

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

THE CITY OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF SANITATION

-----x

Environmental Justice Informational Meeting
RE: Proposed North Shore Converted
Marine Transfer Station

-----x

Union Plaza Nursing Home
33-23 Union Street
Flushing, New York

April 17, 2007
6:32 p.m.

B e f o r e :

HARRY SZARPANSKI,
Assistant Commissioner,
Bureau of Long Term Exports,
The City of New York
Department of Sanitation

1

2

2 A P P E A R A N C E S:

3 For The City of New York Department of

4 Sanitation:

5 Sarah Dolinar

6 Vaughan Arnold

7 Walter Czwartacky

8

9 ALSO PRESENT:

10 Henningson, Durham & Richardson Team

11 Greeley & Hansen Team

12 Ecology & Environment Team

13 The Media

14 The Public

15

16

17

18

19 Marc Russo

20 Reporter

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X O F S P E A K E R S

Speaker:	Page:
HARRY SZARPANSKI.....	4
Assistant Commissioner - Long Term Export - Department of Sanitation	
ROBERT A. LOPINTO.....	15
Member Queens Community Board #7, Chair Environmental Sanitation Committee	
WALTER CZWARTACKY.....	22,23,28,29
Department of Sanitation	
ELO COMFORT.....	26
Henningson, Durham & Richardson	
GENE KELTY.....	30,33,40,43
Chair - Community Board #7	
JIM SINGLETARY.....	35
28th Avenue Homeowners Association	
CARMEN COGNETTA.....	38
Counsel for New York City Council Sanitation Committee	
JOSEPH FEMENIA.....	41
Chair - Community Board #7 Transportation Committee	

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

MR. SZARPANSKI: Good evening.

My name is Harry Szarpanski. I'm Assistant Commissioner for Long Term Export with the Department of Sanitation.

With me tonight are Walter Czwartacky, at the far end, Vaughan Arnold and Sarah Dolinar from the Department also.

We have with us representatives of two of our consulting teams. We have Dan Harkins and the rest of the HDR team. HDR is responsible for conducting the environmental review for the project.

We also have -- we also have Harvey Brodsky leading G&H, Greeley and Hansen. They're responsible for the design of this marine transfer station and the other three MTSs.

I see we don't have big crowd so we can be a little more informal.

First let me talk about the format of this meeting.

First, if you didn't sign in, please do so on your way in. We use the sign-in sheet as

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

our mailing list so if we need to notify you of subsequent meetings, we can do that. I will make a short Powerpoint presentation. We also have copies of that Powerpoint presentation in the back and please take a copy. The handouts are available in both Korean and Mandarin Chinese.

After the Powerpoint I'll open it up to statements, comments, questions, et cetera. I see so far there's only one person signed up to speak. If other people want to speak, please fill out one of those speaker sheets at the table as you entered.

We typically ask people to limit their comments to three minutes, but I don't think that will be necessary tonight.

If there are some specific questions you asked that we can't answer ourselves, we'll turn to our consultants and I'm sure they'll help us out. And if we can't answer them tonight, we'll get back to you at some future date.

We typically allow elected officials to speak first, if they want. It's not the case tonight. But we do have representatives from Councilman Liu's office and Councilman Avella's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

office with us tonight.

And we are making a transcript of this meeting. So as you're speaking if something is not clear, we'll ask you to repeat it for the stenographer.

Let me now start with the short Powerpoint presentation.

(Showing Powerpoint.)

MR. SZARPANSKI: The objectives for tonight are basically to provide you a briefing on what this project is all about, the North Shore, proposed North Shore converted Marine Transfer Station. We'll explain what the New York State Department of Environmental Conservation's process is in terms of their role in the permitting.

We'll talk about how you can get comments to us and we will answer questions that you might have.

This meeting is called an environmental justice informational meeting. The DEC requires us to hold these meetings to make sure that we do our outreach to environmental justice communities, as they define it. Not all

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

of the four MTSSs are in EJ communities, but we decided early on in this process to treat all communities in the same way. So we're holding four of these environmental justice meetings.

The policy that DEC has calls for us to prepare a Public Participation Plan. DEC has already received that from us. They've approved it and this is part of the plan having this meeting.

Then also an implementing and outreach program to make sure that all the stakeholders are aware of these and are able to participate.

The PPP, the Public Participation Plan, also describes all of the information about the project. And I'm not going to go through all of these in detail. You can look at what's involved in this in your handout.

And basically it asks us to allow communities to have an interactive session with us so that they can ask questions. We answer them and inform the community.

In terms of some of the major milestones in the development of the solid waste

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

management Plan, this facility being one of those elements of the plan, we issued a Draft SWMP, Solid Waste Management Plan back in October '04. And then we did a Draft Environmental Impact Statement. And then in April of 2005 we issued the Final Environmental Impact Statement.

Community Board #7 voted yes as part of the ULURP process. The Borough President endorsed the project. And the City Planning Commission approved this as the last step in the ULURP process.

The City Council adopted the SWMP in '06, in July of '06 and then it went to the State DEC and the DEC approved the SWMP in October of '06.

This is somewhat of a small, busy drawing. You have a copy of that in your handout.

It shows how waste, in the various wastesheds, is allocated to various facilities that are part of the SWMP. The area for this wasteshed is shown in light brown. And it's Queens 1, 2, 3 -- I'm sorry. Queens -- it's hard for me to read. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6. No, I'm sorry. 7, 11, 8, 9, 10, 12 and 13 and 14.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

 This is just a site plan. It shows how the facility is going to be laid out. It's superimposed over the existing marine transfer station on the bottom.

 And this is a typical cross section of what one of these marine transfer stations will look like.

 Trucks will arrive onto the tipping floor through the door here (indicating.) The truck will backup and dump its waste onto the next level, which is the loading floor. Waste will then be pushed by a front-end loader into an opening in the floor. There are four such openings and under each opening is a container. The waste will then be tamped into the container. This all occurs still within the enclosed building.

 The container gets moved over and the lid gets put on. And once the lid is on and secure, the container is moved outside of the building where a gantry crane will pick it up and place it onto the barge.

 The floor plan for that facility shows that there's a scale as the truck comes in.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

The trucks then tip from the tipping floor to the next level, the loading floor. And you can see the equipment here. And the containers eventually wind up outside the building once they're sealed and go onto the barge.

The capacity and how much we're seeking to permit at the facility is shown in this slide.

It's important to note that this facility and all the other marine transfer stations will handle the same historic wastesheds that were handled by the marine transfer stations when they used to operate and waste was delivered to the Fresh Kills landfill.

The expected average daily throughput is shown as 2,200 tons a day of Department of Sanitation managed waste. And there's capacity to handle up to another 1,000 tons of commercial waste.

The permit that we're seeking will have limits on it, limits on not-to-exceed amounts on a daily basis and on a weekly basis. There's a 20 percent allowance in those calculations for reasonable variability and growth in the wasteshed

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

and redundancy.

There's what's called a Maximum Peak Day. Since waste is collected and varies on a weekly basis from day to day, there are heavy days and lighter days. Usually the first collection day of the week is the heavier day. We want to make sure that we can handle the Maximum Peak Day which occurs on a day that's normally a heavy day but also on a post-holiday collection where you're collecting waste in only five days that you normally would have collected in six days.

Some of the key elements or features of the marine transfer station.

All waste is processed in an enclosed building and negative air is going to be maintained so that odors don't escape. We will treat the air using a neutralizing agent, not a masking agent.

The waste leaves in sealed containers. And when we concluded the environmental review, results that we found were that there would be no significant adverse impacts from the facility construction or operation.

We looked at how much capacity would

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

be available for commercial waste. And the commercial waste would only be allowed to come in from eight p.m. to eight a.m. And the amount that we calculated was based on limiting the number of trucks going in based on making sure that we would not exceed any noise thresholds.

We've submitted our permit applications to the State DEC. We are waiting for them to deem the applications complete. And there are three permits.

The first one is called a Part 360 Permit. That pertains to the solid waste aspect of the facility.

The second one, the 608/661 is marine related having to do with the construction of water and what quality.

And the third one is a Minor Source Permit. It's an Air State Facility permit.

If you're interested in looking at the complete permit applications, they're available both at Community Board #7's office and at the library listed here. They're also on our web page.

Yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. GENE KELTY: I'm the Chairman
of the Community Board. You got our address
wrong. It's 133-32.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Oh, thank you.
No wonder no one has showed up to look at it. I
apologize.

MR. GENE KELTY: That's all right.
They've got the telephone number. It's just 32.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Okay. Thank you.
The next three slides go into a
little more detail of what each of these permits
are. I think you can look at that and, you know,
it's just a more detailed description on what each
permit covers.

This shows the State DEC process in
either approving or rejecting this permit. We're
in the first box. We are waiting for the DEC to
give us notice that our permit application has
been deemed complete.

Once that happens, the DEC will
issue a notice. It will be to inform people that
the permit application is complete. It will also
start the public comment period and it will give
the notice as to where and when the public hearing

1

2 will occur.

3

4 People can start writing to the DEC
5 once this notice is out there. The DEC will then
6 hold the public hearing. At the end of the
7 public hearing there will be a notice -- I'm
8 sorry. It will be at the end of the written
9 period for people to submit their comments and
10 questions and the hearing record will be closed.
11 The DEC will then either issue or deny the permit.

11

12 The DEC allowed us to put the name
13 of the person at the DEC who people can reach if
14 they have any specific questions about the DEC's
15 process. So that's in your Powerpoint. It's
16 Michelle Moore and the phone number is listed.

16

17 As I mentioned, there's the
18 stenographer here. There's going to be a
19 transcript of this meeting and it's going to be
20 forwarded to the DEC for their record.

20

21 We ask that you provide us any
22 comments that you want to provide to us in writing
23 by April 30th and we will put together a complete
24 listing of your comments and questions and our
25 answers to those questions.

25

You can write to me. My address is

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC., (212) 840-1167

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

there. You can also fax your comments or questions to me at the number listed there.

At this point I'm going to turn it over to you people for any questions, comments and we will start.

Our first speaker is Robert LoPinto.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Good evening.

My name is Bob LoPinto and I'm here wearing two hats.

First, I'm the Chair of the Queens Solid Waste Advisory Board; a member of the Citywide Recycling advisory Board. I'm also a member of the Queens Community Board #7 where I Chair the Environmental Sanitation Committee.

I do not have written comments. My comments will cover both of the hats that I wear, first talking about from the point of view of Citywide and Queens-wide.

The Queens Solid Waste Advisory Board applauds the City in their decision to move forward with reducing the amount of truck traffic in New York City by, again, barging their solid waste from New York City.

We are concerned with two things,

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

one, the identification of the final disposal site. That means, in other words, the methods that the barges will transport, where to, where they will be emptied, how the containers will be moved to the landfill, which landfills and how all that will be controlled by the City, and what the costs will be.

The other question we have, or concern we have --

Yes.

MR. SZARPANSKI: I'm sorry.

Do you want us to answer the questions as you ask them?

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: If you can.

Go ahead.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Yes.

On the first issue. First, keep in mind that we are in negotiations with companies that responded to our RFP, the Request for Proposals, for exporting waste from the marine transfer stations. While we're in negotiations we are not allowed to disclose any details of those proposals.

Some of the details you're looking

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

for are, you know, where are these containers going to go, where are the ultimate disposal locations.

I can tell you a few things which have been already disclosed in the press and some vendors may have disclosed.

One of the locations that's been proposed where the containers will be off-loaded and then put onto either a barge or rail is the New York Container Terminal on Staten Island. It's one of the locations. It's not the only. And there are options there going by rail or by waterborne vessel to its ultimate disposal location.

I think that's all that we've disclosed publicly at this point. So as much as I'd like to tell you more detail, we're precluded from doing so by the City's procurement process.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Okay.

The second item is concerning the commercial -- the use of the marine transfer stations for disposal of commercial waste.

We're concerned on a number of issues. One, how is the City going to effect this

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

from happening. We understand, according to the plan, that only a certain number of truck tickets will be issued to the vendors, so you would limit the number of trucks? The question is would they also be limited by the time of the night that they're coming so that you have a proper number per hour.

And the other flip side of that coin is if this City finds that vendors are not forthcoming to use the facility, is the City going to institute some procedure to force commercial carters to use the facility, and if so -- to make sure that all thousand tons are utilized therefore reducing the overhead cost. And if so, also, how is the pricing going to be affected.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Okay. As you know, one of the big concerns for the administration and the Council in implementing this plan is to make it a more equitable waste disposal system throughout the City of New York.

Right now we have a situation where commercial waste is primarily disposed of in three cluster areas: In the South Bronx, in Williamsburg, Greenpoint/Williamsburg and in

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Jamaica.

So the Council asked us to look at the ways of making sure that commercial waste can wind up at the marine transfer stations. And the analysis we did, as part of the commercial waste study, allocated capacity at the these marine transfer stations to commercial -- to use for commercial waste.

At this point we have -- well, starting from the point we're at now, we are looking -- we think that commercial waste, some commercial waste will be attracted to these facilities based on the proximity where their commercial waste is generated.

We don't know exactly how much will be attracted. Obviously it's what the cost to the carter is to come to our facilities versus what the cost to him is to go to other facilities. But there's an economic advantage of being near where the generation is.

We have thought about mechanisms of inducing commercial waste carters to come to this facility. We haven't come to any conclusions yet. I would assume if we can't attract a sufficient

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

amount - and I don't know what that sufficient amount would be - that we may consider some inducement to maybe lower the price. And in our negotiations with vendors we're looking at an incremental price structure so that, you know, if our waste has a certain cost to it, then the vendor should be able to handle some increment above our rate at a lower cost than the average cost charged to us so that we can possibly charge commercial waste haulers an amount that's lower than our average cost and induce them in that way.

All of these things are things we're looking at. We haven't reached any conclusions. I think we're going to have to wait to see when the system is up and running how much commercial waste winds up at these facilities on its own without any inducements and then we'll look at other methods of bringing commercial waste into the facility.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Okay.

Questions now from the community board point of view. Some of it similar.

Truck traffic.

First of all, when the old marine

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

transfer station was here, you did have a considerable amount of Sanitation traffic that you expect to have a similar amount under this proposed Solid Waste Management plan. You're now adding commercial waste which you had at the old MTS until 1988 when you raised the rates so high you drove everyone away.

In the meantime the neighborhood has changed even from three years ago when you did your EIS. The College Point area has become heavily trafficked with the Corporate Park and the retail shopping area.

You have down that one street besides your own -- your own garage and trucks from Board #11's area. You have the Home Depot. You have Con Edison. You have a number of commercial enterprises that all use that street.

They all end up coming back to College Point Boulevard and there's a limited mechanism for them to get back to the arterial highways.

What I'd like to know is one, how are you going to control your traffic, all of Sanitation's and the commercial traffic to try and

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

even it out as best as you can, or for those times when the rest of the traffic in the area is heavy, even lower yours.

And also, are you planning on any controls of your own besides the traffic light at the end of 31st and College Point Boulevard?

MR. SZARPANSKI: Okay. With respect to the commercial waste I think it's important to keep in mind that commercial waste will only be allowed to come to this facility between hours of eight p.m. and 8 a.m. That matches well with their collection practices.

It also comes at a time where our traffic, the Department's traffic is not high and assuming the neighborhood traffic to stores is not going to be high also.

Are there any other comments you want to add on the commercial waste?

MR. WALTER CZWARTACKY: Mostly I would anticipate that most commercial waste would arrive at the facility after midnight, which would really put them out of the window of our operations and the peak traffic periods in the neighborhood.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

As it pertains to our trucks, we, in our traffic analysis so far, have not -- do not foresee any problems that we can't mitigate signal changes and certain turn light operations, which is, in part, a consequence of the distance of travel that some of the trucks comes from, so that even though there is a peak hour where we would get like 30 trucks, the spread of the entire -- the remainder is -- over the eight-hour period is considerable and therefore doesn't jam up the intersections during the peak hour or otherwise.

If there are problems, we will respond, as we've responded in other locations, with controls in terms of dispatching trucks to the dump site and the like. And we've done those kinds of operations in the Bronx to prevent traffic problems and we would do them here in the future should it prove necessary.

MR. SZARPANSKI: And Bob, we can show you copies, we can give you copies of the profile of the anticipated arrival rates to show you that --

MR. WALTER CZWARTACKY: Let's just remember, the profiles -- the profiles that we ran

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

in the EIS are actually very conservative. They're based on '98 tonnages, which are higher than today's. We anticipated less in the truck than we're currently getting and then they included a contingency amount for safety.

So the numbers projected in the EIS and analyzed in the EIS actually -- are actually higher than the numbers we anticipate will go there. So don't -- as some communities have, don't run around saying they told us this and now they're saying that.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: I understand that.

I guess specifically then, are you going to be -- you're limiting your commercial traffic to 91 trucks, that's what it said. Are you going to limit it to so many an hour? Are you giving a ticket that says you can come between 3 and 4 or are you going to give 91 tickets out and they all decide, 91 of them decide to come at two in the morning and you have so much noise everyone in the neighborhood is now up in arms?

MR. SZARPANSKI: I think since that mechanism is within our control, we're going

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to see how things work out. Commercial waste naturally doesn't all come at the same hour because of the collection practices.

I think if we find that it becomes problematic, it will basically mean that we have to do something about how we sell the tickets, whether we sell a certain number of tickets per hour and we can control that.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: All right. I mean the main concern was that when you did your noise analysis, you assumed a certain number of per hour for your maximum. That's part of the way you had to limit the thousand tons.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Right.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: I guess what I'm getting at is if it actuality starts to go beyond that, then you've got to do something to cut it back so that none of the hours are over the noise threshold.

MR. SZARPANSKI: That's correct.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Okay.

The other problem is is that the entire area has seen a lot more traffic than what you had even three years ago. There's been

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

studies done. The Board is still asking for a revised traffic study for that whole area.

I behoove you to coordinate with the other City agencies, EDC, traffic, et cetera, to look at the traffic problems there. You know that the Van Wyck Expressway, the Whitestone Expressway are being redone. We're now going to have two exits, one direction. We have the turnaround lane.

Actually it would assume your vehicles are going to go through that Linden Place turnaround lane. I've never even checked on that. That's the one that keeps them off of Linden Place. As they come north on the service road, they can do a U-turn to go south and they'll go back to 31st to get to your --

MR. SZARPANSKI: Elo Comfort with HDR.

MR. ELO COMFORT: When we were originally doing the traffic study, one of the things that the Department of Transportation asked us to do was to try and route trucks away from the Linden Place exit because of the congestion problems that already exist there.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

So a number of trucks will actually be exiting south on College Point coming up north along College Point in order for them to access the facility thereby not exacerbating any traffic problem you have at Linden Place.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Since then in last three years, Flushing has been growing in that direction. There's development at College Point and Roosevelt Avenue, and there's anticipated increased residential development down towards College Point Boulevard. So there will also be increased traffic on College Point.

I don't know, someone's -- you're going to have to look at this later on and balance out your routing because you may find that the College Point exit may be worse than the Linden Place. I'm just saying it's -- you know, there's nothing you can answer now but it's something you should be aware of that as the development in downtown Flushing changes, you may have to readdress your routing.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Okay. Well, that's a good point. And we will re-examine it when the facility starts operating, yes.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: And I'm assuming that Sanitation has some control over your vehicles during the day as to how they're coming. I mean do you actually have some sort of communications --

MR. SZARPANSKI: We do. Absolutely, yes.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: -- with the vehicles? So, you know, if there's more of them coming, you can slow some down in the middle of the day if it looks like there --

MR. SZARPANSKI: Certainly if it becomes a problem, we can communicate with our vehicles, yes.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: What percentage of your vehicles will be coming after daytime shift?

MR. SZARPANSKI: A very small percentage. Let me see if we have some actual numbers for you.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: And I'm assuming that's mainly from 6 p.m. till midnight.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Yes. It's --

MR. WALTER CZWARTACKY: It's less

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

than ten trucks an hour starting from 4 p.m. to
midnight.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Okay.

MR. WALTER CZWARTACKY: Usually
less than ten trucks an hour. And that's in both
directions.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Obviously the
local community is concerned with truck traffic.
On the one hand you're going to reduce the amount
of traffic that continues up the Whitestone
Expressway and it's now going to Jersey and
wherever. It's now going to get off and come to
us.

The local traffic problem has gotten
worse over the years and we need to make sure that
when it's starting up, these are looked at and you
have plans in place to modify whatever is going on
to meet the needs of the community.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Okay.

MR. ROBERT LOPINTO: Thank you.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Thank you for
your comments.

I just want to acknowledge that we
did have a representative here from State

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Assemblymember Ellen Young's office, Scott Sieber,
but Scott had to leave. But just for record, the
Assemblywoman's representative was here.

We have another speaker that signed
up so we'll take that speaker. And it's the Chair
of Community Board #7, Gene Kelty.

MR. GENE KELTY: Thank you. Good
evening.

I'm Gene Kelty, the Chair from Board
#7.

I let Bob handle the technicalities,
okay, but I also have Joe, who's my transportation
guy and that's what we're talking about.

You better be realistic to what's
going on in that area. What you say is not going
to happen.

The -- if you looked at page eight,
on your diagram, if you put that back up there,
which is your site plan. They're using 28th
Avenue as they're coming in and out now and
they're going through a residential area 'cause
they're cutting through to get in and get out of
the area, maybe not the commercial people as well.

But when they back up on 31st

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Avenue, 28th Avenue's up here (indicating.)
They're coming here to go down here to come around
at the Sanitation's normal operating garage and
they will be doing that, but they're coming here
and going out and they go out here.

They loop around 30th because 30th
dovetails and becomes College Point Boulevard and
they're forced to go southbound. But if they want
to go into College Point, this intersection goes
clear across. It goes all the way out to Linden
Place and gets onto the Parkway and steps out that
way.

Twenty-eighth Avenue is a
residential area and that's been a bone of
contention for us for years and years and years.
I have Board #11 units coming all the way down
32nd Avenue. The borough has done nothing to stop
them from going on there. I've got numerous
complaints all the time.

Our garage takes care of their
people, but I have the marine transfer station. I
have Easy Pack. I have Borough Equipment. I have
the salt dome over there so I get everybody
landing in my district over there and they really

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

don't care about the community other than our own people.

So go back and do the traffic schedule again and tell them they're not coming in that way. I don't care if you have to put trailblazing signs up on College Point Boulevard that says "marine transfer station only entrance" or something like that. But don't think they're not going to go in that way. They will use 28th Avenue.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Gene, are they using routes that are not designated truck routes?

MR. GENE KELTY: Yes, they are, because it's easy for them. Nobody watches them. You have to understand that's an industrial area and back there we have coal fire. We had another Sanitation unit that was back there, a private carter and they used to use that area. So it's conducive for the local people to go in. So what's the difference if a Sanitation truck goes through there.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Do you know if this has been brought up to our Commissioner's attention?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. GENE KELTY: Well, the Commissioner might talk about a lot of things about Board #11 landing in our district. We haven't talked about that. I'm just bringing to your attention, with your traffic study, make sure that trailblazing goes on. I'm only taking responsibility for Board #7's district. Board #11 has been using 32nd Avenue continually and it shouldn't be my guys, meaning Board #7, going after Board #11. Let their supervisors go after them and trace them down and make them follow the routes.

But I'm telling you I've got Easy Pack. I've got Lot Cleaning, I got Borough Equipment and I got a salt dome. And when the crap hits the fan, they don't care how they do, they're going to get them in there. And I've got a lot of trucks on the street which means they'll use the parking in the lot back to maneuver around. And I also used to have too the household dump over there which we were fighting to get back but that's a different story.

I'm just telling you make sure you watch the traffic plant very closely because

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

you'll hear from some people here from 28th Avenue and they said it does happen. Not as it did in the past, but it's going to happen now.

Plus I want one of his people to be sitting on with us because we have the new police unit that's going to go right across the street from your 131st Avenue. So if you don't think traffic is going to be that light, it's going to be increasing more and more on College Point Boulevard and 31st Avenue. The police now is coming to us to put their school over there.

So that's in the development so your plan, when you did it originally, didn't include that. It's now going to have to include that so you're going to have to go back and look at that.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Okay. Well, typically on an environmental review perspective a facility that comes after our EIS is done needs to account for our traffic as part of their analysis. But from a practical perspective I hear what you're saying. We will bring this up to the Commissioner's level. I'm sure you'll get some immediate relief, but if it doesn't last for too long, please come and tell us again because these

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

things tend to, you know, get cleared up immediately but may not last so.

MR. GENE KELTY: It's only because it's an industrial area they don't pay attention to it, that's why. And I do understand we're busy over there. But 31st Avenue was made wide enough for them to queue up. And I don't care if they have to go up to the side streets there by Home Depot and then sit up there, but they've got to make sure they keep the road open and stay on 31st Avenue. That's the main road in and out of that area, okay.

Thank you.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Thank you.

We have another speaker that signed up.

Jim Singletary.

MR. SINGLETARY: Twenty-eight Avenue Homeowners Association.

I won't rehash everything that Gene just said, but I'm a resident of over 40 years.

I don't want to rehash everything Gene just said, but I'm a resident over 40 years in this particular area. And I can tell you when

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

you had the marine terminal there, it was operating until they put the Department of Sanitation buildings there. And when they get bottled up, they start coming the 28th Avenue way. I don't know if you visualize what I'm getting at.

Your existing Department of Sanitation trucks that I'm talking about, when they can't get out on 30th Avenue, they'll start coming out 122nd Street right across 28th Avenue. And when they come in from Linden Place across 28th, if they see it's crowded on College Point Boulevard, they'll come right down 28th Avenue and go all the way to 120th Street and make a U-turn to go around to get into their depot.

And this -- if you can promise me you're going to monitor this, because it was so bad now that they're fighting with the industrial area, the existing businesses that the last three years has vastly increased. And I'm talking about dump truck 18-wheeler trucks. They're actually fighting on 122nd Street with the Sanitation Department.

And I've seen the inspector come up of the Department Sanitation and say we have the

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

right of way. And I heard them arguing. And I come over and I say, neither one of you's have the right of way. This is a residential street, 28th Avenue, on our side. Maybe you do on the other side going into Linden Place. And all they said is well, I'm sorry, sir, you know, we're all messed up down on 31st Avenue for whatever reason.

MR. SZARPANSKI: We'll clear that --

MR. JIM SINGLETARY: That's not the right way to do business, you know.

MR. SZARPANSKI: You're right. We have to look into this and --

MR. JIM SINGLETARY: I just want to know if there's some kind of mechanism you can set us up with, a phone number or something. Even if we can call the DS itself and say, you know, you got these trucks up there, what are they doing all the way up on 28th Avenue.

And if they get stalled and parked one on top of each other, their engines are running, it's not a practical -- I know it's not your particular problem, sir.

MR. SZARPANSKI: No, no, but it's

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

our Department and we're responsible.

MR. JIM SINGLETARY: We're not going to hold up progress, but if you really get the true picture of what's going on over there, it's kind of unbelievable.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Let me bring this to the attention of our Commissioner. I'm sure he'll will act on this.

MR. JIM SINGLETARY: Thank you very much for your time.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Thank you.

Is there anybody else who would like to speak even if you didn't sign up, on any topic.

(Laughter.)

MR. SZARPANSKI: Is it anybody's birthday today?

MR. CARMEN COGNETTA: Did you talk to the community advisory board?

MR. SZARPANSKI: No, I did not.

Carmen Cognetta, Counsel to the City Council Committee on Sanitation?

MR. CARMEN COGNETTA: And solid waste management.

When the Council was going to agree

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

to the Solid Waste Management plan, we all realized that probably all of us here today probably will not be here when perhaps these things go into effect. Certainly all the Council people will no longer be here because they'll be term-limited out.

So one of the important things we put in the plan was that every marine transfer station will have a community advisory board attached to it that will meet regularly about the concerns of the community starting this year.

So as the planning goes forward, as the construction goes forward and as the implementation goes forward, there will constantly be community input as to the problems that occur. So if a new traffic situation come up, if the trucks are using the wrong streets, that will all be able to be spoken about at the community advisory board and made known to the Department and to the elected officials.

Now, the community advisory board will be made up of appointees. There will be three from the City Council members whose district the facility is in. Three from the Borough

1

2 President, I believe and three from the Mayor or
3 four?

4

MR. SZARPANSKI: Four from the
5 Mayor. Three from the Borough President.

6

7

MR. CARMEN COGNETTA: Four from the
8 Mayor, three from the Borough President, three
9 from the Council members.

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

Now, those community advisory boards
are being formed now so if anybody'S interested in
being on them, they should talk to Councilmember
Avella who's district this is or the Borough
President. And we hope to get them having their
first meeting in July of this year so that they'll
be active and be able to put input into this
process from the very beginning so.

17

MR. SZARPANSKI: Thank you, Carmen.

18

19

Anybody else? Yes. Please stand up
and state your name.

20

21

MR. GENE KELTY: Yes. Gene Kelty
again.

22

23

24

25

One other thing I want to go after,
as a reminder, when we did the original ULURP
application by the community board, there was a
question regarding the height of the building. And

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I just want to do the boiler plate application on here and make the statement.

The height of the building has to be in agreement with the FAA and Port Authority. And I understand it was. I just want to make sure that we're at agreement with that.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Yes. Let me bring you up to date on what happened there.

The Port Authority initially objected to the height of the building. We had many discussions with them as to whether or not this was an obstacle or in any way interfered with airport operations.

We agreed with the Port Authority to reduce the building height by ten feet. The Port Authority withdrew their objections so that's been settled.

MR. GENE KELTY: Thank you.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Yes, sir. Your name.

MR. JOSEPH FEMENIA: Joe Femenia, Community Board #7.

Another part of that height issue was the birds, sea gulls. They usually surround

1

2 this area. Did they come up with a decision based
3 on the birds?

4

MR. SZARPANSKI: Are you referring
5 to birds that may be attracted to our facility?

6

MR. JOSEPH FEMENIA: Yes. And the
7 planes landing.

8

MR. SZARPANSKI: Well, look, in
9 the past when we operated marine transfer
10 stations, we used open hopper barges. Garbage is
11 exposed to the air. Birds saw this. Birds came
12 and followed our barges.

13

The way this facility is designed
14 the truck comes into the facility. No waste is
15 ever exposed to the atmosphere. No waste is seen
16 by anybody. Waste goes into sealed containers and
17 it's only until the containers are sealed that the
18 containers go outside the building. So we do not
19 believe that this facility will attract birds at
20 all.

21

MR. JOSEPH FEMENIA: Except for the
22 trucks 'cause they're not sealed.

23

MR. SZARPANSKI: Well, you know,
24 as somebody else at one point asked whether trucks
25 are going to be followed by birds, we don't see

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

that happening.

MR. GENE KELTY: Harry, I have to disagree with you. We have one of the largest district in Queens, Board #7. And I've got a lot of trucks there that are out and about in the street. And the birds were a problem to the Port Authority over at La Guardia Airport.

Whether it's happening from here or not, we're just bringing another boiler plate statement. Make sure you look at it. Because maybe not your facility because it's enclosed, but the rest of the facility which is Board #7 and partially Board #8 because they're keeping the recyclable trucks over there. It's the same immediate area. So the birds are going to be attracted there anyhow. Maybe not right next to your facility but in the immediate area.

So we're asking you to make sure you keep an eye on the bird problem, okay?

MR. SZARPANSKI: We will. Thank you.

MR. GENE KELTY: Thank you.

MR. SZARPANSKI: Anybody else?

(No response.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MR. SZARPANSKI: I guess everybody
wants to go home.

Okay. Well, if there are no other
questions or comments, thank you all for coming.

If you are on our list, you'll be
notified when the DEC will hold its permit
hearings.

Thanks.

(At 7:29 p.m., the proceedings were
concluded.)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

STATE OF NEW YORK)

SS.

COUNTY OF NEW YORK)

I, MARC RUSSO, a Shorthand
(Stenotype) Reporter and Notary
Public within and for the State of
New York, do hereby certify that the
foregoing pages 1 through 45 taken
at the time and place aforesaid, is
a true and correct transcription of
my shorthand notes.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have
hereunto set my name this 3rd day
of May, 2007.

MARC RUSSO

* * *