



CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

December 7, 2005/Calendar No. 11

C 060055 ZMQ

IN THE MATTER OF an application submitted by the Department of City Planning pursuant to Sections 197-c and 201 of the New York City Charter **for an amendment of the Zoning Map, Section Nos. 7b, 7d, 10a and 10c:**

1. eliminating from an existing R2 District a C1-2 District bounded by 14th Avenue, 145th Place, a line 150 feet southeasterly of 14th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard;
2. eliminating from an existing R3-2 District a C1-2 District bounded by:
 - a. 19th Avenue, a line 150 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, Francis Lewis Boulevard, and Willets Point Boulevard; and
 - b. 19th Avenue, Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue, a line 150 feet westerly of Utopia Parkway, 21st Avenue, a line midway between Utopia Parkway and 169th Street, 20th Avenue, and 169th Street;
3. eliminating from an existing R3-2 District a C2-2 District bounded by 10th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, a line 85 feet southeasterly of 10th Avenue, and Clintonville Street;
4. eliminating from an existing R4 District a C1-2 District bounded by 24th Road, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 169th Street, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 26th Avenue, and Francis Lewis Boulevard;
5. changing from an R2 District to an R1-2 District property bounded by:
 - a. the U.S. Pierhead Line, the northwesterly prolongation of a line 125 feet northeasterly of 149th Street, 2nd Avenue, 149th Street, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 2nd Avenue, 147th Place, 3rd Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 147th Street, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 3rd Avenue and its southwestwesterly prolongation, the southwestwesterly service road of Whitestone Expressway, the southeasterly boundary line of Francis Lewis Park and its southwestwesterly prolongation, and the northeasterly boundary line of Francis Lewis Park and its northwesterly prolongation;
 - b. the U.S. Pierhead Line, a line 120 feet easterly of 161st Street and its northerly prolongation, Riverside Drive and its easterly centerline prolongation, 159th Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 157th Street, a line

100 feet southerly of Powell's Cove Boulevard, a line 100 feet westerly of 157th Street, 9th Avenue, a line 100 feet easterly of 154th Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 154th Place, Riverside Drive, and 158th Street and its northerly centerline prolongation; and

- c. a line 100 feet southerly of 9th Avenue, 162nd Street, 14th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 166th Street, a line 100 feet northwesterly of Cryders Lane, Totten Street, Cryders Lane, 166th Street, a line 95 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, 165th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, a line 100 feet westerly of 165th Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 14th Road, 164th Street, the northerly service road of the Cross Island Parkway, a line midway between 161st Street and 162nd Street, a line perpendicular to the easterly street line of 161st Street distant 175 feet southerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the easterly street line of 161st Street and the southeasterly street line of Cryders Lane, 161st Street, Cryders Lane, 158th Street, a line perpendicular to the westerly street line of 158th Street distant 100 feet northerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the westerly street line of 158th Street and the northwesterly street line of Cryders Lane, a line midway between 157th Street and 158th Street, 14th Avenue, and a line 100 feet westerly of 160th Street;
6. changing from an R3-2 District to an R2 District property bounded by the U.S. Pierhead Line, the northerly prolongation of a line 100 feet westerly of 151st Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 6th Avenue, 150th Street, and a line perpendicular to the southeasterly centerline prolongation of 150th Street at its intersection with the northwesterly street line of 150th Street;
 7. changing from an R2 District to an R2A District property bounded by:
 - a. a line 100 feet southeasterly of 3rd Avenue and its southwestwesterly prolongation, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 147th Street, 3rd Avenue, 147th Place, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 2nd Avenue, 149th Street, 3rd Avenue, 150th Street, 6th Avenue, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 151st Street, 7th Avenue, Powell's Cove Boulevard and its easterly centerline prolongation, a line 100 feet easterly of 152nd Street, 10th Avenue, 152nd Street, 11th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 10th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwestwesterly of Clintonville Street, 11th Avenue, 150th Street, a line 110 feet southeasterly of 11th Avenue, 148th Street, the northeasterly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 14th Avenue, 148th Street, 15th Avenue, 147th Street, 17th Avenue, Parsons Boulevard, 15th Avenue, 144th Place, 14th Avenue, the easterly service road of Whitestone Expressway, 15th Avenue and its northeasterly and westerly centerline prolongation, the westerly street line of former 138th Street, the southerly boundary line of Frank Golden Memorial Park, the easterly street line of 132nd Street, the easterly centerline prolongation of

15th Avenue, 132nd Street, 14th Avenue, 133rd Place, 11th Avenue, 138th Street, 13th Avenue, 143rd Street and its northerly centerline prolongation, 14th Avenue, 144th Street, the westerly service road of Whitestone Expressway, the northeasterly prolongation of the southerly street line of North Drive, and the southwesterly service road of Whitestone Expressway;

- b. 12th Road, 152nd Street, 12th Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of 154th Street, 10th Avenue, 154th Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of 154th Street, 9th Avenue, 160th Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 162nd Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 9th Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of 160th Street, 14th Avenue, a line midway between 157th Street and 158th Street, a line perpendicular to the westerly street line of 158th Street distant 100 feet northerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the westerly street line of 158th Street and the northwesterly street line of Cryders Lane, 158th Street, Cryders Lane, 161st Street, a line perpendicular to the easterly street line of 161st Street distant 175 feet southerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the easterly street line of 161st Street and the southeasterly street line of Cryders Lane, a line midway between 161st Street and 162nd Street, the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, a line 100 feet westerly of 154th Street, 14th Road, and Clintonville Street;
- c. a line 100 feet northerly of 12th Avenue, 166th Street, 12th Avenue, Utopia Parkway, the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 164th Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 14th Road, a line 100 feet westerly of 165th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, 165th Street, a line 95 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, 166th Street, Cryders Lane, Totten Street, a line 100 feet northwesterly of Cryders Lane, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 166th Street, 14th Avenue, and 162nd Street; and
- d. 24th Avenue, Murray Street, a line midway between 23rd Avenue and 24th Avenue, a line 200 feet westerly of 154th Street, 23rd Avenue, 154th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, 157th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of 22nd Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, 22nd Avenue, a line 100 feet easterly of 160th Street, a line 95 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, 23rd Avenue, 166th Street, 21st Road, 163rd Street, 20th Road, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 150 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 19th Avenue, 163rd Street and its northerly centerline prolongation, a line 100 feet northerly of 19th Avenue, 166th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of 20th Avenue, 169th Street, 20th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, a line midway between Utopia Parkway and 169th Street, 21st Avenue, a line 150 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue and its easterly centerline prolongation, the southeasterly and

southwesterly boundary line of Clearview Park and its southeasterly prolongation, 26th Avenue, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 169th Street, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 24th Road, 166th Street, 25th Avenue, and a line 100 feet westerly of Murray Street;

8. changing from an R3-1 District to an R2A District property bounded by:
 - a. 17th Avenue, 147th Street, 18th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard;
 - b. 21st Avenue, a line 100 feet easterly of 154th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, 154th Street, 23rd Avenue, a line 200 feet westerly of 154th Street, a line midway between 23rd Avenue and 24th Avenue, and Murray Street ;
 - c. 17th Avenue, Francis Lewis Boulevard, 160th Street, 20th Road, 157th Street, 20th Avenue, a line 530 feet westerly of 160th Street, 19th Avenue, a line 280 feet southwesterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 18th Avenue, a line 265 feet southwesterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 17th Road, and 157th Street; and
 - d. 20th Road, 163rd Street, 21st Avenue, and a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard;

9. changing from an R3-2 District to an R2A District property bounded by:
 - a. 14th Avenue, 144th Place, 15th Avenue, and the easterly service road of the Whitestone Expressway;
 - b. the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, a line 125 feet westerly of 159th Street, a line 200 feet northerly of 16th Avenue, 159th Street and its southerly centerline prolongation, 17th Avenue, and Francis Lewis Boulevard and its northwesterly centerline prolongation;
 - c. the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 166th Street, 16th Avenue, Willets Point Boulevard, 16th Road, and 163rd Street;
 - d. a line 100 feet northerly of 19th Avenue, 163rd Street and its northerly centerline prolongation, 19th Avenue, a line 150 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 100 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 19th Avenue, and Willets Point Boulevard;

- e. 20th Avenue, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, and a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, and
 - f. 21st Avenue, a line midway between Utopia Parkway and 169th Street, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue, and a line 150 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway;
10. changing from an R3-1 District to an R3A District property bounded by 16th Avenue, 147th Street, 15th Avenue, 148th Street, 14th Avenue, the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, Clintonville Street, the southerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 15th Drive, Murray Street, 17th Avenue, Clintonville Street, 157th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of 154th Street, 21st Avenue, Murray Street, 24th Avenue, Willets Point Boulevard, a line 95 feet easterly of 150th Street, a line midway between 18th Avenue and 19th Avenue, a line 95 feet westerly of 150th Street, 22nd Avenue, 149th Street, a line 110 feet southerly of 23rd Avenue, 146th Street, 20th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard;
11. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3A District property bounded by:
- a. a line 150 feet southerly of 21st Avenue, 146th Street, a line 110 feet southerly of 23rd Avenue, a line 75 feet westerly of 146th Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 24th Avenue, a line 150 feet easterly of Parsons Boulevard, 24th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard; and
 - b. Willets Point Boulevard, 24th Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Murray Street, a line midway between 24th Avenue and 24th Road, and a line 100 feet easterly of 150th street;
12. changing from an R2 District to an R3X District property bounded by Clintonville Street, 163rd Street, 23rd Avenue, a line 95 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, and a line 100 feet easterly of 160th Street;
13. changing from an R3-1 District to an R3X District property bounded by 20th Road, Francis Lewis Boulevard, 163rd Street, Clintonville Street, and 160th Street;
14. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3X District property bounded by the southerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 202nd Street, the southwesterly prolongation of the northwesterly boundary line of Clearview Park, the southwesterly boundary line of Clearview Park, 19th Avenue and its northeasterly centerline prolongation, 201st Street, 17th Avenue, 100th Street, 16th Avenue, Utopia Parkway, a line 80 feet northerly of 17th Road, a line 95 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, 17th Road, and 166th Street;

15. changing from an R2 District to an R3-1 District property bounded by:
 - a. Willets Point Boulevard, Clintonville Street, 22nd Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, a line 100 feet northerly of 22nd Avenue, and 157th Street; and
 - b. 21st Road, 166th Street, 23rd Avenue, and 163rd Street;
16. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3-1 District property bounded by:
 - a. 21st Avenue and its westerly centerline prolongation, Parsons Boulevard, 24th Avenue, a line 150 feet easterly of Parsons Boulevard, a line 100 feet southerly of 24th Avenue, a line 75 feet westerly of 146th Street, a line 110 feet southerly of 23rd Avenue, 146th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, 25th Road and its westerly centerline prolongation, and the westerly service road of the Whitestone Expressway; and
 - b. Willets Point Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of 150th Street, a line midway between 24th Avenue and 24th Road, a line 100 feet westerly of Murray Street, and 25th Avenue;
17. changing from an R2 District to an R3-2 District property bounded by:
 - a. 11th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, a line midway between 11th Avenue and 12th Avenue, and a line 250 feet northeasterly of 150th Street; and
 - b. 11th Avenue, 152nd Street, 12th Road, Clintonville Street, a line midway between 12th Avenue and 12th Road;
18. changing from an R3-1 District to an R3-2 District property bounded by Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, and 160th Street;
19. establishing within a proposed R2A District a C1-2 District bounded by 13th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 14th Road, and Clintonville Street;
20. establishing within a proposed R2A District a C1-3 District bounded by:
 - a. 14th Avenue, 145th Place, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 14th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard; and
 - b. 12th Road, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 14th Avenue, and Clintonville Street;

21. establishing within an existing R3-2 District a C1-3 District bounded by:
 - a. 19th Avenue, a line 100 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, Francis Lewis Boulevard, and Willets Point Boulevard; and
 - b. 21st Road, Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue, and a line 100 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway;
22. establishing within a proposed R3-2 District a C2-2 District bounded by:
 - a. 11th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, a line midway between 11th Avenue and 12th Avenue, and a line 250 feet northeasterly of 150th Street; and
 - b. a line midway between 12th Avenue and 12th Road, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 12th Road, and Clintonville Street;
23. establishing within an existing R4 District a C1-3 District bounded by 24th Road, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 169th Street, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 26th Avenue, and Francis Lewis Boulevard;

Borough of Queens, Community District 7, as shown on a diagram (for illustrative purposes only) dated August 22, 2005, and subject to the conditions of CEQR Declaration E-153.

The application for an amendment to the Zoning Map was filed by the Department of City Planning on August 17, 2005, to address issues of out-of-character residential development in the Whitestone area of Queens, Community District 7.

BACKGROUND

The Department of City Planning proposes comprehensive amendments to the Zoning Map in order to prevent new residential buildings that would be out-of-character with the traditional low-density development patterns of Whitestone. The area proposed for zoning changes is generally bounded by the East River to the north, the Whitestone Expressway to the west, 25th Avenue to the south and the Clearview Expressway and Little Neck Bay to the east. The

rezoning area is bisected by the Cross Island Parkway. The rezoning area contains 311 blocks, as certified, and encompasses the neighborhoods of Whitestone, Beechhurst and Robinwood.

The communities of Whitestone generally occupy the northern area of Community District 7, along the East River. Whitestone is one of the oldest European settlements on Long Island, dating to the 1640's. Whitestone incorporated as a village in 1869, the same year the Long Island Rail Road arrived. This led to the development of homes and estates along the East River in Whitestone, Beechhurst and Robinwood.

North of the Cross Island Parkway and west of Clintonville Street the rezoning area is characterized primarily by one-family detached homes developed at the end of World War II. East of Clintonville Street the rezoning area is characterized by older homes and, in the neighborhoods of Beechhurst and Robinwood, by relatively large single-family detached homes. South of the Cross Island Parkway the rezoning area consists primarily of one- and two-family homes, which are mostly detached residences on lots generally smaller than those in the north of the area, but also includes semi-detached homes and some small apartment buildings. Also in Whitestone is a central shopping district, centered on the intersection of Clintonville Street and 14th Avenue, and a manufacturing district along the East River west of 154th Street, which are not proposed for rezoning. The LeHavre Houses, a development of 30 eight-story apartment buildings along the East River east of 162nd Street is also not part of the rezoning area.

EXISTING ZONING

Whitestone's zoning has not substantially changed since 1961. The majority of the rezoning area is zoned R2, allowing for one-family detached buildings. The R2 district requires that buildings be located on a lot with a minimum area of 3,800 square feet and a minimum width of 40 feet. R2 zoning provides a maximum floor area ratio (FAR) of 0.5, but allows floor area exemptions for space used for garage, mechanical or bulkhead areas. The R2 zone establishes a maximum front wall height of 25 feet when it is located at the minimum front yard depth of 15 feet, but the front wall height may increase one foot for every additional foot the front wall is set back from the minimum front yard line. There is no absolute maximum building height; instead the building height is governed by the sky exposure plane.

South of the Cross Island Parkway the rezoning area is a mix of R3-1 and R3-2 zoning. The R3-1 permits one- and two-family detached or semi-detached, housing while the R3-2 is the lowest density general residence district allowing multiple family dwellings in detached, semi-detached or attached housing types. Both zoning designations provide a maximum FAR of 0.5 with a 0.1 attic allowance. In R3-1 and R3-2 zones, detached buildings must be located on lots with minimum areas of 3,800 square feet and minimum widths of 40 feet. Semi-detached and attached buildings must be located on lots with an area of at least 1,700 square feet and minimum lot widths of 18 feet. In R3-1 and R3-2 districts, a building's perimeter wall height is limited to 21 feet, and maximum building height is set at 35 feet.

In the central Whitestone area, and along Francis Lewis Boulevard, Utopia Parkway and on several corners throughout the study area there are C1-2 and C2-2 commercial overlays. Most of

these overlays reflect existing commercial uses, but some overlays exist where there are only residential uses.

Recent development under existing zoning has been out of character with the built contexts. In R2 districts older homes are replaced by significantly taller and bulkier one-family buildings or larger lots are subdivided into two or more smaller lots with new, out-of-scale homes. In R3-1 and R3-2 districts one- or two-family detached structures are replaced with semi-detached or attached buildings or multiple-family dwellings.

The rezoning proposal responds to concerns regarding overdevelopment from the local City Councilmember, the Borough President's Zoning Taskforce, as well as several civic groups including the Greater Whitestone Taxpayer's Civic Association and the Robinwood Property Owners' Association.

PROPOSED ZONING

The proposed Zoning Map amendments seek to achieve the following four objectives:

1. Prevent out-of-character, multi-family and attached developments in areas developed primarily with one- and two-family, detached residences;
2. Retain the area's low-density character and limit subdivision into smaller building lots;
3. Ensure that new single-family houses match the established scale of traditional development patterns; and
4. Reduce the depth of commercial overlays in order to prevent commercial uses from encroaching onto residential side streets.

Prevent out-of-character development in areas developed primarily with one- and two-family detached residences:

- An R3X district is proposed for several areas where the existing development is predominantly one- and two-family detached houses, including an area of approximately 13 blocks between 166th and 202nd streets and between the Cross Island Parkway and 19th Avenue; a blockfront south of Clintonville Street between 160th and 163rd streets, and three blocks between Clintonville Street and Francis Lewis Boulevard between 160th and 163rd streets. The areas are currently zoned R2, R3-1 and R3-2, yet are predominantly developed with detached one- and two- family houses.

In R3X districts, residential development would be limited to detached one- and two-family dwellings; new semi-detached and attached multi-family buildings would be prohibited. The minimum lot size and lot width requirements would be 3,325 square feet and 35 feet, respectively. The maximum FAR would be 0.5, with an attic allowance of 0.1, the same as the existing R3-1 and R3-2 zones. Front yards must have a minimum depth of ten feet and must be at least as deep as one of the adjacent front yards. Two side yards would be required, with a total of at least ten feet. The maximum building height would be 35 feet.

- An R3A district is proposed for a 64-block area south of the Cross Island Parkway, generally between Parsons Boulevard and Clintonville Street. The existing zoning is R3-1 and R3-2. The proposed zoning would better reflect the density and building types of the area which are predominantly one- and two-family detached houses on narrower lots.

R3A zoning limits residential development to one- and two-family detached houses. The proposed R3A zone has smaller minimum lot size and lot width requirements than required for detached buildings in R3-1 or R3-2 districts. The minimum lot area and lot width in the R3A district would be 2,375 square feet and 25 feet respectively for new developments, which more closely matches the area's smaller lot sizes. Front yards require a minimum depth of ten feet and must be at least as deep as one of the adjacent front yards. Minimum side yards would be eight feet in total. The maximum FAR would remain 0.5, with an attic allowance of 0.1. The maximum building height would be 35 feet.

Retains low-density character and limit subdivision into smaller building lots

In three areas of Whitestone currently zoned R2, an R1-2 district is proposed to better reflect the larger lot sizes typically found in these locations:

- Immediately south and east of Francis Lewis Park, bounded by the East River on the north, and 3rd Avenue on the south and 149th Street to the east;
- Between 154th Place and 162nd Street, north of 9th Avenue to the East River; and
- Along 160th Street and Cryder's Lane between 10th Avenue south and the Cross Island Parkway.

Only single family detached residences are permitted in R1-2 districts. The proposed R1-2 zone would require a minimum lot width of 60 feet and a minimum lot area of 5,700 square feet, which more closely reflects the existing lots in the area. The R1-2 requires a 20-foot front yard, and side yards totaling 20 feet with an eight-foot minimum. The proposed R1-2 districts have a maximum FAR of 0.5.

Ensure that new single-family houses match the established scale of traditional development patterns.

Two-hundred and three (203) blocks currently zoned R2 are proposed to be rezoned R2A. These blocks are located throughout the northern portion of the rezoning area above the Cross Island Parkway and 18th Avenue and in the southeast portion below Willets Point Boulevard and 19th Avenue. Thirteen blocks are proposed to be rezoned from R3-1 to R2A, primarily located east of Francis Lewis Boulevard and north of Willets Point Boulevard. Ten blocks currently zoned R3-2 are also proposed to be zoned to R2A. These R3-2 blocks are mostly located between Francis Lewis Boulevard and 166th Street south of the Cross Island Parkway.

In the R2A district only single family detached residences are permitted. The proposed R2A zone would require a minimum lot width of 40 feet and a minimum total lot area of 3,800 feet. The R2A requires a front yard of at least 15 feet in depth and it must be as deep as an adjoining front yard, up to 20 feet in depth. The R2A has a maximum FAR of 0.5.

In R2A districts, floor area exemptions are limited to 300 square feet for enclosed garages. The R2A has a maximum perimeter wall height of 21 feet and a total building height of 35 feet. The R2A also establishes maximum lot coverage at 30% of the lot area.

Reduce depth of commercial overlays in order to prevent commercial uses from encroaching onto residential side streets, or adjust boundaries to match existing land use patterns.

The Department is proposing to change or remove the C1-2 and C2-2 commercial overlay districts along portions of Utopia Parkway, Francis Lewis Boulevard, Clintonville Street, 149th Street, and 14th Avenue. These commercial overlays currently extend to a depth of 150 feet.

The Department proposes to eliminate commercial overlays on three blockfronts along Utopia Parkway and one blockfront at the southeast corner of 10th Avenue and Clintonville Street none of which contain commercial uses. The Department proposes to replace existing C1-2 overlays along Francis Lewis Boulevard, Utopia Parkway, and along 7th and 14th avenues with C1-3 overlays mapped at a depth of 100 feet to prevent commercial intrusion into the residentially developed side streets. This would decrease the amount of parking required. Under C1-2 generally one space is required per 300 square feet of retail space; in C1-3 overlays generally one space is required for every 400 square feet of retail space. The Department proposes to extend existing C1-2 and C2-2 districts to blockfronts located on the east side of Clintonville Street between 12th Road and 14th Avenue to reflect existing commercial and non-residential uses, and to extend an existing C2-2 overlay to the south side of 11th Avenue east of Clintonville Street.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

This application (C 060005 ZMQ) was reviewed pursuant to the New York State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) and the SEQRA regulations set forth in Volume 6 of the New York Code of Rules and Regulations, Section 617.00 *et seq.* and the City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Rules of Procedure of 1991 and Executive Order No. 91 of 1977. The designated CEQR number is 06DCP011Q. The lead agency is the City Planning Commission.

After a study of the potential environmental impacts of the proposed action, a Negative Declaration was issued on August 22, 2005, which included (E) designations for hazardous materials and noise.

To avoid the potential for hazardous materials impacts, the proposed Zoning Map amendment includes (E) designations for the following property, Block 4860, Lot 15.

The (E) designation for hazardous materials would require that the fee owner of such a site conduct a testing and sampling protocol, and remediation where appropriate, to the satisfaction of the Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) before the issuance of a building permit by the Department of Buildings (DOB) (pursuant to Section 11-15 of the Zoning Resolution – Environmental Requirement.) The (E) designation also requires a mandatory construction-related health and safety plan which must be approved by the DEP.

To avoid the potential for noise impacts the proposed zoning map amendment includes (E) designations for the following property, Block 4860, Lot 15. The (E) designation for noise would require that the fee owner of such a site provide a close window condition with a minimum of 35 dB(A) window/wall attenuation in order to maintain an interior noise level of 45 dB(A). In order to maintain a closed-window condition, an alternate means of ventilation must also be provided. Alternate means of ventilation would include, but would not be limited to, central air conditioning or air conditioning sleeves containing air conditioners or HUD-approved fans.

UNIFORM LAND USE REVIEW

This application (C 060055 ZMQ) was certified as complete by the Department of City Planning on August 22, 2005 and was duly referred to Community Board 7 and the Queens Borough President, in accordance with Article 3 of the Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP) rules.

Community Board Public Hearing

Community Board 7 held a public hearing on this application (C 060055 ZMQ) on September 26, 2005 and on that date, by a vote of 34 to 3, adopted a resolution recommending approval of this application.

Borough President Recommendation

The Queens Borough President held a public hearing on this application (C 060055 ZMQ) on October 6, 2005 and on October 31, 2005 issued a recommendation approving the application subject to the following condition:

The Department of City Planning should reevaluate and refine the proposed R1-2 areas to assure that the new zoning will not create too many non-compliant lots or hardships for property owners in those areas.

City Planning Commission Public Hearing

On October 19, 2005 (Calendar No. 17) the City Planning Commission scheduled November 2, 2005 for a public hearing on this application (C 060055 ZMQ). The hearing was duly held on November 2, 2005 (Calendar No. 17). There were four speakers in favor of the application and six speakers in opposition.

Those speaking in favor of the rezoning proposals included the Councilmember representing District 19, a member of Queens Community Board 7, and an urban planning consultant. These speakers noted that the proposed rezoning would ensure that new development matched the existing scale of the area and that the Department's rezoning efforts were a balanced approach to prevent overdevelopment. The Councilmember encouraged the Department to conduct a further study of the Beechhurst area to ensure that the boundaries of the proposed R1-2 district are appropriate.

There were five speakers in opposition who were homeowners from the Beechhurst area. They expressed concerns that the proposed R1-2 zoning would lower the value of their properties by preventing the subdivision of larger lots. Another property owner expressed concern that the proposed rezoning would split his parcel into an R3-1 portion and an R2A portion and he requested that his entire property remain zoned R3-1.

There were no other speakers, and the hearing was closed.

Waterfront Revitalization Program Consistency Review

This application was reviewed by the Department of City Planning for consistency with the policies of the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program (WRP), as amended, approved by the New York City Council on October 13, 1999 and by the New York State Department of State on May 28, 2002, pursuant to The New York State Waterfront Revitalization and Coastal Resources Act of 1981 (New York State Executive Law, Section 910 et seq.). The designated WRP number is 05-051.

This action was determined to be consistent with the New York City Waterfront Revitalization Program.

CONSIDERATION

The Commission believes that this amendment of the Zoning Map, as modified herein, is appropriate.

The Commission believes that this rezoning action represents a comprehensive zoning strategy for the Whitestone area of Community District 7 and will foster more compatible development in areas with one- and two-family detached residences, retain low-density character, limit subdivision of property, and prevent overscaled housing developments that are out-of-character with traditional development patterns.

The current mismatch between the built character of many parts of Whitestone and the housing type and density permitted by the existing zoning creates an incentive to replace detached housing occupied by one- or two-families with semi-detached or attached houses containing substantially more dwelling units. Changing all or parts of existing R3-2, R3-1 and R2 zones to a mix of lower-density or contextual districts, including R1-2, R2A, R2, R3A, R3X, and R3-1 zoning districts will better reflect the area's predominantly detached housing types and existing density of one- and two-family dwellings.

In particular, the Commission notes that the proposed R3A will better reflect the prevalence of comparatively narrow lots south of the Cross Island Parkway while the proposed R3X will better reflect the comparatively wider lots and detached character east of the Clearview Park. The Commission also notes that the proposed R3-1 for the area south of 21st Street and east of

Parsons Boulevard will ensure that new developments will more closely reflect this area's predominant one and two-family detached and semi-detached character. The Commission believes that the proposal to rezone substantial parts of Whitestone from R2 to R2A will ensure that enlargements and new buildings will be closer in scale with surrounding buildings.

The Commission considered the testimony at its public hearing regarding the concerns expressed by some of the area residents. For the block bounded by 154th and 157th streets, 9th Avenue, and Powell's Cove Boulevard, which is proposed to be rezoned from R2 to R2A and R1-2, the Commission notes the variety of building types and lot sizes on this block. Consequently, the Commission is modifying the application to have this block retain its existing R2 zoning. The Commission believes this modification is appropriate given the size and character of surrounding properties. For the property located at 20th Road and Francis Lewis Boulevard which had proposed to be split between R3-1 and R2A, the Commission believes it is appropriate to keep the property in one zoning district that would allow the owner to develop buildings which are in keeping with the surrounding built environment and is therefore modifying the application to retain the R3-1 zoning. The Commission also is modifying the application to retain the R2 zoning on the eastern blockfront of 160th Street between Powells Cove Boulevard and 9th Avenue as intended in the Department's proposal.

The Commission recognizes concerns voiced by several Beechhurst homeowners and the Councilmember regarding portions of the area that are being rezoning to R1-2. The Commission has asked the Department to study this area to determine if a subsequent rezoning is appropriate.

Finally, the Commission has determined that the proposed commercial overlay changes better reflect existing commercial development, and will prevent the expansion of potentially incompatible commercial uses onto residential side streets.

The Commission believes that the proposed zoning changes will continue to allow generally similar bulk for new residential buildings, but will ensure that they will be of a type, occupancy and scale more consistent with established development patterns.

RESOLUTION

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission finds that the action described herein will have no significant impact on the environment; and be it further

RESOLVED, that the City Planning Commission, in its capacity as the City Coastal Commission, has reviewed the waterfront aspects of the this application and finds that the proposed action is consistent with WRP policies; and be it further

RESOLVED, by the City Planning Commission, pursuant to Sections 197-c and 200 of the New York City Charter, that based on the environmental determinations and the consideration described in this report, the Zoning Resolution of the City of New York, effective December 15, 1961, and as subsequently amended, is further amended by changing the Zoning Map, Section Nos. 7b, 7d, 10a and 10c:

1. eliminating from an existing R2 District a C1-2 District bounded by 14th Avenue, 145th Place, a line 150 feet southeasterly of 14th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard;
2. eliminating from an existing R3-2 District a C1-2 District bounded by:
 - a. 19th Avenue, a line 150 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, Francis Lewis Boulevard, and Willets Point Boulevard; and
 - b. 19th Avenue, Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue, a line 150 feet westerly of Utopia

Parkway, 21st Avenue, a line midway between Utopia Parkway and 169th Street, 20th Avenue, and 169th Street;

3. eliminating from an existing R3-2 District a C2-2 District bounded by 10th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, a line 85 feet southeasterly of 10th Avenue, and Clintonville Street;
4. eliminating from an existing R4 District a C1-2 District bounded by 24th Road, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 169th Street, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 26th Avenue, and Francis Lewis Boulevard;
5. changing from an R2 District to an R1-2 District property bounded by:
 - a. the U.S. Pierhead Line, the northwesterly prolongation of a line 125 feet northeasterly of 149th Street, 2nd Avenue, 149th Street, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 2nd Avenue, 147th Place, 3rd Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 147th Street, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 3rd Avenue and its southwestly prolongation, the southwestly service road of Whitestone Expressway, the southeasterly boundary line of Francis Lewis Park and its southwestly prolongation, and the northeasterly boundary line of Francis Lewis Park and its northwesterly prolongation;
 - b. the U.S. Pierhead Line, a line 120 feet easterly of 161st Street and its northerly prolongation, Riverside Drive and its easterly centerline prolongation, 159th Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 154th Place, Riverside Drive, and 158th Street and its northerly centerline prolongation; and
 - c. a line 100 feet southerly of 9th Avenue, 162nd Street, 14th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 166th Street, a line 100 feet northwesterly of Cryders Lane, Totten Street, Cryders Lane, 166th Street, a line 95 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, 165th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, a line 100 feet westerly of 165th Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 14th Road, 164th Street, the northerly service road of the Cross Island Parkway, a line midway between 161st Street and 162nd Street, a line perpendicular to the easterly street line of 161st Street distant 175 feet southerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the easterly street line of 161st Street and the southeasterly street line of Cryders Lane, 161st Street, Cryders Lane, 158th Street, a line perpendicular to the westerly street line of 158th Street distant 100 feet northerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the westerly street line of 158th Street and the northwesterly street line of Cryders Lane, a line midway between 157th Street and 158th Street, 14th Avenue, and a line 100 feet westerly of 160th Street;

6. changing from an R3-2 District to an R2 District property bounded by the U.S. Pierhead Line, the northerly prolongation of a line 100 feet westerly of 151st Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 6th Avenue, 150th Street, and a line perpendicular to the southeasterly centerline prolongation of 150th Street at its intersection with the northwesterly street line of 150th Street;

7. changing from an R2 District to an R2A District property bounded by:
 - a. a line 100 feet southeasterly of 3rd Avenue and its southwesterly prolongation, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 147th Street, 3rd Avenue, 147th Place, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 2nd Avenue, 149th Street, 3rd Avenue, 150th Street, 6th Avenue, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 151st Street, 7th Avenue, Powell's Cove Boulevard and its easterly centerline prolongation, a line 100 feet easterly of 152nd Street, 10th Avenue, 152nd Street, 11th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 10th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, 11th Avenue, 150th Street, a line 110 feet southeasterly of 11th Avenue, 148th Street, the northeasterly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 14th Avenue, 148th Street, 15th Avenue, 147th Street, 17th Avenue, Parsons Boulevard, 15th Avenue, 144th Place, 14th Avenue, the easterly service road of Whitestone Expressway, 15th Avenue and its northeasterly and westerly centerline prolongation, the westerly street line of former 138th Street, the southerly boundary line of Frank Golden Memorial Park, the easterly street line of 132nd Street, the easterly centerline prolongation of 15th Avenue, 132nd Street, 14th Avenue, 133rd Place, 11th Avenue, 138th Street, 13th Avenue, 143rd Street and its northerly centerline prolongation, 14th Avenue, 144th Street, the westerly service road of Whitestone Expressway, the northeasterly prolongation of the southerly street line of North Drive, and the southwesterly service road of Whitestone Expressway;

 - b. 12th Road, 152nd Street, 12th Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of 154th Street, 10th Avenue, 154th Street, 9th Avenue, a line 100 feet easterly of 160th Street, Powell's Cove Boulevard, 162nd Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 9th Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of 160th Street, 14th Avenue, a line midway between 157th Street and 158th Street, a line perpendicular to the westerly street line of 158th Street distant 100 feet northerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the westerly street line of 158th Street and the northwesterly street line of Cryders Lane, 158th Street, Cryders Lane, 161st Street, a line perpendicular to the easterly street line of 161st Street distant 175 feet southerly (as measured along the street line) from the point of intersection of the easterly street line of 161st Street and the southeasterly street line of Cryders Lane, a line midway between 161st Street and 162nd Street, the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, a line 100 feet westerly of 154th Street, 14th Road, and Clintonville Street;

 - c. a line 100 feet northerly of 12th Avenue, 166th Street, 12th Avenue, Utopia Parkway, the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 164th Street, a line

100 feet southerly of 14th Road, a line 100 feet westerly of 165th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, 165th Street, a line 95 feet northerly of Cross Island Parkway, 166th Street, Cryders Lane, Totten Street, a line 100 feet northwesterly of Cryders Lane, a line 100 feet northeasterly of 166th Street, 14th Avenue, and 162nd Street; and

- d. 24th Avenue, Murray Street, a line midway between 23rd Avenue and 24th Avenue, a line 200 feet westerly of 154th Street, 23rd Avenue, 154th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, 157th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of 22nd Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, 22nd Avenue, a line 100 feet easterly of 160th Street, a line 95 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, 23rd Avenue, 166th Street, 21st Road, 163rd Street, 20th Road, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 150 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 19th Avenue, 163rd Street and its northerly centerline prolongation, a line 100 feet northerly of 19th Avenue, 166th Street, a line 100 feet northerly of 20th Avenue, 169th Street, 20th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, a line midway between Utopia Parkway and 169th Street, 21st Avenue, a line 150 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue and its easterly centerline prolongation, the southeasterly and southwesterly boundary line of Clearview Park and its southeasterly prolongation, 26th Avenue, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 169th Street, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 24th Road, 166th Street, 25th Avenue, and a line 100 feet westerly of Murray Street;

8. changing from an R3-1 District to an R2A District property bounded by:

- a. 17th Avenue, 147th Street, 18th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard;
- b. 21st Avenue, a line 100 feet easterly of 154th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, 154th Street, 23rd Avenue, a line 200 feet westerly of 154th Street, a line midway between 23rd Avenue and 24th Avenue, and Murray Street ;
- c. 17th Avenue, Francis Lewis Boulevard, 160th Street, 20th Road, a line 75 feet easterly of 157th Street, 20th Avenue, a line 530 feet westerly of 160th Street, 19th Avenue, a line 280 feet southwesterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 18th Avenue, a line 265 feet southwesterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 17th Road, and 157th Street; and
- d. 20th Road, 163rd Street, 21st Avenue, and a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard;

9. changing from an R3-2 District to an R2A District property bounded by:

- a. 14th Avenue, 144th Place, 15th Avenue, and the easterly service road of the Whitestone Expressway;

- b. the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, a line 125 feet westerly of 159th Street, a line 200 feet northerly of 16th Avenue, 159th Street and its southerly centerline prolongation, 17th Avenue, and Francis Lewis Boulevard and its northwesterly centerline prolongation;
 - c. the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 166th Street, 16th Avenue, Willets Point Boulevard, 16th Road, and 163rd Street;
 - d. a line 100 feet northerly of 19th Avenue, 163rd Street and its northerly centerline prolongation, 19th Avenue, a line 150 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 100 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 19th Avenue, and Willets Point Boulevard;
 - e. 20th Avenue, a line 150 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, and a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, and
 - f. 21st Avenue, a line midway between Utopia Parkway and 169th Street, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue, and a line 150 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway;
10. changing from an R3-1 District to an R3A District property bounded by 16th Avenue, 147th Street, 15th Avenue, 148th Street, 14th Avenue, the northerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, Clintonville Street, the southerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 15th Drive, Murray Street, 17th Avenue, Clintonville Street, 157th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of 154th Street, 21st Avenue, Murray Street, 24th Avenue, Willets Point Boulevard, a line 95 feet easterly of 150th Street, a line midway between 18th Avenue and 19th Avenue, a line 95 feet westerly of 150th Street, 22nd Avenue, 149th Street, a line 110 feet southerly of 23rd Avenue, 146th Street, 20th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard;
11. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3A District property bounded by:
- a. a line 150 feet southerly of 21st Avenue, 146th Street, a line 110 feet southerly of 23rd Avenue, a line 75 feet westerly of 146th Street, a line 100 feet southerly of 24th Avenue, a line 150 feet easterly of Parsons Boulevard, 24th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard; and
 - b. Willets Point Boulevard, 24th Avenue, a line 100 feet westerly of Murray Street, a line midway between 24th Avenue and 24th Road, and a line 100 feet easterly of 150th street;
12. changing from an R2 District to an R3X District property bounded by Clintonville Street, 163rd Street, 23rd Avenue, a line 95 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, and a line 100 feet easterly of 160th Street;

13. changing from an R3-1 District to an R3X District property bounded by 20th Road, Francis Lewis Boulevard, 163rd Street, Clintonville Street, and 160th Street;
14. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3X District property bounded by the southerly service road of Cross Island Parkway, 202nd Street, the southwesterly prolongation of the northwesterly boundary line of Clearview Park, the southwesterly boundary line of Clearview Park, 19th Avenue and its northeasterly centerline prolongation, 201st Street, 17th Avenue, 100th Street, 16th Avenue, Utopia Parkway, a line 80 feet northerly of 17th Road, a line 95 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway, 17th Road, and 166th Street;
15. changing from an R2 District to an R3-1 District property bounded by:
 - a. Willets Point Boulevard, Clintonville Street, 22nd Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, a line 100 feet northerly of 22nd Avenue, and 157th Street; and
 - b. 21st Road, 166th Street, 23rd Avenue, and 163rd Street;
16. changing from an R3-2 District to an R3-1 District property bounded by:
 - a. 21st Avenue and its westerly centerline prolongation, Parsons Boulevard, 24th Avenue, a line 150 feet easterly of Parsons Boulevard, a line 100 feet southerly of 24th Avenue, a line 75 feet westerly of 146th Street, a line 110 feet southerly of 23rd Avenue, 146th Street, Willets Point Boulevard, 25th Road and its westerly centerline prolongation, and the westerly service road of the Whitestone Expressway; and
 - b. Willets Point Boulevard, a line 100 feet easterly of 150th Street, a line midway between 24th Avenue and 24th Road, a line 100 feet westerly of Murray Street, and 25th Avenue;
17. changing from an R2 District to an R3-2 District property bounded by:
 - a. 11th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, a line midway between 11th Avenue and 12th Avenue, and a line 250 feet northeasterly of 150th Street; and
 - b. 11th Avenue, 152nd Street, 12th Road, Clintonville Street, a line midway between 12th Avenue and 12th Road;
18. changing from an R3-1 District to an R3-2 District property bounded by Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, and 160th Street;
19. establishing within a proposed R2A District a C1-2 District bounded by 13th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 14th Road, and Clintonville Street;
20. establishing within a proposed R2A District a C1-3 District bounded by:

- a. 14th Avenue, 145th Place, a line 100 feet southeasterly of 14th Avenue, and Parsons Boulevard; and
 - b. 12th Road, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 14th Avenue, and Clintonville Street;
21. establishing within an existing R3-2 District a C1-3 District bounded by:
- a. 19th Avenue, a line 100 feet southeasterly of Willets Point Boulevard, 20th Avenue, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 20th Road, Francis Lewis Boulevard, and Willets Point Boulevard; and
 - b. 21st Road, Utopia Parkway, 22nd Avenue, and a line 100 feet southwesterly of Utopia Parkway;
22. establishing within a proposed R3-2 District a C2-2 District bounded by:
- a. 11th Avenue, a line 100 feet southwesterly of Clintonville Street, a line midway between 11th Avenue and 12th Avenue, and a line 250 feet northeasterly of 150th Street; and
 - b. a line midway between 12th Avenue and 12th Road, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Clintonville Street, 12th Road, and Clintonville Street;
23. establishing within an existing R4 District a C1-3 District bounded by 24th Road, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 169th Street, a line 100 feet northeasterly of Francis Lewis Boulevard, 26th Avenue, and Francis Lewis Boulevard;

Borough of Queens, Community District 7, as shown on a diagram (for illustrative purposes only) dated August 22, 2005, and modified on December 7, 2005, and which includes CEQR designation E-153.

The above resolution (C 060055 ZMQ), duly adopted by the City Planning Commission on December 7, 2005 (Calendar No. 11), is filed with the Office of the Speaker, City Council and the Borough President in accordance with the requirements of Section 197-d of the New York City Charter.

AMANDA M. BURDEN, AICP, Chair
KENNETH J. KNUCKLES, Esq., Vice Chairman
ANGELA M. BATTAGLIA, IRWIN G. CANTOR, P.E., ANGELA R. CAVALUZZI, R.A.,
ALFRED C. CERULLO, III, RICHARD W. EADDY, JANE D. GOL, LISA A. GOMEZ,
CHRISTOPHER KUI, JOHN MEROLO, KAREN A. PHILLIPS, DOLLY WILLIAMS,
Commissioners