



CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

November 5, 2003/Calendar No. 23

C 020285 ZMR

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Office of the Staten Island Borough President pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for **an amendment of the Zoning Map, Section Nos. 20d and 21b:**

1. **changing from an R3-1 District to an R3X District property bounded by** a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Crystal Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, a line 165 feet easterly of Crystal Avenue, Riegelmann Street, a line 100 feet easterly of Crystal Avenue, a line 100 feet northerly of Galloway Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Marianne Street, a line 100 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Marianne Street, a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, North Avenue, Shaw Place, Burnside Avenue, Jewett Avenue, Kingsley Avenue, Manor Road, Martling Avenue, Slosson Avenue, Ellsworth Place and its westerly prolongation, a line 100 feet westerly of Fairview Avenue, a line midway between Governor Road and Dongan Avenue and its easterly prolongation, Manor Road, a line 200 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, South Greenleaf Avenue, Kembal Avenue, a line 340 feet easterly of Wescott Boulevard, a line 100 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of Jewett Avenue, Coale Avenue, Jewett Avenue, Markham Place, a line perpendicular to the southerly Street line of Markham Place distant 50 feet westerly (as measured along the Street line) from the intersection of the southerly Street line of Markham Place and the westerly Street line of Jewett Avenue, a line 75 feet southerly of Markham Place, a line 100 feet southeasterly of Smith Court and its northeasterly prolongation, Watchogue Road, a line perpendicular to the southwesterly street line of Watchogue Road distant 100 feet northwesterly (as measured along the street line) from the intersection of the northwesterly street line of Frederick Street and the southwesterly street line of Watchogue Road, a line 150 feet southwesterly of Watchogue Road, a line 120 feet easterly of Willard Place, a line 100 feet southerly of Watchogue Road, Willard Place, Seward Place, the northerly street line of Frederick Street and its westerly prolongation, a line 100 feet easterly of Seward Place and its northerly prolongation, Marble Street, Cheves Avenue, Watchogue Road, a line midway between Glascoe Avenue and Woolley Avenue, College Avenue, and Willowbrook Road;
2. **changing from an R3-1 District to an R2 District property bounded by** a southerly boundary line of Clove Lakes Park and its westerly prolongation, Royal Oak Road and its northerly centerline prolongation, a line 100 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, and Slosson Avenue;
3. **changing from an R3-2 District to an R3X District property bounded by:**
 - a. a line 150 feet southeasterly of Forest Avenue, Veltman Avenue, Hamlin Place, a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Jewett Avenue, a line 225 feet northerly of Egbert Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Llewellyn Place, a line 100 feet southerly of Forest

Avenue, Llewellyn Place, a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Manor Road, Kingsley Avenue, Jewett Avenue, Burnside Avenue, Shaw Place, and North Avenue; and

- b. Houston Street, Willowbrook Road, Stewart Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Watchogue Road, the southerly prolongation of a line midway between Glascoe Avenue and Woolley Avenue, Watchogue Road, Cheves Avenue, Marble Street, O'Connor Avenue, a line 100 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, Stewart Avenue, a line 150 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, Willowbrook Road, Montauk Place, a line 200 feet westerly of Willowbrook Road, Wyona Avenue, Willow Road East, Cambridge Avenue, Nina Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Cambridge Avenue, Caswell Avenue and its westerly prolongation, Willowbrook Expressway, Staten Island Expressway, Richmond Avenue, Deppe Place and its easterly prolongation, Willowbrook Expressway, Vedder Avenue, and Willow Road East; and

4. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3-1 District property bounded by:

- a. the westerly Street line of Stewart Avenue and its southerly prolongation, a line 150 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Stewart Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Sheraden Avenue, Caro Street and its westerly centerline prolongation, Carmel Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Mann Avenue, a line 200 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Perry Avenue, a line 150 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Lester Street, Josephine Street, Manor Road, and Staten Island Expressway; and
- b. Windsor Road, Little Clove Road, the southwesterly prolongation of the southeasterly street line of Bristol Avenue, the northerly boundary line of a park, and the southerly prolongation of the westerly boundary line of a park;

as shown on a diagram (for illustrative purposes only) dated September 8, 2003 Community District 1, Borough of Staten Island.

The application for an amendment of the Zoning Map was filed by the Staten Island Borough President on January 1, 2002, to rezone from R3-2 and R3-1 to R3-1, R3X and R2 an approximately 231 block area in Community District 1 of Staten Island.

BACKGROUND

The area proposed to be rezoned from R3-2 and R3-1 to R3-1, R3X and R2 consists of an approximately 231 block area approximately bounded by the Staten Island Expressway, Forest Avenue, Clove Lakes Park and the Dr. Martin Luther King Expressway in the communities of Castleton Corners, Westerleigh, Graniteville, and Royal Oak in Staten Island, Community District 1.

The area consists primarily of one- and two-family detached homes built between 1920 and 1950.

The Staten Island Borough President's Office is proposing this rezoning in response to community concerns that the R3-2 and R3-1 districts allow semi-detached and attached development that is not in character with the predominant detached existing housing on large lots.

The zoning districts within the proposed rezoning areas are R3-1 and R3-2. The R3-2 district permits one- and two-family attached, semi-detached and detached houses, as well as multi-family buildings. It requires 30-foot rear yards, 15-foot front yards, one on-site parking space per dwelling unit and a maximum .5 FAR plus .1 attic allowance. The R3-1 district permits one- and two-family, semi-detached and detached houses. It requires 30-foot rear yards, 15-foot front yards, one on-site parking space per dwelling unit and a maximum a maximum .5 FAR plus .1 FAR attic allowance.

The proposed R2 zoning district permits single family detached homes that require 40-foot lot widths. It requires 30-foot rear yards, 15-foot front yards, one on-site parking space per dwelling unit and a maximum .5 FAR.

The proposed R3X district permits one- and two-family detached houses on minimum 35 foot wide lots for one- and two- story buildings. It requires 30-foot rear yards, 10 foot front yards, one on-site parking space per dwelling unit and a maximum .5 FAR plus .1 FAR attic allowance.

The proposed rezoning area is 95% residential, .5% commercial, .3% community facility, 3.1% vacant and 1.1% other uses. Detached housing comprises 89% of the residential housing type. The rest are semi-detached and attached houses.

Under the proposed zoning the conformance for building type is 92%, the lot width compliance is 85%, the lot area compliance is 79% and the FAR compliance remains 94%.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 020285 ZMR) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA), and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 04DCP009R. The lead is the City Planning Commission.

After a study of the potential environmental impact of the proposed action, a Negative Declaration was issued on September 8, 2003.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 020285 ZMR) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on September 8, 2003, and was duly referred to Community Board 1 and the Borough President, in accordance with Article 3 of the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP) rules.

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 1 held a public hearing on this application on September 8, 2003, and on September 8, 2003, by a vote of 33 to 0 with 0 abstentions, adopted a resolution recommending approval of the application.

Borough President Recommendation

This application was considered by the Borough President, who issued a recommendation approving the application on October 2, 2003.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On October 8, 2003 (Calendar No. 5), the City Planning Commission scheduled October 22, 2003, for a public hearing on this application (C 020285 ZMR). The hearing was duly held on October 22, 2003 (Calendar No. 15).

There were three speakers in favor of the application and none in opposition.

A representative of the applicant described the demolition of older existing housing to make way for semi-detached and attached housing as problematic because of the increase in density. He also read a statement by the Grant City Civic Association which stated that the proposal would reduce development that has stressed city services. The Councilman from City Council District 50 stated that the denser attached and semi-detached housing is out of context with the character of the existing housing. He also stated that due to the reselling of homes, an existing large supply of attached housing will be available to aspiring homeowners. A representative of the Councilman from City Council District 49 stated that the rezoning would preserve the character of the north shore's older communities.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

Waterfront Revitalization Program Consistency Review

This application was reviewed by the Department of City Planning for consistency with the policies of the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program (WRP), adopted by the Board of Estimate on September 30, 1982 (Calendar No. 17), pursuant to the New York State Waterfront Revitalization and Coastal Resources Act of 1981 (New York State Executive Law, Section 910 et seq.). The designated WRP number is WRP #03-053.

This action was determined to be consistent with the policies of the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this amendment of the Zoning Map is appropriate.

The proposed zoning map change recognizes the established character of this part of the central north shore communities which are characterized by detached homes on large lots. The current zoning has allowed construction of attached and semi-detached housing in these neighborhoods. In some cases, older homes have been demolished to make way for the new construction. As a result, the character of the neighborhoods can be changed, and the additional density results in impacts on parking, schools, road networks, and mass transit.

The proposed R3X and R2 districts would limit future residential development to one- and two- family detached residences compatible with the present development pattern. Ninety-two percent of the existing homes in the area proposed to be rezoned are detached one- and two-family homes. The Commission is aware that the rezoning proposal would limit the opportunity to build a variety of housing types, which would be affordable to the broader community. However, there are adjacent R3-2 zoning districts that would accommodate a variety of housing types that are attractive to moderate income home buyers.

The R2 district requires a minimum lot width of 40 feet for detached buildings. The R3X district requires a minimum lot width of 35 feet for detached buildings. Eighty- five percent of lots in the area to be rezoned will comply to the new R2and R3X lot width requirements. The R2 district requires a lot

area of 3,800 square feet. The R3X district requires a minimum lot area of 3,325 square feet.

Seventy-nine percent of the lots in the area proposed to be rezoned to R2 and R3X will comply to the lot area requirements.

The Commission believes that the mapping of the contextual district in this portion of the central north shore is consistent with the character of existing development. The R2 and R3X zoning districts will promote development patterns that will reinforce the existing large lot character of the area by allowing the construction of only one- and two- family detached homes.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission, in its capacity as the City Coastal Commission, has reviewed the waterfront aspects of this application and finds that the proposed action is consistent with WRP policies; and be it further

RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination and the consideration described in this report, the Zoning Resolution of the City of New York, effective as of December 15, 1961, and as

subsequently amended, is further amended by changing the Zoning Map, Section Nos. 20d and 21b:

1. **changing from an R3-1 District to an R3X District property bounded by** a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Crystal Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, a line 165 feet easterly of Crystal Avenue, Riegelmann Street, a line 100 feet easterly of Crystal Avenue, a line 100 feet northerly of Galloway Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Marianne Street, a line 100 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Marianne Street, a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, North Avenue, Shaw Place, Burnside Avenue, Jewett Avenue, Kingsley Avenue, Manor Road, Martling Avenue, Slosson Avenue, Ellsworth Place and its westerly prolongation, a line 100 feet westerly of Fairview Avenue, a line midway between Governor Road and Dongan Avenue and its easterly prolongation, Manor Road, a line 200 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, South Greenleaf Avenue, Kemball Avenue, a line 340 feet easterly of Wescott Boulevard, a line 100 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of Jewett Avenue, Coale Avenue, Jewett Avenue, Markham Place, a line perpendicular to the southerly Street line of Markham Place distant 50 feet westerly (as measured along the Street line) from the intersection of the southerly Street line of Markham Place and the westerly Street line of Jewett Avenue, a line 75 feet southerly of Markham Place, a line 100 feet southeasterly of Smith Court and its northeasterly prolongation, Watchogue Road, a line perpendicular to the southwesterly street line of Watchogue Road distant 100 feet northwesterly (as measured along the street line) from the intersection of the northwesterly street line of Frederick Street and the southwesterly street line of Watchogue Road, a line 150 feet southwesterly of Watchogue Road, a line 120 feet easterly of Willard Place, a line 100 feet southerly of Watchogue Road, Willard Place, Seward Place, the northerly street line of Frederick Street and its westerly prolongation, a line 100 feet easterly of Seward Place and its northerly prolongation, Marble Street, Cheves Avenue, Watchogue Road, a line midway between Glascoe Avenue and Woolley Avenue, College Avenue, and Willowbrook Road;
2. **changing from an R3-1 District to an R2 District property bounded by** a southerly boundary line of Clove Lakes Park and its westerly prolongation, Royal Oak Road and its northerly centerline prolongation, a line 100 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, and Slosson Avenue;
3. **changing from an R3-2 District to an R3X District property bounded by:**
 - a. a line 150 feet southeasterly of Forest Avenue, Veltman Avenue, Hamlin Place, a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Jewett Avenue, a line 225 feet northerly of Egbert Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Llewellyn Place, a line 100 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Llewellyn Place, a line 150 feet southerly of Forest Avenue, Manor Road, Kingsley Avenue, Jewett Avenue, Burnside Avenue, Shaw Place, and North Avenue; and

- b. Houston Street, Willowbrook Road, Stewart Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Watchogue Road, the southerly prolongation of a line midway between Glascoe Avenue and Woolley Avenue, Watchogue Road, Cheves Avenue, Marble Street, O'Connor Avenue, a line 100 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, Stewart Avenue, a line 150 feet northerly of Victory Boulevard, Willowbrook Road, Montauk Place, a line 200 feet westerly of Willowbrook Road, Wyona Avenue, Willow Road East, Cambridge Avenue, Nina Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Cambridge Avenue, Caswell Avenue and its westerly prolongation, Willowbrook Expressway, Staten Island Expressway, Richmond Avenue, Deppe Place and its easterly prolongation, Willowbrook Expressway, Vedder Avenue, and Willow Road East; and

4. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3-1 District property bounded by:

- a. the westerly Street line of Stewart Avenue and its southerly prolongation, a line 150 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Stewart Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Sheraden Avenue, Caro Street and its westerly centerline prolongation, Carmel Avenue, a line 100 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Mann Avenue, a line 200 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Perry Avenue, a line 150 feet southerly of Victory Boulevard, Lester Street, Josephine Street, Manor Road, and Staten Island Expressway; and
- b. Windsor Road, Little Clove Road, the southwesterly prolongation of the southeasterly street line of Bristol Avenue, the northerly boundary line of a park, and the southerly prolongation of the westerly boundary line of a park;

as shown on a diagram (for illustrative purposes only) dated September 8, 2003 (C 020285 ZMR),
Community District 1, Borough of Staten Island.

The above resolution (C 020285 ZMR), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on November 5, 2003 (Calendar No. 23), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough President in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

AMANDA M. BURDEN, AICP, Chair
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, Esq., Vice Chairman
ANGELA M. BATTAGLIA, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E.,
ANGELA R. CAVALUZZI, R.A., RICHARD W. EADDY,
ALEXANDER GARVIN, JANE D. GOL, JOHN MEROLO, DOLLY WILLIAMS,
Commissioners