

HENRY AND SUSAN MCDONALD HOUSE, 128 Clinton Avenue (aka 128-132 Clinton Avenue and 128 Rear Clinton Avenue), Brooklyn
Built 1853-54; Architect, not determined.

Landmark Site: Borough of Brooklyn Tax Map Block 1887, Lot 82

On June 2, 2015 the Landmarks Preservation Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation as a Landmark of the Henry and Susan McDonald House and the proposed designation of the related Landmark Site (Item No. 2). The hearing was duly advertised in accordance with the provisions of law. Two speakers testified in favor of the designation, including representatives of the New York Landmarks Conservancy and Historic Districts Council. The Commission has also received letters of support for the designation from Council Member Laurie A. Cumbo and Brooklyn Community Board No. 2. There were no speakers or letters in opposition to the designation. This item had been previously heard on June 25, 2013 (Item No. 2). At that hearing there were three speakers in favor of the designation, including representatives of Council Member Letitia James, the Historic Districts Council, and Landmarks Conservancy. There were no speakers in opposition to designation. The Commission also previously received a letter in support of the designation from the Victorian Society New York.

Summary

This unusually well-preserved and rare free-standing Italianate style frame house with Greek Revival style elements was erected for Henry and Susan McDonald in 1853-54. It was built in a period when this area of the Wallabout was undergoing rapid development following an expansion of the Brooklyn Navy Yard and the opening of several new streets. Located at the crest of a hill with excellent views of the East River and Manhattan, Clinton Avenue was the neighborhood's premiere residential street, a wide tree-lined boulevard lined with the villas of wealthy merchants. The house's cubic form, low-hipped roof, strongly projected bracketed eaves, molded window surrounds, wood-and-glass double doors with segmental-arched transom and wood reveal, and columned portico enriched with dentils and paired brackets are characteristic of the Italianate style. Greek Revival style elements include the fluted porch columns with Tower of the Winds Corinthian capitals and first-story windows with eared surrounds. The house was occupied by Henry McDonald, a prosperous baker with a business on Catherine Street in Manhattan, and his family until the mid-1870s. Subsequent owners included merchant David S. Jones, attorney Edgar J. Phillips, and physician Domenick Candella. The McDonald House remains unusually intact and survives today as an important reminder of the early development of Wallabout.



BUILDING DESCRIPTION

Description

The McDonald House is a free-standing two-story frame house with a basement and attic.

Front (East) facade

Historic: wood clapboard; full-width front porch with simplified Tower of the Winds Corinthian columns and cornice with paired brackets and dentils; wood-and-glass double-leaf entrance doors and wood-and-glass segmental-arched transom with molded surround and paneled reveal; two tall windows with eared molded surrounds at first story; three windows with molded surrounds and lintels at a second story; three smaller window openings at attic; roof cornice with paired brackets and dentils; low hipped roof

Alterations: clapboard at first story replaced with wider planks; porch railings, some moldings and brackets, window sash,¹ and roofing material replaced; porch base, front stoop and stoop walls resurfaced; metal leader; attic window openings enlarged prior to 1934; fire escape installed c. 1948;² two satellite dishes on chimney

North Side facade

Historic: wood clapboard at eastern end; five basement windows; one paired and a single window at the first story; one small window at the second story; one small attic window; cornice with dentils and paired brackets; light-colored brick chimney on east end of roof (historic not original); red brick chimney at west end of roof; historic one-story rear yard addition³

Alterations: basement painted; non-historic window grilles at basement; clapboard replaced or covered with shingles at western end and rear yard addition; clapboard at eastern end replaced or covered at attic; replacement sash, air conditioner bracket beneath east first story window; three attic windows sealed; chimney flue at east side of façade painted; non-historic flue cap on west roof chimney; red brick chimney on the roof of the rear yard addition; metal leader

South Side facade

Historic: two attic windows; cornice with dentils and paired brackets

Alterations: basement painted; non-historic door and through-the-wall vent at basement; wood clapboard replaced or covered by shingles, extension at rear yard addition with sloped roof; aluminum siding; windows and a through-the-wall air conditioner; exposed conduit with light fixtures at first and second stories; replacement sash

Rear (West) facade

Historic: possibly wood clapboard; cornice with dentils and paired brackets; replacement sash

Alterations: enlarged attic windows

Site features: raised front yard with historic iron railing on painted stone curb with historic iron gate and painted piers at front lot line; stone-and-dirt driveway; historic iron gate at driveway; wood fences at north and south side yards

Other buildings on the lot: one-story garages⁴ at the rear lot line

SITE HISTORY

Early Development of the Wallabout Area⁵

Before the Europeans first made contact with Native Americans on what is now called Long Island, large portions of the island, including present-day Brooklyn, were occupied by the Lenape, or Delaware Indians.⁶ The Lenape lived in communities of bark- or grass-covered wigwams, and in their larger settlements—typically located on high ground adjacent to fresh water, and occupied in the fall, winter, and spring—they fished, harvested shellfish, and trapped animals. As archaeologist Joan Geismer has noted, the abundance of Native American place names for Wallabout Bay and its surroundings indicate that they “were undoubtedly known and used by local Indian populations.”⁷ It is likely the bay provided quahog or clamming beds for the natives who found great value in shells, which they manufactured into wampum. Used in Lenape ceremonies and valued as trading currency with the Dutch, the Lenape name for Long Island is Sewanhaka, meaning land or island of shells.⁸ No known Native American sites have been recorded within a one-mile radius of this site; however, its location on gently sloping ground about a block from the original shoreline of Wallabout Bay, makes it likely that it was traversed and perhaps used by Native American hunters and gatherers. (The lack of hills or rises probably precludes its use as a campsite.)⁹

In the mid-17th century Europeans began to settle along the inlet now known as Wallabout Bay. The McDonald house is located on a small portion of a farm, extending between present-day Clermont Avenue and Waverly Avenue, that was settled c. 1650 by Pieter Montfort (1616-1661) and was later acquired by Marten Ryerse (Ryerson) (1838-1710). This farm passed through several generations of the Ryerse family and at the time of the American Revolution was owned by Antje Ryerse (Ann Ryerson, 1746-1834) and her husband Jeremiah Vanderbilt (1740/50-1820).¹⁰ Wallabout was then a quiet farming community of about a dozen inter-related families living in houses extending along an old road near the shore of Wallabout Bay, just north of present-day Flushing Avenue.

Following the Revolution, the Jeremiah and Antje Vanderbilt continued to reside at their Wallabout farm with their extended family, which included their daughter Ann and son-in-law William Spader. In 1790 when the federal census was taken, the Vanderbilt-Spader household included four white males, four white females, and seven slaves. In the 1800 and 1810 Census, Jeremiah Vanderbilt had eight slaves in his household, and in 1820 Mrs. Vanderbilt had two slaves.¹¹

While the Wallabout area remained largely rural in the late-18th and early 19th centuries, investors began to build wharves, warehouses, and boatyards along the waterfront. Chief among them was Manhattan shipbuilder John Jackson who together with his brothers Treadwell and Samuel purchased a large tract and opened a shipyard. In 1801 the Jacksons sold their shipyard to the United States government for use as a navy yard. John Jackson then became a key investor in the Wallabout and Brooklyn Toll Bridge Company, which constructed a bridge and causeway across the Wallabout marsh linking to the Brooklyn and Flushing Turnpike. The new road greatly shortened the travel time between Brooklyn and Flushing, spurring development in the Navy Yard area and increasing property values in Wallabout.

Within the Navy Yard, the United States government constructed the Commandant’s House (1805-06, a designated New York City Landmark) and several

brick storehouses and offices. At first, the yard produced gun boats for ventures against the Barbary and Caribbean pirates, which protected the United States' and New York City's involvement in the "triangular trade," the lucrative European-African-American shipping network that traded enslaved workers from Africa and the Caribbean, and products from the Caribbean. In 1815, the yard launched the *Fulton*, the first steam-powered ocean-going vessel. Outside the yard, new houses went up to house the brass foundries, caulkers, joiners, riggers, and sailmakers involved in ship building. Taverns, game rooms, and a hotel also opened near the yard. In 1824 the Federal government purchased an additional thirty-five acres on Wallabout Bay for a Naval Hospital. Construction began on the main hospital building in 1830 and was completed by 1838. This period of Navy Yard growth was paralleled by the development of the surrounding neighborhoods including the area south of the yard.

Mid-19th Century Wallabout and Clinton Avenue

By the time Jeremiah Vanderbilt died in 1820, he had amassed considerable real estate in Brooklyn and Queens. Soon after his death, his grandson John Spader sued for a partition of the estate.¹² Eventually, John Spader and his brother Jeremiah Vanderbilt Spader (1796-1838) acquired adjacent parcels extending roughly from modern-day Flushing Avenue to DeKalb Avenues between Clermont and Waverly Avenues.¹³ The two brothers continued to live side by side and to farm in Wallabout until the 1830s.¹⁴

In 1833 John Spader took advantage of the intense real estate speculation in Wallabout to sell his farm to George W. Pine, partner in the New York City auction house of Pine & Van Antwerp.¹⁵ Spader agreed to accept a mortgage on the property against much of the purchase price. As Pine found purchasers for the individual lots Spader released the lots from the overall mortgage in exchange for a payment of principal and interest, thus Spader remained in a sense a partner in the development. The Spader-Pine development was laid out in an unusually generous manner. Clinton Avenue (named for Dewitt Clinton) was 80 feet wide and developed as a tree-lined boulevard. The individual lots or "sections," as they were referred to in Pine and Spader's deeds of sale, were 100 feet wide and 246 feet deep. Builders and developers began buying up the Clinton Avenue lots, many of which were subdivided into 50 feet wide or 25 feet wide tracts. Over the next few years, several handsome free-standing villas were built on Clinton Avenue, notably the Lefferts-Laidlaw House at 136 Clinton Street (main house built c. 1836-40, southwest wing built c. 1835, moved to present site, c. 1836-40, southeast wing built prior to 1855, a designated New York City Landmark). These houses were set back from the street and surrounded by large lawns. The elegance of the mansions and beauty of gardens made Clinton Avenue one of the most fashionable streets in Brooklyn.

Jeremiah Spader seems to have left most of his property undeveloped and continued farming until his death in 1838. The financial panic of 1837 and the depression that followed halted development in the area for a few years, but the opening of Flushing Avenue, which replaced the Wallabout Turnpike, spurred development in the northern part of Wallabout. At the end of the 1840s the new streets at Wallabout just beyond the Navy Yard were elevated "six to eight feet above the grade of the old country roads."¹⁶ The marshes and low lying ground both within the yard and on the blocks immediately to the south also began to be filled making the neighborhood more desirable as a place of residence.

In March 1849 the trustees of Jeremiah V. Spader's Estate announced that they would be selling his former farm at auction.¹⁷ In contrast to the 1830s subdivision of the John Spader farm, the J.V. Spader farm was divided into 100 city lots, most measuring 25 by 100 feet. The terms of sale provided that the lots were to be graded and Vanderbilt Avenue, which had not previously been cut through, was to be graded and paved at the expense of the estate. During the autumn of 1849, John Spader, who had regained ownership of the northern portion of the block bounded by Myrtle, Vanderbilt, Park, and Clinton Avenues had his property remapped, this time the lots facing on to Vanderbilt Avenue measured 23 by 100 feet or 23 by 115 feet. The lot sizes (suitable for the construction of fairly generous townhouses or row houses) set the stage for the future development of the Vanderbilt Avenue as a middle-class residential enclave. It also had the effect of greatly increasing the value of through-the-block lots extending from Clinton Avenue to Vanderbilt Avenue, since they presented opportunities for further subdivision and development on both street fronts. A new wave of construction began on Clinton Avenue, with some property owners financing their new homes by selling the rear portion of their lots facing Vanderbilt Avenue to developers.

Construction and Early History of the Henry and Susan McDonald House

The land on which the McDonald House is situated was part of John Spader's farm and was sold to Amasa Wright by George W. and Portia C. Pine in 1833. Wright and his wife Nancy then sold it to Lucius Hyde, a physician, in 1835, who sold it to baker Henry McDonald in 1853 for \$6,500 subject to a restrictive covenant against noxious and offensive uses. The parcel conveyed to McDonald measured 100 feet by 200 feet and extended through to Vanderbilt Avenue. McDonald subdivided the parcel in three lots, and later that same year sold one lot to Frances M. Peed and one lot to Wells O. Pettit, and kept the third lot that fronted on Clinton Avenue and measured 50 feet by 120 feet.¹⁸ The house was built by the McDonalds between 1853 and 1854, when Henry McDonald who had a business on Catherine Street in Manhattan, was first listed in the city directories as living on Clinton Avenue in Brooklyn.¹⁹ In 1855 it was depicted on the Perris map of 1855 as a rectangular house with a porch and a glass conservatory at the rear. According to the 1855 New York State Census, Henry and Susan McDonald were residing in the house with their daughter Amelia Dilks and her husband Joseph, a locksmith, their daughter Susan Hobby and her son Henry, their four other children, and two female servants from Ireland.²⁰ By the time of the 1870 U.S. Census, Henry was no longer working and living with him in the house were his wife Susan, daughters Susan Hobby and Henrietta, three young boys between the ages of 2 and 10 years old who were probably grandsons by his daughter Susan, and a female servant from Ireland.²¹ Henrietta was still living in the house when her parents died in 1873.²²

Design of the Henry and Susan McDonald House

The Henry and Susan McDonald House is an unusually well-preserved mid-19th century frame house that was designed in the Italianate style but incorporated elements of the earlier Greek Revival style. Its architect has not been determined. The Greek Revival style dominated American architecture from the late 1820s to the late 1840s, and is characterized by planar wall surfaces, simple massive forms, and classical ornament primarily derived from classic Greek sources.²³ By the 1850s other less restrained and

more picturesque styles, including the Italianate, were becoming fashionable. There were several variants of the Italianate style, including one based on the rural architecture of the Italian countryside – country villas, vernacular buildings and country churches. The Italianate was the dominant mid-19th century architectural style in the United States and Canada. Two principle features of Italianate style buildings are decorative brackets and round-headed arches, usually above window and door openings.²⁴ Other characteristic features of the Italianate style include a height of two or three stories; tall, narrow window openings commonly arched headed; elaborate window lintels or hoods; double doors; porches; low-pitched roofs with overhanging eaves (under which would be decorative brackets); and towers or cupolas.²⁵

The design of the McDonald house, while a product of broad architectural trends, may have been influenced by the architectural pattern books of the time, which began to introduce new ideas about planning and design to the American public in the middle of the 19th century and were among the important sources for designs of villas or cottages.²⁶ Cottages generally referred to the more modest types of houses although the two terms overlap considerably. Perhaps the most influential were those of Andrew Jackson Downing, who transmitted English concepts of rural design and landscaping to a broad audience through books including *A Treatise on the Theory and Practice of Landscape Gardening* (1841), *Cottage Residences* (1842), and *The Architecture of Country Houses* (1850). Downing, who featured work of Andrew Jackson Davis, John Notman, Gervase Wheeler, Richard Upjohn, and Calvert Vaux, published numerous designs for farmhouses, villas, and cottages; these were largely Gothic Revival, Italianate, and Swiss Cottage in style. Downing died in 1852, but his publications were frequently reprinted, and many architects published pattern books in the 1850s, including Samuel Sloan (*The Model Architect*, 1852-53). Although pattern books were influential, they were rarely precisely copied but were adapted “to meet local needs and financial constraints.”²⁷ Many carpenters and builders combined architectural features from a variety of sources. The McDonald house does not appear to be an exact copy of any known pattern book design but several designs for modestly ornamented cubic houses were published in the early 1850s, including design VIII for a suburban cottage in Downing’s *The Architecture of Country Houses* and design XI for a plain villa in Sloan’s *The Model Architect*. The McDonald house differs in some respects – particularly in its execution in wood rather than masonry, higher stoop, full-width porch, entrance at the side bay rather than in the center bay, and attic story.

The McDonald house is two-and-one-half story free-standing frame house; it has a side-passage double-parlor plan with a full basement and is located at the northeast corner of the lot. Although the house is free-standing its proportions and location on the lot recall an urban rather than a suburban or country home. It features characteristic Italianate style details including a cubic form with low-hipped roof, porch and roof cornices with over-hanging eaves and decorative paired brackets, wood-and-glass double-doors with segmental-arch transom, molded surround and paneled wood reveal, and molded window surrounds at the upper stories. The full-width columned porch and floor-length parlor window openings and small attic windows that pierce the fascia board of the cornice, are features found on both Greek Revival and Italianate style houses that have porches. Details incorporated from the earlier Greek Revival style include the fluted porch columns with simplified Corinthian capitals, molded eared surrounds at the first

story windows, and dentils at the porch and roof cornices. Of particular interest are the column capitals with a single row of acanthus leaves surrounding a single row of palm leaves that are based on a plate in Stuart and Revett's *Antiquities of Athens* (published in 1762) illustrating the Tower of the Winds in Athens. This popular device remained fashionable in the 1840s and 1850s, with examples ranging from columns in Alexander Jackson Davis's House of Representative's Chamber in the State Capitol in Raleigh, North Carolina (1840), to the entrance doorway of the Avery House in Granville, Ohio (1842), to the grand portico at Sturdivant Hall in Selma, Alabama (1856).²⁸ In 1939, the Tower of the Winds order was employed for the porch of Graceland, the Memphis, Tennessee, mansion that became the home of Elvis Presley.

Subsequent History of the Henry and Susan McDonald House

Both Henry and Susan McDonald died in 1873 (September 23 and May 30, respectively)²⁹ and the house passed by Henry McDonald's will to one of their daughters, Henrietta.³⁰ On December 5, 1874 a classified advertisement in the *Brooklyn Eagle* offered it for sale: "FOR SALE-HOUSE-128 CLINTON AV, on very easy terms and very cheap, splendid 3 story extension house; all improvements; in perfect condition; 11 rooms; beautiful grounds; 50 x 100; the finest residence on the avenue; want an offer. Apply to H. W. ROZELL, 387 Myrtle av, day or evening."³¹ The house was purchased by Jennie Spowers in 1875.³² The U.S. Census for 1880 lists three families in the house, John J. Spowers, who was in the iron business, with his wife (Jennie), a son and a daughter, and one female servant; James Sascoyne, an agent, with his wife and son; and John Hagar, in the type business, with his wife, two adult women whose last names were also Hagar, and two female servants. The house then had several owners, all of whom lived in the house with their families, including David S. Jones, a flour merchant (dates of ownership, 1881-1890); Nellie C. Phillips, whose husband Edgar was a lawyer, (1890-1906); Wolf Hurwitz, a merchant who was born in Russia (1906-1911); Domenico Candela, a medical doctor who was born in Italy³³ (1911-1920); and Theresa Cranflone, who kept house and whose husband Aurelio was a salesman of produce (1920-1926).³⁴ The house was purchased by Nicola Gagliardo in 1926 from Theresa Cranflone and members of the Gagliardo family owned it until 1974. In the 1930 and 1940 U.S. Census there were two families, all renters, living in the house. In 1930 one family was headed by Joseph Gagliardo, helper at a building company, and another by Harry I. Stover, a paint mixer at a paint company; and in 1940 Joseph Gagliardo and his family still resided in the house and the other family was headed by William Cartini, a head waiter who was born in Italy. It appears from the Brooklyn Address Telephone Directories that by the mid-1950s the house had three families living in it.³⁵ Members of the Gagliardo family sold it to Richard Arnow in 1974. In 2000 he sold it to John Pascoe who then sold it to its present owners in 2006.³⁶ It remains a three-family house today.

Report prepared by
Cynthia Danza
Additional research by Gale Harris
Research Department

NOTES

¹ A historic photograph from 1934 (New York Public Library Collection) shows what appears to be French doors at the first story with four panes (the top horizontal muntin is larger than the two below) in each door (it is possible that they could be French doors with three panes and a transom above or double-hung sash with a center muntin that is larger), four-over-four double-hung sash at the second story and casement windows with six panes in each sash at the attic. In a photograph from 1941 (Brooklyn Historical Society Collection) the first story windows are not visible, and it appears that there was two-over-two double-hung sash at the second story, and casement windows with each sash having a single pane at the attic.

² The fire escape was installed pursuant to a 1948 Building Notice in order to comply with a pending Department of Buildings violation that required a second means of egress or sprinklers. New York City Department of Buildings, Brooklyn, BN 2008-1948.

³ The rear yard addition replaced the original glass conservancy and appears in the historic 1934 and 1941 photographs. The first map that shows a one-story wood rear yard addition is the 1887 Sanborn Map, vol. 2, plate 54.

⁴ The architectural drawings by Vincent D. Luongo filed with the Department of Buildings in connection with ALT 5505-1953 notes that the garages were built under NB 338-1881 but the folder for that NB at the Buildings Department has no permit in it. The first map that shows a free-standing brick carriage house at the southwest corner of the lot is the 1887 Sanborn Map, vol. 2, plate 8. After 1950 (see Sanborn Map, 1915-Nov. 1950, vol. 2, plate 52), a second garage was built at the northwest corner of the lot.

⁵ This section is adapted from Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC), *Wallabout Historic District Designation Report* (LP-2445) (New York: City of New York, 2011), historical and architectural essay prepared by Gale Harris, 4-10, and LPC, *Lefferts-Laidlaw House Designation Report* (LP-2099) (New York: City of New York, 2001), prepared by Gale Harris, 2.

⁶ This section on the early development of Wallabout is based on John A. Strong, *The Algonquian Peoples of Long Island from the Earliest Times to 1700* (Interlaken, NY: Books, 1997), 152, 163-165; Joan Geismar and Stephen Oberon, *Stage 1-A Cultural Resources Documentary Study and Assessment of Potential Impact, Proposed Navy Yard Cogeneration Facility*, prepared for Blasland and Bouck Engineers, PC, 1993 (on file with Landmarks Preservation Commission Environmental Review Department), 15-26; United States Department of the Interior, National Park Service, National Register of Historic Places Inventory-Nomination Form, *Lefferts-Laidlaw House*, prepared by Merrill Hesch, 1985; LPC, "Brooklyn Survey: Vanderbilt Avenue Proposed Historic District," 1977, n.p.; LPC, *Vinegar Hill Historic District Designation Report* (LP-1952) (New York: City of New York, 1997), prepared by Donald Presa, 3-5; LPC, *Clinton Hill Historic District Designation Report* (LP-2017) (New York: City of New York, 1981), 3-4; Henry W. Stiles, *The Civil, Political, Professional and Ecclesiastical History and Commercial and Industrial Record of the County of Kings and the City of Brooklyn, New York, from 1683-1834*, 2 vols. (New York: W.W. Munsell & Co, 1884), v. 1, 145.

⁷ Joan H. Geismar, *Documentation of the Wallabout Urban Renewal Area Housing Site (Block 2027) Brooklyn, NY*, (CEQR No. 88-323K), prepared for the New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development (New York: City of New York, 1988), 14. Native Americans called the bay *Marechkaneck* and the area *Rennegackonck* after the creek the Dutch subsequently named *Waal-bogt*.

⁸ Adriaen Van Der Donck wrote in 1655 about the manufacture of wampum: "They strike off the thin parts of those shells [sewam] and preserve the pillars or standards, which they grind smooth and even ... and drill a hole through every piece and string the same on strings, and afterwards sell their strings of wampum in that manner. This is the only article of moneyed medium among the natives, with which any traffic can be driven; and it is also common with us in purchasing necessities and carrying on trade; many thousand strings are exchanged every year for peltries near the seashores where the wampum is only made, and the peltries are brought for sale." Adriaen Van Der Donck, *A Description of New Netherlands*, ed. and intro by Thomas F. O'Donnell (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1968), 93.

⁹ The 1639 Mantus map indicates evidence of Lenape habitation upon the nearby hills of the Wallabout in what is now known as Clinton Hill and Fort Greene.

¹⁰ In 1811, probably soon after Jan Ryerson died, his real estate was inherited by his daughters Antje and Christintie (aka Syntie). Wishing to pass the property on to their grandchildren, Antje and Jeremiah bought Christintie's half interest in the property through a series of transactions that left Jeremiah with a clear title to the property. See Conveyances Liber 38, 109, 111, 113.

¹¹ United States Census, 1790, Kings County, Brooklyn, 4.

¹² Vanderbilt made a will in 1795 leaving his property to his son John and asking him to provide for his widow. By the time Jeremiah died in 1820, his son was dead and the executors he had appointed 25 years earlier were either elderly or deceased. The surviving executors agreed to relinquish control to John Spader and neighbors Abraham Meserole and General Jeremiah Johnson. Kings County, Office of the Surrogate, Wills Liber 2, 381.

¹³ Liber Deeds and Conveyances, Liber 12, 675; "In Partition," *New York Daily Advertiser*, Dec. 19, 1820, 3.

¹⁴ United States Census, 1830, Kings County, Brooklyn, 236-237; John Spader does not appear in the 1790, 1800 or 1810 census as the head of the household, in the 1820 census he appears and had no slaves in his household. John Spader was also active in Democratic Party politics and held a number of positions in Brooklyn government including town assessor (1824) and Justice of the Peace (1830-31). See the list of Brooklyn town officers in the Brooklyn Directories 1824-31; "Kings County," *National Advocate*, Apr. 22, 1819, 2.

¹⁵ Pine paid \$62,594 for the property, \$50,000 more than Spader had spent to purchase the land. Conveyances Liber 38, 124, 125; Kings County, Mortgages Liber 26, 264; "A Map of the Property of John Spader & George W. Pine in the Seventh Ward City of Brooklyn," surveyed by Sidney G. Herbert, Nov. 13, 1833, copy on file in the Brooklyn Borough President's Office, Topographic Division.

¹⁶ "Improvements at the Wallabout," *Brooklyn Eagle*, May 18, 1848, 3.

¹⁷ "James Cole, Auctioneer," *Brooklyn Eagle*, Mar. 23, 1849, 2; "Tuesday March 27th," *Brooklyn Eagle*, Mar. 23, 1849, 3. See also the auction map for the sale "Positive Sale of Valuable Building Lots in the City of Brooklyn Belonging to the Estate of Jeremiah V. Spader, decd.," at the Brooklyn Historical Society Flat Maps (B P-[1849]b.FI). Copy also on file at the Brooklyn Borough President's Office, Topographic Division.

¹⁸ Deeds and Conveyances, deed from John and Phebe Spader to George W. Pine, recorded November 14, 1833, Liber 38, 124 and 125; deed from George W. and Portia C. Pine to Amasa Wright, recorded December 6, 1833, Liber 38, 358; deed from Amasa and Nancy Wright to Lucius Hyde, recorded January 10, 1835, Liber 45, 186; deed from Lucius Hyde to Henry McDonald, recorded February 24, 1853, Liber 312, 259; deed from Henry and Susan McDonald to Frances M. Peed, recorded March 11, 1853, Liber 314, 312; and deed from Henry and Susan McDonald to Wells O. Petit, recorded August 18, 1853, Liber 332, 515.

¹⁹ New York City and Brooklyn directories.

²⁰ New York State Census, 1855, Brooklyn, 11th Ward.

²¹ United States Census, 1870, Kings County, 20th Ward, 136.

²² Classified advertisement, *Brooklyn Eagle*, October 11, 1873, 5.

²³ LPC, *Duffield Street House Designation Report*, (LP-2089) (New York: City of New York, 2001) prepared by Gale Harris, 4.

²⁴ Alan Gowans, *Styles and Types of North American Architecture*, (New York: Harper Collins, 1992), 189-192.

²⁵ Virginia and Lee McAlester, *A Field Guide to American Houses*, (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1994), 211-214.

²⁶ This paragraph is adapted from LPC, *George B. and Susan Elkins House Designation Report*, (LP-2207) (New York: City of New York, 2006) prepared by Michael D. Caratzas, 7-9.

²⁷ Daniel D. Reiff, *Houses from Books: Treatises, Pattern Books, and Catalogs in American Architecture, 1738-1950* (University Park, Penn.; Pennsylvania State University Press, 2001), 62.

²⁸ This discussion on the Tower of the Winds order is taken from, Reiff, 53; Calder Loth, "Classical Comments: Tower of the Winds Order," *Classicist Blog*, posted by Sara Durkacs on Oct. 20, 2010 at <http://blog.classicist.org/?p=1425> accessed May 27, 2015.

²⁹ *Brooklyn Eagle*, September 24, 1873, 3; *Brooklyn Eagle*, May 31, 1873, 2.

³⁰ Kings County, Office of the Surrogate, Wills Liber 53, 22.

³¹ *Brooklyn Eagle*, December 5, 1874, 3.

³² Deeds and Conveyances, Executors and Devisee of Henry McDonald to Jennie Spowers, recorded September 10, 1875, Liber 1214, 538 and 456.

³³ Candela was also a partner in the private banking firm of Guarini and Candela. See his 1919 application for a U.S. passport and city directories of 1913 and 1925. The 1915 New York State Census, 1900 and 1920 U. S. Census list him as a medical doctor.

³⁴ Deed and Conveyances, deed from Jennie and John J. Spowers, Jr., to David S. Jones, recorded August 22, 1881, Liber 1436, 37; deed from David S. Jones to Nellie C. Phillips, recorded December 17, 1890, Liber 2018, 489; agreement between Edgar J. and Nellie C. Phillips and Wolf Hurwitz, recorded June 15, 1906, Liber 39, 357; deed from Wolf and Bessie Hurwitz to Domenico Candela, recorded December 6, 1911, Liber 3330, 297; deed from Rosa Candela to Theresa Cranflone, recorded July 13, 1920, Liber 3967, 357; U.S. Census 1900, 1910, and 1920; New York State Census 1892, 1905, 1915 and 1925.

³⁵ New York Telephone Company, Brooklyn Address Directories 1929-1980, 1986.

³⁶ Deed and conveyances, deed from Joseph Gagliardo, surviving joint tenant, to Richard Arnow dated February 18, 1974, Liber 685, 694, and deed from the heirs of Frances Gagliardo to Richard Arnow dated May 10, 1974, Liber 711, 1161; deed from Richard Aroneau to John Pascoe dated March 23, 2000, Liber 4888, 158; and deed from John Pascoe to Joseph P. Degado and Justine A. Fasciano dated March 1, 2006, Liber 151, 471.

FINDINGS AND DESIGNATION

On the basis of a careful consideration of the history, the architecture, and the other features of this building, the Landmarks Preservation Commission finds that the Henry and Susan McDonald House has a special character and a special historical and aesthetic interest and value as part of the development, heritage, and cultural characteristics of New York City.

The Commission further finds that, among its important qualities, the Henry and Susan McDonald House is an unusually well-preserved and rare free-standing Italianate style frame house with Greek Revival style elements; that it was erected for Henry and Susan McDonald in 1853-54; that it was built in a period when this area of the Wallabout was undergoing rapid development following an expansion of the Brooklyn Navy Yard and the opening of several new streets; that Clinton Avenue, located at the crest of a hill with excellent views of the East River and Manhattan, was the neighborhood's premiere residential street, a wide tree-lined boulevard lined with the villas of wealthy merchants; that the house's cubic form, low-hipped roof, strongly projected bracketed eaves, molded window surrounds, wood-and-glass double doors with segmental-arched transom and wood reveal, and columned portico enriched with dentils and paired brackets are characteristic of the Italianate style; that Greek Revival style elements include the fluted porch columns with simplified Corinthian capitals and first-story windows with eared surrounds; that the house was occupied by Henry McDonald, a prosperous baker with a business on Catherine Street in Manhattan, and his family until the mid-1870s; that subsequent owners included merchant David S. Jones, attorney Edgar J. Phillips, and physician Domenick Candella; and that the McDonald House remains unusually intact and survives today as an important reminder of the early development of Wallabout.

Accordingly, pursuant to the provisions of Chapter 74, Section 3020 of the Charter of the City of New York and Chapter 3 of Title 25 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission designates as a Landmark the Henry and Susan McDonald House, 128 Clinton Avenue (aka 128-132 Clinton Avenue and 128 Rear Clinton Avenue), Brooklyn, and designated Borough of Brooklyn Tax Map Block 1887, Lot 82, as its Landmark Site.

Meenakshi Srinivasin, Chair

Frederick Bland, Diana Chapin, Wellington Chen, Michael Goldblum, John Gustafsson,
Adi Shamir-Baron, Kim Vauss, Commissioners



Henry and Susan McDonald House
128 Clinton Avenue (aka 128-132 Clinton Avenue and 128 Rear Clinton Avenue), Brooklyn
Front Facade
Photo: Cindy Danza, 2014



Henry and Susan McDonald House
 Front Porch
Photo: Christopher D. Brazee, 2015



Henry and Susan McDonald House
 Upper Stories of the Front Facade
Photo: Cindy Danza, 2014



Henry and Susan McDonald House
View of Front and Side Facade
Photo: Cindy Danza, 2014



Henry and Susan McDonald House

Percy Loomis Sperr, "Brooklyn: Clinton Avenue - Park Avenue," 1934

*Source: Irma and Paul Milstein Division of United States History, Local History and Genealogy,
The New York Public Library.*



Henry and Susan McDonald House
1941

Source: Brooklyn Historical Society



HENRY AND SUSAN McDONALD HOUSE (LP-2543), 128 Clinton Avenue (aka 128-132 Clinton Avenue & 128 Rear Clinton Avenue) Landmark Site: Borough of Brooklyn, Tax Map Block 1887, Lot 82

Graphic Source: New York City Department of City Planning, MapPLUTO, Release 11v1, 2011. Author: New York City Landmarks Preservation Commission, JM. Date: June 17, 2013