



CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

August 25, 2004/Calendar No. 20

N 050011 HKR

IN THE MATTER OF a communication dated July 9, 2004 from the Executive Director of the Landmarks Preservation Commission regarding the landmark designation of the St. Paul's Avenue-Stapleton Heights Historic District which consists of the property bounded by a line beginning at a point on the eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, then extending easterly to and along the northern property line of 169 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern property line of 169 St. Paul's Avenue and part of the eastern property line of 173 St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along part of the southern property line of 173 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along part of the western property line of 173 St. Paul's Avenue and the western property lines of 185 St. Paul's and 189 St. Paul's Avenue and a line extending to the northern curb line of Clinton Street, southerly across Clinton Street to the southern curb line of Clinton Street, easterly along the southern curb line of Clinton Street to a point on a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 203 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along said line and the eastern property lines of 203 St. Paul's Avenue and 207 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along part of the northern property line of 211 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern property lines of 211 through 231 St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along part of the southern property line of 231 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern property lines of 239 and 241 St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along part of the southern property line of 241 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern property lines of 249 through 257 St. Paul's Avenue and 15 Taxter Place and a line extending to the northern curb line of Taxter Place, across Taxter Place to the southern curb line of Taxter Place, southerly along said line and the eastern property lines of 277 (aka 271-277) St. Paul's Avenue through 291 St. Paul's Avenue and part of the eastern property line of 309 St. Paul's Avenue (aka 295-339 St. Paul's Avenue, 175-185 Beach Street), westerly along part of the southern property line of 309 St. Paul's Avenue (aka 295-339 St. Paul's Avenue, 175-185 Beach Street), southerly along part of the eastern property line of 309 (aka 295-339 St. Paul's Avenue, 175-185 Beach Street) and a line extending to the northern curb line of Beach Street, southerly across Beach Street to the southern curb line of Beach Street, westerly along the southern curb line of Beach Street to a point on a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 347 (aka 341-347) St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along said line and along the eastern property line of 347 (aka 341-347) St. Paul's Avenue and part of the eastern property line of 351 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along part on the northern property line of 351 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along part of the eastern property line of 351 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along part of the northern property line of 353 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern property lines of 353 through 357 St. Paul's Avenue and part of the eastern property line of 369 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along part of the southern property line of 369 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along part of the eastern property line of 369 St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along part of the southern property line of 369 St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern property line of 377 and 387 St. Paul's Avenue, southeasterly along the eastern property line of 393 St. Paul's Avenue and part of the eastern property line of 399 St. Paul's Avenue, southwesterly along part of the eastern property line of 399 St. Paul's Avenue,

southerly along part of eastern property line of 403 St. Paul's Avenue, part of the eastern property line of 413 St. Paul's Avenue, and a line extending to the northern curb line of Willow Street, westerly along the northern curb line of Willow Street to the northwestern curb line of Stone Street and Willow Street, southerly across Willow Street to the northeastern curb line of Willow Street and Stone Street, easterly along part of the of the northern curb line of Stone Street to a point on a line extending northerly from the eastern property line of 447 St. Paul's Avenue,

southerly across Stone Street to the southern curb line of Stone Street, southerly along said line and part of the eastern property line of 447 St. Paul's Avenue to a point on a line between 447 and 449 St. Paul's Avenue, northwesterly along said line and a line extending to the eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, southerly along the eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue to a point on a line extending easterly from the southern property line of 94 Trossach Road (aka 94-98 Trossach Road, 446-458 St. Paul's Avenue), westerly across St. Paul's Avenue to the western curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along said line and the southern property line of 94 Trossach Road (aka 94-98 Trossach Road, 446-458 St. Paul's Avenue), northerly along the western property line of 94 Trossach Road (aka 94-98 Trossach Road, 446-458 St. Paul's Avenue) and a line extending to the southern curb line of Trossach Road, easterly along the southern curb line of Trossach Road to the southwest corner of Trossach Road and St. Paul's Avenue, northerly across Trossach Road to the northwest corner of Trossach Road and St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along the western curb line of St. Paul's Avenue to a point on a line extending easterly from the southern property line of 400 St. Paul's Avenue (aka 76 Occident Avenue), westerly along said line and the southern property line of 400 St. Paul's Avenue (aka 76 Occident Avenue), southerly along part of the eastern property line of 107 Marion Avenue, westerly along the southern property line of 107 Marion Avenue and part of the southern property line of 131 Marion Avenue (aka 131-141 Marion Avenue), northerly along part of the western property line of 131 Marion Avenue (aka 131-141 Marion Avenue), westerly along part of the southern property line of 131 Marion Avenue (aka 131-141 Marion Avenue), northerly along part of the western property line of 131 Marion Avenue (aka 131-141 Marion Avenue) and a line extending to the southern curb line of Marion Avenue, easterly along the southern curb line of Marion Avenue following its northward curve to the southeast corner of Marion Avenue and Occident Avenue, northerly across Occident Avenue to the northeast corner of Occident Avenue and Marion Avenue, westerly across Marion Avenue to the northwest corner of Occident Avenue and Marion Avenue and along the northern curb line of Occident Avenue to a point on a line extending southerly from the western property line of 37 Occident Avenue (aka 31-37 Occident Avenue), northerly along said line and the western property lines of 37 Occident Avenue (aka 31-37 Occident Avenue), 62 through 56 Marion Avenue and 44 Pommer Avenue (aka 50 Marion Avenue) and a line extending to the southern curb line of Pommer Avenue, northerly across Pommer Avenue to the northern curb line of Pommer Avenue, northerly along said line to the northwestern property line of 45 Pommer Avenue (aka 48 Marion Avenue), northerly along the western property line of 45 Pommer Avenue (aka 48 Marion Avenue) and 36 through 14 Marion Avenue and part of the western property line of 168 Cebra Avenue (aka 154-178 Cebra Avenue, 1-9 Catlin Street, 2 Marion Avenue), westerly along part of the southern property line of 168 Cebra Avenue (aka 154-178 Cebra Avenue, 1-9 Catlin Street, 2 Marion Avenue) and a line extending to the eastern curb line of Catlin Avenue, northerly along the western curb line of Catlin Avenue to the southeast corner of Catlin Avenue and Cebra Avenue, northerly across Cebra Avenue to the northern curb line of Cebra Avenue, northwesterly along the northern curb

line of Cebra Avenue to a point on a line extending southerly from the western property line of 147 Cebra Avenue (aka 141-147 Cebra Avenue), northerly along said line and the western property line of 147 Cebra Avenue (aka 141-147 Cebra Avenue), easterly along part of the northern property line of 147 Cebra Avenue (aka 141-147 Cebra Avenue), northerly along part of the western property line of 147 Cebra Avenue (aka 141-147 Cebra Avenue), easterly along part of the northern property line of 147 Cebra Avenue (aka 141-147 Cebra Avenue) and the northern property lines of 151 through 169 Cebra Avenue, southerly along part of the eastern property line of 169 Cebra Avenue to a point on a line extending westerly from the northern property line of 173 Cebra Avenue, easterly along the northern property lines of 173 and 175 Cebra

Avenue (aka 2 Dyson Street) and a line extending to the western curb line of Dyson Street, southwesterly along the western curb line of Dyson Street to a point on a line extending westerly from the northern property line of 1 Dyson Street (aka 1-1A Dyson Street, 181 Cebra Avenue), easterly across Dyson Street to the eastern curb line of Dyson Street, easterly along said line and part of the northern property line of 1 Dyson Street (aka 1-1A Dyson Street, 181 Cebra Avenue), northerly along part of the western property line of 1 Dyson Street (aka 1-1A Dyson Street, 181 Cebra Avenue), easterly along part of the northern property line of 1 Dyson Street (aka 1-1A Dyson Street, 181 Cebra Avenue) and the northern property line of 189 Cebra Avenue, northerly along the western property line of 298 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along the northern property line of 298 St. Paul's Avenue and a line extending to the western curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, easterly across St. Paul's Avenue to the eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along the eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue to the southeast corner of Taxter Place, northerly across Taxter Place to the northern curb line of Taxter Place, northerly along said line and the

eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue to a point on a line extending easterly from the southern property line of 218 St. Paul's Avenue, westerly across St. Paul's Avenue to the western curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along said line and the southern property line of 218 St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along the western property line of 218 and 210-212 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along part of the northern property line of 210-212 St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along the eastern property line of 208 St. Paul's Avenue, westerly along the southern property line of 204 St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along part of the western property line of 204 St. Paul's Avenue, easterly along part of the northern property line of 204 St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along part of the western property line of 204 St. Paul's Avenue and the western property lines of 202 through 192 St. Paul's Avenue, and a line extending to the southern curb line of Paxton Street, northerly across Paxton Street to the northern curb line of Paxton Street, northerly along said line and the western property line of 172 St. Paul's Avenue (aka 168-172 St. Paul's Avenue), easterly along the northern property line of 172 St. Paul's Avenue (aka 168-172 St. Paul's Avenue) and a line extending to the western curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, easterly across St. Paul's Avenue to the eastern curb line of St. Paul's Avenue, northerly along the curb line of St. Paul's Avenue to the point of beginning, by the Landmarks Preservation Commission on June 29, 2004 (List No. 355, LP 2147).

Pursuant to Section 3020.8 (a) and (b) of the City Charter, the City Planning Commission shall submit to the City Council a report with respect to the relation of any designation by the Landmarks Preservation Commission, whether of a

historic district or a landmark, to the Zoning Resolution, projected public improvements, and any plans for the development, growth, improvement or renewal of the area involved.

The St. Paul's Avenue-Stapleton Heights Historic District consists of 92 buildings and contains portions of 14 blocks located on or to the west of St. Paul's Avenue, a major thoroughfare that curves around the base of Ward Hill and Grymes Hill, linking the villages of Tompkinsville and Stapleton in Community District 1 in northeastern Staten Island. The district is an unusually well-preserved residential neighborhood that is a significant reminder of the architectural and historic development of Staten Island. It is an excellent example of an early-nineteenth century to early-twentieth century suburban residential community. Composed primarily of wood-frame freestanding houses, this type of neighborhood has become increasingly rare in New York City.

Development in the area began in 1829 when streets and building lots were laid out by Caleb T. Ward, the original owner of a 250 acre tract of land that includes all of the land within the district. The first homes, several of which remain today, were built in the 1830s in the Greek Revival style along St. Paul's Avenue. Later homes, built from the 1850's through the early 1900's, are representative of Second Empire style, Queen Anne style, Stick style, Shingle style, Colonial Revival style, and Craftsman style. Almost one-third of the homes were built in the Neoclassical and Craftsman style by prominent Staten Island architects. This commonality contributes to the architectural significance and sense of place within the district. Several architecturally significant churches are also located within the district, including the High Victorian Gothic style St. Paul's Memorial Church and Rectory building built between 1866 and 1870- both of which are individually designated New York City Landmarks.

The St. Paul's Avenue-Stapleton Heights Historic District is primarily zoned R3X. The R3X designation allows for single-family and two-family detached homes with a FAR of 0.5 on lots of at least 35 feet in width and 3,325 square feet in area.

A small area of the district to the south of Occident Avenue and to the west of St. Paul's Avenue is zoned R2. The R2 designation allows for single-family detached homes with a FAR of 0.5 on lots of at least 40 feet in width and 3,800 square feet in area. All areas of the district along the west side of St. Paul's Avenue and to the west are within the Special Hillside Preservation District (SHPD).

There are two individually designated New York City landmark buildings located in this historic district: St. Paul's Church and St. Paul's Church Rectory located at 215 and 225 St. Paul's Avenue, respectively. No transfer of development rights is permitted from any structure within an historic district.

All landmark buildings or buildings within Historic Districts are eligible to apply for use and bulk waivers pursuant to Section 74-711 of the Zoning Resolution.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

Pursuant to Section 3020.8(a) of the City Charter, the City Planning Commission held a public hearing on August 11, 2004 (Calendar No. 22).

There were eight speakers in favor of the application and none in opposition. Those who testified in favor of the application included representatives from the Landmarks Preservation Commission, the Office of the City Council member from the 49th District, the Historic Districts Council, the Mud Lane Society for the Renaissance of Stapleton, several current residents of the proposed historic district, and several residents of adjacent neighborhoods in Staten Island.

Speakers in favor of the proposal stressed the uniqueness of the neighborhood and the quality of the homes. Many described the sense of place they felt by the assortment of 19th century architectural styles. They noted that the designation of the historic district was the only way to truly preserve the character of the neighborhood. Several speakers commented that a strong sense of neighborhood and community exists as a direct result of the common experiences related to owning and maintaining older homes. Some speakers also noted that the first attempts to establish an historic district in this area began approximately 20 years ago.

Most speakers in favor of the proposal expressed concerns about the high rate of new home construction on Staten Island and in the vicinity of the proposed historic district. They expressed fears that without the protection of the historic district, many of these homes were at a high risk of being demolished by over-zealous developers.

There were no other speakers and the hearing was closed.

CONSIDERATION

The City Planning Commission has evaluated the designation of the St. Paul's Avenue-Stapleton Heights Historic District in relation to the Zoning Resolution and the economic growth and development of the area.

The Commission believes that the architectural character of the homes contributes positively and significantly to the strong sense of community that exists in the neighborhood. The Commission further believes that the existence of an historic district will help to ensure that an important part of Staten Island's cultural and developmental history is protected. The Commission further believes that this proposal will strengthen and preserve a unique residential neighborhood.

The proposed St. Paul's Avenue-Stapleton Heights Historic District does not conflict with the Zoning Resolution, projected public improvements or any plans for the development, growth, improvement or renewal of the historic district or the area involved.

AMANDA M. BURDEN, AICP, Chair

KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, ESQ., Vice Chairman

**ANGELA M. BATTAGLIA, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ANGELA R. CAVALUZZI, RA,
RICHARD EADDY, CHRISTOPHER KUI, KAREN PHILLIPS, DOLLY WILLIAMS,
Commissioners**