



IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD):

- 1) pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law of New York State for:
 - a) the designation of properties located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37), as an Urban Development Action Area; and
 - b) an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and
- 2) pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter for the disposition of such property to a developer to be selected by HPD;

to facilitate the construction of approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing, Borough of Brooklyn, Community District 16.

Approval of three separate matters is required:

1. the designation of property located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37), as an Urban Development Action Area; and
2. An Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and
3. The disposition of such property, to a developer selected by HPD

The application for an Urban Development Action Area designation and project approval and disposition of City-owned property (C 170153 HAK) was filed by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) on November 21, 2016.

Approval of this application would facilitate the development of an eight-story building with approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing in the Brownsville neighborhood of Community District 16, Brooklyn.

The Department of Housing Preservation and Development states in its application that:

The Disposition Area consists of underutilized property which tends to impair or arrest the sound development of the surrounding community, with or without tangible physical blight. Incentives are needed in order to induce the correction of these substandard, insanitary, and blighting conditions. The project activities would protect and promote health and safety and would promote sound growth and development. The Disposition Area is therefore eligible to be an Urban Development Action Area and the proposed project is therefore eligible to be an Urban Development Action Area Project pursuant to Article 16 of the General Municipal Law.

RELATED ACTIONS

In addition to the application for an Urban Development Action Area designation and project approval and disposition of city-owned property, which is the subject of this report, implementation of the proposed project also requires action by the City Planning Commission on the following application, which is being considered concurrently with this application.

C 170154 ZSK Special permit pursuant to Section 74-903 of the Zoning Resolution to modify the floor area requirements for a non-profit institution with sleeping accommodations.

BACKGROUND

The New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development is seeking Urban Development Action Area designation, project approval, and disposition of City-owned property located at 210/214 Hegeman Avenue (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37), to facilitate the development of an eight-story building providing approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing in the Brownsville neighborhood of Community District 16, Brooklyn.

210/214 Hegeman Avenue is located along the southern blockfront of Hegeman Avenue between Watkins Street and Mother Gaston Boulevard. It consists of two vacant City-owned lots (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37), totaling 7,600 square feet of lot area and is currently vacant and undeveloped. The site is located in an R6 zoning district. The R6 zoning district is medium-density district widely mapped in Brooklyn, with a maximum allowable floor area ratio (FAR) of 2.43, or 4.8 for certain community facilities.

The proposed actions would facilitate the development of an eight-story, 36,160 square-foot supportive housing facility containing approximately 70 studio units (about 300 square feet each), and one superintendent unit. Approximately 60 percent of the units (42) would be reserved for individuals exiting a NYC DHS shelter with special needs, and approximately 40 percent of the units (28) would be reserved for individuals earning below 60 percent of the area median income (AMI). Residents would receive on-site social services provided by trained staff, and security would be available 24 hours a day, seven days a week. The cellar would include storage, shared spaces for communal activities, social service offices, staff offices, and laundry facilities. Supportive housing facilities are defined as philanthropic or non-profit institutions with sleeping accommodations, which is a community facility (Use Group 3) use.

The proposed building would be about 79 feet - 4 inches high and the street wall would be setback five feet from the property line to allow for landscaping in the front. It would rise 60 feet high from the initial setback, at which point an additional 10-foot setback would be provided. The total proposed FAR is 4.76. No parking would be provided as the project site is within the Transit Zone.

The area surrounding the site is generally developed with residential, commercial, manufacturing, institutional, and open space land uses. It is primarily characterized by two- and three-story attached or semi-detached residential buildings with some larger buildings in the area, including the Plaza Residences, a six-story affordable housing development directly across Hegeman Avenue from the project area. The project area is within an R6 zoning district, which encompasses most of the surrounding area. There are C1-3 and C2-3 commercial overlays along portions of Hegeman Avenue, Rockaway Avenue, and New Lots Avenue. There is also an M1-1 district to the northeast and an M3-1 district to the south of the project area. The project area is well served by public transportation with the MTA L-train New Lots Avenue stop just over a quarter-mile away and the B35 and B15 bus lines serving the area.

To facilitate the proposed project, HPD is requesting Urban Development Action Area designation, project approval, the disposition of City-owned property, and a special permit pursuant to Zoning Resolution (ZR) Section 74-903 to allow an increase in FAR for the proposed

supportive housing facility. ZR 24-11 allows certain community facilities within R6 zoning districts to be built on an as-of-right basis at an FAR of 4.8. However, ZR Section 24-111(b) restricts philanthropic or non-profit institutions with sleeping accommodations in an R6 zoning district to 2.43 FAR. The special permit allows the FAR for this use to be increased to 4.8. The proposed development would have a community facility FAR of 4.76, which would also be the total FAR, as the community facility is the only proposed use.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The application (C 170153 HAK), in conjunction with the application for the related action (C 170153 ZSK), was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 *et seq.* and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 17HPD026K. The lead agency is the Department of Housing Preservation and Development.

After a study of the potential impact of the proposed actions, a Negative Declaration was issued on November 14, 2016.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 170153 HAK), in conjunction with the application for the related action (C 170154 ZSK), was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on November 28, 2016, and was duly referred to Brooklyn Community Board 16 and the Brooklyn Borough President in accordance with Title 62 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b).

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 16 held a public hearing on this application (C 170153 HAK) and the related action (C 170154 ZSK) on December 20, 2016, and on that date, by a vote of 24 in favor, one opposed, and with no abstentions, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the application.

Borough President Recommendation

This application (C 170153 HAK) and the application for the related action (C 170154 ZSK)

were considered by the Borough President of Brooklyn, who on January 23, 2017 issued a recommendation to approve the application.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On January 18, 2017 (Calendar No. 2), the City Planning Commission scheduled February 1, 2017 for a public hearing on this application (C 170153 HAK) and the application for the related action (C 170154 ZSK). The hearing was duly held on February 1, 2017 (Calendar No. 29). There were five speakers in favor and none opposed.

Speakers included two representatives from the applicant (HPD), two representatives of the service provider (CAMBA), and the project architect. The HPD representative presented the project overview and provided background information. The CAMBA representative provided an overview of the CAMBA mission and programs. Another CAMBA representative provided the details of the proposed project. The project architect discussed the design features of the proposed project and the neighborhood context. HPD representatives also discussed the regulatory agreement and explained that the agreement will be for a minimum of 30 years, and that after the agreement expires, HPD would attempt to extend the agreement for another minimum of 30 years. A CAMBA representative also stated that CAMBA has renewed regulatory agreements every time they have expired because it is their mission to provide affordable and supportive housing. HPD explained that there are no gender considerations in the selection process. The CAMBA representative noted that special needs of the residents of the supportive housing units would likely include individuals with mental illness.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this application (C 170153 HAK) for UDAAP designation, project approval, and the disposition of City-owned property, in conjunction with the application for the related action (C 170154 ZSK), is appropriate.

The proposed actions will facilitate an eight-story mixed-use building with approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing in the Brownsville neighborhood of Community

District 16, Brooklyn. The proposed building will provide on-site support services, front desk security, and common space for use by residents.

The subject properties have been vacant for many years and redevelopment of this site will remove a blighting influence from the neighborhood while providing much-needed supportive and affordable housing. The location of the proposed development is close to transit and retail, allowing easy access by building residents.

The related application for a special permit (C 170154 ZSK), which will allow a maximum FAR of 4.8 for community facility use, is appropriate. The FAR of the proposed community facility building would be 4.76. The increase in floor area is required to provide more severely-needed supportive and affordable housing units than would be achievable as-of-right, and contributes to the financial feasibility of the project.

The proposed development's distribution of bulk will not unduly obstruct light and air to adjoining properties or public access. The proposed building will provide a 30-foot rear yard with a landscaped patio and garden, which will be available to residents for outdoor passive recreation while also allowing light and air to the adjacent private residential buildings. In addition, the building will be setback 5-feet from the street line.

The proposed development will not require any additions to the supporting services of the neighborhood. The proposed development will have support staff located on site. Case management services will provide services such as financial literacy training, nutrition workshops, benefits advocacy, linkages to job training programs, resume workshops, computer skills training, and mental health groups.

The streets providing access to the proposed development are adequate to handle any traffic generated by the proposed development. The development site fronts on Hegeman Avenue, a 70-foot-wide street with two travel lanes and two-directional traffic. In addition, the site is close to public transportation and it is anticipated that the residents of this development will use public transportation.

The Commission believes that proposed development will make productive use of vacant,

underutilized properties while providing much-needed supportive and affordable housing in the Brownsville neighborhood.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant adverse impact on the environment, and

WHEREAS, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development has recommended the designation of properties located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37) in the Borough of Brooklyn as an Urban Development Action Area; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Housing Preservation and Development has also recommended the approval of an Urban Development Action Area Project for such property;

THEREFORE, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission after due consideration of the appropriateness of the actions, certifies its unqualified approval of the following matters pursuant to the Urban Development Action Area Act:

- a) the designation of properties located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37) as an Urban Development Action Area; and
- b) an Urban Development Action Area Project for such area; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination and the consideration of this report, the application of the Department of Housing Preservation and Development for the disposition of city-owned properties located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue (Block 3639, Lots 35 and 37) in Community District 16, Borough of Brooklyn, to a developer to be selected by the Department of Housing Preservation and Development, is approved.

The above resolution (C 170153 HAK), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on March 8, 2017 (Calendar No. 11), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council and the Borough President, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City

Charter.

KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, *Esq.*, *Vice-Chairman*

**RAYANN BESSER, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ALFRED C. CERULLO, III,
MICHELLE R. DE LA UZ, JOSEPH I. DOUEK, RICHARD W. EADDY,
CHERYL COHEN EFFRON, HOPE KNIGHT, ANNA HAYES LEVIN,
ORLANDO MARIN, LARISA ORTIZ Commissioners**

MARISA LAGO, *Chair*, *abstaining*

Brooklyn Borough President Recommendation

CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
22 Reade Street, New York, NY 10007
calendaroffice@planning.nyc.gov



INSTRUCTIONS

1. Return this completed form with any attachments to the Calendar Information Office, City Planning Commission, Room 2E at the above address.
2. Send one copy with any attachments to the applicant's representatives as indicated on the Notice of Certification.

APPLICATION

210-214 HEGEMAN AVENUE – 170154 ZSK AND 170153 HAK

In the matter of the applications submitted by the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) pursuant to Article 160 of the General Municipal Law of New York State for the designation of properties located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue, in the Brownsville neighborhood of Brooklyn Community District 16 (CD 16) as an Urban Development Action Area and Project (UDAAP) for such area, and pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter for the disposition of such property to be selected by HPD. Such actions would facilitate the construction of an eight-story, 42,000 square-foot building containing approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing. Additional application submitted by HPD pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to ZR Section 74-903 to modify the requirements of ZR Section 24-11, Maximum Floor Area and Percentage of Lot Coverage, to apply to a non-profit institution with sleeping accommodations in connection with the proposed building.

BROOKLYN COMMUNITY DISTRICT NO. 16

BOROUGH OF BROOKLYN

RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE
 APPROVE WITH
MODIFICATIONS/CONDITIONS

DISAPPROVE
 DISAPPROVE WITH
MODIFICATIONS/CONDITIONS

SEE ATTACHED

BROOKLYN BOROUGH PRESIDENT

January 23, 2017

DATE

RECOMMENDATION FOR: 210-214 HEGEMAN AVENUE – 170154 ZSK AND 170153 HAK

The New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD), pursuant to Article 160 of the General Municipal Law of New York State, seeks the designation of properties located at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue, in the Brownsville neighborhood of Brooklyn Community District 16 (CD 16), as an Urban Development Action Area and Project (UDAAP) for such area, and, pursuant to Section 197-c of the New York City Charter, the disposition of such properties to CAMBA Housing Ventures, Inc. (CAMBA), the developer selected by HPD. Such actions would facilitate the construction of an eight-story, 42,000 square-foot building containing approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing. An additional application submitted by HPD, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter, seeks the grant of a special permit pursuant to the New York City Zoning Resolution (ZR) Section 74-903 to modify the requirements of ZR Section 24-11, Maximum Floor Area and Percentage of Lot Coverage, to apply to a non-profit institution with sleeping accommodations in connection with the proposed building.

On January 9, 2017, Brooklyn Borough President Eric L. Adams held a public hearing on this text amendment. There were no speakers on this item.

In response to Borough President Adams' inquiry to clarify details with regard to the affordable housing, the applicant stated that for low-income lottery units the maximum qualifying income is \$31,008, with rents at \$736 per unit, including a utility allowance. For the supportive housing units, the AMI is typically around 30 percent; however, because these units are specifically set aside for formerly homeless with a disability, the determination will be made on an individual basis through a New York City Department of Homeless Services (DHS) referral program. CAMBA anticipates receiving a rental subsidy, so the rents for such units will reflect the current fair market rents at that time.

Deputy Brooklyn Borough President Diana Reyna noted the increased population of homeless children, with the highest percentages attending schools in Brownsville, and the need for family-sized supportive housing units. The representative stated that CAMBA shares these concerns and that family-sized units are included in developments where the size of the project allows, and when it is financially feasible. The representative noted that CAMBA is currently also working on a project at New York City Housing Authority's (NYCHA) Van Dyke Houses that will consist of 100 family-sized units. However, for this project specifically, based on the size of the parcel and the financial constraints, with per unit subsidy, in order to maximize the use of City property, only studio units are being proposed.

In response to Borough President Adams' inquiry to clarify the types of social services that would be offered and whether these services would be made available to all members of the community, the representative stated that for safety purposes, as well as per contract, services will only be offered to tenants of the building. The social services will focus around maintaining housing stability and preventative health care. There will be case managers on-site, as well as opportunity to access the full range of services provided by CAMBA off-site, such as job search, legal services, workforce training, etc.

In response to Borough President Adams' concerns regarding qualifying incomes for the proposed low-income units not being affordable to the senior population, the representative stated that CAMBA's developments accommodate tenants of all ages. However, this particular project does not have the financing to provide the deeply affordable rents to accommodate seniors. The HPD representative stated that the Supportive Housing Loan Program is being contemplated for this development, which allows for up to 60 percent of Area Median Income (AMI). This project has a very tight budget but it might be possible to add a couple of units at deeper affordability levels to

accommodate the senior population. The HPD representative stated that the agency also supports the provision of units for seniors and has created a new program, the Senior Affordable Rentable Apartments (SARA) program, under Mayor Bill de Blasio's Housing New York: A Five-Borough, Ten-Year Plan, to develop 100 percent senior housing, currently seeking sites in Brooklyn.

Deputy Borough President Reyna noted that the church next to the project site has access to air rights that could potentially be used to relieve the size constraints of this project. The representative stated that CAMBA reached out to the church at the beginning stages of this development but there was no interest. However, even if the interest was there, the zoning might still place constraints on overall height of the building, potentially adding just one other setback story.

In response to Borough President Adams' inquiry to clarify the marketing strategies for tenant selection process, the representative stated that in the past CAMBA has used a third party marketing agent for the lottery and marketing. The agent provides informational sessions on the NYC Housing Connect process and the lottery process application. Additionally, information and applications will be delivered to local elected officials and community groups.

Borough President Adams is aware of the community's concerns regarding the safety in this neighborhood and it was noted that the proposed enhanced lighting would help to alleviate such concerns, though the intended lighting requires more clarity. In response, the representative stated that in addition to a full-time security presence, the applicant will be providing six building-mounted lights, between the windows of the first floor, over the landscaped setback. This will provide a well-illuminated area in front of the building and, at the same time, not create an objectionable condition for the ground floor residents.

In response to Borough President Adams' policy of promoting the use of renewable and sustainable energy resources and promoting practices to retain stormwater runoff, the applicant's representative stated this project will be certified under the Enterprise Green Communities Program, a sustainability program for affordable housing developments, endorsed by HPD. The project will also include enhanced insulation, energy-efficient lighting and mechanical equipment, low-flow plumbing fixtures, non-toxic materials, and use of recycled materials. The development will have a cool roof that will also include water retention measures, and an on-site bioswale will be included as part of the five-foot landscaped setback. Additionally, infrastructure will be provided to accommodate solar power, ensuring the building will be solar ready when finances become available in the future toward such installation. While the developer is a strong proponent of Passive House design, given the constrained economics of this project, such design standards are not financially feasible.

In response to Borough President Adams' policy of maximizing job opportunities for Brooklynites and procure supplies locally through the inclusion of Local Business Enterprises (LBE) and Minority- and Women-Owned Business Enterprises (MWBE), the representative stated that CAMBA works closely with the contractor to provide reporting on local hiring efforts. In the past, the contractor has met with local groups to ensure that people know how to become qualified for a construction job. Additionally, in past projects, CAMBA has employed more than 60 local community members.

Subsequent to the hearing CAMBA provided a letter dated January 20, 2017 clarifying some of the questions addressed during the hearing. In reference to providing family-sized supportive housing units, the applicant noted that while the financing and size limitations of this particular site restrict the development to studio units, CAMBA has recently worked to develop such units in three other developments within Brownsville and Wingate. In reference to LBE and MWBE participation, the applicant shared a successful track record of utilizing such enterprises in their past developments, and stated that such efforts will be tracked on a quarterly basis. In reference to Passive House

design and other sustainable measures, the applicant noted that while the limited budget for this development does not allow Passive House design standards, the development has a number of sustainable features that closely resemble such standards. Additionally, the applicant will continue to research the feasibility of furthering their green infrastructure efforts. The project currently includes a stormwater series retention system, utilizing both roof and tank in order to manage stormwater. Lastly, in reference to the potential air rights transfer from the adjacent church site, the applicant stated that such transfer was addressed at the beginning stages of the development and determined to be less effective than the proposed rezoning in providing a greater amount of affordable housing area.

Subsequent to the hearing, Borough President Adams' staff contacted the New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) regarding the adequacy of street lighting in the area surrounding the proposed development. The street lighting team was notified to conduct a lighting survey of the block outside the project site, which generally takes a few months. The street lighting team will proceed with the evaluation according to its assigned correspondence number, DOT-323366-K1F4.

Consideration

Brooklyn Community Board 16 (CB 16) approved this application without conditions.

CAMBA is proposing a Use Group 3 community facility building with sleeping accommodations (permanent housing) that would be targeted to a population of formerly homeless and low-income individuals. Approximately 60 percent of the building's units will be reserved for individuals exiting a DHS shelter with a special need, and approximately 40 percent of the building's units will be reserved for individuals earning below 60 percent of the AMI.

For 40 years, CAMBA has operated as a non-profit organization that has helped New Yorkers build and sustain vibrant neighborhoods with services that lay the groundwork for economic stability, educational fulfillment, a healthy lifestyle, and strong families. CAMBA's 20/20 Vision lays out tangible solutions that support diverse communities where New Yorkers — regardless of their ZIP codes — have the resources and supports they need to reach their full potential.

The project site consists of 7,600 square-feet of unimproved City-owned lots located on the south side of Hegeman Avenue, between Watkins Street and Mother Gaston Boulevard. The blocks surrounding the project site are predominantly residential, with a mix of two- to three-story attached and semi-attached homes, and large mid- and high-rise multifamily apartment buildings.

In order to facilitate the proposed development, the granting of the requested zoning bulk special permit would allow the community facility floor area ratio (FAR) of up to 4.8 to be applied to a non-profit institution with sleeping accommodations. The building façade requires an initial setback distance of 20 feet due to R6 zoning, pursuant to ZR Section 24-522, and Hegeman Avenue having a street right-of-way width of 70 feet, which is defined as a narrow street. Compliance with the 20-foot setback requirement would result in a loss of six dwelling units on the seventh and eighth floors, thereby affecting the project's financing. Therefore, a mayoral zoning override is required for the proposed building to address its non-compliance with respect to waiving the otherwise required setback distance of 20 feet, resulting in a reduction of this initial setback distance. Borough President Adams finds the proposed bulk to be generally consistent with Plaza Residences, as well as the rezoning requested to facilitate Ebenezer Plaza.

The residents of the proposed building would receive on-site social services provided by trained staff. Security would be available on-site 24 hours a day, seven days a week. In addition to housing social services, building amenities would include a computer room, a laundry facility, and

storage space. Open space amenities would include a rear yard with a sunken outdoor patio that is directly accessible to common areas, delimited by a garden at ground level.

The project site is accessible by public transit, including the elevated L 14 Street Canarsie Local line at the New Lots Avenue station, and is served by multiple bus routes, including along Hegeman Avenue. No accessory off-street parking spaces are to be provided pursuant to an as-of-right waiver according to ZR Section 25-33. There would be four bicycle parking spaces in the cellar.

Borough President Adams generally supports the development of underutilized City-owned vacant land to produce permanent affordable housing for the community. The proposed land use actions would facilitate an eight-story building with approximately 70 units of affordable and supportive housing for homeless and low-income individuals. The proposed project reflects Mayor de Blasio's Housing New York: A Five-Borough, Ten-Year Plan, through the development of affordable and supportive housing for the city's most vulnerable residents.

As indicated in the Environmental Assessment Statement (EAS) for these land use actions, an average daily census of single adults in the DHS shelter system was 13,060 in June 2016. This represents an increase of 9.5 percent compared to the average daily census in June 2015. In light of this trend, DHS projects an increase in the single adult shelter census through Fiscal Year 2017 (FY17). In order to transition such population from shelter into permanent housing as successfully as possible, DHS recognizes that the receiving permanent housing providers must provide services to the formerly homeless that would assist single adults exiting the shelter system in order for formerly homeless individuals to remaining stably housed in the community.

Borough President Adams believes that there is a need for supportive housing options for individuals who are circumstantially homeless, including persons with disabilities. The best solution for individuals needing shelter, who also require supportive services to maintain independent living, is through permanent housing where such an apartment is pursuant to the execution of a lease. Supportive housing is a cost-effective way of addressing the diverse needs of the homeless, while also integrating residents into the life of the neighborhood. Borough President Adams believes that there is a need to move away from homeless shelters and transitional housing as the solution to homelessness. New York State Governor Andrew Cuomo and the New York State Legislature should execute the memorandum of understanding needed to release \$2 billion in funding to advance the creation of more than 100,000 units of affordable and supportive housing over the next five years throughout New York State.

Borough President Adams supports the public policy of integrating supportive housing units into a community by interspersing such units in the same building with housing units for low-income families, with a blend of 40 percent of occupants being families earning up to 60 percent AMI.

Considering this section of Brooklyn has a great share of homeless shelters and transitional housing, Borough President Adams believes that steps need to be taken by all levels of government to reduce the reliance on such housing options by creating permanent, supportive housing units. The City needs to replace the costly and cumbersome shelter system with a new, more cost-effective model that prioritizes conversion of temporary housing into permanent housing. Producing permanent housing is less expensive and provides a more stable housing stock to serve the homeless population. As more permanent units come online, steps should be taken to reduce the capacity of area shelters and transitional housing accommodations in this community.

This proposal is generally consistent with recent City policy changes that have evolved to blend such supportive housing developments with 40 percent of the apartments designated for low-income households. Tenants are assigned to such apartments through the City's affordable

housing lottery, inclusive of a 50 percent local preference, for occupants earning up to 60 percent AMI. As a service provider, CAMBA has demonstrated its ability to capably operate such permanent housing accommodations.

Borough President Adams supports Mayor de Blasio's goal to achieve 200,000 affordable housing units over the next decade. Brooklyn is one of the fastest growing communities in the New York metropolitan area and the ongoing Brooklyn renaissance has ushered in extraordinary changes that were virtually unimaginable even a decade ago. Unfortunately, Brooklyn's success has led to the displacement of long-time residents who can no longer afford to live in their own neighborhoods. Borough President Adams is committed to addressing the borough's affordable housing crisis through creation and preservation of much-needed affordable housing units for very low- to middle-income Brooklynites.

Borough President Adams believes that the low-income studio apartments would be suitable to house seniors; however, rents indexed near 60 percent of AMI would preclude the vast majority of seniors from qualifying. Should initiatives such as Income Average advance at the federal government, there would be an opportunity to provide a portion of the units within the proposed building at rents that would allow for more seniors to qualify. CAMBA and HPD should seek funding opportunities that would enable some units to be rented to permit very low-income seniors to be lottery eligible.

In areas where new developments can be realized on City-owned sites, Borough President Adams supports the disposition of such sites being developed for affordable housing to remain as permanently affordable housing units as a means to minimize the loss of affordable housing units. Where HPD has designated for-profit companies to develop affordable housing, the duration of such affordable housing is often driven by financial considerations. Standard regulatory agreements used by government agencies might consist of 30 or 50 years. As tenants move out after the expiration of such regulatory agreement, those units would no longer be an affordable housing resource. The duration issue would be largely mitigated because the intended disposition to CAMBA, a non-profit affordable housing development entity whose core mission is to be an affordable housing provider as well as a strong advocate for affordable housing, provides a soft guarantee that all units would remain affordable for the lifetime that CAMBA remains in operation.

The development is generally consistent with Borough President Adams' policy regarding sustainable design by having a cool roof that will also include water retention measures and commitment to the provision of infrastructure that would make the building solar ready, should subsequent finances enable the installation of solar panels. Borough President Adams encourages CAMBA to coordinate with the Mayor's Office of Sustainability, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority (NYSERDA), and/or New York Power Authority (NYPA) at each project site. Such modifications would increase energy efficiency and reduce the development's carbon footprint.

Borough President Adams believes that there are additional opportunities by incorporating permeable pavers in the outdoor patio and garden area, which would help to advance DEP green-water/stormwater strategies. He encourages CAMBA to reach out to the New York City Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) with its offer toward achieving such a green-water/stormwater strategy. Such efforts would deflect stormwater from entering the 26th Ward Water Pollution Control Plant during wet weather. According to the New York City Green Infrastructure 2014 Annual Report, such green infrastructure has a critical role in addressing water quality challenges while providing numerous environmental, economic, and social co-benefits.

Though Borough President Adams supports the proposed land use actions, he seeks clarification from HPD regarding promoting LBE and MWBE contracting participation. He also seeks reporting

from HPD, within CD 16, regarding its unit type distribution as provided, currently in production and in the pipeline, catering to permanently housing the homeless population as compared to its affordable housing initiatives. Additionally, he seeks public safety enhancements.

Jobs

Borough President Adams is concerned that too many Brooklyn residents are currently unemployed or underemployed. It is his policy to promote economic development that will create more employment opportunities. According to averaged data from 2008 to 2012, double-digit unemployment remains a pervasive reality in many of Brooklyn's neighborhoods, with more than half of our community districts experiencing poverty rates of 25 percent or greater. Prioritizing local hiring would assist in addressing this employment crisis. Additionally, promoting Brooklyn-based businesses and including those that qualify as LBE and MWBE is central to Borough President Adams' economic development agenda. This site provides opportunities for CAMBA to retain a Brooklyn-based contractor and subcontractor, especially those who are designated LBEs, consistent with section 6-108.1 of the City's Administrative Code, and MWBE establishments, as a means to meet or exceed standards per Local Law 1 (no fewer than 20 percent participation).

As with HPD's expressed intent to work toward increasing opportunities for MWBEs to participate in the development process and connecting local residents to career training for when it subsidizes new development in the East New York Neighborhood Plan area, Borough President Adams believes that HPD should seek the same for this development. This should be achieved through a land disposition agreement or similarly legal binding mechanism, for CAMBA, as the project developer, to retain Brooklyn-based contractors and subcontractors, especially those that are designated LBEs consistent with section 6-108.1 of the City's Administrative Code, and LBE and MWBE establishments, as a means to meet or exceed standards per Local Law 1 (no fewer than 20 percent participation). HPD should coordinate the monitoring of such participation with an appropriate monitoring agency.

Documenting Affordable Housing Development in CD 16

Borough President Adams applauds CAMBA and HPD on their efforts to provide low-income and supportive housing and recognizes that there are site funding and size limitations associated with creating larger family-sized units within the proposed development.

While supportive housing for the special needs population is an effective, and much-needed, mechanism in addressing the needs of placing the homeless into permanent housing, there is a sense that the production of supportive housing developments has largely focused on accommodating single-person households. In addition, even where such supportive developments contain a blend of low-income and supportive housing units, quite often they consist entirely of studio apartments, as is the case with 210-214 Hegan Avenue. While there is a need for affordably-priced single-person accommodations, given the extent of rent-burdened households, there is a compelling need for affordable apartments with multiple bedrooms. Given the expanding homeless population, which comprises households with children, it is important to recognize that targeting and overwhelming a certain area with single-unit supportive housing is not effective for the community as a whole.

Borough President Adams understands that not every solution can be addressed in a single development, though he believes that housing affordability solutions should be comprehensive. In order to assure adequate provision of affordable housing in the Ocean Hill and Brownsville sections of CD 16, he believes it is appropriate for HPD to document its affordable housing efforts, listing completed projects, those in production, and those in the pipeline. The listing should note to what extent (number of housing units) such development caters to permanently housing the homeless population as compared to its other affordable housing initiatives, including units targeted for seniors, as well as the bedroom distribution for such apartments. This data would confirm whether

adjustments should be made moving forward as HPD seeks the disposition of City-owned property pursuant to its Brownsville 100 Days to Progress initiative's Brownsville Neighborhood Planning Progress Report, from November 2016, toward developing its remaining portfolio of yet to be redeveloped City-owned lots.

Borough President Adams calls on HPD to compile data regarding projects within CD 16 since 2005, completed, in production, and still in the pipeline, in order to determine the extent to which such projects are resources to permanently house the homeless population, in terms of total units provided by bedroom distribution. This should be inclusive of supportive housing for the special needs population, as well as other forms of affordable housing, such as housing units targeted for seniors. This should be done prior to initiating disposition of City-owned property as part of HPD's Brownsville 100 Days to Progress initiative's Brownsville Neighborhood Planning Progress Report, from November 2016. Such analysis should be provided to CB 16 and its affected local elected officials.

Public Safety Enhancements

Borough President Adams applauds CAMBA's commitment to incorporate lighting fixtures along its Hegeman Avenue façade to supplement the lighting from the street fixtures under the jurisdiction of DOT. Given the concerns expressed regarding public safety, he seeks improvements that would achieve a safer pedestrian environment. The pending analysis by DOT with regard to the suitability of its street light fixtures is one additional means to complement the efforts being undertaken by CAMBA.

Borough President Adams' calls on DOT to complete its analysis regarding its street lighting fixture and report its findings to CB 16 and local elected officials.

Recommendation

Be it resolved that the Brooklyn borough president, pursuant to sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter, recommends that the City Planning Commission (CPC) and City Council approve this application.

Be It Further Resolved:

1. That the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD):
 - a. Require CAMBA to retain Brooklyn-based contractors and subcontractors, especially those who are designated Local Business Enterprises (LBE) consistent with section 6-108.1 of the City's Administrative Code, and Minority- and Women-Owned Business Enterprises (MWBE), as a means to meet or exceed standards per Local Law 1 (no fewer than 20 percent participation), as well as to coordinate the monitoring of such participation with an appropriate monitoring agency, and
 - b. Provide data regarding projects within CD 16 since 2003, completed, in production, and still in the pipeline, in order to determine the extent to which such projects are resources to permanently house the homeless population, in terms of total units provided by bedroom distribution. This should be inclusive of supportive housing for the special needs population, as well as other forms of affordable housing, such as housing units targeted for seniors. This should be done prior to initiating disposition of City-owned property as part of HPD's Brownsville 100 Days to Progress initiative's Brownsville Neighborhood Planning Progress Report, from November 2016. Such analysis should be provided to CB 16 and its affected local elected officials

2. That the New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) completes the street lighting evaluation according to correspondence number DOT-323366-K1F4 and reports any findings to Brooklyn Community Board 16 (CB 16) and the affected local elected officials



January 20, 2017

Brooklyn Borough President
Hon. Eric L. Adams
Borough Hall
209 Joralemon Street
Brooklyn, NY 11201

Re: Sustainable, Affordable and Supportive Housing at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue;
Jan 9th, 2017 Hearing Follow-Up Questions

Hon. Eric L Adams:

CAMBA Housing Ventures is the non-profit sponsor of the proposed sustainable, affordable and supportive housing at 210-214 Hegeman Avenue, Brooklyn. Below are responses to questions posed by your office at the January 9th hearing at Brooklyn Borough Hall. Thank you for your hard work on behalf of Brooklyn and the opportunity to discuss the project.

1. Units for homeless families (particularly with respect to the population of homeless children in Brownsville schools)

As discussed at the hearing, 210-214 Hegeman will provide affordable and supportive housing, coupled with on-site services, to 70 New Yorkers in need, including 42 homeless individuals. This project will help to alleviate the overburdened NYC shelter system, where the current shelter census includes over 13,000 single adults (Jan 17, 2017). 210-214 Hegeman will also provide much needed sustainable and affordable housing to 28 low-income New Yorkers through an HPD lottery, including a 50% preference for Community Board 16 residents. CAMBA Housing Ventures (CHV)/CAMBA will work with local Brownsville organizations, Community Board 16, and elected officials to complete outreach during the marketing and lease up phase. CAMBA's on-site services will assist tenants to stay stably housed and achieve their goals. CHV will also look to house residents and take referrals from shelters located in close proximity to the project site, working closely with the local community board, Councilmember Barron, and the NYC Dept. of Homeless Services.

While this particular project focuses on providing housing to formerly homeless individuals and single adults, CHV/CAMBA has also recently worked to develop sustainable, affordable and supportive housing for formerly homeless families in three large, new Brooklyn developments. CHV/CAMBA's Van Dyke project is located within Brownsville/CB16 at 603 Mother Gaston Boulevard. Van Dyke includes 30 units for formerly homeless families and is entering the marketing and lease up phase in



winter/spring 2017. CHV/CAMBA's CAMBA Gardens Phase I/II affordable and supportive housing development in Wingate, Brooklyn, also includes 38 total units for homeless families. CAMBA Garden's Phase II is currently in the marketing/lease up phase. There is a significant need for affordable housing for all New Yorkers, including individuals and families, and CHV/CAMBA will continue to explore development opportunities for homeless families in the greater New York City and Brownsville.

2. Efforts on tracking the number of women in construction jobs & LBEs.

CHV/CAMBA has an excellent track record of exceeding goals and works closely with the selected general contractor to track jobs and businesses. CHV/CAMBA will utilize best efforts to track the number of women in construction jobs and track the utilization of Locally-Based Enterprises. Please see attached summary of CHV's three most recent projects, including detailed information on M/WBE utilization and local jobs and local vendors. As an example, on CHV's recently completed CAMBA Gardens Phase II development, the project awarded \$7,296,629 to M/WBE contractors and employed 159 Brooklyn residents, including 54 local community board residents. At CAMBA Gardens Phase I, the project awarded over \$9MM to MWBE contractors and awarded over \$19MM in contracts to Brooklyn based contractors and subcontractors. Both CAMBA Gardens Phase I and II exceeded the NY State goals for MWBE utilization. This information is tracked quarterly on CHV projects.

3. Additional info on passive house cost differentials.

CHV/CAMBA is committed to sustainable development and sustainability can be achieved in a number of ways. Participating in Enterprise Green Communities, 210-214 Hegeman will include many sustainable features, including efficient boilers and HVAC equipment, increased insulation, energy efficient windows, energy start appliances, water saving fixtures, and efficient lighting. Hegeman will also include healthy indoor air quality, utilize recycled content materials and will be designed to be solar ready. The project incorporates 3" insulation on the north and south walls to increase energy efficiency, and is nearly 50 percent greater than the standard 2-1/8" insulation. Recognizing the important role of building design and construction practices in creating a more sustainable city, CHV will continue to explore opportunities to include additional green elements found in passive house design as funding allows. While there are no concrete cost differential numbers available, Dattner Architects has worked with a contractor to estimate a range of 5%-10% cost increment. For smaller buildings similar to Hegeman, the increment may be on the high end since there are not economies of scale.

4. Reaching out to the neighboring church regarding the current status of the project.



CHV/CAMBA previously discussed the project with the neighboring church during its preliminary planning stages. CHV/CAMBA determined that a potential transfer of development rights would not result in more affordable housing than the proposed development. The proposed special permit is the best mechanism to achieve maximum affordable housing development at this small, underutilized site. CHV/CAMBA will reach out to the neighboring church again during the public review process.

5. Research funding opportunities with DEP for water management measures.

CHV will research the NYC Dept. of Environmental Protection (DEP) funding opportunities for the design and construction of green infrastructure and evaluate feasibility and costs with the project architect, landscape architect and mechanical engineer. The project's design currently includes a storm water series detention system, utilizing two forms of detention - both roof and a tank together as one system in order restrict storm water to DEP's allowable flow standards. The project contains controlled flow roof drains on both the upper and setback roofs that restrict flow and detain water for a short period of time. The leaders then run down the building collecting with the area drains at grade from outside the building at the cellar ceiling. The area drain for the cellar outdoor space runs below the cellar slab to a pit where it's then pumped up to the cellar ceiling and combines with the other storm water drains, depositing to a storm water detention tank located in the front set back of the building. Here, the storm water is further restricted and held to DEP's allowable release rate which can finally be discharged to the city sewer.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "DAR", is written over a light blue horizontal line.

David A. Rowe, Executive Vice President, CAMBA Housing Ventures

Cc: Diana Reyna, Deputy Borough President, Office of the Brooklyn Borough President
Richard Bearak, Director of Land Use, Office of the Brooklyn Borough President
Olga Chernomorets, Land Use Coordinator, Office of the Brooklyn Borough President
Jessica Katz, Assistant Commissioner, NYC HPD
Lin Zeng, Director of Brooklyn Planning, NYC HPD
Sara Tempel, Project Manager, NYC HPD
Joanne M. Oplustil, President/CEO, CAMBA/CAMBA Housing Ventures
Sharon R. Browne, Executive Vice President, CAMBA/CAMBA Housing Ventures
Michael Berne, Vice President, CAMBA Housing Ventures



Community/Borough Board Recommendation

Pursuant to the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure

Application #:	Project Name:
CEQR Number:	Borough(s):
	Community District Number(s):

Please use the above application number on all correspondence concerning this application

SUBMISSION INSTRUCTIONS

- Complete this form and return to the Department of City Planning by one of the following options:
 - EMAIL (recommended):** Send email to CalendarOffice@planning.nyc.gov and include the following subject line: (CB or BP) Recommendation + (6-digit application number), e.g., "CB Recommendation #C10000ZSQ" ~~XXXXXXXXXX~~
 - MAIL:** Calendar Information Office, City Planning Commission, 120 Broadway, 31st Floor, New York, NY 10271
 - FAX:** to (212) 720-3488 and note "Attention of the Calendar Office"
- Send one copy of the completed form with any attachments to the applicant's representative at the address listed below, one copy to the Borough President, and one copy to the Borough Board, when applicable.

Docket Description:

Applicant(s):		Applicant's Representative:	
Recommendation submitted by:			
Date of public hearing:		Location:	
Was a quorum present? YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO <input type="checkbox"/>		<i>A public hearing requires a quorum of 20% of the appointed members of the board, but in no event fewer than seven such members.</i>	
Date of Vote:		Location:	
RECOMMENDATION			
<input type="checkbox"/> Approve		<input type="checkbox"/> Approve With Modifications/Conditions	
<input type="checkbox"/> Disapprove		<input type="checkbox"/> Disapprove With Modifications/Conditions	
Please attach any further explanation of the recommendation on additional sheets, as necessary.			
Voting			
# In Favor:	# Against:	# Abstaining:	Total members appointed to the board:
Name of CB/BB officer completing this form		Title	Date