



IN THE MATTER OF application submitted by Bridge Land Vestry, LLC pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for additional parking spaces) and Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution to allow an automated accessory off-street parking garage with a maximum capacity of 42 spaces on portions of the ground floor, cellar and sub-cellar of a proposed mixed-use building on property located at 70 Vestry Street (Block 223, Lots 3, 13 & 20), in C6-3A and C6-2A Districts, within the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 1.

The application for a special permit was filed by Bridge Land Vestry LLC on December 23, 2015. The requested special permit would facilitate the provision of 42 residential parking spaces within a mixed-use development at 70 Vestry Street in the Tribeca neighborhood of Manhattan.

BACKGROUND

70 Vestry Street is part of a larger zoning lot (Block 223; Lot 3, 13, 20) that is generally bounded by Desbrosses Street to the north, Washington Street to the east, Vestry Street to the south, and West Street to the west. The site (Block 223, Lot 3) had been developed with one-, two-, and five-story buildings containing both commercial and automotive uses which were demolished to facilitate construction of the new building. The rest of the zoning lot is developed with a nine-story mixed residential-commercial building (Lot 13) and a two-story commercial building (Lot 20) which will remain unchanged.

Most of the site (approximately 20,386.16 square feet) is zoned C6-3A within area A4 of the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District (“TMU”). Area A4 allows a maximum floor area ratio (FAR) of 6.5 for all permitted uses. The maximum building height is 140 feet, with a further 10-foot penthouse permitted, and the base height must be a minimum of 60 feet and a maximum of 70 feet.

A smaller portion of the site (approximately 3,975.49 square feet), located within 100 feet of Washington Street, is zoned C6-2A and is located in Area A5 of the TMU. The A5 designation allows for a maximum FAR of 5.5 for all permitted uses. The maximum building height in area A5 is 110 feet and the base height must be a minimum of 60 feet and a maximum of 70 feet. In

both districts, the required setback distance above the street wall is 10 feet for wide streets (applicable to West Street) and 15 feet for narrow streets (applicable to Desbrosses Street and Vestry Street). Uses permitted as-of-right include residential (Use Groups 1 and 2), community facilities (Use Groups 3 and 4) and commercial (Use Groups 5 to 12). Furthermore, Section 111-10 of the Zoning Resolution permits additional uses, such as automotive and semi-industrial uses in Use Group 16 and manufacturing uses in Use Group 17, with exceptions.

The applicant proposes to develop an as-of-right 12-story, with penthouse, 47-unit residential building on the site (Block 223, Lot 3). The total zoning floor area of the building will be 153,690 square feet, comprised of 152,861 square feet of residential floor area and 829 square feet of community facility or commercial floor area. The proposed development will also include 13,710 gross square feet of parking space and 17,038 square feet of storage, amenity, and mechanical space. The building's cellar and sub-cellar levels will include accessory residential amenity spaces, storage, and the proposed automated parking facility. The building will rise to a height of 194 feet and its street walls will be built to the street line with frontage on Desbrosses Street, Vestry Street, and West Street.

The proposed action would facilitate the establishment of a 42 space accessory parking garage in the cellar and sub-cellar of the building. The parking garage will be fully automated and will include a 24.5' deep, 16' wide entry bay, which will serve as an auto elevator lift within the interior courtyard at the ground floor of the building. The parking facility will have 21 at the cellar level (6,855 gross square feet), and 21 at the sub-cellar level (6,855 gross square feet). The automated parking system is designed for the storage and retrieval of vehicles in high density parking facilities and allows for the automated storage and retrieval of vehicles through self-guided technology.

Section 13-041(d) does not permit parking garages as-of-right within the Manhattan Core.

The proposed development with 47 residential units would be permitted nine accessory parking spaces as-of-right. A special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 (Special Permits for additional parking spaces) and 13-451(a) (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) is requested to provide a residential parking facility with 42 spaces.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 160145 ZSM) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA), and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 15DCP161M. The lead is the City Planning Commission.

After a study of the potential impacts of the proposed actions, a Negative Declaration was issued on April 11, 2016.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW PROCEDURE (ULURP)

This application (C 160145 ZSM) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on April 11, 2016, and was duly referred to Community Board 1 and the Borough President in accordance Title 62 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b).

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 1 held a public hearing on this application (C 160145 ZSM) on April 26, 2016, and on that date, by a vote of 36 to 1 with 0 abstentions and 1 recusal, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the application with the condition that, “the applicant consider the provision of appropriate local amenities for the surrounding rapidly growing residential community.”

Borough President Recommendation

This application (C 160145 ZSM) was considered by the Borough President, who issued a recommendation on May 31, 2016 supporting approval of the application.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On May 25, 2016 (Calendar No. 2), the City Planning Commission scheduled June 8, 2016 for a public hearing on this application (C 160145 ZSM). The hearing was duly held on June 8, 2016 (Calendar No. 30). There were two speakers in favor of the application and none in opposition.

The applicant's land use attorney described the proposed as-of-right development and the automated parking facility's operations and vehicle circulation. He stated that City Planning's target parking space rate for the surrounding area is 20% and that the current rate is negative 21% for the 10-year look back period. It is expected that many residents of the building will own vehicles and the request for additional parking spaces is intended to internalize the parking demand so that the new vehicles introduced by the proposed development do not occupy parking spaces in public parking facilities or on the street. He also stated that approximately 20% of the trays will allow for electrical charging and that all of the trays can be converted to allow for electric charging if needed.

A representative for the Manhattan Borough President reiterated the Borough President's recommendation and stated that the Borough President would like to see an analysis of a longer look-back period, consideration of more mass transit options, access to bike-share and dedicated bicycle lanes, and analysis of overlapping study areas considered in future parking special permit requests.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

WATERFRONT REVITALIZATION PROGRAM CONSISTENCY

The application (C 160145 ZSM) was reviewed by the City Coastal Commission for consistency with the policies of the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program (WRP), as amended, approved by the New York City Council on October 30, 2013 and by the New York State Department of State on February 3, 2016, pursuant to the New York State Waterfront Revitalization and Coastal Resources Act of 1981, (New York State Executive Law, Section 910 *et seq.*) The designated WRP number is 15-044.

This action was determined to be consistent with the policies of the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this application for a special permit to facilitate a 42-space accessory parking garage, is appropriate.

Residential parking facilities are not permitted within the Manhattan Core except by special permit pursuant to Section 13-451, provided that the proposed spaces will serve the parking needs of area residents. The proposed building could be developed with nine accessory parking spaces for the residential use.

The entrance to the parking garage is located midblock, which provides pedestrian traffic ample awareness of a vehicles intent to enter the site via the curb cut. Pedestrians will be alerted when vehicles exit the building by two flashing warning lights located on the exterior of the building, on either side of the garage, and an audible warning. The Commission believes this configuration and warning system will alleviate undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements in to and out of the parking garage.

Desbrosses and Vestry Streets are not designated bike routes, bus routes, or truck routes. The direction of traffic on both streets is one-way and thus vehicles will not cross oncoming traffic when entering or exiting the parking facility. The Commission believes that this configuration will not interfere with the efficient functioning of streets or create serious traffic congestion in the area.

The parking garage is intended for use only by unit owners of the building or nearby residents, and will not accommodate transient users. Therefore, the parking garage will not be subject to varying numbers of vehicles on certain days and at certain times, but will instead be used on a regular basis and schedule only by the tenants of the building or nearby residents who have licenses for the available spaces. The automated facility will provide the required reservoir spaces, sufficient

internal queueing, and can process incoming vehicles in 81.5 seconds on average, which will allow for the efficient movement of vehicles off the street.

The site contains five existing curb cuts, with two on Desbrosses Street, one on West Street, and two on Vestry Street. All existing curb cuts will be removed and two new curb cuts will be constructed for the parking garage's entrance, on Desbrosses Street, and exit, on Vestry Street. The Commission observes that active and inactive curb cuts exist along Desbrosses and Vestry Streets, and therefore believes that the location of the entrance and exit would not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape.

The applicant documented the new and eliminated residential units and off-street parking spaces within one-third of a mile from the development site between 2004 and 2018, the project's expected build year, to demonstrate that the request for 42 residential parking spaces is reasonable and not excessive in regard to recent trends in residential development and the provision of parking. Using data from the Department of Buildings, the Department of Consumer Affairs, and additional research performed by the applicant, the study found that between 2004 and 2018, the ratio of the change in off-street parking spaces to the change in residential units without the proposed 42 parking spaces and 47 residential units is negative 24.9%. With the proposed 42 parking spaces and 47 residential units, that ratio would increase to negative 21.6%. The study assumes the parking spaces would serve the parking needs of residents both on the development site and in the immediate vicinity. The growth ratio is well below 20%, the Department of City Planning's expected growth ratio of new off-street parking spaces to new residential units for Manhattan Community District 1.

The Commission therefore believes that the ratio of new off-street parking spaces to new residential units with the proposed project demonstrates that the request for 42 residential parking spaces is reasonable and not excessive in regard to recent trends in residential development and the provision of parking.

FINDINGS

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for Additional Parking Spaces) of the Zoning Resolution:

- (1) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with #uses# or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (2) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of #streets#, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (3) such #use# will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;
- (4) for #public parking garages#, that where any floor space is exempted from the definition of #floor area#, such additional floor space is needed in order to prevent excessive on-street parking demand and relieve traffic congestion; and
- (5) such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape.

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution:

- (a) the number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:
 - (1) the increase in the number of #dwelling units#; and
 - (2) the number of both public and #accessory# off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities. In making this determination, the Commission may take into account off-street parking facilities for which building permits have been granted, or which have obtained City Planning Commission special permits pursuant to Section 13-45.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, the City Coastal Commission finds that the action will not substantially hinder the achievement of any WRP policy and hereby determines that this action is consistent with WRP policies; and be it further

RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination, and the consideration and findings described in this report, the application submitted by Bridge Land Vestry, LLC pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for additional parking spaces) and Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution to allow an automated accessory off-street parking garage with a maximum capacity of 42 spaces on portions of the ground floor, cellar and sub-cellar of a proposed mixed-use building on property located at 70 Vestry Street (Block 223, Lots 3, 13 & 20), in C6-3A and C6-2A Districts, within the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 1, is approved, subject to the following terms and conditions:

1. The property that is the subject of this application (C 160145 ZSM) shall be developed in size and arrangement substantially in accordance with the dimensions, specifications and zoning computations indicated on the following approved plans, prepared by Philip Habib & Associates, filed with this application and incorporated in this resolution:

<u>Drawing No.</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Last Date Revised</u>
1 of 2	Parking Plan Ground Level	March 8, 2016
2 of 2	Parking Plan Cellar & Subcellar	March 8, 2016

2. Such development shall conform to all applicable provisions of the Zoning Resolution, except for the modifications specifically granted in this resolution and shown on the plans listed above which have been filed with this application. All zoning computations are subject to verification and approval by the New York City Department of Buildings.
3. Such development shall conform to all applicable laws and regulations relating to its construction, operation and maintenance.
4. All leases, subleases, or other agreements for use or occupancy of space at the subject property shall give actual notice of this special permit to the lessee, sublessee or occupant.
5. Upon failure of any party having any right, title or interest in the property that is the subject of this application, or the failure of any heir, successor, assign, or legal representative of such party, to observe any of the covenants, restrictions, agreements, terms or conditions of this resolution whose provisions shall constitute conditions of the special permit hereby granted, the City Planning Commission may, without the consent of any other party, revoke any portion of or all of said special permit. Such power of revocation shall be in addition to and not limited to any other powers of the City Planning Commission, or of any other agency of government, or any private person or entity. Any such failure as stated above, or any alteration in the development that is the subject of this application that departs from any of the conditions listed above, is grounds for the City Planning Commission or the City Council, as applicable, to disapprove any application for modification, cancellation or amendment of the special permit hereby granted.
6. Neither the City of New York nor its employees or agents shall have any liability for money damages by reason of the city's or such employee's or agent's failure to act in accordance with the provisions of this special permit.

The above resolution (C 160145 ZSM), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on July 13, 2016 (Calendar No. 11), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough

President together with a copy of the plans of the development, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

CARL WEISBROD, Chairman

KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, ESQ., Vice Chairman

RAYANN BESSER, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ALFRED C. CERULLO, III,

MICHELLE R. DE LA UZ, JOSEPH I. DOUEK, RICHARD W. EADDY,

CHERYL COHEN EFFRON, HOPE KNIGHT, ANNA HAYES LEVIN,

ORLANDO MARIN, LARISA ORTIZ, Commissioners

COMMUNITY BOARD #1 – MANHATTAN
RESOLUTION

DATE: APRIL 26, 2016

COMMITTEE OF ORIGIN: TRIBECA

COMMITTEE VOTE: 7 In Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstained 0 Recused
BOARD VOTE: 36 In Favor 1 Opposed 0 Abstained 1 Recused

RE: 70 Vestry Street, application for City Planning Commission Special Permit pursuant to sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the New York City Zoning Resolution to allow a 42 space accessory parking garage at 70 Vesey Street

WHEREAS: Bridge Land Vestry, LLC requests a special permit from the City Planning Commission pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the New York City Zoning Resolution to permit an accessory off-street parking garage on-site with 42 accessory parking spaces in a proposed 47-unit residential building at 70 Vestry Street, and

WHEREAS: In 2010, the City approved the North Tribeca Rezoning which encouraged residential development in contextual mixed-use buildings in an approximately 25-block area as part of the growing Tribeca residential community, and

WHEREAS: The proposed building will be 149 feet tall, with 12 stories and the permitted penthouse above the roof. The street walls of the proposed building will be built to the street. Excluding the accessory parking garage, the development is entirely as-of-right, and

WHEREAS: The proposed garage will be located in the cellar and sub-cellar level with over 17,960 gross sq. ft. operated through an automated parking system, and

WHEREAS: The parking regulations in the “Manhattan Core” limit the maximum accessory off-street parking to twenty percent of the dwelling units or nine parking spaces, but the City Planning Commission may grant a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 to allow an accessory off-street parking garage in excess of the nine permitted accessory off-street parking spaces with 33 additional spaces, and

WHEREAS: The proposed facility would provide building residents with a safe and convenient place for parking and will not contribute to traffic congestion, and the proposed facility would be consistent with and would not change the neighborhood’s character, now

THEREFORE

BE IT

RESOLVED

THAT: CB1 recommends that the City Planning Commission approve the request for a special permit pursuant to section 13-45 and 13-451 of the Zoning Resolution to allow an off-street parking garage with a capacity of 42 spaces at 70 Vestry Street, and

BE IT

FURTHER

RESOLVED

THAT: CB1 recommends that the applicant consider the provision of appropriate local amenities for the surrounding rapidly growing residential community.



OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

1 Centre Street, 19th floor, New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f
431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027
(212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f
www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov

Gale A. Brewer, Borough President

May 31, 2016

**Recommendation on ULURP Application No. C 160145 ZSM -
70 Vestry Street Accessory Garage
By Bridge Land Vestry LLC**

PROPOSED ACTION

Bridge Land Vestry, LLC (“the applicant”), an affiliate of The Related Companies, seeks a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451 of the New York City Zoning Resolution (“ZR”) to allow for an accessory off-street parking facility on-site with 42 accessory off-street parking spaces (the “proposed garage”) in the cellar and sub-cellar level of a new as-of-right residential building currently under construction at 70 Vestry Street. The proposed garage would be located on a portion of a larger zoning lot bounded by Desbrosses Street to the north, Vestry Street to the south, Washington Street to the east and West Street to the west (Block 223, Lots 3, 13 and 20)¹. The development is located on a zoning lot divided between Area A4 and Area A5 of the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District (TMU) in Community District 1, Manhattan with a C6-3A and C6-2A zoning district, respectively.

The special permit requires that all of the applicable conditions of ZR § 13-20 (SPECIAL RULES FOR MANHATTAN CORE PARKING FACILITIES) be met and that the findings of §13-45 and 13-451 have been met. These findings are as follows:

- (1) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with uses or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (2) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of streets, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (3) such use will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;

¹ The development site is located on Lot 3, formerly lots 3, 5, 7,9,11 12 and 112 and parts of former lots 13 and 15. The remainder of the zoning lot includes Lots 20 and 13, part of former lots 13 and 15; there is remaining floor area allocated to this portion.

- (4) for public parking garages, that where any floor space is exempted from the definition of floor area, such additional floor space is needed in order to prevent excessive on-street parking demand and relieve traffic congestion;
- (5) such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape; and
- (6) the number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:
 - (a) the increase in the number of dwelling units; and
 - (b) the number of both public and accessory off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed garage is being developed in relationship to a new as-of-right residential development on 70 Vestry Street. The residential development will reach 140 feet tall and will be segmented into 12 stories with a rooftop penthouse. The building will be comprised of 47 market-rate dwelling units totaling 186,358 gross sq. ft. and an additional 829 gross sq. ft. of community facility / commercial space. Street wall heights and setbacks will meet the upper restrictions of the respective C6-3A and C6-2A zoning districts that govern site.

The proposed garage will be run by an automated parking system operated by the Park Plus *ParkTronic* AGV System (“Parktronic System”) created by Park Plus, Inc. The proposed garage will consist of 42 parking spaces with spaces divided evenly between the cellar and sub-cellar floors of the development. The Entry Bay/VRC of the proposed garage is located on the northeastern edge of the development site. The 24.5’ deep, 16’ wide Entry Bay/VRC will be outfitted with a vehicle elevator lift and pursuant to ZR 13-25 (a)(1) there will be two reservoir spaces for queuing vehicles waiting for access to the vehicle elevator lift. The developer has identified the Entry Bay/VRC and the southeastern bend of the courtyard’s circular driveway as the two required reservoir spaces.

Access to the garage is limited to two unidirectional 15’ wide curb cuts, one from Desbrosses Street and one located on Vestry Street. Vehicles will enter the development by driving west on Desbrosses Street and using the curb cut approximately 97’ east of West Street. The vehicle will travel along a 10’ wide parking access lane south until it comes to the bend on the southwestern edge of the circular vehicle path. At that point the driver will reach the first reservoir spot and the indicators on the Entry Bay will signal the driver to approach, at which point the vehicle will continue into the bay. The Parktronic System’s process for how the AGV will proceed from that point is laid out in the applicant’s certification packet. All other vehicle traffic due to drop off or pick up from the building entrance is diverted at the point of entry into a separate 10’ foot lane west of the parking access lane.

The objective of seeking the special permit, and for the proposed garage being considered, is to provide parking access for residents for the as-of-right development given the applicant's statements that the need for spaces will be beyond the maximum ceiling of permitted spaces. As we understand it, residents of the development will have priority status for claiming a space in the proposed garage but if the demand does not meet their expectation they are then prepared to offer the spaces to the public for monthly use only.

Site Description

The proposed development site, including the proposed garage, is located at 70 Vestry Street in Manhattan Community Board 1, Manhattan. The site includes Block 223, Lot 3 (f/k/a Lots 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 12, 112 and p/o former Lots 13 and 15) and is associated with several addresses including 62-74 Vestry Street, 264-270 West Street and 31-39 Desbrosses Street. The development site is an irregular shaped lot with frontages approximately 140 feet long on Desbrosses Street, 176 feet long on West Street and 133 feet long on Vestry Street. The surrounding streets include three narrow streets (Washington Street, with north bound traffic, is 60 feet in width and Vestry Street and Desbrosses Street, running west and east, respectively, are 65 feet in width) and one wide street (West Street, running north and south, is 120 feet in width).

The development is located on a zoning lot divided between Area A4, mapped a C6-3A, and Area A5, mapped C6-2A, of the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District (TMU). The maximum floor area ratio (FAR) permitted on a zoning lot in A4/ C6-3A and A5/ C6-2A is 6.5 and 5.5., respectively.

In 2015 the applicant moved to demolish the existing buildings and is constructing their new development. According to records from the Department of Buildings 6 buildings existed on the lot prior to their demolition. Those buildings included (4) 2-story commercial buildings and (2) 5-story commercial buildings, one of which was primarily used for storage. This block was also home to one of Tribeca's first restaurants, F. Illi Ponte Ristorante, which opened its doors at 39 Desbrosses Street in 1967 and served the area for nearly five decades before closing their doors in 2013.

Area Context

The proposed development is located on the western edge of Northern Tribeca. Today the area hosts a range of diverse uses including parkland, different intensities of manufacturing, parking facilities, and mixed and stand-alone residential and commercial. The proposed development neighbors the Tribeca North Historic District, one of 4 districts that overlap with Tribeca. North and south of the proposed development building heights range from structures that are 5 to 15 stories on average; and to the east there are structures that are 1 to 5 stories.

West of the proposed development is West Street which serves as the service road for the West Side Highway, a six-to-eight lane boulevard that runs from the southern tip of Manhattan up to West 72nd Street along the Hudson River. Beyond the boulevard is Hudson River Park, a 550 acre, 4.5 mile park that makes up a pivotal portion of the Manhattan Waterfront Greenway.

There are a number of transportation options accessible to the proposed development site. There is subway access to the 1 train at Canal Street and the A, C, and E Trains, which are .4 miles and .5 miles away from the proposed development site, respectively. The M20 bus provides northbound service via Hudson Street and southbound service via Varick Street within a quarter mile of the site. In addition, within a .7 mile radius there is access to the M5 bus line.

Additionally Citi bike is available to users in North Tribeca. Citi bike has three bike stations installed near the proposed development site, all approximately within a quarter mile radius of the site. Those bike stations are located at the intersections of Laight Street and Hudson Street, Watts Street and Greenwich Street, and Greenwich Street and North Moore Street. Bike lanes have been established for riders both northbound and southbound along the West Side Highway Bike Path / Greenway and a southbound stripped lane north of the proposed development starting at the intersection of Canal Street and Washington Street.

BACKGROUND

The earliest development of the area goes back to the Dongan Charter of 1686. The Dongan Charter encouraged owners with parcels on Greenwich Street to privately invest in adding infill to the low-water mark in an effort to build additional wharves. In exchange, the city allowed for this to be a profitable venture for those investors. Landfill was extended even further out in 1730 with the signing of the Montgomery Charter. Those efforts led to establishing present day Washington and West Streets.

Picking up briskly after the turn of the 19th Century, the community was a focal point for food-related warehousing and distribution operators. Among the most important anchors for this activity was the Washington Market, a major satellite in the constellation of the city's thriving city market scene and at its peak in 1900, the largest market in North America. But in the second half of the 20th century those businesses started to experience decline due to changing practices in how food distributors connected with their customer bases and the relocation of lower Manhattan's city markets to Hunts Point Cooperative Market in the Bronx. A growing interest in repurposing underutilized manufacturing land for residential use led to the creation of the Special Tribeca Mixed Use District (TMU) in 1976. The TMU envisioned protections for light manufacturing and warehousing with careful management of residential growth. Over time property owners showed a preference for residential development in the area, and drove additional modifications of the TMU with a 2006 four block rezoning of a M1-5 district into a split C6-2A and C6-3A district referred to as the Tribeca North Rezoning. Soon after, the City Planning Commission moved forward with a broader North Tribeca Rezoning in 2010.

The move to make residential construction as-of-right was facilitated by the aforementioned rezoning and changes to off-street parking rules for the Manhattan Core, last amended in May 2013. These modifications led to a dramatic decrease in DCA-licensed off-street parking spaces in this community. Beside the 180-space parking facility at 450 Washington Street, parking space capacity is being displaced for residential use. One example is the 283 unit residential

building attached to the aforementioned garage immediately north of the proposed development site. Another recent example is from summer 2014 when Ponte Equities and Barone Management pulled permits to demolish a 1-story Chad-Erik EZ Park garage (22-28 Desbrosses, 445 Washington, 449 Washington, 454-456 Greenwich Street) to allow for the construction of an as-of-right 11-story, 110 ft. tall hotel and dining establishment.

The applicant's residential growth parking study analysis is attached with their certification packet documents, and it shows the decrease in overall parking capacity for the neighborhood.

COMMUNITY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

The Tribeca Committee of Manhattan Community Board 1 ("CB1") voted on April 13, 2016 to approve the 70 Vestry Street Garage Application with 7 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstained and 0 recused. At its full board meeting on April 26, 2016, CB1 recommended an approval with no conditions of this application with 36 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstained, and 1 recused. The resolution concluded that the proposed garage as planned imposes no safety risks for the community and would not have adverse effects on traffic congestion or the character of the immediate neighborhood. The Tribeca Committee did request that the applicant consider the provision of appropriate local amenities for the surrounding rapidly growing residential community.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S COMMENTS

The requirement of a special permit in and of itself has likely greatly reduced the number of new parking spaces in the past two years, a primary goal of the Manhattan Core Parking Text, and this itself should be viewed as an achievement. However, it is clear that this requirement is not eliminating the desire for additional spaces as residential units continue to be constructed at the higher stratosphere of market price and the expectation with such price is that parking shall be provided on site. In the heavily congested Manhattan Core, where access to public transit is the most prevalent in the city, every effort should be made to reduce car trips. In Manhattan, where public space is limited and valuable, reduction of private vehicular trips allows roadway to be reclaimed by other public purposes like plazas, expanded sidewalks, or increased vegetation. It is through this lens that applications for additional parking, which makes car trips easier and more likely, should be evaluated.

The review process needs to be comprehensive enough to fully evaluate new parking. Recommendations from the Borough President on prior parking special permits have continued to call on the Department of City Planning and the City Planning Commission to consider a more robust set of factors aside from the parking methodology analysis, including the absolute availability of parking, the supply of parking prior to the ten-year look-back and the current capacity and utilization rate of parking facilities in the neighborhood, access to mass transit and distance from arterial roadways; and, finally, to evaluate the garage design and its interface with the pedestrian realm.

The application for additional parking spaces at 70 Vestry Street has met all relevant findings for the special permit pursuant to §13-45 and 13-451 of the ZR by completing the methodology framework and is appropriate for this particular neighborhood. Even when applying the more robust criteria this office has employed over the last two years, this garage application would still be considered appropriate given its immediate proximity to West Street and the West Side Highway. As stated above, there is a loss of parking capacity in the neighborhood, and measures have been proposed to enhance the pedestrian realm. The pedestrian realm could further be strengthened if the applicant adheres to the recommendation from the Community Board to prioritize appropriate local amenities on the ground floor.

The applicant has worked with their transportation engineers at Philip Habib & Associates to plan out a thoughtful vehicle and pedestrian circulation plan with signage throughout the development site. The applicant has indicated that any potential conflict areas for vehicles and pedestrians will be covered by multiple warning devices. Additionally a stop sign and a speed bump have been installed on the Vestry Street exit to strengthen pedestrian safety for those who travel along the northern side. Finally, the circular pathway design creates multiple reservoir spaces beyond what is required; therefore there is a very low probability that there will be a queuing issue on Desbrosses Street. As required by the ZR, the applicant is also making available 24 bicycle spaces that given the location of the development site to established multi-directional bike lanes, will encourage that use over vehicle transportation.

The multiple layers of safety are a welcomed precaution, and given the moderate number of vehicles that will be utilizing this proposed garage the safety plan appears sufficient. The applicant should still be encouraged to add additional visual signage specifically on both sides of the area between the exit of the Entry Bay/VAC and the opposite-facing walking path that leads to the entrance of the building, given the proximity to crosswalks and entrances to Hudson River Park.

The design of the interior drive-thru, provision of reservoir spaces, and automated system will prevent the garage from adding congestion to the local street system. Lastly, given the current structure of the special permit and adherence to the recommended methodology set forth by the Department of City Planning, it is believed that the applicant has completed due diligence in proving this proposal meets the findings for additional parking spaces at this location.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

Therefore, the Manhattan Borough President recommends approval of ULURP Application No. C 160145 ZSM.



Gale A. Brewer
Manhattan Borough President