA) 10251 CLERICAL ASSOCIATE 10252 SECRETARY	0 0 0	0 0	0 0 0	0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	4 8 1	0 0	0 1 0	0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	4 9 1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	92.86	0.00	$7.1\overset{1}{4}$	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
AGENCY CODE : 905 DISTREEO JOB GROUP : 018 POLICE	ICT ATTO													
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP

RUN DATE: 01/05/16 RUN TIME: 08:37:43.6 QUARTER 2 YEAR 20		YWIDE E	QUAL EM	PLOYMEN CE COMP	TYWIDE T DATAB OSITION TTORNEY	ASE SYS SUMMAR	TEM (CE Y	EDS)	CES		PA REPO	GE: RT: EB	260 EPR210	
30827 SENIOR DETECTIVE INVESTIGA	6	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	8
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	75.00	0.00	12.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	12.50	0.00	0.00	0.00 1	.00.00
EEO JOB GROUP : 031 PARA	ICT ATTC PROFESSI		CUPATIO	NS E					FEM					
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK	UN- KNOWN		TOTAL EMP
56056 COMMUNITY ASSISTANT 56057 COMMUNITY ASSOCIATE 56058 COMMUNITY COORDINATOR	0 4 2	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 1 0	1 5 1	0 0 0	1 4 0	0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	0 0 0	2 14 3
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	31.58	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	5.26	7 36.84	0.00	26.32	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00 1	00.00
AGENCY TOTAL:	39 36.46	1.87	2.80	2 1.87	0.00	2.80	41 38.32	2.80	7 6.54	0.93	0.00	6 5.61	0.00 1	107



# OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY RICHMOND COUNTY

# MICHAEL E. MCMAHON DISTRICT ATTORNEY

130 STUYVESANT PLACE STATEN ISLAND, NEW YORK 10301 TELEPHONE (718) 876-6300

June 24, 2016

Charise L. Terry, PHR
Executive Director
NYC Equal Employment Practices Commission
253 Broadway, Suite 602
New York, NY 10007

Re: Preliminary Determination for Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 and December 31, 2015.

## Dear Executive Director Terry:

Please find below the Richmond County District Attorney's Office response to the preliminary audit review.

## **Corrective Action #1:**

A. Section 1. of the RCDA Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, page 2, is hereby amended to read as follows:

The Office of the Richmond County District Attorney (RCDA) is an equal opportunity employer and prohibits discriminatory employment actions against and treatment of City employees and applicants for employment based on actual or perceived race, color, national origin, alienage or citizenship status, religion or creed, gender (including "gender identity" - which refers to a person's actual or perceived sex, and includes self-image, appearance,

behavior or expression, whether or not different from that traditionally associated with the legal sex assigned to the person at birth), predisposing genetic characteristics, disability, age (18years and over), prior record of arrest or conviction, partnership status, military status, sexual harassment, sexual orientation, status as a victim or witness of domestic violence, sex offenses or stalking, pregnancy, marital status, consumer credit history, unemployment status or caregiver status.

B. Section 4, Subsection F, paragraph 1, is hereby amended to read as follows:

The following federal, state and local agencies enforce laws against discrimination: The United States Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (the "EEOC") and the Department of Justice, New York State Division of Human Rights, and the New York City Commission on Human Rights. Information about how to contact these agencies is given below: EEOC website at <a href="https://www.eeoc.gov">https://www.eeoc.gov</a> or 866-408-8075, NYS Division of Human Rights website at <a href="http://www.dhr.ny.gov">http://www.dhr.ny.gov</a> or (888) 392-3644, NYC Commission on Human Rights website at <a href="http://www.nyc.gov/html/cchr/html/home/home.shtml">http://www.nyc.gov/html/cchr/html/home/home.shtml</a> or (718) 722-3131. Complaints may also be filed at the Office of Citywide Diversity and Equal Employment Opportunity, DCAS, 1 Centre Street, 17th Floor, New York, NY 10007, (212) 386-0257. Please note that there are statutory deadlines for filing complaints with each of these agencies.

An updated version of the EEO Policy will be posted on the RCDA intranet and electronic copy distribute to all employees.

### **Corrective Action #2:**

As stated in the agency initial submission, the City's EEO Computer Based Training website was not functioning for the greater part of 2015. I have just been given access in May 2016 (see Appendix 1).

The agency will provide the training to all new and existing employees as soon as possible.

## **Corrective Action #3:**

RCDA recruitment efforts did not adversely impact any particular protected class. However, concerted efforts will be made to reach out to professional and community based organizations serving women, minorities and other protected groups, especially in job titles where protected classes are being underutilized.

Regarding the underutilization of protected classes in clerical job group, it must be noted that all the employees serving in this group are permanent employees who have been called from the civil service lists. The office has no control over their demographics.

## **Corrective Action #4:**

There are no barriers to equal employment opportunity within the agency. All job vacancies are posted citywide. Candidates were selected for interviews based on their skills without identifying their race, age, ethnicity or other categories.

All promotions are based on merit, and all separated employees during the period in review either resigned or retired voluntarily.

The District Attorney's non-discriminatory commitment is illustrated by the fact that there were no EEO complaints during the period in review.

## **Corrective Action #5:**

An assessment of office hiring procedures has been conducted. No adverse impact on any particular racial, ethnic, disability or gender group has been discerned. Candidates were selected for employment based solely on job-related skills.

On the underutilization of protected classes in the Managers, Clerical and Paraprofessional job groups, all the employees in the Clerical group are permanent employees who have been called from the civil service list. Most of the employees in the remaining two job categories are staff members who have been working for the agency/city for a long period of time. Therefore we do not expect any changes to take place with these demographics until a separation takes place.

## Corrective Action #6:

The utilization data has been reviewed. Efforts will be made at broadening the advertisement of job vacancies, particularly with respect to discretionary titles, in minority publications, as well as participating in career fairs such as the LGBT career fair.

## Corrective Action #7:

The agency has been reviewing the utilization data. Where there is underrepresentation in civil service (list) titles, the office has been collaborating with the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) to ensure that the contents of the examinations reflect job-related competencies, skills and abilities (CSA). For example, one of the titles indicated in the utilization report is Reporter/Stenographer.

The office worked with DCAS in the development of the examination for the title in December 2015 by sending the typical tasks and representations during group discussions (see Appendix 2).

### **Corrective Action #8:**

All managers, bureau chiefs and the executives involved in the selection process during the period in review are seasoned professionals that have knowledge of legal and illegal interview questions and unconscious bias. Their focus is only on job-related techniques in order to select the most capable candidates.

As stated in the agency's initial submission, the office is developing a Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (UGESP) to streamline the selection process.

## Corrective Action # 9:

The Richmond District Attorney's Office will enroll the new EEO Counselor, Ashleigh Owens, who joined the agency in January 2016, in the next available training for EEO Professionals.

The period in review was July 1, 2014, through December 31, 2015. During that period, the Office EEO Counselor was Camille Gatins. As such, the agency submitted her EEO certification.

## **Corrective Action #10:**

The individual who was the EEO Officer for the greater part of 2015 no longer works for the agency. At this time, the office cannot determine whether there were meetings between him and the former Acting District Attorney during the period in review.

Moving forward, RCDA will maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and communications between the District Attorney and the principal EEO professional on EEO matters.

## **Corrective Action #11:**

The Richmond County District Attorney's Office will be implementing the above measures and increase the awareness of the need for all-inclusive workforce.

As a non-Mayoral agency, RCDA will be submitting an annual plan.

- Kha

Taiwo Onabanjo

Principal HR Professional Principal EEO Professional

Michael E. McMahon

District Attorney



Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

Marie E. Giraud, Esq.
Agency Attorney/
Director of Compliance Monitoring

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

### **BY MAIL AND EMAIL**

July 8, 2016

Michael E. McMahon District Attorney Office of the Richmond County District Attorney 130 Stuyvesant Place, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor Staten Island, NY 10301

RE: Audit Resolution #2016/905: Final Determination Pursuant to the Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2015.

Dear District Attorney McMahon:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you for your June 24, 2016 response to our June 10, 2016 Preliminary Determination and for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit.

As indicated in our Preliminary Determination, this Commission has adopted uniform standards¹ to assess agencies' employment practices and programs for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. The attached Determination contains the Commission's findings and required corrective actions pertaining to the referenced review, evaluation and monitoring of your agency's employment practices and procedures.

Chapter 36, Section 832.c of the New York City Charter requires that: 1) the EEPC assign a 6-month compliance period to monitor your agency's efforts to eliminate remaining required corrective actions; and 2) the agency provide a written response within 30 days from the date of this letter indicating corrective action taken.

¹ Founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code, §§8-107.1(a) and 8-107.13(d)); New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7) and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter.



The assigned compliance-monitoring period is: <u>JULY 2016 TO DECEMBER 2016</u>.

If corrective actions remain: Your agency's response should indicate what steps your agency has taken, or will take, to implement the corrective actions during the designated period. Documentation which supports the implementation of each corrective action shall be uploaded to TeamCentral, the EEPC's Automated Compliance-Monitoring System. Your agency will be monitored monthly until all corrective actions have been implemented. Instruction on how to access and navigate TeamCentral is attached. Upon your agency's completion of the final corrective action, this Commission requires that your agency upload a final memorandum signed by the agency head which informs employees of the changes implemented pursuant to our audit and re-emphasizes commitment to the EEO program. Upon receipt of the final memorandum, the EEPC will issue a *Determination of Compliance*.

If no corrective actions remain: Your agency is exempt from the aforementioned monitoring period. However, this Commission requires a final memorandum signed by the agency head which informs employees of the changes implemented pursuant to our audit and re-emphasizes commitment to the EEO program. This will be considered your agency's final action. Upon receipt of the memo, a *Determination of Compliance* will be issued.

If there are further questions regarding this Final Determination or the compliance-monitoring process, please have the Principal EEO Professional call Marie Giraud, Esq., Agency Attorney/Director of Compliance Monitoring at 212-615-8942.

Thank you and your staff for your continued cooperation.

Sincerely,

Charise L. Terry, PH Executive Director

C: Taiwo Onabanjo, Principal EEO Professional



Agency: Richmond County District Attorney

Compliance Period: July 2016 to December 2016

#### FINAL DETERMINATION

Agency response indicating corrective action taken with documentation is due within 30 days.

The Equal Employment Practices Commission's findings and required corrective actions are based on the audit methodology which includes collection and analysis of the documents, records and data the agency provided in response to the *EEPC Document and Information Request Form;* the *EEPC Interview Questionnaires* for EEO professionals and others involved in EEO program administration; and, if applicable, the *EEPC Employee Survey;* the *EEPC Supervisor/Manager Survey;* the agency's *Annual EEO Plans* and *Quarterly EEO Reports;* and workforce and utilization data from the *Citywide Equal Employment Database System.* Additional research and follow-up discussions or interviews were conducted as appropriate.

After reviewing the agency's optional response (if applicable) to the EEPC's preliminary Determination, our Final Determination is as follows:

#### Agree

Regarding your responses<sup>2</sup> to the following EEPC required corrective actions, we *Agree* based on documentation that is attached to your response.

<u>Corrective Action #1</u> Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the <u>Equal Employment</u> Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies — or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws — for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: an up-to date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.

Agency Response: "An updated version of the EEO Policy will be posted on the RCDA intranet and electronic copy distribute [sic] to all employees." Page 2 of agency response and subsequent attachment.

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC accepts the agency's response and updated EEO Policy (which includes a list of "Other Places Where Complaints May Be Filed" and an up to date list of protected classes) as verification that Corrective Action #1 has been implemented.

#### **Monitoring Required**

The agency's implementation of the following required corrective actions will be monitored during the assigned compliance monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #2

Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or

<sup>2</sup> Excerpts are italicized.

Final Determination Page 3 of 7



responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.

Agency Response: "The agency will provide the training to all new and existing employees as soon as possible." Agency response page 2.

<u>EEPC Response:</u> The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to the implementation of corrective action #2. Documentation which verifies implementation will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period.

#### **Corrective Action #3**

Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

#### Agency Response:

"[C]oncerted efforts will be made to reach out to professional and community based organizations serving women, minorities and other protected groups, especially in job titles where protected classes are being underutilized. Regarding the underutilization of protected classes in Clerical job group, it must be noted that all the employees serving in this group are permanent employees who have been called from the civil service lists." Agency response page 3.

#### **EEPC Response**:

The EEPC recognizes the agency's efforts to begin the process of addressing underutilization in the remaining three (3) job groups. An assessment of the agency's recruitment efforts will be required during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #4

Ensure that the Director of Human Resources/principal EEO professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

<u>Agency Response</u>: "The District Attorney's non-discriminatory commitment is illustrated by the fact that there were no EEO complaints during the period in review." Agency response page 3.

<u>EEPC Response</u>: An assessment of the agency's regular/annual internal audit of its statistical information, employment practices and the agency's determination of barriers to equal

Final Determination Page 4 of 7



opportunity/corrective actions required, if any, will be required during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

#### **Corrective Action #5**

Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are jobrelated. Discontinue using criteria that are not job related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

Agency Response: "An assessment of office hiring procedures has been conducted. No adverse impact on any particular racial, ethnic, disability or gender group has been discerned. [A]II the employees in the Clerical job group are permanent employees who have been called from the civil service list." Agency response page 3.

#### **EEPC Response**:

The EEPC recognizes the agency's effort to address Corrective Action #5. Documentation of the agency's assessment of the manner in which candidates are selected for employment will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #6

If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

Agency Response: "The utilization data has been reviewed. Efforts will be made at broadening the advertisement of job vacancies, particularly with respect to discretionary titles, in minority publications, as well as participating in career fairs such as the LGBT career fair." Agency response page 4.

#### **EEPC Response:**

The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement Corrective Action #6. Documentation of the agency's efforts to recruit and hire interested and qualified women, minorities, and candidates from other protected groups into discretionary titles in job groups that indicate underrepresentation, will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #7

If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-

Final Determination Page 5 of 7



related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

Agency Response: "Where there is underrepresentation in civil service (list) titles, the office has been collaborating with the Department of Citywide Administrative Services (DCAS) to ensure that the contents of the examinations reflect job-related competencies, skills and abilities (CSA). For example, one of the titles indicated in the utilization report is Reporter/Stenographer. The office worked with DCAS in the development of the examination for the title in December 2015 by sending the typical tasks and representations [sic] during group discussions." Agency response page 4.

#### **EEPC Response**:

The EEPC recognizes the agency's effort to implement Corrective Action #7 and documentation of the agency's effort to work with DCAS on the Reporter/Stenographer examination. Documentation of the agency's efforts to recruit and hire interested and qualified women, minorities, and candidates from other protected groups into civil service (list) titles in job groups that indicate underrepresentation, will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #8

Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).

Agency Response: "[T]he office is developing a Uniform Guidelines [sic] on Employee Selection Procedures (UGESP) to streamline the selection process." Agency response page 4.

#### **EEC Response:**

The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement Corrective Action #8. Documentation which demonstrates implementation of this corrective action will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #9

Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.

Agency Response: "The Richmond District Attorney's Office will enroll the new EEO Counselor [...], who joined the agency in January 2016, in the next available training for EEO Professionals." Agency response page 4

Final Determination Page 6 of 7



#### **EEPC** Response:

The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement Corrective Action #9. Documentation which demonstrates implementation of this corrective action will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #10

Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.

<u>Agency Response</u>: "Moving forward, RCDA will maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and communications between the District Attorney and the principal EEO professional on EEO matters." Agency response page 5.

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to implement Corrective Action #10. Documentation which demonstrates implementation of this corrective action will be reviewed during the compliance-monitoring period.

#### Corrective Action #11

Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

Agency Response: "As a non-Mayoral agency, RCDA will be submitting an annual plan."

<u>EEPC Response</u>: The EEPC recognizes the agency's commitment to the implementation of corrective action #11. The EEPC will provide further guidance at the initiation of the compliance-monitoring period.

Thank you and your staff for your continued cooperation.

Final Determination Page 7 of 7

# EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES COMMISSION CITY OF NEW YORK

**RESOLUTION #2016/905:** Final Determination pursuant to the Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 through December 31, 2015.

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2) and (5) of the New York City Charter, the Equal Employment Practices Commission is authorized to audit and evaluate the employment practices, programs, policies, and procedures of city agencies and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women, and to make recommendations to city agencies to insure equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women; and

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2), this Commission has adopted Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits and Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; and

Whereas, pursuant to its audit of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's (RCDA) Employment Practices and Procedures, the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) issued a Preliminary Determination letter, dated June 10, 2016, setting forth findings and the following required corrective actions:

- 1. Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: an up-to date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.
- Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.
- 3. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

- 4. Ensure that the Director of Human Resources/principal EEO professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.
- 5. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
- 6. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 7. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable). Then advertise in minority- or female oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 8. Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).
- 9. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.
- 10. Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.

11. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

Whereas, the agency submitted its response to the EEPC's Preliminary Determination letter, on June 24, 2016 with documentation of its actions to rectify required corrective action no. 1; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC considered the agency's response and issued a Final Determination on July 8, 2016 which agreed and accepted documentation for implementation of the aforementioned corrective actions, and indicated that corrective action(s) nos. 2 - 11 require compliance monitoring; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832 (c) of the City Charter, the EEPC is required to monitor the agency for a period not to exceed six months, from July 2016 through December 2016, to determine whether it implemented remaining required corrective actions; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832 (c) of the City Charter, the agency is required to respond in 30 days and make monthly reports thereafter to the Commission on the progress of implementation of such corrective actions; and

Whereas, all of the EEPC's corrective actions are required by, or are consistent with, federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; Now Therefore,

**Be It Resolved**, that the Commission will forward this Final Determination to Michael E. McMahon, District Attorney of Richmond County.

Approved unanimously on September 9, 2016.

Angela Cabrera

Commissioner

Arva Rice

Commissioner

Malini Cadambi Daniel
Commissioner

Absent

Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Commissioner



### OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY RICHMOND COUNTY

#### MICHAEL E. MCMAHON DISTRICT ATTORNEY

130 STUYVESANT PLACE STATEN ISLAND, NEW YORK 10301 TELEPHONE (718) 876-6300

August 25, 2016

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director NYC Equal Employment Practices Commission 253 Broadway, Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

Re: Audit Resolution #2016/905: Final Determination Pursuant to the Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 through December 31, 2015.

#### Dear Executive Director Terry:

I am writing to acknowledge receipt of the Final Audit Resolution #2016/905, which is related to the employment practices and procedures of my office. Please be assured that we have already begun corrective actions for the findings that you previously brought to our attention. We have already completed EEO training and will continue to implement any other actions necessary to be in complete compliance during the next sixmonth compliance monitoring period.

Should you or any member of your staff have any questions regarding this issue, please feel free to contact my Director of Human Resources, Mr. Taiwo Onabanjo. He can be reached at (718) 556-7170.

Sincerely

Michael E. McMahon

District Attorney

MEM:sjb



### OFFICE OF THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY RICHMOND COUNTY

#### MICHAEL E. MCMAHON DISTRICT ATTORNEY

130 STUYVESANT PLACE STATEN ISLAND, NEW YORK 10301 TELEPHONE (718) 876-6300

#### MEMORANDUM

To:

All Staff

C:

**EEPC** 

From:

Michael E. McMahon, District Attorney

Date:

January 23, 2017

Subject:

**EEPC Audit/ RCDA EEO Program** 

The Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) completed an audit of our office's employment practices and procedures with a review of the period from January 1, 2012 to December 31, 2015, to ensure compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. I am pleased to report that we are now in full compliance with the audit standards. The following changes have been implemented to the agency's Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) program:

- 1. The agency's *EEO Policy* has been updated to include the newly classified protected classes.
- 2. The *Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures* (UGESP) has been developed and implemented to provide a single set of principles of assessing applicants for employment.
- 3. The agency has created an *Annual RCDA EEO Diversity and Inclusion Plan*: to report to the EEPC on the agency's plan for the coming year.
- 4. The agency's workforce analysis will be conducted by the HR professional at once annually.

I affirm this Agency's strong commitment to maintaining fair employment practices for all employees and job applicants. It is essential that RCDA prevents discrimination and ensures that all employees are aware of their rights and obligations under the agency's Equal Employment Opportunity Policy.

All employees are encouraged to utilize the resources available within RCDA's EEO Office and to address any concerns to Taiwo Onabanjo, Director of Human Resources/EEO Officer or Ashleigh Owens, Special A.D.A. for External Affairs/EEO Counsel.

A copy of the agency's EEO Policy and discrimination complaint and investigation procedures ca be obtained at: http://intranet.rcdaoffice.org/EEO%20Policy/Forms/AllItems.aspx

#### EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES COMMISSION CITY OF NEW YORK

**RESOLUTION #2016AP/905C-24:** Determination of **Compliance** (Monitoring Period Required) by the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney with the Equal Employment Practices Commission's required corrective actions pursuant to the Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 through December 31, 2015.

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2) and (5) of the New York City Charter, the Equal Employment Practices Commission is authorized to audit and evaluate the employment practices, programs, policies, and procedures of city agencies and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women, and to make recommendations to city agencies to insure equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women; and

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2), this Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits* and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; and

Whereas, pursuant to its audit and analysis of the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney's (RCDA) Employment Practices and Procedures, the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) issued a Preliminary Determination letter, dated June 10, 2016, setting forth findings and the following required corrective actions:

- 1. Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: an up-to date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.
- 2. Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.
- 3. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
- 4. Ensure that the Director of Human Resources/principal EEO professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity

within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.

- 5. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
- 6. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 7. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 8. Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).
- Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy by promptly attending training for EEO professionals by DCAS or another appropriate agency/school. Obtain a certificate of completion.
- 10. Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
- 11. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

Whereas, the RCDA submitted its response to the EEPC's Preliminary Determination letter, on June 24, 2016, with documentation of its actions to rectify required corrective action #1, and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Submission of Quarterly Reports on EEO Activity is optional for non-Mayoral agencies.

EEPC considered the agency's response and issued a Final Determination on July 8, 2016, which agreed and accepted documentation for implementation of the aforementioned corrective action, with corrective actions #2 through 11, remaining; and

Whereas, the RCDA submitted its response to the EEPC's final determination letter, on August 25, 2016, and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC monitored the agency's implementation of the remaining corrective actions from July 2016 through December 2016 with an extension of one month granted by the EEPC; and

Whereas, at the EEPC's request pursuant to Section 815.a.(15) of the New York City Charter, the RCDA submitted a copy of the agency head's memorandum to staff, which outlined the corrective actions implemented in response to the EEPC's audit and reiterated his commitment to the agency's EEO Program; and

Whereas, all of the EEPC's corrective actions are required by, or are consistent with, federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; Now Therefore,

**Be It Resolved**, that the RCDA has implemented the required corrective actions deemed necessary to ensure compliance with the equal employment opportunity standards of this Commission and requirements of Chapters 35 and 36 of the City Charter.

**Be It Finally Resolved**, that the Commission will forward the Determination of Compliance to District Attorney Michael E. McMahon of the Richmond County District Attorney's Office.

Approved unanimously on February 16, 2017.

Angela Cabrera

Whele Cabrer

Commissioner

Arva Rice

Commissioner

Malini Cadambi Daniel

Commissioner

Elaine S. Reiss, Esq.

Commissioner



Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

#### BY MAIL AND EMAIL

February 16, 2017

Michael E. McMahon District Attorney Office of the Richmond County District Attorney 130 Stuyvesant Place, 7th Floor Staten Island, NY 10301

Re: Resolution #2016AP/905C-24: Determination of Agency Compliance

Dear District Attorney McMahon:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC or Commission), I want to inform you that the Commission has issued the attached Determination of Compliance to the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney. This Commission has determined that the Office of the Richmond County District Attorney has implemented the required corrective actions deemed necessary by this Commission for ensuring a fair and effective affirmative employment program of equal opportunity as required by the equal employment opportunity standards of this Commission and Chapters 35 and 36 of the New York City Charter.

On behalf of this Commission, I want to thank you and EEO Officer Taiwo Onabanjo for the cooperation extended to the EEPC during the compliance-monitoring period.

Sincerely,

Malini Cadambi Daniel

Commissioner

c: Taiwo Onabanjo, Principal EEO Professional

This

## Determination of Compliance

is issued to the

## Office of the Richmond County District Attorney

for successfully implementing 11 of 11 required corrective actions pursuant to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's Employment Practice and Procedures Audit From July 1, 2014 to this date.

On this 16th day of February in the year 2017,

Malini Cadambi Daniel, Commissioner

1 Cadamt.

Charise L. Terry, PHR, Executive Director

In care of District Attorney, Michael E. McMahon and Principal EEO Professional Taiwo Onabanjo