## 2016 Housing Supply Report

May 26, 2016

## Board Members

Chair:
Hon. Kathleen A. Roberts (Ret.)
Public Members:
Steven Flax
Cecilia Joza
K. Sabeel Rahman

Helen Schaub
Owner Members:
Mary Serafy
Scott Walsh
Tenant Members:
Harvey Epstein Sheila Garcia

## Staff Members

Executive Director:
Andrew McLaughlin
Research Director:
Brian Hoberman
Sr. Research Associate:
Danielle Burger
Office Manager:
Charmaine Superville


# 2016 Housing Supply Report 

## What's New

$\checkmark$ Permits for 56,528 new dwelling units were issued in New York City in 2015, a 176.0\% increase over the prior year and the sixth consecutive year of increase.
$\checkmark$ There was a $106.2 \%$ increase in the number of co-op or condo units accepted in 2015, to 439 plans containing 19,742 units.
$\checkmark$ The number of housing units newly receiving 421-a exemptions decreased $21.3 \%$ in 2015, to 5,468 .
$\checkmark$ The number of housing units newly receiving $\mathrm{J}-51$ abatements and exemptions increased $8.5 \%$ in 2015 , to 44,259.
$\checkmark$ The number of new housing units completed in 2015 increased $21.0 \%$ over the prior year, to 14,357 .
$\checkmark$ Demolitions were up in 2015, increasing by $24.7 \%$, to 1,887 buildings.
$\checkmark$ City-sponsored residential construction spurred 20,327 new housing starts in FY 2015, 58\% of which were rehabilitations.
$\boldsymbol{\checkmark}$ The City-owned in rem housing stock fell, declining $45.0 \%$ during FY 2015, to 419 units.

## Overview

Between 2014 and 2015 there was a $176.0 \%$ increase in the number of permits issued for new dwelling units, rising to 56,528 , the sixth consecutive year of increase. The number of units accepted by the Attorney General in co-op and condo plans also rose, by $106.2 \%$, with the number of plans rising by $64.4 \%$. But the number of units receiving 421 -a benefits fell for the fourth consecutive year, decreasing 21.3\% from 2014 levels, while rehabilitation of residential units under the J-51 tax abatement and exemption program rose during 2015 , up $8.5 \%$. The number of completed housing units rose during 2015, increasing $21.0 \%$ to 14,357 units, as did the number of demolitions, rising for the third consecutive year, by $24.7 \%$ during 2015. A tight housing market also remains in New York City, with a Citywide rental vacancy rate of $3.45 \%$ and $12.2 \%$ of all rental housing considered overcrowded as of 2014.

## New York City's Housing Inventory

Most New Yorkers live in multi-family rental housing rather than owning homes. According to the 2014 Housing and Vacancy Survey (HVS), ${ }^{1}$ rental units comprise $64.2 \%$ of New York City's available housing stock, $76 \%$ more than the proportion of rental units in the nation as a whole. ${ }^{2}$ New York City in 2014 had a total of $3,400,093$ housing units, the largest housing stock since the first HVS was conducted in 1965. New York City's housing is not only dominated by the size of its rental housing stock, but unlike most cities, the bulk of rental units are rent regulated. Of the 2,184,297 occupied and vacant rental units reported in the most recent HVS, $38.9 \%$ were unregulated, or "free market." The remaining units were rent regulated, including pre-war (pre-47) rent stabilized ( $35.1 \%$ ), post-war (post-46) rent stabilized (12.1\%), rent control ( $1.2 \%$ ), or various other ${ }^{3}$ types of regulation programs ( $12.8 \%$ ). (See pie chart on the following page.)

The HVS also indicated that New York City's housing market remains tight, finding a Citywide vacancy rate of $3.45 \%$ in 2014 , below the $5 \%$ threshold required for rent regulation to continue under State law. This translates into the availability of just 75,458 vacant units out of more than 2.1 million rental units Citywide. The vacancy rate ranged from a low of $2.69 \%$ in Queens to a high of $4.07 \%$ in Manhattan. Brooklyn's vacancy rate was $3.06 \%$, the Bronx's rate was $3.77 \%$, while the sample size in Staten Island is so small that an accurate rate cannot be reported. ${ }^{4}$

Vacancy rates also vary by rent regulation status. Post-war stabilized units had one of the lowest vacancy rates, at $1.63 \%$ in 2014 . Pre-war stabilized units also maintained a low vacancy rate, at $2.29 \%$, while private, non-regulated units were vacant at a $5.60 \%$ rate.

## Number of Renter and Owner Units

## New York City's Housing Stock Is Predominantly Renter-Occupied



Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, 2014 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey Note: Above figures exclude vacant units that are not available for sale or rent.

The frequency of crowding also varied by rent regulation status. Overall, 12.2\% of all rental housing in New York City in 2014 was overcrowded (defined as more than one person per room, on average) and $4.7 \%$ was severely overcrowded (defined as an average of more than 1.5 persons per room). Pre-war stabilized housing was most crowded, with $15.0 \%$ of units overcrowded and $6.1 \%$ severely overcrowded, while $14.6 \%$ of post-war units were overcrowded, and $5.5 \%$ were severely overcrowded. Overall, $14.9 \%$ of rent stabilized housing was overcrowded and $6.0 \%$ was severely overcrowded. In nonregulated housing, $11.3 \%$ was overcrowded and $4.2 \%$ severely overcrowded.

## Changes in the Housing Inventory

## Housing Permits

Housing supply grows in a variety of ways: new construction, substantial rehabilitation of deteriorated buildings, and conversions from non-residential buildings into residential use. The number of permits
authorized for new construction is a measure of how many new dwelling units will be completed and ready for occupancy, typically within three years, depending on the type of housing structure.

Following a dramatic decrease in 2009, the City has issued an increasing number of housing permits each year. In 2015, permits were issued for 56,528 units of new housing, an increase of $176.0 \%$ from the 20,483 units in 2014 (see graph on following page). ${ }^{5}$

Permits increased by triple digits in every borough but Staten Island, where they fell $24.0 \%$. (See Appendix 1 and the map on Page 6.) Brooklyn's permits increased by the greatest percentage, rising $244.7 \%$, to 26,026 units. Newly issued permits also increased in Queens, by $158.5 \%$ (to 12,667 units); in the Bronx, by $148.4 \%$ (to 4,682 units); and by $132.1 \%$ in Manhattan (to 12,612 units).

Permit levels are now higher Citywide than 2008 levels (the previous peak in permits), with permits as compared to 2008 up 104.2\% in Brooklyn, $88.6 \%$ in the Bronx, $63.9 \%$ in Queens, $30.0 \%$ in Manhattan, and $66.7 \%$ Citywide. They are down $56.9 \%$ in Staten Island.

Almost two-thirds of permits issued during 2015
were during the second quarter, in the three months before the 421-a program was originally set to expire. Permits for new units issued in this quarter rose $638.1 \%$ over the same quarter of 2014, even as the number of buildings containing these units rose only $104.4 \%$. The average building size rose in all boroughs but Staten Island, rising by the greatest proportion in Queens, where the average building size in this quarter rose from 11 to 49 units as compared to the same quarter of 2014. Average building size also rose substantially in Manhattan (rising from 52 units to 168 units) and Brooklyn (rising from 14 units to 40 units). Following an extension of the 421-a program through mid-January, 2016, permits issued during the fourth quarter of 2015 also rose substantially as compared to the same quarter of the previous year, rising $122.8 \%$. For historical permit information by quarter, see Appendix 3.

Permits issued Citywide in the first quarter of 2016 were down as compared to the same period of the prior year, with both increases and decreases at the borough level. The number of permits issued in New York City decreased from 6,183 in the first quarter of 2015 to 2,158 during the first quarter of 2016, a $65.1 \%$
decrease. Citywide figures were propelled downward by significant decreases in permits issued in Brooklyn, Manhattan, and Queens, with decreases of $86.5 \%$, $74.3 \%$ and $52.9 \%$, respectively. Permits issued rose in the Bronx, by $54.4 \%$ as compared to the first quarter of 2015, as well in Staten Island, rising 29.5\%. Due to a $67.3 \%$ drop in the average building size Citywide, permits issued for new units decreased in this quarter, even as the number of buildings newly permitted rose by $6.9 \%$. Notably, in Manhattan, where the number of buildings newly permitted in both the first quarter of 2015 and 2016 was 11, the average building size fell from 105 units to 27 units, and fell in Brooklyn from 38 units to eight units.

Permit data can also be analyzed more deeply by looking at the reported size of the buildings applying for permits. In 2015, a total of 1,998 buildings received permits (containing a total of 56,528 housing units). Citywide, $23.5 \%$ of these buildings were singlefamily, $19.2 \%$ were two-family, $10.0 \%$ were three- or four-family structures, and $47.3 \%$ were buildings with five-or-more units. This is by far the highest proportion of five-or-more unit buildings since at least 1996 (the first year data is available). Almost $97 \%$ of all permits

Units Issued New Housing Permits, 1991-2015, in Thousands


issued Citywide were for units in five-family or greater buildings, with the average five-family or greater building containing 58 units for the City as a whole, and 131 units in Manhattan (both large increases from the prior year). As the chart on this page illustrates, almost all building permits in Manhattan and Brooklyn were for the largest buildings, while in Staten Island virtually all permits were for either one- or two-family buildings. Building size was more evenly distributed in the Bronx and Queens. (See Appendix 2.)

## Housing Completions

This report also examines the number of units completed in the City each year, illustrating what housing actually enters the market in a particular year. In 2015, an estimated 14,357 new housing units were completed, a $21.0 \%$ increase from 2014. ${ }^{6}$ At the local level, completions were up in all boroughs, rising by the greatest proportion in the Bronx, which rose 44.3\% (to 2,396 units). Completions also rose in Manhattan, up $33.8 \%$ (to 2,986 units), Brooklyn, up 18.7\% (to 5,324 units), Queens, up 5.0\% (to 3,110 units), and Staten Island, up 2.1\% (to 541 units). (See Appendix 4 for a historical breakdown. ${ }^{7}$ )

## City-Sponsored Construction

Housing is also created through publicly funded sources, including programs sponsored by the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) and the New York City Housing Development Corporation (HDC). HPD's Office of Development operates a number of programs that develop affordable housing for low- and moderateincome New Yorkers. Programs include the Extremely Low and Low-Income Affordability Program, which is HPD's multi-family new construction housing initiative, financed through both public and private sources; the Affordable Neighborhood Cooperative Program, which provides very low interest loans for the rehabilitation of buildings into affordable cooperatives for low and moderate-income households; and the Multifamily Housing Rehabilitation Loan Program, which provides rehabilitation loans at a maximum $3 \%$ interest for the
replacement of major building systems. HDC operates some of the same programs as HPD, in addition to programs such as the Mitchell-Lama Preservation Program, which offers loans to Mitchell-Lama owners in order to make needed capital improvements, and the Preservation Program, which provides tax-exempt bond financing to affordable housing developments with at least 50 units.

HPD- and HDC-sponsored programs spurred a total of 20,327 housing starts ${ }^{8}$ in FY 2015, a 126.1\% increase over the prior Fiscal Year. ${ }^{9}$ Of these starts, 11,842 were preservation, and 8,485 were new construction. HPD and HDC collectively expect to start an additional 18,000 units of new construction and preservation in FY 2016. During the first eight months of FY 2016 there were 12,977 starts by HPD and HDC, an increase of $19.3 \%$ over the prior Fiscal Year. ${ }^{10}$

As part of Mayor de Blasio's ten-year, $\$ 41$ billion plan to build and/or preserve 200,000 units of affordable housing, in March of this year the City Council modified the rules surrounding Mandatory Inclusionary Housing (MIH) to increase affordability requirements when rezoning allows additional residential density. The new MIH requirements will apply to any building with more than 10 units. The specific requirements will be decided at the discretion of the City Council, which has four affordability options to choose from. Per the new guidelines, buildings in rezoned areas must include between 20\%$30 \%$ affordable units, targeted at households making anywhere from 40\%-115\% of Area Median Income. Buildings with between 11 and 25 units have the option to pay into a fund to develop affordable housing off-site. Neighborhoods that are currently under review for rezoning include East New York in Brooklyn; Inwood and East Harlem in Manhattan; Flushing West and Long Island City in Queens; the Jerome Avenue corridor in the Bronx; and Bay Street in Staten Island. ${ }^{11}$

In January of 2016, the Administration reported that they had financed 40,204 units of affordable housing since Mayor de Blasio took office, 65\% preservation and $35 \%$ new construction. Just over 5,000 of these units were dedicated to special needs populations (the homeless and seniors) and $91 \%$ of the units were rentals. By borough, 35.7\% of the starts
were located in Manhattan, with 29.5\% in Brooklyn, $27.4 \%$ in the Bronx, $4.2 \%$ in Queens, and $3.2 \%$ in Staten Island. By affordability level, $5.0 \%$ of the starts were aimed at extremely low-income households, $10.5 \%$ at very low-income households, $61.0 \%$ at low-income households, $6.0 \%$ at moderateincome households, and $17.0 \%$ at middle-income households. ${ }^{12}$

## Tax Incentive Programs

The City offers various tax incentive programs to promote the development of new housing. The 421-a tax incentive program, now expired, was available for new renter- and owner-occupied multifamily properties containing three or more rental units. The program allowed for a reduction in the taxable assessed value of eligible properties. That is, owners were exempt from paying additional real estate taxes due to the increased value of the property resulting from the improvements made. Eligible projects were required to be new construction of multiple dwellings on lots that were vacant, predominantly vacant, or improved with a non-conforming use three or more years before the new construction commenced. Rental apartments built with 421-a tax exemptions were subject to the provisions of the Rent Stabilization Laws during the exemption period. Initial rents were required to be approved by HPD and were then subject to increases established by the NYC Rent Guidelines Board.

A variety of factors were used to establish the level and period of 421-a benefits, and properties were also subject to construction guidelines. Properties received an exemption for 10 to 25 years depending on location, the number of units reserved for low- and moderate-income tenants, and whether they were located in a neighborhood preservation area. Longer exemption periods applied in northern Manhattan and boroughs outside Manhattan, and to projects that received governmental assistance or contained not less than $20 \%$ low-income units. ${ }^{13}$

The 2007 Housing Supply Report outlined major changes in the 421-a program which took effect in 2008, including a major expansion of the Geographic Exclusion area (the area which required $20 \%$ of units
in any given building to be set aside for affordable housing), new limits on the amount of assessed value that was exempt from taxes, and on-site affordability requirements extended to a length of 35 years. The 421-a program expired in January of 2016, and as of the time of this publication has not yet been renewed by the NYS Legislature.

Despite the expiration of the program, 421-a units approved before the expiration continue to be newly certified as they reach completion. In 2015, the number of housing units newly certified decreased for the fourth consecutive year, down $21.3 \%$, to 5,468 units (see graph below), including decreases in every borough but Staten Island. ${ }^{14}$ Newly certified units did increase in Staten Island, rising from zero units to 11, while they fell in the Bronx, by $84.6 \%$; in Manhattan, by $18.1 \%$; in Queens, by $10.2 \%$; and in Brooklyn, by $4.6 \%$.

Citywide, the largest proportion of units newly certified in 2015 were in buildings located in Brooklyn and Manhattan, which contained $38.5 \%$ and $33.0 \%$ of the total units in the City, respectively. Queens had $25.5 \%$ of these units, the Bronx had $2.8 \%$, and $0.2 \%$ were in Staten Island. Because buildings in Manhattan are so much larger than buildings in the outer boroughs, one-third of units were in Manhattan,

Units Newly Receiving 421-a Certificates, 1999-2015, in Thousands

21\% Decrease in Units Newly Issued 421-a Certificates in 2015

despite having only 22 of the 180 buildings (12\%) newly approved for 421 -a benefits Citywide. Notably, while the number of units newly approved in 2015 fell by $21 \%$, the number of buildings containing these units fell by a greater proportion ( $45 \%$ ), indicating that the average building size in 2015 was larger than that in 2014. (See Appendices 7 and 8.)

While the overall (both owner- and renteroccupied) number of newly certified 421-a units fell $21.3 \%$ between 2014 and 2015, the number of rental units in this program fell by a lesser amount, $9.5 \%$. While the number of rental units rose in Brooklyn and Queens, by $20.3 \%$ and $22.3 \%$, respectively, they fell by $83.4 \%$ in the Bronx and $9.6 \%$ in Manhattan. One rental building, containing 11 units, was newly approved in Staten Island, which saw neither a newly approved rental nor owner-occupied building in 2014.

In Fiscal Year 2016, the 421-a program will cost the City $\$ 1.2$ billion in lost tax revenue for all housing types, including 88,000 rental units, 56,000 co-op and condo units, and 29,000 1-3 family and mixed-use structures. ${ }^{15}$

Another program that has offered affordable housing, the New York State Mitchell-Lama program, has suffered from a loss of housing since "buyouts" from the program began in 1985. Between 1955 and 1978, approximately 140,000 units of low- and middle-income housing were built in New York City through this tax-break and mortgage subsidy program. Since buyouts began in 1985, the City has lost approximately 45,000 units of Mitchell-Lama housing (including 4,000 units of hospital/university staff housing), although some has transitioned to rent stabilization. After averaging an annual loss of more than 5,000 units between 2004 and 2007, the pace has now slowed considerably, and only one development (in Manhattan, with 1,651 units) bought out in $2015 .{ }^{16}$

## Conversions and Subdivisions

New housing units are also brought onto the market through subdivisions and conversions. Subdivisions involve the division of existing residential space into an increased number of units. Non-residential spaces, such as offices or other commercial spaces, can also be converted for residential use. As chronicled in prior

Housing Supply Reports, during the mid-2000s, with a tight housing market and high demand for luxury apartments, there were an increasing number of conversions in neighborhoods Citywide. Conversions occurred in facilities as diverse as hospitals, recording studios, power plants, office buildings, and churches.

One indicator of conversions is the number of nonresidential buildings newly receiving J-51 benefits for conversion to residential use. In 2015, one formerly non-residential building, containing 39 units, received J-51 benefits for conversion to a co-op or condo. This is $84 \%$ less units than in 2014, when 243 units (all rental) in formerly non-residential buildings converted using J-51 benefits. ${ }^{17}$

Conversion of single room occupancy (SRO) buildings also continued over the past year. SRO owners may convert SRO housing to other uses after obtaining a "Certificate of No Harassment" (CONH) from HPD. Following a decrease in 2014, approved CONH applications rose, up 52.8\%, from 108 in 2014 to 165 in $2015 .{ }^{18}$

Efforts are also underway to ensure that SROs are used for permanent housing rather than as transient hotels. As of May 1, 2011, laws were newly passed strengthening the City's ability to crack down on housing being used illegally for transient occupancy. Transient occupancy is now clearly defined as stays of less than 30 days, and between May of 2011 and April of 2012 1,820 violations (ranging from $\$ 800$ to $\$ 2,000$ ) were issued to illegal hotel operators (including private apartments, hostels, and SROs). ${ }^{19}$ More than 5,800 violations have been issued since (including more than 1,300 between May, 2015 and April, 2016), ${ }^{20}$ and in late 2012, the City Council strengthened this law even further, increasing fines to up to $\$ 25,000$ for repeat offenders. ${ }^{21}$

As detailed in last year's Housing Supply Report, the NYS Attorney General, using data provided by Airbnb, released a report in October of 2014 that found that as many as $72 \%$ of the company's listings were illegal, and $6 \%$ of hosts (offering hundreds of units for rent) garnered $36 \%$ of all bookings and $37 \%$ of all revenue. ${ }^{22}$ In the wake of that report, and facing pressure from regulators to release data about their business, in December of 2015 and February of 2016 Airbnb released limited data on its New York City
rentals. Focused primarily on listings of "Entire Home" rentals, many of which are illegal in New York City, the data shows that as of February 15, 2016, of the 40,349 listings on Airbnb, $54 \%$ were offers of entire homes. Of the hosts who offer entire homes, approximately $40 \%$ of the revenue comes from hosts with multiple listings, including 10\% from hosts with five or more listings. In a letter to State lawmakers that accompanied the February data, Airbnb reaffirmed their commitment to remove listings from their site that are controlled by commercial operators. ${ }^{23}$ However, a news report from the end of February claims that of the more than 600 hosts who were removed from the site in November of 2015, 134 had relisted at least one unit on the site, with 44 adding at least two. ${ }^{24}$

## Cooperative and Condominium Activity

Developers planning to build new co-op or condo buildings, and owners wishing to convert their rental buildings to co-ops or condos, must file plans with, and receive acceptance from, the New York State Attorney General's Office. ${ }^{25}$ In 2015, the Attorney General accepted 439 co-op and condo plans, a $64.4 \%$ increase from the number accepted in 2014. These 439 plans encompassed 19,742 housing units, $106.2 \%$ more than in 2014 and the fourth consecutive year of increase in units (see graph on the next page).

Almost half of all plans, 209, were accepted for buildings located in Brooklyn; 180 were located in Manhattan; 39 plans were accepted for Queens; nine plans were accepted in the Bronx; and two plans were in Staten Island. Because Manhattan buildings tend to be larger than the outer boroughs, more units were located in Manhattan $(11,476)$, with Brooklyn $(5,265)$ and Queens $(2,567)$ trailing, and only 414 units in the Bronx and 20 in Staten Island. (See Appendices 5 and 6.)

The majority of the plans accepted Citywide in 2015 were for new construction, comprising 342 of 439 plans, and a total of 14,578 of 19,742 units. This is similar to the prior year, when new construction accounted for 210 of the 267 accepted plans. The second largest source of co-op and condo units were


## New Co-op and Condo Units, 2003-2015

Rise in Newly Accepted Co-op \& Condo Units

NYC's housing stock, where more than $57 \%$ of units are in buildings constructed prior to $1947 .{ }^{26}$ Through tax abatement and exemption subsidy programs offered by the City for rehabilitation, units are able to remain in, or be readmitted to, the City's housing stock. The J-51 tax abatement and exemption program is intended to encourage the periodic renovation of New York City's stock of both renterand owner-occupied housing.

The J-51 tax relief program is similar to the 421-a program in that it requires that those rental units not already rent stabilized be subject to rent regulation for the duration of the benefits. Rehabilitation activities that are permitted under J-51 regulations are
units located in non-eviction conversions (with 37 plans and 4,106 units), and 59 plans, with 988 units, were rehabilitations. One plan, with 70 units, was a conversion eviction plan sponsored by HPD. Of all the newly accepted plans in 2015, 91.4\% of the units were in condo plans, and $8.6 \%$ were in co-op plans (see graph on this page).

While the conversion of rental housing into co-op and condo units increases the housing inventory for sale, it simultaneously reduces the total number of housing units for rent. Conversions represented $21.2 \%$ of the total number of units in 2015 co-op and condo plans, a lesser share than the $41.3 \%$ share in 2014. Because most conversion plans are non-eviction plans (including all but one plan in 2015), only when the original rental tenant moves out, or opts to buy the apartment, does the apartment become owner-occupied and removed from the rental universe.

## Rehabilitation

Another method for adding (or keeping) residential units to the City's housing stock is through rehabilitation of old buildings. As buildings age, they must undergo renovation and rehabilitation to remain in habitable condition. This is particularly relevant to

Major Capital Improvements (MCIs), moderate and gut rehabilitation of both government-assisted and privately-financed multiple dwellings (which requires significant improvement to at least one major buildingwide system), as well as improvements to co-ops and condos (subject to certain assessment guidelines if the project does not include substantial governmental assistance). While prior incarnations of the J-51 program allowed for conversion of lofts and nonresidential buildings into multiple dwellings, regulations effective January 1, 2012 allow only for conversions if there is substantial governmental assistance. ${ }^{27}$

In 2015, 44,259 units newly received J-51 benefits, an increase of $8.5 \%$ from the previous year (see graph on the next page and Appendix 8). ${ }^{28}$ These units were contained in 2,175 buildings, an increase of $54.7 \%$ from 2014 levels. The location of the units newly receiving benefits ranged from $39.3 \%$ located in Queens; to $26.1 \%$ in the Bronx; $25.6 \%$ in Brooklyn; $6.4 \%$ in Manhattan; and $2.6 \%$ in Staten Island. Units newly receiving benefits fell by double digits in Manhattan and Brooklyn, by $22.9 \%$ and $20.6 \%$, respectively. But units newly receiving J-51 benefits rose substantially in Queens, up $24.0 \%$, as well as in the Bronx, up $35.4 \%$, and in Staten Island, which rose 309.6\%. (See Appendices 7 and 8.) While the number
of units newly receiving J-51 benefits rose Citywide, the average size of the buildings receiving benefits dropped, from an average of 29 units in 2014, to 20 units in 2015.

In Fiscal Year 2016, the J-51 tax program will cost the City $\$ 266.2$ million in lost tax revenue for all housing types, including approximately 300,000 rental units and 237,000 owner units. ${ }^{29}$

While J-51 is owner-initiated, a City-initiated program will also help rehabilitate $\mathrm{NYC's}^{\prime}$ housing stock. In January, 2011, HPD began their "Proactive Preservation Initiative (PPI)," which identifies those buildings in need of rehabilitation, regardless of whether there are complaints from tenants in the building. HPD works to identify distressed buildings that are actively declining and in danger of becoming blighted and those buildings that exhibit levels of distress that warrant further action are placed on the PPI list. HPD works with these buildings to reduce housing code violations, and once violations have been reduced by at least $80 \%$, buildings are removed from the list. ${ }^{30}$ Through June 30, 2015, a total of 1,078
buildings have been added to the PPI list, and 512 ( $47 \%$ ) of these buildings subsequently released from the program due to improvements in the buildings. An additional 187 buildings ( $17 \%$ ) were found to have a high enough level of violations that they qualified for transfer to the Alternative Enforcement Program (details below). Of the 379 buildings remaining on the PPI list (as of July, 2015), $73 \%$ have shown improvement in building conditions, and violations have dropped an average of $43 \% .{ }^{31}$

HPD is also continuing rehabilitation work through its "Alternative Enforcement Program (AEP)," now in its ninth year of identifying the 200-250 "worst" buildings in the City, based on housing code violations. The most recent group of 250 buildings include 3,704 units of housing, with 6,492 non-hazardous A-class violations, 20,543 hazardous B-class violations, and 5,143 immediately hazardous C-class violations. If landlords in this program do not make repairs to their buildings, the City steps in to do so, and then charges the landlords. Through the first eight rounds of the program, the City has discharged 1,128 buildings that

## Units Receiving Initial J-51 Benefits, 1993-2015, in Thousands

2015 Saw Increase in Number of Units Newly Receiving J-51 Benefits

entered the program, with a combined total of 14,728 units of housing. ${ }^{32}$

## Tax-Delinquent Property

## In Rem Housing

For two decades, the City foreclosed on thousands of tax-delinquent residential properties, becoming the owner and manager of these buildings, known as in rem properties. By its peak in 1986, the City owned and managed 4,000 occupied buildings containing 40,000 units of housing and almost 6,000 vacant buildings containing 55,000 units of housing. Most of these were dilapidated multi-family buildings occupied by a predominantly low-income population. To counter this trend, HPD developed multiple disposition programs over time to manage, rehabilitate and sell many of these in rem buildings. HPD's Alternative Management Programs began in 1994 with the goal of returning City-owned properties to private owners and stimulating neighborhood development. HPD has successfully reduced the number of occupied and vacant in rem units in central management to 419 through June 2015, a 99.0\% decline since FY 1994. ${ }^{33}$

## Anti-Abandonment Strategies

The City has been able to significantly reduce its share of in rem buildings by identifying buildings at risk and helping owners. Key initiatives to prevent abandonment include the Third Party Transfer Program, which targets distressed and other buildings with tax arrears, ${ }^{34}$ and housing education courses, which teach owners and superintendents basic management, maintenance, and finance skills to improve their properties. ${ }^{35}$

Since the mid-1990s, the City has not taken title (i.e., vesting) of properties that are tax delinquent. Instead, the City has developed a comprehensive antiabandonment strategy. First, tax liens for properties that are not distressed are sold in bulk to private investors. After the lien is sold, the lien holder is entitled to collect the entire lien amount, plus other interest and charges, from the property owner. In
addition, the property owner must continue to pay current taxes to the City. If the owner has not paid the lien or entered into a payment plan, the lien holder can file for foreclosure on the property. ${ }^{36}$

An additional facet of the City's anti-abandonment strategy is third party transfer. For buildings that are distressed and in tax arrears, the City can initiate an in rem tax foreclosure action against property owners. The policy, authorized under Local Law 37 of 1996, transfers the title of in rem properties directly to new owners (qualified third parties) without the City ever taking title itself. The properties are temporarily transferred to Neighborhood Restore, a nonprofit corporation, and upon the judgment of the court, are transferred to a qualified third party. ${ }^{37}$ Since it began in 1996, the NYC Department of Finance has collected at least $\$ 536$ million in revenue associated with properties in this program, and more than 500 buildings have been transferred to responsible for-profit and non-profit owners. No new properties were transferred during 2014 or $2015 .{ }^{38}$

## Demolitions

While in the early 1990s relatively few residential buildings in New York City were demolished, this began to change in 1996, the same year that the number of building permits issued began to increase significantly. In fact, the number of buildings demolished between 2005 and 2007 alone was almost triple the number demolished in all the years from 1990 to 1999 combined. But after generally declining during the most recent recession, demolitions have increased for the third consecutive year. A total of 1,887 buildings were demolished in 2015, a $24.7 \%$ increase over the prior year, following an increase of $17.7 \%$ in 2014. Brooklyn accounted for $35.4 \%$ of all the buildings demolished in 2015, Queens had 32.4\%, Staten Island had 14.1\%, Manhattan had 11.9\%, and the Bronx had the lowest proportion, $6.1 \%$. Demolitions rose in every borough but the Bronx, where they fell $7.2 \%$. Proportionally, demolitions rose at the greatest rate in Manhattan, rising $86.0 \%$; followed by Brooklyn, with a $47.1 \%$ rise; Queens, with a $10.3 \%$ rise; and Staten Island, which rose by $3.1 \%$. ${ }^{39}$ (See Appendix 9.)

## Summary

In 2015, housing permits increased for the sixth consecutive year, rising by $176.0 \%$, while the number of completed housing units increased by $21.0 \%$. The number of units newly receiving 421-a tax benefits fell $21.3 \%$ in 2015, while units newly receiving J-51 tax abatements and exemptions increased by $8.5 \%$. For the fourth consecutive year there was an increase in newly accepted co-op and condo units, with units rising $106.2 \%$ and plans rising by $64.4 \%$. Rental housing availability remains tight, with a Citywide vacancy rate of just $3.45 \%$ in 2014, and overcrowding remains a problem. Mayor de Blasio's ten-year housing initiative calls for the development and preservation of 200,000 units of housing, 40,000 of which have already been started, to help reduce the affordable housing shortage.

## Endnotes

1. The New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey is conducted triennially, sponsored by the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development and conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau. Data is based on "Selected Initial Findings of the 2014 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey," prepared by HPD.
2. The U.S. housing stock was comprised of $36.9 \%$ renter-occupied units, according to the 2014 American Community Survey, conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau. To calculate the ratio of renter-occupied units in New York City, staff did not include vacant units that are not for sale or for rent in the total number of housing units.
3. Other units include public housing, Mitchell-Lama, In Rem, HUDregulated, Article 4 and Loft Board units.
4. Since the number of vacant units available for rent in Staten Island is small, and the HVS is a sample survey, the sampling error of the vacancy rate is likely to be large, and thus, the Census Bureau could not calculate an accurate vacancy rate.
5. U.S. Census Bureau web site. http://censtats.census.gov/bldg/bldgprmt.shtml
6. NYC Department of City Planning data. Note that the data is continually updated and is subject to change, including data from prior years.
7. Beginning with the 2006 Housing Supply Report, the NYC Department of City Planning (DCP) defines a housing completion as any unit receiving either a final or a temporary Certificate of Occupancy in the stated year. DCP provided this information for the 2004 calendar year and beyond, and believes it is a more accurate representation of new housing in New York City than previous methodologies which only counted final Certificates of Occupancy.
8. Starts refer to the number of units beginning construction or rehabilitation in a given period.
9. Preliminary Fiscal 2016 Mayor's Management Report [http://home2.nyc.gov/html/ops/html/data/mmr.shtml](http://home2.nyc.gov/html/ops/html/data/mmr.shtml)
10. Citywide Performance Reporting website: <http://www.nyc.gov/html /ops/cpr/html/home/home.shtml>; Accessed May 2016.
11. http://www1.nyc.gov/assets/planning/download/pdf/plans-studies/mih/mih-summanry-adopted.pdf and http://labs.council.nyc/land-use/mih-zqa/mih/
12. "Breaking Records: Mayor de Blasio's Affordable Housing Plan has Financed 40,000 Apartments So Far, Enough for 100,000 New Yorkers." HPD Press Release. January 11, 2016. Extremely LowIncome is defined as 0-30\% of Area Median Income (AMI); Very LowIncome: 31-50\% of AMI; Low-Income: 51-80\% of AMI; ModerateIncome: 81-120\% of AMI; Middle-Income: 121-165\% of AMI.
13. Program information available at: <http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/ developers/tax-incentives-421a.page>
14. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Tax Incentives Program data.
15. "Annual Report on Tax Expenditures," NYC Department of Finance publication, February, 2016.
16. The number of Mitchell-Lama buyouts were provided most recently through the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development and the NYS Division of Housing and Community Renewal, and in previous years through other sources, such as the report "Affordable No More: An Update" by the Office of the New York City Comptroller, Office of Policy Management on May 25, 2006.
17. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Tax Incentives Program data.
18. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development.
19. Mayor Bloomberg Announces Results of City's Efforts to Curb Dangerous Illegal Hotels in New York City After State Legislation Enhances Enforcement Abilities." Mayor's Office Press Release 157-12. April 27, 2012.
20. Office of the Criminal Justice Coordinator, Mayor's Office of Special Enforcement. Inclusive of data through April 82016.
21. "Illegal Hotel Fines Could Skyrocket," The Real Deal. September 12, 2012.
22. "Airbnb in the City," NYC Attorney General, October 2014 and press release, "A.G. Schneiderman Releases Report Documenting Widespread Illegality Across Airbnb’s NYC Listings; Site Dominated by Commercial Users," October 16, 2014.
23. Airbnb Action: Our Community Compact in New York City. https://www.airbnbaction.com/our-community-compact-in-new-yorkcity/
24. "Airbnb's Purged Listings Are Already Coming Back," Bloomberg, February 25, 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-25/airbnb-s-purged-landlords-are-relisting-their-apartments
25. NYS Attorney General's Office, Real Estate Financing Bureau data and the NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Sales Unit. Virtually all accepted units reported are from data provided by the NYS Attorney General. For the purposes of this report, "accepted" refers only to those co-op and condo plans that require offering plans. Those that do not, and receive a "noaction" letter from the NYS Attorney General's office, are not included in this data.
26. Landlord Information/Tax Incentives: J-51, NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development web site.
[http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/developers/tax-incentives-j51.page](http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/developers/tax-incentives-j51.page).
27. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Tax Incentives Program data. Note that, similar to the 421-a program, J-51 provides tax abatements and incentives to both renter- and owner-occupied units.
28. "Annual Report on Tax Expenditures," NYC Department of Finance publication, February, 2016.
29. "HPD Commissioner Wambua, Council Speaker Quinn Celebrate Success of Proactive Preservation Initiative and Announce Publication of the Second At-Risk Building List." HPD Press Release. March 21, 2012.
30. At-Risk Buildings List as of June 30, 2015.
[http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/owners/PPI.page](http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/owners/PPI.page)
31. "HPD Publishes List of 250 Distressed Properties in the Latest Round of HPD's Alternative Enforcement Program." HPD Press Release. February 2, 2016.
32. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development.
33. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development website. [http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/owners/compliance-property-tax-delinquency.page](http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/owners/compliance-property-tax-delinquency.page)
34. NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development website. [http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/renters/online-digitallibrary.page](http://www1.nyc.gov/site/hpd/renters/online-digitallibrary.page)
35. NYC Department of Finance, General Information on the City's Tax Lien Sale Process. <http://www1.nyc.gov/site/finance/taxes/ property-lien-sales.page>
36. "New York City Case Study: Third Party Transfer Initiative: A Solution To Property Abandonment," by Lisa Mueller, Local Initiative Support Corporation report, January 14, 2003.
37. Most recent figures obtained from NYC Department of Housing Preservation and Development, May, 2016.
38. NYC Department of Buildings (DOB) data. Note that demolition statistics include both residential as well as commercial buildings, as the DOB does not specify the type of building in its data.

## Appendices

## 1. Permits Issued For Housing Units in New York City, 1960-2016

| Year | Bronx | Brooklyn | Manhattan | Queens | Staten Island | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1960 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 46,792 |
| 1961 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 70,606 |
| 1962 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 70,686 |
| 1963 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 49,898 |
| 1964 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 20,594 |
| 1965 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 25,715 |
| 1966 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 23,142 |
| 1967 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,174 |
| 1968 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,062 |
| 1969 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 17,031 |
| 1970 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,365 |
| 1971 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 32,254 |
| 1972 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 36,061 |
| 1973 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 22,417 |
| 1974 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 15,743 |
| 1975 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 3,810 |
| 1976 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 5,435 |
| 1977 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 7,639 |
| 1978 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,096 |
| 1979 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 14,524 |
| 1980 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 7,800 |
| 1981 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,060 |
| 1982 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 7,649 |
| 1983 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,795 |
| 1984 | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | 11,566 |
| 1985 | 1,263 | 1,068 | 12,079 | 2,211 | 3,711 | 20,332 |
| 1986 | 920 | 1,278 | 1,622 | 2,180 | 3,782 | 9,782 |
| 1987 | 931 | 1,650 | 3,811 | 3,182 | 4,190 | 13,764 |
| 1988 | 967 | 1,629 | 2,460 | 2,506 | 2,335 | 9,897 |
| 1989 | 1,643 | 1,775 | 2,986 | 2,339 | 2,803 | 11,546 |
| 1990 | 1,182 | 1,634 | 2,398 | 704 | 940 | 6,858 |
| 1991 | 1,093 | 1,024 | 756 | 602 | 1,224 | 4,699 |
| 1992 | 1,257 | 646 | 373 | 351 | 1,255 | 3,882 |
| 1993 | 1,293 | 1,015 | 1,150 | 530 | 1,185 | 5,173 |
| 1994 | 846 | 911 | 428 | 560 | 1,265 | 4,010 |
| 1995 | 853 | 943 | 1,129 | 738 | 1,472 | 5,135 |
| 1996 | 885 | 942 | 3,369 | 1,301 | 2,155 | 8,652 |
| 1997 | 1,161 | 1,063 | 3,762 | 1,144 | 1,857 | 8,987 |
| 1998 | 1,309 | 1,787 | 3,823 | 1,446 | 2,022 | 10,387 |
| 1999 | 1,153 | 2,894 | 3,791 | 2,169 | 2,414 | 12,421 |
| 2000 | 1,646 | 2,904 | 5,110 | 2,723 | 2,667 | 15,050 |
| 2001 | 2,216 | 2,973 | 6,109 | 3,264 | 2,294 | 16,856 |
| 2002 | 2,626 | 5,247 | 5,407 | 3,464 | 1,756 | 18,500 |
| 2003 | 2,935 | 6,054 | 5,232 | 4,399 | 2,598 | 21,218 |
| 2004 | 4,924 | 6,825 | 4,555 | 6,853 | 2,051 | 25,208 |
| 2005 | 4,937 | 9,028 | 8,493 | 7,269 | 1,872 | 31,599 |
| 2006 | 4,658 | 9,191 | 8,790 | 7,252 | 1,036 | 30,927 |
| 2007 | 3,088 | 10,930 | 9,520 | 7,625 | 739 | 31,902 |
| 2008 | 2,482 | 12,744 | 9,700 | 7,730 | 1,255 | 33,911 |
| 2009 | 1,647 | 1,003 | 1,363 | 1,474 | 570 | 6,057 |
| 2010 | 1,064 | 2,093 | 704 | 2,358 | 508 | 6,727 |
| 2011 | 1,116 | 1,522 | 2,535 | 3,182 | 581 | 8,936 |
| 2012 | 2,552 | 3,353 | 2,328 | 1,428 | 673 | 10,334 |
| 2013 | 2,638 | 6,140 | 4,856 | 3,161 | 1,200 | 17,995 |
| 2014 | 1,885 | 7,551 | 5,435 | 4,900 | 712 | 20,483 |
| 2015 | 4,682 | 26,026 | 12,612 | 12,667 | 541 | 56,528 |
| 2016 (1st Qtr) ${ }^{\text {a }}$ | 866 (561) | $482(3,574)$ | $297(1,154)$ | 368 (782) | 145 (112) | 2,158 (6,183) |

$\Omega$ First three months of 2016. The number of permits issued in the first three months of 2015 is in parenthesis.
Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch.

## 2. Permits Issued by Building Size \& Borough (In Percentages), 2007-2015

| Year/Borough | 1-Family | 2-Family | 3/4 Family | 5 or More-Family | Total Buildings |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2007 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 6.8\% | 43.7\% | 41.7\% | 7.8\% | 643 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 18.3\% | 51.7\% | 30.0\% | 1,079 |
| Manhattan | 5.0\% | 1.7\% | 5.8\% | 87.6\% | 121 |
| Queens | 17.1\% | 53.1\% | 21.3\% | 8.6\% | 1,562 |
| Staten Island | 60.7\% | 38.6\% | 0.2\% | 0.6\% | 511 |
| Citywide | 16.0\% | 38.5\% | 29.8\% | 15.8\% | 3,916 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 43.4\% | 17.7\% | 23.1\% | 15.8\% | 373 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 25.0\% | 18.7\% | 56.3\% | 787 |
| Manhattan | 2.0\% | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 98.0\% | 152 |
| Queens | 18.5\% | 42.3\% | 14.8\% | 24.4\% | 755 |
| Staten Island | 50.4\% | 40.1\% | 0.5\% | 9.0\% | 367 |
| Citywide | 20.1\% | 30.0\% | 14.3\% | 35.7\% | 2,434 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 38.1\% | 14.4\% | 20.6\% | 26.9\% | 160 |
| Brooklyn | 0.8\% | 28.2\% | 38.9\% | 32.1\% | 131 |
| Manhattan | 0.0\% | 0.0\% | 11.8\% | 88.2\% | 34 |
| Queens | 29.7\% | 43.3\% | 16.0\% | 11.0\% | 418 |
| Staten Island | 48.0\% | 49.8\% | 0.0\% | 2.2\% | 271 |
| Citywide | 31.2\% | 37.1\% | 15.3\% | 16.5\% | 1,014 |
| 2010 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 9.2\% | 38.5\% | 23.1\% | 29.2\% | 65 |
| Brooklyn | 3.6\% | 31.4\% | 27.9\% | 37.1\% | 140 |
| Manhattan | 0.0\% | 18.2\% | 9.1\% | 72.7\% | 11 |
| Queens | 12.4\% | 67.2\% | 11.2\% | 9.2\% | 509 |
| Staten Island | 71.9\% | 27.2\% | 0.6\% | 0.3\% | 349 |
| Citywide | 30.3\% | 47.3\% | 10.6\% | 11.8\% | 1,074 |
| 2011 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 1.5\% | 35.3\% | 19.1\% | 44.1\% | 68 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 44.3\% | 30.5\% | 25.3\% | 174 |
| Manhattan | 3.6\% | 0.0\% | 3.6\% | 92.9\% | 28 |
| Queens | 21.5\% | 57.0\% | 11.9\% | 9.6\% | 386 |
| Staten Island | 52.5\% | 47.2\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | 341 |
| Citywide | 26.5\% | 48.3\% | 11.3\% | 13.8\% | 997 |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 5.9\% | 39.3\% | 17.0\% | 37.8\% | 135 |
| Brooklyn | 0.4\% | 20.5\% | 36.9\% | 42.2\% | 249 |
| Manhattan | 9.5\% | 4.8\% | 0.0\% | 85.7\% | 42 |
| Queens | 26.8\% | 41.9\% | 16.9\% | 14.4\% | 284 |
| Staten Island | 64.1\% | 34.6\% | 0.0\% | 1.3\% | 298 |
| Citywide | 27.8\% | 32.5\% | 16.2\% | 23.5\% | 1,008 |
| 2013 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 2.4\% | 41.6\% | 12.0\% | 44.0\% | 125 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 19.8\% | 31.6\% | 48.6\% | 364 |
| Manhattan | 1.6\% | 7.8\% | 0.0\% | 90.6\% | 64 |
| Queens | 39.3\% | 32.6\% | 13.3\% | 14.8\% | 399 |
| Staten Island | 55.9\% | 42.5\% | 0.2\% | 1.4\% | 431 |
| Citywide | 29.1\% | 32.0\% | 13.3\% | 25.7\% | 1,383 |
| 2014 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bronx | 0.0\% | 33.3\% | 20.4\% | 46.3\% | 108 |
| Brooklyn | 0.0\% | 19.3\% | 25.8\% | 55.0\% | 400 |
| Manhattan | 1.3\% | 9.0\% | 2.6\% | 87.2\% | 78 |
| Queens | 47.8\% | 25.4\% | 10.5\% | 16.3\% | 448 |
| Staten Island | 68.1\% | 31.1\% | 0.2\% | 0.6\% | 479 |
| Citywide | 35.8\% | 25.3\% | 11.6\% | 27.4\% | 1,513 |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Brooklyn | 5.3\% | 7.0\% | 14.7\% | 73.0\% | 812 |
| Bronx | 2.9\% | 26.3\% | 9.5\% | 61.3\% | 137 |
| Manhattan | 3.8\% | 1.9\% | 2.9\% | 91.4\% | 105 |
| Queens | 31.0\% | 26.3\% | 11.6\% | 31.2\% | 552 |
| Staten Island | 63.0\% | 36.7\% | 0.0\% | 0.3\% | 392 |
| Citywide | 23.5\% | 19.2\% | 10.0\% | 47.3\% | 1,998 |

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch.

## 3. Permits Issued For Housing Units by Quarter, 2005-2015

| Year | Bronx | Brooklyn | Manhattan | Queens | Staten Island | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2005 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 739 | 2,214 | 1,786 | 1,088 | 226 | 6,053 |
| Q2 | 1,646 | 2,705 | 3,466 | 1,441 | 559 | 9,817 |
| Q3 | 1,185 | 1,912 | 1,697 | 2,447 | 558 | 7,799 |
| Q4 | 1,367 | 2,197 | 1,544 | 2,293 | 529 | 7,930 |
| 2006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 1,023 | 2,265 | 2,466 | 1,647 | 296 | 7,697 |
| Q2 | 1,208 | 2,793 | 1,802 | 1,742 | 292 | 7,837 |
| Q3 | 1,134 | 2,308 | 2,553 | 2,318 | 255 | 8,568 |
| Q4 | 1,293 | 1,825 | 1,969 | 1,545 | 193 | 6,825 |
| 2007 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 1,037 | 2,621 | 1,551 | 1,864 | 191 | 7,264 |
| Q2 | 901 | 3,478 | 1,544 | 3,255 | 192 | 9,370 |
| Q3 | 794 | 2,071 | 3,589 | 1,086 | 189 | 7,729 |
| Q4 | 356 | 2,760 | 2,836 | 1,420 | 167 | 7,539 |
| 2008 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 862 | 1,603 | 485 | 705 | 238 | 3,893 |
| Q2 | 701 | 8,970 | 7,623 | 5,497 | 546 | 23,337 |
| Q3 | 695 | 1,520 | 880 | 1,016 | 397 | 4,508 |
| Q4 | 224 | 651 | 712 | 512 | 74 | 2,173 |
| 2009 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 164 | 137 | 151 | 508 | 117 | 1,077 |
| Q2 | 130 | 511 | 716 | 353 | 233 | 1,943 |
| Q3 | 497 | 243 | 336 | 331 | 144 | 1,551 |
| Q4 | 856 | 112 | 160 | 282 | 76 | 1,486 |
| 2010 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 56 | 175 | 326 | 249 | 199 | 1,005 |
| Q2 | 490 | 867 | 166 | 612 | 121 | 2,256 |
| Q3 | 231 | 246 | 176 | 394 | 83 | 1,130 |
| Q4 | 287 | 805 | 36 | 1,103 | 105 | 2,336 |
| 2011 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 205 | 291 | 146 | 411 | 88 | 1,141 |
| Q2 | 508 | 624 | 1,199 | 1,416 | 228 | 3,975 |
| Q3 | 248 | 303 | 391 | 459 | 178 | 1,579 |
| Q4 | 155 | 304 | 799 | 896 | 87 | 2,241 |
| 2012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 564 | 600 | 556 | 197 | 193 | 2,110 |
| Q2 | 619 | 310 | 1,041 | 643 | 134 | 2,747 |
| Q3 | 409 | 1,496 | 421 | 378 | 142 | 2,846 |
| Q4 | 960 | 947 | 310 | 210 | 204 | 2,631 |
| 2013 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 214 | 1,184 | 568 | 428 | 162 | 2,556 |
| Q2 | 1,066 | 1,117 | 1,162 | 730 | 689 | 4,764 |
| Q3 | 336 | 1,918 | 1,708 | 1,006 | 172 | 5,140 |
| Q4 | 1,022 | 1,921 | 1,418 | 997 | 177 | 5,535 |
| 2014 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 379 | 1,725 | 1,809 | 1,067 | 121 | 5,101 |
| Q2 | 583 | 1,617 | 1,041 | 1,471 | 140 | 4,852 |
| Q3 | 736 | 2,675 | 1,506 | 812 | 207 | 5,936 |
| Q4 | 187 | 1,534 | 1,079 | 1,550 | 244 | 4,594 |
| 2015 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Q1 | 561 | 3,574 | 1,154 | 782 | 112 | 6,183 |
| Q2 | 1,269 | 15,453 | 9,760 | 9,182 | 151 | 35,815 |
| Q3 | 1,651 | 1,163 | 1,057 | 250 | 175 | 4,296 |
| Q4 | 1,201 | 5,836 | 641 | 2,453 | 103 | 10,234 |

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch.

## 4. New Dwelling Units Completed in New York City, 1960-2015

| Year | Bronx | Brooklyn | Manhattan |  | Queens | Staten Island |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

[^0]Source: New York City Department of City Planning, Certificates of Occupancy issued in Newly Constructed Buildings.

## 5. Number of Residential Co-op and Condo Plans Accepted for

 Filing By the NYS Attorney General's Office, 2010-2015|  | $2010$ <br> Plans (Units) | 2011* <br> Plans (Units) | $2012$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2013$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2014$ <br> Plans (Units) | $2015$ <br> Plans (Units) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Private Plans |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| New Construction | $235(4,907)$ | $185(3,785)$ | $121(2,810)$ | $151(3,753)$ | $210(5,155)$ | $341(14,575)$ |
| Rehabilitation | 0 | 2 (14) | 11 (106) | 21 (649) | 37 (462) | 59 (988) |
| Conversion (Non-Eviction) | 20 (812) | 20 (457) | $25(1,539)$ | 18 (843) | $20(3,956)$ | $37(4,106)$ |
| Conversion (Eviction) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Private Total | 255 (5,719) | $207(4,256)$ | $157(4,455)$ | $190(5,245)$ | 267 (9,573) | $437(19,669)$ |
|  | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) | Plans (Units) |
| HPD Sponsored Plans |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| New Construction | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 (3) |
| Rehabilitation | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Conversion (Non-Eviction) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Conversion (Eviction) | 4 (59) | 9 (209) | 3 (97) | 0 | 0 | 1 (70) |
| HPD Total | 4 (59) | 9 (209) | 3 (97) | 0 | 0 | 2 (73) |
| Grand Total | $259(5,778)$ | $216(4,465)$ | $160(4,552)$ | $190(5,245)$ | 267 (9,573) | $439(19,742)$ |

*Figures corrected and differ from those found in the 2012 Housing Supply Report Note: Figures exclude "Homeowner" and "Commercial" plans/units. Source: New York State Attorney General's Office, Real Estate Financing Bureau.

## 6. Number of Units in Co-op and Condo Plans Accepted for Filing By the NYS Attorney General's Office, 1987-2015

| Year | New Construction | Conversion Eviction | Conversion Non-Eviction | Rehabilitation | Total <br> New Construction Conversion \& Rehab | Units in HPD <br> Sponsored Plans |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1987 | 8,460 | 1,064 | 35,574 | -- | 45,098 | 1,175 |
| 1988 | 9,899 | 1,006 | 32,283 | -- | 43,188 | 1,159 |
| 1989 | 6,153 | 137 | 25,459 | -- | 31,749 | 945 |
| 1990 | 4,203 | 364 | 14,640 | -- | 19,207 | 1,175 |
| 1991 | 1,111 | 173 | 1,757 | -- | 3,041 | 2,459 |
| 1992 | 793 | 0 | 566 | -- | 1,359 | 1,674 |
| 1993 | 775 | 41 | 134 | -- | 950 | 455 |
| 1994 | 393 | 283 | 176 | 807 | 1,659 | 901 |
| 1995 | 614 | 426 | 201 | 1,258 | 2,499 | 935 |
| 1996 | 21 | 0 | 149 | 271 | 441 | 0 |
| 1997 | 1,417 | 26 | 131 | 852 | 2,426 | 533 |
| 1998 | 3,225 | 0 | 386 | 826 | 4,437 | 190 |
| 1999 | 1,123 | 343 | 359 | 1,029 | 2,854 | 295 |
| 2000 | 1,911 | 203 | 738 | 220 | 3,072 | 179 |
| 2001 | 3,833 | 22 | 1,053 | 124 | 5,032 | 22 |
| 2002 | 2,576 | 260 | 1,974 | 348 | 5,158 | 260 |
| 2003 | 4,870 | 0 | 639 | 418 | 5,927 | 0 |
| 2004 | 6,018 | 274 | 1,550 | 334 | 8,176 | 274 |
| 2005 | 12,210 | 269 | 2,356 | 223 | 15,058 | 269 |
| 2006 | 19,870 | 273 | 6,331 | 0 | 26,474 | 273 |
| 2007 | 19,511 | 248 | 5,441 | 71 | 25,271 | 248 |
| 2008 | 13,998 | 241 | 2,582 | 130 | 16,951 | 241 |
| 2009 | 7,270 | 274 | 725 | 73 | 8,342 | 274 |
| 2010 | 4,916 | 59 | 812 | 0 | 5,787 | 59 |
| 2011 | 4,625 | 209 | 505 | 14 | 5,353 | 209 |
| 2012 | 2,810 | 97 | 1,539 | 106 | 4,552 | 97 |
| 2013 | 3,753 | 0 | 843 | 649 | 5,245 | 0 |
| 2014 | 5,155 | 0 | 3,956 | 462 | 9,573 | 0 |
| 2015 | 14,575 | 73 | 4,106 | 988 | 19,742 | 73 |

Note: Rehabilitated units were tabulated separately beginning in 1994. HPD Plans are a subset of all plans. Some numbers were revised from prior years.
Source: New York State Attorney General's Office, Real Estate Financing Bureau.

## 7. Tax Incentive Programs, 2013-2015

Buildings Newly Receiving Certificates for 421-a Exemptions, 2013-2015

|  | 2013 |  |  | 2014 |  |  | 2015 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Certificates | Buildings | Units | Certificates | Buildings | Units | Certificates | Buildings | Units |
| Bronx | 34 | 51 | 800 | 37 | 63 | 980 | 11 | 29 | 151 |
| Brooklyn | 152 | 208 | 2,921 | 107 | 148 | 2,209 | 80 | 92 | 2,107 |
| Manhattan | 56 | 57 | 2,493 | 29 | 27 | 2,203 | 22 | 22 | 1,804 |
| Queens | 79 | 97 | 1,515 | 62 | 90 | 1,553 | 29 | 36 | 1,395 |
| Staten Island | 4 | 6 | 161 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 11 |
| TOTAL | 325 | 419 | 7,890 | 235 | 328 | 6,945 | 143 | 180 | 5,468 |

Buildings Newly Receiving J-51 Tax Abatements and Exemptions, 2013-2015

|  | 2013 |  |  | 2014 |  |  | 2015 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Buildings | Units | Certified Cost (\$1,000s) | Buildings | Units | $\begin{gathered} \text { Certified } \\ \text { Cost }(\$ 1,000 \mathrm{~s}) \end{gathered}$ | Buildings | Units | Certified Cost (\$1,000s) |
| Bronx | 297 | 28,511 | \$26,919 | 170 | 8,520 | \$13,171 | 173 | 11,534 | \$18,065 |
| Brooklyn | 194 | 6,635 | \$19,091 | 276 | 14,265 | \$26,517 | 252 | 11,326 | \$22,622 |
| Manhattan | 58 | 4,405 | \$6,719 | 69 | 3,678 | \$10,702 | 60 | 2,836 | \$9,675 |
| Queens | 1,355 | 15,928 | \$10,003 | 875 | 14,043 | \$10,885 | 1,680 | 17,412 | \$16,902 |
| Staten Island | 2 | 180 | \$200 | 16 | 281 | \$1,976 | 10 | 1,151 | \$4,177 |
| TOTAL | 1,906 | 55,659 | \$62,933 | 1,406 | 40,787 | \$63,249 | 2,175 | 44,259 | \$71,441 |

Source: New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Office of Development, Tax Incentive Programs.

## 8. Tax Incentive Programs - Units Receiving Initial Benefits, 1981-2015

| Year | 421-a | $\mathrm{J}-51$ | Year | 421-a | $\mathrm{J}-51$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1981 | 3,505 | - | 1999 | 6,123 | 82,121 |
| 1982 | 3,620 | -- | 2000 | 2,828 | 83,925 |
| 1983 | 2,088 | -- | 2001 | 4,870 | 81,321 |
| 1984 | 5,820 | -- | 2002 | 4,953 | 70,145 |
| 1985 | 5,478 | -- | 2003 | 3,782 | 74,005 |
| 1986 | 8,569 | -- | 2004 | 6,738 | 117,503 |
| 1987 | 8,286 | -- | 2005 | 5,062 | 66,370 |
| 1988 | 10,079 | 109,367 | 2006 | 3,875 | 66,010 |
| 1989 | 5,342 | 64,392 | 2007 | 4,212 | 55,681 |
| 1990 | 980 | 113,009 | 2008 | 4,521 | 64,478 |
| 1991 | 3,323 | 115,031 | 2009 | 4,613 | 37,867 |
| 1992 | 2,650 | 143,593 | 2010 | 5,895 | 50,263 |
| 1993 | 914 | 122,000 | 2011 | 11,007 | 54,775 |
| 1994 | 627 | 60,874 | 2012 | 10,856 | 45,886 |
| 1995 | 2,284 | 77,072 | 2013 | 7,890 | 55,659 |
| 1996 | 1,085 | 70,431 | 2014 | 6,945 | 40,787 |
| 1997 | 2,099 | 145,316 | 2015 | 5,468 | 44,259 |
| 1998 | 2,118 | 103,527 |  |  |  |

[^1]|  | Bronx |  | Brooklyn |  | Manhattan |  | Queens |  | Staten Island |  | Total |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Year | $\begin{aligned} & 5+ \\ & \text { Units } \end{aligned}$ | Total | 5+ Units | Total | $\begin{gathered} 5+ \\ \text { Units } \end{gathered}$ | Total | 5+ Units | Total | $\begin{aligned} & 5+ \\ & \text { Units } \end{aligned}$ | Total | $\begin{gathered} 5+ \\ \text { Units } \end{gathered}$ | Total |
| 1985 | 81 | 157 | 3 | 101 | 59 | 73 | 3 | 133 | 1 | 31 | 147 | 495 |
| 1986 | 48 | 96 | 14 | 197 | 19 | 38 | 3 | 273 | 4 | 67 | 88 | 671 |
| 1987 | 14 | 55 | 2 | 130 | 22 | 33 | 1 | 273 | 6 | 83 | 45 | 574 |
| 1988 | 3 | 34 | 2 | 169 | 25 | 44 | 2 | 269 | 0 | 160 | 32 | 676 |
| 1989 | 6 | 48 | 8 | 160 | 20 | 38 | 3 | 219 | 0 | 109 | 37 | 574 |
| 1990 | 4 | 29 | 3 | 133 | 20 | 28 | 5 | 119 | 0 | 71 | 32 | 380 |
| 1991 | 10 | 33 | 15 | 95 | 9 | 14 | 1 | 68 | 0 | 32 | 35 | 242 |
| 1992 | 12 | 51 | 6 | 63 | 2 | 5 | 1 | 41 | 0 | 33 | 21 | 193 |
| 1993 | 0 | 17 | 4 | 94 | 0 | 1 | 3 | 51 | 0 | 5 | 7 | 168 |
| 1994 | 3 | 14 | 4 | 83 | 5 | 5 | 2 | 42 | 0 | 8 | 14 | 152 |
| 1995 | 2 | 18 | 0 | 81 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 37 | 0 | 17 | 4 | 153 |
| 1996 | - | 30 | - | 123 | - | 25 | - | 118 | - | 84 | - | 380 |
| 1997 | - | 29 | - | 127 | - | 51 | - | 168 | - | 119 | - | 494 |
| 1998 | - | 71 | - | 226 | - | 103 | - | 275 | - | 164 | - | 839 |
| 1999 | - | 67 | - | 211 | - | 53 | - | 227 | - | 159 | - | 717 |
| 2000 | - | 64 | - | 499 | - | 101 | - | 529 | - | 307 | - | 1,500 |
| 2001 | - | 96 | - | 421 | - | 160 | - | 519 | - | 291 | - | 1,487 |
| 2002 | - | 126 | - | 500 | - | 89 | - | 600 | - | 456 | - | 1,771 |
| 2003 | - | 161 | - | 560 | - | 100 | - | 865 | - | 564 | - | 2,250 |
| 2004 | - | 238 | - | 691 | - | 141 | - | 1,128 | - | 547 | - | 2,745 |
| 2005 | - | 245 | - | 1,080 | - | 145 | - | 1,545 | - | 477 | - | 3,492 |
| 2006 | - | 334 | - | 1,109 | - | 259 | - | 1,485 | - | 381 | - | 3,568 |
| 2007 | - | 302 | - | 984 | - | 282 | - | 1,407 | - | 308 | - | 3,283 |
| 2008 | - | 206 | - | 925 | - | 252 | - | 1,082 | - | 215 | - | 2,680 |
| 2009 | - | 166 | - | 467 | - | 153 | - | 663 | - | 177 | - | 1,626 |
| 2010 | - | 121 | - | 326 | - | 76 | - | 464 | - | 129 | - | 1,116 |
| 2011 | - | 93 | - | 308 | - | 124 | - | 463 | - | 141 | - | 1,129 |
| 2012 | - | 121 | - | 284 | - | 144 | - | 434 | - | 139 | - | 1,122 |
| 2013 | - | 105 | - | 367 | - | 145 | - | 453 | - | 216 | - | 1,286 |
| 2014 | - | 125 | - | 454 | - | 121 | - | 555 | - | 258 | - | 1,513 |
| 2015 | - | 116 | - | 668 | - | 225 | - | 612 | - | 266 | - | 1,887 |

Note: The Census Bureau discontinued collecting demolition statistics in December, 1995. The New York City Department of Buildings began supplying the total number of buildings demolished from 1996 forward, and cannot specify whether buildings are residential, nor if they have $5+$ units. Demolition statistics from 1985 though 1995 are solely residential buildings.

Source: U.S. Bureau of the Census, Manufacturing and Construction Division, Building Permits Branch; New York City Department of Buildings.


[^0]:    Note: Dwelling unit count is based on the number of Certificates of Occupancy issued by NYC Department of Buildings, or equivalent action by the Empire State Development Corporation or NYS Dormitory Authority. Prior year's data may be adjusted and may not match prior reports.
    $\pi$ Data from 2004-2015 now includes Final Certificates of Occupancy (as with all other years) as well as Temporary Certificates of Occupancy data for the first time. Data will be updated every year to reflect the most current estimates.

[^1]:    Source: New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development, Office of Development, Tax Incentive Programs

