

New York City Bus Lane Camera Enforcement

2024 Report Covering the period of 2022 and 2023



Background

The New York City Department of Transportation (DOT) committed to ensuring fast and reliable bus travel for New Yorkers. Through 2023, DOT has worked closely with the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA), MTA New York City Transit (NYCT), and MTA Bus Company (MTA Bus) to install over 180 miles of bus lanes around the city to allow buses on dozens of bus routes to bypass vehicular traffic. The effectiveness of these bus lanes relies not only relies upon good infrastructure design, but also effective enforcement.

In the summer of 2010, New York City and the MTA were given legislative authority to begin operating camera-based bus lane enforcement. The authorizing legislation allowed camera-based enforcement only on Select Bus Service (SBS) corridors in each borough of New York City. Based on this authority, the City and the MTA initiated implementation of an enforcement system using stationary cameras mounted above bus lanes beginning in November 2010. DOT installs and maintains stationary, street-mounted bus lane enforcement cameras to capture violations for vehicles traveling in the bus lane from stationary vantage points.

In 2019, State legislative authority was extended to allow the operation of camera-based enforcement on all bus lanes within New York City, not just SBS corridors. With this broader authorization, the legislation also added restrictions regarding time, fine amounts, and enforcement



methods. Bus lane cameras are permitted to issue violations whenever bus lanes are in effect. A graduated fine program was also instituted, which lowers the base bus lane fine from \$115 to \$50. After the first violation, the fine amount increases for subsequent violations within a 12-month period to \$100 for the second offense, \$150 for the third offense, \$200 for the fourth offense, and \$250 for each subsequent offense.

In 2024 expanded legislative authority went into effect, and MTA transitioned from the ABLE program to the Automated Camera Enforcement (ACE) program which issues additional violations for vehicles parking in bus stops and double parking along bus routes. The new program began enforcement after a 60-day warning period in the summer of 2024. Both the stationary camera and ABLE programs are subject to the same fine structure, and violations from both programs are reviewed by DOT. Revenue from DOT stationary camera revenues is remitted to the New York City Department of Finance, while ABLE camera revenue is directed to the New York City Transportation Assistance Fund, which the MTA can access to help fund its operations.

This state legislatively mandated report, which covers 2022 and 2023, will focus only on the DOT stationary camera and ABLE programs, providing an overview of the implementation of both programs, reviewing the outreach and education conducted, and discussing the violation results.

The expanded legislative authority which went into effect in 2024 included additional reporting requirements on bus speeds, reliability, and ridership. newer reporting components are not a part of this report, as data was not collected with this purpose in mind in 2022 and 2023. The next two-year report will incorporate this data¹.

¹ The legislation that went into effect in 2024 requires an itemized list of expenditures made by the MTA, as well as a detailed report o the bus speeds, reliability, and ridership before and after implementation of the bus rapid transit demonstration program for each bus route, including current statistics. As the requirement was not in effect for years prior to 2024, it is not reported here.



Outreach and Education

Prior to implementing the camera enforcement program, DOT and NYCT conducted a joint outreach and public education campaign to raise awareness of bus lanes and their applicable rules.

NYCT conducted bus and subway media campaigns to raise bus lane awareness, beginning in 2010 with the start of SBS on the M15 in Manhattan. At the same time, DOT distributed brochure to drivers, bus riders, and community stakeholders along SBS corridors. The brochure, available at **www.nyc.gov/buslanes**, has been translated into the six most common languages spoken in New York City and all information in the brochure is also available by calling 311. In addition, DOT and the New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission work together to educate taxi and livery drivers, including direct messaging to drivers and fleet owners. DOT has also worked with the New York City Police Department, American Automobile Association (AAA), the Truck Association of New York, and local Business Improvement Districts to educate the public about bus lane rules.

DOT and/or MTA issue press releases when enforcement on a new corridor goes into effect, and often complement this with social media postings (e.g., Facebook, X/Twitter).

Bus Lane Camera Enforcement in Context

The Select Bus Service program, which integrated camera-enforced bus lanes with a suite of corridor-specific improvements, led to notable bus speed increases ranging from 15% to 31%, depending on the route. While camera enforcement has been a crucial element of those speed gains, it is difficult to isolate its effect relative to the effect of other strategies that were implemented simultaneously, such as off-board fare payment.

DOT initiated the Better Buses program in 2019 to further the goals of SBS on a broader array of bus corridors. In 2022 and 2023, DOT installed 23.1 miles of new and upgraded bus lanes, including projects on University Avenue and Gun Hill Road in the Bronx, 1st Avenue, 3rd Avenue, and Avenues A and D in Manhattan, 21st Street and Northern Boulevard in Queens, and Livingston Street in Brooklyn. DOT prioritizes bringing bus-mounted and stationary cameras as soon as feasible after a new bus priority project is implemented.



Camera Operations

Under the City's traffic rules, bus lanes in New York City can be legally used by non-bus vehicles under a limited set of circumstances, including making the next legal right turn, accessing the curb or a driveway within 200 feet, stopping to expeditiously pick up or drop off passengers or goods, or to avoid an emergency vehicle. As a result, the camera enforcement system needs to be able to differentiate between these legal activities and illegal uses of the bus lane before issuing violations. The systems therefore rely on the use of recorded video that is reviewed by trained camera operators before a violation is issued.

Two types of violation monitoring equipment have been used to date. The first is a fixed location camera system implemented by DOT. In the fixed system, two cameras are mounted above the bus lane. One camera provides a high-quality view of the rear of a vehicle, clearly showing the vehicle's license plate, but not showing the driver of the vehicle. The second camera provides a wider-angle view of the street, clearly showing both potential actions in the bus lane, and also showing other activity on the street that might have forced a vehicle to use the bus lane. These camera arrays are often mounted above bus lanes approaching right turn locations. If a non-bus motorist continues through the intersection in the bus lane without turning right, these cameras identify a potential violation.

Through 2023, fixed bus lane cameras were installed at 188 locations along the following corridors:



Brooklyn

Bedford Avenue* Church Avenue Flatlands Avenue Fulton Street* Glenwood Road Jay Street* Kings Highway Nostrand Avenue* Pennsylvania Avenue Rockaway Parkway* Rogers Avenue* Smith Street Utica Avenue*

Bronx

149th Street* Bronx River Avenue East 161st Street East 163rd Street Fordham Road* Webster Avenue*

Manhattan

181st Street* 125th Street 14th Street* 1st Avenue* 207th Street 23rd Street* 2nd Avenue* 34th Street* 3rd Avenue 42nd Street 5th Avenue 86th Street* Allen Street* Broadway Lexington Avenue Madison Avenue

Queens

Archer Avenue* Beach 59th Street Broadway* Cross Bay Boulevard Fresh Pond Rd* Hillside Avenue* Hoffman Drive Jamaica Av Main Street* Merrick Boulevard Queens Boulevard Rockaway Beach Blvd. Sutphin Boulevard*

Staten Island

Hylan Boulevard*

* Mobile (ABLE) cameras also in use through 2023

The operating cost incurred by DOT for stationary cameras in 2022 and 2023 was \$8,773,020 and \$8,761,035, respectively.

The second type of violation monitoring equipment is operated by the MTA and consists of on-bus mobile cameras, which were first tested in a NYCT pilot program in 2010–2011 and then fully implemented under the ABLE program in 2019.

ABLE cameras operated on the following twenty-one routes through 2023:

B25	BX12-SBS	M15-SBS	Q44-SBS
B26	BX19	M23-SBS	Q54
B42	BX35	M34-SBS	Q58
B44-SBS	BX36	M86-SBS	S79-SBS
B46-SBS	BX41-SBS	Q43	
B62	M14-SBS		



For the ABLE camera system, equipment is installed inside of the bus that can capture the rear license plates of vehicles stopped in the bus lane as the bus passes the vehicle. It then uses GPS to mark that location. To issue a violation under this system, two buses must observe the same vehicle stopped at the same GPS location, and the two buses must make this observation at least five minutes apart. This ensures that violations are not issued to vehicles making an expeditious drop-off in the bus lane, which is allowed under the City's traffic rules. Because this system records only no standing and no parking violations, it does not duplicate the stationary camera system, which captures primarily driving in the bus lane violations. The DOT cameras and the ABLE cameras are each best suited to a specific type of violation, so the continued rollout of both programs is essential to increasing the effectiveness of bus lanes.

Budgeted MTA operating costs for the ABLE program were \$2,715,000 in 2022 and \$3,610,000 in 2023.

Program Results: Events Recorded, Violations and Adjudication

Under both the DOT stationary camera and MTA ABLE enforcement programs, cameras record potential violation events, which are then reviewed and processed by the camera contractor and DOT technicians. During the reporting period, a total of 990 unique cameras recorded potential violation events, including 371 (two per site) stationary bus lane cameras at 188 locations and 619 on-bus mobile cameras.

DOT does not issue notices of liability for all events, as there are instances when cameras are triggered but a violation cannot be confirmed. This could be due to a range of reasons, including a blurry image, or an authorized emergency vehicle being captured by the camera in the bus lane. Table 1 shows the events recorded every month in 2022 and 2023. From January 1, 2022 through December 31, 2023, 36,117,200 total camera events associated with bus lanes were recorded by DOT stationary cameras, and 500,882 total camera events associated with bus lanes were recorded through the MTA ABLE program.

Table 1Monthly Breakdown of Events Recorded bythe Bus Lane Camera Enforcement System, 2022 and 2023

Month	Stationary Bus Lane Camera	ABLE (on-bus)	Total
January 2022	1,183,004	12,286	1,195,290
February 2022	1,243,966	12,873	1,256,839
March 2022	1,563,091	16,467	1,579,558
April 2022	1,490,498	15,474	1,505,972
May 2022	1,573,942	15,614	1,589,556
June 2022	1,559,771	16,158	1,575,929
July 2022	1,424,854	11,228	1,436,082
August 2022	1,421,662	7,330	1,428,992
September 2022	1,402,282	6,865	1,409,147
October 2022	1,438,329	13,455	1,451,784
November 2022	1,373,171	16,937	1,390,108
December 2022	1,324,765	27,250	1,352,015
January 2023	1,596,279	36,289	1,632,568
February 2023	1,178,662	29,129	1,207,791
March 2023	1,723,213	33,267	1,756,480
April 2023	1,632,477	23,436	1,655,913
May 2023	1,690,167	23,808	1,713,975
June 2023	1,766,432	21,868	1,788,300
July 2023	1,590,903	23,198	1,614,101
August 2023	1,584,619	26,624	1,611,243
September 2023	1,507,513	25,215	1,532,728
October 2023	1,670,941	22,676	1,693,617
November 2023	1,618,936	26,850	1,645,786
December 2023	1,557,723	36,385	1,594,108
Total	36,117,200	500,682	36,617,882

Automated Bus Camera Events, 2022–23 DOT Stationary Cameras



Automated Bus Camera Events, 2022–23 MTA ABLE (Mobile Cameras)



Monthly Events



When a violation is confirmed, notices of liability are sent to the registered owner of a motor vehicle by DOT for both stationary and ABLE mobile camera infractions. These notices of liability include information about the date, time and location of the violation, a photo of the vehicle recorded, and a link to a website with a personalized PIN that allows the video of the violation to be viewed. Table 2 enumerates the notices of liability issued by DOT. From January 1, 2022 through December 31, 2023, 1,248,543 notices of liability were issued for stationary camera violations, and 229,442 notices of liability were issued for ABLE mobile camera violations.

Table 2Monthly Breakdown of Notices of Liability Issued by the Bus LaneCamera Enforcement System, 2022 and 2023

Month	Stationary Bus Lane Camera	ABLE (on-bus)	Total
January 2022	44,198	3,149	47,347
February 2022	40,844	3,214	44,058
March 2022	49,341	3,830	53,171
April 2022	54,922	3,562	58,484
May 2022	57,939	4,287	62,226
June 2022	56,840	6,266	63,106
July 2022	62,264	4,810	67,074
August 2022	56,799	2,817	59,616
September 2022	50,970	2,694	53,664
October 2022	53,125	3,972	57,097
November 2022	46,028	4,642	50,670
December 2022	49,712	6,494	56,206
January 2023	56,262	11,830	68,092
February 2023	34,090	17,378	51,468
March 2023	49,244	19,003	68,247
April 2023	53,892	13,062	66,954
May 2023	49,407	12,598	62,005
June 2023	46,382	12,258	58,640
July 2023	43,316	12,701	56,017
August 2023	43,638	15,695	59,333
September 2023	41,446	15,607	57,053
October 2023	62,136	14,585	76,721
November 2023	73,024	14,622	87,646
December 2023	72,724	20,366	93,090
Total	1,248,543	229,442	1,477,985

Automated Bus Camera Notices of Liability 2022–2023



Of the vehicles that received a notice of liability in 2022, 86% of vehicles received only one violation, 9% of vehicles received two, and 5% received three or more. Of the vehicles that received a notice of liability in 2023, 80% of vehicles received only one violation, 12% of vehicles received two, and 8% received three or more. This data indicates that, even with the significant expansion of the mobile camera program, the majority of registered motor vehicle owners receiving violations are not repeat offenders.

The notices of liability are also sent to the New York City Department of Finance (DOF) for adjudication. DOF adjudicates all automated camera enforcement violations for the City and has developed a high quality process to adjudicate the violations identified through the bus lane camera program.

Of the total stationary bus lane camera violations that were issued in 2022 and 2023, 92% were not challenged and 8% were challenged. Six percent of the total violations were challenged and ruled guilty while 2% were challenged and ruled not guilty.

Of the total MTA on-bus mobile camera program violations that were issued in 2022 and 2023, 86% were not challenged and 14% were challenged. Eight percent of total violations challenged and ruled guilty, while 6% were challenged and ruled not guilty. DOT Stationary Camera Adjudication 2022 & 2023





The total amount of revenue collected as a result of violations issued by the full bus lane automated enforcement program during 2022 and 2023 was \$106,584,200.86, comprised of \$91,127,285.46 from the stationary camera program and \$15,456,915.40 from the on-bus cameras. In total, this amounts to about \$87 per violation issued. This figure accounts for the graduated fine structure, late payment penalties, and violations dismissed or otherwise not paid to date.

Conclusion

The bus lane camera enforcement program is an effective and critical component of New York City's bus priority approach, helping to ensure that improvements to bus speeds and reliability can be realized by keeping those bus lanes clear of unauthorized users. As the program continues to grow in scale, DOT, in coordination with other city agencies and MTA, is committed to administer the program in a fair and efficient manner.

