



OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE TRIALS AND HEARINGS

Dismissal Report March 2019

- Vehicle For Hire & Taxi Hearings
- Health & Restaurant Hearings
- ECB Hearings
- DCA Hearings



FIDEL F. DEL VALLE

COMMISSIONER &
CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE TRIALS AND HEARINGS

April 20th, 2019

- **Pursuant to New York City Local Law No. 64, attached is the Monthly Report Relating to Dismissals of Civil Penalty Violations in the Tribunals within the jurisdiction of OATH for the month of March, 2019.**
- **Please be advised that the numbers for OATH's Health, DCA and Taxi & Limousine Tribunals reflect the number of charges rather than the number of summonses, dismissed. There may be multiple charges on each summons.**

FY 19 Vehicle for Hire & Taxi Hearings*

AGENCY	Dismissals	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Grand Total
TLC	Dismissed No Violation/On the Merits	361	391	293	311	308	317	348	279	331				2,939
	Dismissed No Jurisdiction		3	2	1	1	5	2	1	19				34
	Dismissed Defective Service					1	1	1	1	2				6
	Dismissed Defective Summons/charge (defective on its face)	12	8	6	7	5	5	9	78	79				209
	Dismissed - Failure to Prosecute	10	16	11	17	27	8	17	35	10				151
	Dismissed - Successfully Disputed Ownership		1											1
	Dismissed - Wrong Party Named		5		6			1						12
	Dismissed - No Prima Facie Case	31	31	19	27	7	24	43	43	64				289
	Withdrawal	19	39	24	28	64	40	76	38	13				341
	Dismissed - Administrative Dismissal													
TLC	Total Dismissed	433	494	355	397	413	400	497	475	518	-	-	-	3,982
NYPD	Dismissed No Violation/On the Merits	11	19	10	38	29	18	18	13	36				192
	Dismissed No Jurisdiction		1											1
	Dismissed Defective Service							3		2				5
	Dismissed Defective Summons/charge (defective on its face)	21	17	14	15	13	7	12	8	38				145
	Dismissed - Failure to Prosecute				1									1
	Dismissed - Successfully Disputed Ownership													-
	Dismissed - Wrong Party Named													-
	Dismissed - No Prima Facie Case	7	6	3	9	3	6	10	3	16				63
	Withdrawal													-
	Dismissed - Administrative Dismissal													-
NYPD	Total Dismissed	39	43	27	63	45	31	43	24	92	-	-	-	407
Port Authority	Dismissed No Violation/On the Merits	3	1	6	6	6		3	1					26
	Dismissed No Jurisdiction													-
	Dismissed Defective Service													-
	Dismissed Defective Summons/charge (defective on its face)													-
	Dismissed - Failure to Prosecute							1						1
	Dismissed - Successfully Disputed Ownership													-
	Dismissed - Wrong Party Named													-
	Dismissed - No Prima Facie Case		4	1	2	2								9
	Withdrawal													-
	Dismissed - Administrative Dismissal													-
Port Authority	Total Dismissed	3	5	7	8	8	-	4	1	-	-	-	-	36
Grand Total		475	542	389	468	466	431	544	500	610	-	-	-	4,425

*by charge

FY 19 Health & Restaurant Hearings*

AGENCY	Dismissals	July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Grand Total
DOHMH*	Dismissed No Violation/On the Merits	2,748	2,747	2,550	3,057	2,591	2,172	2,598	2,108	2,525				23,096
	Dismissed No Jurisdiction	15	3	6	24	3	3	3	6	24				87
	Dismissed Defective Service	15	37	10	25	33	11	84	6	7				228
	Dismissed Defective Summons/charge (defective on its face)	13	28	28	24	24	6	14	7	7				151
	Dismissed - Failure to Prosecute	11	-	1	2	8	2	1	-	1				26
	Dismissed - Successfully Disputed Ownership	1	5	-	-	-	-	3	-	-				9
	Dismissed - Wrong Party Named	10	11	17	13	4	2	6	6	-				69
	Dismissed - No Prima Facie Case	216	256	148	205	212	166	175	101	219				1,698
	Withdrawal	4	7	9	1	3	5	2	8	4				43
	Dismissed - Administrative Dismissal	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Grand Total	3,033	3,094	2,769	3,351	2,878	2,367	2,886	2,242	2,787	-	-	-	25,407	

*by charge

FY 19 DCA Hearings

AGENCY	Dismissals	July	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	Jun	Grand Total	
DCA*	Dismissed No Violation/On the Merits	24	39	39	33	20	22	34	24	43				278	
	Dismissed No Jurisdiction	-	1	1	-	-	-	-	-	-				2	
	Dismissed Defective Service	-	4	2	1	-	2	3	10	-				22	
	Dismissed Defective Summons/charge (defective on its face)	1	1	3	9	-	1	2	1	-				18	
	Dismissed - Failure to Prosecute	-	-	2	7	-	3	-	-	4				16	
	Dismissed - Successfully Disputed Ownership	-	-	-	-	-	-	10	-	-				10	
	Dismissed - Wrong Party Named	1	-	6	-	-	3	1	5	1				17	
	Dismissed - No Prima Facie Case	-	-	-	1	1	1	-	20	-				23	
	Withdrawal	19	28	21	39	11	28	24	39	13				222	
	Dismissed - Administrative Dismissal	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	Grand Total		45	73	74	90	32	60	74	99	61	-	-	-	608

*by charge

FY 19 ECB Hearings

Agency Group	Issuing Agency	Dismissal Reason	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	Grand Total		
BUILDINGS(DOB)	DOB-DEPT OF BUILDINGS	ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB		6	4		8	14	6	2	4				44		
		DEFECTIVE NOV	29	41	33	41	56	76	43	90	78					487	
		DEFECTIVE SERVICE	73	92	61	121	118	147	127	151	139					1029	
		DISPUTED OWNERSHIP	42	45	37	42	32	45	25	58	41					367	
		IMPROPER PARTY CITED	85	102	70	96	91	85	109	64	117					819	
		NO ECB JURISDICTION	2	1		2		2	17	3	2					29	
		NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS	616	644	506	677	664	703	666	833	858					6167	
		PROSECUTION WITHDRAWN	130	151	239	120	163	107	164	232	159					1465	
		UNASSIGNED REASON	2		9	4	2	1	1							19	
		WORK DONE BY PREV. OWNER	54	51	40	45	37	28	31	54	52					392	
		DATA CORRECTION	2	11	8	18	19	28	43	30	32					191	
		FAILURE TO PROSECUTE	2	3	3	4	8	3								26	
		NO PRIMA FACIA CASE	29	66	30	58	77	69	74	83	74					560	
		WITHDRAWAL AFTER ADJUDICATE	5	10	7	8	5	8	6	3	11					63	
		INTEREST OF JUSTICE			1						1					2	
		DOB-DEPT OF BUILDINGS Total			1071	1224	1047	1236	1280	1316	1312	1604	1570				11660
		810-DEPT OF BUILDINGS 810	ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB				1	1									2
			IMPROPER PARTY CITED														
			DEFECTIVE NOV								1						1
			DEFECTIVE SERVICE								2						2
			NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS		2		2		2	4			3				13
			NO PRIMA FACIA CASE		1	1			1								3
		810-DEPT OF BUILDINGS 810 Total			3	1	3	1	3	7	3	3				21	
		BUILDINGS(DOB) Total			1071	1227	1048	1239	1281	1319	1319	1604	1573				11681
		ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION(DEP)	824-DEP - IWC	ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB	1								1				2
				DEFECTIVE NOV		1	4	8	2								
DEFECTIVE SERVICE	2					1										3	
DISPUTED OWNERSHIP																	
IMPROPER PARTY CITED																	
NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS	1			2		1										4	
PROSECUTION WITHDRAWN	4			2	12	1	5	3			3	2				32	
NO PRIMA FACIA CASE								1								1	
824-DEP - IWC Total				8	5	16	11	7	4	4	2				57		
825-DEP - BUREAU OF CUST SRV	ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB			30	5	4	23	15	9	13	9	3					111
	DEFECTIVE NOV				1				1	2	4	1					9
	DEFECTIVE SERVICE			5	3	1	1	2	4	1	3						20
	DISPUTED OWNERSHIP			1		2	1			1	2	2					9
	IMPROPER PARTY CITED					2	2	1									5
	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE							1									1
	NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS			4	8	2	5	8	4	8	6	8					53
	PROSECUTION WITHDRAWN					1		1					1				3
	WORK DONE BY PREV. OWNER							1		1							2
	NO PRIMA FACIA CASE			2	2		2	1	2	1	1	1					12
	825-DEP - BUREAU OF CUST SRV Total			42	19	12	34	30	20	27	25	16			225		
	826-DEP - BUREAU OF ENV. COMP			ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB				1									
DEFECTIVE NOV																	
DEFECTIVE SERVICE						2	1				3						6
DISPUTED OWNERSHIP														3			3
IMPROPER PARTY CITED				1													1
NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS				1	1	1					2						5
PROSECUTION WITHDRAWN		2									6				8		
NO PRIMA FACIA CASE										1					1		
WITHDRAWAL AFTER ADJUDICATE																	
826-DEP - BUREAU OF ENV. COMP Total			4	3	3			5	1	9				25			
989-DEP POLICE	ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB							1							1		
	DEFECTIVE NOV																
	DEFECTIVE SERVICE																
	DISPUTED OWNERSHIP																
	NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS					1			1						2		
	NO PRIMA FACIA CASE																
989-DEP POLICE Total						1	1	1						3			
ASB-ASBESTOS CONTROL PROGRAM	ADMIN. DISMISSAL ECB	1									3				4		
	DEFECTIVE NOV		2	1			1		1		1				6		
	DEFECTIVE SERVICE																
	DISPUTED OWNERSHIP					1									1		
	IMPROPER PARTY CITED	2			1										3		
	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE														1		
	NO VIOL. DISMISS ON MERITS	4	14	8	7	7	2	6	17	8					73		
	PROSECUTION WITHDRAWN	5	7	8	6	6	5	6	3	20					66		
	DATA CORRECTION								3						3		
	NO PRIMA FACIA CASE		2						2	1					5		
ASB-ASBESTOS CONTROL PROGRAM Total			12	25	17	15	14	7	15	24	33			162			

