



IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for Additional Parking Spaces) and Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution to allow an attended accessory off-street parking facility with a maximum capacity of 64 spaces on portions of the ground floor and subcellar level 2 of a proposed mixed use building on property located at 220 Central Park South (Block 1030, Lots 15, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 39, 46, 48 and 58), in R10H and C5-1 Districts, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 5.

This application for a special permit was filed by VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC on January 25, 2017. The requested special permit, in conjunction with the related action, would facilitate the provision of 64 accessory residential parking spaces within a mixed-use development at 220 Central Park South in the Midtown neighborhood of Manhattan.

RELATED ACTION

In addition to the special permit that is the subject of this report, implementation of the proposed project also requires action by the City Planning Commission on the following application, which is being considered concurrently with this application:

N 170250 ZCM Joint certification by the City Planning Commission and the Department of Transportation (DOT) to allow more than one curb cut on a narrow street

BACKGROUND

The proposed development at 220 Central Park South occupies a 27,608-square-foot “L”-shaped portion of a larger 91,704-square-foot zoning lot that encompasses the majority of the block bounded by Central Park South to the north, 7th Avenue to the east, West 58th Street to the south, and Broadway and Columbus Circle to the west. The site is located at the southern edge of Central Park and north of the high-density Midtown commercial office district, at the northern end of Manhattan Community District 5. The area south of Central Park and north of West 57th Street has a strong residential presence, and is generally characterized by 12- to 37-story residential buildings among shorter, four- to nine-story buildings, most with ground floor retail. Recent residential

towers in this area have reached heights of 1,000 feet or more, and generally have been developed as-of-right.

Central Park South is a wide street that carries traffic in both east and west directions, and West 58th Street is a narrow street that carries eastbound traffic. Seventh Avenue and Broadway (south of Columbus Circle) are both wide streets that carry southbound traffic. The Columbus Circle traffic circle connects Broadway, Central Park West, Central Park South, Broadway, and 8th Avenue via a wide stream of counterclockwise traffic centered on a plaza with water fountains, benches, and plantings encircling a statue of Christopher Columbus.

The development site portion of the zoning lot – Lots 19, 17, 16, and 15 – occupies 75 feet of frontage along Central Park South and 200 feet of frontage along West 58th Street. The zoning lot and development site are split between an R10H zoning district and a C5-1 zoning district, and no portion of the zoning lot is located in a special district. The development site was previously occupied by five buildings, all of which have been demolished. Two of the buildings that previously occupied the Lot 19 portion of the development site – a 22-story residential building at 220 Central Park South and a 14-story residential building at 221 West 58th Street – shared a 44-space accessory parking garage, which was served by a 16-foot-wide curb cut on West 58th Street. A four-story public parking garage containing 129 parking spaces was located at 225-227 West 58th Street (Lot 17) and was served by two curb cuts: a 13-foot curb cut and a 21-foot curb cut.

The applicant proposes to develop a new 66-story residential building containing 118 residential units and 64 accessory residential parking spaces. The building will be comprised of two components – a taller, approximately 950-foot tower will be located along West 58th Street, and a shorter, approximately 270-foot-tall building (the “villa”) will be located along Central Park South. The tower and “villa” will be connected at the first floor via a shared passageway. A residential entrance will be located on Central Park South, and entrances to the parking, retail, and motor court (which will provide access to the residential lobbies) will be located on West 58th Street. The development will contain approximately 472,500 square feet of floor area, and the zoning lot (including existing buildings to remain) will contain approximately 1,040,440 square feet of floor

area (11.35 FAR). Approximately 183,178 square feet of the development's floor area will be generated by off-site affordable units through the Voluntary Inclusionary Housing program.

Along West 58th Street, the three existing curb cuts would be replaced with two 22-foot-wide curb cuts separated by a distance of approximately 129 feet. The western curb cut would serve the proposed parking garage, and eastern curb cut would serve the motor court, which is a 58-foot (wide) by 80-foot (deep) open area with granite pavers that will provide an off-street drop off at the residential entrances that serve both the tower lobby on West 58th Street and the "villa" lobby on Central Park South.

The proposed parking garage containing 64 accessory residential parking spaces will be located in the second subcellar level of the proposed development, and seven reservoir spaces will be located along the entry lane on the ground floor level. The garage will have a surface area of 11,830 square feet at the second subcellar level, within which seven spaces will be elevated in stackers and the remaining 57 will be located at surface level. Inbound vehicles traveling eastbound on West 58th Street will enter the garage via a 22-foot-wide curb cut and proceed down the driveway, where a parking attendant will then take the vehicle down to the second subcellar level by a car elevator. From the driveway, garage patrons will be able to walk into the lobby or back onto the street. Exiting garage users will wait in the pedestrian waiting area adjacent to the attendant station until an attendant brings their vehicles up from the second subcellar level via a car elevator. Drivers would then exit the facility via the shared 22-foot curb cut and turn left onto eastbound West 58th Street.

Sections 13-45 and 13-451(a) Special Permit (C 170249 ZSM)

Within the Manhattan Core – which the Zoning Resolution defines as the area within Manhattan Community Districts 1-8 – Section 13-11(a) allows a maximum number of accessory off-street parking spaces for residential use in an amount equal to 20 percent of the total number of dwelling units. The proposed development would contain 118 residential units, which would allow 24 accessory parking spaces as-of-right. The applicant requests a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451(a) (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) to provide an attended,

accessory residential parking facility with a total of 64 spaces (40 beyond the 24 allowed as-of-right) on the development site.

Section 26-15 Joint Certification (N 170250 ZCM)

Section 26-15 (Curb Cuts) normally allows, for residential parking, no more than one curb cut on any narrow street frontage of a zoning lot. In connection with the proposed residential parking facility and the motor court to the residential lobbies, two new curb cuts are proposed along West 58th Street, a narrow street. Along the zoning lot's 395 feet of frontage along the north side of West 58th Street, there are four existing curb cuts: three curb cuts associated with the prior parking uses that existed on the development site, and a 12-foot curb cut immediately west of the development site that serves a trash storage area for the residential building at 240 Central Park South (Lot 58), which is also part of the larger zoning lot. While the proposed development will replace and consolidate the three prior parking curb cuts into two, Section 26-15 would not normally permit those new curb cuts since the 12-foot curb cut at 240 Central Park South will remain.

Two additional curb cuts exist along the north side of West 58th Street that are not associated with the zoning lot and would not restrict the zoning lot's ability to locate or retain one curb cut as-of-right along West 58th Street. Immediately to the east of the development site is a 10-foot curb cut serving an active (and landmarked) three-story fire house (Engine Company Number 23) (Lot 23), which the zoning lot jogs around and excludes. To the east of the zoning lot (and approximately 75 feet from the development site) is a 25-foot curb cut associated with a parking garage serving the residential building at 200 Central Park South (Lot 29).

Section 26-15 provides that zoning lots in excess of 30,000 square feet may locate more than one curb cut along a narrow street by joint certification by the City Planning Commission and DOT that such additional curb cuts would not result in conflict between pedestrian and vehicular circulation and would result in a good overall site plan. In order to locate, along West 58th Street, two new curb cuts associated with the proposed development in addition to the 12-foot curb cut to remain at 240 Central Park South, the applicant requests a joint certification pursuant to Section 26-15.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 170249 ZSM) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA), and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 et seq. and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 16DCP034M. The lead is the City Planning Commission.

After a study of the potential environmental impacts of the proposed action, a Negative Declaration was issued on June 19, 2017.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 170249 ZSM) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on June 19, 2017, and was duly referred to Community Board 5 and the Borough President in accordance with Title 62 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-02(b).

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 5 held a public hearing on this application (C 170249 ZSM) on July 13, 2017, and on that date, by a vote of 32 in favor, three opposed, and with one abstention, adopted a resolution recommending approval the application.

Borough President Recommendation

This application (C 170249 ZSM) was considered by the Borough President, who issued a recommendation on August 14, 2017 to approve the application, with the comment that “we once again urge the Department of City Planning and the City Planning Commission to reconsider the parking calculation methodology to include a more robust set of factors.”

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On August 9, 2017 (Calendar No. 15), the City Planning Commission scheduled August 23, 2017 for a public hearing on this application (C 170249 ZSM). The hearing was duly held on August

23, 2017 (Calendar No. 33). There were two speakers in favor of the application and none in opposition.

The applicant's representative described the proposed development and the actions requested. He noted that the motor court was intended to eliminate any curbside passenger pickup and drop-off and the associated on-street queuing that could disrupt traffic flow. He explained that the development site previously contained two garages with a combined capacity of 173 spaces and three curb cuts totaling 56 feet within a 75-foot segment of the sidewalk, and that the proposed curb cut configuration would reduce the number of curb cuts to two and the total length of curb cuts to 44 feet. He further explained that the separation of the two curb cuts by 129 feet would help minimize any potential conflict between the parking and motor court uses. He noted that DOT had reviewed the proposed curb cut configuration in 2016, prior to the filing of the application for the joint certification. He also described the residential growth study that was submitted as part of the special permit application to support the request for 40 accessory residential parking spaces above the 24 spaces permitted as-of-right.

A representative for the Manhattan Borough President reiterated the Borough President's recommendation and previously-stated comments and concerns regarding the methodology used in the residential growth study that normally accompanies special permits requested under Sections 13-45 and 13-451(a).

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this application for a special permit pursuant to Sections 13-45 and 13-451(a) of the Zoning Resolution is appropriate.

The Commission notes that the development site previously contained a total of 173 public parking spaces across two separate parking facilities, and that the proposed accessory residential parking facility containing 64 spaces reflects a decrease in parking on the site. The Commission

understands that the two public parking facilities were served by three curb cuts that were clustered together, and believes that, generally, such clustering could result in conflicts between pedestrians and entering and exiting vehicles. The applicant proposes to replace these three curb cuts with two 22-foot curb cuts separated by 129 feet – one serving the proposed parking facility and the other serving the motor court. The Commission is pleased with the rationalization and separation of curb cuts, which should help reduce the potential for conflicts between pedestrian and vehicles, and would improve the sidewalk condition for pedestrians from what exists today along the north side of West 58th Street.

The Commission is aware that the development is located across the street from a proposed 60-foot loading curb cut on the south side of West 58th Street that is associated with the new as-of-right mixed-use development at 217 West 57th Street (a/k/a the “Nordstrom Tower”), where a Nordstrom department store is expected to be located on the lower levels of the building. While close, the Commission observes that the curb cut proposed as part of the parking facility at 220 Central Park South is located just west of the Nordstrom loading curb cut. Based on the location of the curb cuts proposed as part of this application and at the as-of-right development at 217 West 57th Street, the Commission does not believe that there would be a conflict between vehicles entering and exiting the 220 Central Park South parking facility and trucks entering and exiting the Nordstrom loading dock, and therefore believes that the location of the entrance and exit to the proposed parking facility would not impede traffic flow along West 58th Street.

The Commission is also aware that the proposed curb cut associated with the motor court is close (25 feet) to the curb cut associated with the active FDNY firehouse on the north side of West 58th Street (Lot 23). The applicant informed the Commission that it consulted the FDNY when locating the motor court and parking facility to ensure that the curb cuts and vehicular movements associated with each use would not conflict with the entering and exiting of fire engines and other emergency vehicles, and that the FDNY did not raise concerns.

The applicant documented the new and eliminated residential units and off-street parking spaces within one-third of a mile from the development site between 2005 and 2018, the project’s

expected build year, to demonstrate that the request for 40 additional accessory residential parking spaces is reasonable and not excessive in regard to recent trends in residential development and the provision of parking. Using data from the Department of Buildings, the Department of Consumer Affairs, and additional research performed by the applicant, the study found that between 2005 and 2018, the ratio of the change in off-street parking spaces to the change in residential units without the proposed development is 15.53 percent. With the proposed development containing a total of 64 accessory residential parking spaces and 118 residential units, that ratio would increase to 16.5 percent. The Commission notes that the ratio is well-below 20 percent, which is the ratio of new off-street parking spaces to new residential units permitted in developments in Manhattan Community District 5. The Commission therefore believes that the ratio of new off-street parking spaces to new residential units within the proposed project demonstrates that the request for 40 additional residential parking spaces is reasonable and not excessive in regard to recent trends in residential development and the provision of parking.

The Commission is in receipt of a letter from the DOT, indicating that it has reviewed the proposed curb cut quantity and locations, and has determined that the two 22-foot curb cuts serving the proposed parking facility and motor court will not result in conflict between pedestrian and vehicular circulation and will result in a good overall site plan. The Commission concurs with DOT's assessment and also makes such finding required for the joint certification required by Section 26-15 to allow the proposed curb cuts along West 58th Street.

FINDINGS

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 13-45 (Special Permits for Additional Parking Spaces) of the Zoning Resolution:

- (1) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with #uses# or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;

- (2) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of #streets#, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (3) such #use# will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;
- (4) N/A;
- (5) such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape.

The City Planning Commission hereby makes the following findings pursuant to Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) of the Zoning Resolution:

- (a) the number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:
 - (1) the increase in the number of #dwelling units#; and
 - (2) the number of public and #accessory# off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities. In making this determination, the Commission may take into account off-street parking facilities for which building permits have been granted, or which have obtained City Planning Commission special permits pursuant to Section 13-45.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impacts on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determination, and the consideration and findings described in this report, the application submitted by VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter for the grant of a special permit

pursuant to Zoning Resolution Section 13-45 (Special Permits for additional parking spaces) and Section 13-451 (Additional parking spaces for residential growth) to allow an attended accessory off-street parking facility with a maximum capacity of 64 spaces on portions of the ground floor and subcellar level 2 of a proposed mixed use building on property located at 220 Central Park South (Block 1030, Lots 15, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 39, 46, 48 and 58), in R10H and C5-1 Districts, Borough of Manhattan, Community District 5, is approved, subject to the following terms and conditions:

1. The property that is the subject of this application (C 170249 ZSM) shall be developed in size and arrangement substantially in accordance with the dimensions, specifications and zoning computations indicated on the following approved plans, prepared by Philip H. Habib, Licensed P.E., of Philip Habib & Associates, filed with this application and incorporated in this resolution:

<u>Drawing No.</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Last Date Revised</u>
1 of 4	Zoning Lot Site Plan	6/19/2017
2 of 4	Parking Plan Ground Level	6/19/2017
3 of 4	Lower Levels Cellar and Subcellar 1	6/19/2017
4 of 4	Building Section & Subcellar 2	6/19/2017

2. Such development shall conform to all applicable provisions of the Zoning Resolution, except for the modifications specifically granted in this resolution and shown on the plans listed above which have been filed with this application. All zoning computations are subject to verification and approval by the New York City Department of Buildings.
3. Such development shall conform to all applicable laws and regulations relating to its construction, operation and maintenance.
4. All leases, subleases, or other agreements for use or occupancy of space at the subject property shall give actual notice of this special permit to the lessee, sublessee or occupant.

5. Upon failure of any party having any right, title or interest in the property that is the subject of this application, or the failure of any heir, successor, assign, or legal representative of such party, to observe any of the covenants, restrictions, agreements, terms or conditions of this resolution whose provisions shall constitute conditions of the special permit hereby granted, the City Planning Commission may, without the consent of any other party, revoke any portion of or all of said special permit. Such power of revocation shall be in addition to and not limited to any other powers of the City Planning Commission, or of any other agency of government, or any private person or entity. Any such failure as stated above, or any alteration in the development that is the subject of this application that departs from any of the conditions listed above, is grounds for the City Planning Commission or the City Council, as applicable, to disapprove any application for modification, cancellation or amendment of the special permit hereby granted.

6. Neither the City of New York nor its employees or agents shall have any liability for money damages by reason of the city's or such employee's or agent's failure to act in accordance with the provisions of this special permit.

The above resolution (C 170249 ZSM), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on October 4, 2017 (Calendar No. 12), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council, and the Borough President together with a copy of the plans of the development, in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

MARISA LAGO, *Chair*
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, ESQ., *Vice Chairman*
RAYANN BESSER, ALFRED C. CERULLO, III,
MICHELLE R. DE LA UZ, RICHARD W. EADDY,
CHERYL COHEN EFFRON, HOPE KNIGHT, ANNA HAYES LEVIN,
ORLANDO MARIN, LARISA ORTIZ *Commissioners*

MANHATTAN COMMUNITY BOARD FIVE

Vikki Barbero, Chair

450 Seventh Avenue, Suite 2109
New York, NY 10123-2199
212.465.0907 f-212.465.1628

Wally Rubin, District Manager

July 14, 2017

Hon. Marisa Lago
Chair of the City Planning Commission
22 Reade Street
New York, NY 10007

Re: Application # 170249ZSM and N170250ZCM by VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC for a special permit pursuant to ZR Section 13-45 and 13-451 (a) and a certification pursuant to ZR Section 26-15 to allow an attended accessory parking garage with a maximum capacity of 64 spaces on portions of the ground floor and sub-cellar in an as-of-right building that is currently under construction at 220 Central Park South.

Dear Chair Lago:

At the regularly scheduled monthly Community Board Five meeting on Thursday, July 13, 2017, the following resolution passed with a vote of 32 in favor; 3 opposed; 1 abstaining:

WHEREAS, VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC has applied for a special permit pursuant to ZR Section 13-45 and 13-451 (a) and a certification pursuant to ZR Section 26-15 to allow an attended accessory parking garage with a maximum capacity of 64 spaces on portions of the ground floor and sub-cellar in an as-of-right building that is currently under construction at 220 Central Park South; and

WHEREAS, Community Board Five evaluates any special permit applications for proposed public parking garages in Community District Five that have an impact on the number and flow of cars in the district

WHEREAS, CB5 understands that there is a demand for parking spaces on the part of many residents and workers in the district; and

WHEREAS, The previous parking garage located on premises contained 173 parking spaces and 3 curb cuts; and

WHEREAS, The proposed accessory parking facility shall contain a maximum of 64 parking spaces and two curb cuts, a net reduction of 109 parking spaces and one curb cut; and

WHEREAS, The Department of City Planning has issued guidance that the target quantity of parking spaces in this area is 20% of available and planned residential units; and

WHEREAS, The Department of City Planning provides specific guidance on the method to calculate parking as a percent of residential units; and

WHEREAS, The applicant submitted studies utilizing this methodology indicating that their proposed parking facility would increase the percentage of space relative to residential unit to 15.68 percent; and

WHEREAS, The proposed curb cuts are required to be placed in such a way that they will not significantly impact traffic to the immediate and surrounding area; and

WHEREAS, NYC Department of Transportation issued a letter stating the proposed curb cuts and their placement will not result in significant impact to West 58th Street or the adjacent streets; and

WHEREAS, The applicant is installing a motor court to accommodate taxi and car service to prevent idling traffic on West 58th Street and the surrounding areas; and

WHEREAS, The New York City Planning Commission provides rules exempting any parking facility with less than 85 additional spaces from completing an Environmental Impact Statement; and

WHEREAS, The applicant, though proposing less than 85 additional spaces, did complete an Environmental Assessment Statement; and

WHEREAS, The Environmental Assessment Statement concluded there were no significant impacts and a Negative Declaration was made; and

WHEREAS, CB5 is on record requesting a more thorough environmental study requirement for a threshold lower than 85 additional parking spaces; and

WHEREAS, The aggregate decrease in parking spaces, curb cuts and traffic flow from the previous use on this site would not result in a significant adverse impact; and

WHEREAS, The use of the accessory parking facility is appropriate in the context of the residential building and neighborhood it will serve; therefore be it

RESOLVED, Community Board Five **recommends approval** of Application # 170249ZSM and N170250ZCM by VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC for a special permit pursuant to ZR Section 13-45 and 13-451 (a) and a certification pursuant to ZR Section 26-15 to allow an attended accessory parking garage with a maximum capacity of 64 spaces on portions of the ground floor and sub-cellar in an as-of-right building that is currently under construction at 220 Central Park South.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on this matter.

Sincerely,



Vikki Barbero
Chair

John Murray
Acting Chair, Land Use, Housing & Zoning Committee



OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT
BOROUGH OF MANHATTAN
THE CITY OF NEW YORK

1 Centre Street, 19th floor, New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8300 p (212) 669-4306 f
431 West 125th Street, New York, NY 10027
(212) 531-1609 p (212) 531-4615 f
www.manhattanbp.nyc.gov

Gale A. Brewer, Borough President

August 14, 2017

**Recommendation on
ULURP Application No. C 170249 ZSM – 220 Central Park South
by VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC**

PROPOSED ACTIONS

VNO 225 West 58th Street LLC (the “applicant”) seeks approval of a **special permit** pursuant to Section 13-45 and Section 13-451 of the Zoning Resolution (ZR) to allow an attended off-street parking garage with a maximum capacity of 64 spaces on portions of the ground floor and subcellar of a proposed mixed-use building at 220 Central Park South (Block 1030, Lots 15, 16, 17, 19, 24, 25, 39, 46, 48, and 58) in R10H and C5-1 Districts of Manhattan Community District 5.

The special permit requires that all of the applicable conditions of ZR § 13-20 (SPECIAL RULES FOR MANHATTAN CORE PARKING FACILITIES) be met and that the findings of §13-45 and 13-451 have been met. These findings are as follows:

- (1) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic associated with uses or public facilities, including access points to mass transit facilities in close proximity thereto, or result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (2) the location of the vehicular entrances and exits to such parking facility will not interfere with the efficient functioning of streets, including any lanes designated for specific types of users or vehicles, due to the entering and leaving movement of vehicles;
- (3) such use will not create or contribute to serious traffic congestion and will not unduly inhibit surface traffic and pedestrian flow;
- (4) for public parking garages, that where any floor space is exempted from the definition of floor area, such additional floor space is needed in order to prevent excessive on-street parking demand and relieve traffic congestion;
- (5) such parking facility will not be inconsistent with the character of the existing streetscape; and
- (6) the number of off-street parking spaces in such proposed parking facility is reasonable and not excessive in relation to recent trends in close proximity to the proposed facility with regard to:
 - (a) the increase in the number of dwelling units; and

- (b) the number of both public and accessory off-street parking spaces, taking into account both the construction, if any, of new off-street parking facilities and the reduction, if any, in the number of such spaces in existing parking facilities.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project site is a 27,608 square foot irregularly-shaped mid-block through-lot located between Central Park South and West 58th Street. The site has 75 feet of frontage on Central Park South and 200 feet of frontage on West 58th Street, and is part of a merged zoning lot that together total 91,704 square feet. The applicant is seeking a special permit pursuant to ZR § 13-45 and 13-451 to build an accessory parking garage with a maximum of 64 spaces in a proposed mixed-use building. The project site had previously been occupied by two residential buildings, an apartment hotel, a commercial building, and a public parking garage. All of these buildings have since been demolished.

Background

The project site is just north of the Special Midtown District, which was enacted in 1982 with the general goal of strengthening the business core of Midtown Manhattan. The northerly boundary of the Special Midtown District is midblock between West 57th Street and West 58th Street. The project site is just outside of this special district and is governed by the underlying regulations of the C5-1 and R10H districts. The southern portion is zoned C5-1 and makes up approximately 73 percent of the site's lot area, while the northern portion is zoned R10H and makes up approximately 27 percent.

Proposed Development

The applicant proposes to construct a new 66-story mixed-use building with approximately 472,500 square feet of floor area and 118 market-rate condominium dwelling units, and a 64-space attended accessory parking facility on the ground floor and sub cellar level 2. The proposed building complies with all use and bulk regulations, but the proposed accessory parking facility requires a special permit, as the building could include only 24 accessory parking spaces as-of-right.

Entrances to the proposed building, the garage, and the retail component will be on West 58th Street, with a secondary entrance to the residential units from Central Park South. There will be two 22-foot-wide curb cuts, separated by approximately 129 feet. The western curb cut will serve the proposed garage, while the eastern curb cut will serve the motor court, which is an off-street drop off area for the residential entrances.

The ground floor level of the proposed garage will occupy approximately 3,425 square feet, with six reservoir spaces and two car elevators. The portion of the garage on sub cellar level 2 will occupy approximately 11,830 square feet, with 64 spaces including 7 double-height stackers. Upon entering the garage traveling eastbound on West 58th Street, garage patrons will go through

a two-lane driveway until they reach the reservoir spaces, where they will leave their vehicles with a parking attendant.

Area Context

The project site is located in a R10H zoning district and a C5-1 zoning district in Manhattan Community District 5, between West 58th Street and West 59th Street and adjacent to Columbus Circle. Central Park is located just north of the project site. The surrounding area also includes many cultural resources, such as Lincoln Center for the Performing Arts, the New York Philharmonic, the New York City Ballet, the New York City Center, and Carnegie Hall.

Land uses in the area include commercial, mixed residential and commercial, multifamily residential, park space and institutional uses. The area has seen tremendous growth in high-rise luxury residential development in the last ten years, as many sites have been assembled through zoning-lot mergers and air-rights transfers.

Adjacent properties on the same block as the proposed development include multifamily elevator buildings and other mixed-use buildings ranging from 8 stories to 35 stories. Three landmarked buildings occupy the same zoning lot as the project site: 240 Central Park South Apartments, Gainsborough Studios, and the Former Helen Miller Gould Stable. Other buildings of historical and architectural significance on the same block include Engine Company Number 23 and the Sire Building. In total, there are 13 designated NYC Landmarks and the Central Park Scenic Landmark within the Study Area of the application.

The Columbus Circle Subway Station, serving the A, B, C, D, and 1 subway lines, is the closest station to the project site and a major transportation node for the entire city. Columbus Circle also provides access to multiple bus lines, including the M12, the M20, the M104, the M31, the M57, the M10, and the M7. There is also convenient access to the 57th Street—Seventh Avenue Station for the N, Q, R, and W lines. Citibike stations are also located nearby along Broadway at West 60th Street and West 58th Street,

Proposed Actions

The applicant seeks a Parking Special Permit pursuant to ZR § 13-45 and 13-451 to allow additional accessory parking spaces for residential growth in order to construct a 64-space accessory residential parking garage. Only 24 spaces are permitted as-of-right for the proposed building.

COMMUNITY BOARD RECOMMENDATION

At its Full Board meeting on July 13, 2017, Manhattan Community Board 5 (CB5) approved a resolution recommending **approval** of the application for a special permit to allow a 64-space accessory parking garage. CB5's recommendation expressed that the applicant submitted studies according to the methodology set out by the Department of City Planning, and showed that the

proposed garage would not have significant adverse impacts to the surrounding area. In addition, CB5's recommendation noted that the previous parking garage located on the premises of the project site contained 173 parking spaces and 3 curb cuts, and that the proposed garage would represent an overall reduction of the amount of parking spaces and curb cuts. CB5 also called out the proposed motor court as a way to accommodate taxi and car service to prevent idling traffic in the area and on local through streets.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S COMMENTS

The Borough President's Office has consistently called on the Department of City Planning and the City Planning Commission to consider a more robust set of factors in the parking methodology analysis. In particular, recommendations from this office on prior parking special permits have stressed the importance of considering the utilization rate of parking facilities prior to the ten-year look-back period. Without this data, there is doubt over the suitability of the ten-year look-back period as a benchmark for the appropriate number of parking spaces for a neighborhood today.

This office also believes that proximity to mass transit should be a major consideration of the parking methodology. In this case, the project site is well-served by public transportation; Columbus Circle is one of the major transportation nodes of the city, with ample access to subway and bus service. Given this location, and considering the existing congestion of the surrounding area, this office is generally reluctant to recommend approval of additional parking spaces. However, we also recognize that there are different profiles for car users, and that parking spaces can serve as storage for destination-based car usage that go beyond the reach of the public transportation system, as opposed to everyday commuting within the city. While Columbus Circle provides ready access to the subway and bus system, the project site does not enjoy easy access to multiple regional transportation systems, as do some other parking special permit project sites that have come before this office. Thus, it seems to be an appropriate location for light destination-based car storage and usage.

This office has also established limited comfort with the notion that residents and owners tend not to use their cars on a regular basis, as opposed to commuters and other transient parking users. We acknowledge the point raised by CB5 that going from a public parking garage with 173 spaces to a residential parking garage with 64 spaces might well represent a net reduction in car usage and congestion.

The applicant meets the individual findings for a special permit pursuant to ZR §13-45 and 13-451. Our office believes that the 40 additional parking spaces would not unduly interrupt the flow of pedestrian traffic, result in any undue conflict between pedestrian and vehicular movements, interfere with the functioning of streets, create serious congestion, or otherwise substantially impact the neighborhood. Based on these findings, our office recommends approval of the special permit. However, we once again urge the Department of City Planning and the City Planning Commission to reconsider the parking calculation methodology to include a more robust set of factors.

BOROUGH PRESIDENT'S RECOMMENDATION

Therefore, the Manhattan Borough President recommends **approval** of ULURP Application No. C 170249 ZSM.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Gale A. Brewer". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large initial "G" and "A".

Gale A. Brewer
Manhattan Borough President