

AUDIT REPORT



CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER
BUREAU OF FINANCIAL AUDIT
WILLIAM C. THOMPSON, JR., COMPTROLLER

Analysis of the Financial and Operating Practices of Union-Administered Benefit Funds With Fiscal Years Ending in Calendar Year 2005

FM07-067S

December 28, 2007



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER
1 CENTRE STREET
NEW YORK, N.Y. 10007-2341

WILLIAM C. THOMPSON, JR.
COMPTROLLER

To the Citizens of the City of New York

Ladies and Gentlemen:

In accordance with the responsibilities of the Comptroller contained in Chapter 5, §93, of the New York City Charter, my office performed a comparative analysis of the overall financial activities of union-administered benefit funds whose fiscal years ended in calendar year 2005.

New York City contributed approximately \$979.8 million to 116 welfare, retiree, and annuity funds whose fiscal years ended during calendar year 2005. Benefit funds provide City employees, retirees, and dependents with a variety of supplemental health benefits not provided under City-administered health insurance plans. We review funds such as these to provide fund trustees and other interested parties with a means of comparing the administrative and benefit expenses of similar-sized funds.

I trust that this report contains information that is of interest to you. If you have any questions concerning this report, please contact my audit bureau at audit@Comptroller.nyc.gov or telephone my office at 212-669-3747.

Very truly yours,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'William C. Thompson, Jr.'.

William C. Thompson, Jr.

WCT/fh

Report FM07-067S
Filed: December 28, 2007

Table of Contents

REPORT IN BRIEF	1
Findings and Conclusions	2
Recommendations	6
INTRODUCTION	8
Background	8
Oversight Mechanisms	12
Objective	12
Scope of Analysis	13
FUND EXPENSES	14
High Percentages of Revenue Spent on Administration.....	17
Low Percentages of Revenue Spent on Administration	20
Funds with Improved Administrative Expenses-to-Revenue Ratios.....	22
Annuity Funds: Administrative Expenses.....	23
Administrative Expenses vs. Total Expenses.....	24
EXPENDITURES FOR BENEFITS	25
RESERVE LEVELS	29
OPERATING DEFICITS	32
ANALYSIS OF TOTAL REVENUE	34
Certain Funds Should Address Financial and Operating Issues to Ensure Maximum Use of Revenue and Continued Financial Stability	35
EXCEPTIONS ON FUND OPERATIONS	37
Eligibility Delay.....	37
CPA Opinions.....	38
Consolidation of Professional Services.....	40
Late Submission of Directive #12 Reports	40
Field Audit of Funds	41
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	45

EXHIBITS:

- A. Schedule of Official Fund Names
- B. Schedule of Financial Data
- C. Schedule of Administrative Expenses
- D. Schedule of Available Benefits
- E. Schedule of Benefit Fund Ratios

APPENDICES:

- A. Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12
- B. Commonly Found Unacceptable Practices of Welfare Funds
- C. Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds Issued in Fiscal Years 1985–2007
- D. Funds Using Common Professional Service Providers

*The City of New York
Office of the Comptroller
Bureau of Financial Audit*

**Analysis of the
Financial and Operating Practices of
Union-Administered Benefit Funds
With Fiscal Years Ending in
Calendar Year 2005**

FM07-067S

REPORT IN BRIEF

The purpose of this report is to provide comparative analysis of the overall financial activities of the 97 union-administered active and retiree welfare, education, and annuity funds that receive City contributions and is based on our analyses of individual funds.

The City of New York contributed approximately \$979.8 million to the 116 union-administered annuity, active, and retiree welfare funds with fiscal years ending during calendar year 2005. The benefit funds were established under the provisions of collective bargaining agreements between the unions and the City of New York. Benefit funds provide City employees, retirees, and dependents with a variety of supplemental health benefits not provided under City-administered health insurance plans, including dental care, optical care, and prescription drug benefits. Other benefits are provided at the discretion of the individual funds. Annual contributions to the welfare funds for full-time employees ranged from \$900 to \$1,885 per employee during 2005.

Accountability for fund expenditures is a contractual requirement: the funds must be audited annually by a certified public accountant (retained by the funds); the funds must submit an annual statement showing their "condition and affairs" in the form prescribed by the City Comptroller; and the funds must provide an annual report to each employee covered by the fund.

In November 1977, the Comptroller's Office published the first Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12 that contained uniform reporting and auditing requirements for benefit funds. In 1997, Directive #12 was revised to include provisions that modified fund reporting requirements, required assessments of consultant services, modified the criteria for contracting services through competitive bids, and expanded the requirements for hiring independent certified public accountants to audit the funds.

The information generated as a result of Directive #12 reporting requirements provide a basis for our comparative analyses of fund operations to identify deviations from the norm. To perform these analyses, we compute certain expense and benefit category averages that are used to

compare funds of similar size; our results can then be used by fund trustees and administrators to perform their own internal analyses.

This is the Comptroller's 26th report related to the data received in response to Directive #12. The analysis is based on the financial activities of benefit funds receiving contributions from the City during calendar year 2005. Annual reports from these funds are usually delayed at least one year because, according to Directive #12, the funds have up to nine months after the close of their fiscal years (some of which end on December 31) to submit the required data.

We reviewed the financial information provided by 115 of the 116 funds that received City contributions during 2005; one fund (Local 1183, Board of Elections) was excluded from this analysis because it failed to submit the financial information required under Comptroller's Directive #12. (Exhibit A at the end of this report lists each fund by its official and its abbreviated name.) However, the computation of category averages and our other financial analyses were limited to the 97 funds that received City contributions during each fund's 2005 Fiscal Year (most of the funds' Fiscal Years ended in either June or December of 2005), approximately \$951.4 million in total. Fourteen funds that received a substantial portion of their revenues from sources other than the City, one College Scholarship Fund that provides benefits only to high school students, and three funds with a different fiscal year-ends than their associated welfare funds were not included in either the computation of category averages or in the financial analyses, since they would have distorted the results. (These funds are listed separately in Exhibit B.)

As of the end of their 2005 Fiscal Years, the welfare funds' net assets available for 87 plan benefits totaled \$1.3 billion, and the 29 annuity funds had a net fund balance of approximately \$4.1 billion.

Findings and Conclusions

As in previous reviews of the financial data submitted by the funds for the past 26 years, there were variations in the amounts spent for administrative purposes although, in certain instances, there was a clear indication that these expenses were reduced. Some of the funds cited in our 2004 report for spending higher-than-average amounts on administration remain in that same category in 2005, while other funds were added to this category because their administrative costs increased in 2005. In 2005, \$80.1 million (7.5 percent) of total revenue for all funds was spent on administration, as compared to \$78.5 million (7.2 percent) spent on administration in 2004. The percentage of total revenue spent on administration varied among funds, reflecting the broad discretion exercised by each fund's Board of Trustees.

As before, several welfare funds expended lower-than-average amounts for benefits and maintained high reserves. In addition, the benefit expenditures of each of 12 funds exceeded its individual total revenues, causing the funds to dip into their reserves. The use of reserves to provide benefits may indicate that the benefits provided were not evaluated in relation to the resources available to the funds. Reserves held by funds provide a cushion if claims for benefits exceed revenues in any given year. In the past, the Comptroller's Office has used general guidelines of 100 percent of revenue for insured funds and 200 percent of revenue for self-insured funds as reasonable levels for welfare fund reserves. High reserves are an indication of a fund's financial

viability, but may also indicate that a fund is not providing as many benefits to its members as it could. Moreover, in 2005, 30 of 73 active and retiree welfare funds in our analysis incurred operating deficits totaling \$24.9 million, which reduced their available reserves. The deficits ranged from \$3,062 to \$8.8 million.

In summary, we identified the following financial issues that should be addressed:

- The expenses of certain funds exceeded their revenues, resulting in operating deficits. Operating deficits could deplete fund reserves, which could ultimately lead to insolvency.
- Certain funds spent a large percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses. Reducing administrative expenses would allow funds to increase benefits for members.
- Certain funds had large operating surpluses resulting in high reserves. Excess reserves may indicate that funds should increase members' benefits.

The chart on the following page lists those funds with financial issues (indicated in the shaded areas of the chart) that should be addressed by fund management.

Funds with Potential Financial Problems
(Problem Areas Highlighted)

FUNDS	TOTAL REVENUE	OVERALL EXPENSES	SURPLUS OR OPERATING (DEFICIT)	ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSE		BENEFITS EXPENSE		FUND BALANCE			RISK OF INSOLVENCY (SEE LEGEND)
				Total	% of Rev.	Total	% of Rev.	Total	% of Rev.	Balance / Deficit*	
Local 832 Teamsters RWF	\$ 166,660	\$ 201,381	\$ (34,721)	\$ 33,220	19.93%	\$ 168,161	100.9%	\$ (101,161)	I	I	I
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	6,651,697	7,445,432	(793,735)	395,752	5.95	7,049,680	105.98	168,835	2.54	21.27	P
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	25,937,497	28,911,752	(2,974,255)	1,267,765	4.89	27,643,987	106.58	3,736,195	14.40	125.62	ST
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust WF	79,609	147,060	(67,451)	19,875	24.97	127,185	159.76	75,590	94.95	112.07	ST
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF	1,319,148	1,436,446	(117,298)	109,878	8.33	1,326,568	100.56	205,657	15.59	175.33	ST
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers RWF	7,086,027	8,998,540	(1,912,513)	465,236	6.57	8,533,304	120.42	4,059,212	57.28	212.24	MT
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	161,064	186,061	(24,997)	4,262	2.65	181,799	112.87	58,279	36.18	233.14	MT
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	270,748	393,049	(122,301)	66,805	24.67	326,244	120.50	903,770	333.80	738.97	LT
United Probation Officers Association WF	1,307,776	1,452,457	(144,681)	268,645	20.54	1,183,812	90.52	1,911,459	146.16	1,321.15	LT
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	340,368	447,465	(107,097)	47,881	14.07	399,584	117.40	366,106	107.56	341.85	LT
Local 14A-14B IUOE WF/RWF	132,065	92,106	39,959	34,036	25.77	58,070	43.97	770,658	583.54	-	N
Local 15A-C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	597,277	322,482	274,795	94,589	15.84	227,893	38.16	5,204,590	871.39	-	N

Legend

I - Insolvent

N - Currently not at Risk of Insolvency

P - Possible Risk of Insolvency in less than 1 year

ST - Short-term Risk of Insolvency within 1 - 2 years

MT - Mid-term Risk of Insolvency between 2- 3 years

LT - Long-term Risk of Insolvency greater than 3 years

*A ratio estimating the number of years that a fund can operate before being "in the red" if all factors remain constant. For example, "101%" would indicate the fund has approximately one year before becoming insolvent.

Fund managers have a fiduciary responsibility to provide optimum benefits to members while keeping administrative costs to a minimum. A fund that accumulates excessive reserves or expends large amounts for administrative costs does not achieve its basic goal of providing optimum benefits to members. The trustees of these funds should evaluate how their funds could be better operated.

This report's exhibits and appendices can be a starting point for fund trustees and administrators to identify areas for cost reduction or other appropriate action to ensure financial stability. No conclusions should be drawn from any single exhibit in this report. For example, even though an exhibit might show that a particular fund's benefit expenses exceeded its revenues; this might not be a problem if the fund has sufficient or high reserves. On the other hand, funds incurring high administrative costs relative to other funds of a similar size should review their costs carefully and reduce them whenever possible.

In addition, we identified other issues that should be addressed:

Eligibility Delay

The intent of the standard benefit fund agreements between the City and the unions is that welfare fund benefits be available during each member's entire period of employment with the City. Thus, the funds should make their members eligible for benefits beginning on their first day of employment with the City. However, two funds (Local 237 Teamsters Welfare Fund and District Council 9 Painters Industry Welfare Fund) delay eligibility for their members to receive benefits for a maximum of 30 days and 90 days, respectively. Consequently, members or their dependents who may be in need of benefits during the funds' waiting periods are precluded from obtaining such benefits.

CPA Opinions

Directive #12 requires that all welfare, retiree, annuity, and affiliated funds receiving City contributions have their financial statements audited annually by certified public accountants. Each audit must include a complete examination in accordance with generally accepted auditing standards, whereby an opinion is expressed on the financial statements taken as a whole. Further, the fund agreements between the City and the unions require the preparation of each fund's financial statements on the accrual basis of accounting and in conformance with generally accepted accounting principles (GAAP). Of the 97 funds reviewed, 10 received adverse opinions and 5 received qualified opinions from their independent auditors because their financial statements were not in compliance with GAAP. (The 15 funds as well as the specific issues raised in the CPA reports are detailed on pages 38 to 40 of this report.)

Consolidation of Professional Services

Most funds receiving City contributions enter into contracts with various professional providers for services such as accounting-auditing and legal counsel. Many funds use the same professional service provider for similar services. (Appendix D lists the funds using the same providers for similar professional services.) Trustees of funds using the same providers for similar services may reduce their funds' administrative expenses by negotiating future contracts jointly.

Late Submission of Directive #12 Reports

In 2005, 69 of the 97 funds (71.1 percent) in our analysis did not submit their Directive #12 reports in a timely manner. Comptroller's Directive #12 requires that within nine months after the close of a fund's fiscal year, each fund's trustees must submit a report with the City Comptroller showing the fund's condition and affairs during its preceding fiscal year. The Directive #12 reports provide a basis for a timely comparative analysis of fund operations and for the identification of deviations from the norm.

Field Audits of Funds

In addition to analyzing Directive #12 submissions, the Comptroller's Office periodically performs audits of the financial and operating practices of selected funds. There were 79 audit reports issued by the Comptroller's Office during Fiscal Years 1985-2007. (These audits are listed in Appendix C at the end of the report.) During Fiscal Year 2007, we issued the following two reports:

- Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Local 333 Insurance Fund for New York City Employees, Report # FL05-090A
- Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Local 333 Retirement Insurance Fund for New York City Retirees, Report # FL05-091A

(See pages 41 to 44 of this report for details regarding these two audits.)

Recommendations

As a result of our analysis, we make the following eight recommendations:

- Trustees of funds with high percentages of administrative costs to total revenue and/or low percentages of benefit expenses to total revenue should reduce administrative expenses and increase benefits to members.
- Trustees of funds using the same professional service providers for similar services should consider jointly negotiating future contracts with these providers to reduce administrative expenses through economies of scale.
- Trustees of the insolvent fund and funds with low reserve levels should take steps to ensure that their funds remain solvent. To accomplish this goal, funds should endeavor to reduce administrative expenses. If this is not possible or does not provide sufficient funds to ensure solvency, the trustees should attempt to reduce costs associated with benefits.
- Trustees of funds that are incurring significant operating deficits, particularly those with low reserve levels, should ensure that anticipated benefit and administrative expenses will not exceed projected total revenue.

- Trustees of funds with high reserve levels, particularly those whose funds spend less than average amounts of their revenue on benefits, should consider enhancing their members' benefits.
- Trustees of funds that delay members' eligibility for benefits beyond their first day of employment should revise their fund's policy to comply with their union's welfare fund agreement with the City.
- OLR (Office of Labor Relations) should recover the portion of City contributions from those funds that do not provide benefits to members from their first day of employment.
- OLR should use the information in this report to ensure that the trustees of the funds cited herein correct the conditions cited in adverse or qualified opinions received from their independent accountants.

INTRODUCTION

Background

New York City has provided various health insurance benefits to its employees since 1947. Since 1966, the City has provided its active employees, their families, and retirees with basic health and hospitalization coverage.

As a result of collective bargaining with the Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association in 1962, the City agreed to contribute \$56.50 per employee to the union's welfare fund allowance, in addition to health insurance benefits it provided directly. This allowance provided additional health insurance benefits. By 1971, managerial employees and most full-time employees represented by collective bargaining units received this benefit. In 1973, retirees and part-time employees became eligible to receive additional health benefits, subject to certain restrictions. In some cases separate funds were established for the retirees.

By 2005, the annual contributions to 116 union-administered welfare funds ranged from \$900 to \$1,885 per employee per year; the aggregate annual cost to the City (including contributions to annuity funds) was approximately \$979.8 million.

Pursuant to the collective bargaining agreements, City contributions are placed in legally established trusts administered by trustees appointed by the unions or associations. City officials, therefore, are not directly involved in fund administration.

The determination of types of benefits, amounts, deductibles, etc., is left to the trustees' discretion. The benefits provided are listed in the fund agreements between the City and the unions. Some funds now provide legal assistance and educational activities in addition to health benefits. Other funds, such as the Uniformed Officers' Funds, receive additional City contributions to operate Civil Legal Representation Funds that provide protection for their members from civil lawsuits. Some funds are self-insured; other funds provide most of their benefits through insurance companies. Typical benefits provided by funds to members and their families include the following:

- dental benefits—including regular exams, cleaning, X-rays, fluoride treatments, fillings, extractions, crowns, root canals, orthodontics, and other dental procedures;
- optical benefits for examinations and eyeglasses;
- prescription drug reimbursement;
- life insurance; and
- supplemental health and hospitalization.

In addition to contributing to the various welfare funds, the City contributes a dollar (or more) to annuity funds for each workday of uniformed employees and certain other workers on active duty. Upon retirement, death, or termination, an employee receives a lump sum distribution consisting of the City's contributions to the employee's annuity fund, plus any interest or other income earned, in addition to the employee's statutory City pension.

Nineteen funds received between \$1 million and \$3 million in City contributions in 2005, and 45 funds received more than \$3 million each. Of the 45 funds receiving more than \$3 million, 17 funds received more than \$10 million each from the City, accounting for approximately 77.3 percent of the City's contributions to benefit funds in 2005, as shown on Table I on the next page.

Table I
Funds Receiving More Than \$10 Million* in City Contributions in 2005

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>NYC Contributions**</u>
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF	\$244,087,662	\$240,828,208
District Council 37 WF	231,258,820	217,000,541
Patrolmen's Benevolent Association WF	40,126,751	36,070,021
Patrolmen's Benevolent Association RWF	32,235,896	31,630,277
Local 237 Teamsters WF	31,805,950	28,881,474
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	25,937,497	25,248,845
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF	23,552,409	23,370,588
Sergeants Benevolent Association (Police) WF/RWF	16,639,476	16,219,844
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Association RWF	16,158,000	15,469,814
Detectives Endowment Association RWF	14,797,060	14,250,107
Corrections Officers Benevolent Association WF	13,699,168	13,568,026
Local 237 Teamsters AF	18,174,629	13,402,752
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Association WF	15,834,884	13,174,001
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management WF	15,337,817	12,314,397
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	12,506,518	12,271,164
Patrolmen's Benevolent Association AF	20,088,001	12,101,227
New York State Nurses Association WF	<u>10,830,339</u>	<u>10,052,736</u>
Total	<u>\$783,070,877</u>	<u>\$735,854,022</u>

*This cutoff figure is arbitrary and used for descriptive purposes only. A cutoff to \$9 million would add another three funds to the list.

**The difference between Total Revenue and New York City contributions consists of revenue from interest, dividends, other employer contributions, investments, miscellaneous income and losses on investments.

RWF = Retiree Welfare Fund

WF = Welfare Fund

AF = Annuity Fund

We categorized the 116 funds covered in this report by size, as follows:

Table II
Number and Categories of Benefit Plans in Survey

<u>NYC Contributions</u>	<u>Active and Retiree Plans</u>	<u>Annuity</u>	<u>Total</u>
Less than \$100,000	4	2	6
\$100,000 to \$300,000	11	1	12
\$300,000 to \$ 1 million	13	2	15
\$1 million to \$3 million	13	6	19
\$3 million to \$10 million	17	11	28
\$10 million to \$20 million*	8	2	10
More than \$20 million*	7	0	7
Funds excluded from this analysis because they would have distorted the results	<u>14</u>	<u>5</u>	<u>19</u>
Total	<u>87</u>	<u>29</u>	<u>116</u>

*Local 621 SEIU Active and Retiree Welfare Funds are administered by Local 237 Teamsters' Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds, respectively. Therefore, Local 621's financial information was incorporated in the Local 237 fund financial information.

The 45 funds (insured, self-insured, and annuity) with City contributions of more than \$3 million (including the 17 listed in Table I with contributions of more than \$10 million) received approximately \$907.8 million from the City and provided benefits to the bulk of the City's work force. (Exhibit B details the revenues and expenses of all funds.) Fourteen funds that received a substantial portion of their revenues from sources other than the City, one College Scholarship Fund that provides benefits only to public high school students, and three funds with different fiscal year-ends than their associated welfare funds were not included in either the computation of category averages or in the financial analyses, since they would have distorted the results. In addition, one fund (Local 1183, Board of Elections) was excluded from this analysis because it failed to submit the financial information required under Comptroller's Directive #12. (These funds are listed separately in Exhibit B.)

Certain unions offer education, legal services, and disability benefits through separate funds. For purposes of this report, we consolidated these separate funds with their respective welfare-benefit funds.

Oversight Mechanisms

The funds' agreements with the City's Office of Labor Relations (OLR) provide the following oversight mechanisms to monitor the funds' financial and operating activities:

- The trustees are required to keep accurate records in conformance with generally accepted accounting principles. The funds are audited annually by a certified public accountant (CPA) selected by the trustees. Comptroller's Directive #12 strongly recommends that funds select independent certified public accountants through a competitive proposal process and that funds contract only with firms listed on the Comptroller's prequalified list of CPAs. Each CPA audit report must be submitted to the City Comptroller within nine months after the close of each fund's fiscal year. Funds are also subject to further audit by the City Comptroller.
- Nine months after the close of its fiscal year, each fund's trustees must file a report with the City Comptroller showing the fund's "condition and affairs" during its fiscal year.¹ The report must contain information as prescribed in Comptroller's Directive #12. In addition, an annual membership report must be mailed to all fund members. This report summarizes the financial condition of the fund.

In 1977, the Comptroller's Office published the first Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12 that contained uniform reporting and auditing requirements for the benefit funds. (The Comptroller's Directives are used to establish policies governing internal controls, accountability, and financial reporting.)

In addition to providing a uniform reporting mechanism, Directive #12 requires that the funds' CPAs prepare management letters commenting upon weaknesses in internal and management controls that were identified during their audits. Further, the Directive requests comments on management matters, such as investment policies, bidding practices, staff utilization, and accounting allocations. Directive #12 also requires that every year, each fund report the percentage of administrative costs to total annual revenue. Overall, this percentage is expected to be "reasonable."

The revised Directive #12 in use during Fiscal Year 2005, which is attached as Appendix A, became effective on July 1, 1997, and is the most current version of Comptroller's Directive #12.

Objective

Our objective was to provide comparative data on the overall financial activities of the 97 union-administered active and retiree welfare, education, and annuity funds that received City contributions during the Fund's Fiscal Year 2005.

¹ The main component of the "condition and affairs" is the financial statements, which are audited and certified by an independent CPA firm. Most of the other documents (i.e., Administrative and Benefit Expense Schedules) include various calculations derived from information contained in the financial statements.

Scope of Analysis

This is the 26th report issued by the Comptroller's Office on the financial operations of union-administered welfare, retiree welfare, and annuity funds. This report is based upon Fiscal Year 2005 financial reports and other information filed by the various funds with the City Comptroller's Office, as required by Comptroller's Directive #12.

The purpose of this report is to provide comparative analysis of the overall financial activities of the funds and their benefits. The individual analyses also provide a means of viewing accountability of the fund trustees and administrators in reference to fund expenditures, by supplementing each fund's required CPA audit.

We reviewed the financial information provided by 115 of the 116 funds that received City contributions during Fiscal Year 2005; one fund (Local 1183, Board of Elections) was excluded from this analysis because it failed to submit the financial information required under Comptroller's Directive #12. (Exhibit A at the end of this report lists each fund by their official and abbreviated names.) However, the computation of category averages and our other financial analysis was limited to 97 funds, which received approximately \$951.4 million in total City contributions during each fund's 2005 Fiscal Year (most of the funds' fiscal years ended in either June or December of 2005). Fourteen funds were excluded since they receive a substantial portion of their revenues from sources other than the City; one College Scholarship Fund was excluded since it only provides benefits to high school students; and three funds with different fiscal year-ends than their associated welfare fund, were not included in this financial analysis because they would have distorted the results.

Our examination was performed in accordance with the City Comptroller's responsibilities under Chapter 5, §93, of the New York City Charter, and under the provisions of agreements between the City and the individual unions.

FUND EXPENSES

For purposes of this report, benefit expenses include costs directly associated with providing benefits to members, such as salaries or other payments to attorneys who provide direct legal services to members; instructors who conduct in-house training for members; and physicians who examine members for worker's disability purposes. Administrative expenses include salaries for fund employees; insurance company retention fees; overhead costs involved in doing business (i.e., costs associated with processing claims); rent for office space and office expenses; professional fees paid for legal, accounting, and consultant services; and travel and conference expenditures. (See Exhibit C for a breakdown of Administrative Expenses.)

In 2005, about \$80.1 million (7.5 percent) of total revenue was spent on administering the funds as compared to \$78.5 million (7.2 percent) in 2004. The largest single component—salaries for administrative and clerical staff—totaling \$34.1 million—represented 42.6 percent of total administrative expenses in 2005. Other major administrative expenses included \$7 million for rent, \$9.9 million for office expenses, \$780,735 for insurance retention charges, \$6 million for investment and custodial services, \$13.8 million for consultant services, and \$3.6 million for legal, accounting, and auditing services.

Funds provide benefits on an insured or self-insured basis. Whether a fund is insured or self-insured affects the level of its reported administrative expenses significantly. Self-insured funds categorize claims processing costs as administrative expenses. In contrast, insured funds include most claims processing costs as part of their insurance premiums and thus categorize them as benefit expenses. Therefore, reported administrative expenses of insured funds are generally lower than those of self-insured funds. To make insured and self-insured funds more comparable, we transferred insurance company retention charges to administrative costs wherever possible.

For comparison purposes, we categorized the funds into the following three groups:

- insured active and retiree welfare funds (we classified a fund as insured if at least 80 percent of its benefits were provided by insurance companies rather than directly by the fund),
- self-insured active and retiree welfare funds, and
- annuity funds.

Current City contracts do not specify what portion of the funds' total revenue may be reasonably spent on administrative expenses. In the absence of such guidelines, we calculated the average for each fund category (based on funds of similar size), thus enabling us to isolate those funds whose administrative expenses deviated significantly from the averages. Tables III and IV indicate, by category, the average amount and percentages of total revenue expended by the 97 funds on administrative costs and the range of such percentages in 2005.

Table III
Average Amount and Percentage of Total Revenue
Spent by 97 Funds on Administration

<u>City Revenue</u>	<u>Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>			<u>Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>			<u>Annuity Funds</u>		
	<u>Number^(A)</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Number</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Number</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>
Less than \$100,000	(3)	\$ 3,107	5.37%	(1)	\$ 18,818	19.56%	(2)	\$ 24,614	22.30%
\$100,000 to \$300,000	(2)	19,149	13.07	(9)	36,848	16.22	(1)	54,610	20.54
\$300,000 to \$1 million	(3)	97,403	18.36	(10)	118,799	15.52	(2)	132,315	13.68
\$1 million to \$3 million	(0)	N/A	N/A	(13)	154,274	9.37	(6)	131,164	5.78
\$3 million to \$10 million	(0)	N/A	N/A	(17)	565,001	8.08	(11)	502,934	4.67
\$10 million to \$20 million	(0)	N/A	N/A	(8)	1,026,709	7.09	(2)	763,042	3.99
More than \$20 million	(1)	1,267,765	4.89	(6)	8,158,048	8.12	(0)	N/A	N/A
Overall Average 2005	(9)	\$ 178,621	5.74%	(64)	\$1,098,609	8.09%	(24)	\$342,242	4.75%
Overall Average 2004	(8)	\$ 302,990	9.20%	(66)	\$1,030,296	8.27%	(24)	\$335,459	3.38%

N/A – Not Applicable

(A) Figures in parenthesis represent the number of funds in each category.

Table IV
Ranges of Percentages of Total Revenue
Spent by 97 Funds on Administration

<u>City Revenue</u>	<u>Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>	<u>Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>	<u>Annuity Funds</u>
Less than \$100,000	2.44% to 11.98%	19.56%	0.00%* to 27.35%
\$100,000 to \$300,000	2.65 to 25.77	7.20 to 24.97	20.54
\$300,000 to \$1 million	14.30 to 23.06	10.80 to 20.60	10.80 to 15.80
\$1 million to \$3 million	N/A	4.99 to 20.54	4.61 to 9.73
\$3 million to \$10 million	N/A	3.98 to 15.91	0.44 to 10.44
\$10 million to \$20 million	N/A	3.41 to 13.63	3.74 to 4.21
<u>More than \$20 million</u>	<u>4.89</u>	<u>7.22 to 10.99</u>	<u>N/A</u>
Overall Average 2005	5.74%	8.09%	4.75%
Overall Average 2004	9.20%	8.27%	3.38%

N/A – Not Applicable

* One fund's administrative costs were paid by either the welfare fund or the union.

High Percentage of Revenue Spent on Administration

Tables V and VI list selected insured and self-insured active and retiree welfare funds with significantly higher percentages of revenue spent on administration than their respective category averages for 2005.

Table V
Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds with
High Administrative Expense-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>Less than \$100,000</u>			
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	5.37%	11.98%	123.09%
<u>\$100,000 to \$300,000</u>			
Local 14A-14B IUOE WF/RWF*	13.07%	25.77%	97.17%
<u>\$300,000 to \$1 Million</u>			
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees RWF	18.36%	23.06%	25.60%

* This fund also incurred higher than average administrative costs in 2004.

Table VI
Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With High Administrative Cost-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>\$100,000 to \$300,000</u>			
Local No. 5 Mncpl. Employees Benefit Trust Fund WF*	16.22	24.97	53.95
Local 3 IBEW City Employees Welfare Fund	16.22	24.67	52.10
Local 858 IBT (OTB) Branch Office Managers WF*	16.22	24.02	48.09
Local 832 Teamsters RWF*	16.22	19.93	22.87
<u>\$300,000 to \$1 million</u>			
Doctors Council RWF*	15.52	20.60	32.73
Doctors Council WF*	15.52	19.88	28.09
United Probation Officers Association RWF*	15.52	19.55	25.97
<u>\$1 million to \$3 million</u>			
United Probation Officers Association WF*	9.37	20.54	119.21
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF	9.37	13.55	44.61
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	9.37	11.82	26.15
<u>\$3 million to \$10 million</u>			
House Staff Comm. of Interns & Residents WF*	8.08	15.91	96.91
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF*	8.08	14.32	77.23
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefit WF/RWF*	8.08	13.88	71.78
Organization of Staff Analysts WF	8.08	11.55	42.95
<u>\$10 Million to \$20 Million</u>			
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management WF*	7.09	13.63	92.24
Local 237 Teamsters RWF*	7.09	12.45	75.60
<u>Over \$20 Million</u>			
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF*	8.12	10.99	35.34

*These funds also incurred higher-than-average administrative costs in 2004.

Without full audits of the individual funds, it is impossible to determine why these funds' administrative costs exceeded their category averages.

Table VII shows certain funds that have increased the percentage of their revenues spent on administration.

Table VII
High Percentage Increase of Revenue
Spent on Administration

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percentages</u>		<u>Percentage</u>
	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>Increase</u>
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters WF	1.44%	2.44%	69.44%
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF	7.03	10.92	55.33
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	16.74	24.67	47.37
District No. 1 MEBA Benefit Fund Trust WF/AF	4.97	7.20	44.87
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	9.77	14.07	44.01
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	11.71	15.98	36.46
New York City Retiree WF	3.96	5.01	26.52
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	6.43	7.93	23.33
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust Fund WF	20.44	24.97	22.16

Without full audits of the individual funds, it is impossible to determine why these funds' administrative costs increased in 2005.

**Low Percentages of Revenue
Spent on Administration**

Tables VIII and IX show selected insured and self-insured active and retiree welfare funds operating with substantially lower-than-average percentages of revenue spent on administration than their respective category averages for 2005.

Table VIII
Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With Low Administrative Cost-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percentages</u>		
	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>Less than \$100,000</u>			
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters WF	5.37%	2.44%	(54.56%)
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters RWF	5.37	3.23	(39.85)
<u>\$100,000 to \$300,000</u>			
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Association WF*	13.07	2.65	(79.72)

*The fund also had lower than average administrative costs in 2004.

Table IX
Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With Low Administrative Cost-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percentages</u>	
		<u>Actual</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
<u>\$100,000 to \$300,000</u>			
District No. 1 MEBA Benefit Fund Trust WF/AF*	16.22%	7.20%	(55.61%)
NYC Municipal Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF*	16.22	7.93	(51.11)
<u>\$1 million to \$3 million</u>			
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF*	9.37	4.99	(46.74)
Correction Captains Association RWF	9.37	5.57	(40.55)
<u>\$3 million to \$10 million</u>			
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association RWF*	8.08	3.98	(50.74)
Detectives Endowment Association WF*	8.08	4.55	(43.69)
<u>\$10 million to \$20 million</u>			
Detectives Endowment Association RWF*	7.09	3.41	(51.90)
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc. RWF	7.09	3.88	(45.28)

*These funds also had lower than average administrative costs in 2004.

These results may indicate that some funds operate in a significantly less costly manner than others.

**Funds With Improved Administrative
Expense-to-Revenue Ratios**

Table X lists 11 funds that significantly reduced the percentage of their revenues spent on administration. These funds reduced their administrative expense percentages between 20.56 and 62.44 percent. There may be several reasons why administrative expenses decrease significantly from one year to the next. For example, funds may contract with less costly providers (e.g., accountants, attorneys, and consultants), or trustees may change the basis of expense allocations between the union and the fund. However, without full audits of the individual funds, it is impossible to determine how these funds reduced their administrative expenses.

Table X
**Funds with Lower Percentages of Revenue
Spent on Administrative Expenses**

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percentages*</u>		<u>Percentage Decrease</u>
	<u>2004</u>	<u>2005</u>	
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters RWF	8.60%	3.23%	(62.44%)
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	5.85	2.65	(54.70)
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees RWF	24.43	14.30	(41.47)
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/ RWF	8.27	4.89	(40.87)
Doctors Council WF	33.55	19.88	(40.75)
Local 891 School Custodian & Custodian Engineers WF/ RWF	9.39	5.59	(40.47)
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	5.39	3.88	(28.01)
Local 15A-C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	21.96	15.84	(27.87)
Local 832 Teamsters RWF	25.61	19.93	(22.18)
Correction Captains Association RWF	7.09	5.57	(21.44)
Doctors Council RWF	25.93	20.60	(20.56)

*Our analysis of the administrative expenses as reported on the financial statements is uniformly evaluated for the purpose of our report. At times we may be required to reclassify specific expenses (i.e., insurance retention) to ensure that all funds are evaluated uniformly.

Annuity Funds: Administrative Expenses

In addition to contributing to the active and retiree welfare funds, the City contributes to annuity funds for uniformed employees and other specific workers on active duty. Upon termination from City service, covered employees receive lump sum distributions based on the value of their accounts. These distributions can include City contributions plus interest and dividends, investment appreciation (depreciation), or other income.

Annuity funds differ from active and retiree welfare funds in that they derive a significant portion of their total revenue from investment income and generally provide only one type of benefit. The percentage of revenue that annuity funds spend on benefits and administration is not comparable to the percentages spent by active and retiree welfare funds. Therefore, we computed category averages for the 24 annuity funds covered in this report separately from those amounts calculated for active and retiree welfare funds. Table XI below highlights eight of the 24 annuity funds with high administrative cost-to-revenue ratios. One fund (NYC Deputy Sheriff’s Association Annuity Fund) was not included in the table since its administrative costs were paid by either the welfare fund or the union.

Table XI
Annuity Funds with High Administrative Cost-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Administrative Expense Percentages</u>		
	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
District Council 37*	4.67%	10.44%	123.55%
Correction Officers Benevolent Association*	4.67	8.52	82.44
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Municipal Engineers	5.78	9.73	68.34
Detectives Endowment Association	4.67	6.87	47.11
Superior Officers Council (Police)	4.67	6.15	31.69
Local 333 United Marine Division*	22.30	27.35	22.65
Local 891 (IUOE)*	5.78	7.01	21.28
Assistant Dep. Wardens/Dep. Wardens Assoc.	20.54	20.54	—

*These funds incurred significantly higher-than average administrative costs in 2004.

Reducing administrative expenses would increase the members’ equity and result in larger annuity payments to members.

Administrative Expenses vs. Total Expenses

Administrative expenses are directly related to benefit expenses and volume (i.e., the more claims processed, the greater the expense for salaries, stationery, printing, etc.).

Table XII illustrates the category average percentages of administrative expenses to total expenses and restates the category average percentages of administrative expenses to total revenue (from page 15):

Table XII
Administrative Expenses as a Percentage of
Total Revenue and Total Expenses

<u>Revenue Category</u>	<u>Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>		<u>Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>	
	<u>Administrative as a Percentage of</u>			
	<u>Total Expenses</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Total Expenses</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>
Less than \$100,000	8.52%	5.37%	18.95%	19.56%
\$100,000 to \$300,000	13.77	13.07	15.40	16.22
\$300,000 to \$1 million	22.06	18.36	15.85	15.52
\$1 million to \$3 million	N/A	N/A	10.39	9.37
\$3 million to \$10 million	N/A	N/A	8.40	8.08
\$10 million to \$20 million	N/A	N/A	7.70	7.09
More than \$20 million	<u>4.38</u>	<u>4.89</u>	<u>8.01</u>	<u>8.12</u>
Overall Average	<u>5.25%</u>	<u>5.74%</u>	<u>8.17%</u>	<u>8.09%</u>

N/A- Not Applicable

EXPENDITURES FOR BENEFITS

The City has not established guidelines on the percentage of annual revenue that should be spent on benefits. In the absence of such guidelines, we calculated category averages for the funds listed below in Table XIII to illustrate by category the average amount and percentages of total revenue expended by funds on benefits. Wherever funds insured some or all of their benefits, we reduced the total premiums by the retention charges (overhead costs involved in doing business, i.e., costs associated with processing claims) to calculate net benefit expenses.

Table XIII
Percentage of Total Revenue Spent on Benefits, by Fund Category

<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>	<u>Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>
Less than \$100,000	57.61%	83.63%
\$100,000 - \$300,000	81.83	89.10
\$300,000 - \$1 million	64.85	82.39
\$1 million - \$3 million	N/A	80.85
\$3 million - \$10 million	N/A	88.19
\$10 million - \$20 million	N/A	85.02
More than \$20 million	<u>106.58</u>	<u>93.16</u>
Overall Average (Not Weighted)	<u>103.64%</u>	<u>90.99%</u>

N/A – Not Applicable

Although these percentages do not indicate the quality of benefits provided, they do provide a benchmark for comparison and further study. (Exhibit D at the end of this report indicates the amounts expended and the types of benefits provided by the funds.)

Some funds spent more than their category average for benefits; others spent less. Table XIV lists selected funds whose benefit expenses significantly exceeded the respective category averages. However, when a fund's expenses exceed the category average, it does not necessarily represent a problem. For example, Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF exceeded the category average but still had sufficient reserves to ensure its continued financial stability.

Table XIV
Self-Insured and Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With High Benefit-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Benefits as a Percentage of Total Revenue</u>		
	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust Fund WF*	89.10	159.76	79.30
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Association RWF*	57.61	100.57	74.57
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	82.39	117.40	42.49
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Association WF*	81.83	112.87	37.93
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc. RWF*	88.19	120.42	36.55
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	89.10	120.50	35.24
Local 30A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF*	80.85	100.56	24.38
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF*	88.19	105.98	20.17
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF	88.19	102.92	16.70
New York City Retiree WF*	88.19	101.21	14.76
Local 832 Teamsters RWF*	89.10	100.90	13.24
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	106.58	106.58	N/A

N/A – Not Applicable

*These funds also spent more than the category average in 2004.

In contrast, several funds spent less than the category averages for benefits, as shown in Table XV.

Table XV
Self-Insured and Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With Low Benefit-to-Revenue Ratios

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Benefits as a Percentage of Total Revenue</u>		
	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation From Category Average</u>
Local 14A-14B IUOE WF/RWF*	81.83%	43.97	(46.27)%
Local 15 A-C Operating Engineers WF/RWF*	64.85	38.16	(41.16)
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters WF*	57.61	34.82	(39.56)
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF*	80.85	53.08	(34.35)
Local 891 School Custodians & Custodian Engineers WF/RWF	88.19	62.63	(28.98)
Local 832 Teamsters WF	82.39	58.91	(28.50)
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	89.10	67.32	(24.44)
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	82.39	65.22	(20.84)

*This fund spent less than the category average in 2004.

The benefit expenses for the 12 funds listed in Table XVI exceeded total revenue, causing the funds to dip into their reserves. The use of reserves for benefits may indicate that the benefits provided were not evaluated in relation to the resources available to the funds.

Table XVI
Self-Insured and Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With Benefit Expenses That Exceeded Their Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Benefit Expenses</u>	<u>Percentage of Revenue Spent on Benefits</u>	<u>2004 - 2005 Percentage Decrease in Reserve</u>	<u>Ending Fund Balance 2005</u>
<u>Under \$100,000</u>					
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc. RWF*	\$ 48,906	\$ 49,184	100.57%	(5.17%)	\$ 112,488
<u>\$100,000 to \$300,000</u>					
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc. WF	161,064	181,799	112.87	(30.02)	58,279
Local 832 Teamsters RWF	166,660	168,161	100.90	(52.26)	(101,161)
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust Fund WF	79,609	127,185	159.76	(47.25)	75,590
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF*	270,748	326,244	120.50	(11.92)	903,770
<u>\$300,000 to \$1Million</u>					
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	340,368	399,584	117.40	(22.56)	366,106
<u>\$1 Million to \$3 Million</u>					
Local 30A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF	1,319,148	1,326,568	100.56	(36.32)	205,657
<u>\$3 Million to \$10 Million</u>					
New York City Retiree WF	6,531,732	6,611,011	101.21	(5.25)	7,338,896
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Association RWF	7,086,027	8,533,304	120.42	(25.57)	4,059,212
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	6,651,697	7,049,680	105.98	(85.21)	168,835
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF*	11,165,248	11,491,325	102.92	(6.29)	28,465,370
<u>Over \$20 Million</u>					
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	25,937,497	27,643,987	106.58	(18.73)	3,736,195

*These funds also had high reserves (fund balances) in relation to annual revenue (see Tables XVIII and XIX), so the benefit spending in excess of revenue is not a major concern.

The formula used to calculate the 2004-2005 percentage decrease in reserves is shown in narrative form as follows:
(2004 reserves minus 2005 reserves) divided by 2004 reserves x 100 = 2004 to 2005 percentage decrease in reserves.

Fund trustees should carefully examine the relationship of benefit expenditures to revenues. If a fund overspends on benefits, it may use up necessary reserves. If a fund underspends on benefits, it may provide insufficient benefits for its members while building unnecessary reserves. The funds should achieve a proper balance.

RESERVE LEVELS

Reserves held by the funds provide a cushion if claims for benefits exceed revenues in any particular year. Reserves accumulate when fund revenues exceed fund expenses. (See Exhibit B.) These amounts are separate and distinct from any amounts held by insurance carriers. Table XVII shows the reserve averages for each fund category.

Table XVII
Average Amount of Reserves and Percentage of
Reserves to Annual Revenue by Category

<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>		<u>Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds</u>	
	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Amount</u>	<u>Percent</u>
Less than \$100,000	\$ 283,086	489.14%	\$ 223,668	232.44%
\$100,000 - \$300,000	414,469	282.79	631,709	278.14
\$300,000 - \$1 million	2,092,760	394.46	1,591,047	207.89
\$1 million - \$3 million	N/A	N/A	2,244,336	136.35
\$3 million - \$10 million	N/A	N/A	9,313,042	133.26
\$10 million - \$20 million	N/A	N/A	14,383,195	99.36
More than \$20 million	3,736,195	14.40	69,312,887	68.96
Overall Average	\$1,299,186	41.77%	\$11,566,570	85.20%

N/A – Not Applicable

Using 100 percent of total annual revenue as a reasonable level for reserves for insured active and retiree welfare funds, we identified seven funds with excess reserves. (See Exhibit B.) The seven funds listed in Table XVIII have reserves in excess of 100 percent of revenue.

Table XVIII
Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
Reserves in Excess of 100 Percent of Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Fund Reserves</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>
Local 15A-C Operating Engineers WF/RWF*	\$5,204,590	871.39%
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters WF	454,057	636.92
Local 14A-14B IUOE WF/RWF*	770,658	583.54
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters RWF*	282,714	529.16
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Association RWF*	112,488	230.01
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees RWF*	420,253	116.28
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF*	653,438	103.24

*Also identified in 2004 Survey of Benefit Funds Report as having more than 100 percent of reserves to total revenue.

Using 200 percent of total annual revenue as a reasonable level for reserves for self-insured funds, we identified 20 funds, listed in Table XIX, that had reserves in excess of this amount.

Table XIX
Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
Reserves in Excess of 200 Percent of Revenue

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Fund Reserves</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>
NYC Municipal Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF*	\$1,496,847	496.37%
NYC Municipal Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF*	736,977	449.03
District No 1 MEBA Beneficial Fund Trust WF/AF*	691,525	408.95
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF*	903,770	333.80
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	3,184,415	323.82
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	969,748	322.26
Doctors Council WF*	3,868,999	288.20
Doctors Council RWF*	1,777,556	265.77
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF*	28,465,370	254.95
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF*	4,757,236	252.74
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF*	4,622,001	248.08
Licensed Practical Nurses WF *	4,426,403	245.54
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF*	223,668	232.44
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF*	8,803,772	230.82
Detectives Endowment Association WF	21,988,575	226.85
Local 237 Teamsters WF*	71,138,141	223.66
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Association WF*	8,878,900	208.46
District Council 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)*	3,178,776	201.02
Local 30 IUOE Municipal Employees RWF*	1,699,304	200.20
Local 832 Teamsters WF	1,265,231	200.06

*Also identified in the 2004 Survey of Benefit Funds Report as having more than 200 percent of reserves to total revenue.

OPERATING DEFICITS

In 2005, 30 of the 73 active and retiree welfare funds in our analysis incurred operating deficits totaling \$24.9 million, as shown in Table XX. The deficits ranged from \$3,062 to \$8.8 million. One fund, Local 832 Teamsters RWF, depleted its reserve in 2004 and has been insolvent since then. We question the ability of Local 832 Teamsters RWF to continue to operate and to provide benefits to its members.

Table XX
Funds with Operating Deficits and Declining Reserves

<u>Fund Name</u>	2005 <u>Operating Deficit</u>	2005 <u>Reserves</u>	2004 <u>Reserves</u>	2004-2005 Percentage Decrease in <u>Reserves</u>
DC 37 WF*	\$8,815,007	\$139,497,027	\$148,312,034	(5.94%)
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF*	2,974,255	3,736,195	4,597,185	(18.73)
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF*	2,921,645	134,719,221	138,452,038	(2.70)
Local 237 Teamsters WF	2,546,803	71,138,141	73,843,276	(3.66)
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF*	1,924,618	28,465,370	30,376,071	(6.29)
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers RWF*	1,912,513	4,059,212	5,453,802	(25.57)
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF*	793,735	168,835	1,141,352	(85.21)
Local 237 Teamsters RWF*	710,338	8,711,926	9,466,630	(7.97)
New York City Retiree WF*	406,374	7,338,896	7,745,270	(5.25)
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF*	308,294	3,474,405	3,564,699	(2.53)
New York State Nurses Association WF	304,157	10,901,972	11,533,114	(5.47)
Patrolmen's Benevolent Association RWF*	193,912	29,110,729	29,304,641	(0.66)
United Probation Officers Association WF	144,681	1,911,459	2,056,140	(7.04)
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF*	122,301	903,770	1,026,071	(11.92)
Doctors Council WF*	121,258	3,868,999	3,990,257	(3.04)
Local 30A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF*	117,298	205,657	322,955	(36.32)
Civil Service Bar Association WF*	113,469	833,231	912,050	(8.64)
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	107,097	366,106	472,776	(22.56)
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF*	79,276	3,184,415	3,263,691	(2.43)
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust WF*	67,451	75,590	143,289	(47.25)
Doctors Council RWF*	44,967	1,777,556	1,822,523	(2.47)
Local 832 Teamsters RWF*	34,721	(101,161)	(66,440)	(52.26)
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF*	34,051	1,246,093	1,287,236	(3.20)
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	29,554	533,768	535,058	(0.24)
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees RWF*	27,555	420,253	443,879	(5.32)
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Association WF*	24,997	58,279	83,276	(30.02)
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	14,568	969,748	984,597	(1.51)
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Association RWF*	6,136	112,488	118,624	(5.17)
NYC Muni Steamfitters & Steamfitters Helpers RWF	4,488	736,977	741,465	(0.61)
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF*	3,062	223,668	226,730	(1.35)
	<u>\$24,908,581</u>	<u>\$458,648,825</u>	<u>\$482,154,289</u>	<u>(4.88%)</u>

*These funds also incurred operating deficits and declining reserves in 2004.

We identified insured and self-insured welfare funds that are either insolvent or are approaching low levels of reserves. In identifying these funds, we considered the dollar amount of reserves, the ratio of reserves to the funds' total annual revenue, whether the funds are insured or self-insured, and recent years' operating results. Table XXI highlights funds that, provided that the current trend of using reserves for operations continues, may have current as well as future solvency problems.

Table XXI
Funds with Low Reserve Levels

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Excess of Revenue Over Expenses</u>	<u>Fund Reserves</u>	<u>Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>	<u>Category Average for Percentage of Reserves to Total Revenue</u>	<u>Percentage Deviation from Category Average</u>
Local 832 Teamsters RWF*	(\$34,721)	(\$101,161)	(60.70%)	278.14%	(121.82%)
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust Fund	(67,451)	75,590	94.95	278.14	(65.86)
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF*	971,180	1,796,006	7.63	68.96	(88.94)
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Association RWF	1,905,573	5,849,622	36.20	99.36	(63.57)
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF*	(793,735)	168,835	2.54	133.26	(98.09)
Local 30A – C Operating Municipal Engineers WF*	(117,298)	205,657	15.59	136.35	(88.57)
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association RWF*	(308,294)	3,474,405	34.51	133.26	(74.10)
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF*	(2,974,255)	3,736,195	14.40	14.40	N/A
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc. WF*	(24,997)	58,279	36.18	282.79	(87.21)

*Indicates those funds whose expenses exceeded revenue in 2004.

High reserve levels may indicate that funds do not spend enough of their total annual revenue on benefits; low reserve levels may point to excessive amounts of revenue spent on benefits and administrative expenses.

ANALYSIS OF TOTAL REVENUE

In 2005, the 73 active and retiree welfare funds in our survey had revenue totaling \$896.9 million. Expenses for these funds totaled \$891.5 million—\$71.9 million for fund administration and \$819.6 million for benefits to members. The \$5.4 million surplus (revenues over expenses) increased the funds' reserves.

In previous sections, we analyzed funds' use of their total revenues. Table XXII lists funds that, compared to category averages, have high administrative costs and/or low benefit costs.

Table XXII
Insured and Self-Insured Active and Retiree Welfare Funds
With High Administrative Expenses
And/or Low Benefit Costs

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Total Revenue</u>	<u>Percentage of Administrative Expenses to Total Revenue</u>		<u>Percentage of Benefit Expenses to Total Revenue</u>	
		<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund Actual</u>	<u>Category Average</u>	<u>Fund Actual</u>
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters WF*	\$ 71,290	5.37%	2.44%	57.61%	34.82%
Local 15A-C Operating Engineers WF/ RWF*	597,277	18.36	15.84	64.85	38.16
Local 858 IBT, (OTB) Branch Office Managers WF	303,234	16.22	24.02	89.10	71.66
Local 14A-14B IUOE WF/RWF*	132,065	13.07	25.77	81.83	43.97
Local 832 Teamsters WF	632,417	15.52	13.77	82.39	58.91
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF*	1,863,124	9.37	9.85	80.85	53.08
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters RWF*	53,427	5.37	3.23	57.61	48.69
United Probation Officers Association WF	1,307,776	9.37	20.54	80.85	90.52
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	48,906	5.37	11.98	57.61	100.57
House Staff Comm. of Interns & Resident WF	4,040,494	8.08	15.91	88.19	71.35
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management WF	15,337,817	7.09	13.63	85.02	84.00

*Indicates those funds having high administrative costs and/or low expenditures for benefits in 2004.

The basic objective of a welfare fund is to provide benefits to members. This can be better achieved by keeping administrative costs to a minimum. Funds that accumulate excessive reserves or expend large amounts for administration at the expense of members' benefits do not achieve their basic objective. Therefore, the trustees of these funds should evaluate how they expend total revenue.

Certain Funds Should Address Financial and Operating Issues to Ensure Maximum Use of Revenue and Continued Financial Stability

In summary, we identified certain financial issues that in our opinion should be addressed by the fund management, specifically:

- The expenses of certain funds exceeded their revenues, resulting in operating deficits. Operating deficits could deplete fund reserves, which could ultimately lead to insolvency.
- Certain funds spent a large percentage of their revenue on administrative expenses. Reducing administrative expenses would provide funds to increase benefits for members.
- Certain funds had large operating surpluses resulting in high reserves. Excess reserves may indicate that funds should increase members' benefits.

Fund managers have a fiduciary responsibility to provide optimum benefits to members while keeping administrative costs to a minimum. A fund that accumulates excessive reserves or expends large amounts for administrative costs is not achieving its basic goal of providing optimum benefits to members while achieving financial stability. Accordingly, the trustees of the funds listed in Table XXIII should evaluate how fund resources could be better used.

Specifically, Table XXIII lists those funds with financial issues (as indicated in the shaded areas of the table) that, in our opinion, should be addressed.

**Table XXIII
Funds with Potential Problems
(Problem Areas Highlighted)**

FUNDS	TOTAL REVENUE	OVERALL EXPENSES	SURPLUS OR OPERATING (DEFICIT)	ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSE		BENEFITS EXPENSE		FUND BALANCE			RISK OF INSOLVENCY (SEE LEGEND)
				Total	% of Rev.	Total	% of Rev.	Total	% of Rev.	Balance / Deficit*	
Local 832 Teamsters RWF	\$ 166,660	\$ 201,381	\$ (34,721)	\$ 33,220	19.93%	\$ 168,161	100.9%	\$ (101,161)	I	I	I
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	6,651,697	7,445,432	(793,735)	395,752	5.95	7,049,680	105.98	168,835	2.54	21.27	P
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	25,937,497	28,911,752	(2,974,255)	1,267,765	4.89	27,643,987	106.58	3,736,195	14.40	125.62	ST
Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust WF	79,609	147,060	(67,451)	19,875	24.97	127,185	159.76	75,590	94.95	112.07	ST
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF	1,319,148	1,436,446	(117,298)	109,878	8.33	1,326,568	100.56	205,657	15.59	175.33	ST
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers RWF	7,086,027	8,998,540	(1,912,513)	465,236	6.57	8,533,304	120.42	4,059,212	57.28	212.24	MT
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	161,064	186,061	(24,997)	4,262	2.65	181,799	112.87	58,279	36.18	233.14	MT
Local 3 IBEW City Employees WF	270,748	393,049	(122,301)	66,805	24.67	326,244	120.50	903,770	333.80	738.97	LT
United Probation Officers Association WF	1,307,776	1,452,457	(144,681)	268,645	20.54	1,183,812	90.52	1,911,459	146.16	1,321.15	LT
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	340,368	447,465	(107,097)	47,881	14.07	399,584	117.40	366,106	107.56	341.85	LT
Local 14A-14B IUOE WF/RWF	132,065	92,106	39,959	34,036	25.77	58,070	43.97	770,658	583.54	-	N
Local 15A-C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	597,277	322,482	274,795	94,589	15.84	227,893	38.16	5,204,590	871.39	-	N

Legend

I - Insolvent

N - Currently not at Risk of Insolvency

P - Possible Risk of Insolvency in less than 1 year

ST - Short-term Risk of Insolvency within 1 - 2 years

MT - Mid-term Risk of Insolvency between 2- 3 years

LT - Long-term Risk of Insolvency greater than 3 years

*A ratio estimating the number of years that a fund can operate before being "in the red" if all factors remain constant. For example, number "101%" would indicate the fund has approximately one year before becoming insolvent.

EXCEPTIONS ON FUND OPERATIONS

Certified public accountants hired by the benefit funds issue opinions on financial statements prepared by the funds and issue management letters commenting on management practices and internal control systems of the funds, in accordance with Comptroller's Directive #12. Some management letters noted various exceptions to fund operations. Based on our review of the funds' financial statements, the opinions and management letters submitted by the CPAs, and the booklets distributed by the funds describing their benefits, we found that a number of funds did not comply with certain aspects of Directive #12 and their agreements with the City.

Eligibility Delay

The intent of the standard benefit fund agreements between the City and the unions is that welfare fund benefits be available during each member's entire period of employment with the City.

Specifically, the standard fund agreements between the City and the unions state:

"The Union agrees to provide from the Fund for each Covered Employee the supplementary benefits described in the schedule annexed to this Agreement marked as Appendix 'C', for the period of employment with the City of each such Covered Employee during the term of this Agreement, whether or not any payment or payments made to the Union pursuant to the formula prescribed in section 2(c) of this Agreement actually included the full sum prescribed by Appendix 'B' on account of such Employee during the twenty-eight (28) day cycle for which such payment or payments are made."

Thus, the funds should make their members eligible for benefits, beginning on their first day of employment with the City. However, a review of benefit booklets distributed by some funds and telephone confirmations with fund officials revealed that two funds (Local 237 Teamsters' Welfare Fund and District Council 9 Painting Industry Welfare Fund) delay eligibility for their members for a maximum of 30 days and 90 days, respectively.² Thus, these funds are delaying the eligibility of their members for benefits. Consequently, members or their dependents who may be in need of benefits during the fund waiting periods are precluded from obtaining such benefits.

In separate letters dated May 11, 2007 and October 2, 2007, the Office of Labor Relations (OLR) denied Local 1969 welfare fund's (District Council 9 Painting Industry Welfare Fund) request to further negotiate "first day" welfare fund coverage. OLR responded that Local 1969's current eligibility rules were not in compliance with the Welfare Fund Agreement signed by the parties or consistent with the findings of the Comptroller's 2004 Benefit Fund Audit Report and therefore must provide welfare fund coverage effective on a member's first day of employment.

² Our analysis focused on the delay to new employees enrolled in welfare benefit funds (active) since the members of retiree funds and annuity funds qualify to receive benefits once they leave active service.

We commend OLR for taking action and recommend that it closely monitor whether these funds provide benefits on the first day a member begins City employment. If not, OLR should take appropriate action, such as delaying the contributions made by the City to these funds and recoup past contributions for the periods when City employees were not covered for benefits.

CPA Opinions

Certified public accountants audit and render opinions on the funds’ financial statements. The fund agreements between the City and the unions require the preparation of each fund’s financial statements on the accrual basis of accounting and in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles (GAAP). CPAs may render one of the following opinions:

<u>Opinion</u>	<u>Description</u>
Unqualified	Financial statements present fairly, in all material respects, the financial position, results of operations, and cash flows of the entity in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles.
Qualified	Except for the effects of the matter(s) to which the qualification relates, the financial statements present fairly, in all material respects, the financial position, results of operations, and cash flows of the entity in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles.
Adverse	Financial statements do not present fairly the financial position, results of operations, or cash flows of the entity in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles.
Disclaimer	The auditor does not express an opinion on the financial statements.

Eighty-two of the 97 funds reviewed received unqualified opinions, 5 funds received qualified opinions, and 10 funds received adverse opinions from their independent auditors. The financial statements for 14 of the 15 funds with qualified or adverse opinions were not presented in accordance with GAAP (see list below). GAAP requires that post-retirement and other benefit obligations be presented on the fund’s financial statements. Also, the CPA firm that audited the financial statements of Local 3 NYC Communications Electricians Annuity Fund indicated that it could not form an opinion on whether the fund had adequate retroactive contributions to pay benefits.

FUND	OPINION	COMMENTS
Local 3 NYC Communications Electricians AF	Qualified	New York City did not provide sufficient documentation that would allow a reconciliation of retroactive contributions for the periods prior to January 1, 2002; therefore, the auditors were unable to form an opinion regarding the amount of contributions

FUND	OPINION	COMMENTS
		available for benefits.
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF	Qualified	The Fund provides benefits from current income instead of accruing the liability for benefits payable on an actuarially determined basis as required by generally accepted accounting principles.
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF	Qualified	The Fund provides benefits from current income instead of accruing the liability for benefits payable on an actuarially determined basis as required by generally accepted accounting principles.
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighter's Assoc. RWF	Qualified	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements as required by generally accepted accounting principles.
Assistant Deputy Wardens/ Deputy Wardens Association WF/RWF	Qualified	The Fund provides benefits from current income instead of estimating the liability for the benefits on an actuarially determined basis as required by generally accepted accounting principles.
Organization of Staff Analysts WF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations in their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations and its present value of death benefits from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Correction Officers Benevolent Association RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations and its present value of death benefits from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Detectives Endowment Association RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Correction Captains Association RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefit WF/RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit and obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees RWF	Adverse	The Fund excluded post-retirement benefit obligations from their financial statements. The effects of such omission are presumed to be material.

Funds receiving adverse or qualified opinions should take immediate action to correct these problems.

Consolidation of Professional Services

Most funds receiving City contributions enter into contracts with various professionals for services such as accounting-auditing and legal counsel. Many funds use the same professional service provider for similar services. One CPA firm, for example, Gould, Kobrick & Schlapp, provides accounting services for 14 different unions representing 39 separate funds. (Appendix D lists the funds using the same providers for similar professional services.)

Trustees of funds using the same providers for similar services may reduce their funds' administrative expenses by negotiating future contracts jointly.

Late Submission of Directive #12 Reports

In 2005, 69 of the 97 funds (71.1 percent) in our analysis did not submit their Directive #12 reports in a timely manner. Comptroller's Directive #12 requires that within nine months after the close of a fund's fiscal year, each fund's trustees must submit a report with the City Comptroller showing the fund's condition and affairs during its preceding fiscal year. Included with a fund's annual report is a financial statement, a CPA-prepared management letter commenting upon internal and management controls that were assessed during the CPA audit. Further, Directive #12 also requires that each fund comment on management matters such as investment policies, bidding practices, staff utilization, and accounting allocations. The Directive #12 reports provide a basis for a timely comparative analysis of fund operations and for the identification of deviations from the norm.

Moreover, our analysis found that two of the 69 funds submitted their Directive #12 reports in excess of nine months after their due dates—18 months after their fiscal year-end; 33 funds submitted their Directive #12 reports between three and nine months late—12 to 18 months after their fiscal year-end; and the remaining 34 funds submitted their Directive #12 reports less than three months after their due dates. Table XXIV lists those two funds that were significantly late (i.e., more than nine months after their due dates) in submitting their Directive #12 reports to the Comptroller's Office.

Table XXIV
Funds That Were Significantly Delayed in
Submitting Directive #12 Reports

<u>Fund Name</u>	<u>Fiscal Year Ended</u>	<u>Directive #12 Due 9-months After the Fund's Fiscal-Year-End</u>	<u>Date Received</u>	<u>Number of Days Past Due</u>
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF	7/31/05	4/30/06	3/6/07	310 Days
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Association WF	6/30/05	3/31/06	1/18/07	293 Days

Fund trustees and administrators have a contractual responsibility to submit their Directive #12 reports on time. The information generated as a result of a Directive #12 report provides a basis for our comparative analyses of fund operations to identify deviations from the norm. The timely release of this comparative analysis allows those funds that deviate from the norm to evaluate how fund resources could be better used.

Field Audits of Funds

In addition to analyzing Directive #12 submissions, the Comptroller's Office periodically performs audits of the financial and operating practices of selected funds. There were 79 audit reports issued by the Comptroller's Office during Fiscal Years 1985-2007. (These audits are listed in Appendix C at the end of the report.)

Each audit report discusses the extent to which each fund met its basic objective of providing benefits to members and identifies various areas for improvement. Often we identify weaknesses common to more than one fund. Among the more common weaknesses identified in these audits (see Appendix B for a list of common weaknesses) were the following:

- inaccurate or unsupported basis for allocating common expenses;
- a larger percentage of revenues spent on administrative expenses compared to other funds with total revenues of a similar size;
- benefit and administrative expenses misstated in Directive #12 filings; and
- funds expended on questionable items.

During Fiscal Year 2007, we issued two reports. A brief summary of the findings from these audits follows:

***Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices
Of the Local 333 Insurance Fund for New York City Employees,
Report # FL05-090A***

The audit disclosed that the fund was not in compliance with the procedures and reporting requirements of Comptroller's Directive #12. In addition, the fund had no written benefit-processing or accounting procedures and made benefit payments totaling \$94,560 to ineligible individuals and/or without supporting documentation. Furthermore, the fund spent a significantly larger percentage of its City contributions on administrative expenses when compared to other, similarly-sized welfare funds. Specifically, the fund:

- Did not receive the proceeds from stock issued by Prudential in 2002 until 2004 because the fund's trustees failed to distribute the proceeds in a timely manner. The delay in the distribution of the proceeds from the stock sale for approximately three years and depositing the proceeds in a union account may constitute a breach in the trustees' fiduciary responsibility to the welfare fund and its members.
- Misstated benefit and administrative expenses on its Directive #12 filing. Specifically, administrative expenses were understated by 121 percent and benefit expenses were overstated by 15 percent.
- Failed to solicit bids to procure insurance services, as required by Directive #12. Consequently, the fund may not be receiving the best possible price for insurance services it procures for its members.
- Did not maintain time records for its employees as required by Directive #12. The Fund has no written procedures requiring that time-keeping records be maintained. Time records allow for the documenting and tracking of the hours employees work by recording daily employee arrival and departure times and the accruals for and charges against vacation and sick leave, as required by Directive #12. Consequently, we could not confirm whether employees were paid for hours they actually worked.
- Had no written procedures governing the processing of benefit payments. As a result, the fund made improper benefit payments totaling \$94,560. Of the 239,833 in claims we reviewed, \$94,560 (39 percent) in payments were made to ineligible individuals and made without supporting documentation.
- Paid claims for dependents whose eligibility was not documented. Of the 831 benefit claims reviewed, 21 claims were for services provided to individuals who were listed as dependents of eligible members. However, the fund did not have documentation in its files (i.e., birth certificates, marriage licenses) showing that the individuals were in fact eligible dependents for 13 (62 percent) of the 21 claims.
- Did not have a formal agreement with its accountant. Without a formal written agreement, we could not determine whether payments to the fund's accountant were reasonable and justifiable and what services were to be provided.

- Is owed \$895 by the union. The fund overpaid the union \$746 in shared telephone expenses and paid \$149 for lunch at a union meeting.
- Is owed \$1,339 by the retiree fund. The fund paid \$1,339 in life insurance premiums that should have been paid the retiree fund.
- Did not properly authorize checks. Checks issued from its operating account, optical benefit account, and supplemental benefit account for calendar year 2004 were not properly authorized.
- Spent a significantly larger percentage of its City contributions on administrative expenses when compared to other, similarly-sized funds. Specifically, the fund spent 36.06 percent of its City contributions on administrative expenses. In comparison, 11 similarly-sized funds spent an average of 15.90 percent of their City contributions on administrative expenses.

In their response, fund officials agreed with the audit findings and recommendations and described the actions that have been taken to address the report's recommendations.

***Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices
Of the Local 333 Retirement Insurance Fund for
New York City Retirees, Report # FL05-091A***

The audit disclosed that the fund was not in compliance with the procedures and reporting requirements of Comptroller's Directive #12. In addition, the fund had no written benefit-processing or accounting procedures and made benefit payments totaling \$34,195 to ineligible individuals and/or without supporting documentation. Further, the fund spent a significantly larger percentage of its percentage of its City contributions on administrative expenses when compared to other, similarly-sized welfare funds. Specifically, the fund:

- Did not receive the proceeds from stock issued by Prudential in 2002 until 2004 because the fund's trustees failed to distribute the proceeds in a timely manner. The delay in the distribution of the proceeds from the stock sale for approximately three years and depositing the proceeds in a union account may constitute a breach in the trustees' fiduciary responsibility to the welfare fund and its members.
- Misstated benefit and administrative expenses on its Directive #12 filing. Specifically, administrative expenses were understated by 55 percent and benefit expenses were overstated by 14 percent.
- Had no written procedures governing the processing of benefit payments. As a result, the fund made improper benefit payments totaling \$34,195. Of the 206,391 in claims reviewed, \$39,195 (16.57 percent) in payments were made to ineligible individuals and/or made without supporting documentation.

- Paid claims for dependents whose eligibility was not documented. Of the 75 benefit claims reviewed, 7 claims were for services provided to individuals who were listed as dependents of eligible members. However, the fund did not have documentation in its files (i.e., marriage licenses or partnership agreements) showing that the individuals were in fact eligible dependents for 3 (43 percent) of the 7 claims.
- Spent a significantly larger percentage of its City contributions on administrative expenses when compared to other, similarly-sized funds. Specifically, the Fund spent 30 percent of its City contributions on administrative expenses. In comparison, 11 similarly-sized funds spent an average of 16.36 percent of their City contributions on administrative expenses.
- Failed to solicit bids to procure insurance services, as required by Directive #12. Consequently, the fund may not be receiving the best possible price for insurance services it procures for its members.
- Did not have a formal agreement with its accountant. Without a formal written agreement, we could not determine whether payments to the fund's accountant were reasonable and justifiable and what services were to be provided.
- Is owed \$662 by the union. The fund overpaid the union \$662 in shared telephone expenses.
- Is owed \$1,147 by the retiree fund. The active fund owes the retiree fund \$1,147 for shared computer expenses.
- Did not maintain time records for its employees, as required by Directive #12. The fund has no written procedures requiring that time-keeping records be maintained. Time records allow for the documenting and tracking of the hours employees work by recording daily employee arrival and departure times and the accruals for and charges against vacation and sick leave, as required by Directive #12. Consequently, we could not confirm whether employees were paid for hours they actually worked.
- Did not properly authorize checks. Checks issued from its operating account, optical benefit account, and supplemental benefit account for calendar year 2004 were not properly authorized.

In their response, fund officials agreed with the audit findings and recommendations and described the actions that have been taken to address the report's recommendations.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Administrative and Benefit Expenses

There continues to be a variance in administrative costs as a percentage of total revenue for funds in each revenue category. Concurrently, some funds spend a significantly lower percentage of their revenue on benefits compared to other funds.

Recommendations

1. Trustees of funds with high percentages of administrative costs to total revenue and/or low percentages of benefit expenses to total revenue should reduce administrative expenses and increase benefits to members.
2. Trustees of funds using the same professional service providers for similar services should consider jointly negotiating future contracts with these providers to reduce administrative expenses through economies of scale.

Reserves

Several funds have incurred operating deficits and maintain very low levels of reserves, which may indicate potential future solvency problems. Other funds continue to maintain extremely high levels of reserves.

Recommendations

3. Trustees of the insolvent fund and funds with low reserve levels should take steps to ensure that their funds remain solvent. To accomplish this goal, funds should endeavor to reduce administrative expenses. If this is not possible or does not provide sufficient funds to ensure solvency, the trustees should attempt to reduce costs associated with benefits.
4. Trustees of funds that are incurring significant operating deficits, particularly those with low reserve levels, should ensure that anticipated benefit and administrative expenses will not exceed projected total revenue.
5. Trustees of funds with high reserve levels, particularly those whose funds spend less than average amounts of their revenue on benefits, should consider enhancing their members' benefits.

Exceptions on Fund Operations

As in previous years, we identified various funds that do not comply with all aspects of their unions' agreements with the City and with Comptroller's Directive #12.

Recommendations

6. Trustees of funds that delay members' eligibility for benefits beyond their first day of employment should revise their fund's policy to comply with their union's welfare fund agreement with the City.
7. OLR should recover the portion of City contributions from those funds that do not provide benefits to members from their first day of employment.
8. OLR should use the information in this report to ensure that the trustees of the funds cited herein correct the conditions cited in adverse or qualified opinions received from their independent accountants.

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES - 2005

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens Assoc AF	Assistant Deputy Wardens/Deputy Wardens Association Annuity Fund
Assistant Dep Wardens/Dep Wardens WF/RWF/CLRF	Assistant Deputy Wardens/Deputy Wardens Association Security Benefits Fund
Captains Endowment Assoc CLRF Fund	Captains Endowment Association - Civil Legal Representation Fund
Civil Service Bar Assoc WF	Civil Service Bar Association Security Benefits Fund
Committee of Interns and Residents Education Fund	Professional Educational Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents
Correction Captains Assoc Annuity Fund	Correction Captains Association Annuity Fund
Correction Captains Association RWF	Correction Captains Association Security Benefits Fund - Retirees
Correction Captains Association WF/CLRF	Correction Captains Association Security Benefits Fund/ Civil Legal Representation Fund
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc AF	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Annuity Fund
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc RWF	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Security Benefits Fund --Retirees
Correction Officers' Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Security Benefits Fund - Actives
DC 37 WF	District Council 37 Benefits Fund Trust/Health & Security Plan Trust/Education Fund
DC 9 Painting Industry Annuity Fund (Local 1969)	Painting Industry Annuity Fund
DC 9 Painting Industry WF/RWF (Local 1969)	Painting Industry Insurance Fund and Subsidiary
Detectives Endowment Assoc Annuity Fund	Detectives' Endowment Association Annuity Fund
Detectives Endowment Assoc CLRF	Detectives' Endowment Association Civil Legal Representation Fund
Detectives Endowment Association RWF	Detectives' Endowment Association Health Benefits Fund - Retirees
Detectives Endowment Association WF	Detectives Endowment Association Health Benefits Fund
District Council 37 AFSCME Annuity Fund	District Council 37 AFSCME Annuity Fund Plan
District No. 1 MEBA Bene. Fund Trust WF/AF	MEBA City Employees' Beneficial Fund Trust
Doctors Council Annuity Fund	Doctors Council Annuity Fund
Doctors Council RWF	Doctors Council Retirees Welfare Fund
Doctors Council WF	Doctors Council Welfare Fund
Fire Alarm Dispatchers Benevolent Assoc WF	Fire Alarm Dispatchers' Benevolent Association, Inc. - Welfare Fund
House Staff Comm of Interns & Residents WF/Legal	House Staff Benefits Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents
Licensed Practical Nurses WF	Licensed Practical Nurses Welfare Fund
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin. RWF	CSA Retiree Welfare Fund
Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Admin. WF	CSA Welfare Fund
Local 1 Plumbing Industry Annuity Fund	Plumbers Local Union No. 1 Additional Security Benefit Fund
Local 1180 CWA Members Annuity Fund	Communications Workers of America Local 1180 Members' Annuity Fund
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management RWF	CWA Local 1180 Retirees Benefit Fund
Local 1180 CWA Municipal Management WF/LEGAL/ED	CWA Local 1180 Security Benefit Fund/ Legal Benefits Fund/ Education Fund
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees RWF	C.W.A. Local 1181 Security Benefits Fund - Retirees
Local 1181 CWA Supervisory Employees WF	C.W.A. Local 1181 Security Benefits Fund
Local 1182 CWA Security Benefit Fund RWF/WF/Legal	C.W.A. Local 1182 Security Benefits Fund/ Prepaid Legal Services Benefit Fund

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES -- 2005

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
Local 1199 National Ben Fund Hosp Health Care WF Local 14A - 14B IUOE WF/RWF	1199 SEIU National Benefit Fund for Health and Human Service Employees International Union of Operating Engineers Local 14 - 14B Welfare Fund City of New York Employees
Local 15 A-C Operating Engineers WF/RWF	International Union of Operating Engineers Local Union 15, 15A, 15C Municipal Employees Welfare Fund
Local 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) Operating Muni. Engineers AF	Annuity Trust Fund for Municipal Employees of the Operating Engineers Union Local 15, 15A, 15C
Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF	United Federation of Teachers Welfare Fund
Local 211 Allied Building Inspectors WF	Allied Building Inspectors Local Union No. 211 I.U.O.E Welfare Fund
Local 237 Teamsters Annuity Fund	Teamsters Local 237 Additional Security Benefit Fund
Local 237 Teamsters RWF	Teamsters Local 237 Retirees' Benefit Fund
Local 237 Teamsters WF	Teamsters Local 237 Welfare Fund
Local 246 SEIU RWF	New York City Local 246 Retiree Welfare Fund
Local 246 SEIU NYC Annuity Fund	New York City, Local 246, S.E.I.U. Annuity Fund
Local 246 SEIU Welfare Fund	New York City Local 246 Welfare Fund
Local 3 IBEW City Employees Welfare Fund	City Employees Welfare Fund Local Union # 3 I.B.E.W.
Local 3 IBEW Electrical Workers Industry AF	Annuity Plan of the Electrical Industry
Local 3 IBEW Electricians RWF	I.B.E.W. Local 3 New York City Electrical Division Health & Welfare Fund - Retired
Local 3 IBEW Electricians WF	I.B.E.W. Local 3 New York City Electrical Division Health & Welfare Fund - Active
Local 3 NYC Communications Electricians AF	I.B.E.W. Local 3 New York City Communications Electricians Annuity Plan
Local 30 A-C Operating Municipal Engineers WF	Operating Engineers Union Local 30, 30-A, 30-B AND 30-C Municipal Employees Welfare Trust Fund
Local 30 A-D IUOE Engineers Annuity Fund	Local 30 I.U.O.E. City Employees Annuity Fund
Local 30 IUOE Municipal Employees RWF	Local 30 Municipal Retired Employees Welfare Trust Fund
Local 300 SEIU Civil Service Forum Annuity Fund	Service Employees International Union, Local 300 Civil Service Forum Annuity Fund
Local 300 Civil Service Forum RWF	Local 300 S.E.I.U., AFL-CIO Civil Service Forum Retired Employees' Welfare Fund
Local 300 Civil Service Forum WF	Local 300 S.E.I.U., AFL-CIO Civil Service Forum Active Employees' Welfare Fund
Local 306 Municipal Employees WF	Local 306 Health and Welfare Fund
Local 333 United Marine Division Annuity Fund	Local 333 Beneficial Fund Annuity Plan for New York City Employees
Local 333 United Marine Division RWF	Local 333 Insurance Fund for N.Y.C. Retirees
Local 333 United Marine Division WF	Local 333 Insurance Fund for N.Y.C. Employees
Local 371 Social Service Employees AF	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Annuity Fund
Local 371 Social Service Employees WF/Legal/EF/Admin	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Welfare Fund/Educational/ Legal/ Administrative
Local 40 Iron Workers Annuity Fund	Iron workers Local 40 Annuity Fund
Local 40 Iron Workers Welfare Fund	Iron Workers Local 40 Health Fund

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES - 2005

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
Local 444 Sanitation Officers Annuity Fund	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Compensation Accrual Fund
Local 444 Sanitation Officers RWF	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Retirees Welfare Fund
Local 444 Sanitation Officers WF	Local 444 Sanitation Officers' Security Benefits Fund
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters Annuity Fund	Structural Steel Painters Retirement Fund
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters RWF	Structural Steel and Bridge Painters Local 806 Retired Municipal Employees Welfare Trust Fund
Local 806 Structural Steel Painters WF	Structural Steel and Bridge Painters Local 806 Municipal Employees Welfare Trust Fund
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc AF	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Compensation Accrual Fund
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc RWF	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Retirees' Welfare Fund
Local 831 Uniformed Sanitationmen's Assoc WF	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Security Benefits Fund
Local 832 Teamsters RWF	Retirees Security Benefits Fund of Local 832 I.B.T.
Local 832 Teamsters WF	Security Benefit Fund of Local 832 I.B.T.
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc AF	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Annuity Fund
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc. RWF	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Retired Fire Officers Family Protection Plan
Local 854 Uniformed Fire Officers Assoc WF	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Retired Family Protection Plan
Local 858 IBT, (OTB) Branch Office Managers WF	Local 858 I.B. of T. Branch Office Managers (O.T.B.) Welfare Fund
Local 891 School Custod & Custod Engineers WF/RWF	Local 891 International Union of Operating Engineers, School Custodians and School Custodian Engineers Welfare Fund
Local 891(IUOE) Annuity Fund	International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 891 Annuity Fund
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Association AF	Compensation Accrual Fund of the Uniformed Firefighters Association AND Subsidiary
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc RWF	Retired Firefighters Security Benefit Fund of the Uniformed Firefighters Association
Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Association WF	Security Benefit Fund of the Uniformed Firefighters Association
Local No. 5 MNCPL Employees Benefit Trust Fund	Local No. 5 Municipal Employees Benefit Trust Fund
New York City Retirees WF	New York City Retirees Benefits Fund
New York State Court Clerks Association RWF	New York State Court Clerks Association Retirees' Security Benefits Fund
New York State Nurses Association WF	New York State Nurses Association Welfare Plan for New York City Employed Registered Professional Nurses
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc Annuity Fund	New York City Deputy Sheriffs Association Annuity Fund
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc RWF	New York City Deputy Sheriffs Association Security Benefits Fund Retirees
NYC Deputy Sheriffs Assoc WF	New York City Deputy Sheriffs Association Security Benefits Fund
NYC District Council of Carpenters AF	New York City District Council of Carpenters Annuity Fund
NYC District Council of Carpenters WF	New York City District Council of Carpenters Welfare Fund

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF OFFICIAL FUND NAMES - 2005

<u>Name of Fund Used in this Report</u>	<u>Official Name of Fund</u>
NYC Municipal Plumbers & Pipefitters WF	New York City Municipal Plumbers and Pipefitters Health and Welfare Fund
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers RWF	New York City Municipal Steamfitters and Steamfitter Helpers Retirees Health and Welfare Fund
NYC Muni. Steamfitters & Steamfitter Helpers WF	New York City Municipal Steamfitters and Steamfitter Helpers Health and Welfare Fund
NYS Court Officers Association RWF	New York State Court Officers Association Security Benefit Fund
NYS Supreme Court Uniformed Officers Assoc. RWF	New York State Supreme Court Officers Association Security Benefits Fund
Organization of Staff Analysts WF	Organization of Staff Analysts Welfare and Education Funds
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc Annuity Fund	Annuity Fund of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc RWF	Retiree Health and Welfare Fund of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York
Patrolmen's Benevolent Assoc WF/CLRF	Health and Welfare Fund of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York
Pavers & Roadbuilders District Council WF	Pavers and Road Builders District Council AFL-CIO Welfare Fund
Professional Staff Congress CUNY WF/RWF	PSC - CUNY Welfare Fund
Sergeants Benevolent Association (Police) AF	Sergeants Benevolent Association of the City of New York, Inc. Annuity Fund
Sergeants Benevolent Assoc.(Police) WF/RWF/CLRF	Sergeants Benevolent Association of the City of New York, Inc. Health & Welfare Fund/CLRF
Superior Officers Council (Police) AF	Superior Officers Council Annuity Trust Fund
Superior Officers Council (Police) RWF	Superior Officers Council Retiree Health and Welfare Fund
Superior Officers Council (Police) WF/CLRF/CEA	Superior Officers Council Health and Welfare Fund/Civil Legal Representation Fund
Surrogates & Supreme Court Reporters Assoc RWF	Welfare Fund of the Retirees of the Association of Surrogate's and Supreme Court Reporters within the City of New York
UFT Albert Shanker College Scholarship Fund	Albert Shanker College Scholarship Fund of the United Federation of Teachers
United Probation Officers Association RWF	United Probation Officers Association Retirement Welfare Fund
United Probation Officers Association WF	United Probation Officers Association Welfare Fund

EXHIBIT B

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA
2005

Page 1

NAME OF FUND	REF.	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC \$ PER FULL TIME MEMBER	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL / TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF													
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000													
LOCAL 306 MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES WF	56	70	1,275-1,475	82,909	13,316	96,225	80,469	18,818	99,287	-3,062	223,668	232.44%	0.00%
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY				82,909	13,316	96,225	80,469	18,818	99,287	-3,062	223,668	232.44%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000													
DISTRICT NO. 1 MESA BENE. FUND TRUST W/IAF	18	99	N/A	141,475	27,624	169,099	120,833	12,168	133,001	36,098	691,525	408.95%	47.03%
FIRE ALARM DISPATCHERS BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF	23	182	N/A	268,820	19,289	288,109	228,677	48,487	277,164	10,945	408,203	141.68%	-49.06%
LOCAL 3 IBEW CITY EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND	48	223	1,275	236,199	34,649	270,748	326,244	66,805	393,049	-122,301	903,770	333.80%	20.01%
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION RWF	59	181	1,275	288,869	12,054	300,923	279,079	36,412	315,491	-14,568	969,748	322.20%	16.86%
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS RWF	74	32	1,475	166,494	186	166,680	188,161	33,220	201,381	-34,721	-101,161	-80.70%	-121.82%
LOCAL 858 (IBT, (OTB) BRANCH OFFICE MANAGERS WF	79	173	N/A	271,821	31,413	303,234	247,300	72,826	290,126	13,108	503,880	166.17%	-40.26%
LOCAL NO. 6 MNCPL EMPLOYEES BENEFIT TRUST FUND	84	131	N/A	100,587	-20,978	79,609	127,185	19,876	147,060	-67,451	75,590	94.95%	-65.86%
NYC MUNL STEAMFITTERS & STEAMFITTER HELPERS WF	86	189	1,360-1,560	255,212	48,344	304,556	202,993	23,916	226,908	74,648	1,496,847	495.37%	78.48%
NYC MUNL STEAMFITTERS & STEAMFITTER HELPERS RWF	87	91	1,360-1,440	137,527	26,698	164,125	160,586	17,927	178,513	-4,488	736,977	449.03%	61.44%
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY				1,867,004	177,059	2,044,063	1,821,158	331,835	2,152,993	-108,730	5,666,379	278.14%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION													
ASSISTANT DEP WARDENS/DEP WARDENS WF/ RWF/CLRF	2	505	1,500	717,164	18,927	736,111	608,134	91,876	600,009	136,102	1,005,073	136.64%	-34.32%
DOCTORS COUNCIL RWF	21	449	N/A	540,287	128,652	668,939	576,023	137,783	713,806	-44,867	1,777,556	265.77%	27.84%
DOCTORS COUNCIL WF	22	988	N/A	977,708	364,760	1,342,468	1,196,892	266,834	1,463,726	-121,258	3,888,999	288.20%	38.63%
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS RWF	50	465	N/A	780,088	18,016	798,103	520,854	86,194	606,748	191,355	1,595,380	199.90%	-3.84%
LOCAL 30 UNDE MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES RWF	53	523	1,540-1,575	827,473	21,329	848,802	748,745	97,996	846,711	32,091	1,699,304	200.20%	-3.70%
LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM RWF	54	523	N/A	705,147	28,156	733,302	645,546	117,210	762,856	-29,554	533,768	72.79%	-84.99%
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION WF	60	297	1,225	335,631	4,837	340,368	399,884	47,881	447,465	-107,097	366,106	107.56%	-48.28%
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS WF	76	500	N/A	618,894	13,623	632,417	372,971	87,058	469,629	172,788	1,265,231	200.06%	-3.77%
NYC MUNICIPAL PLUMBERS & PIPEFITTERS WF	85	701	1,340	926,056	57,333	983,389	918,833	143,832	1,062,665	-79,276	3,184,415	323.82%	55.77%
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION RWF	110	357	N/A	664,682	4,823	669,505	448,930	111,328	560,258	9,247	614,639	107.93%	-48.08%
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY				5,993,050	660,264	7,653,304	6,306,882	1,187,991	7,493,873	159,431	16,910,471	207.69%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION													
CIVIL SERVICE BAR ASSOC WF	3	804	N/A	1,273,947	63,734	1,327,681	1,261,220	179,930	1,441,150	-113,469	833,231	62.76%	-53.97%
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION RWF	5	1,321	N/A	1,867,020	29,802	1,896,822	1,479,667	106,874	1,586,231	311,691	1,675,131	88.31%	-35.23%
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION WF/CLRF	6	880	N/A	1,282,132	30,781	1,312,913	1,008,976	93,499	1,101,576	211,338	1,999,241	162.28%	11.68%
DC 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY WFRWF (LOCAL 1969)	20	846	1,575	1,644,578	36,720	1,681,298	1,424,847	107,993	1,532,840	48,458	3,178,776	201.02%	47.43%
LOCAL 211 ALLIED BUILDING INSPECTORS WF	42	1,132	1,540	1,733,290	148,972	1,882,262	1,234,630	146,027	1,380,657	501,405	4,767,236	252.74%	85.38%
LOCAL 246 SEIU RWF	46	883	1,575	1,362,528	31,155	1,393,683	1,133,265	120,179	1,253,444	140,239	765,825	64.95%	-59.70%
LOCAL 246 SEIU WELFARE FUND	47	1,628	1,575	2,363,892	44,393	2,408,285	1,982,896	236,982	2,198,878	209,407	1,795,838	74.67%	-45.31%
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS WF	51	1,229	N/A	1,772,670	90,464	1,863,124	989,008	183,585	1,172,593	690,561	4,622,001	248.08%	81.94%
LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM WF	55	965	N/A	1,408,279	77,006	1,485,284	1,343,788	176,547	1,518,335	-34,051	1,246,093	83.90%	-38.47%
LOCAL 30A-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS WF	57	849	1,540-1,575	1,307,032	12,116	1,319,148	1,326,668	109,878	1,436,446	-117,298	205,667	15.59%	-88.67%
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS WF	65	1,196	1,665	1,772,326	44,435	1,816,760	1,422,801	90,697	1,513,498	303,262	1,769,477	98.65%	-28.97%
LICENSED PRACTICAL NURSES WF	68	1,082	N/A	1,685,844	136,842	1,822,686	1,529,391	188,062	1,717,443	85,243	4,426,403	246.54%	60.08%
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION WF	109	811	N/A	1,243,993	63,783	1,307,776	1,163,812	268,645	1,432,457	-144,681	1,911,469	146.16%	7.19%
TOTAL \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY				20,597,630	800,292	21,397,822	17,300,169	2,065,568	19,365,717	2,032,105	29,176,368	136.35%	

EXHIBIT B
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC \$ PER FULL TIME MEMBER	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	ECESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL / TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF (cont'd)													
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION													
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC RWF	7	4,572	N/A	7,277,704	83,382	7,361,086	5,671,312	527,744	6,399,056	862,040	4,895,816	68.51%	-50.03%
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION WF	16	6,867	N/A	8,987,726	705,227	9,692,953	7,613,280	440,772	8,054,052	1,638,901	21,988,576	228.85%	70.23%
HOUSE STAFF COMM OF INTERNS & RESIDENTS WF/LEGAL	24	1,917	N/A	3,177,581	862,913	4,040,494	2,882,738	642,713	3,525,452	515,042	5,888,618	145.74%	9.37%
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMIN. WF	25	5,361	1,429	8,530,000	993,867	9,523,867	8,560,226	687,238	9,257,464	266,403	11,810,524	125.06%	-6.15%
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMIN. RWF	26	6,731	935-1,372	8,852,692	879,388	9,732,080	7,481,002	798,173	8,279,176	1,452,905	14,673,712	150.76%	13.15%
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT RWF	29	6,176	N/A	9,685,539	1,479,709	11,165,248	11,491,325	1,598,541	13,089,866	-1,924,618	28,465,370	264.95%	91.32%
LOCAL 1182 CWA SECURITY BENEFIT FUND RWF/WF/LEGAL	33	2,093	N/A	3,238,600	547,537	3,786,137	2,652,992	525,560	3,378,542	407,595	2,987,898	78.92%	-40.78%
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS RWF	64	2,513	1,390	3,511,998	302,188	3,814,187	2,871,287	205,788	3,077,075	737,112	8,803,772	230.82%	73.21%
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSC RWF	72	7,100	1,425	8,813,770	254,996	10,068,766	8,975,893	401,167	10,377,060	-308,294	3,474,405	34.51%	-74.10%
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSDC WF	73	6,700	1,425	8,832,280	483,961	9,326,241	7,199,488	907,278	8,106,763	1,219,478	10,871,354	116.57%	-12.52%
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC WF	77	2,433	1,410	3,262,267	396,936	4,259,203	3,454,616	227,369	3,681,985	577,216	8,878,900	208.46%	56.43%
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC. RWF	78	4,599	1,410	6,741,363	344,664	7,086,027	6,533,304	465,236	6,998,540	-1,912,513	4,059,212	67.28%	-57.02%
LOCAL 891 SCHOOL CUSTOD & CUSTOD ENGINEERS WFR/W	80	1,485	1,475	3,013,255	22,645	3,035,900	1,901,501	169,806	2,071,307	964,593	2,734,307	90.07%	-32.41%
NEW YORK CITY RETIREES WF	89	4,000	1,080-1,560	6,214,418	317,314	6,531,732	6,611,011	327,095	6,938,106	-406,374	7,338,896	112.36%	-16.68%
ORGANIZATION OF STAFF ANALYSTS WF	93	5,244	N/A	8,287,884	615,291	8,903,176	7,003,886	1,028,339	8,032,225	870,950	15,506,416	174.16%	30.69%
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) RWF	105	4,419	1,465	6,444,114	206,583	6,651,697	7,049,680	385,752	7,445,432	-793,735	168,835	2.54%	-98.00%
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) WF/CLRF/ACEA	106	2,454	1,465	3,516,166	211,274	3,827,440	3,415,859	246,460	3,662,319	165,121	6,676,099	148.30%	11.29%
TOTAL \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY				110,988,358	8,717,865	118,806,243	104,769,401	9,605,018	114,374,419	4,431,824	158,321,709	133.26%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION													
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/CLRF	9	6,315	N/A	13,558,026	131,142	13,689,168	12,457,317	841,313	13,298,630	400,538	11,262,995	82.22%	-17.25%
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION RWF	15	9,178	N/A	14,250,107	546,953	14,797,060	12,978,607	504,261	13,482,868	1,314,192	12,168,656	82.43%	-17.04%
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOC RWF	81	9,699	1,540	15,469,814	688,186	16,158,000	13,625,844	626,583	14,252,427	1,905,573	6,849,622	38.20%	-63.67%
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION WF	83	6,735	1,465	13,174,001	2,660,883	15,834,884	11,503,366	882,639	12,386,005	3,468,889	30,497,252	192.60%	93.84%
NEW YORK STATE NURSES ASSOCIATION WF	82	6,377	1,540	10,052,736	777,603	10,830,339	10,295,561	838,945	11,134,496	-304,157	10,901,972	100.66%	1.31%
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOC.(POLICE) WF/RWF/CLRF	113	10,544	N/A	16,219,844	419,632	16,639,476	13,058,107	891,543	13,949,650	2,689,826	17,124,269	102.91%	3.57%
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT WF/LEGAL/IED	28&30	7,800	N/A	12,314,397	3,023,420	15,337,817	12,883,153	2,091,177	14,974,330	363,487	18,520,866	120.75%	21.53%
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS RWF	44&86	7,873	900-1,590	12,271,164	236,354	12,507,518	11,559,648	1,657,208	13,216,856	-710,338	8,711,926	69.66%	-28.89%
TOTAL \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY				107,320,089	8,483,173	116,803,262	98,461,583	8,213,689	108,675,252	9,128,010	115,055,657	99.36%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION OVER \$20 MILLION													
DC 37 WF	10	155,185	1,357-1,540	217,000,541	14,258,279	231,258,820	223,385,438	16,588,389	240,073,827	-8,816,007	139,497,027	60.32%	-12.53%
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES WF/LEGAL/EF/ADA	62	15,194	N/A	23,370,588	181,821	23,552,409	19,993,879	2,587,350	22,681,229	971,160	1,796,006	7.63%	-88.94%
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC RWF	96	21,846	1,465	31,630,277	605,619	32,235,896	29,730,813	2,698,995	32,429,808	-183,912	29,140,729	90.31%	30.96%
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/CLRF	97	23,005	1,465	36,070,021	4,058,730	40,128,751	30,699,880	3,611,714	34,311,394	5,815,357	39,616,187	96.73%	43.17%
LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHERS WF	41	160,282	N/A	240,828,208	3,259,454	244,087,662	226,665,447	20,343,860	247,009,307	-2,924,645	134,719,221	55.19%	-19.97%
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS WF	45&67	18,435	900-1,895	28,881,474	2,924,476	31,805,950	31,334,776	3,017,978	34,352,753	-2,546,803	71,138,141	223.66%	224.33%
TOTAL OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY				577,781,109	26,286,379	603,067,488	561,810,032	48,548,285	610,758,318	-7,690,830	415,677,321	68.96%	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED FUNDS				824,730,049	44,136,358	868,866,407	790,548,684	70,310,975	860,859,659	8,008,748	740,260,473	85.20%	

EXHIBIT B

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA
2005

Page 3

NAME OF FUND	REF	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC \$ PER FULL TIME MEMBER	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL / TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
INSURED WF & RWF													
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000													
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC RWF	12	35	N/A	40,483	8,423	48,906	49,184	5,858	55,042	-6,136	112,488	230.01%	-52.98%
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS RWF	69	33	N/A	52,390	1,037	53,427	26,012	1,726	27,738	25,689	282,714	528.16%	8.18%
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS WF	70	44	N/A	69,573	1,717	71,290	24,825	1,737	26,562	44,728	454,057	636.92%	30.21%
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY				162,446	11,177	173,623	100,021	9,321	109,342	64,281	849,269	489.14%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000													
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC WF	13	129	N/A	157,489	3,565	161,054	161,789	4,262	186,051	-24,997	68,279	36.16%	-87.21%
LOCAL 14A-14B IUOE WFRWF	37	79	1,540	119,589	12,476	132,065	58,070	34,036	92,106	39,959	770,658	583.54%	106.35%
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY				277,088	16,041	293,129	219,869	38,298	276,167	14,962	828,937	282.79%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION													
LOCAL 1161 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES RWF	31	208	N/A	351,053	10,385	361,438	337,301	51,672	388,973	-27,555	420,253	116.28%	-70.52%
LOCAL 1161 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES WF	32	362	N/A	558,786	74,120	632,906	467,010	145,947	612,957	19,949	553,438	103.24%	-73.83%
LOCAL 15A-C OPERATING ENGINEERS WFRWF	38	323	1,090-1,475	451,730	115,547	567,277	227,893	84,589	322,482	274,795	5,204,590	871.39%	120.91%
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY				1,361,569	200,032	1,581,601	1,032,204	292,208	1,324,412	257,189	5,276,281	394.45%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION OVER \$20 MILLION													
PROFESSIONAL STAFF CONGRESS CUNY WFRWF	101	16,241	1,175-1,615	25,248,845	688,652	25,937,497	27,643,987	1,267,765	28,911,752	-2,974,255	3,736,195	14.40%	0.00%
TOTAL OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY				25,248,845	688,652	25,937,497	27,643,987	1,267,765	28,911,752	-2,974,255	3,736,195	14.40%	
TOTAL INSURED FUNDS				27,079,948	916,902	27,996,850	28,016,081	1,607,592	30,623,673	-2,627,823	11,592,672	41.77%	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED AND INSURED FUNDS				651,809,997	45,054,260	696,864,257	619,564,765	71,918,587	691,483,332	5,380,925	751,953,145	83.84%	

EXHIBIT B

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA
2015

Page 4

NAME OF FUND	REF	NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS	NYC \$ PER FULL TIME MEMBER	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	OTHER REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	BENEFIT EXPENSES	ADMIN EXPENSES	TOTAL EXPENSES	EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES	FUND BALANCE	FUND BAL / TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
ANNUITY FUNDS													
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000													
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	11	154	N/A	26,114	15,605	40,719	32,629	0	32,629	6,090	644,901	1338.20%	-1.82%
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION ANNUITY FUND	58	898	250	68,332	111,881	180,013	111,277	49,227	160,504	19,509	2,463,694	1366.62%	0.41%
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY				93,446	127,286	220,732	143,906	49,227	193,133	27,599	3,008,595	1363.01%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000													
ASSISTANT DEP WARDENS/DEP WARDENS ASSOC AF	1	165	N/A	141,732	124,151	265,883	478,098	54,610	532,708	-266,825	4,831,525	1817.16%	0.00%
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY				141,732	124,151	265,883	478,098	54,610	532,708	-266,825	4,831,525	1817.16%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION													
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	4	888	N/A	572,463	540,877	1,113,340	2,162,688	175,892	2,338,580	-1,225,240	18,284,798	1642.07%	37.98%
LOCAL 3 NYC COMMUNICATIONS ELECTRICIANS AF	127	65	N/A	578,738	242,906	821,644	170,375	88,738	259,113	562,531	4,746,810	577.72%	-51.46%
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY				1,151,201	783,783	1,934,984	2,333,063	264,630	2,597,693	-662,709	23,028,608	1190.12%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION													
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS ANNUITY FUND	63	1,197	N/A	2,846,462	1,237,280	4,083,742	3,312,690	218,411	3,531,101	552,441	28,158,198	689.52%	19.00%
LOCAL 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) OPERATING MUNI. ENGINEERS AJ	117	430	N/A	1,192,307	483,577	1,675,884	863,908	163,066	1,026,974	648,910	14,882,727	888.05%	53.27%
DOCTORS COUNCIL ANNUITY FUND	124	1,365	N/A	2,704,653	460,860	3,165,513	231,444	148,090	379,534	2,785,979	13,956,987	440.91%	-23.90%
LOCAL 300 SERJ CIVIL SERVICE FORUM ANNUITY FUND	125	903	N/A	1,038,183	128,559	1,166,742	243,359	63,784	307,143	859,599	5,341,065	457.78%	-20.99%
LOCAL 89 (IUOE) ANNUITY FUND	126	1,117	2,356	1,149,926	167,835	1,307,761	178,043	91,734	269,774	1,037,987	6,987,944	534.34%	-7.78%
LOCAL 246 SERJ NYC ANNUITY FUND	128	1,839	N/A	1,897,259	315,108	2,212,368	363,091	101,900	464,991	1,747,377	9,541,763	431.29%	-26.56%
TOTAL \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY				10,828,790	2,783,220	13,612,010	5,182,736	786,982	5,979,717	7,632,293	78,886,682	579.41%	

EXHIBIT B
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA
2005

<u>NAME OF FUND</u>	<u>REF</u>	<u>NUMBER OF NYC MEMBERS</u>	<u>NYC \$ PER FULL TIME MEMBER</u>	<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE</u>	<u>OTHER REVENUE</u>	<u>TOTAL REVENUE</u>	<u>BENEFIT EXPENSES</u>	<u>ADMIN EXPENSES</u>	<u>TOTAL EXPENSES</u>	<u>EXCESS OF REVENUE OVER EXPENSES</u>	<u>FUND BALANCE</u>	<u>FUND BAL / TOTAL REV</u>	<u>DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE</u>
ANNUITY FUNDS (cont'd)													
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION													
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC AF	8	6,307	N/A	3,550,832	3,458,746	7,009,578	7,568,593	597,100	8,165,793	-1,156,215	63,931,130	912.05%	10.07%
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	14	5,508	N/A	5,698,305	10,824,033	16,522,339	11,060,323	1,134,720	12,195,043	4,327,296	167,809,065	1015.65%	22.56%
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOC AF	71	6,300	1,370	6,693,650	1,760,730	10,454,380	8,055,809	474,732	8,530,541	1,923,839	82,041,492	784.76%	-5.29%
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC AF	76	3,789	1,044-2,610	4,364,592	5,515,302	9,879,894	4,888,424	235,579	5,224,003	4,655,991	114,951,224	1163.47%	40.42%
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION AF	82	8,894	N/A	9,402,094	4,846,347	14,248,441	6,317,834	336,172	6,654,006	7,594,435	105,170,080	738.12%	-10.92%
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) AF	104	2,499	N/A	4,860,163	11,643,781	16,303,944	9,235,068	1,002,305	10,237,973	6,065,971	151,798,976	931.05%	12.37%
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) AF	112	4,671	N/A	5,264,683	10,342,689	15,607,352	5,647,541	583,773	6,231,314	9,376,038	140,361,032	899.45%	8.55%
LOCAL 30A-D IUOE ENGINEERS ANNUITY FUND	114	1,067	N/A	4,885,946	2,907,546	7,793,492	1,636,351	34,414	1,670,765	6,122,727	49,909,611	640.40%	-22.71%
LOCAL 1180 CWA MEMBERS ANNUITY FUND	119	11,129	N/A	3,944,744	1,435,833	5,380,577	779,466	185,456	964,932	4,415,645	28,092,388	522.11%	-36.99%
DISTRICT COUNCIL 37 AFSCME ANNUITY FUND	121	75,686	261-1,116	4,252,693	3,370,525	7,623,218	1,416,510	795,877	2,212,387	5,410,831	51,741,149	678.73%	-18.09%
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES AF	123	15,194	478	7,130,336	503,638	7,633,974	660,554	151,537	812,091	6,821,883	25,697,533	336.62%	-59.37%
TOTAL \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY				61,848,139	56,609,160	118,457,299	67,366,573	5,532,275	62,898,848	55,558,441	581,523,680	828.59%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION													
LOCAL 257 TEAMSTERS ANNUITY FUND	43	13,339	N/A	13,402,752	4,771,877	18,174,629	4,535,925	679,522	5,215,447	12,959,182	98,191,905	540.27%	-24.34%
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	95	28,533	522	12,101,227	7,986,774	20,088,001	13,880,935	846,562	14,727,497	5,360,504	175,047,008	871.40%	22.03%
TOTAL \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY				25,503,979	12,758,651	38,262,630	18,416,860	1,526,084	18,942,944	18,319,686	273,238,913	714.11%	
TOTAL ANNUITY FUNDS				98,567,287	73,186,241	172,753,528	83,931,235	8,213,808	92,145,043	80,608,465	1,364,500,004	789.85%	
GRAND TOTAL				951,377,284	118,240,501	1,069,617,785	903,496,000	80,132,376	983,628,376	85,989,410	2,116,453,149	197.87%	

EXHIBIT B
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF FINANCIAL DATA
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	NYC \$ PER FULL TIME MEMBER	NYC CONTRIBUTION REVENUE	NYC % OF TOTAL REVENUE	TOTAL REVENUE	FUND BALANCE
NYS SUPREME COURT UNIFORMED OFFICERS ASSOC. RWF (1)	107	\$1,240	\$2,480	0.13%	\$1,911,261	\$1,177,225
LOCAL 1199 NATIONAL BEN FUND HOSP HEALTH CARE WF(1)	35	\$1,518-1,540	\$3,686,933	0.41%	\$902,493,022	\$281,735,011
LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS WELFARE FUND (1)	118	\$1,358-1,475	\$115,159	0.25%	\$46,292,066	\$21,169,386
NYS COURT OFFICERS ASSOCIATION RWF (1)	91	N/A	\$7,262	0.24%	\$3,043,610	\$5,979,757
NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS WF (1)	88	\$106.25/MO	\$1,653,675	0.95%	\$173,893,653	\$210,390,063
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICAL WORKERS INDUSTRY AF (1)	49	9.81/HR	\$4,308,163	3.77%	\$114,151,500	\$957,348,159
DC 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY ANNUITY FUND (LOCAL 1969) (1)	19	\$2/DAY	\$283,779	0.98%	\$29,010,305	\$251,822,271
LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS ANNUITY FUND (1)	111	N/A	\$1,028,160	2.52%	\$40,800,519	\$439,888,406
PAVERS & ROADBUILDERS DISTRICT COUNCIL WF (1)	100	\$115-\$121	\$566,610	3.70%	\$15,332,831	\$18,771,351
SURROGATES & SUPREME COURT REPORTERS ASSOC RWF (1)	108	\$785	\$3,990	2.39%	\$166,614	\$480,053
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS ANNUITY FUND (2)	120	N/A	\$236,975	3.61%	\$6,562,650	\$45,629,683
NEW YORK STATES COURT CLERKS ASSOCIATION RWF(2)	90	\$930	\$40,300	4.27%	\$942,985	\$1,436,943
NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS AF (2)	116	\$4.87/HR	\$11,053,683	7.17%	\$154,081,264	\$969,681,081
LOCAL 1 PLUMBING INDUSTRY ANNUITY FUND (2)	27	\$6,240-3,120	\$2,357,586	9.42%	\$25,038,671	\$114,415,739
UFT ALBERT SHANKER COLLEGE SCHOLARSHIP FUND (3)	40	N/A	\$1,400,000	98.84%	\$1,011,722	\$45,102
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOC CLRF FUND (4)	See #16	\$75	\$428,939	69.43%	\$617,762	\$4,205,838
CAPTAINS ENDOWMENT ASSOC CLRF FUND (4)	See #106	N/A	\$56,776	98.89%	\$57,412	\$236,463
COMMITTEE OF INTERNS AND RESIDENTS EDUCATION FUND (4)	122	N/A	\$937,890	91.44%	\$1,025,697	\$1,448,017
LOCAL 1183 CWA BOARD OF ELECTIONS BENEFIT FUND WF (5)	34		\$622,450			
			<u>TOTAL</u>		<u>\$28,390,810</u>	

NA - Amount of per member contribution was not provided by the Fund

The above listed funds have been excluded from this analysis because:

- (1) These funds were excluded from our analysis because they received a substantial portion of their revenues from sources other than the City.
- (2) These funds would distort the specific groups' category averages since they maintain other groups' health plans that receive substantial revenues not contributed by the City of New York.
- (3) Under the United Federation of Teachers's collective bargaining agreement, scholarship benefits are paid only to public high school students.
- (4) These funds had different fiscal year-end dates than their associated welfare funds consolidation of these funds with their associated welfare fund would have distorted the information reported.
- (5) Local 1183 - CWA Board of Elections Benefit Fund was excluded from this analysis because it failed to submit a Directive # 12 filing for 2005.

EXHIBIT C

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES

2005

Page 1

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXP.	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMSN	LEGAL	ACCTNG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELEPHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSURANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	RETENTION	INVEST CUSTODIAL SVS
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF																
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000																
LOCAL 304 MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES WF	56	18,818	0	0	3,667	0	4,435	0	0	0	0	5,124	0	591	0	0
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY		18,818	0	0	3,667	0	4,435	0	0	0	0	5,124	0	591	0	0
		100.00%	0.00%	0.00%	46.06%	0.00%	23.57%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	27.23%	0.00%	3.14%	0.00%	0.00%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000																
DISTRICT NO. 1 MEBA BENE. FUND TRUST WFI&F	18	12,168	0	0	3,658	0	4,513	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3,992
FIRE ALARM DISPATCHERS BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF	23	48,487	7,829	16,545	0	0	3,400	3,420	6,238	905	3,796	405	0	949	0	0
LOCAL 3 IBEW CITY EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND	48	66,905	0	0	31,598	3,095	6,086	20,229	0	325	0	3,698	0	1,794	0	0
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION RWF	59	36,412	0	0	0	0	3,750	0	0	770	175	0	0	26,717	0	0
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS RWF	74	33,220	0	0	31,270	0	1,500	0	0	0	450	0	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 858 IRT, (OTB) BRANCH OFFICE MANAGERS WF	79	72,826	6,265	11,193	10,654	29,246	6,107	2,275	593	189	2,437	2,813	0	1,055	0	0
LOCAL NO. 5 MNCPL EMPLOYEES BENEFIT TRUST FUND	84	19,875	2,378	11,643	455	0	4,000	46	506	0	363	467	0	77	0	0
NYC MUNL STEAMFITTERS & STEAMFITTER HELPERS WF	86	23,915	0	0	12,988	1,500	4,886	0	0	0	0	3,332	0	1,309	0	0
NYC MUNL STEAMFITTERS & STEAMFITTER HELPERS RWF	87	17,927	0	0	5,864	750	5,385	0	0	0	0	1,941	0	3,987	0	0
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY		331,635	16,472	39,381	96,387	34,590	44,612	26,970	7,337	2,189	12,221	12,586	0	35,883	0	3,992
		100.00%	4.97%	11.87%	29.06%	10.43%	13.45%	7.83%	2.21%	0.66%	3.69%	3.80%	0.00%	10.82%	0.00%	1.20%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION																
ASSISTANT DEP WARDENS/DEP WARDENS WFI RWF/CLRF	2	91,875	10,080	21,934	17,946	6,250	8,000	3,741	3,689	1,215	17,174	1,346	0	0	0	0
DOCTORS COUNCIL RWF	21	137,783	11,251	34,664	36,244	5,172	6,081	0	480	0	11,486	6,224	0	12,131	0	12,050
DOCTORS COUNCIL WF	22	286,834	25,269	75,911	80,978	17,317	9,927	1,298	991	0	22,597	9,975	0	4,370	0	19,201
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS RWF	50	86,194	897	38,503	17,891	2,475	4,600	1,964	1,151	0	2,259	1,169	601	1,131	0	13,753
LOCAL 10 IBEW MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES RWF	53	97,896	1,825	52,265	1,590	12,000	7,750	1,475	333	11,013	9,835	0	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM RWF	54	117,210	8,982	15,135	47,191	4,600	8,200	12,575	0	3,453	12,706	524	0	0	0	2,843
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION WF	60	47,881	0	31,304	0	0	9,500	0	0	984	914	0	0	5,179	0	0
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS WF	75	37,958	10,000	0	56,814	0	3,000	11,340	0	0	0	0	0	1,489	0	4,415
NYC MUNICIPAL PLUMBERS & PIPEFITTERS WF	85	143,932	0	0	77,552	7,464	8,138	22,842	0	0	1,130	5,349	0	5,631	0	15,626
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION RWF	110	111,328	414	0	60,000	2,700	5,720	0	415	36,235	2,112	1,092	0	2,640	0	0
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		1,187,991	68,718	270,707	398,116	57,973	70,816	55,335	7,069	62,900	80,213	25,179	601	32,571	0	67,888
		100.00%	5.78%	22.79%	33.51%	4.88%	5.96%	4.66%	0.60%	4.45%	6.75%	2.12%	0.04%	2.74%	0.00%	5.71%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION																
CIVIL SERVICE BAR ASSOC WF	3	179,930	910	6,000	149,187	0	11,350	2,107	0	0	1,130	8,911	0	307	0	28
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION RWF	5	105,574	9,137	3,918	57,716	4,406	7,000	6,988	3,137	576	3,454	875	0	2	7,755	1,410
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION WFI&CLRF	6	93,499	18,274	7,836	25,584	7,027	7,000	6,989	6,274	1,152	5,180	1,002	0	32	5,279	1,870
DC 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY WFI&RWF (LOCAL 1959)	20	107,983	3,540	55,968	34,009	0	3,710	0	729	314	0	0	0	100	0	9,823
LOCAL 211 ALLIED BUILDING INSPECTORS WF	42	146,027	25,795	35,400	37,851	9,000	14,600	0	3,097	6,927	7,020	6,437	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 246 SEIU RWF	46	120,179	13,340	54,163	31,317	6,500	4,900	0	1,970	1,589	5,626	774	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 246 SEIU WELFARE FUND	47	235,982	25,826	104,862	59,989	15,500	4,900	0	3,813	4,319	15,950	823	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS WF	51	183,555	2,427	79,378	35,537	6,025	8,500	5,121	3,114	286	6,106	2,178	1,748	727	0	33,400
LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM WF	55	175,547	9,264	30,322	74,631	13,800	8,200	16,190	0	3,811	10,785	931	0	1,439	0	6,174
LOCAL 30A-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS WF	57	109,878	1,944	48,075	1,500	17,046	7,750	3,224	620	13,463	4,184	2,072	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS WF	88	90,697	20,000	7,967	38,134	3,800	9,700	2,942	0	0	370	1,281	0	0	0	6,703
LICENSED PRACTICAL NURSES WF	88	188,052	0	92,694	37,806	12,000	29,346	4,499	0	4,732	3,042	3,453	0	380	0	0
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION WF	109	288,845	308	0	162,000	8,600	14,300	0	1,148	57,377	10,684	0	0	13,728	0	0
TOTAL \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY		2,005,558	131,264	538,583	745,361	102,604	131,186	48,060	23,902	94,566	73,531	28,437	1,746	16,716	12,434	59,298
		100.00%	6.56%	26.75%	37.16%	5.12%	6.54%	2.40%	1.19%	4.71%	3.67%	1.42%	0.09%	0.83%	0.62%	2.95%

EXHIBIT C

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXP.	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMISSN	LEGAL	ACCT'NG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELE-PHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSUR-ANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	RETENTION	INVEST CUSTODIAL SVS	
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF (cont'd)																	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION																	
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC RWF	7	527,744	32,092	119,728	336,016	0	13,800	0	4,941	7,436	5,705	2,339	0	4,167	0	1,000	
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION WF	16	440,772	0	180,158	136,000	15,000	16,375	0	5,160	4,139	11,150	10,796	0	4,381	57,057	557	
HOUSE STAFF COMM OF INTERNS & RESIDENTS WF/LEGAL	24	642,713	71,440	326,107	53,544	1,140	24,165	33,099	3,655	87,951	34,123	23,315	4,085	-27,439	0	13,528	
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMIN. WF	25	697,238	56,229	498,078	20,912	4,800	8,370	2,414	6,905	20,770	25,363	19,051	0	6,083	0	27,283	
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMIN. RWF	26	798,173	68,408	560,823	24,588	4,800	8,370	303	8,524	25,638	37,707	16,133	0	13,479	0	28,300	
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT RWF	29	1,598,541	129,202	581,282	181,037	29,507	17,900	61,906	38,808	211,177	140,330	17,399	24,841	92,139	0	105,013	
LOCAL 1182 CWA SECURITY BENEFIT FUND RWF/LEGAL	33	525,650	49,423	235,572	54,386	26,400	13,000	15,566	7,512	26,698	18,684	13,193	0	62,635	0	12,381	
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS RWF	64	205,788	20,000	21,161	91,188	3,600	9,700	4,342	0	0	1,303	7,267	0	0	0	47,247	
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSC RWF	72	401,167	16,042	104,903	211,564	20,123	29,004	0	5,000	0	3,922	498	0	0	0	11,111	
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOC WF	73	907,275	135,000	297,647	111,436	41,037	29,004	0	3,180	7,022	81,619	9,333	157,179	7,923	0	26,985	
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC WF	77	227,369	7,025	120,391	0	12,368	9,300	5,691	1,840	2,888	3,672	48,060	0	-50,966	67,100	0	
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC. RWF	78	465,236	25,222	148,650	24,218	19,798	9,300	4,842	2,088	10,713	3,791	2,675	0	0	215,238	0	
LOCAL 881 SCHOOL CUSTOD & CUSTOD ENGINEERS W/FRM	80	169,806	0	0	57,038	23,250	28,000	8,177	2,497	349	5,443	4,685	0	0	17,619	21,748	
NEW YORK CITY RETIREES WF	89	327,095	0	0	176,288	3,625	15,410	16,271	0	0	8,987	8,431	0	98,083	0	0	
ORGANIZATION OF STAFF ANALYSTS WF	93	1,028,339	149,938	555,718	236,455	0	15,250	0	15,772	14,480	29,600	6,936	0	4,190	0	0	
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) RWF	105	395,752	22,136	99,470	233,420	0	8,400	390	3,782	7,329	13,798	5,406	0	1,821	0	0	
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) WF/CLRF/ICEA	106	246,460	22,136	99,470	87,744	0	8,400	390	3,782	7,329	10,964	5,406	0	839	0	0	
TOTAL \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY		9,605,018	805,296	3,841,058	2,005,914	206,446	263,748	153,291	111,446	433,919	438,161	201,322	186,105	207,158	357,014	286,143	
		100.00%	8.38%	41.03%	20.88%	2.14%	2.75%	1.60%	1.16%	4.52%	4.56%	2.10%	1.94%	2.16%	3.72%	3.07%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION																	
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/CLRF	9	341,313	32,092	118,809	626,877	0	34,700	0	9,881	7,436	7,239	2,838	0	1,440	0	0	
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION RWF	15	504,261	0	184,360	223,637	8,833	16,375	0	5,160	4,139	9,084	10,797	0	11,828	49,783	265	
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOC RWF	61	626,583	26,326	199,929	266,006	9,700	12,000	4,284	9,188	58,754	7,613	4,811	0	19,000	0	8,973	
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION WF	83	362,639	28,325	315,455	248,587	21,227	12,000	5,780	9,189	86,102	14,003	5,610	3,705	0	0	134,656	
NEW YORK STATE NURSES ASSOCIATION WF	92	838,945	84,750	75,250	264,634	15,165	9,800	9,760	7,000	10,500	17,504	8,939	0	0	236,647	58,996	
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOC.(POLICE) WF/RWF/CLRF	113	891,543	12,694	413,903	287,167	48,000	21,252	0	0	51,035	45,820	2,204	466	9,022	0	0	
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT WF/LEGAL/ED	288.30	2,091,177	137,668	807,078	262,006	34,425	22,560	-3,722	60,040	72,928	204,269	33,521	306,706	123,705	0	40,003	
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS RWF	448.66	1,557,208	128,566	793,493	302,613	33,694	21,460	33,193	7,580	13,798	166,089	10,689	0	46,822	0	10,291	
TOTAL \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		8,213,959	428,440	2,888,277	2,481,617	170,944	160,127	49,295	99,038	284,692	461,621	79,420	310,867	210,817	346,430	253,184	
		100.00%	5.22%	35.16%	30.21%	2.08%	1.83%	0.60%	1.19%	3.47%	5.62%	0.97%	3.78%	2.57%	4.22%	3.08%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION OVER \$20 MILLION																	
DC 37 WF	10	16,888,389	959,870	9,157,921	208,375	336,218	208,108	77,811	72,806	3,876,794	1,065,796	210,345	95,036	191,312	0	228,199	
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES WF/LEGAL/EF/ADM	52	2,587,360	201,501	1,298,759	244,320	97,500	48,750	6,230	24,223	125,800	127,792	24,695	0	379,324	0	8,756	
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC RWF	96	2,698,995	469,142	1,442,708	242,943	59,422	136,364	0	33,007	130,652	91,089	57,908	36,750	0	0	0	
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/CLRF	97	3,611,714	581,184	1,975,119	310,490	125,915	171,393	0	32,094	180,634	114,475	76,737	43,673	0	0	0	
LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHERS WF	41	20,343,860	3,003,662	9,542,013	5,895,093	188,721	62,173	18,480	113,426	805,768	484,030	81,119	242,623	21,309	0	204,443	
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS WF	458.67	3,017,978	15,584	1,208,055	662,169	104,435	62,598	15,132	14,771	95,095	217,410	64,537	47,929	250,219	0	250,044	
TOTAL OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		48,948,286	6,230,943	24,624,576	7,253,390	912,211	669,386	117,463	290,327	5,215,543	2,100,601	515,241	465,010	382,164	0	671,442	
		100.00%	10.69%	60.31%	14.82%	1.86%	1.37%	0.24%	0.59%	10.66%	4.29%	1.05%	0.95%	1.80%	0.00%	1.37%	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED FUNDS																	
		70,310,975	6,681,134	32,300,561	12,989,362	1,483,773	1,334,281	449,404	538,119	6,083,799	3,166,348	897,319	964,229	1,385,901	716,878	1,350,857	
		100.00%	9.50%	46.94%	18.47%	2.11%	1.90%	0.64%	0.77%	8.65%	4.50%	1.23%	1.37%	1.97%	1.02%	1.92%	

EXHIBIT C

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXP.	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMSN	LEGAL	ACCT'NG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELE- PHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSUR- ANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	RETENTION	INVEST CUSTODIAL SVS	
INSURED WF & RWF																	
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000																	
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC RWF	12	5,858	1,500	0	1,200	0	2,900	0	0	0	258	0	0	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS RWF	69	1,726	0	0	0	0	1,560	0	0	0	0	176	0	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS WF	70	1,737	0	0	0	0	1,475	0	0	0	0	205	0	0	0	57	0
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY		9,321	1,500	0	1,200	0	5,925	0	0	0	258	381	0	0	0	57	0
		100.00%	16.09%	0.00%	12.67%	0.00%	63.67%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	2.77%	4.09%	0.00%	0.00%	0.61%	0.00%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000																	
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC WF	13	4,262	0	0	0	0	2,900	0	0	0	0	0	0	1,362	0	0	0
LOCAL 14A-14B IUOE WFRWF	37	34,036	787	27,833	0	0	2,000	0	0	0	0	3,416	0	0	0	0	0
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY		38,298	787	27,833	0	0	4,900	0	0	0	0	3,416	0	1,362	0	0	0
		100.00%	2.05%	72.67%	0.00%	0.00%	12.79%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	8.92%	0.00%	3.56%	0.00%	0.00%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION																	
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES RWF	31	51,672	0	0	76	5,250	3,513	0	0	748	98	0	0	39,202	0	1,785	
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES WF	32	145,947	28,613	0	8,080	3,750	4,600	50,479	3,905	8,499	3,378	2,371	2,209	-36,296	64,800	1,679	
LOCAL 15A-C OPERATING ENGINEERS WFRWF	38	94,589	2,382	51,700	0	4,000	8,645	0	0	3,060	4,988	6,706	0	0	0	11,868	
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		292,208	31,005	51,700	6,136	14,000	17,858	50,479	3,905	12,337	8,464	9,077	2,209	2,906	64,800	15,332	
		100.00%	10.61%	17.69%	2.78%	4.79%	6.11%	17.28%	1.34%	4.22%	2.90%	3.11%	0.76%	0.99%	22.18%	5.25%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION OVER \$20 MILLION																	
PROFESSIONAL STAFF CONGRESS CUNY WFRWF	101	1,267,765	166,445	747,176	116,854	47,278	29,363	7,386	4,880	7,092	39,785	64,817	0	47,689	0	0	0
TOTAL OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		1,267,765	166,445	747,176	116,854	47,278	29,363	7,386	4,880	7,092	39,785	64,817	0	47,689	0	0	0
		100.00%	12.34%	68.94%	9.14%	3.73%	2.32%	0.58%	0.39%	0.56%	3.14%	5.11%	0.00%	3.76%	0.00%	0.00%	
TOTAL INSURED FUNDS		1,607,692	489,737	826,709	126,190	61,278	58,046	57,865	8,785	19,429	48,607	77,691	2,209	51,957	64,857	16,332	
		100.00%	11.80%	51.43%	7.79%	3.81%	3.61%	3.60%	0.55%	1.21%	3.02%	4.83%	0.14%	3.23%	4.03%	0.95%	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED AND INSURED FUNDS		71,918,567	6,870,871	33,127,290	13,114,642	1,545,051	1,392,327	507,269	546,904	6,103,228	3,214,855	945,010	966,438	1,437,858	780,735	1,366,189	

EXHIBIT C

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXP.	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMISSN	LEGAL	ACC'T'NG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELE- PHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSUR- ANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	RETENTION	INVEST CUSTODIAL SVS
ANNUITY FUNDS																
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000																
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	11	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION ANNUITY FUND	58	49,227	0	0	22,200	6,500	7,850	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12,677
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY		49,227	0	0	22,200	6,500	7,850	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	12,677
		100.00%	0.00%	0.00%	45.10%	13.20%	15.95%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	25.75%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000																
ASSISTANT DEP WARDENS/DEP WARDENS ASSOC AF	1	54,610	0	0	7,200	4,250	4,500	0	0	0	280	3,650	0	0	0	34,730
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY		54,610	0	0	7,200	4,250	4,500	0	0	0	280	3,650	0	0	0	34,730
		100.00%	0.00%	0.00%	13.18%	7.78%	8.24%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.51%	6.68%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	63.60%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION																
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	4	175,892	9,137	3,918	15,000	9,396	8,500	6,988	3,137	576	1,958	6,174	0	98	0	111,010
LOCAL 3 NYC COMMUNICATIONS ELECTRICIANS AF	127	88,738	0	0	8,500	5,012	7,500	0	0	0	0	7,668	0	0	0	60,060
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		264,630	9,137	3,918	23,500	14,408	16,000	6,988	3,137	576	1,958	13,842	0	98	0	171,070
		100.00%	3.45%	1.48%	8.88%	5.44%	6.05%	2.64%	1.19%	0.22%	0.74%	6.23%	0.00%	0.04%	0.00%	64.64%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION																
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS ANNUITY FUND	63	218,411	20,000	0	9,681	3,500	19,000	1,969	0	0	984	18,227	0	550	0	144,400
LOCAL 15, 15A, 15C (JUDE) OPERATING MUNI. ENGINEERS AF	117	153,056	4,746	73,477	0	10,000	9,837	445	1,042	16,225	3,690	4,129	0	0	0	39,475
DOCTORS COUNCIL ANNUITY FUND	124	148,080	0	0	9,004	18,839	12,000	0	0	0	77,219	16,028	0	0	0	14,000
LOCAL 300 SEIU CIVIL SERVICE FORUM ANNUITY FUND	125	63,784	2,419	4,040	12,900	9,000	6,500	0	0	353	0	200	225	635	0	27,511
LOCAL 881 (JUDE) ANNUITY FUND	126	91,731	0	0	11,568	9,000	15,000	0	0	0	2,392	4,702	0	305	0	48,764
LOCAL 246 SEIU NYC ANNUITY FUND	128	101,900	0	5,200	17,750	9,000	3,500	0	0	0	6,863	3,581	0	41	0	55,975
TOTAL \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY		786,982	27,165	82,717	60,903	60,439	65,837	2,414	1,042	16,578	91,138	46,967	226	1,531	0	330,125
		100.00%	3.45%	10.51%	7.74%	7.68%	8.37%	0.31%	0.13%	2.11%	11.58%	5.96%	0.03%	0.19%	0.00%	41.95%

EXHIBIT C

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSES
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	TOTAL ADMIN. EXP.	RENT	SALARIES	FEES & COMMISSN	LEGAL	ACCT'NG	TRAVEL & CONF.	TELE- PHONE	OFFICE EQUIP & RENTAL	OTHER OFFICE EXPENSE	INSUR- ANCE	REPAIRS & MAINT	OTHER	RETENTION	INVEST CUSTODIAL SYS
ANNUITY FUNDS (cont'd)																
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION																
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC AF	8	597,100	15,413	57,257	120,238	0	9,400	0	12,352	2,028	1,868	864	0	1,361	0	376,218
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	14	1,134,720	0	42,295	14,684	12,000	24,500	0	1,850	2,069	4,542	9,555	0	-13,453	0	1,036,698
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOC AF	71	474,732	17,551	97,375	69,506	15,773	29,004	0	0	0	33,889	0	0	0	0	251,634
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC AF	76	235,579	24,484	124,626	39,576	17,317	9,900	2,361	1,281	5,992	10,082	0	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION AF	82	338,172	13,163	152,248	17,874	9,700	4,500	2,604	9,188	30,025	7,199	22,794	0	0	0	66,876
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) AF	104	1,002,905	11,069	49,736	2,400	6,843	19,800	0	1,891	3,653	32,371	2,702	0	820	0	871,810
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) AF	112	583,773	6,347	56,569	10,073	48,000	31,640	0	0	114	4,701	18,914	0	537	0	408,878
LOCAL 30A-D IUDE ENGINEERS ANNUITY FUND	114	34,414	180	5,674	0	12,000	8,250	1,712	0	2,836	1,685	2,067	0	0	0	0
LOCAL 1180 CWA MEMBERS ANNUITY FUND	119	185,466	0	0	68,056	9,998	9,500	0	0	0	573	0	0	1,434	0	95,905
DISTRICT COUNCIL 37 AFSCME ANNUITY FUND	121	795,877	0	0	0	22,255	15,690	415	0	58,930	766	13,380	0	219,055	0	464,885
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES AF	123	151,537	0	0	2,866	7,500	7,917	0	0	0	30,166	7,260	0	0	0	96,028
TOTAL \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY		5,532,275	63,187	545,790	345,054	161,386	170,101	7,092	26,562	105,658	127,832	76,136	0	209,554	0	3,868,933
		100.00%	1.59%	9.87%	6.24%	2.92%	3.07%	0.13%	0.48%	1.91%	2.31%	1.38%	0.00%	3.79%	0.00%	56.32%
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION																
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS ANNUITY FUND	43	679,522	0	0	0	51,091	23,971	1,345	0	0	50,221	37,481	0	106,935	0	408,478
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	95	846,562	26,997	334,058	178,956	44,168	79,184	0	5,171	11,557	131,300	21,662	13,509	0	0	0
TOTAL \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		1,526,084	26,997	334,058	178,956	95,259	103,155	1,345	5,171	11,557	181,521	59,143	13,509	106,935	0	408,478
		100.00%	1.77%	21.89%	11.73%	6.24%	6.76%	0.09%	0.34%	0.76%	11.89%	3.88%	0.89%	7.01%	0.00%	26.77%
TOTAL ANNUITY FUNDS		8,213,808	151,486	866,473	637,813	342,242	367,443	17,839	36,812	134,369	402,729	199,636	13,735	318,118	0	4,626,013
		100.00%	1.84%	11.77%	7.77%	4.17%	4.47%	0.22%	0.44%	1.64%	4.90%	2.43%	0.17%	3.87%	0.00%	56.32%
GRAND TOTAL		80,132,375	7,022,357	34,093,763	13,782,355	1,887,293	1,759,770	525,108	582,816	6,237,597	3,517,584	1,144,646	980,173	1,755,976	780,735	5,982,202
		100.00%	8.76%	42.55%	17.16%	2.36%	2.20%	0.66%	0.73%	7.78%	4.51%	1.43%	1.22%	2.19%	0.97%	7.48%

EXHIBIT D
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF- INSURED UNDER \$100,000								
LOCAL 306 MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND	56 P10,6	80,469	X		Life Insurance, Dental Optical Prescription Drugs	X X X X	X X X X	X X X X
SELF- INSURED \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY								
LOCAL 858, IBT OTB BRANCH OFFICE MANAGERS WELFARE FUND	79 P16	217,300	X		Life Insurance Dental Optical Prescription Drugs	X X X X	X X X X	X X X X
NYC MUNICIPAL STEAMFITTERS AND STEAMFITTER HELPERS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	87 P15	150,686	X		Life Insurance Dental Optical Legal Hearing Aid	X X X X X	X X X X X	X X X X X
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	74 P8	168,161		X	Dental Utilization Optical Podiatry Limited Medical Insurance Death Benefits Legal Service Plan Membership in Retirees Association	X X X X X X X	X X X X X X X	X X X X X X X
DISTRICT COUNCIL 1 MEBA BENEFICIAL FUND TRUST WF/AF	18 P13	120,833	X		Life Insurance Dental Optical Training Severance and Death Payouts Reimbursement of Medical/dental	X X X X X X	X X X X X X	X X X X X X
LOCAL LODGE 5 MUNICIPAL BLACKSMITHS AND BOILERMAKERS RWF & WF	84 P24	127,185	X		Dental Dental - Supplemental Optical - Direct Prescription Card Life Insurance	X X X X X	X X X X X	X X X X X
FIRE ALARM DISPATCHERS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION WELFARE FUND	23 P8,9,3	228,677	X	X	Dental benefit Optical plan Drugs Life Insurance Retirement benefit	X X X X X	X X X X X	X X X X X
NYC MUNICIPAL STEAMFITTERS AND STEAMFITTER HELPERS WELFARE FUND	86 P16	202,993	X		Life Insurance Dental Optical Legal	X X X X	X X X X	X X X X
LOCAL 3 IBEW CITY EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND	48 P16	326,244	X		Life Insurance Optical Dental Legal Services Chiropractor Hearing Orthodicts	X X X X X X X	X X X X X X X	X X X X X X X
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION RETIREE WELFARE FUND	59 P4,5	279,079	X		Insurance Premiums Vision Supplemental (unreimbursed medical expenses)	X X X X	X X X X	X X X X

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF- INSURED								
\$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY								
LOCAL300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM RWF	54 P.7	645,646		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Death	X		
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	50 P.4,11	520,554		X	Death	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Hearing aid	X	X	X
ASST DEPUTY WARDENS ASSOC WELFARE FUND/RWF/CLRF	2 P.18	508,134	X	X	Life Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Supplementary Medical	X	X	X
				X	Pharmacy	X	X	X
				X	Legal Services	X		
				X	Maternity	X	X	
				X	Retirement Counselling	X		
				X	Civil Legal Defense	X		
				X	Legal Criminal Defense	X		
				X	Hospital	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aids	X	X	X
				X	Health Insurance	X		
				X	Legal Service Fringe	X		
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS WELFARE FUND	75 P.8	372,571		X	Death Benefit	X	X	X
				X	Dental Utilization	X	X	X
				X	Disability Wages	X		
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical & Eyeglasses	X	X	X
				X	Podiatry	X	X	X
				X	Maternity	X	X	
			X	X	Limited Medical Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Legal Services Plan	X	X	
				X	Retiree Assoc. Membership	X		
				X	Scholarship			X
LOCAL 30 IUOE MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES RETIREE WELFARE FUND	53 Exh. VI	718,715		X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Chiropractic Service	X	X	X
				X	Medicare	X	X	
				X	Health Reimbursement Arrangement	X	X	X
				X	Death Benefits	X	X	
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	110 P.9	448,930		X	Dental	X	X	
				X	Optical	X	X	
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	
				X	Hearing Aids	X	X	
				X	Podiatry	X	X	
				X	Mammography	X	X	
				X	Emergency Room	X	X	
				X	Medical	X	X	
				X	Therapy	X	X	
				X	In-Hospital Indemnity	X	X	
				X	Prosthetic Appliance	X	X	
				X	Anesthesia	X	X	
				X	Nursing at home/ Pvt Duty Nursing	X	X	
DOCTORS COUNCIL RETIREE WELFARE FUND	21 P.21	576,023		X	Dental Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Psychiatric	X	X	
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Physical Examination	X	X	
				X	Private Duty Nursing	X	X	
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	
				X	Podiatry	X	X	
				X	Legal Services	X	X	
				X	Mammogram	X or	X	
				X	Health Reimbursement	X		

EXHIBIT D
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF- INSURED								
<u>\$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY - cont'd</u>								
DOCTORS COUNCIL WELFARE FUND	22 P.13	1,196,892	X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Legal Services	X	X	
				X	Podiatric Care	X	X	
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Maternity/Adoption	X or	X	
				X	Psychiatric Counseling	X	X	X
				X	Physical Examination	X	X	
				X	Mammogram	X or	X	
				X	Health Reimbursement	X	X	X
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION WELFARE FUND	60 P.4,5	399,584	X		Life Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Vision	X	X	X
				X	Supplemental (unreimbursed medical expenses)	X	X	X
NYC MUNICIPAL PLUMBERS AND PIPEFITTERS WELFARE FUND	85 P.11,17	918,883	X		Life Insurance and Disability	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Orthotics	X		
				X	Chiropractic	X	X	X
				X	Health Club	X		
SELF-INSURED								
<u>\$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY</u>								
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOC. WELFARE FUND/ CLRF	6 P.6,38	1,008,076	X		Life Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Maternity	X	or X	
			X		Catastrophic Insurance	X	X	X
				X	In-hospital Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Emergency Room	X	X	X
				X	Other Benefits (Supplemental Medical)	X	X	X
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOC RETIREE WELFARE FUND	5 P.7,38	1,479,657	X		Life Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Drug rider reimbursements	X	X	X
			X		Catastrophic Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	In-Hospital Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Other Benefits (Supplemental Medical)	X	X	X
LOCAL 30A-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS WELFARE FUND	57 P.4	1,326,568		X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Legal	X	X	
			X		Dental	X	X	X
				X	Death	X	X	
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS WF	51 p.7,35	989,008		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drug	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Death	X	X	X
				X	Medical consultations	X	X	X

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
<u>\$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY - Cont'd</u>								
LOCAL 246 SEIU RETIREE WELFARE FUND	46 P.4	1,133,265		X	Death Benefit	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	
				X	Hearing Aid	X		
				X	Optical	X	X	
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
LOCAL 721 LICENSED PRACTICAL NURSES WELFARE FUND	68 P.9,29	1,529,391	X		Life Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	LT Disability	X		
			X		Disability Insurance Premiums	X		
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X	X	X
LOCAL 246 SEIU WELFARE FUND	47 P.19	1,962,896		X	Death Benefit	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
			X		Prepaid Legal Services	X		
				X	Hearing Aid	X		
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION WELFARE FUND	109 P.11	1,183,812		X	Life Insurance	X	X	
				X	Dental	X	X	
				X	Optical	X	X	
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	
				X	Disability	X	X	
				X	Anesthesia	X	X	
				X	Podiatry	X	X	
				X	Medical	X	X	
				X	Mammography	X	X	
				X	In Hospital Indemnity	X	X	
				X	Emergency Room	X	X	
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS WELFARE FUND	65 P.22	1,422,801		X	Death Benefit	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Legal	X	X	
				X	Supplementary Medical	X	X	X
			X		Life Insurance	X	X	X
DISTRICT COUNCIL 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY CIVIL SERVICE DIVISION WF/RWF.	20 P.20,30	1,424,847	X		Life Insurance	X		
			X		Disability	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Medical Spending	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Hearing	X	X	X
LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM WF	55 P.7	1,343,788	X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Prepaid Legal Service	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Death	X		

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
\$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY - Cont'd								
LOCAL 211	42	1,234,830		X	Dental	X	X	X
ALLIED BUILDING INSPECTORS WELFARE FUND	P.46			X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Chiropractic/Podiatry	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Death Benefit	X		
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X		
CIVIL SERVICE BAR ASSOCIATION WELFARE FUND	3 P4,13	1,261,220	X X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Prescription drugs	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Nursery	X		X
				X	Lifestyle	X		
				X	Nurse Helpline	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
SELF-INSURED								
\$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY								
LOCAL 444	64	2,871,287		X	Death Benefit	X	X	X
SANITATION OFFICERS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	P.8,20			X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Supplemental Medical	X	X	X
				X	High Option Rider/Reimb. Drug	X		
			X		Life Insurance	x	x	x
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC PLAN WELFARE FUND	77 P.25	3,454,616	X X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aids	X	X	X
			X		HIP Premium	X		
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION WELFARE FUND/CLRF	16 P.26,9	7,613,280		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Catastrophic deductible	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Appliances Benefit	X	X	X
			X		Insurance Premiums	X	X	X
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) WELFARE FUND/CLRF	106 P.11	3,415,859	X		Dental - Comprehensive	X	X	X
				X	Dental -Insurance Schedule	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
			X		Catastrophic Health Ins. (GHI)	X	X	X
			X		Extended Health Ins., (HIP)	X		

EXHIBIT D
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
\$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY - cont'd								
NEW YORK CITY RETIREE WELFARE FUND	89 P.11	6,611,011		X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
			X	X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Life Insurance	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Legal	X		
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Podiatry	X	X	X
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOC RETIREE WELFARE FUND	72 P.3,7	9,975,893	X	X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Supplemental Medical	X	X	X
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) RETIREE WELFARE FUND	105 P.10	7,049,680	X	X	Dental Comprehensive	X	X	X
			X	X	Dental Insurance Schedule	X	X	X
				X	Hospitalization	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drug Benefits	X	X	
				X	Death Benefit	X		
				X	Health Rider Reimbursement	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
			X	X	Catastrophic Health (G.H.I)	X	X	X
CORRECTION OFFICERS BENEVOLENT ASSOC RETIREE WELFARE FUND	7 P.7	5,871,312	X	X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical and other	X	X	X
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X	X	X
			X	X	Life Insurance	X		
LOCAL 891 SCHOOL CUSTODIAN AND CUSTODIAN ENGINEERS WELFARE FUND	80 P.46	1,901,501	X	X	Life Insurance	X		
			X	X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Catastrophic	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drug	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Continuation Benefits	X	X	
				X	Legal Benefits	X	X	
				X	Variable Benefit	X	X	
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT RETIREE WELFARE FUND	29 P.52,4 P.8	11,491,325		X	Direct Optical Benefits	X	X	
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Pension Counseling	X		
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	
				X	Podiatry	X	X	
				X	Retiree Division Program	X	X	X
				X	General Medical Benefit	X	X	
				X	Clinical	X	X	
				X	Direct Dental Benefits	X	X	
				X	Legal Service Benefits	X	X	
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION RETIREE WELFARE FUND	78 P.4	8,533,304	X	X	Life Insurance	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Health card Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aids	X	X	X
				X	Death Benefits	X		
			X	X	Dental expense-healthplex	X	X	X
				X	HIP Premium	X	X	X
				X	Express scripts-Drugs	X	X	X
ORGANIZATION OF STAFF ANALYSTS WELFARE FUND	93 P.14,4	7,003,886	X	X	Long Term Disability	X	X	X
			X	X	Life Insurance	X	X	X
				X	Survivor Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Pension Counseling	X	X	X
				X	COBRA Reimbursement	X	X	X
				X	Self-insured health benefits	X	X	X
				X	Educational benefits	X	X	X
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMINISTRATORS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	26 P.15	7,481,002		X	Dental Schedule of Allowances	X	X	X
			X	X	Dental - DHMO Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
			X	X	Hospitalization	X	X	X
				X	Major Medical Supplemental to Basic Coverage	X	X	X

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
\$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY - cont'd								
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMENS ASSOCIATION WELFARE FUND	73 P.23,8	7,199,488	X		Group Life Insurance and accident	X	X	X
			X		Dental (HealthPlex, Inc.)	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	General Medical Anesthesia	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Limited Medical	X	X	X
				X	Line of Duty Injury (LODI)	X		
				X	Resident Health & Benefit Svcs.	X	X	X
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMINISTRATORS WELFARE FUND	25 p42	8,560,226		X	Life Insurance	X		
				X	Dental - Schedule of Allowances	X	X	X
			X		Dental - DHMO	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Survivors Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Major Medical - Suppl. to Basic	X	X	X
LOCAL 1182 CWA PARKING ENFORCEMENT AGENTS WELFARE FUND/LEGAL	33 P.40,4	2,852,992	X	X	Disability	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X	X	X
				X	Podiatry	X		
			X		Life Insurance	X		
HOUSE STAFF COMMITTEE OF INTERNS & RESIDENTS WELFARE/LEGAL FUND	24 P.6,11	2,882,739	X		Life Insurance	X	X	
			X		Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Outpatient Psychiatric Care	X	X	X
				X	Major Medical	X	X	X
				X	Childbirth Educ	X	X	X
				X	Pediatrics & Circumcision	X		X
				X	Maternity	X or	X	
				X	Short Term Disability	X		
			X		Long Term Disability Insurance	X		
				X	Conferences & Books WMC	X		
				X	Obstetrics	X	X	
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aids	X	X	X
				X	Substance Abuse	X	X	X
				X	Conferences - HHC	X		
SELF-INSURED								
\$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY								
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/RWF/CLRF	113 P.44	13,058,107		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Death Benefit	X	X	X
				X	Catastrophic Health	X	X	X
			X		Expanded Medical	X	X	X
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT WELFARE FUND/LEGAL/EDUCATION	28/30 WF P.8 ED P.6 L P.3	12,883,153	X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Psychiatry	X	X	X
				X	Maternity	X or	X	
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X	X	X
				X	Podiatry	X	X	
				X	Court Cost	X		
				X	Clinical	X	X	X
				X	Telephone Hot Line			X
				X	Workplace literacy program	X		
				X	Urban leadership program	X		
				X	Tuition reimbursements	X		
				X	Central Labor Rehabilitation	X		
				X	Book purchases	X		
				X	Adult education	X		
				X	Medical Reimbursements	X		

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
\$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY - cont'd								
LOCAL 94	81	13,625,844		X	Dental	X	X	X
UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOC	P.9,7			X	Dentcare	X	X	X
RETIREE WELFARE FUND				X	Optical	X	X	X
			X		GHI (Widows)		X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
			X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Prescription Drugs (Widows)		X	X
				X	Maintenance Drug Program	X	X	X
			X		HIP - widows (COBRA)		X	X
			X		Cigna Healthcare		X	X
LOCAL 237	44/66	11,659,648		X	Death Benefit	X		
TEAMSTERS	P.12,50		X	X	Dental	X	X	X
RETIREE WELFARE FUND	P.51			X	Optical	X	X	X
(includes Fund 66, Local 621 RWF)				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Education Program	X		
				X	Social Program	X		
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	
				X	Legal Services	X		
				X	Supplemental Medical	X	X	
LOCAL 94	83	11,503,356		X	Dental	X	X	X
UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS	P.24			X	Dentcare	X	X	X
ASSOCIATION				X	Optical	X	X	X
WELFARE FUND				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs (Widows)	X	X	X
				X	Obstetrical Anesthesia	X	X	X
				X	Surgical Anesthesia	X	X	X
				X	Maintenance Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	UFA/UFOA Welfare Fund	X	X	X
			X		GHI	X	X	X
				X	Med-Mobile Screening	X		
			X		Life Insurance	X		
			X		GHI Widows		X	X
			X		US Healthcare		X	X
			X		HIP- Extended Coverage	X	X	X
			X		Cigna Healthcare		X	X
				X	Drug Refund	X	X	X
CORRECTION OFFICERS	9	12,457,317	X		Life Insurance premiums	X		
BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION	P.6,29			X	Dental	X	X	X
WELFARE FUND/CLRF				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Prepaid Legal Services	X		
				X	Civil Legal Representation	X		
				X	Other Health Benefits	X	X	X
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT	15	12,978,607		X	Dental	X	X	X
ASSOCIATION	P.24,8			X	Optical	X	X	X
RETIREE WELFARE FUND				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Catastrophic Deductible	X	X	X
				X	Medical Co-payment Refund	X	X	X
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
			X		Hospital Rider	X		
			X		Appliance Rider	X	X	X
			X		Catastrophic	X	X	X
				X	Death Benefit	X	X	X

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
\$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY - cont'd								
NYS NURSES ASSOC WELFARE FUND	92 P.10,3	10,295,551	X		Life/Disability	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Podiatry	X	X	X
				X	Long-Term Disability	X		
				X	(COBRA) Extended Benefits	X		
				X	Hearing Aids	X		
				X	Major Medical Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drug	X	X	X
SELF-INSURED								
OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY								
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND/LEGAL/EDUCATION/ADMIN	62 W 29 L 25 E 39	19,993,879		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
			X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prosthetic Appliances	X	X	X
				X	Health & Safety Coordinator	X		
				X	Podiatry	X	X	
				X	Burial	X		
				X	Diagnostic Exam	X	X	
				X	Pension Counseling	X		
				X	Hearing Aid	X	X	X
				X	Abortion	X or	X	
				X	Civil Matters	X		
				X	Criminal Representation	X	X	X
				X	Court Costs	X		
				X	Tuition Reimbursements	X		
				X	Job Related Conferences	X		
				X	Dues for Professional Org	X		
				X	Civil Service Exam Prep Courses	X		
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT RETIREE WELFARE FUND	96 P.19	29,730,813		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Other Supplemental Benefits	X	X	X
			X		Supplemental Hospitalization	X	X	X
				X	Pension Counseling Benefit	X		
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION WELFARE FUND/CLRF	97 P.20	30,699,680		X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Catastrophic Benefits	X	X	X
			X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Office Visit Co-payment	X	X	X
				X	Other Supplemental Benefits	X	X	X
				X	Pension Counseling	X		
				X	Legal Services Benefit	X		
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS WELFARE FUND (includes fund 67, local 621 WF)	45/67 P.12,58 P.59	31,334,775		X	Death Benefit	X	X	X
			X		Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Short Term Disability	X		
				X	Legal Service	X		
				X	Hearing Aid & Other	X	X	X
				X	Pre retirement Pension Counseling Svcs.	X		
				X	Training & Education	X		

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
SELF-INSURED								
OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY - cont'd								
LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHERS WELFARE FUND (Includes active and retiree security funds)	41 P.27	226,665,447		X	Death Benefit	X		
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Hearing Aids	X	X	X
			X	X	Retiree Program	X	X	
				X	Retiree - Legal Service	X	X	
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Appliances / Other	X	X	X
				X	Optional Rider Reimbursement	X	X	
				X	SLOAC	X		
				X	Durable Medical Equipment	X	X	X
DC 37 WELFARE FUND	10 E3 W10	223,385,438		X	Dental Claims	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Death	X		
				X	Optical Claims	X	X	X
				X	Podiatry	X		
				X	Audiology	X		
				X	Program Costs	X		
				X	Health & Pension Services Unit	X	X	X
				X	Legal Services	X	X	X
				X	Social Service Crisis Intervention Progra	X	X	X
				X	Dental Centers	X	X	X
				X	Optical Centers	X	X	X
				X	Educational Costs	X		
				X	Tuition Refund Program	X		
				X	Government grants and contracts	X		
INSURED								
UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY								
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	69 p9,4	26,012	X		Life Insurance	X		
				X	Optical	X	X	
				X	Dental	X	X	X
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS WELFARE FUND	70 p9	24,825	X		Life Insurance	X		
			X		Dental	X	X	X
				X	Health Benefits	X	X	X
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOCIATION	12 R7	49,184	X		Group Life & A.D.D. Insurance	X		
			X		Optical	X		
			X		Dental	X	X	X
INSURED								
\$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY								
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC. WELFARE FUND	13 W7	181,799	X		Group Life & A.D.D. Insurance	X		
			X		Group Dental	X	X	X
			X		Optical Care	X		
				X	Legal, ProgeSSIONal Lobby	X		
LOCAL 14 A-14B IUOE WELFARE FUND/RWF	37 p93	58,070		X	Death Benefits	X		
				X	Optical Benefits	X	X	X
			X		Dental Benefits	X	X	X

EXHIBIT D
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
INSURED								
<u>\$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY</u>								
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES RETIREE WELFARE FUND	31 P.7,25,4	337,301	X X X X		Life Insurance Premiums Prescription Drugs Dental Optical Prepaid Legal Benefit	X X X X X	X X X X	X X X X
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND	32 P.7,25,4	467,010	X X X X		Life Insurance Premiums Dental Optical Prescription Drugs Prepaid Legal Services	X X X X X	X X X X	X X X X
LOCAL 15A-C OPERATING ENGINEERS WELFARE FUND/RWF	38 P.58	227,893	X X X	X	Dental Death Benefit Member Assistance	X X X	X X X	X X X
INSURED								
<u>OVER \$ 20 MILLION CATEGORY</u>								
PROFESSIONAL STAFF CONGRESS CUNY WELFARE FUND/RWF	101 P.11	27,643,987	X X X X X X X X		Disability-active Major Medical Dental Basic Health Benefits Optical Prescription Drugs Hearing Aids Well Care Programs Death Benefits	X X X X X X X X	X X X	X X X X
NYC CONTRIBUTIONS LESS THAN 5% OF TOTAL REVENUE OR WILL DISTORT THE GROUPS' CATEGORY AVERAGE								
SURROGATES & SUPREME COURT REPORTERS ASSOCIATION RETIREE WELFARE FUND	108 P.10,3	118,989		X X X	Dental Optical Life Insurance	X X X	X X X	X X X
NYS COURT CLERKS ASSOCIATION RETIREE WELFARE FUND	90 P.3,27	1,031,957	X	X X X X X X	Dental Burial Optical Multi Physical Exam Hearing Aid Hospital Health Insurance	X X X X X X X	X X X X X X	X X X X
NEW YORK STATE COURT OFFICERS ASSOCIATION ACTIVE / RETIREE WELFARE FUND	91 P.3,4,27	1,073,989		X X X X X X X X	Dental Optical Life Insurance Prepaid Legal Maternity Hospital Income Dental facility costs Death benefit Direct legal benefit	X X X X X or X X X X	X X X X X X	X X X X
SUPREME COURT UNIFORM OFFICERS RETIREE WELFARE FUND	107 P.3,4,10	1,784,894		X X X X X X X X	Dental Death Benefit (Retiree) Life and AD&D Vision Medical Reimbursement Maternity Hospital Income Disability Other (Hearing Aid/Ambulance) Bullet Proof Vest	X X X X X or X X X X	X X X X X X	X X X X

EXHIBIT D
 SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
 SCHEDULE OF SELF-INSURED, INSURED WELFARE AND RETIREE WELFARE FUNDS, EDUCATION FUNDS
 AVAILABLE BENEFITS 2005

FUND NAME (BY REVENUE CATEGORY)	REF	TOTAL BENEFIT EXPENSE	INSURED	SELF- INSURED	TYPE OF BENEFIT	COVERAGE		
						Member	Spouse	Children
NYC CONTRIBUTIONS LESS THAN 5% OF TOTAL REVENUE OR WILL DISTORT THE GROUPS' CATEGORY AVERAGE cont'd								
NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS WELFARE FUND / RETIREE	88 P.4,53	183,674,425	X		Hospitalization & Death	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Medical and Dental	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Scholarship Awards			X
PAVERS & ROAD BUILDERS DISTRICT COUNCIL WELFARE FUND	100 P.18,7	11,560,253		X	Medical	X	X	X
				X	Hospital Room and Board	X	X	X
				X	Hospital Other	X	X	X
				X	NYS Surcharge	X		
				X	Surgical	X	X	X
				X	Diagnostic/Lab tests	X	X	X
				X	Major Medical	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescriptions	X	X	X
				X	Interpretations	X	X	X
				X	Chemotherapy Treatments	X	X	X
				X	Consultation	X	X	X
				X	Medicare Reimbursement	X		
				X	Death and Dismemberment	X		
				X	Legal	X		
			X	X	Disability Benefits	X		
LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS WELFARE FUND	118 P.3,6,14 BB:p.1,7	52,844,318		X	Preferred Provider Organizations	X	X	X
				X	Legal	X	X	X
				X	Medical	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Optical	X	X	X
				X	Prescription Drugs	X	X	X
				X	Supplementary Medicare	X		
LOCAL 1199 NATIONAL BENEFIT FUND HOSPITAL HEALTH CARE WF	35 Exh.B (BES)	849,535,957		X	Hospital	X	X	X
				X	Disability	X		
				X	Medical	X	X	X
				X	Dental	X	X	X
				X	Surgical	X	X	X
				X	Prescriptions	X	X	X
			X	X	Life Insurance	X		
				X	Laboratory and X-ray	X	X	X
				X	Vision care	X	X	X
				X	Emergency room	X	X	X
				X	Ambulatory care	X	X	X
				X	Anesthesia	X	X	X
				X	Medicare premiums	X	X	
				X	Camps, scholarships, etc.			X
				X	Retirement programs	X	X	
				X	Hip	X	X	X
				X	Youth Mentoring Program			X
				X	Citizenship Program	X		
				X	Burial	X		
			X	X	AD&D Insurance	X		
				X	Health First 65 Plus Benefits	X		
				X	Hypertension	X		

EXHIBIT E
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
BENEFIT FUND RATIOS
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF											
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000											
LOCAL 306 MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES WF	56	83.63%	0.00%	19.56%	0.00%	81.05%	0.00%	18.95%	0.00%	-3.18%	0.00%
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY		83.63%		19.56%		81.05%		18.95%		-3.18%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000											
DISTRICT NO. 1 NEBA BENE. FUND TRUST W/AF	18	71.46%	-19.80%	7.20%	-55.61%	90.85%	7.38%	9.15%	-40.58%	21.35%	-501.32%
FIRE ALARM DISPATCHERS BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF	23	79.37%	-10.92%	16.83%	3.76%	82.51%	-2.47%	17.49%	13.57%	3.80%	-171.43%
LOCAL 3 IBEW CITY EMPLOYEES WELFARE FUND	48	120.50%	35.24%	24.67%	52.10%	83.00%	-1.89%	17.00%	10.39%	-45.17%	749.06%
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION RWF	59	92.74%	4.09%	12.10%	-25.40%	88.46%	4.56%	11.54%	-25.06%	-4.84%	-9.02%
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS RWF	74	100.90%	13.24%	19.93%	22.87%	83.50%	-1.30%	16.50%	7.14%	-20.83%	291.54%
LOCAL 858 IBT, (OTB) BRANCH OFFICE MANAGERS WF	79	71.66%	-19.57%	24.02%	48.08%	74.90%	-11.47%	25.10%	62.99%	4.32%	-181.20%
LOCAL NO. 5 MNCPL EMPLOYEES BENEFIT TRUST FUND	84	159.76%	79.30%	24.97%	53.95%	86.49%	2.23%	13.51%	-12.27%	-84.73%	1492.67%
NYC MUNI. STEAMFITTERS & STEAMFITTER HELPERS WF	86	87.32%	-24.44%	7.93%	-61.11%	89.48%	6.74%	10.54%	-31.56%	24.76%	-565.23%
NYC MUNI. STEAMFITTERS & STEAMFITTER HELPERS RWF	87	91.81%	3.04%	10.92%	-32.88%	89.37%	6.64%	10.63%	-30.97%	-2.73%	-48.63%
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY		89.10%		16.22%		84.60%		15.40%		-5.32%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION											
ASSISTANT DEP WARDENS/DEP WARDENS WF/ RWF/CLRF	2	69.03%	-16.22%	12.48%	-19.59%	84.69%	0.64%	15.31%	-3.41%	16.49%	788.94%
DOCTORS COUNCIL RWF	21	86.12%	4.53%	20.60%	32.73%	80.70%	-4.10%	19.30%	21.77%	-6.72%	-423.08%
DOCTORS COUNCIL WF	22	89.16%	8.22%	19.88%	28.09%	81.77%	-2.83%	18.23%	15.02%	-9.03%	-534.13%
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS RWF	50	65.22%	-20.84%	10.80%	-30.41%	85.79%	1.96%	14.21%	-10.35%	23.98%	1052.88%
LOCAL 30 IUDC MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES RWF	53	84.67%	2.77%	11.55%	-25.58%	88.00%	4.58%	12.00%	-24.29%	3.78%	81.73%
LOCAL 300 CIVL. SERVICE FORUM RWF	54	88.05%	6.87%	15.98%	2.98%	84.64%	0.58%	15.36%	-3.09%	-4.03%	-293.75%
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION WF	60	117.40%	42.49%	14.07%	-9.34%	89.30%	8.12%	10.70%	-32.49%	-31.47%	-1612.98%
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS WF	75	68.91%	-28.50%	13.77%	-11.28%	81.06%	-3.67%	18.94%	19.50%	27.32%	1213.46%
NYC MUNICIPAL PLUMBERS & PIPEFITTERS WF	85	93.44%	13.41%	14.63%	-5.73%	86.46%	2.75%	13.54%	-14.57%	-8.06%	-487.50%
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION RWF	110	78.63%	-4.32%	19.55%	25.97%	80.13%	-4.78%	19.87%	25.36%	1.62%	-22.12%
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		82.38%		15.62%		84.15%		15.85%		2.08%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION											
CIVIL SERVICE BAR ASSOC WF	3	94.99%	17.49%	13.66%	44.61%	87.51%	-2.34%	12.49%	20.21%	-8.55%	-187.42%
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION RWF	5	78.00%	-3.63%	5.57%	-40.55%	93.34%	4.16%	6.66%	-35.90%	16.43%	68.00%
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION WF/CLRF	6	76.78%	-5.03%	7.12%	-24.01%	91.51%	2.12%	8.49%	-19.29%	16.10%	54.62%
DC 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY WF/RWF (LOCAL 1969)	20	90.11%	11.45%	6.23%	-27.11%	92.95%	3.73%	7.05%	-32.15%	3.06%	-68.71%
LOCAL 211 ALLIED BUILDING INSPECTORS WF	42	65.60%	-19.88%	7.76%	-17.18%	89.42%	-0.21%	10.58%	1.83%	25.84%	172.39%
LOCAL 246 SEIU RWF	46	81.31%	0.57%	8.62%	-8.00%	80.41%	0.89%	9.59%	-7.70%	10.06%	2.86%
LOCAL 246 SEIU WELFARE FUND	47	81.51%	0.82%	9.80%	4.59%	89.27%	-0.38%	10.73%	3.27%	8.70%	-11.04%
LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS WF	51	63.06%	-34.35%	9.85%	5.12%	84.35%	-5.87%	16.65%	50.63%	37.06%	278.94%
LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM WF	55	90.47%	11.90%	11.82%	26.15%	88.45%	-1.29%	11.55%	11.16%	-2.29%	-123.42%
LOCAL 30A-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS WF	57	100.66%	24.38%	8.33%	-11.10%	92.35%	3.06%	7.65%	-26.37%	-6.89%	-190.90%
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS WF	65	78.32%	-3.13%	4.99%	-46.74%	94.01%	4.91%	5.99%	-42.35%	16.59%	70.65%
LICENSED PRACTICAL NURSES WF	68	84.84%	4.94%	10.43%	11.31%	89.05%	-0.62%	10.95%	5.39%	4.73%	-51.64%
UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION WF	109	80.52%	11.96%	20.54%	119.21%	81.50%	-9.05%	18.50%	78.06%	-11.06%	-213.09%
TOTAL \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY		80.65%		9.37%		89.61%		10.38%		9.78%	

EXHIBIT E
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
BENEFIT FUND RATIOS
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
SELF-INSURED WF & RWF (cont'd)											
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION											
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC RWF	7	79.76%	-9.56%	7.17%	-11.26%	91.75%	0.16%	8.25%	-1.79%	13.07%	250.40%
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION WF	16	78.54%	-10.94%	4.55%	-43.69%	94.53%	3.20%	5.47%	-34.88%	16.91%	353.35%
HOUSE STAFF COMM OF INTERNS & RESIDENTS WF/LEGAL	24	71.35%	-19.10%	15.91%	96.91%	81.77%	-10.73%	18.23%	117.02%	12.75%	241.82%
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMIN. WF	25	89.88%	1.92%	7.32%	-9.44%	92.47%	0.95%	7.53%	-10.38%	2.80%	-24.93%
LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMIN. RWF	26	76.87%	-12.84%	8.20%	1.49%	90.35%	-1.35%	9.64%	14.76%	14.93%	300.27%
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT RWF	29	102.92%	16.70%	14.32%	77.23%	87.79%	-4.16%	12.21%	45.36%	-17.24%	-562.20%
LOCAL 1182 CWA SECURITY BENEFIT FUND RWF/WF/LEGAL	33	75.35%	-14.58%	13.85%	71.78%	84.44%	-7.82%	15.56%	85.24%	10.77%	188.74%
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS RWF	54	75.28%	-14.64%	5.40%	-33.17%	93.31%	1.87%	6.69%	-20.36%	19.33%	418.23%
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSC RWF	72	99.08%	12.35%	3.98%	-50.74%	95.13%	4.95%	3.87%	-53.93%	-3.06%	-182.04%
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOC WF	73	77.20%	-12.46%	9.73%	20.42%	88.81%	-3.05%	11.19%	33.21%	13.08%	260.67%
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC WF	77	81.11%	-8.03%	5.34%	-33.91%	93.82%	2.42%	8.18%	-26.43%	13.55%	263.27%
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC RWF	78	120.42%	36.55%	6.57%	-18.69%	94.83%	3.53%	5.17%	-38.45%	-26.99%	-823.59%
LOCAL 891 SCHOOL CUSTOD & CUSTOD ENGINEERS WF/RW	80	62.63%	-28.98%	5.59%	-30.82%	91.90%	0.22%	8.20%	-2.36%	31.77%	751.74%
NEW YORK CITY RETIREES WF	89	101.21%	14.76%	5.01%	-33.00%	95.29%	4.03%	4.71%	-43.93%	-6.22%	-266.76%
ORGANIZATION OF STAFF ANALYSTS WF	93	78.67%	-10.79%	11.55%	42.95%	87.20%	-4.80%	12.80%	52.38%	9.78%	162.20%
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) RWF	105	105.98%	20.17%	8.95%	-26.36%	94.68%	3.36%	5.32%	-36.67%	-11.93%	-419.84%
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) WF/CLRF/CEA	106	89.25%	1.20%	6.44%	-20.30%	93.27%	1.82%	6.73%	-19.88%	4.31%	15.55%
TOTAL \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY		88.19%		8.08%		91.60%		8.40%		3.73%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION											
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/CLRF	9	80.93%	6.95%	6.14%	-13.40%	93.67%	1.48%	6.33%	-17.79%	2.92%	-62.94%
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION RWF	15	87.71%	3.16%	3.41%	-51.90%	96.26%	4.29%	3.74%	-51.43%	8.88%	12.69%
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOC RWF	81	84.33%	-0.81%	3.88%	-46.28%	95.60%	3.58%	4.40%	-42.86%	11.79%	49.52%
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION WF	83	72.66%	-14.55%	5.45%	-23.13%	93.02%	0.78%	6.88%	-9.35%	21.91%	178.05%
NEW YORK STATE NURSES ASSOCIATION WF	92	95.06%	11.81%	7.75%	9.31%	92.47%	0.18%	7.53%	-2.21%	-2.81%	-135.66%
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOC (POLICE) WF/RWF/CLRF	113	78.48%	-7.69%	5.36%	-24.40%	93.61%	1.42%	6.39%	-17.01%	16.17%	105.20%
LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT WF/LEGAL/ED	238/30	84.00%	-1.20%	13.63%	92.24%	86.03%	-6.79%	13.97%	81.43%	2.37%	-69.92%
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS RWF	448/66	93.23%	9.66%	12.45%	75.60%	88.22%	-4.42%	11.78%	52.98%	-6.68%	-172.08%
TOTAL \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		85.02%		7.09%		92.30%		7.70%		7.98%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION OVER \$20 MILLION											
DC 37 WF	10	95.60%	3.89%	7.22%	-11.08%	93.05%	1.15%	6.86%	-13.23%	-3.81%	197.86%
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES WF/LEGAL/EF/ADA	82	84.89%	-8.88%	10.99%	35.34%	88.54%	-3.75%	11.46%	43.07%	4.12%	-421.83%
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC RWF	96	92.23%	-1.00%	8.37%	3.08%	91.88%	-0.34%	8.32%	3.87%	-0.60%	-53.13%
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC WF/CLRF	97	76.51%	-17.87%	9.00%	10.84%	89.47%	-2.74%	10.53%	31.46%	14.49%	-1332.03%
LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHERS WF	41	92.86%	-0.32%	8.33%	2.59%	91.76%	-0.25%	8.24%	2.87%	-1.20%	-8.25%
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS WF	458/67	98.52%	5.75%	9.49%	16.87%	91.21%	-0.86%	8.79%	9.74%	-8.91%	526.78%
TOTAL OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		93.18%		8.12%		91.89%		8.01%		-1.28%	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED FUNDS		90.99%		8.09%		91.83%		8.17%		0.92%	

EXHIBIT E
SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
BENEFIT FUND RATIOS
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
INSURED WF & RWF											
NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000											
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC RWF	12	100.67%	74.67%	11.98%	123.09%	89.36%	-2.32%	10.64%	24.88%	-12.65%	-133.90%
LOCAL 808 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS RWF	69	48.69%	-15.48%	3.23%	-39.86%	93.78%	2.51%	6.22%	-27.00%	48.08%	29.88%
LOCAL 808 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS WF	70	34.82%	-39.66%	2.44%	-54.66%	93.48%	2.16%	6.54%	-23.24%	62.74%	69.48%
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY		57.61%		5.37%		91.48%		6.52%		37.02%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000											
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC WF	13	112.87%	37.93%	2.65%	-79.72%	97.71%	13.31%	2.29%	-83.37%	-15.52%	-404.31%
LOCAL 14A-14B IUOE WFI/RWF	37	43.97%	-46.27%	25.77%	97.17%	63.05%	-26.88%	36.95%	168.34%	30.28%	493.33%
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY		81.83%		13.07%		86.23%		13.77%		5.10%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION											
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES RWF	31	93.33%	43.92%	14.30%	-22.11%	86.72%	11.27%	13.28%	-39.80%	-7.62%	-145.38%
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES WF	32	71.79%	13.79%	23.06%	25.60%	78.19%	-2.26%	23.81%	7.93%	3.15%	-81.24%
LOCAL 15A-C OPERATING ENGINEERS WF/RWF	38	38.16%	-41.16%	15.84%	-13.73%	70.67%	-9.33%	29.33%	32.96%	46.01%	174.03%
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		64.85%		18.36%		77.94%		22.06%		18.79%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION OVER \$20 MILLION											
PROFESSIONAL STAFF CONGRESS CUNY WFI/RWF	101	106.58%	0.00%	4.89%	0.00%	95.62%	0.00%	4.38%	0.00%	-11.47%	0.00%
TOTAL OVER \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		106.58%		4.89%		95.62%		4.38%		-11.47%	
TOTAL INSURED FUNDS		103.64%		5.74%		94.75%		5.25%		-9.39%	
TOTAL SELF-INSURED AND INSURED FUNDS		91.38%		8.02%		91.93%		3.07%		0.60%	

EXHIBIT E

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
BENEFIT FUND RATIOS
2005

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
ANNUITY FUNDS											
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION UNDER \$100,000</u>											
NYC DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	11	80.13%	22.92%	0.00%	-100.00%	100.00%	34.21%	0.00%	-100.00%	19.87%	58.96%
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION ANNUITY FUND	58	61.82%	-5.17%	27.35%	22.65%	69.33%	-6.95%	30.67%	20.32%	10.84%	-13.28%
TOTAL UNDER \$100,000 CATEGORY		65.19%		22.30%		74.51%		25.48%		12.50%	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$100,000 TO \$300,000</u>											
ASSISTANT DEP WARDENS/DEP WARDENS ASSOC AF	1	179.82%	0.00%	20.54%	0.00%	89.75%	0.00%	10.25%	0.00%	-100.35%	0.00%
TOTAL \$100,000 TO \$300,000 CATEGORY		179.82%		20.54%		89.75%		10.25%		-100.35%	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION</u>											
CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	4	194.25%	61.11%	15.80%	15.50%	92.48%	2.87%	7.52%	-26.20%	-110.05%	221.31%
LOCAL 3 NYC COMMUNICATIONS ELECTRICIANS AF	127	20.74%	-32.80%	10.80%	-21.05%	65.75%	-26.79%	34.25%	236.11%	68.46%	-299.86%
TOTAL \$300,000 TO \$1 MILLION CATEGORY		120.57%		13.68%		89.81%		10.19%		-34.25%	
<u>NYC CONTRIBUTION \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION</u>											
LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS ANNUITY FUND	63	81.12%	112.63%	5.35%	-7.44%	93.81%	8.03%	6.18%	-52.96%	13.53%	-75.87%
LOCAL 15, 15A, 15C (NUOE) OPERATING MUNI ENGINEERS AI	117	51.55%	35.12%	9.73%	68.34%	84.12%	-3.13%	15.88%	20.67%	38.72%	-30.94%
DOCTORS COUNCIL ANNUITY FUND	124	7.31%	-80.84%	4.68%	-19.03%	60.98%	-29.78%	39.02%	196.50%	88.01%	56.96%
LOCAL 300 SEIU CIVIL SERVICE FORUM ANNUITY FUND	125	20.86%	-45.32%	5.47%	-5.36%	79.23%	-8.76%	20.77%	67.83%	73.68%	31.41%
LOCAL 891 (NUOE) ANNUITY FUND	126	13.61%	-64.33%	7.01%	21.28%	86.00%	-24.00%	34.00%	158.36%	79.37%	41.56%
LOCAL 246 SEIU NYC ANNUITY FUND	128	16.41%	-56.99%	4.61%	-20.24%	78.09%	-10.03%	21.91%	66.49%	78.98%	40.86%
TOTAL \$1 MILLION TO \$3 MILLION CATEGORY		38.15%		5.78%		86.84%		13.16%		58.07%	

EXHIBIT E

SURVEY OF BENEFIT FUNDS
BENEFIT FUND RATIOS
2005

Page 5

NAME OF FUND	REF	BEN EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	BEN EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	ADM EXP/ TOTAL EXP	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE	EXCESS/ TOTAL REV	DEVIATION FROM CAT. AVERAGE
ANNUITY FUNDS (cont'd)											
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION											
CORRECTION OFFICERS' BENEVOLENT ASSOC AF	8	107.98%	122.96%	8.51%	82.44%	92.69%	1.63%	7.31%	-16.93%	-16.49%	-135.16%
DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	14	66.84%	38.22%	6.87%	47.11%	90.70%	-0.55%	9.30%	5.68%	26.19%	-44.16%
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOC AF	71	77.06%	69.12%	4.54%	-2.78%	94.43%	3.54%	5.57%	-36.70%	18.40%	-60.77%
LOCAL 884 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOC AF	76	60.49%	4.15%	2.38%	-49.04%	95.49%	4.70%	4.51%	-48.75%	47.13%	0.49%
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION AF	82	44.34%	-8.45%	2.36%	-49.48%	94.95%	4.11%	5.05%	-42.61%	53.30%	13.65%
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) AF	104	56.64%	18.95%	6.15%	31.69%	90.20%	-1.10%	9.80%	11.36%	37.21%	-20.66%
SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) AF	112	36.19%	-25.27%	3.74%	-19.91%	90.63%	-0.63%	9.37%	5.48%	60.07%	28.08%
LOCAL 30A-D (UOE) ENGINEERS ANNUITY FUND	114	21.00%	-56.64%	0.44%	-90.58%	97.94%	7.39%	2.06%	-76.59%	78.56%	67.51%
LOCAL 1180 CWA MEMBERS ANNUITY FUND	119	14.49%	-70.08%	3.45%	-26.12%	89.78%	-11.43%	19.22%	118.41%	82.07%	74.99%
DISTRICT COUNCIL 37 AFSOCME ANNUITY FUND	121	18.58%	-61.64%	10.44%	123.55%	64.03%	-29.79%	35.97%	308.75%	70.88%	51.34%
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES AF	123	8.65%	-82.14%	1.99%	-57.39%	81.34%	-10.81%	18.66%	112.05%	89.36%	90.53%
TOTAL \$3 MILLION TO \$10 MILLION CATEGORY		48.43%		4.67%		91.20%		8.80%		46.90%	
NYC CONTRIBUTION \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION											
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS ANNUITY FUND	43	24.96%	-48.14%	3.74%	-6.27%	86.97%	-5.83%	13.03%	70.33%	71.30%	48.91%
PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOC ANNUITY FUND	95	69.10%	43.57%	4.21%	5.51%	94.25%	2.06%	5.75%	-24.84%	26.69%	-44.26%
TOTAL \$10 MILLION TO \$20 MILLION CATEGORY		48.13%		3.99%		92.35%		7.65%		47.88%	
TOTAL ANNUITY FUNDS		48.58%		4.75%		91.09%		8.91%		46.66%	
GRAND TOTAL		34.47%		7.49%		91.85%		8.15%		0.04%	

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER

INTERNAL CONTROL AND ACCOUNTABILITY DIRECTIVES

**DIRECTIVE 12 - EMPLOYEE BENEFIT FUNDS - UNIFORM REPORTING AND
AUDITING REQUIREMENTS**

INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY

This Directive sets forth accounting, auditing and financial guidelines for employee and retiree Benefit Funds which receive contributions from the City of New York. It also establishes detailed information reporting requirements for the funds and their boards of trustees. All Benefit Funds that receive contributions from the City of New York are required to conform with this Directive's provisions.

The accounting, auditing and reporting requirements prescribed herein vary in accordance with the amount of funding the Benefit Fund receives from the City. Benefit Funds are divided into two funding level categories: those with New York City Contributions less than \$300,000 (Level I); and those with \$300,000 or more in New York City Contributions (Level II).

1.0 GENERAL INFORMATION

1.1 Organization

- 1.0 General Information
- 2.0 Definitions
- 3.0 General Guidelines and Requirements
- 4.0 Annual Reporting Requirements
- 5.0 Independent Annual Audit
- 6.0 Trustee Representation Letter
- 7.0 Federal ERISA Reporting Requirements
- 8.0 Annual Report to Fund Membership
- 9.0 Supporting Schedules

Exhibits:

- A - Administrative Expense Schedule
- B - Benefit Expense Schedule
- C - Key Ratio Schedule

1.2 Effective Date

This directive is effective for Benefit Fund plan years beginning on or after July 1, 1997.

1.3 Notice

In reissuing this directive, the Office of the Comptroller has undertaken to clarify, whenever possible the prior version's text. In reissuing this directive, there is no intent to change the existing interpretation of any subject unless explicitly stated in the text.

1.4 Assistance

Requests for additional copies and questions concerning this Directive should be addressed to: Joseph Trapani, Chief, Bureau of Management and Accounting Systems, (669-8201), 1 Centre Street, Municipal Building, Room 1005, New York, NY 10007.

2.0 DEFINITIONS

The following define the key terms used in this Directive:

2.1 Benefit Fund

Benefit Funds consist of any welfare or annuity fund that receives contributions from the City of New York. Examples of Benefit Funds include supplemental health care, educational, legal benefit, annuity, and civil/legal representation funds. Benefit Funds may be for either active or retired New York City employees.

2.2 New York City Contribution

The New York City Contribution is the total of the direct payments the City of New York is required, pursuant to applicable collective bargaining agreements, to make to a Benefit Fund on behalf of relevant employees and retirees.

The City of New York, as used herein, is a reference to its constituent agencies which are defined in the Charter of The City of New York, Chapter 52, Section 1150, subdivision 2, as a city, county, borough, or other office, position, administration, department, division, bureau, board or commission, corporation, institution or agency of government, the expenses of which are paid in whole or in part from the City's treasury.

2.3 Benefit Expense

Benefit expenses, as used herein, are the direct costs of providing benefits. These costs include:

- Claims paid by the fund for self-insured benefits.

- Insurance premium payments less any retention charges.
- The cost of providing medical referral services.
- Salaries or other payments to:
 - Attorneys who provide direct legal services to members.
 - Instructors who conduct in-house training for members.
 - Physicians who examine members for workers' disability purposes.
 - Other professionals and consultants who provide services directly to members.

2.4 Administrative Expense

Administrative Expenses are all those costs that are not Benefit Expenses, including, but not limited to:

- Salaries and allowances for the fund's administrative support staff.
- Rents and other occupancy costs.
- Insurance policies for offices, equipment and other general business purposes.
- Fees paid to third party or fund administrators for administrative purposes.
- Miscellaneous fees and commissions.
- Insurance company retention charges.

2.5 Insurance Retention Charges

Insurance Retention Charges represent the portion of the insurance premiums retained by an insurance company to recover the administrative costs of handling benefit payments. Retention charges are applicable only to insured welfare plans.

3.0 GENERAL GUIDELINES AND REQUIREMENTS

3.1 Supplementary Benefit Agreements

The supplementary benefit agreements between the City of New York and the labor unions establish the Comptroller's authority to audit and request specific information from the Benefit Funds, and describe the Funds' underlying reporting responsibilities.

The agreements require, in part, that Benefit Funds maintain accurate records and books of account in conformance with generally accepted accounting principles, file annual trustees' statements with the Office of the Comptroller containing substantiation and other information that the Comptroller shall from time to time prescribe, as per individual Fund

supplemental agreements, and obtain annual independent audits of their financial statements. The agreements also specify the Comptroller's right to audit all Benefit Fund expenditures.

The agreements also set forth conflict of interest guidelines. These guidelines provide that Benefit Funds, and all fund trustees, officers and employees are prohibited from directly or indirectly receiving, in connection with the solicitation, sale, service or administration of a Benefit Fund contract, any payment, commission, loan or other thing of value from any entity or individual; and that Benefit Fund trustees, officers or employees may not directly or indirectly receive any payment, commission, loan service or any other thing of value from the Benefit Fund, except that such person may receive employee benefits to which he or she is otherwise entitled, and reasonable compensation for necessary services and expenses rendered or incurred in connection with official duties.

Many of the financial, accounting, auditing and reporting guidelines in this directive replicate, or are derived from, supplementary benefit agreement terms and conditions.

3.2 Accounting Standards

Every Benefit Fund which receives New York City Contributions is required to maintain adequate books of account and related records that will enable it to prepare complete and auditable financial statements on an accrual basis of accounting in conformity with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles.

3.3 Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directives

It is recommended that all Benefit Funds for which the New York City Contribution is \$300,000 or greater (Level II Funds) comply, where applicable, with the Internal Control and Accountability Directives issued by the Office of the Comptroller.

3.4 Spending Guidelines

Benefit Funds should insure that New York City Contributions are spent appropriately and monitored carefully. This includes:

- Restricting their use only for expenditures and programs that directly or indirectly benefit fund members.
- Carefully controlling Administrative Expenses and insuring that they do not exceed a reasonable percentage of total Benefit Fund revenue.
- Insuring that spending for Benefit Fund employee salaries, fees paid to trustees and fees or commissions paid to professionals and service providers are not excessive or unreasonable in relation to the service or product received.
- Using competitive processes to the greatest degree practicable to procure goods and services.

In addition:

- Political and charitable contributions of any kind paid from the New York City Contribution or related investment earnings are prohibited.
- Payments on Benefit Fund contracts or other obligations generally must be made by check drawn on the fund payable directly to the creditor, beneficiary or obligee. Payments, that are not customarily paid by check, including, but not limited to, electronic transfers and imprest fund expenditures, are permissible.

3.5 Service Provider Assessments

The services rendered by consultants shall be assessed at least once every two years. The assessments shall be reported in the board's official minutes and attached to the trustees' representation letter.

It is further recommended, that the work of consultants and all individuals or organizations, with the exception of medical service providers, that are paid for services rendered on a fee or commission basis, be assessed each year with the results reported in the board's official minutes and attached to the trustees' representation letter.

3.6 Investment Policy and Procedures

3.6.1 Trustee Representation Letter

Level II Benefit Funds must attach a copy of their investment policy to the trustee representation letter along with the trustees' certification that the fund has complied with its policy and procedures.

3.6.2 Investment Policy Recommendation

To insure that idle monies are invested judiciously, appropriately safeguarded and accounted for fully, it is recommended that the board of trustees:

- Insure that the fund has a written investment policy which describes the permissible types of investments and the guidelines to be adhered to for each investment type. The policies and procedures should also cover, as appropriate, compliance with ERISA investment guidelines and any statutory or legal restrictions, collateralization, the use and selection of financial institutions such as depositories, custodians and trusts, and the use and selection of financial advisors.
- Conduct annual reviews of the fund's compliance with the investment policies and procedures.
- Insure that the investment policy and procedures are periodically reviewed and revised as necessary to reflect changes in available investment opportunities and market conditions.

- Establish a trustee investment committee, that includes the fund's chief fiscal officer, to oversee the investment function.
- Insure that internal accounting and procedural controls provide an environment which encourages adherence to the fund's investment policies and procedures. The internal controls should:
 - Separate the investment authorization and accounting functions.
 - Insure that investment transactions are fully recorded at an appropriate level of detail.
 - Mandate that all transactions are based on written authorizations.
 - Regularly report on all investment activity to Trustees.
 - Provide for the bonding of appropriate Benefit Fund staff.

3.7 Travel Policy

The board of trustees must establish a written travel policy which sets forth reasonable standards for all out-of-town travel and attendance at conferences, seminars and other events. In addition to establishing guidelines describing when, and for what purposes travel is appropriate, and expenditure limitations for transportation, lodging, meals and other expenses, the policy must require the board of trustees' advance authorization of all out-of-town travel.

3.7.1 Travel Policy Minimum Requirements

The travel policy, at a minimum, must:

- Prohibit first-class travel.
- Provide that reimbursement of expenses will be made only upon submission of a completed request with supporting documents attached.
- Require persons authorized to travel on Benefit Fund business to report to the board of trustees describing the benefits derived from the trip. The reports must be incorporated in the board's official minutes. It is recommended that the reports be in writing.

In addition, it is recommended that the travel policy:

- Place limitations on the number of individuals who attend, as well as the number of times individuals may travel each year for non-essential purposes such as attending general purpose training and educational courses, attending professional development, or industry conferences, or trade shows.

- Establish reasonable per diem rates such as the Federal General Services Administration's per diem rates, by locality, for normal daily travel expenditures.
- State that Level II funds comply with the Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive 6, *Authorization, Reimbursement and Audit of Travel, Meals, Lodging and Miscellaneous Agency Expenses*.

3.7.2 Travel Reporting Requirements

A copy of the fund's travel policy must be attached to the trustee representation letter. In addition, a summary of all trustee/staff expenditures for conference attendance and out-of-town travel must be submitted annually as part of the trustee representation letter.

3.8 Cost and Expense Allocations

Benefit Funds that share premises with related or other entities will have common Administrative Expenses such as rent, utilities, general management and other general expenses. These costs should be allocated equitably for reporting and accountability purposes. The allocation must be made systematically, applied consistently from year-to-year, and must be reviewed annually. Staff salaries should be apportioned based on records which document the efforts devoted to each entity. An explanation of the fund's allocation methodologies must be attached to the trustee representation letter.

3.9 Competitive Proposals for Insured Benefits and Other Services

Contracts for insured benefits, except for basic medical and hospital augmentations negotiated with the same insurer, must be awarded using a competitive proposal process. Benefit Funds must solicit at least three firms with the appropriate size, experience and qualifications to provide such benefits or services. The board of trustees must prepare a certification for each benefit or service contract which states that a minimum of three proposals were solicited and discloses the date on which the fund solicited the proposals and the names of all companies solicited. The certification must be included in the board's official minutes and be attached to the trustee representation letter.

It is recommended that Benefit Funds, with the exception of medical service providers, use a similar competitive proposal process to choose third party administrators and all other professional service providers.

Additionally, funds should consider using the guidance provided in the City of New York Procurement Policy Board Rules and the Mayor's Office of Contracts' Rules Implementation Memoranda to assist in developing appropriate competitive proposal processes.

3.10 Comptroller's Audits

The fund's books, records and accounts, including the full minutes of the board of trustees' meetings, are subject to review and audit by the Office of the Comptroller.

4.0 ANNUAL REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

This Directive requires Benefit Funds to prepare and submit a number of reports, copies of documents and other materials to the Office of the Comptroller. All required filings must be submitted annually, no later than nine months after the close of the Benefit Funds' fiscal year.

4.1 Funding Levels Defined

Fund filing requirements vary according to the size of the New York City Contribution as indicated below:

- Level I - Benefit Funds for which New York City Contributions are less than \$300,000.
- Level II - Benefit Funds for which New York City Contributions are \$300,000 or more.

4.2 Reporting Requirements Summary

Subsequent sections of this Directive establish Benefit Fund reporting requirements which vary among the two funding levels. To assist boards of trustees and Benefit Funds, a synopsis of reporting responsibilities and requirements, by funding level, along with references to the appropriate sections of the Directive, is provided here:

Annual Independent Auditor's (CPA) Report

- 1) Statement of Net Assets Available for Benefits
- 2) Statmnt. of Changes in Net Assets Avail. for Benefits
- 3) Footnotes to financial statements
- 4) Auditor's opinion on the financial statements
- 5) Administrative Expense Schedule
- 6) Benefit Expense Schedule

Auditor's Management Letter

DIRECTIVE REFERENCE	LEVEL I	LEVEL II
5.0	Yes	Yes
5.3	Yes	Yes
5.3	Yes	Yes
5.3	Yes	Yes
5.4	Yes	Yes
5.3/9.1	Yes ¹	Yes
5.3/9.2	Yes ¹	Yes
5.7	Yes	Yes

¹ Fund must provide schedule, however, independent audit is at the fund's option.

APPENDIX A
Comptroller's Directive #12

Trustee Representation Letter

- a) Fund name, address, etc.
- b) Trustee names, addresses, etc.
- c) Fund administrator, name, address, etc.
- d) New York City Contribution
- e) Total Benefit Fund revenue
- f) Number of City employees/retirees
- g) Percent NYC employees to total fund enrollment
- h) Allocation methodologies
- i) Travel policy
- j) Trustee/staff travel report
- k) Payments to trustees
- l) Payments to top five officers/trustees/staff
- m) Fee/commission payments
- n) Benefit plan amendments
- o) Insurer changes
- p) IRS 5500, 5500c or 990
- q) Investment policies and procedures
- r) Audit contract

ERISA Reports 5500 & 5500C (If filed)

Level I Fund addendum

Annual Membership Report

Exhibits

A - Administrative Expense Schedule

B - Benefit Expense Schedule

C - Key Ratios Schedule

DIRECTIVE REFERENCE	LEVEL I	LEVEL II
6.0	No	Yes
6.1.1	No	Yes
6.1.2	No	Yes
6.1.3	No	Yes
6.1.4	No	Yes
6.1.5	No	Yes
6.1.6	No	Yes
6.1.7	No	Yes
3.8/6.1.8	No	Yes
3.7/6.1.9	No	Yes
3.7.2/6.1.10	No	Yes
6.1.11	No	Yes
6.1.12	No	Yes
3.5/3.9/6.1.13	No	Yes
6.1.14	No	Yes
6.1.15	No	Yes
7.0/6.1.16	No	Yes
3.6/6.1.17	No	Yes
5.5/6.1.18	No	Yes
7.0/6.1.16	Yes	Yes
7.0	Yes	No
8.0	Yes	Yes
9.1	Yes ¹	Yes
9.2	Yes ¹	Yes
9.3	Yes	Yes

4.3 Filing Address

All filings required by the Directive must be submitted to:

Mr. Henry Lockworth
The City of New York
Office of the Comptroller
Bureau of Financial Audit
1 Centre Street, 13th Floor, Room 1300 North
New York, NY 10007
(212) 669-8258

5.0 INDEPENDENT ANNUAL AUDITS

All Benefit Funds must prepare annual financial statements in accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP). Each year's financial statements must be audited annually by independent Certified Public Accountants (CPA).

5.1 Auditor Selection

It is strongly recommended that independent certified public accountants be selected through the use of a competitive proposal process. Requests for proposals should be sent to at least three firms with the appropriate size, experience and qualifications to perform the audit. Requests for proposals should incorporate a copy of this directive.

In addition, it is recommended that:

- The audit selection process be completed no later than 60 days after the beginning of the Benefit Fund's calendar or fiscal year. Timeliness in engaging CPAs is important to insure that there is no break in continuity in the auditing process and, if necessary, to facilitate the transfer of information from one firm to its successor.
- Benefit Funds contract only with firms included on the Office of the Comptroller's prequalified list of CPAs. A copy of the list may be obtained from the filing address listed in §4.3 above.

5.2 Audit Standards

The audit must be conducted in accordance with generally accepted auditing standards (GAAS) as promulgated by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants.

5.3 Audit Scope

The scope of the independent audit for all Benefit Funds must include the following:

- (1) Statement of net assets available for benefits
- (2) Statement of changes in net assets available for benefits
- (3) Footnotes to financial statements

Funds where City contributions are \$300,000 or greater (Level II) are additionally required to provide an Administrative Expense Schedule (Exhibit A) and Benefit Expense Schedule (Exhibit B) which have been audited as part of the independent audit of the basic financial statements.

5.4 Audit Opinion

The auditor's opinion must state whether the financial statements are presented fairly in accordance with generally accepted accounting principles.

5.5 Audit Contract

It is strongly recommended that audit contracts not exceed four years in length. After four years, a new request for proposals should be issued. Additionally, for Level II funds, if the same firm is awarded the contract in a subsequent four year period, the audit firm should be required to assign a different senior manager and partner-in-charge. Benefit funds are strongly encouraged not to award contracts to the same firm for more than two consecutive four-year periods.

The audit contract must require that the audit report be issued within nine months after the close of the fund's calendar or fiscal year and must incorporate procedures, established by the Comptroller, for the Comptroller's audit of the fund. Additionally, for Level II funds, a copy of the audit contract must be attached to the trustee representation letter, and must specify that the audit work papers are subject to review by the Comptroller's Office.

5.6 Peer Review

The independent auditor must provide the Benefit Fund with copies of any peer reviews performed in accordance with the AICPA's guidelines. The Benefit Fund should use the peer reviews as part of their evaluation in selecting an independent auditor.

5.7 Management Letter

Audit contract terms must include a requirement that the auditor issue a management letter when, in the CPA's professional judgment and as per AICPA guidelines, one is merited. The management letter must comment on any material weaknesses or reportable conditions in any of the five elements which make up the Benefit Fund's internal control structure: control environment, risk assessment, information and communication, control

activities and monitoring. When appropriate, the management letter should contain recommendations to fund management on how to improve the noted conditions.

In gaining an understanding of the funds internal control structure, the auditor should take special note of the following areas:

- Adequacy of expenditure documentation and approval processes.
- Expense allocations for Benefit Funds that share their premises with other organizations.
- The adequacy and propriety of the fund's investment policies and procedures and of the fund's compliance with them.
- Competitive procurement practices.
- Staff utilization including the reasonableness of staffing in relation to workload requirements.
- All other matters that the auditors consider appropriate for disclosure to the trustees.

If the independent auditors conclude that there are no material weaknesses, the management letter should so indicate.

6.0 TRUSTEE REPRESENTATION LETTER

The boards of trustees of Level II funds must submit a trustee representation letter to the Comptroller annually which summarizes the Benefit Fund's management policies and activities and provides key information about the fund's operation. The trustee representation letter must be signed by all of the fund's trustees and must include an affirmation that, under the penalties for perjury, in accordance with the supplemental agreement, the report is a true and accurate reflection of management's policies and the state of the fund's affairs for the reporting period.

Level I funds have abbreviated requirements which are described in §7.0.

6.1 Trustee Representation Letter Requirements

The trustee representation letter must contain:

- 6.1.1 The Benefit Fund's name, address and telephone number.
- 6.1.2 The names and business addresses of all board of trustee members.
- 6.1.3 The fund administrator's name, address, and telephone number.

6.1.4 The total amount of New York City Contributions for the fund's fiscal or calendar year.

6.1.5 Total Benefit Fund revenue from all sources.

6.1.6 The number of City employee and retiree members at year end.

6.1.7 The number of City employees or retirees expressed as a percentage of the total number of covered Benefit Fund members.

6.1.8 For Benefit Funds that share premises, staff or other expenses with related or other entities, a description of all cost or expense allocation formulas, including an explanation of the allocation methodology and the basis for distribution. (§3.8.)

6.1.9 A copy of the fund's travel policy. (§3.7)

6.1.10 A summary of all expenditures for out-of-town travel and attendance at conferences for trustees and staff. The summary should include the name and position of the traveler/attendee, the dates of travel, the destination, the reason for the trip and the total expenditure. (§3.7)

6.1.11 A listing of all amounts paid to any trustee and a description of the work or services rendered.

6.1.12 A statement disclosing the total remuneration for the five most highly paid individuals from among trustees, officers and staff.

6.1.13 The identification of all individuals or organizations paid on a fee or commission basis, including administrators, investment managers, attorneys, accountants and other professional service providers. For each individual or organization, the provider's name and address, a description of the relationship, the fees paid and, if applicable, the amount of funds held or managed must be provided.

For consultants, a copy of the official board minutes authorizing the hiring of each consultant and the trustees' biennial assessment of the consultants' performance. (§3.5)

For insured benefit contracts, certification of the competitive selection process as described in §3.9.

6.1.14 If any amendments were made to the benefit plan during the year, a copy of the new benefit booklet or other member notification. If there were no changes the representation letter must state so.

6.1.15 If any benefits were changed from third party insured to self-insured or vice-versa during the year, the reasons for the change, including a detailed explanation of the advantages and any expected cost savings.

6.1.16 If required to file with the IRS, a copy of IRS Form 5500 or 5500C (or IRS Form 990).

6.1.17 A copy of the Benefit Fund's investment policy and procedures and the certification described in §3.6.1.

6.1.18 A copy of the independent audit contract. (§5.5)

6.2 Substitution of Statements or Filings

Funds may, in lieu of any specific requirement in §6.1 above, substitute copies of statements or filings made pursuant to State or Federal Law. Each substitution must be clearly referenced to its corresponding requirement in §6.1.

7.0 FEDERAL ERISA REPORTING REQUIREMENTS

Funds may choose to comply with the Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974's (ERISA) reporting guidelines for Benefit Fund expenditures and activities. ERISA requires that certain Benefit Funds, depending on membership size, file Internal Revenue Service Forms 5500 or 5500C. Funds choosing to comply with ERISA and which are required, under ERISA, to file 5500 or 5500C should provide an information copy to the Comptroller's Office with the trustee representation letter. At the Fund's discretion, a copy of IRS Tax Form 990 filing may be submitted, to the Comptroller's Office, instead of Forms 5500 or 5500C.

Funds with New York City Contributions under \$300,000, (Level I) must attach an addendum to the Comptroller's copy of Form 5500 or 5500C (or Form 990) with the following information:

- The number of City employee members and retirees at year-end.
- Total New York City Contributions for the year.
- Amendments to benefits. If amendments were made, a copy of the new benefit booklet or other membership notification. If there were no amendments, a statement to that effect.

8.0 ANNUAL REPORT TO FUND MEMBERSHIP

Each fund is required to issue an annual report to its membership. A copy of the annual report, with cover letter, must be sent to each member of the fund and be filed with the Office of the

Comptroller. The annual report must advise the membership of the financial condition and operations of the fund and advise the membership of significant changes and other important matters. At a minimum, the annual report must include a copy or a condensed version of the most recent independently audited financial statements. This requirement may be fulfilled by publishing the cover letter and report in a fund authorized publication provided that the publication is mailed to each member individually.

9.0 SUPPORTING SCHEDULE REQUIREMENTS

All Benefit Funds are required to provide the following supporting schedules:

9.1 Administrative Expense Schedule

This schedule compares the Benefit Fund's Administrative Expenses for the last two fiscal years, however, three fiscal years of comparable data is required for any year that the result of the Benefit Fund's operations shows a deficit that exceeds five times the fund balance. The format is provided in Exhibit A. A narrative must also be provided by the board of trustees as an attachment, explaining any adverse trends from year to year, or any expense fluctuations in excess of plus or minus fifteen percent from the prior year. This schedule also requires the computation of Administrative Expenses as a percentage of total Benefit Fund revenue.

Benefit Funds with New York City Contributions under \$300,000 (Level I) must attach this schedule to the Comptroller's copy of the ERISA reporting described in Section 7.0. All other funds (Level II) must have this schedule independently audited and included as part of the annual audit report.

9.2 Benefit Expense Schedule

This schedule requests specific information for each benefit provided by the fund. The format is provided in Exhibit B.

Benefit Funds with New York City Contributions under \$300,000 (Level I) must attach this schedule to the Comptroller's copy of the ERISA reporting described in §7.0. All other funds (Level II) must have this schedule independently audited and included as part of the annual audit report submission.

9.3 Key Ratio Schedule

The Key Ratio Schedule requests the comparative analysis of certain Benefit Fund financial indicators for each of the last two years. The format is provided in Exhibit C. Each fund (Levels I and II) must submit this analysis as part of its annual reporting submission, due no later than nine months after the close of its fiscal year.

**THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER**

**INTERNAL CONTROL AND
ACCOUNTABILITY DIRECTIVE 12 SUPPLEMENT**

**FOR FUNDS NOT ESTABLISHED AND MAINTAINED BY
MUNICIPAL LABOR COMMITTEE UNIONS**

This supplement adds Section 9.4, *Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule*, to Section 9.0 of Comptroller's Internal Control and Accountability Directive #12 which was issued on February 28, 1997.

The benefit funds established and maintained by Municipal Labor Committee (MLC) unions pursuant to collective bargaining agreements with the City of New York, have agreed to provide this supplemental information in a separate submission to the Comptroller's Office. All other funds must submit it as part of the annual reporting requirements described in Section 4.0 of the directive.

9.4 Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule

The Multi-Employer Analysis Schedule requires funds to provide:

The number of covered New York City employee and retiree members at year end.

1.1 The number of employee and retiree members for each of the fund's five largest non-City contributors at year end.

The number of trustee and/or benefit fund employee members at year end.

The employee and/or retiree member contribution rate for each of the fund's five largest non-City contributors and for the trustees and/or benefit funds.

The format is provided in Exhibit D. Each fund (Level I and II) must submit this analysis as part of its annual reporting submission, due no later than nine months after the close of its fiscal year.

Exhibit A

ADMINISTRATIVE EXPENSE SCHEDULE

DESCRIPTION	1993*	1994	1995
Salaries			
% of total Administrative Expense			
Fringe Benefits			
Investment and Custodial Services			
Legal			
Accountant			
Fees and Commissions - Other			
Rent			
Travel and Conference			
Telephone			
Insurance Retention Charges			
Office Equipment and Rental			
Stationery, Printing, Postage, Office Supplies			
Insurance			
Repairs & Maintenance			
Others (Please Describe):			
Total Administrative Expense			
Total Benefit Fund Revenue			
% Administrative/Revenue			

* Required if Fund has a current year's operating deficit in excess of five times its fund balance.

EXPLANATION OF EXPENSE CATEGORIES

EXPENSE CATEGORY	EXPENSES INCLUDED
Salaries	Salaries, Payroll Taxes, Employment Agency Fees
Fringe Benefits	Employee Fringe Benefits and Severance Pay
Investment and Custodial Services	Investment Management and Custodial Services
Legal	Attorney Fees
Accounting	Accountant Fees
Fees and Commissions - Other	Consulting, Third Party Administrators (e.g. Claims Processing), Communications and Publicity, Security, Actuary, Computer Software Design
Rent	Rent, Utilities, Storage, Building and Moving Expenses
Travel and Conference	Trustee Allowances, Meeting Expenses, Dues, Subscriptions, Awards, Auto Expenses
Telephone	Telephone and Telegrams
Insurance Retention Charges	Insurance Company Administrative Charge to handle benefit payments
Office Equipment and Rental	Depreciation, Amortization, Computer Hardware, Furniture and Equipment
Stationery, Printing, Postage, Office Supplies	Publications, Advertising, Messenger, Petty Cash, Microfilm, Records, Photocopy, Computer Supplies
Insurance	Fiduciary Liability, Bonding, Office Insurance
Repairs and Maintenance	Office Cleaning, Repairs and Maintenance
Other	Any other expense that does not fall in above categories. Each expense must be listed separately and described.

Exhibit B

BENEFIT EXPENSE SCHEDULE

BENEFIT	DESCRIPTION	IS BENEFIT INSURED/SELF- INSURED	COST OF BENEFIT FOR YEAR	BENEFIT COVERAGE *

* Use key numbers below to indicate coverage categories

- 1. Member
- 2. Spouse
- 3. Children

**BENEFIT FUND
KEY RATIO SCHEDULE**

	1994	1995
Total Revenue		
Administrative Expense		
% of Revenue		
Benefit Expense		
% of Revenue		
Total Expense		
Net Surplus/(Deficit)		
Fund Balance Year-End		
% of Total Revenue		

Exhibit D

MULTI-EMPLOYER ANALYSIS SCHEDULE

Reporting Year _____		
EMPLOYERS	NUMBER OF EMPLOYEE AND/OR RETIREE MEMBERS	CONTRIBUTION PER EMPLOYEE AND/OR RETIREE
New York City		
Five Largest Non-City Contributors: (enter name)		
1)		
2)		
3)		
4)		
5)		
Benefit Fund/Trustee		

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUND

AREA

UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE

- Benefit processing system weaknesses
 - Funds do not verify eligibility of employees' dependents. Documentation such as, marriage or birth certificates is not reviewed before processing benefits for members' dependents.
 - Funds do not always check the eligibility database before processing benefits.
 - Funds paid benefits not in accordance with guidelines.
 - Funds pay claims without obtaining the proper documentation.
 - Funds improperly delay eligibility.
 - Benefit payments are made without being reviewed and approved by an individual other than the claims processor.
 - Coordination of benefits provisions are not properly applied.
- Benefit administration
 - Funds do not maintain sufficient information concerning members usage of benefits such as legal services and are therefore unable to assess the prudence of continuing to provide such benefits.
- Allocation of common expenses
 - Expenses are allocated between funds and related entities without:
 - establishing a reasonable basis for the allocation (i.e. contribution rate, number of participants, actual usage).
 - supporting documentation substantiating the percentage allocated.

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUND

AREA

UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE

- Documentation for expenses
 - Amounts expended by Funds do not have supporting documentation such as approved vouchers, bills and receipts.
 - Questionable expenses charged to fund.
 - Benefit expenses were not recorded by the Fund.
 - Payment to consultants did not specify service rendered, amount, method of compensation or period covered.

- Travel and conference expenses
 - Funds do not follow the following guidelines:
 - The number of conference attendees is not kept to an absolute minimum.
 - Airfares or group rates are not paid directly to the sponsoring organization, or to the airlines or hotels. Reimbursements to trustees are made without adequate documentation.
 - Coach airfare or group rates are not used.
 - Reimbursements are made for personal expenditures (flowers, entertainment, etc.)
 - Meal advances are not limited.
 - Reimbursement for local transportation and meals are made despite failure to present properly documented expense vouchers.
 - Persons attending conferences do not submit written reports on the sessions they attended.

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUND

AREA

UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE

- Payments to trustees
 - Summary reports were not discussed or recorded at Board of Trustees meetings.
 - Fund per diem expenses for trustees exceeded IRS guidelines.
 - Fund officials routinely have business lunches during the day with their staff.
 - Trustees received fixed monthly allowances.
 - Trustees did not submit documentation for such allowances.
 - Insufficient guidelines for paying trustees for performing fund work.
- Written contracts
 - Funds do not maintain written contract or agreements with:
 - consultants.
 - accountants.
 - attorneys.
- Competitive bidding for professional
 - Funds do not competitively bid or consider alternative and benefit services providers for the following types of services:
 - consultants (actuary, computer, investments).
 - attorneys.
 - fiduciary liability and bonding insurance.
- Retention charges for insured benefits
 - The funds do not have a formal package of all the solicitation materials including a complete description of benefits, estimated retentions, and all conditions which the successful bidder must meet.

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUND

AREA

UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE

- The person responsible for preparing bid specifications and/or compiling experience data needed for the formal bid solicitation is an independent consultant, dependent on commissions for compensation.
 - Retention charges, expressed as percentage of premiums are higher than the limits established by the NYS Insurance Department.
 - Commissions expressed as a percentage of premiums are higher than guidelines established by the NYS Insurance Department.
- Internal Controls
 - Funds do not maintain an adequate set of accounting records, including the following:
 - general ledger.
 - cash disbursements journal.
 - cash receipts journal.
 - Funds do not:
 - stamp paid on all vouchers (indicating date and check number).
 - segregate incompatible duties between personnel.
 - prohibit writing checks to cash or bearer.
- Significant Operating Deficits
 - Substantial operating deficits have exhausted the fund's reserve.
 - Funds maintain inadequate level of reserves

COMMONLY FOUND UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICES OF WELFARE FUND

<u>AREA</u>	<u>UNACCEPTABLE PRACTICE</u>
High Administrative Expenses	- A significant larger percentage of total revenue was spent on administrative expenses, in comparison to other similar funds.
• Postretirement benefits	- The Funds financial statements do not present the Plan's obligation to provide health and welfare benefits to participants after retirements (postretirement benefit obligations) as required by generally accepted accounting principles. The effects of the omission of postretirement benefit obligation information of the Plan's financial statements are presumed to be material.
• Other	- Cost savings analyses are not performed prior to major purchases (i.e. computer). - Work logs are not maintained by professionals to determine actual work performed and time spent.

Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2007

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
C 84-202	Allied Building Inspectors Local 211 – International Union of Operating Engineers Welfare Fund	12/14/84
C 83-203	Local 144 Civil Service Division Welfare Fund	01/14/85
C 83-208	Parking Enforcement Agents Local 1182 Security Benefits Fund	03/12/85
C 84-204	New York City Local 246 Service Employees International Union Welfare Fund	04/19/85
C 85-203	Local 300 Service Employees International Union Civil Service Forum Employees Welfare Fund	02/27/86
C 85-202	Correction Officers' Benevolent Association, Inc. Security Benefits Fund	04/07/86
C 85-207	Correction Captains Association Security Benefits Fund	06/25/86
C 83-206	House Staff Benefits Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents	07/25/86
C 86-202	Superior Officers Council of the New York City Police Department Retiree Health and Welfare Fund	10/03/86
C 86-201	Uniformed Sanitationmen's Association Retirees Welfare Fund Local 831	10/15/86
C 86-203	New York State Court Clerk's Association Retirees Security Benefits Fund	10/22/86
C 86-204	Uniformed Fire Officers Association - Retired Fire Officers Family Protection Plan Local 854	11/18/86
C 86-205	Local 858 International Brotherhood of Teamsters, OTB Branch Office Managers Welfare Fund	05/05/87
C 85-206	Security Benefit Fund Local 832 International Brotherhood of Teamsters	05/08/87
C 86-208	Doctors Council Welfare Fund	08/11/87
C 86-213	Local 721 Licensed Practical Nurses Welfare Fund	11/20/87
C 87-202	Health Benefits Fund and the Retiree's Health and Welfare Fund of the Detectives Endowment Association	05/11/88
C 88-200	Patrolmen's Benevolent Association of the City of New York Retiree Health and Welfare Fund	06/06/88

Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2007

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
C 88-203	Local 1182 CWA Parking Enforcement Agents Welfare Fund	09/22/88
C 87-203	Professional Staff Congress - CUNY Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds	10/13/88
C 88-205	Civil Service Bar Association Welfare Fund	10/19/88
C 88-201	Local 333 United Marine Division Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds	01/12/89
C 88-207A2	Housing Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds - Legal Services	04/06/89
C 88-204	Local 444 Sanitation Officers Association Welfare and Retiree Welfare Funds	04/20/89
C 88-207B	Housing Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Welfare, Retiree Welfare and Annuity Funds	06/30/89
C 89-205	Correction Officers Benevolent Association Annuity Fund	03/28/90
C 89-203	Local 1180 Communication Workers of America Security Benefits and Education Funds - Benefit Expenditures	04/27/90
C 90-205	NYC Retirees Welfare Fund	06/14/90
C 90-207	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Family Protection Plan	06/18/90
C 90-202	Social Service Employees Union Local 371 Administrative, Welfare, Legal Services and Education Funds	06/28/90
C 90-203	Local 211 International Union of Operating Engineers Allied Building Inspectors Welfare Fund	06/28/90
C 90-209	Local 2 United Federation of Teachers WF	05/06/91
C 90-210	Local 94 Uniformed Firefighters Assoc. RWF	05/04/91
C 90-211	Local 1 Council of Supervisors & Administrators WF	01/23/91
S 91-02	United Probation Officers Association Welfare and Retirement Welfare Fund	10/22/91
7I 93-099	System Audit Report on the General Controls for the Health and Welfare Applications of the Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Health and Welfare Fund	08/30/94
4D 93-050	Patrolmen's Benevolent Association Health and Welfare Fund (Including the Civil Legal Representation Fund)	09/02/94

Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2007

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FL95-129A	Financial & Operating Practices of the NYC Transit Police Officers Security Benefit Fund	06/20/95
FL95-130A	Financial & Operating Practices of Local 858 - International Brotherhood of Teamsters	06/09/95
FR95-068A	CUNY Faculty Welfare Fund for Retirees Under Agreement No. 3080 7/1/93 - 12/31/93	01/10/95
FR95-115A	The NYC Board of Education United Federation of Teachers (UFT) Welfare Fund Payments Under Agreement (#132)	03/01/95
FR96-059A	NYC Police Department Welfare Fund Payments for Active Employees Covered Under Agreements #A-2145 and #A-2146 - July 1, 1994 to April 7, 1995	12/29/95
FL96-058A	Financial and Operating Practices of the Parking Enforcement Agents Local 1182 Communication Workers of America Security Benefits Fund	06/10/96
FL96-153A	Doctor's Council Welfare Fund	06/20/96
FL96-178A	Fraudulent Claims Paid by the Doctors Council Welfare Fund	06/27/96
FL96-161A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Local 144 Civil Service Division Welfare Fund July 1, 1993 to June 30, 1994	04/07/97
FL97-077A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Operating Engineers, Local 30 A-C Municipal Employees Welfare Fund - July 1, 1994 to June 30, 1995	05/08/97
FR97-128A	Audit Report on the NYC Finance Department Welfare Fund Payments for Active Employees Covered Under Agreements #A-3412 and #A-3412-1 for the Period from July 1, 1995, to July 26, 1996	06/24/97
FR98-082F	follow-up Audit Report on the NYC Office of Labor Relations Welfare Fund Retirees Benefit Payments Under Agreements A-1 Through A-127 for the Period March 1996 - August 1996	04/14/98
FR98-083A	Audit Report on Payments Made to Various Welfare Benefit Funds by the New York City Board of Education, for Active Employees and Retirees, for the Period September 1, 1996 to August 31, 1997	06/22/98
FR98-100A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 832 International Brotherhood of Teamsters Security Benefits Fund January 1, 1996 to December 31, 1996	06/24/98

Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2007

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FL98-101A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 300 Service Employees International Union Civil Service Forum Retiree Welfare Fund July 1, 1994 - June 30, 1995	06/03/98
FL98-090A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 1183 Board of Elections Communication Workers of America Welfare Fund October 1, 1994 - September 30, 1995	06/09/98
FL98-143A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of Local 1183 Board of Elections Communication Workers of America Retiree Fund October 1, 1994 - September 30, 1995	06/09/98
FL98-194Ab	Audit Report on District Council 37 Benefits Fund Trust and Affiliated Funds' Data Processing Preparation for the Year 2000	03/03/99
FL99-161A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of District Council 37 Education Fund July 1, 1996 – June 30, 1997	06/30/99
FL00-074A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Retirees Welfare Fund January 1, 1998 – December 31, 1998	06/05/00
FL00-075A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of the Correction Officers' Benevolent Association Welfare Fund January 1, 1998 – December 31, 1998	06/05/00
FL99-162A	Audit Report on the Financial and Operating Practices of District Council 37 Health and Security Plan Trust July 1, 1996 – June 30, 1997	06/12/00
FL00-165A	District Council 37 Benefits Fund Trust	12/22/00
FM00-178A	International Union of Operating Engineers Local 891 Welfare Fund	01/26/01
FL01-095A	Doctor Council Welfare Fund	03/02/01
FL01-094A	Doctors Council Retiree Welfare Fund	03/02/01
FR01-170A	House Staff Benefits Plan and Legal Services Plan of the Committee of Interns and Residents	06/26/01

Comptroller's Audit Reports on Benefit Funds
Issued in Fiscal Years 1985 to 2007

<u>Report Number</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Date Issued</u>
FL01-085F	Board of Elections Local 1183 Communication Workers of America Retiree Fund	06/22/01
FL01-084F	Board of Elections Local 1183 Communication Workers of America Welfare Fund	06/22/01
FL02-083A	Communication Workers Association Local 1182 Security Benefits Fund	04/12/02
FL02-085A	Detectives Endowment Association Health Benefit Fund-Active Employees	04/23/02
FL02-086A	Detectives Endowment Association Health Benefit Fund-Retirees	04/26/02
FL03-087A	Local 300 SEIU Civil Service Forum Welfare Fund	06/10/03
FL03-088A	Local 300 SEIU Civil Service Forum Retired Employees Welfare Fund	06/10/03
FL03-086A	Sergeant Benevolent Association Health and Welfare Fund	06/30/03
FL03-151A	Local 444 Sanitation Officers Security Benefit Fund	06/30/03
FL04-093A	Local 721 Licensed Practical Nurses Welfare Fund	06/30/04
FL04-094A	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Family Protection Plan	06/30/04
FL04-095A	Uniformed Fire Officers Association Retired Fire Officers Family Protection Plan	06/30/04
FL05-088A	Municipal Employees Welfare Fund of the International Union of Operating Engineers Local Union 15, 15A and 15C	03/29/06
FL05-090A	Local 333 Insurance Fund for New York City Employees	06/26/07
FL05-091A	Local 333 Retirement Insurance Fund for New York City Retirees	06/26/07

TYPE OF SERVICE

FUNDS USING COMMON PROFESSIONAL SERVICE PROVIDERS

APPENDIX D

(Page 1 of 6)

2005
FUND NAME

AUDITING

BERDON LLP, CPA & ADVISORS	DISTRICT COUNCIL 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY CIVIL SERVICE DIVISION (AF)
BERDON LLP, CPA & ADVISORS	DISTRICT COUNCIL 9 PAINTING INDUSTRY CIVIL SERVICE DIVISION (WF/RWF)
BERDON LLP, CPA & ADVISORS	LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS (AF)
BERDON LLP, CPA & ADVISORS	LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS (RWF)
BERDON LLP, CPA & ADVISORS	LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS (WF)
BERDON LLP, CPA & ADVISORS	PROFESSIONAL STAFF CONGRESS CUNY (WF/RWF)
BUCHBINDER TUNICK & COMPANY LLP, CPA	DISTRICT NO.1 MEBA CITY EMPLOYEES BENEFICIAL FUND TRUST (WF/AF)
BUCHBINDER TUNICK & COMPANY LLP, CPA	LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHER (WF)
BUCHBINDER TUNICK & COMPANY LLP, CPA	LOCAL 891 IUOE (AF)
BUCHBINDER TUNICK & COMPANY LLP, CPA	LOCAL 891 SCHOOL CUSTODIAN & CUSTODIAN ENGINEERS (WF/RWF)
BUCHBINDER TUNICK & COMPANY LLP, CPA	UFT ALBERT SHANKER COLLEGE SCHOLARSHIP FUND
DANIEL E. JELINSKY, CPA	DOCTORS COUNCIL (RWF)
DANIEL E. JELINSKY, CPA	DOCTORS COUNCIL (WF)
DANIEL E. JELINSKY, CPA	DOCTORS COUNCIL (AF)
ERNST & YOUNG, L.L.P	LOCAL 3 ELECTRICAL WORKERS INDUSTRY ANNUITY (AF)
ERNST & YOUNG, L.L.P	PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (AF)
ERNST & YOUNG, L.L.P	PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (WF/CLRF)
ERNST & YOUNG, L.L.P	PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (RWF)
FURMAN & HAUSWIRTH., CPA	SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) (AF)
FURMAN & HAUSWIRTH., CPA	SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) (WF/RWF/CLRF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CIVIL SERVICE BAR ASSOCIATION (WF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION (AF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION (WF/CLRF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CORRECTION OFFICERS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (RWF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CORRECTION OFFICERS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (AF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	CORRECTION OFFICERS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (WF/CLRF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION (AF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION (RWF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION (WF/CLRF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT (RWF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT (WF/LEGAL/EF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	LOCAL 1180 CWA MEMBERS (AF)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	LOCAL 1182 CWA PARKING ENFORCEMENT AGENTS (WF/LEGAL)
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA	LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS (RWF)

TYPE OF SERVICE

FUNDS USING COMMON PROFESSIONAL SERVICE PROVIDERS

APPENDIX D

(Page 2 of 6)

2005

FUND NAME

AUDITING (CONTINUED)

GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
GOULD , KOBRICK & SCHLAPP, P.C., CPA
HERBERT J. HIRSCHHORN, CPA, P.C.
HERBERT J. HIRSCHHORN, CPA, P.C.
IRVINGS ROTH & RUBIN, PLLC
IRVINGS ROTH & RUBIN, PLLC
JERRY B. KLEIN, CPA
JERRY B. KLEIN, CPA
JERRY B. KLEIN, CPA
KLEIMAN & WEINSHANK, LLP, CPA
KLEIMAN & WEINSHANK, LLP, CPA
KLEIMAN & WEINSHANK, LLP, CPA
LOOZIS & WEGENER, CPA
LOOZIS & WEGENER, CPA
LOOZIS & WEGENER, CPA
NOVAK FRANCELLA, LLC, CPAS
NOVAK FRANCELLA, LLC, CPAS
NOVAK FRANCELLA, LLC, CPAS
OWEN PETERSON & CO., LLP, CPA
OWEN PETERSON & CO., LLP, CPA
OWEN PETERSON & CO., LLP, CPA
PETER DECARLO, CPA, PLLC

LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS (WF)
LOCAL 3 NYC COMMUNICATIONS ELECTRICIANS (AF)
LOCAL 300 S.E.I.U CIVIL SERVICE FORUM (RWF)
LOCAL 300 S.E.I.U. CIVIL SERVICE FORUM (WF)
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES (WF/LEGAL/EF/ADMIN)
LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES (AF)
LOCAL 721 LICENSED PRACTICAL NURSES (WF)
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS (RWF)
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS (WF)
LOCAL 806 STRUCTURAL STEEL PAINTERS (AF)
LOCAL 300 S.E.I.U. CIVIL SERVICE FORUM (AF)
NYS SUPREME COURT UNIFORM OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
ORGANIZATION OF STAFF ANALYSTS (WF)
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES RWF
LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES WF
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS (RWF)
LOCAL 832 TEAMSTERS (WF)
DISTRICT COUNCIL 37 (WF)
DISTRICT COUNCIL 37 AFSCME (AF)
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION (AF)
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION (RWF)
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION (WF)
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) (RWF)
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) (WF/CLRF)
SUPERIOR OFFICERS COUNCIL (POLICE) (AF)
NEW YORK CITY DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOCIATION (AF)
NEW YORK CITY DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
NEW YORK CITY DEPUTY SHERIFFS ASSOCIATION (WF)
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION (RWF)
LOCAL 333 UNITED MARINE DIVISION (WF)
NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS (AF)
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (AF)
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (WF)
LOCAL 94 UNIFORM FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION (AF)

TYPE OF SERVICE

FUNDS USING COMMON PROFESSIONAL SERVICE PROVIDERS

APPENDIX D

(Page 3 of 6)

2005
FUND NAME

AUDITING (CONTINUED)

PETER DECARLO, CPA, PLLC	LOCAL 94 UNIFORM FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
PETER DECARLO, CPA, PLLC	LOCAL 94 UNIFORM FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION (WF)
ROCCO J. RICCIARDI, CPA	ASSISTANT DEPUTY WARDENS / DEPUTY WARDENS ASSOCIATION (AF)
ROCCO J. RICCIARDI, CPA	ASSISTANT DEPUTY WARDENS / DEPUTY WARDENS ASSOCIATION (WF/RWF/CLRF)
ROCCO J. RICCIARDI, CPA	LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS (AF)
ROCCO J. RICCIARDI, CPA	LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS (WF)
ROCCO J. RICCIARDI, CPA	LOCAL444 SANITATION OFFICERS (RWF/LODDF)
ROCCO J. RICCIARDI, CPA	LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICER'S LINE OF DUTY DISABILITY
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, CPA	LOCAL 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS (AF)
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, CPA	LOCAL 30A-D INTERNATIONAL UNION OF OPERATING ENGINEERS (AF)
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, LLP CPA	LOCAL 211 ALLIED BUILDING INSPECTORS (WF)
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, LLP CPA	LOCAL 30 IUOE MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES (RWF)
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, LLP CPA	LOCAL 30, 30-A, 30-B AND 30-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS (WF)
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, LLP CPA	LOCAL 14-14B IUOE (WF/RWF)
SCHULTHEIS & PANETTIERI, LLP CPA	LOCAL 15A-C OPERATING ENGINEERS (WF/RWF)
SOLOWAY, GOLDSTEIN, SILVERSTEIN & CO., P.C.	LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS (AF)
SOLOWAY, GOLDSTEIN, SILVERSTEIN & CO., P.C.	LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS (WF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	LOCAL 3 IBEW CITY EMPLOYEES (WF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	LOCAL 306 MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES (WF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	LOCAL 858 I.B.T. (O.T.B) BRANCH OFFICE MANAGERS (WF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	NEW YORK CITY RETIREES (WF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	NYC MUNICIPAL PLUMBERS AND PIPEFITTERS (WF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	NYC MUNICIPAL STEAMFITTERS AND STEAMFITTER HELPERS (RWF)
STEINBERG, STECKLER & PICCIURRO, CPAS	NYC MUNICIPAL STEAMFITTERS AND STEAMFITTER HELPERS (WF)
STEVEN H. HABER, CPA	UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
STEVEN H. HABER, CPA	UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (WF)
TARLOW & CO., CPA'S	LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS AND ADMINISTRATORS (RWF)
TARLOW & CO., CPA'S	LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS AND ADMINISTRATORS (WF)
WENDEL-WALOWITZ ASSOCIATES, INC.	LOCAL 246 SEIU (RWF)
WENDEL-WALOWITZ ASSOCIATES, INC.	LOCAL 246 SEIU (WF)
WENDEL-WALOWITZ ASSOCIATES, INC.	LOCAL 246, SEIU NYC (AF)

TYPE OF SERVICE

FUNDS USING COMMON PROFESSIONAL SERVICE PROVIDERS

APPENDIX D

(Page 4 of 6)

2005
FUND NAME

LEGAL COUNSEL

TAUBMAN KIMELMAN & SOROKA	LOCAL 211 ALLIED BUILDING INSPECTORS (WF)
TAUBMAN KIMELMAN & SOROKA	LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS (AF)
TAUBMAN KIMELMAN & SOROKA	LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS (RWF)
TAUBMAN KIMELMAN & SOROKA	LOCAL 444 SANITATION OFFICERS (WF)
BRADY, MCGUIRE, & STEINBERG, PC	LOCAL 15, 15A, 15C (IUOE) OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS (AF)
BRADY, MCGUIRE, & STEINBERG, PC	LOCAL 15A-C OPERATING ENGINEERS (WF/RWF)
BRUCE K. BYRANT	LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMINISTRATORS (WF)
BRUCE K. BYRANT	LOCAL 1 COUNCIL OF SUPERVISORS & ADMINISTRATORS (RWF)
COLLERAN O'HARA MILLS	LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS (AF)
COLLERAN O'HARA MILLS	LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS (WF)
GREENBERG BURZICHELLI GREENBERG P.C.	LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS (RWF)
GREENBERG BURZICHELLI GREENBERG P.C.	LOCAL 3 IBEW ELECTRICIANS (WF)
GREENBERG BURZICHELLI GREENBERG P.C.	LOCAL 30 IUOE MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES (RWF)
GREENBERG BURZICHELLI GREENBERG P.C.	LOCAL 30, 30-A, 30-B AND 30-C OPERATING MUNICIPAL ENGINEERS (WF)
GREENBERG BURZICHELLI GREENBERG P.C.	LOCAL 30A-D INTERNATIONAL UNION OF OPERATING ENGINEERS (AF)
HOLM & O'HARA, LLP	CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION (AF)
HOLM & O'HARA, LLP	CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
HOLM & O'HARA, LLP	CORRECTION CAPTAINS ASSOCIATION (WF/CLRF)
HOLM & O'HARA, LLP	LOCAL 3 NYC COMMUNICATIONS ELECTRICIANS (AF)
JOEL GLANSTEIN, ESQ.	UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (WF)
JOEL GLANSTEIN, ESQ.	UNITED PROBATION OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
MEYER, SUOZZI, ENGLISH & KLEIN PC	LOCAL 246, SEIU (RWF)
MEYER, SUOZZI, ENGLISH & KLEIN PC	LOCAL 246, SEIU (WF)
MEYER, SUOZZI, ENGLISH & KLEIN PC	LOCAL 858 IBT, (OTB) BRANCH OFFICE MANAGERS WF
MEYER, SUOZZI, ENGLISH & KLEIN PC	LOCAL 246, SEIU NYC (AF)
MICHAEL T. MURRAY P.C	PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (AF)
MICHAEL T. MURRAY P.C	PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (RWF)
MICHAEL T. MURRAY P.C	PATROLMEN'S BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (WF/CLRF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	ASSISTANT DEPUTY WARDENS / DEPUTY WARDENS ASSOCIATION (AF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	ASSISTANT DEPUTY WARDENS / DEPUTY WARDENS ASSOCIATION (WF/RWF/CLRF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION (AF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION (RWF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	DETECTIVES ENDOWMENT ASSOCIATION (WF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	UFT ALBERT SHANKER COLLEGE SCHOLARSHIP FUND
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHER (WF)

TYPE OF SERVICE

FUNDS USING COMMON PROFESSIONAL SERVICE PROVIDERS

APPENDIX D

(Page 5 of 6)

2005

FUND NAME

LEGAL COUNSEL (CONTINUED)

MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 246, SEIU (RWF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 246, SEIU (WF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM (RWF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 300 CIVIL SERVICE FORUM (WF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES (WF/LEGAL/EF/ADMIN)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 891 SCHOOL CUSTODIAN AND CUSTODIAN ENGINEER (WF/RWF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 371 SOCIAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES (AF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 300 SEIU CIVIL SERVICE FORUM (AF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 891 IUOE (AF)
MIRKIN & GORDON, P.C.	LOCAL 246, SEIU NYC (AF)
MITCHEL B. CRANER, ATTORNEY	NYC MUNICIPAL STEAMFITTERS AND STEAMFITTER HELPERS (WF)
MITCHEL B. CRANER, ATTORNEY	NYC MUNICIPAL STEAMFITTERS AND STEAMFITTER HELPERS (RWF)
MITCHEL B. CRANER, ATTORNEY	NEW YORK CITY RETIREES (WF)
MITCHEL B. CRANER, ATTORNEY	LOCAL 3 IBEW CITY EMPLOYEES (WF)
MITCHEL B. CRANER, ESQ	DC-37 (WF)
O'DWYER & BERNSTEIN, LLP	NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS (WF)
O'DWYER & BERNSTEIN, LLP	SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) (AF)
O'DWYER & BERNSTEIN, LLP	SERGEANTS BENEVOLENT ASSOCIATION (POLICE) (WF/RWF/CLRF)
O'DWYER & BERNSTEIN, LLP	NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS (AF)
PRYOR, CASHMAN, SHERMAN, & FLYNN	DOCTORS COUNCIL (RWF)
PRYOR, CASHMAN, SHERMAN, & FLYNN	DOCTORS COUNCIL (WF)
PRYOR, CASHMAN, SHERMAN, & FLYNN	LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (WF)
PRYOR, CASHMAN, SHERMAN, & FLYNN	DOCTORS COUNCIL (AF)
RONALD SHECTMAN, ET AL	LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (AF)
RONALD SHECTMAN, ET AL	LOCAL 854 UNIFORMED FIRE OFFICERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
SCHULTE, ROTH & ZABEL LLP	NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS (WF)
SCHULTE, ROTH & ZABEL LLP	NYC DISTRICT COUNCIL OF CARPENTERS (AF)
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK	PROFESSIONAL STAFF CONGRESS CUNY (WF/RWF)
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK	LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT (WF/LEGAL/EF)
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK	LOCAL 1180 CWA MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT (RWF)
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK & MOSS LLP	LOCAL 1182 CWA PARKING ENFORCEMENT AGENTS (WF/LEGAL)
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK & MOSS, LLP	LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES RWF
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK & MOSS, LLP	LOCAL 1181 CWA SUPERVISORY EMPLOYEES WF
SPIVAK, LIPTON, WATANABE & SPIVAK & MOSS, ORFAN LLP	LOCAL 1180 CWA MEMBERS (AF)
STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP	LOCAL 2 UNITED FEDERATION OF TEACHER (WF)

TYPE OF SERVICE

FUNDS USING COMMON PROFESSIONAL SERVICE PROVIDERS

**2005
FUND NAME**

LEGAL COUNSEL (CONTINUED)

STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP
STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP
STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP
STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP
STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP
STROOCK & STROOCK & LAVAN, LLP
SULLIVAN, PAPAIN, BLOCK ET. AL.
SULLIVAN, PAPAIN, BLOCK ET. AL.
WILLIAM I SHUMAN
WILLIAM I SHUMAN

LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS (AF)
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS (RWF)
LOCAL 237 TEAMSTERS (WF)
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION (AF)
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION (RWF)
LOCAL 831 UNIFORMED SANITATIONMEN'S ASSOCIATION (WF)
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION (RWF)
LOCAL 94 UNIFORMED FIREFIGHTERS ASSOCIATION (WF)
LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS (AF)
LOCAL 40 IRON WORKERS (WF)