The New York City Council's Response to the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget and Fiscal 2021 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report

As required under Sections 247(b) and 12(e) of the New York City Charter

Hon. Corey Johnson
Speaker

Hon. Daniel Dromm
Chair, Finance Committee

Hon. Helen Rosenthal
Chair, Subcommittee on Capital Budget

Latonia R. McKinney
Director, Finance Division

April 7, 2021

Finance Division

Legal Unit
Rebecca Chasan, Senior Counsel
Noah Brick
Stephanie Ruiz

Budget Unit
Regina Ryan, Deputy Director
Nathan Toth, Deputy Director
Crilhien Francisco, Unit Head
Chima Obichere, Unit Head
John Russell, Unit Head
Dohini Sompura, Unit Head
Eisha Wright, Unit Head
Aliya Ali
Sebastian Bacchi
John Basile
Chelsea Baytemur
Monika Bujak
Sarah Gastelum
Julia Haramis
Lauren Hunt
Florentine Kabore
Jack Kern
Daniel Kroop
Monica Pepple
Michele Peregrin
Masis Sarkissian
Frank Sarno
Jonathan Seltzer
Nevin Singh
Jack Storey
Luke Zangerle

Revenue and Economics Unit
Raymond Majewski, Deputy Director, Chief Economist
Emre Edev, Assistant Director
Paul Sturm, Supervising Economist
Hector German
William Kyeremateng
Nashia Roman
Andrew Wilber

Discretionary Funding and Data Support Unit
Paul Scimone, Deputy Director
James Reyes
Savanna Chou

Administrative Support Unit
Nicole Anderson
Maria Pagan
Courtneigh Summerrise

Table of Contents

Introduction

The New York City Council herein presents its response to the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget and Fiscal 2021 Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, as required by Sections 247(b) and 12(e) of the New York City Charter, respectively.

On January 14, 2021, Mayor de Blasio released a $92.3 billion proposed budget, which was conservatively crafted in light of the devastating impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic and the economic and budgetary risks that the City was facing at the time.

While much has changed since the release of the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget in January, the City's financial outlook is still precarious.

Relief provided by the federal government does significantly improve the City's short-term financial situation. The Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) increased it reimbursement rate such that the City will be fully reimbursed for its eligible COVID-19 expenses. And, in March, the $1.9 trillion American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA), provided funding for vaccinations; direct relief to States, localities, and families; and to struggling communities.[1]

The passage of the economic stimulus had two significant effects with respect to the City's budget. First, it sharply improved forecasters' outlook for national economic growth over the next two years. In January 2021, IHS Markit expected real gross domestic product to grow by 4.0 percent and 3.9 percent in 2021 and 2022, respectively. Just two months later, their forecast was raised to 5.7 percent and 4.1 percent, with the nation's output of goods and services expected to return to its pre-pandemic level as early as the second quarter of 2021.[2] This means that businesses and households will see incomes rise, leading to a faster bounce back in tax revenues for the City.

The Council's March 2, 2021 tax forecast projections exceeded those of the Administration by $904 million in Fiscal 2021 and $669 million in Fiscal 2022. But now, even this forecast may be overly conservative.[3] As of the end of February, Fiscal 2021 tax collections were $500 million above the Preliminary Plan, putting the City on pace to likely collect even more.

Second, ARPA provided $350 billion in emergency funding for direct aid to states and localities across the country so they can be better armed to provide relief and assistance to those impacted by COVID-19 and the resulting economic recession.[4] It is anticipated that the City will receive approximately $5.9 billion of this direct federal aid in two tranches, with the first distributed by May 10, 2021 and the second twelve months later.

[1] H.R.1319 - American Rescue Plan Act of 2021, available at https://www.congress.gov/bill/117th-congress/house-bill/1319

[2] IHS Markit, "Executive Summary: U.S. Economic Outlook", January and March 2021.

[3] New York City Council Finance Division, "Report to the Committee on Finance, Economic and Revenue Forecast, Tax Revenue Collections and Cash Plan" March 2, 2021.

[4] FACT SHEET: The American Rescue Plan Will Deliver Immediate Economic Relief to Families (Mar. 18, 2021), available at https://home.treasury.gov/news/featured-stories/fact-sheet-the-american-rescue-plan-will-deliver-immediate-economic-relief-to-families

In addition, ARPA provided significant categorical funding, including nearly $9 billion for K-12 schools in New York State, of which New York City should receive approximately half. It should be noted that these amounts are estimates. The official calculations will be released by the Treasury Department and the State Education Department in the coming weeks.

Lastly, the State budget is faring better as well. New York State anticipates receiving $2.5 billion more in federal aid and $2.5 billion more in tax revenue than was projected in the Executive Budget. This additional federal aid and better-than-expected revenue collections will help the State avoid the draconian cuts to City support proposed by the State earlier in the year. In fact, on March 22, 2021, the New York State Budget Director said that the cuts proposed by the State in January would no longer be needed. Further, budget proposals from the State Senate and the Assembly contain permanent revenue enhancements that would do more than just restore budget cuts. They would provide resources for a more equitable future including crucial investments in education, and health. However, it is critical that the State not supplant its own contributions with federal aid, particularly with education funding.

Even while the City's financial and economic outlook has much improved, the Council recognizes that the people of New York City are still suffering. Council Members heard this throughout the month of March at Preliminary Budget hearings in 27 committees, with testimony from 40 agency heads and hundreds of members of the public.

The pandemic has shined a light on the persistence of income inequality and the growing unemployment crisis. As of February, the City's unemployment rate is still 12.9 percent, up from 3.7 percent prior to the pandemic. There are 634,700 fewer jobs in New York City.[5] Lower-wage workers have endured the brunt of the impact of these job losses.[6]

In New York State, more than one-fifth of households are behind in their rent, two-fifths of households are having trouble paying their usual households' expenses, and one-fifth of households with children are not getting enough to eat because they cannot afford to buy a sufficient amount of food.[7]

Small businesses have also suffered throughout this pandemic. The number of small businesses open is down 41.5 percent compared to pre-pandemic levels. For small businesses in the leisure and hospitality industry, that number was even higher with a decline of 57.4 percent in the number remaining open.[8] It is anticipated that many businesses that closed due to the pandemic will not reopen or bring their employees back at all, prolonging the recovery of the City's workforce.

---

[5] New York State Department of Labor Current Employment Statistics - New York State Department of Labor (ny.gov)

[6] New York City Council Finance Division, "How are the People of New York City Doing: A Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget Fact Sheet", Committee on Finance, March 2,2021.

[7] Center for Budget and Policy Priorities, Tracking the COVID-19 Recession's Effects on Food, Housing, and Employment Hardships | Center on Budget and Policy Priorities (cbpp.org).

[8] Opportunity Insights, Economic Tracker.

The City's recovery will be slower than the nation as a whole. This slower recovery will also be experienced by other mass transit dependent cities with large dense central business districts and cities where travel and tourism are important industries.[9] These economic conditions will most likely result in significant gaps in the outyears, over $4 billion in each remaining year of the Financial Plan. Tax revenue projections for Fiscal 2022 are down $5.4 billion from their pre-pandemic level. Property taxes are projected to decline in Fiscal 2022, for the first time since 1998, as we see the pandemic's impact on the market values of commercial and rental properties.

While the City has received an enormous reprieve in the form of federal aid, it is our responsibility to ensure that the City's budget is not merely balanced for the upcoming fiscal year, but that we achieve this without further depleting our reserves and work toward further reducing the outyear gaps. At the same time, we must focus on delivering assistance to those harmed by the pandemic. More than ever, our social safety net will be critical to our recovery. We must also restore funding for vital agencies that are critical to the social and emotional well-being of all New Yorkers, including the Department of Parks and Recreation and the Department of Youth and Community Development. This commitment to equity also means that the City cannot commit to the hiring of additional school safety agents. After more than a year of interrupted learning, we must prioritize the social, emotional, and educational needs of students.

The Administration must also focus on increasing efficiencies. The voluntary Program to Eliminate the Gap (PEG) should once again become mandatory for every City agency, with savings targets of between three and five percent. Reassessing baselined spending to eliminate duplicative programs, revise spending estimates, and establish spending controls will help reduce outyear gaps. We suggest several savings initiatives herein that should be included in the Financial Plan. The Administration should call on its agencies to find lasting spending reductions.

More work needs to be done as we head towards full recovery. The recent federal stimulus package has the potential to be transformative, but only if used strategically. The Mayor must work with the Council as these decisions are being made in advance of the release of the Executive Budget. The Council represents the voice of the people, the diversity of the five boroughs, and the interests of its unique neighborhoods. The priorities set forth in this response synthesize the concerns of the people and deserve to be recognized in the budget.

[9] New York City Council Finance Division, "Report to the Committee on Finance, Economic and Revenue Forecast, Tax Revenue Collections and Cash Plan" March 2, 2021

Fiscal 2021 Council Priorities Not Funded In Fiscal 2022

Leading up to the adoption of the Fiscal 2021 budget as the COVID-19 pandemic surged and a national reckoning about racial justice and police accountability began, the Council looked to ensure that New Yorkers, some of whom are among the most vulnerable and disadvantaged, had access to core services and programs. In the Adopted Budget, the Council secured funding restorations for summer camp and youth jobs, education programs, senior services, public health, park workers, and other programs and services. In the November 2020 Financial Plan, the Administration provided one-time funding of $30.6 million in Program to Eliminate the Gap restorations for education, bringing the total investment for Fiscal 2021 to $354.7 million. All of the current year restorations are shown in the table below.

The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget zeros out millions of dollars in these expense budget priorities identified by the Council in Fiscal 2021. Except for $100 million for FSF; the Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) and the Beacon, Cornerstone, and COMPASS summer camp programs; and a portion of the City University of New York's (CUNY) Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP), the Preliminary Plan leaves these programs out. The Council urges the Administration to include funding for these core programs in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget and to enhance many of them. Proposals to increase support for these programs are presented throughout this Budget Response.

Fiscal 2021 Expense Budget Priorities

$ in millions

#	Agency	Program	Amount
1	ACS	Child Care Vouchers	$4,000
2	ACS	Foster Care Fair Futures	$2,700
3	CUNY	Delay new admissions to ASAP	$34,300
4	CUNY	Remediation Programs	$1,700
5	DCLA	Cultural programs and CIGS Restoration	$20,200
6	DFTA	NORCS	$811
7	DFTA	NYCHA Senior Centers and Clubs	$1,878
8	DFTA	Senior Centers	$1,928
9	DOE	Child Care Contracts	$3,825
10	DOE	Fair Student Funding	$100,000
11	DOE	LGBTQ Curriculum	$1,000
12	DOE	Restore 38 Social Worker Positions	$4,825
13	DOE	Single Shepherd Guidance Counselors	$11,600
14	DOE	Community Schools Restoration	$6,000
15	DOE	Affinity Schools Restoration	$2,600
16	DOE	Learning to Work Restoration	$22,000
17	DPR	100 Park Workers and 50 Gardeners	$10,000
18	DSNY	Community Compost Program Subsidy	$2,886
19	DYCD	Adult Literacy	$6,400
20	H+H	Test and Trace Community Partners	$10,000
21	DYCD	SYEP, WLG, SONYC, COMPASS, Beacon & Cornerstones	$105,750
22	HPD	Landlord Ambassador Program	$350
		Total	$354,753

Save for the City's Future

Begin to Build Back Fiscal Reserves

The Council calls on the Administration to work to restore the City's reserves. To minimize painful spending cuts and tax increases during the current economic downturn, the City has been making heavy use of the $8.9 billion in fiscal reserves it had built prior to the pandemic. The Preliminary Financial Plan's use of reserves would have left the City with only $5.4 billion at the end of Fiscal 2021, and $2 billion by the end of Fiscal 2022.

With the large influx of federal aid, both directly to the City's budget and indirectly as an economic stimulus which will result in higher tax revenues, the time is ripe for the City to begin to rebuild its reserves.

Support Human Service Providers

The City relies on human services providers to deliver public services to over three million New Yorkers. In the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget, human service contracts total over $5 billion in 12 agencies. Last year, the Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget imposed a retroactive cut to the hard-won Indirect Cost Rate (ICR) initiative. Despite the cut, the human services workforce continued working and formed a great part of the City's frontline in battling the COVID-19 pandemic. The average human services worker in the City makes just $32,700 annually, well below the 2019 New York City Self-Sufficiency Standard required to meet basic needs.[10] To fairly cover the costs of public services provided by human services agencies, the Administration should fund the following proposals.

Fully Fund Indirect Cost Rate Initiative — *$57 million*

The Executive Financial Plan should add $57 million to restore the ICR cut in Fiscal 2021 and baseline the full $91 million for ICR to ensure that all providers are reimbursed for indirect costs. Shortchanging non-profit providers has negative consequences on service delivery and quality. City agencies such as the Department for Homeless Services (DHS), Department for the Ageing (DFTA), and the Department of Youth and Community Development (DYCD), contract almost all of their programs to non-profit human services providers. These providers deliver some of the most essential public services to New Yorkers including foster homes, homeless shelters, after-school programs, and social adult day care, among others.

Fund Cost of Living Adjustments for Human Service Providers — *$48 million*

In Fiscal 2018, the City introduced a three-year cost of living adjustment (COLA) for human services workers. The COLA expired at the end of Fiscal 2020 and was not renewed in the Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget, leaving frontline workers without a COLA increase in the middle of a pandemic. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should include a baselined COLA increase for human services workers. Anticipating regular wage increases to keep up with cost-of-living increases in the budget is customary for City workers, the City should do the same for its contracted public sector workforce. Renewing the COLA on the personnel services line of all human services

[10] Human Services Council, FY22 Budget Priorities to Support the Human Services Sector

contracts at a rate of three percent would cost an estimated $48 million in Fiscal 2022 and the outyears.

Establish Wage Equity across the Human Services Sector

To advance progressive values and improve essential government programs, the Council calls on the Administration to reevaluate public sector wages across the board and plan to correct disparities. Promoting wage equity across the public sector workforce, including contract workers, is essential to creating a fair and more stable New York City with quality public services. New York City's budget supports a workforce of more than 388,000 direct employees and thousands more indirect employees. The Council's review of pay equity has shown that leaving in place the effects of cost-cutting or out-sourcing decisions made long ago and failing to review pay across the wide range of the workforce has created substantial pay gaps for many workers, too many of whom are women and people of color. There is no doubt that achieving wage equity for all categories of workers has a substantial financial cost. Accordingly, the Council is calling on the Administration to map out a plan and create a fund to achieve wage equity over the course of this Financial Plan.

Leave No New Yorker Hungry

Access to food is still a persistent challenge for many New Yorkers who continue to rely on food pantries, soup kitchens, home-delivered meals, and grab-and-go meals to meet their basic needs during this pandemic. It is estimated that more than two million New Yorkers are food insecure, with a 65 percent increase of people depending on food pantries when compared to pre-COVID times. At the onset of the pandemic the administration not only quickly created new food initiatives, but also provided additional support to pantries within the Emergency Food Assistance Program (EFAP) network to address gaps in access to food. None of the funding added in Fiscal 2020 and Fiscal 2021 is reflected in the Fiscal 2022 budget. Additionally, the pandemic brought to light the importance of community partners in quickly providing access to food, especially small pantries that do not have City contracts. In the coming year, the extraordinary need for food assistance among New Yorkers will continue so the City's programs should as well. The Fiscal 2022 Budget should make additional investments in the following areas.

Expand and Improve Food Pantry Programs ***$60 million***

The number of clients served by EFAP providers nearly doubled when comparing the second half of 2020 to 2019. Despite this, the $20.2 million baselined budget for EFAP has not increased since Fiscal 2019. An additional $10 million in baseline funding for EFAP would meet the increased level of demand and ensure that food is directed to where it is needed most. The additional funding also should be available to reimburse providers' operational expenses such as rent, utilities, and additional staffing. The City also should support small community-based pantries that are not part of the EFAP network with a baseline budget of $20 million. This supports community based pantries in addition to a call for the administration to fund and add school based pantries in high need communities that the Council has supported since Fiscal 2016 as well as CUNY pantries. The City should also continue its successful Pandemic Food Reserve Emergency Distribution (P-FRED) program with an allocation of $30 million in Fiscal 2022 for fresh food, which should be accessible to all pantries. Lastly, pantries should provide food appropriate to the communities they serve and the EFAP and City funded pantries should be required to supply culturally relevant foods including halal and kosher food.

Provide Home-Delivered Meals to the Homebound and Seniors $96.6 million

As the pandemic continues, home-delivered meals and grocery boxes services should be provided to homebound and limited mobility New Yorkers. In addition, DFTA's home-delivered meals program should be expanded to meet the demand from seniors. Moreover, DFTA should increase the reimbursement rate for meals to match the recommended national standard. In Fiscal 2022, $80 million would extend the GetFood NYC program that provides home-delivered meals for homebound individuals. It is expected that the need for such program would decrease over time as more New Yorkers are vaccinated and additional options are in place for these individuals to access food. Also, the City should explore resuming the grocery box delivery option as a limited fee-for-service model.

Adding $16.6 million in baseline funding to DFTA’s home-delivered meals program would increase the reimbursement rate for meals from $9.58 to $10.69, add an additional 3,300 senior clients for services, and provide weekend meals.

Reform and Sustain Health and Mental Health Services

As COVID-19 continues to ravage the City, the Department of Health and Mental Hygiene (DOHMH) will remain focused on disease prevention, treatment and recovery. DOHMH has had approximately 6,000 staff working on COVID-19 this year, and their work will continue into the next few years. The pandemic has been deadly for many, but the long-term impacts of COVID-19 will continue to be felt by the thousands who survived virus. The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget does not adequately fund COVID-19response and recovery programs. To do so, the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should fully fund City agencies in three areas: (1) responding to health inequalities exposed by COVID-19; (2) restoring safety net programs; and (3) expanding access to mental health care services and referrals to address long-term impact of COVID-19.

Many of the underlying conditions susceptible to COVID-19 are preventable or treatable with appropriate primary care. Higher spending on primary care has been shown to decrease emergency department use, thereby reducing the overall health care costs. Access to primary care is key to combating diseases but is limited in many areas of the City. The Administration should address the inequalities in health by funding primary care, expanding access to health care and telehealth, and reducing barriers to receiving health services.

Furthermore, the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should reflect the City’s ongoing public health and mental health budgetary needs related to the pandemic. The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget does not fund Test and Trace (T2) programs, vaccination programs, or new programs aimed solely at reducing health inequalities among communities hardest hit by COVID-19. These programs are critical as the City moves toward recovery. Finally, the Administration should present a Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget that fully funds DOHMH and NYC Health + Hospitals (H+H) and prepares the City for the long-term impacts of the coronavirus pandemic. To adequately cover the costs of health and mental health services, the Administration should fund the following proposals.

Sustain and Increase Funding for Community-Based Organizations to Support T2 — $20 million

The Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget included an initial $10 million allocation for community-based organizations to support and facilitate engagement with the City's Test and Trace Corps (T2). Forty-one organizations received four-month awards and contracts were subsequently extended for 39 organizations, covering November 2020 through June 2021. Ongoing community transmission and racial, socio-economic, and linguistic disparities in vaccinations necessitate sustained and enhanced funding in Fiscal 2022. The Council calls on the Administration to include $20 million to support community-based organizations in continuing to provide culturally competent services across the City.

Expand Neighborhood Action Centers — $9.4 million

A $9.4 million investment should be made to double the numbers of Neighborhood Action Centers across the City from three to six. The City's Neighborhood Action Centers, located in Brownsville, East Harlem, and Tremont, are fundamental in tackling the racial disparities in health care by providing a variety of resources and programs to serve residents' health needs. The Centers bring together health care providers, New York City agencies, and community-based organizations and programs under one roof.

Offer Mental Health Care to Communities Hardest Hit by COVID-19 — $2.3 million

Mental health services should be expanded to provide mental health support in the 33 communities hardest hit by COVID-19 by reallocating $2.3 million from the Mental Health First Aid Training under ThriveNYC. Mental Health First Aid has not provided trainings since March 2020.

Expedite Sexual Assault Kit Process — $1 million

The Council calls on the Administration to add $1 million to the Office of Chief Medical Examiner (OCME) to ensure that the City processes sexual assault kits within three days. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should increase the OCME headcount by ten positions to meet the three-day expectation. Additionally, more assault kits would need to be purchased at an estimated cost of $1,000 to $1,500 per kit.

Increase Funding for Non COVID-19 Infectious Diseases — $1 million

COVID-19 has prevented New Yorkers from getting regular checkups and testing. This could lead to increases in positive tests of tuberculosis, hepatitis, HIV, and other infectious diseases. More funding is needed for advertisement and outreach in order to get more people tested and treated. The Council urges the Administration to include $1 million in funding to ensure that New Yorkers are prepared to resume the health services they need.

Expand Syringe Pick Up and Create Public Education Campaign — $1 million

With stay-at-home orders and sanitation services being reduced during the past year due to the pandemic, there have been notable increases in syringe sightings in public spaces. The Council urges the Administration to add $500,000 to increase funding for syringe exchange contracts to pick up needles in high use areas. DOHMH should survey communities to determine which neighborhoods have a high amount of syringe waste. DOHMH should then contract with syringe exchange contracts and the Department of Sanitation to ensure these areas have increased cleaning. In addition, $500,000 should be allocated to create a public education campaign for homeowners in the areas hardest hit by syringe waste. The education campaign should include causes of addiction and options of where to report high amounts of syringe waste.

Restore and Increase Funding for Animal Care Center ***$3.35 million***

A $3.4 million investment should be made for the Animal Care Center (ACC) in Fiscal 2022to support expanded services for ACC. Specifically, there should be $1.5 million to increase medical services intended to save animal lives, $300,000 for site security, $700,000 for community pet outreach, and $500,000 for mobile adoption programs. In addition, $350,000 should be used to address attrition problems at ACC, as employees have not received a COLA in recent years.

Keep New Yorkers in their Homes and Support the Homeless

The eviction moratorium has protected New Yorkers by allowing them to stay in their homes during the pandemic. This, coupled with rental assistance programs, prevented thousands of families and individuals from entering the shelter system during the past 12 months. In the next fiscal year, as the City begins to recover and the health threats from the pandemic subside, the City should focus on permanent housing solutions while also maintaining pandemic-related programs. The Fiscal 2022 budget should make investments in the following initiatives.

Continue the Shelter De-Densify Program ***$568 million***

At the onset of the pandemic, the Administration began to house homeless single adults in isolation and de-densifying hotel rooms to curb the spread of COVID-19 in congregate homeless settings. The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget does not have any funding for these programs, yet the program will continue into Fiscal 2022. This year, through March 2021, DHS has placed 9,000 single adults in commercial hotel rooms at a cost of $173 per room, per night. The Fiscal 2021 total cost is approximately $568 million, which federal funding will almost entirely cover. The Administration should properly budget for COVID-19 related expenses and commercial hotel sites in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget

Maintain Stabilization Beds ***$60 million***

DHS has brought over 1,000 stabilization beds online since the beginning of the pandemic, most utilizing hotel rooms. The funding for these programs is yet to be reflected in the Fiscal 2022 budget, but the need for the beds will continue. As part of its street homelessness strategy, DHS should maintain these stabilization beds and make them permanent in its portfolio. While the cost of stabilization beds will likely be funded by federal revenue in Fiscal 2022, the Administration should plan to keep stabilization beds online permanently. Given the average cost of a DHS hotel room is $173 per night, the total cost of making stabilization bed sites permanent is approximately $60 million a year.

Help Tenants and Homeowners Avoid Eviction and Foreclosure ***$1 million***

Since December 2020, there has been a residential eviction moratorium for tenants who have endured COVID-19 related hardship, as well as a moratorium on residential foreclosure proceedings. Both are set to expire on May 1, 2021. According to the Office of Court Administration, approximately 6,800 people in New York State have filed hardship declarations with the courts. As of March 14, 2021, there were an estimated 222,000 active eviction cases in New York State, and more than 400,000 households may be sued by their landlords when the current eviction protections are lifted. The Administration should add $1 million in the Executive Budget to fund targeted outreach in neighborhoods with the greatest number of eviction and foreclosure filings to notify tenants and homeowners about the moratorium being lifted on May 1, and the current protections available to them as well as referrals to legal services and technical assistance as needed.

Expand the Office of the Tenant Advocate ***$1.1 million***

The Office of the Tenant Advocate (OTA) enforces Tenant Protection Plan requirements and offers support for tenants subjected to unsafe living conditions. In 2020, the OTA received 2,236 inquiries from the public, a 28 percent increase from 2019, which resulted in the Department of Buildings (DOB) conducting 553 inspections and sending over 1,500 referrals to other local and state agencies. The majority of complaints were related to non-compliance with COVID-19 safety measures, work without permit complaints, failure to comply with Tenant Protection Plan complaints, and failure to post or insufficient posting of Tenant Protection Plans. DOB is expanding the OTA to include a Plan Exam Unit which will audit Tenant Protection Plans in occupied residential and mixed-use buildings. Accordingly, the Council is calling for the OTA to be expanded by ten positions, for a cost of $1.1 million, to meet the future needs of this office.

Exempt HPD from the Citywide Hiring & Attrition Program

It is imperative that the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) be allowed to maintain its current headcount for positions involved in executing financing and acquisition of properties, tenant protection enforcement, and supportive housing programming. These positions are vital to HPD's core mission and must be exempted from the citywide 3:1 attrition to hiring rate savings plan. As of February 2021, actual headcount across the categories of financing and acquisition, code enforcement, and supportive housing rental assistance at HPD totaled approximately 455 positions, out of 2,342 active positions overall.

Increase CityFHEPS Voucher to the Fair Market Rate ***$41 million***

As part of its housing and homeless strategy, the City should increase the value of rental vouchers to begin to move more families and individuals out of shelter. The CityFHEPS voucher is underutilized due to the low rental allowance. Increasing the CityFHEPS voucher to the fair market rate (FMR) will allow more people to move from shelter to permanent housing, lowering the shelter census and potentially lowering shelter costs as sites are taken offline. The Department of Social Services (DSS) has called on the State to increase the State rental assistance levels to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development-set FMR level. The City should increase the CityFHEPS voucher to FMR levels as well. This proposal would cost approximately $41 million in the first year, growing to approximately $205 million in the outyears. Actual costs will depend on the number of vouchers used and the level of State funding available.

Increase Domestic Violence Shelter Capacity ***$52 million***

The current domestic violence (DV) shelter system, operated by the Human Resources Administration (HRA), does not have enough capacity to fully meet the demand. Adding $52 million to the DV shelter system would allow for HRA to expand shelter capacity to be more closely aligned with actual demand. HRA's DV shelter system, which is primarily designed for families, provides trauma-informed care with onsite support services specialized to victims of DV.

Currently, there are 2,514 beds in HRA's emergency DV shelter system, where stays are limited to 180 days, and 362 units in the Tier II DV shelter system.

Expand the Source of Income Unit ***$350,000***

The City Commission on Human Rights (CCHR) began investigating and responding to claims of source (SOI) discrimination in housing in 2018. SOI discrimination undermines the City's housing voucher programs that aid New Yorkers in finding housing and leaving the shelter system. CCHR's SOI Unit responds to SOI claims and intervenes to prevent the discriminatory practices. Recognizing the need for New Yorkers to find stable housing, the Council calls on the Administration to add $350,000 for five additional staff lines.

Connecting New Yorkers to Public Benefits and Services

The devastating economic impact of the pandemic has increased the number of New Yorkers qualifying for public assistance, due to job earnings losses. The service arm of HRA has not kept pace with the increased need for benefits. Not only is additional support needed to enroll New Yorkers in assistance programs like public assistance (PA) and Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP), but more extensive outreach is required to connect New Yorkers to benefits. In sharp contrast to the increased need for benefits, participation in many core social service programs, such as child protective services, foster care services, adult protective services, domestic abuse prevention services, and elder abuse prevention services have dropped during the pandemic. Service disruptions and isolation have cut off access to services and reported drops in caseload and need are more likely due to under reporting and isolation than actual need. The City should enhance its ability to better identify those in need of these services, and then connect them to these services.

The pandemic has also unveiled the extremely limited capacity of DFTA to meaningfully connect with all seniors and protect seniors across the City from the impacts of the pandemic. DFTA was unable to lead pandemic response efforts. While DFTA's core programs are senior centers, case management and home care services, it has become clear that this agency's scope and capacity should be expanded. Most seniors are not connected to senior centers, and homecare and case management services are extremely limited. Even DFTA's home delivered meals program falls short of the need. DFTA should develop the capacity to provide guidance and leadership on senior issues and the way City programs interact with older New Yorkers.

As the City anticipates billions of dollars in relief from the ARPA, the Council recommends investments in social services, children, and aging related services.

Address Increased Poverty in the City and Ensure Access to Benefit Programs ***$37 million***

The pandemic has considerably increased poverty and economic hardship, but HRA's budget has essentially remained unchanged. Additional resources should be dedicated to ensuring that HRA has sufficient, well-trained staff to provide timely benefits administration; to improving client service, including phone system upgrades to ensure access for those challenged with technology; and for outreach and education regarding benefits eligibility and programs. HRA should also develop ways to address those individuals pushed off benefit programs due to pandemic relief support. It is expected that approximately 80,000 City workers will be returning to in-person work this coming May and that may address some of the issues around benefits access. However, more resources are needed to maintain employee and client safety as offices re-open, as well as to ensure low-income City residents can access the appropriate benefits and outreach.

Address the Under-Reporting of Abuse Cases During the Pandemic ***$14 million***
Reports of domestic violence, child abuse, and adult abuse and neglect have fallen considerably during the pandemic and led to a drop in service levels. As individuals and families remain quarantined, the ability to report abuse is hindered, as many are residing with their abusers. HRA should monitor the volume of adult protective services referrals and active cases as the eviction moratorium ends and court resume normal operations.

- An additional $5 million should be allocated to adult protective services, which hasn't seen a baseline increase for years. An outreach campaign should be established to provide education about abuse and the available support services.
- An additional $5 million should be allocated to DV services to allow providers to expand services to address under reporting of cases and to support the outreach and education work done by the Mayor's Office to End Gender-Based Violence (ENDGBV) and the Family Justice Centers.
- An additional $4 million should be allocated for eight additional Family Enrichment Centers in high need communities to address gaps in preventive services and provide aid in preventing child abuse and neglect.

Teach Trauma-Informed Interviewing Techniques ***$1 million***
The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should baseline $1 million in the ENDGBV budget to train criminal justice and public safety agencies that interact with domestic violence and sexual assault victims in trauma-informed interviewing techniques. Many victims report feeling unsafe and disempowered due to commonly used interrogative interviewing techniques and therefore choose not to pursue pressing charges. Trainings should be offered, but not limited to, the New York Police Department (NYPD) and District Attorneys, with special emphasis on special victims divisions.

Pay Parity for Residential Child Welfare Staff ***$15.5 million***
A $15.5 million investment for pay parity for contracted residential staff, in both juvenile justice (Close to Home) and congregate foster care settings, should be made to manage the high turnover and staffing shortages due to low pay and staff poaching by the Administration for Children’s Services (ACS). Case planners play a critical role in engaging the child, parents, and foster family in regular contact and working towards an appropriate permanency arrangement; yet the low salaries create a revolving door of turnover.

Restore and Enhance Fair Futures ***$20 million***
Fair Futures provides coaches, tutors, and other supporting health, housing, education and employment for foster youth aged 11 to21. The model increases graduation rates, post-secondary enrollment, and youth self-sufficiency. The Administration included $2.7 million in Fiscal 2021, however one-time State funding meant the program operated on $12 million. However, this cannot be repeated in Fiscal 2022. The Administration should baseline enhanced

funding of $20 million to fully fund the cost of Fair Futures and support tutoring for younger teens.

Support Foster Kinship Finding and Improved Family Visiting ***$2.8 million***

Exits from foster care have slowed dramatically this year due to the limited operation of Family Court during COVID-19. The pace of reunifications fell 28 percent according to the Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report, while adoptions fell 69 percent. In Fiscal 2020, following the recommendations of the Foster Care Task Force, the City supported eight pilot programs: four focused on improving the quantity and quality of family visits, and another four focused on locating kin of children entering foster care to improve the rate of kinship placements. The Administration should return these eight pilot programs in Fiscal 2022, as they are effective investments for an equitable COVID-19 recovery for vulnerable families and children.

Fund DFTA’s Core Senior Services ***$16 million***

Additional investments for the following core DFTA programs would help address the gaps in services for seniors. In Fiscal 2021, the Council secured $2.7 million for senior centers. This funding should be restored in Fiscal 2022 and the following additional investments should be made:

- The Administration made a commitment to add $10 million for model senior center budgeting to appropriately fund staff and program costs. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget must add $10 million for senior centers. In addition, the Administration must maintain its commitment of $5 million for meals and kitchen salaries at senior centers, which was delayed in Fiscal 2021 but is still reflected in Fiscal 2022 and in the outyears.
- The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should baseline $6 million to address the case management and homecare waitlists. Of this amount, $2.6 million would clear the 2,300 seniors awaiting case management services and hire additional case workers to bring caseloads down to the 65 cases per case manager, which is the recommended average. The remaining $3.4 million would help 393 seniors awaiting homecare services.

Improve DFTA's Front Door to Access Senior Services ***$5.89 million***

Improving the front door to senior services, including DFTA’s website and helplines with an additional $3 million would help more seniors access City services, find relevant programming online and in-person, and answer questions related to aging in general. In addition, providing every senior center and club with an average of $10,000, for a total of $2.9 million to create and distribute marketing materials for isolated older adults, could help in communicating what services exist, and provide an initial touch point for seniors who are currently not engaged in City-funded senior services.

Create New Naturally Occuring Retirement Communities ***$2 million***

Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities (NORCs) support seniors aging in place by providing on-site health, recreation, and educational needs within their immediate community. NORCs have played a critical role linking seniors to services and information during the pandemic. However, baseline City support totals only $8 million. Adding $2 million to the baseline for the City's NORCs would add between five and ten new NORCs, depending on their size and budget. Additionally, the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should add and baseline $1.13 million to support

NORC programs that were funded on a one-time basis this year. This would restore these programs to their Fiscal 2020 funding level.

Fund Senior Mental Health Recovery ***$4.9 million***

The Geriatric Mental Health Program embeds mental health clinicians in community based senior centers. DFTA currently has two geriatric mental health programs under the Thrive umbrella, for Clinicians in Senior Centers and the Visiting Program for Homebound Seniors. An additional $4.9 million would address the growing need for mental health services due to social isolation, grief and mental health trauma during the COVID-19 pandemic. These programs are part of the overall ThriveNYC initiative but should be managed by DFTA to ensure they are meeting seniors' needs.

Address the Senior Digital Divide ***$4.4 million***

Over the summer, 10,000 seniors in New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) developments received internet-enabled tablet devices. The tablets aim to combat social isolation, help maintain connections with loved ones, and close the digital divide among New York's senior population. Another one-time investment of $4.4 million would support 10,000 additional tablets that could be given to seniors in need, as well as provide training such as online courses and a technical support helpline for questions and troubleshooting.

Supporting Students for a Better Tomorrow

The pandemic has detrimentally impacted student learning. The many challenges of remote learning, the missed interactions and canceled extracurricular programs, and the extreme social isolation will leave too many students far below their expected learning levels. For students to be prepared and to excel in the upcoming school year, the Department of Education (DOE) should make a wide array of additional investments in new and expanded programs. First and foremost, public schools must be supported. The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget proposes to cut school budgets by $150 million. The Mayor has already announced that this will be reversed, but the Financial Plan must show a commitment to growing school budgets and appropriately staffing classrooms and student supports. The Executive Financial Plan will present a far different financial outlook for DOE as the federal revenue from the ARPA and the Coronavirus Response and Relief Supplemental Appropriations Act (CRRSA) are recognized. This Response sets forth proposals help school communities recover from the pandemic and to reimagine the City's school system and childcare programs. Below is a list of specific investments the Council would like included in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget.

100 Percent Fair Student Funding ***$741 million***

Fair Student Funding (FSF) is the primary funding source for school budgets and allows school principals the discretion to spend these funds on school essentials such as pedagogical staff, enrichment programs, and support staff. The FSF allocation in Fiscal 2021 is roughly $10.24 billion collectively across all DOE schools and is funded primarily by the City, in conjunction with Foundation Aid from the State. In Fiscal 2021, the citywide average FSF allocation is 93 percent, with no school receiving less than 90 percent of its FSF entitlement. The Administration proposed in the Preliminary Budget to cut school budgets by $150 million. The Mayor has announced that this cut will be reversed, but significant increases to FSF must be made to get all schools to 100 percent of FSF. Setting an appropriate baseline level of support for school budgets should allow schools to eliminate overcrowded classrooms, offer rich arts instructions, and offer students a menu of enrichment opportunities. In the coming year DOE should also allow students aging out of school to remain enrolled for an additional year to compensate for the loss instructional time and supports available this year.

Targeted Class Size Reduction ***$250 million***

As students return to full-time, in person learning, reducing class size is imperative to address learning loss. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should introduce a targeted class size reduction initiative to add 2,500 teachers and provide support to schools to reallocate school resources to lower class sizes. Schools with academically struggling students and those with vulnerable student populations should be selected to significantly reduce class sizes and create a more effective learning environment.

Extend Access to Social and Emotional Supports ***$125 million***

Addressing the social, emotional, and mental health needs of students is just as important as the instruction students receive in schools and guidance counselors and social workers provide vital services. Investing in mental health services, especially as students navigate the impact of COVID-19, is paramount as students prepare to in-person learning in the fall. Federal funding from ARPA and CRRSA can be used to address gaps and enhancements for these services.

- **Social Workers and Guidance Counselors.** The National Association of Social Workers (NASW) recommends a ratio of one social worker per 250 general education students in each school building. While DOE reports adhering to a 1:215 social worker to student ratio, it also reports having 304 social workers serving more than one school building. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should add at least $110 million to ensure that every public school has at least one full-time a social worker and one full-time guidance counselor. DOE must then make a plan to ensure every school adheres to the national social worker to student ratio recommended by the NASW for general education students. Finally, DOE must ensure that every District 75 school has a school psychologist. These positions are in addition to restoring $4.8 million for 38 social workers and $11.6 million for 130 Single Shepherd guidance counselors, both which were cut in DOE's baselined budget. Adding this funding to the Executive Budget would allow schools to begin the hiring process to be prepared for the upcoming school year.
- **Invest in a Mental Health Continuum.** The DOE should provide direct mental health support to students with a $15 million investment in a mental health continuum as recommended by the Mayor’s Leadership Team on School Climate and Discipline. Developing a continuum of services in 100 high need schools would give students with significant mental health needs access to direct mental health services and behavioral supports so they can remain in school.

Create Community Schools ***$235.8 million***

Community schools provides a vital educational and enrichment services to a community. These schools should serve as a model for all schools, and additional investments should be made in Fiscal 2022 and in the outyears.

- **Restore Community School Funding.** In Fiscal 2021 DOE announced a plan to cut support for community schools, the Learning to Work program, and Affinity schools by a collective $45.8 million. These cuts were partially restored in the current year but remain in the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget. It is very concerning that the administration added $10.8 million to the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget to create 27 new community schools, while not addressing the baseline cut to this program. The Executive Budget should restore the entire $45.8 million cut.
- **Make Every School a Community School.** The budget should add $475,000 per school over the next four years to make every school a community school. A $190 million investment in Fiscal 2022 would bring 400 schools to the community school model. To add a community partner to every school would require a $686 million investment by Fiscal 2025. The community school model should include school-based food and personal hygiene pantries similar to those supported by the City Council.

Improve Special Education Services

Prior to the pandemic, DOE did not meet State mandated special education requirements. The deficiency in services has been further compounded by school closures and remote learning. Large investments in special education services can help to ensure students do not lag behind in educational milestones.

- **Compensatory Services.** According to DOE's report on special education services, as of January 2021, nine percent of identified students with disabilities do not receive any special education services, and 37 percent are only receiving half of the services to which they are entitled in their Individualized Education Program (IEPs). DOE should assess the need and fund additional special education teachers and therapists (speech, occupational, and physical therapists, counselors, psychologists, etc.) in the Fiscal 2022 budget to provide the make-up instruction and services and give current staff the chance to work over the summer. Make-up instruction and services must be easily accessible to all special education students, without administrative and impartial hearing barriers, and begin this summer. In addition, DOE should develop and fund a plan in Fiscal 2022 and in the outyears to increase evaluation for special education services and address growth in enrollment in special education services by providing more programming.
- **Parity for Special Education Pre-K Providers and Expand Special Education Pre-K.** An $85 million investment would fund pay parity for special education providers as well as add enough special education pre-K seats for all eligible children. Special education pre-K is jointly funded by the City and the State, and the State sets reimbursements rates for schools. The State has failed to increase the tuition reimbursement rates for years, resulting in more than 30 community-based organizations in the City closing their special education pre-K programs due to inadequate funding. Increasing the tuition reimbursement rate is necessary to expand special education pre-K capacity and to raise pay rates of special education pre-K providers

to parity with their general education counterparts. Parity will improve staff retention and stabilize special education pre-K programs.

Although not funded in the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget, DOE plans to operate 3K programs in every school district by next year, sooner than previously planned. This expansion excludes the addition of legally required special education pre-K seats. Prior the pandemic, the City had projected a shortage of 1,000 to 2,000 special education pre-K seats. The demand for preschool special education classes will likely increase in the coming months, as children with disabilities who missed months of services during the pandemic are identified as needing more intensive intervention.

Ensure Every School has a Nurse ***$10 million***

In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Administration committed to placing a nurse in every building. However, as of June there were 137 schools without access to a nurse. DOE should invest at least $10 million in baseline funding to ensure the 137 schools can hire a full-time nurse and begin the transition of making its part-time nurses into full-time staff in anticipation of school fully re-opening in the fall.

Expand Summer Educational and Recreational Programming ***$84.5 million***

The City should reimagine its summer youth programs and develop a suite of services that are holistic and also provide educational and recreational opportunities to children. This summer will serve a re-entry point to the community for our youngest residents, and the services provided need to be contemplated in a thoughtful manner.

- **Summer Education.** Remote Learning has attributed to learning loss. Students need literacy and math interventions, as well as social engagement activities. Investing $70.4 million would provide summer education for students in kindergarten through 12th grade. Priority should be given to students with disabilities, English Language Learners, students in foster care, students in the juvenile and criminal justice systems, and students in temporary housing. In addition to instructional and recreational opportunities, DOE must provide English Language Learners with targeted make-up supports. Compensatory services for all students with disabilities must begin this summer. Summer education will help address learning loss issue prior to the beginning of the new school year, as well as aid in the transition to full in person learning in the fall.

- **Summer Public School Athletic League.** In addition to summer education programs, the City should offer recreational activities for student through a summer Public School Athletic League (PSAL) program. An additional $8.4 million would fund about 140 PSAL teams to provide over 97,000 students the opportunity to participate in a variety of summer sports.

- **Summer Camp.** The DYCD-funded summer camp programs should be tightly coordinated with the DOE's summer enrichment services to provide the largest array of programming to the greatest number of students. DYCD should give providers early notice of available school buildings and give them extra flexibility with enrollment and schedules this summer. Providers should be encouraged to add and modify program offerings and extended services should be allowed as federal aid becomes available. By coordinating with DOE, DYCDs programs should find many families interested in participating this summer. To give access to all children, the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget must restore $5.7 million for 9,000 School's Out NYC (SONYC) summer camps slots.

Keep School Playgrounds Open ***$2.2 million***

The Trust for Public Land, in partnership with DOE, has renovated school play yards and made them available for community use during non-school hours. This Open Playground Program relies on school custodians to clean and maintain the playgrounds. DOE budget cuts have reduced support for the program and kept school yards locked. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should restore $2.2 million to the keep the playgrounds open. Funding would go to school custodians for playground maintenance and opening costs.

Offer Small Group Tutoring ***$100 million***

DOE should allocate at least $100 million to offer students extra instructional time and tutoring during after school hours and on the weekends to make up for the learning losses during this school year. Tutoring sessions for a cohort of five to ten students provided throughout the academic year should target students who had the most difficulty with remote school including English Language Learners. Access to extra help and tutoring should be widely available and provided by teachers, qualified community-based organization staff, and new partners.

Expand the Public School Athletic League ***$5.6 million***

Students at all public high schools should have an opportunity to play sports so the PSAL should offer a minimum of one sport for each gender every season, for a total of six teams each school year over the next three years. Currently, 530 high schools have at least six teams and 90 schools have five or fewer teams. To phase in the increase, it would cost $5.6 million in Fiscal 2022 with a total cost of $19 million over three years.

Expand Restorative Justice Practices ***$53.3 million***

Restorative justice practices de-emphasize archaic forms of discipline and punishment and reinforce social emotional learning. Adding $53.3 million to the Fiscal 2022 budget would provide a school-based restorative justice coordinator at 320 high needs schools.

Support and Enhance LGBTQ Curriculum

The Council has supported LGBTQ inclusive curriculum by allocating $1 million for professional development and developing LBGTQ inclusive curriculum for literacy and history classes since Fiscal 2016. Given the success of this initiative, the Administration should baseline and enhance this funding for a total of $2 million in Fiscal 2022 to fully integrate this work into DOE's curriculum.

Extend Immigrant Family Engagement ***$8.46 million***

The DOE should hire 31 community coordinators to reconnect families with their school communities, especially in immigrant communities and those with limited English proficiency. Investing in direct engagement would encourage parents to access new services to address learning loss and answer questions about a return to in-person learning in the fall. In parallel, DOE should run a multi-lingual multi-media campaign to communicate with parents using a variety of media platforms and methods including radio, digital, television, and mobile advertisements.

Create a Citywide Literacy Curriculum & Program ***$50 million***
To help teachers address the learning loss created by virtual learning, the City should allocate $50 million to provide more professional development trainings by Universal Literacy staff and create new literacy curriculum based on phonics.

Restore and Baseline Student Success Centers ***$3.5 million***
Student Success Centers are collaborations between community-based organizations and multi-school campuses that are staffed by adults and youth leaders who work in partnership to develop awareness about college and guide students through the college access, financial aid, and enrollment processes. The youth leaders are representative of the students they serve: first-generation college-bound students with a range of academic success. DOE must restore $3.5 million to sustain existing Student Success Centers, bring back four that were closed as a result of the cuts introduced in the Fiscal 2021 Executive Budget, and add three new centers.

Expand Outward Bound Crew Model ***$1.6 million***
Adding $1.6 million in Fiscal 2022 would expand Outward Bound's Crew Model approach to 50 additional secondary schools, with the goal of adding an additional 50 schools in Fiscal 2023 for another $1.6 million. This program's goal is to build the capacity of partner schools to successfully embed Crew in their school communities and culture.

Restore and Baseline Urban Advantage ***$3.5 million***
Urban Advantage supports teaching science through partnerships with eight science-based cultural institutions. A $3.5 million restoration to bring the baseline budget to $6.5 million would help connect middle school students and teachers with cultural institutions to improve science instruction and learning.

Hire 52 more Title IX Coordinators ***$2 million***
The Council calls on the DOE to hire more Title IX coordinators for their borough offices. Title IX coordinators are key to supporting school environments that are free from sexual violence and discrimination and that welcome and support all students. Currently, the DOE has seven Title IX coordinators serving the entire school system of 1.1 million students. The DOE should hire 52 additional Title IX Coordinators over the course of the next three fiscal years by phasing in $2 million per year.

Restore College Access for All ***$19.7 million***
The Administration should restore the College Access for All program to provide more support to high school seniors with college and career readiness/post-secondary planning, assist with financial aid and college applications, and conduct mock college and career interviews. Additionally, it would support middle school students' transition to high school and plan ahead for college. The Fiscal 2021 Budget cut services for College Access for All and combined high school and middle schools components of this program, which limited individualized support by grade.

Sustain and Expand NYC Kids RISE Save for College Program ***$6 million***
Through the Save for College Program, every student enrolled in a participating public elementary school, starting in kindergarten, automatically receives an NYC Scholarship Account invested in the NY 529 Direct Plan with a $100 seed deposit and up to $200 in early rewards.

Their families can open their own college savings accounts and start saving their own money in the ways and amounts that make sense for them, building financial capability and stability. At the same time, their communities can contribute to groups of these NYC Scholarship Accounts as both a targeted and universal platform for community-driven asset-building in every neighborhood. The Administration should invest $6 million to sustain the NYC Kids RISE Save for College Program in School District 30 and expand the program to two additional districts.

Baseline Work, Learn, Grow ***$20 million***

The Fiscal 2022 budget should baseline $20 million for the Council's year-round youth employment program launched in Fiscal 2016. Work, Learn, Grow (WLG) helps participants build work skills and aptitude by launching them into the diverse work opportunities available, through direct exposure and access to a paid workforce program. A permanent program should offer job experiences and training to 5,000 youth.

Devices for All Students ***$269.9 million capital***

DOE should routinely equip all upper grades students and teachers with personal computing devices as a routine. Remote instruction will likely continue to be used by public schools after the pandemic in many different formats. Purchasing approximately 113,000 digital devices every year over the next three years for a total cost of $269.9 million would provide each student in the 6th to 12th grade with a device. DOE should also develop a permanent in-house system to track IT inventory and install relevant applications on devices to avoid the need to contract with vendors for device management.

Air Condition Non-Classroom Spaces ***$69 million capital***

DOE's Fiscal 2020-2024 Capital Plan allocates $276 million to the A/C for All initiative, which will bring air conditioning to all instructional spaces. By adding $69 million to the capital plan, A/C for All could be expanded to non-classroom spaces, with a priority for cafeterias and kitchens.

Expand Accessibility in Schools ***$750 million capital***

DOE's Fiscal 2020-2024 Capital Plan allocates $750 million for school accessibility projects. Doubling this investment would help achieve partial or full accessibility in about half of school buildings from the current target of 33 percent.

Install Solar Panels on Schools ***$240 million capital***

Adding $240 million to DOE's Fiscal 2020-2024 Capital Plan, or $80 million for each of the three remaining years of the Plan, would allow the School Construction Authority (SCA) to install solar panels on school roofs to help achieve the carbon neutral goal for public building set forth in Council's Green New Deal The cost of installing solar panels on schools varies depending on site specific conditions. SCA should commence work on school buildings that can easily accommodate panels and provide an assessment of retrofitting work required on other school building roofs before solar upgrades can be completed.

Support CUNY's Accelerated Study in Associate Programs ***$10 million***

The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget proposed a $10 million cut to the Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP) program, CUNY's signature degree completion program. In Fiscal 2021, the Adopted Budget reversed a proposed $34 million cut to ASAP. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should restore the proposed $10 million cut and ensure that the program maintains the same service level for the same number of students in Fiscal 2022. This year just under 24,000 students participate in ASAP.

Baseline Remediation Programs ***$2 million***

CUNY's Remediation Programs support students by helping them move more quickly into credit-bearing courses. In Fiscal 2021, the Adopted Budget added $1.7 million for the program. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should add and baseline $2 million for remediation programs, which would support approximately 9,000 CUNY students each year.

Expand Child Care

The pandemic has shown the flexibility of childcare providers in meeting the needs of working parents. The pandemic has also laid bare how essential childcare is to the City's economy and workforce, especially women.

- **Fully Fund All Child Care Requests for Proposals.** DOE announced awards for the Family Child Care network in February 2020 and announced provisional awards for the Birth-to-Five and Head Start/ Early Head Start request for proposals (RFP) in November 2020, for services beginning July 2021. While DOE newly awarded 90 percent of the providers who have an existing contract, concern remains regarding a shift in seat type (extended day and extended year), as well as the number of infant and toddler seats awarded. In February 2021, DOE released a second RFP to expand the childcare capacity in neighborhoods with high need as a result of COVID-19. However, this RFP is not open to providers who won a provisional award in the first round and does not address the shift in seat type nor the shortage of awarded infant and toddler seats. Furthermore, the Fiscal 2022 budget for early childhood education is $592.4 million, or $6.9 million less than the Fiscal 2021 budget, and does not account for the new contracts set to begin on July 1. In response, the Council calls for the Fiscal 2022 budget for early childhood education to fully fund all current and announced RFPs, as well as broaden eligibility for providers to apply. Additionally, the Council calls on DOE to add capacity for infant and toddler seats, especially in neighborhoods that saw a reduction in these awards in the recent RFP. When filling gaps in childcare availability created by DOE's new procurements, DOE should review proposals from longstanding community providers, especially those serving communities of color, and restore qualified programs. The childcare system should be viewed as a core strategy of the City's economic recovery plan and DOE should ensure that full time, year-round childcare is available to families who need it most. In Fiscal 2022, DOE should allocate at least $45 million to expand childcare services, the same amount that is allocated to Learning Labs in Fiscal 2021.

- ***Extend Pay Parity to Day Care Directors.*** ***$21 million***

  The historic early childhood education pay parity deal that the Council negotiated with the Administration in Fiscal 2020 did not include pay parity for 3-K and pre-K directors and assistant directors. The maximum salary of most directors at non-DOE childcare facilities is about $60,000, and a $21 million investment would provide parity for all directors and assistant directors at non-DOE 3-K and pre-K centers. This is particularly needed because those working in community-based organizations work longer daily hours, get fewer vacation days, and pay 20 percent of their health care premium when compared to their DOE counterparts.

- ***Fund Low-Income Child Care Vouchers.*** ***$19.8 million***
  Subsidized childcare offered through ACS vouchers is a critical resource for thousands of New York families. Special Child Care Funding (SCCF) vouchers are 100 percent City-funded vouchers for low-income families engaged in work, education or training. In Fiscal 2021, ACS has a total of $31.4 million for SCCF vouchers. Adding $19.8 million would add close to 3,000 new low-income SCCF vouchers, bringing the total to approximately 6,500 vouchers.

Provide Tax Relief to Struggling New Yorkers

Expand the Proposed Small Businesses Credit ***$50 million***

The Council calls upon the Administration to expand the small business tax credit to ensure that it helps stabilize small businesses citywide and facilitates their complete opening.

Over the course of the year, thousands of businesses were forced to permanently shut their doors and lay off workers. Recent data show that the number of small businesses that remained open in the City dropped by 41.5 percent between January 2020 and February 2021.[11]

Given all the hardships small businesses face, it is imperative that the City puts measures in place to assist their recovery. In order to assist small businesses, in January 2021, the Mayor proposed the Small Business Recovery Tax Credit, which targets small businesses in the arts, entertainment, recreation, food services and accommodation sectors, to provide a total of $50 million in tax credits to filers that retain or expand their workforce in 2021. The credit, which would be capped at $10,000 per small business, would provide needed support to struggling small businesses and simultaneously incentivize workforce retention. In this way it is a complement to the Federal Paycheck Protection program (PPP) but is also superior to that program in aiding mom and pop businesses with few employees and high rents.

While the Council supports this proposed credit, should be expanded to provide adequate financial support. The Administration should double the current allocation to $100 million and increase the cap above the current $10,000 threshold to ensure that small businesses in high rent areas of the City receive enough help to aid their recovery.

Increase the City's Earned Income Tax Credit ***$37 million***

The Council calls on the Administration to expand the City's Earned Income Tax Credit (EITC).

The EITC is a refundable tax credit that provides income support to low and moderate income to working individuals and families. Originally implemented on the federal level, New York State and City have versions in their personal income tax structures. The City and State EITCs provides additional help to families coping with the City's high cost of living.

Recognizing that the EITC has proven to be an efficient and effective way to provide extra funds for working families, the State Assembly has proposed increasing the State's EITC by 33 percent starting in tax year 2021. At a minimum, the City should match this increase and raise its EITC by

[11] Data from Opportunity Insights, Economic Tracker

at least 33 percent as well. This option would provide the average taxpayer with incomes of $20,000 - $25,000 a refundable credit of around $275, or $70 more than they are currently receiving. This would cost the City $37 million for tax year 2021.

However, at one-sixth the level, New York City's EITC is significantly less generous than the State's EITC. Therefore, the City should seek not just match the State's proposed increase but exceed it to shrink the gap between the City and State EITCs.

Expand the Property Tax Rebate

The Council calls on the Administration to expand the market value eligibility threshold of its proposed property tax rebate and include coops and condos.

In January, the Mayor proposed a $300 property tax rebate available only, though unlike prior rebates this would be restricted to just Class 1 homeowners with market values under $500,000. Unlike prior property tax rebates the City has provided, the Mayor's proposal would not make the rebate available to coop or condo homeowners.

The rationale provided by the Administration was that the City's arcane property tax system means that most Class 1 homes will see increased assessments despite flat market value growth. However, roughly 119,000 coop and condo owners will also see assessment increases in Fiscal 2022, but would be left out of the Mayor's proposed relief.

The Mayor's proposal also is not geographically equitable. Nearly half of the rebates would flow to Staten Island, despite that borough having only about 11 percent of the City's homeowners. The remaining 50 percent of the rebates would primarily go to homeowners in the Bronx, Queens, and Brooklyn, which collectively house more than six times as many homeowners as Staten Island. Virtually no rebates would go to homeowners in Manhattan.

By the Council's estimation, based on the proposed thresholds, only 60,000 households, or six percent of the City's homeowners, would qualify for the rebate, for a total of $20 million; far less than the 293,000 homeowners the Mayor claims would be helped at a $88 million cost. As a result, there is room within the Mayor's existing cost estimate to address the inequities in the proposed rebate by expanding the market value eligibility threshold and including coops and condos.

Lower Property Tax Interest Rates & Expand Deferral Plans ***$16 million***

The Council calls on the Administration to maintain small housing stock, and support struggling businesses in hard hit sectors, by imposing lower interest rates and on the late payments of property taxes and expanding deferral programs to all struggling property owners.

While some property owners have access to low-cost credit and mortgage refinancing, many do not. All too often, women, people of color and immigrant property owners face greater barriers accessing credit and capital markets. And, even when they do, it comes at a higher cost than that extended to white owners or large corporations. Unlike other small businesses, small property owners are excluded from PPP loans, the federal government's main support for business impacted by COVID-19.

The problem is not limited to small properties. Financial scarring in the tourism, retail, and food service sectors will hamper the City's recovery and hobble an employment sector that had been a growing source of jobs prior to the pandemic. Under current conditions, an 18 percent late payment property tax interest rate is excessive for these properties.

Therefore, the City should leverage the influx in liquidity provided by federal stimulus to extend more flexible property tax payment options for all struggling property owners. These should be accompanied by lower interest rates, including a reduction of the 18 percent rate charged to larger properties. The only real net cost to the City over the financial plan would be the loss of interest income on property tax deferrals. However, the City only earned roughly $16 million over the past several years, meaning that low interest tax deferrals are a low-cost, high impact tax policy.

Ensure the Cleanliness, Upkeep, and Safety of the City's Parks

The arrival of the COVID-19 pandemic has brought to light the challenges many everyday New Yorkers face gaining access to open spaces, particularly in low-income communities citywide. As a result of the pandemic, the City witnessed dramatic increases in the usage of parks and other outdoor open spaces including city streets and sidewalks. This presented challenges to the Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) as the agency's Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget was significantly reduced due to the COVID-19 economic impact on City resources. The budget cuts to DPR resulted in the loss of nearly 2,000 seasonal maintenance and operations workers during the summer months of 2020, we witnessed un-mowed lawns, trash pile ups, and cordoned off spaces across our parks system. As the City gradually reopens, our parks and open spaces will be vital to the City's recovery. As such, the Council calls on the Administration to ensure that adequate funding is provided for parks maintenance and staffing in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget including the following proposals.

Restore and Baseline Funding for Improved Parks Operations ***$38.9 million***

The Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget cuts that came into effect on July 1, 2020 significantly affected Parks' operations. These cuts contributed to the sanitation problem across the City's green spaces when parks became one of the few out-door places that New Yorkers could go to. City parks became the places that offered physical, emotional and mental benefits to those who remained in the City. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should restore and baseline funding for the following parks services:

- $20 million for 300 maintenance workers;
- $3 million for 50 Urban Park Rangers;
- $6 million for 80 Parks Enforcement Patrol Officers;
- $3.4 million for 15 GreenThumb staff and materials for community gardeners;
- $4.5 million for our natural forest and trails; and
- $2 million for tree stump removal.

Plant Street Trees ***$10 million capital***

The Administration should add $10 million in capital funding to plant more street trees.

Ensuring Justice and Public Safety for All New Yorkers

Recent criminal justice reform efforts have sought to ensure fairness and equity and to address racial disparities. These efforts include the plan to close Rikers Island, expansion of programs like supervised release, alternatives to incarceration and reentry services, the elimination of cash bail, and efforts to decriminalize poverty and mental health. However, the protests across the nation this past year and the dialogue they created have shown that further progress is needed on police accountability, mass incarceration, and racial inequity. COVID-19 has exacerbated existing racial inequities: communities that have been historically marginalized and under-resourced have experienced job and housing loss, food insecurity, lack of access to community programming, and access to schools. These compounding circumstances have contributed to a spike in gang and gun-related violence in communities already facing under investment. In Fiscal 2021, the Council invested over $28.3 million in criminal justice and public safety initiatives that support programs like the crisis management system, support for persons involved in the sex trade and human trafficking, diversion programs, and alternatives to incarceration. While the Administration's Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Plan does address some of these concerns, it is not enough. The Council calls upon the Administration to fund programs that further reduce incarceration, provide crucial supportive services and enhance public safety.

Restore Board of Correction Staff ***$830,000***

The Preliminary Plan cut the Board of Correction's (BOC) headcount from 34 positions to 26 positions, or nearly 24 percent. These cuts will hinder the Board's ability to effectively oversee the City's jails. Without adequate staff, the Board cannot comprehensively investigate deaths in the City's jails or carefully monitor the DOC's response to the COVID-19 pandemic. Also, additional staff is required for the Board to monitor the City's transition to borough-based jails. The BOC's budget should be increased by $830,000 to restore the positions cut in the Preliminary Plan. BOC's Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget is $2.4 million, less than one percent of the Department of Correction's (DOC) $1.16 billion budget. This restoration would increase BOC's budget to just 0.3 percent of DOC's total budget in Fiscal 2022.

Create a New 116th Police Precinct ***$92 million capital***

The 105th Precinct in Queens covers a very broad geographic area, stretching from Glen Oaks in Northeast Queens to Rosedale and Laurelton in Southeast Queens. The precinct building, located in Queens Village, is in the northern area of the precinct and, as a result, the southern neighborhoods suffer from slow response times. In the Fiscal 2021 Adopted Budget, funding for a new precinct was diverted to a new community center – the Roy Wilkins Recreation Center in Jamaica. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Capital Plan should restore the $92 million in funding for the new 116th Precinct construction project, in order to reduce crime and improve response times. Both the recreation center and the 116th precinct project should proceed with haste.

Baseline Core Programs and Services ***$12.3 million***

- **Baseline Children Advocacy Center Discretionary Funding.** The Council has provided supplementary funding to Safe Horizon for over ten years to operate its five Child Advocacy Centers. Working in coordination with hospitals, law enforcement, and child protective services the Centers provide services to over 4,000 children under the age of

12 who are victims of serious sexual and physical abuse, each year. The Administration should baseline $748,000 in funding to ensure that these critical services are available for New York's most vulnerable population – children who have come forward about abuse.

- **Fund Project Reset.** The Council calls on the Administration to include $2.9 million to fund Project Reset, a pre-arraignment diversion program across the City. Project Reset provides restorative services to individuals charged with low-level, non-violent crimes. Participants who successfully complete programming will subsequently have their cases dismissed. Funding would support the continuation of Project Reset programming in the Bronx and expansion of programming to Brooklyn, Queens, and Staten Island. Manhattan currently has an operational program which is supported by the New York District Attorney's forfeiture funding. This program has the support of all the City's prosecutors and funding for this program should be baselined and included in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget.

- **Right Size Article 10 Abuse and Neglect Cases Contracts.** The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget for the public defense providers' Article 10 abuse and neglect contracts is $23.3 million across the four family court providers. This is not sufficient to address rising caseloads, however. For the past three fiscal years, the Mayor's Office of Criminal Justice (MOCJ) has provided an additional $8.7 million in one-time funding to the providers to address this issue. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should include the addition of baseline funding of at least $8.7 million to account for the trending increase in Article 10 cases and ensure reasonable caseload management and quality service, and to prevent attrition among the providers.

Wage Equity

- ***Ensure Pay Parity for Legal Services Providers.*** The Fiscal 2020 Budget adoption deal required the Administration to fund pay increases for lawyers with less than five years of work history employed by legal service providers, including indigent defense contractors. Subsequently, the November 2019 Plan added $7.3 million for pay parity across the indigent defense providers' baselined contracts managed by MOCJ and HRA's Office of Civil Justice (OCJ), with $3.7 million for each Office respectively. Although the funding was recognized in the indigent defense budget over a year ago, as of March 2021, the providers' contracts have yet to be amended by MOCJ or HRA and the Administration has not fulfilled its commitment to the deal. It is critical that the Administration follow through with this commitment.

- ***Support Pay Parity for Fire Department Emergency Medical Technicians and Paramedics.*** As the lowest paid first responders in New York City, the Council has continually called for Emergency Medical Services (EMS) members' wage equity. Through the pandemic, emergency medical technicians (EMTs) and paramedics have provided lifesaving medical care and transports to hospitals at record high call volumes, directly making New York City a safer place. While the Council is unable to set the salaries of New York's Best and Bravest, we again call on the Administration to increase the salaries of EMS members so they are comparable to other first responders. The Administration should perform an analysis to determine the cost of phasing in a wage increase to EMS workers and reset the Fire Department's (FDNY) emergency medical technicians and paramedics' wage scales to align with other emergency medical responders more closely. The approximately 4,300 members of EMS, including EMTs and paramedics, 59 percent of whom are nonwhite, earn significantly less than other emergency responders in New York City and other EMS services around the country. A starting EMT in San Francisco earns $74,000 in the first year, compared to $35,254 for an FDNY EMT. After five years, the base salary in New York is only $50,604 for EMTs, $65,226 for paramedics, in comparison to $85,292 for firefighters. The gap continues into supervisor ranks, and the average salary is $102,253 for a Uniformed FDNY lieutenant and $70,139 for an FDNY EMS lieutenant.

Budget Accuracy

- ***Restructure MOCJ Budget.*** MOCJ manages over $500 million in contracts for criminal justice programs and indigent defense services but only has two units of appropriation housed in the Miscellaneous Budget (one for criminal justice programming and one for indigent defense services). Better transparency is needed so that spending can be more accurately tracked. As the City's primary criminal justice programming provider, the contracted funding should be moved to the Mayoral Budget and incorporated in MOCJ's total budget as their own units of appropriation and budget codes. Additionally, each sub-office within MOCJ and the contracts they manage should have its own clear budget code.

Support Cultural Organizations and Libraries

The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Plan does not adequately fund the City's cultural organizations and library systems as they recover from the economic impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic. The cultural community is not only an economic driver but is also the foundation for much of what makes New York City vibrant, healthy, and alive. Similarly, the libraries are vital to New York neighborhoods, and should be open and available to New Yorkers. To ensure that the City is well equipped to manage the recovery from this pandemic, the Council calls on the Administration to support cultural organizations and the library systems by supporting the following proposals in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget.

Support the Arts ***$20.2 million***

The Administration should restore $20.2 million for funding to support cultural organizations in Fiscal 2022. This funding supports the Cultural Institution Groups (CIG), provides across-the-board grant increases for all Cultural Development Fund recipients, COVID-19 relief, arts education and impact grants, and funding for energy grants and CreateNYC initiatives.

Support for Shuttered Arts and Music Venues

The Administration should set aside federal relief dollars for financial assistance for independent arts and music venues that have been unable to open and will take a long time to reopen. These venues need assistance to pay back debt and for outfitting for safe re-opening. For the City's cultural organizations, there have been gaps in the funding eligibility of federal programs including employee caps and lack of direct focus on cultural institutions and federal dollars should be used to remedy this.

Support Amusement Parks

The Administration should set aside federal relief dollars to help outdoor amusement parks that have been unable to open. At the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, outdoor amusement parks had to shut down and continue to face financial insecurity and uncertainty. For the City's amusement parks, there have been gaps in the funding eligibility of federal programs including exclusion from The Shuttered Venue Operators Grant (SVOG), employee caps, and a lack of direct focus on amusement parks.

Restore Library Cuts and Baseline Council Subsidy Support ***$22.2 million***

The Administration should restore the $10.3 million subsidy cut in Fiscal 2022 for the library systems and baseline of the $11.9 million added at adoption in Fiscal 2021 by the Council. For the systems, reduction in earnings from waived fines, cancellation of fundraising events, and closure of space rentals and retail shops is happening concurrently with increased COVID-19 related spending. This funding is needed to support the libraries so that they can manage the year-over-year increase in programing and circulation expenses, and cover the rise in cost of materials, staff, and operating expenses. Funds also allow the systems to maintain physical spaces and cover repairs and upkeep that are not capitally eligible.

Fund Library Repair and Maintenance ***$156 million capital***

The Council urges the Administration to add $156.4 million in additional capital dollars in Fiscal 2022 for library repair and maintenance to bridge the current gap in capital funding for the system's ongoing infrastructure needs. Public libraries are helping New Yorkers rebuild their lives and reconnect to their communities as we come out of the pandemic and need to fully functioning infrastructure to do so.

Improving Governmental Operations

After reviewing the Preliminary Plan, the Council has identified funding shortfalls in the provision of basic governmental operations services that should be restored.

Fund the Office of Street Vendor Enforcement ***$4.5 million***

The Administration should provide sufficient funding for the Department of Consumer and Worker Protection (DCWP) to properly implement Local Law 18 of 2021, which allows for the issuance of 4,000 new street vendor permits over the next ten years, creates an Office of Street Vendor Enforcement, and establishes a street vendor advisory board. Resources for DCWP to implement this law have yet to be included in the Financial Plan. For Fiscal 2022, DCWP will require $4.5 million for additional staffing and related resources for year one of implementation.

Reverse Community Board Cuts ***$686,000***

The Preliminary Plan includes cuts of $686,000 across Fiscal 2021 and Fiscal 2022 to all Community Boards and the Council urges the Administration restore this cut. It includes a total budget of $18.8 million for all Community Boards, with an average allocation of $318,000 to each of the 59 Community Boards. The Community Boards are already short-staffed and under-budgeted and cannot handle a reduction to their budgets.

Enhance Immigrant Services

COVID-19 has had a disproportional effect on the immigrant community, with many succumbing to the illness and many others losing their job and struggling to feed and provide for their families. The federal government provided a level of relief for local communities which excluded undocumented immigrants and mixed-status families. The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget fails to fund and support services that have been essential to the recovery of the City and immigrant New Yorkers during this fiscal year. The Council calls on the Administration to support the following proposals in the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget.

Baseline the Adult Literacy Initiative ***$12 million***

The City's Adult Literacy Initiative has provided immigrant New Yorkers with the tools to achieve higher levels of literacy – which are associated with greater health knowledge, use of healthcare services, and the ability to manage chronic health conditions and communicate with healthcare providers. Currently, there are more than 2.2 million adults in New York City without English language proficiency or a high school diploma. The Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget fails to restore or baseline funding for these two key programs that are undoubtedly vital to the City's efforts in recovering from the coronavirus pandemic.

The Council urges the Administration to baseline $12 million for the Adult Literacy Initiative. Once this Council initiative is fully funded by the Administration then all future awards would be subject to the RFP process moving forward. Funding for the Adult Literacy Initiative supports CBOs that provide instruction in Adult Basic Education, High School Equivalency, and English for Speakers of Other Languages.

Launch an Adult Literacy Pilot ***$10.5 million***

The Council calls on the Administration to include $10.5 million to support an adult literacy pilot, which is critical for parents' ability to better support their students' education. This pilot project would quadruple City funding for approximately 25 community-based adult literacy programs to enable them to fully invest in comprehensive adult literacy programs, as well as providing greater investments in student support services, digital literacy development, professional development, and contextualized curriculum and instruction.

Increase funding for ActionNYC and Legal Services ***$8.5 million***

The Council urges the Administration to add $8.5 million to expand ActionNYC and legal services citywide**.** ActionNYC provides legal representation to all New Yorkers at community sites, public health facilities, public school and libraries.

Expand Language Access ***$3 Million***

The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should include $3 million to expand language access in two ways: 1) $2.5 million to create a Community Legal Interpreter Bank, and 2) $750,000 to develop language services worker-owned cooperatives in immigrant communities. A community legal interpreter bank would recruit, train, and dispatch legal interpreters.

The pandemic has laid bare some major lapses in City services that are critical to the success of immigrants accessing City services, chiefly the increased need for adequate language services. The flurry of evolving news and changes related to COVID-19 exposed the lack of appropriate language services in both the rollout of news by the City and the public health institutions. Under

Local Law 30 of 2017, the Administration's obligation is to provide language access, including interpretation and translation in the provision of City services. Over the last fiscal year, the City invested almost $1.2 million for its language services efforts– with many immigrant community organizations filling the gap. However, services are overly dependent on telephonic interpretation services and the Fiscal 2022 budget fails to address the increased need that has been exposed by the pandemic.

An allocation of $750,000 could fund three language services worker-owned cooperatives--one for African LLDs, one for Asian LLDs, and one for indigenous Latin American LLDs. The language services worker co-ops would help meet demand for professional, high-quality language services in the courts, education, health care, and the private sector, while providing skilled employment and business ownership opportunities to immigrant communities.

Reinstate Translation Services at Poll Sites ***$640,000***

The Board of Elections (BOE) currently offers interpretation services in Spanish, Chinese, Bengali, and Korean in neighborhoods where these languages are commonly spoken. Interpretation, unfortunately, is not available in all the City's most spoken languages – including Russian, Haitian Creole, Yiddish, and Polish. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should include $640,000 to reinstate the interpretation program last offered by the Civic Engagement Commission (CEC) in Fiscal 2020.

Baseline Day Laborer Centers ***$2.8 million***

Since the onset of the COVID-19 pandemic, the City's Day Laborer Centers have served as a critical tool in the City's response by being at the front lines delivering essential services to day laborers in high-impacted areas. These worker centers have delivered food and emergency cash assistance, trained workers in Site Safety and emergency preparedness, and have helped day laborers achieve job security through job dispatching. These centers have also connected day laborers to other essential services such as housing and rent relief, legal services (as it relates to wage theft), and mental health services. Once this Council initiative is fully funded by the Administration then all future awards would be subject to the RFP process moving forward. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should baseline $2.8 million for Day Laborer Centers.

Restore Key to the City ***$700,000***

The Key to the City (KTTC) program, a long-standing collaboration between the New York Immigration Coalition and New York Legal Assistance Group provided large-scale screening and application preparation clinics for immigrants in New York City until Fiscal 2020. The KTTC program can help immigrant communities navigate changes in federal immigration policy. The need to reach immigrants on a large scale is important as the Biden Administration continues to move forward with immigration reform, as the City recovers from the pandemic, and as the New York Immigration Courts reopen. Once this Council initiative is fully funded by the Administration then all future awards would be subject to the RFP process moving forward. The Administration should add $700,000 to the Fiscal 2022 Budget for the KTTC program.

Address Critical Infrastructure and Safety Needs

The Fiscal 2021 Budget made cuts to City's Vision Zero and Roadways Resurfacing programs. While the need for these services might have been lower in Fiscal 2021 due to stay-at-home orders, as the City begins to reopen our roadway infrastructure and pedestrian and vehicular traffic safety will be paramount to a full recovery. Roadway and pedestrian safety should be a priority in Fiscal 2022.

In addition, NYCHA buildings have experienced years of deferred maintenance and as a result are in dire need of repairs. Over time, NYCHA's deteriorating infrastructure has created health and safety issues for its tenants. Along with full federal funding and contributions from the State, a substantial capital commitment by the City is needed to help address this situation.

Restore Vision Zero's Outreach Campaign ***$4.2 million***

According to the Preliminary Mayor's Management Report, in the first four months of Fiscal 2021, overall citywide traffic fatalities rose 39.5 percent, from 76 to 106. Fatalities among pedestrians, motorcyclists, motor vehicle operators and passengers have continued to increase. The Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should add $4.2 million to the Vision Zero outreach campaign to restore funding to the previous level of $7.2 million.

Resurface 1,300 Lane Miles Annually ***$87.9 million***

The Department of Transportation (DOT) previously had a goal to repave 1,300 lane miles annually, which was reduced to 1,100 lane miles per year in Fiscal 2020 and Fiscal 2021. Although the reduced paving level was acceptable in Fiscal 2021 because of a mild-winter and reduction of traffic at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, which caused less wear and tear on the City's streets. Lane resurfacing was further reduced in the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget to 910 lane miles at a cost of $205 million. With the COVID-19 vaccine campaign underway and a steady decline in the virus, the City should anticipate an increase in traffic as the City begins to reopen. Moreover, the winter of 2020-2021 resulted in significantly more snowfall, at over 39 inches, compared to the five inches of snowfall in the 2019-2020 season. As a result, the City can expect to see an increase in damaged streets in need of road resurfacing. Therefore, the Fiscal 2022 Executive Budget should increase and baseline $87.9 million to repave 1,300 lane miles annually.

Fund NYCHA Repairs and Improvements ***$5.2 billion capital***

The Council calls on the Administration to increase NYCHA's annual capital funding to $2 billion to address ongoing capital needs at NYCHA. This would require additional capital funding of $5.2 billion over the next four years (Fiscal 2022-2025). Currently, the total projected cost to bring all buildings, systems and grounds to a state of good repair across the NYCHA portfolio is $40 billion over a five- year period. In addition, from 2001 to 2019, NYCHA has experienced a cumulative federal capital grant funding loss of $1.2 billion compared to eligibility. As the capital needs of aging buildings grow, operating costs, such as maintenance and repair, also increase. The Council's allocations have attempted to fill critical capital funding gaps within NYCHA, and while the Administration has allocated $1.6 billion in Fiscal 2021, city capital funding to NYCHA decreases to $402 million in Fiscal 2022, $344 million in Fiscal 2023 and $336 million in Fiscal 2024-2025. A dedicated capital funding stream is needed to ensure that critical infrastructure improvements are routinely made. Lastly, the Council urges the Administration to continue to request full design-build authorization from the State for all eligible City projects. The use of design-build, particularly for large construction projects, would save the City time and money with estimated dollar savings ranging from between 6 percent and 15 percent per eligible City project.

Restore Headcount for the City's Capital Program ***$13 million***

The Department of Design and Construction (DDC) is the City's capital project manager and plays a large role in the City getting its capital program back on track. DDC manages capital projects for most of the City's agencies in some capacity and therefore must have an adequate staffing level to help address the COVID-19 related backlog of capital projects. The Preliminary Budget cut 262 positions from DDC's budget. The Council calls on the Administration to restore the $13 million cut to DDC's headcount.

Improve Sanitation Services

The economic impact of the coronavirus pandemic heavily reduced City revenues, which resulted in large reductions in sanitation services during Fiscal 2021. The ongoing vaccination effort and gradual re-opening that is underway will further strain sanitation services. The Mayor has recently announced a restoration of the majority of the baseline litter basket services, however this restoration does not go far enough. The Council requests that the Administration fully all Sanitation services. Additionally, the Department of Sanitation (DSNY) should continue to lead and focus on diverting organic materials from landfills, as set out by Zero Waste by 2030. The following proposals will ensure that the City is well-equipped to address the needs of all New Yorkers as we recover from the pandemic and increase the use of public spaces.

Fully Fund all Sanitation Services ***$24.9 million***

The Council calls on the Administration to include $24.9 million to reverse Fiscal 2021 and Fiscal 2022 service reductions to litter basket collection, e-waste collection, street sweeping, rat mitigation zone trash collection, lot cleaning, syringe collection, and highway ramp cleaning.

Expand Programs to Reach Zero Waste by 2030 ***$14.8 Million***

The Council calls for the Administration to invest $14.8 million to expand vital City programs that divert wastes from landfills to help achieve the City's goal of Zero Waste by 2030. Below is a breakdown of the programs and recommended funding increases:

- $2.5 million for the GrowNYC compost program;
- $4.5 million for other community composters and food scrap drop-off operators;
- $3.5 Million for new compost processing facilities;
- $2 million for multifamily building collection and processing pilot;
- $1 million for Zero Waste Schools and NYCHA organics pilot projects;
- $1 million for composting in municipal agencies; and
- $250,000 for a feasibility study on mandatory curbside composting.

Keep Security In-House at DSNY Facilities ***$4 million***

The Administration should include $4 million to restore security cuts at DSNY facilities. Currently, security at DSNY facilities is conducted by sanitation workers. As it stands, DSNY's Fiscal 2022 Budget proposal would outsource this responsibility to a private firm.

Fully Fund Commercial Waste Zone Program ***$4 million***

The Council calls on the Administration to include $4 million to ensure that the City is prepared and has the adequate resources to implement the Commercial Waste Zone law, as provided in Local Law 199 of 2019. The Commercial Waste Zone Program, which would completely transform the City's current and dysfunctional, polluting, unsafe and inefficient commercial waste collection system into one that is sustainable, fair to private sanitation workers and reliable for businesses across all five boroughs.

Support Small Businesses

In response to the pandemic and its economic impact on the City's small businesses, the City launched six loan and grant programs through the Department of Small Business Services (SBS). The rollout of and participation in these programs exposed the disparate distribution throughout the City. To address this, SBS should ensure that there is an equitable distribution of funds across the small businesses sector. SBS should assist NYC businesses in taking full advantage of the opportunity to receive federal funds. Additionally, to ensure that small businesses have access to the support needed to bounce back from the economic impact of the pandemic, we urge that the Fiscal 2022 Executive Plan include support for the following programs.

Provide Lifeline for Small Businesses

The Council strongly believes that small businesses are the backbone of New York City's economy and deserve and need much more assistance from the Administration to adapt, survive and earn sustainable incomes as they get back on their feet. The survival of the small business economy is essential to ensure the City can have a strong, equitable economic recovery from the financial collapse caused by the pandemic. There has to be a long- term plan in assisting small businesses that have been victims of the pandemic. The long term-plan has to factor in whether the City's economy will strengthen quickly enough for small businesses to satisfy the terms of the loans provided by the Administration, and the potential impact on businesses struggling to pay off the additional debt. We urge the Administration to use the federal dollars provided in the American Rescue Act to expand on current financial programs and to disburse vital direct aid to businesses equitably in all boroughs in the form of grants or forgivable loans. SBS launched six loan and grant programs in response to the pandemic with a total funding of $86.9 million. This is not enough by any means. With the influx of federal dollars, supplemented with City funding if necessary, the initial amount should be doubled if not tripled to assist our small businesses. The Administration should increase its assistance to low-to moderate income areas of New York City to restart or continue operations after experiencing challenges from COVID-19. These new funds should be targeted for businesses in the hardest hit communities that cannot easily access capital and to minority and immigrant business owners.

The need for an increased digital presence is clear as so much activity has rapidly shifted online hence the Administration should increase its technical assistance in web development skills to small businesses. Developing an online marketplace may enable a small business to continue to increase revenue despite COVID-related restrictions.

The City should simultaneously relax burdensome regulations and fines on businesses until they can get on their feet again. The Administration should expand its outreach to create awareness of the new City and State rules and regulations as well as guidance on best practices for reopening while continuing to encourage consumers to shop locally.

Reinstate the Commercial Lease Assistance Program ***$1.5 million***

The Council calls on the Administration to restore $1.5 million for the Commercial Lease Assistance Program, a program crucial for our businesses during the economic crisis. The Commercial Lease Assistance Program launched in Fiscal Year 2018 and offers pre-litigation services to help small business owners resolve problems before they end up in court achieving successful outcomes while avoiding thousands of dollars in attorney fees. The program was eliminated in Fiscal 2021, as a result of agency reductions due to the economic impact of the pandemic.

Many small businesses do not have the legal teams to do this costly and time-consuming work on their own, with on average about 400 small businesses are assisted each fiscal year through this program. Small businesses will continue to face significant challenges in the coming months as a result of the pandemic and it is vital that this program is restored to provide small business owners with the resources they need.

Restore the Graffiti Free NYC program ***$3.1 million***

The Council calls for the Administration to restore $3.1 million for the Graffiti Free NYC program. As a result of continued budgetary constraints due to COVID-19, the Graffiti Free NYC program has been suspended by the New York Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC). The Graffiti Free and Clean NYC programs provided graffiti removal services and pressure washing of highly trafficked sidewalks in the City's commercial corridors.

The program cleaned 11,090 graffiti sites in Fiscal 2018, and 14,236 sites in Fiscal 2019, and 10,557 sites in Fiscal 2020. No graffiti sites were cleaned through the Graffiti Free NYC program in Fiscal 2021 as result of budget reductions, and the City’s MMR no longer includes the indicators ‘Graffiti sites cleaned’ and ‘Square feet of graffiti removed (000)’, as the program has been paused due to COVID-19 related budget cuts.

Savings to Re-invest in Council Priorities

Increase Debt Service Savings

The Administration’s estimates for interest rates on Transitional Finance Authority (TFA) variable rate debt and on new issues of TFA and general obligation (GO) bonds are excessively conservative. Using more realistic but still conservative assumptions the Council estimates that these costs in Fiscal 2021 and Fiscal 2022 will be $150 million less than in the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Plan.

Recognize Additional Revenue from 421(a) Tax Exemption Fees

The Fiscal 2022 budgeted revenue from 421(a) Tax Exemption Fees is substantially lower than the actual revenue collected each of the last three fiscal years. The Executive Plan should increase projected revenue from 421(a) Tax Exemption Fees by $22.2 million in Fiscal 2021 and $23.7 million in Fiscal 2022.

Recognize Additional Revenue from Affordable NY Housing Program

The budgeted revenue from Affordable NY Housing Program fees is substantially lower than the actual revenue collected for each of the last three fiscal years. As such, the Administration should increase projected revenue from Affordable NY Housing Program fees by $2.4 million in Fiscal 2021 and $5.4 million in Fiscal 2022.

Recognize Additional Revenue from Street Opening Permits

Over the last three fiscal years, (2018-2020), the average actual revenues from Street Opening/Utility Permit fees are $39.6 million. However, the Fiscal 2022 budgeted amount is only $31 million. As such the Administration should realign the revenue estimate with the three-year average of actual revenue generated under this revenue source by increasing the Fiscal 2022 budgeted amount by $8.5 million.

Recognize Additional Revenue from Bus Camera Fines

Bus Lane Camera fines have averaged $13.4 million over the last three years (from 2018 to 2020). The amount of revenue currently estimated in the Fiscal 2022 budget for these fines is $10 million. The Administration should increase the Fiscal 2022 revenue projection for these fines by $3.4 million to align with the three-year average.

Recognize Additional Revenue from Environmental Control Board Fines

Environmental Control Board fines have averaged $75.1 million over the last three years (from 2018 to 2020). The amount of revenue currently estimated in the Fiscal 2022 budget is $65.1 million. The Administration should increase the Fiscal 2022 revenue projection for these fines by $9.9 million to align with the three-year average.

Recognize ACS Prior-Year Revenue

ACS' Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Budget does not accurately reflect regularly occurring prior-year State and federal revenues. It is expected the agency will realize a savings of $46 million in Fiscal 2021 and $76 million in Fiscal 2022 by replacing City funds with State and federal revenue.

Realize Prior Year Medicaid Revenues

HRA typically recognizes prior year revenue, from State and federal sources, relating to the agency's ongoing reconciliations with the State on prior year Medicaid payments. It is expected that HRA's Fiscal 2022 Budget should reflect at least $50 million in prior year Medicaid revenue. In the Fiscal 2021 Executive Plan $50 million in such revenue was recognized for Fiscal 2020, and the Fiscal 2022 Preliminary Plan $53.9 million was recognized for Fiscal 2021.

Recognize LinkNYC Kiosks Revenue

The Fiscal 2022 budget does not recognize miscellaneous revenue from the LinkNYC program. The Administration has been working with CityBridge, the entity responsible for the management of the LinkNYC kiosks, to ensure payments established through their franchise agreement. The Financial Plan should include payments due to the City as per its franchise agreements, which would at minimum be $25 million in Fiscal 2022. If the current franchisee cannot meet its obligations, the City should seek a new vendor.

Reduce the Citywide Heat, Light and Power Budget

In Fiscal 2020, the City spent $652.3 million on heat, light and power (HLP). Nonetheless, the Fiscal 2021 budget for HLP remains at $715.3 million. With the majority of City offices closed for most of this fiscal year, the City will spend far less than budgeted for HLP. The Fiscal 2021 HLP budget should be reduced by at least $75 million. Additionally, over the past five fiscal years, average actual yearly expenditures for the HLP budget totaled $690 million. Hence, the Fiscal 2022 HLP budget, which is also $715.3 million, can be reduced by $25 million to more accurately reflect actual spending.

Find Efficiencies in the Citywide Lease Budget

The Fiscal 2021 and Fiscal 2022 citywide lease budget totals $1.37 billion and $1.35 billion, respectively. Due to the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, all non-essential City workers are still telecommuting from home. This has led to a reduction in city office use, and hence, less maintenance, electricity, heating, security, and cleaning requirements, among others. For Fiscal 2021, the City should realize budget savings of at least five percent due to this lower City office usage. Additionally, for Fiscal 2022, the City should commit to reducing its citywide lease budget by five percent by postponing enhanced space requests, conducting further lease audits, and renegotiating lease contracts due to the potential partial continuation of City workers telecommuting. This would generate savings of approximately $130 million across Fiscal 2021 and Fiscal 2022.

Reduce Citywide Motor Vehicle Fuel Budget

For Fiscal 2020, the citywide motor vehicle fuel budget totaled $79.9 million at Adoption, while actual expenditures for the year totaled $62.9 million. This reduction was in large part due to the COVID-19 pandemic. For Fiscal 2021, the citywide motor vehicle fuel budget totals $70.3 million. The City should reduce the Fiscal 2021 citywide motor vehicle budget by $10 million, to reflect the impact of the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic on motor vehicle fuel usage in the City, and to align the budget with last year’s actual expenditures.

Reduce Citywide Fuel Oil Budget

For Fiscal 2020, the citywide fuel oil budget totaled $84.3 million at Adoption, while actual expenditures for the year totaled $52.7 million. This reduction was in large part due to the COVID-19 pandemic. For Fiscal 2021, the citywide fuel oil budget totals $76.6 million. The City should reduce the Fiscal 2021 citywide fuel oil budget by $20 million, to reflect the impact of the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic on fuel oil usage in the City, and to align the budget with last year’s expenditures.

Right-size the Office of Purchasing Management at DOE

DOE’s budget for its Office of Purchasing Management is greater than actual spending in Fiscal 2020 and Fiscal 2019. By aligning the budget to historical spending $3.5 million in savings could be achieved. Savings total $3 million in Fiscal 2021 and $500,000 in Fiscal 2022.

Realize Additional eFMAP Savings

The Families First Coronavirus Response Act provides a temporary 6.2 percent increase in federal matching funds, known as the enhanced Federal Medical Assistance Percentage (eFMAP), to States that meet the eligibility criteria during the emergency period. The federal government announced in early 2021 that eFMAP would be extended an additional six months until at least the end of calendar year 2021. It is estimated the extension will bring $2 billion or more in additional federal revenue to the State. To date, OMB has recognized eFMAP savings for all of calendar year 2020 in the budget but has only reconciled, and subsequently adjusted the budget for, the amount due to the City relating to the first six months of calendar year 2020. According to the State, the City's eFMAP savings for January to June of 2020 totals $201 million. Assuming savings for subsequent periods will be the same, additional savings of $402 million should be reflected in HRA's budget for calendar year 2021.

Right-Size Budget for Longevity Differentials

The Department of Correction offers longevity pay for uniformed staff with more than five and a half years of service. A significant number of uniformed staff joined the Department within the past five years and have not yet qualified. The proportion of newer staff will grow as staff with longer tenures separate from the DOC. However, the Department's budget maintains a baseline of $43.5 million for longevity differentials and does not reflect DOC's current workforce. In Fiscal 2020, the Department's actual spending was $31.4 million, $12.1 million less than its baseline.

The Preliminary Plan recognizes this underspending in Fiscal 2021 by reducing the budget for longevity pay from $43.6 million to $36.8 million. However, the Plan returns the baseline to $43.5 million in Fiscal 2022. Department should right-size its longevity pay budget to reflect the changing composition of its workforce. The Fiscal 2022 budget should be reduced by $12.1 million.

Reduce Contract Spending on Professional Services, Consultants, and Technology Services

The City should work to reduce its reliance on professional consultants, technology services, and other contracts by five percent in Fiscal 2022, for a total savings of $85 million. This reduction should be taken across the board for professional services in accounting/auditing, engineering/architect, computer services, and other contracts, Contractual Services General, and on technology contracts. The Fiscal 2021 Budget for these contracts total $1.7 billion. By re-negotiating contracts, consolidating contracts, and in-sourcing contracted work, the City can recognize a five percent savings in Fiscal 2022 and the outyears. The savings should focus on large consulting contracts and include work that can be done by City employees, and expensive technology contracts where possible. The City should prioritize in-sourcing contracts, and find other efficiencies in these areas.

Re-estimate Arterial Highway Catch Basin Cleaning

DEP spends approximately $4.7 million on average per fiscal year for arterial highway catch basin cleaning; however, the FY22 budget for highway catch basin cleaning is $4.94 million. DEP's arterial highway catch basin budget should be adjusted accordingly, to $4.7 million, to reflect actual spending.

Improve the Mayor’s Management Report

The Mayor’s Management Report (MMR) and the Preliminary Mayor’s Management Report (PMMR) are critical tools for tracking and evaluating the City government’s operations and performance. However, after conducting a though review of the structure and content of the Fiscal 2021 PMMR, the Council has identified several areas for improvement. Several broad recommendations as well as agency specific recommendations for the forthcoming MMR are listed below:

General MMR Structure

- **Include Clear Targets for all Indicators.** Performance targets should be attached to all MMR indicators where applicable and should be updated annually. Additionally, further clarification should be provided in cases where the justification for selecting a specific target is not immediately clear. Throughout the MMR, there are several examples of agencies consistently outperforming performance targets. All targets should be evaluated and updated on an annual basis to better match an agency’s capacity.

- **Improve the Link between Performance Indicators and the City Budget.** The MMR should make stronger connections between operational performance and the resources allocated to carry out those operations. More specifically, the Council recommends including capital funding data for all projects or initiatives related to indicators in the MMR.

Citywide Performance Indicators

- **Develop Standard Measures of Capital Project Implementation Efficiency and Effectiveness.** In order to estimate the expediency and efficiency of each agency’s capital program, the MMR should include a set of universal measures for capital projects. These standards should include, for example, cost per square foot of new construction, time from design to completion, cost of design versus cost of construction, the number of days job sites remain idle, among others.

- **Include a Section on the Implementation of the Citywide Savings Initiatives.** The Council recommends including a section in the MMR that tracks realized savings from the Citywide Savings Initiatives included in the Citywide Savings Program. These initiatives are designed to create lasting, programmatic savings across multiple agencies. However, since they are not specifically tied to agency budgets, they are difficult to monitor.

Agency Indicators

Law Department

- **Judgements and Claims.** Judgement and Claims payouts have averaged $723.1 million over the past five fiscal years. The MMR should include a Judgement and Claims section to track cases and settlements, as well as report on initiatives implemented to avoid lawsuits.

NYCHA

- **Permanent Affordability Commitment Together Conversions.** The MMR should include indicators that track the status of the 62,000 apartments undergoing a public-private partnership conversion as part of the Permanent Affordability Commitment Together (PACT) initiative. Indicators should show the number of units in the various stages of conversion, including those with a letter of intent, in the resident engagement process, with a developer selected, currently being renovated, and those where conversions have been completed.

HPD

- **Affordable Housing Lottery Applicants.** The MMR should report on the number of applications submitted for each available unit on Housing Connect each fiscal year.
- **Supportive Housing Units.** The MMR should report on the total number of congregate housing units preserved and constructed each fiscal year.

DOHMH and OCME

- **Unclaimed Descendants.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show trends and year-to-year information on descendants who are not claimed at OCME.
- **Descendants Buried in Public Burial.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to monitor how many bodies are buried on public burial ground per fiscal year.
- **Average Descendants Storage Capacity.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to track OCME's storage capacity.
- **Suspected Overdose Deaths.** The MMR should report on the number of suspected overdose deaths each fiscal year.
- **Adults with Physical Checkup.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the total number of adults, aged 25 and above, who have had a physical checkup in the past 12 months, since primary care physical checkups have proven to reduce healthcare cost.
- **Adults with Serious Mental Illness Diagnosis.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to provide information on adults that live with a serious mental illness. Currently, the MMR only provides information on adults in Assistance Outpatient Treatment.
- **NYC Well Mobile Crisis Teams.** An indicator should be added in the MMR that tracks the deployment of mobile crisis teams.

NYPD

- **Training Hours Completed.** The MMR should include additional indicators that expand the section on counterterrorism training hours completed, adding figures for training hours completed for implicit bias, FETI, crisis conversion, among others.

- **Traffic Fatalities.** The MMR should include an indicator to separate the total number of fatalities for bicyclists and pedestrians.
- **Police Commissioner Deviation.** The MMR should include indicators that show the number of times the Police Commissioner deviates from the Civilian Complaint Review Board's (CCRB) recommendation, as well as provide the number of days it takes for the NYPD to issue the written explanation for the deviation.
- **Hate Crimes.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show hate crime statistics.

DYCD

- **Summer Youth Employment Program (SYEP) Applications and Participation.** The MMR should report the number of SYEP applications, and participation in all program components. The MMR should also report stipends and wages paid to participants in each program.
- **Runaway Homeless Youth.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to separate services for Runaway Homeless Youth ages 16 though 20 and Homeless Youth Adults ages 21 through24.
- **COMPASS/SONYC/Beacon/Cornertsone Programs.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to include the number of participants by school and summer program.

Department of Investigation (DOI)

- **Fingerprint Indicators.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show fingerprint information, to make sure they are conducted in a timely manner.
- **Open Docket of Investigations.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the number of DOI investigations that are currently active and closed by fiscal year.

CCHR

- **Commission-Initiated Investigations.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the total number of investigations initiated by CCHR.

DSNY

- **Litter Basket Routes.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to track daily litter basket collection routes.

DOC

- **Marginal Cost of Incarceration.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the cost for each new person incarcerated, for a more direct analysis of policies and initiatives to reduce jail population.

HRA

- **Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP).** The MMR does not include adequate information regarding SNAP. The indicators should be expanded to include information on how quickly, on average, SNAP users exhaust their monthly benefits, as well as a breakdown of the number of recipients receiving the minimum, maximum, or some other benefit level. Additional indicators should include the total number of SNAP applications submitted, broken down by new applications and renewals, with an acceptance rate for each type and the top reasons for denial.

- **Medicaid Recipients.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to provide a count of HRA-administered Medicaid recipients who are non-Modified Gross Adjusted Income qualified (MAGI), MAGI renewals, and any other categories.

- **Medicaid Homecare Services.** An indicator should be included in the MMR to provide a count of the Medicaid-eligible clients who apply for homecare services and are denied, care outcomes, cost avoidance, and types of quality of service.
- **Emergency Food Assistance Program (EFAP).** The MMR does not include any information regarding EFAP. New indicators should include information on the number of EFAP applications received, a count of active EFAP providers broken out by type, the number of EFAP providers that have closed, the number of EFAP deliveries made to community-based providers each month, the amount of food delivered, and the number of clients served by EFAP providers.

- **Food Insecure Residents.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to show the total number of food insecure City residents, broken down by borough.

- **Domestic Violence Shelter.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to show the total number of available domestic violence Tier II units, along with the vacancy rates and average length of stay for both domestic violence emergency shelters and domestic violence Tier II shelters.

DHS

- **Shelter Cost by Type of Shelter.** An indicator should be added to the MMR on the cost of shelter by facility type. Currently, it only reports on the average cost of shelter per day by household type. Given the varying cost of shelter facilities, additional indicators should be added in the MMR.

- **Shelter Units with WiFi Access.** DHS aims to install WiFi in 10,500 shelter apartments by the summer of 2021. This is a vitally important resource for DHS clients, especially as students are attending school online and need access to reliable internet connection. In future years, the PMMR should report the number of units with WiFi access, by shelter type and population.

Department of Cultural Affairs (DCLA)

- **CIG Diversity, Inclusion, and Equity Plans.** Indicators should be added in the MMR/PMMR to track the implementation of Cultural Institutions Groups (CIGs) diversity, equity, and inclusion plans.

Department of City Planning (DCP)

- **Housing Creation.** The MMR should report the total number of affordable housing units created by fiscal year.

Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC)

- **Landmark Designation Disaggregated by Borough.** The MMR should show the total number of landmark designations, disaggregated by borough.

DOB

- **Improve Processing Efficiency.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to show the number of job filings processed through DOB NOW, the various work permit types, and renovation type.
- **Enforce Building and Zoning Laws.** Indicators should be added in the MMR to show the total number of stop-work orders issued, the number of sites which resumed work following a stop-work order, the number of sites which have received more than one violation over the life of the project, and the number of stop-work orders issued due to noncompliance with COVID-19 safety guidelines.
- **Review Initial Construction Plans.** The MMR should report the average plan review time disaggregated by borough office.

DOT

- **Leading Pedestrian Intervals (LPI).** An indicator should be added in the MMR which provides information on LPI's, including historical data.
- **Open Restaurants Program.** The MMR should report on the number of restaurants that have applied to and are participating in the Open Restaurant Program.
- **Open Streets Program.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to provide information on the total number of miles of streets included in the Open Streets Program.

Taxi & Limousine Commission (TLC)

- **Green Grants Program.** An indicator should be added in the MMR to provide the total amount of Green Grants awarded by fiscal year.

DFTA

- **Senior Subsidized Employment.** The MMR should restore two previously removed indicators for senior subsidized employment programs: the number of seniors trained for unsubsidized employment, and the number of senior trainees placed in unsubsidized employment.
- **Number of Unduplicated Seniors Served.** The MMR should report on the total number of unduplicated New York City seniors reached by DFTA.

ACS

- **DOE Residential Care.** The MMR should report on the number of students in DOE residential care programs and the average cost per child.
- **Child Maltreatment in Foster Care.** The MMR should be expanded to include an indicator reporting on the actual number of children maltreated during family foster care placements annually. Currently, the MMR is limited to reporting out a ratio per 100,000 care days.

DOE

- **Pupil Transportation.** Currently, the MMR includes no information related to student transportation. Indicators should be added in the MMR to report on the number special education and general education bus routes, counts of student riders, measures of timeliness, reliability and cost. The MMR should also track the energy efficiency of buses.
- **Support Children with Special Needs.** The MMR should report on the number of students enrolled in contract schools, as well as the average cost per student. Additionally, the MMR should include indicators for the number of students waiting to be placed in special education services, including the average placement time. The MMR should also include the number of Carter cases settled each year by DOE, the average settlement cost and the percentage of students by disability type associated with these settlements. Finally, the MMR should report on the yearly average spending on related special needs services per student.
- **Early Childhood Education.** The MMR should report on the number of 3-K and pre-K students enrolled in program by type of setting and cost per pupil. This data should be compared to data of children ages three and four residing in the City NYC. The MMR should also break out enrollment by type of program, including Head Start/Early Head Start and identify extended day and extended year seats.
- **Meals Served.** The MMR should report on the cost of each meal served. For Covid-19, the MMR should report on the number of meals served at Grab and Go sites broken out by type (for example, adult vs children, halal, kosher, breakfast, and lunch).
- **Teachers.** The MMR should report on the number of teachers and other staff in the Absent Teacher Reserve pool.

- **Rigorous Courses.** The MMR should report on the percentage of students who completed rigorous courses. It should also report on the percentage of students who completed rigorous courses in the subject areas of Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math.