

Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

### VIA MAIL AND EMAIL

May 18, 2017

Karen Mazza Interim Executive Director New York City Employees' Retirement System 335 Adams Street, suite 2300 Brooklyn, NY 11201

Re: Preliminary Determination for Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the New York City Employees' Retirement System's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

Dear Executive Director Mazza:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you and your agency for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit. This letter contains the Commission's findings and preliminary determinations pursuant to our audit and analysis of your agency's Employment Practices and Procedures for the period covering July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

The New York City Charter, Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(5), empowers this Commission to audit and evaluate city agencies' employment practices, programs, policies and procedures, and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for employees and applicants seeking employment with city agencies. Section 832.c provides that this Commission may, pursuant to an audit, make a preliminary determination that any plan, program or procedure utilized by any city agency does not provide equal employment opportunity and recommend all necessary and appropriate procedures, approaches, measures, standards and programs to be utilized by agencies in these efforts.

The New York City Employees' Retirement System, which may herein be referred to as "the agency," falls within the Commission's purview under Chapter 36, Section 831(a) of the New York City Charter, which delineates city agency as any "city, county, borough or other office, administration, board, department, division, commission, bureau, corporation, authority, or other agency of government where the majority of the board members of such agency are appointed by the mayor or serve by virtue of being city officers or the expenses of which are paid in whole or in part from the city treasury..."

The purpose of this audit and analysis is to evaluate the agency's employment practices and procedures, not to issue findings of discrimination pursuant to the New York City Human Rights Law. This



Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits*<sup>1</sup> and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. These standards are founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; the New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code §§8-107(1)(a) and (d), 8-107.13, and 8-107.1); the New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; the Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7); the Americans with Disabilities Act and its Accessibility Guidelines; and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter. Prescribed corrective actions are consistent with the aforementioned parameters.

Since this Commission is empowered to review and recommend actions which each agency should consider including in its annual plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity (Annual EEO Plan), the audited agency should incorporate required corrective actions in its current EEO Program and prospective Annual EEO Plans.

### Scope and Methodology

This Commission's audit methodology includes collection and analysis of the documents, records and data the agency provides in response to the *EEPC Document and Information Request Form;* responses to the *EEPC Interview Questionnaires* for EEO professionals and others involved in EEO program administration; and, if applicable, review of the agency's *Annual EEO Plans* and *Quarterly EEO Reports* and analysis of workforce and utilization data from the *Citywide Equal Employment Database System* (CEEDS).

This Commission reviews the workforce statistics and utilization analysis information available via CEEDS to understand the concentrations of race and gender groups within an agency's workforce. (CEEDS may be unavailable for certain non-mayoral agencies. In such cases, the EEPC requests that the agency submit similar statistics and analysis.) EEO Program Analysts examine imbalances between the number of employees in a particular job category and the number that would reasonably be expected when compared to their availability in the relevant labor market. Personnel transactions are reviewed in order to ascertain the agency's employment practices. Where underutilization is revealed within an agency's workforce, EEO Program Analysts assess whether the agency has undertaken reasonable measures to address it.

EEO Professionals (including, but not limited to, past or current EEO Officers, Deputy or Co-EEO Officers, EEO Counselors, EEO Trainers, EEO Investigators, Disability Rights Coordinators, Career Counselors, 55-a Program Coordinators) and others involved in EEO program administration such as the Principal Human Resources Professional are given a two-week deadline to complete and return their individual questionnaires. The Commission's EEO Program Analysts also conduct additional research and follow-up discussions or interviews with EEO professionals, when appropriate.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Corresponding audit/analysis standards are numbered throughout the document.



### Description of the Agency

New York City Employees' Retirement System (NYCERS) is a defined benefit retirement plan. Defined benefit retirement plans for public sector employees offer benefits which are defined in law. Generally, retirement allowances payable from such plans are based on a member's years of service, age and compensation base. Other types of benefits such as loans, disability and death benefits are also offered and specified in law. All benefits payable are funded by employee and employer contributions and from earnings on the invested assets of the system. NYCERS performs many functions for active members and retirees alike. Among other things, each year NYCERS issues approximately 50,000 loans and processes thousands of refunds and buy-back applications. For retirees, NYCERS verifies retirement allowances, calculates cost-of-living-adjustments.

NYCERS had 437 employees at the end of the period in review. (See workforce composition, attached as Appendix 2.)

### PRELIMINARY DETERMINATIONS AFTER AUDIT AND ANALYSIS

Following are the corresponding audit standards for each subject area along with the EEPC's findings and required corrective actions, where appropriate:

### I. <u>ISSUANCE, DISTRIBUTION AND POSTING OF EEO POLICIES</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.
  - The agency did not demonstrate that there was issued an EEO policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, and advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #1</u>: Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.

 Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies – or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws – for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: a policy against sexual harassment; uniform and



responsive procedures for investigating discrimination complaints and providing reasonable accommodations; an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for the agency's EEO professionals, as well as federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.

✓ The agency adopted the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies (2014), the EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines (2016), and the EEO Handbook About EEO: What You May Not Know, which were distributed annually during individual units' EEO meetings. Additionally, the agency reported that a copy of the aforementioned documents, contact information for the agency's EEO professionals, contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination, and reasonable accommodation procedures, were posted on the bulletin board of each copy/fax room. The EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines (2016), and the link to the EEO policy and addendum, contained an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws. Furthermore, the EEO policy, complaint forms and procedures, and reasonable accommodation forms and procedures, were electronically accessible to all employees via the agency's intranet homepage and electronic shared drive.

### II. EEO TRAINING FOR AGENCY:

Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 3. Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.
- ✓ During the period in review, 422 (95%) employees completed the DCAS EEO Computer Based Training. Additionally, during the period in review, the agency conducted annual in-house EEO training sessions for all employees in each unit; the training sessions included the following topics: General Anti-Discrimination Protections, Sexual Harassment Policy, Disabilities Policy, and Anti-Retaliation Policy. The agency also reported that new employees (as part of onboarding) participated in EEO training conducted by the principal EEO Professional, which included the following topics: EEO Protection Under Federal, State, and Local City Laws, Employment Discrimination and Retaliation, Sexual Harassment, and Specific Discrimination Prohibitions.

### III. <u>EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES (Recruitment, Hiring & Promotion)</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

4. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these



organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

➤ The agency did not assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impacted any particular group. Additionally, the CEEDS Report: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2015 (first quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; this underutilization persisted through the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review). The 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups. (See Appendices #3-5.) Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #2</u>: Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

- 5. The principal EEO Professional, HR Professional, and General Counsel review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required to correct deficiencies.
- ✓ The agency reported that the principal EEO Professional, principal HR Professional and General Counsel met with the Executive Director on an ad hoc basis to discuss HR and EEO-related issues.
  - The agency did not demonstrate that the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs were reviewed on an annual basis to identify whether there were barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required to correct deficiencies. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #3:</u> Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.



- 6. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
  - The agency did not assess the manner in which candidates were selected for employment to determine whether such efforts adversely impacted any particular group. Additionally, the CEEDS Report: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups. (See Appendices #4-5.) Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #4</u>: Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

- 7. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it reviewed relevant utilization data to determine whether underrepresentation existed in titles wherein the agency had discretion in hiring. Additionally, the CEEDS Report: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups, which may include discretionary titles. (See Appendices #4-5.) Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #5</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

8. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service



Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it reviewed relevant utilization data to determine whether underrepresentation existed in *civil service* (list) titles. Additionally, the CEEDS Report Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group, and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups. (See Appendices #4-5.) Corrective Action Required.

<u>Corrective Action #6</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- 9. Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).
- ✓ The agency reported that the Human Resources Professional is the individual responsible for recruiting and hiring. The Human Resources Professional completed the DCAS Structured Interviewing and Unconscious Bias training on October 29, 2015. Additionally, the agency adopted the DCAS Guide to Structured Interviewing; and established uniform questions for each position, the interviews were conducted by the HR Professional, a manager, and the unit supervisor, each of whom were provided the Guide to Structured Interviewing and uniform questions.
- 10. Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for advancement and transfer within the agency by: administering incentive programs; publicizing promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; and/or using other methods to communicate internal opportunities.
- ✓ The agency's principal HR Professional informed employees of each promotional opportunity via electronic mail. Additionally, the agency reported that all job postings were available via NYCAPS Employee Self-Service, internal postings (on bulletin boards), and the agency's intranet page. The agency reported that all candidates were considered based on their skills and knowledge.



The agency did not demonstrate that it promoted employees' awareness of opportunities for promotion and transfer within the agency; or that it administered incentive programs; publicized promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; or used other methods to communicate internal opportunities. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #7</u>: Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for advancement and transfer within the agency by: administering incentive programs; publicizing promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; and/or using other methods to communicate internal opportunities.

- 11. Ensure that employees are considered internally for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer by: providing and encouraging training, development or mentorship programs to improve their performance and skills; establishing internal talent pools via cross-training, cross divisional assignments, job transfers, and/or job rotation; and identifying internal successors with applicable knowledge/skills/abilities.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it ensured that incumbent employees were considered for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer. <u>Corrective</u> action required.

<u>Corrective Action #8</u>: Ensure that employees are considered internally for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer by: providing and encouraging training, development or mentorship programs to improve their performance and skills; establishing internal talent pools via cross-training, cross divisional assignments, job transfers, and/or job rotation; and identifying internal successors with applicable knowledge/skills/abilities.

- 12. At minimum, indicate the agency is an equal opportunity employer in recruitment literature.
- ✓ During the period in review, the agency advertised for the several vacant positions including: Executive Agency Counsel, Computer Systems Manager, Customer Information Representative (part-time), Administrative Labor Relations Analyst, Community Assistant, and Computer Specialist (Software). Each job posting contained the EEO tagline "NYCERS is an Equal Opportunity Employer."
- 13. Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the hiring manager.
- ✓ The agency reported that NYCAPS e-Hire was used to maintain and track applicant/candidate information during the period in review. Additionally, the agency maintained an Interview & Selection Reporting Log for each position interviewed (see §III.12), which captured the following information: Civil Service Title, Job Vacancy Number, Job Opening ID Number, Name of Applicant,



Interviewed (reason why/why not the applicant was interviewed), Gender and Ethnicity, Current/Last Employer, Current and Last Salary, and Recruitment Source.

➤ The Interview & Selection Reporting Log did not capture disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, or reason selected/not selected (or disposition) for each candidate (information that NYCAPS eHire had the capability to capture). Additionally, the information captured in the agency's log was recorded by the Unit supervisor. Corrective action required.

<u>NOTE:</u> Executive Order 21 bans New York City employers from inquiring about a job applicant's wage or salary history, or considering a job applicant's salary history in determining the salary, compensation or other compensation in the offer of employment.

<u>Corrective Action #9</u>: Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the *position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the individuals involved in the hiring decision.* 

### IV. CAREER COUNSELING:

Determination: The agency is in partial compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 14. Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it designated a professional to provide career counseling to employees upon request. <u>Corrective action required.</u>

<u>Corrective Action #10</u>: Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.

15. The Human Resources Professional distributes the identity of the agency Career Counselor and ensures that all employees have access to information regarding job responsibilities, performance evaluation standards, examinations, training opportunities and job postings; ensures that all new employees are advised of the EEO policies, their rights and responsibilities under such policies and the discrimination complaint procedures; informs the principal EEO Professional of the number of 55-a program participants and efforts the agency has made to employ, promote or accommodate qualified individuals with disabilities; involves the principal EEO Professional in EEO-related matters; and promptly consults with the principal EEO Professional if informed of, or suspects that a violation of the EEO Policy has occurred.



✓ The principal HR Professional (Human Resources Director) informed employees of examinations, and job opportunities via electronic mail (see §III.10) and, upon hire, informed employees of their job responsibilities and performance evaluation standards, in person; and of the requirement to complete the DCAS EEO Computer Based Training (see §II.3). The agency reported no EEO policy violations and no 55-a program participants during the period in review. The agency also reported that the principal HR Professional met with the principal EEO Professional on an ad hoc basis to discuss HR and EEO-related issues.

## V. <u>EEO AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS FOR EMPLOYEES/</u> <u>APPLICANTS FOR EMPLOYMENT WITH DISABILITIES:</u>

Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 16. Ensure that information regarding employee rights and obligations, and the complaint, investigation and reasonable accommodation procedures is made available in appropriate alternative formats (i.e., large print, audio and/or Braille) upon request to employees and applicants for employment with disabilities.
- ✓ The agency reported that Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies (2014), the EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines (2016), the EEO Handbook About EEO: What You May Not Know, and reasonable accommodation procedures, were immediately available in large print; audio and Braille formats would be made available upon request.
- 17. Document reasonable accommodation requests and their outcomes.
- ✓ The agency reported that requests for reasonable accommodation, and their outcomes, were
  documented via Reasonable Accommodation Request Form, available to employees on the
  agency's intranet; and that it was the responsibility of the principal EEO Professional to process
  reasonable accommodation requests. The agency reported that there were no requests during the
  period in review.

### VI. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION - EEO PROFESSIONALS:</u> Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 18. Appoint a principal EEO Professional to implement EEO policies and standards within the agency. The principal EEO Professional is trained and knowledgeable regarding city, state, and federal EEO laws; the requirements of the agency's EEO policies, standards and procedures; and the prevention, investigation, and resolution of discrimination complaints.
- ✓ During the period in review the agency designated the *Director of Security & Facilities Operations* as the principal EEO Professional. The principal EEO Professional completed the following DCAS training: *Diversity and Equal Employment Opportunity Basic Training, Training on Effective Complaint Investigations and How to Handle Challenging Situations*, and EEO Computer Based



Training. Employees were informed of the name and contact information of the principal EEO Professional during the *Annual EEO Policy Meetings*.

- 19. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.
- ✓ In addition to the principal EEO Professional, the agency designated the Assistant General Counsel as an EEO Officer, to assist the principal EEO Professional with advising employees of their rights and responsibilities, and to conduct complaint intakes/interviews. The EEO Officer completed DCAS EEO Computer Based Training on August 31, 2016.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that the EEO Officer was adequately trained in EEO laws and procedures and knew how to carry out the responsibilities under the EEO Policy. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #11</u>: Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.

- 20. The principal EEO Professional reports directly to the agency head (or an approved direct report other than the General Counsel) in order to exercise the necessary authority and independent judgment to fulfill EEO responsibilities.
- ✓ The principal EEO Professional reported directly to the Executive Director in order to exercise the necessary authority and independent judgment to fulfill EEO responsibilities. This reporting relationship was reflected in the agency's organizational chart, dated January 5, 2017.
- 21. To ensure the integrity and continuity of the EEO Program, maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
- ✓ The agency reported that the Principal EEO Professional and the Executive Director met on at ad hoc basis in order to discuss HR and EEO related issues; the meetings were also attended by the Human Resources Director and General Counsel.
  - The agency did not maintain appropriate documentation of meetings or other communications between the agency head and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #12</u>: Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.



### VII. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION – SUPERVISORS/MANAGERS:</u> Determination: The agency is in partial compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 22. Establish and administer an annual managerial/non-managerial performance evaluation program to be used for probationary periods, promotions, assignments, incentives and training.
- ✓ The agency established, and administered, an annual performance evaluation program for managerial and non-managerial employees for each year of the period in review. The agency's performance evaluation policy stated, "NYCERS' performance evaluation management system includes an annual (or more frequent if required), documented evaluation of employee or manager performance by their immediate supervisor. The employee appraisal process consists of individual tasks along with performance standards specifically designed to measure performance. Major tasks and performance evaluation standards serve as the primary basis in assessing the employee's ability to perform the day to day functions of their position."
- 23. The managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).
  - ➤ The Managerial Performance Evaluation Form does not contain a rating for EEO responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #13</u>: Ensure that the managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).

## VIII. REPORTING STANDARD FOR AGENCY HEAD: Determination: The agency is not in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 24. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports<sup>2</sup> (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.
  - The agency did not submit to the EEPC Annual Plans of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity or quarterly reports for the years in the period in review. <u>Corrective action</u> required.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Submission of *Quarterly Reports on EEO Activity* is optional for non-Mayoral agencies.



<u>Corrective Action #14</u>: Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

### After implementation of the EEPC's corrective actions, if any:

 The agency head distributes a memorandum informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and re-emphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

<u>Final Action</u>: Distribute a memorandum signed by the agency head informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and reemphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

### Conclusion

The agency has <u>14</u> required corrective action(s) at this time.

Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter, your agency has the *option* to respond to this *preliminary determination*, but must respond to our Final Determination if corrective action is required.

Optional Response to preliminary determination: If submitted, your optional response should indicate, with attached documentation, what steps your agency has taken or will take to implement the prescribed corrective actions, and must be received in our office within 14 days from the date of this letter. No extensions will be granted for the option to respond to the preliminary determination.

(Optional Conference) During the Optional Conference, we will discuss the immediate steps your agency should take and address questions regarding your agency's implementation of the prescribed corrective action(s).

(No Response Option) If your agency does not respond to this preliminary determination within 14 days, it will become the EEPC's Final Determination.

Mandatory Response to Final Determination: Following this preliminary determination, the EEPC will issue a Final Determination where we may modify or eliminate the corrective actions based on verified information; identify remaining action which requires further monitoring in order to ensure implementation; and assign a mandatory compliance-monitoring period of up to 6 months for this purpose. Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter your agency must respond to our Final Determination within 30 days. Your response to the Final Determination will initiate the compliance monitoring period.



In closing, we want to thank you and your staff for the cooperation extended to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's EEO Program Analysts during the course of our audit and analysis.

Respectfully Submitted by,

Nathan P. Conway, EEO Program Analyst

Approved by,

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

c: Craig Thornton, Principal EEO Professional/Director of Security & Facility Operations

Appendix-1
New York City Employees' Retirement System
EEO Job Group Descriptions

# DESCRIPTION OF CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) JOB GROUP CATEGORIES

- OO1 Administrators: Occupations in which employees set broad policies and exercise overall responsibility for the execution of these policies. This category includes: elected officials, commissioners, executive directors, deputy commissioners, chairpersons, general counsels, controllers, chiefs of department, inspector generals and kindred workers.
- **Managers:** Occupations in which employees direct individual departments or special phases of the agency's operations, or provide specialized consultation on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: assistant commissioners, deputy directors, assistant directors, project managers, special assistants, superintendents, deputy counsels and kindred workers.
- OO3 Management Specialists: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of management, finance or personnel, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: accountants, underwriters, financial analysts, personnel analysts, staff analysts, program analysts, buyers, purchasing specialists, inspectors, research analysts, program officers, project coordinators and kindred workers.
- OO4 Science Professionals: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of various scientific or mathematical fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: architects, engineers (chemical, nuclear, civil, electrical, industrial, mechanical, marine), computer specialists, telecommunications specialists, actuaries, statisticians, physicists, chemists, geologists, biologists, foresters and kindred workers.
- O05 Health Professionals: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the medical or health fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: physicians, dentists, veterinarians, optometrists, podiatrists, registered nurses, pharmacists, dieticians, occupational therapists, physician's assistants and kindred workers.
- Oo6 Social Scientists: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the social sciences, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: librarians, archivists, economists, psychologists, sociologists, urban planners and kindred workers.
- OO7 Social Workers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of social work, youth and family counseling, addiction treatment and casework, which is usually acquired through college or training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: caseworkers, probation officers, correctional counselors, juvenile counselors, addiction treatment counselors, eligibility specialists, human rights specialists, community liaison workers, clergy and kindred workers.
- **008** Lawyers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the law and the judicial process, which is usually acquired through college training. This category includes: attorneys, assistant district attorneys, counsels, assistant counsels, deputy counsels, law judges, and kindred workers.
- O09 Public Relations: Occupations which require special knowledge or skills in public relations, journalism, modern language or the fine arts, which are usually acquired through college training, specialized post-secondary school education, or work experience or training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: technical writers, graphic designers, musicians, actors, directors, announcers, painters, illustrators, photographers, artists, editors, press officers, public relations specialists, public relations advisors, interpreters, customer service specialists and kindred workers.
- 010 Technicians: Occupations which require a combination of basic scientific or technical knowledge and manual skill which can be obtained through specialized post-secondary school education or through equivalent on-the-job training. This category includes: health technicians (clinical laboratory, dental hygienists, health records, radiologic

and licensed practical nurses), electrical and electronic technicians, engineering technicians (electrical, electronic, industrial, and mechanical), drafting occupations, surveying and mapping technicians, science technicians, airline pilots and navigators, air traffic controllers, broadcast equipment operators, computer programmers, legal assistants, investigators, and kindred workers.

- 011 Sales: Not applicable.
- **O12 Clerical Supervisors:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for overseeing and supervising the duties of clerical staff. This category includes: chief clerks, supervising clerks, principal administrative associates, supervising cashiers, telegraph superintendents, supervising stenographers and kindred workers.
- O13 Clerical: Occupations in which employees are responsible for internal and external communication, recording and retrieval of data and/or information and other paperwork required in an office. This category includes: cashiers, computer operators, word processors, secretaries, stenographers, typists, ticket agents, receptionists, clerks (information, personnel, file, library, records), bookkeepers, office machine operators, telephone operators, messengers, dispatchers, stock clerks, meter readers, office aides, general office clerks, bank tellers and kindred workers.
- 014 Household Services: Not applicable.
- O15 Police Supervisors: Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officers status set broad policies in the area of public safety and security, exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies, direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations, or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: sergeants, captains, lieutenants, inspectors, captains (correction), wardens and kindred workers.
- O16 Fire Supervisors: Occupations in which uniformed employees set broad policies in the area of public safety and protection; exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies; direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations; or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: lieutenants, captains, battalion chiefs, deputy chiefs, supervising fire marshals, supervising fire prevention inspectors and kindred workers.
- **017** Firefighters: Occupations in which uniformed employees are entrusted with public safety, security and protection from destructive forces. This category includes: firefighters, marine engineers (uniformed), fire prevention inspectors, fire protection inspectors and kindred workers.
- O18 Police and Detectives: Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officer status are entrusted with public safety, security and protection. This category includes: police officer, detectives, correction officers, bridge and tunnel officers, sheriffs, special officers, enforcement agents (traffic, sanitation) and kindred workers.
- **019** Guards: Occupations in which employees are entrusted with public safety and security. This category includes: school crossing guards, housing guards, watch persons, lifeguards, park rangers, school guards and kindred workers.
- O2O Food Preparation: Occupations in which employees are responsible for the preparation and distribution of food, or management of food services, in City facilities (e.g. schools, correctional institutions, and concessions). This category includes: cooks, school lunch helpers, school lunch managers, food service managers, commissary managers and kindred workers.
- **021 Health Services:** Occupations in which employees are responsible for assisting health professionals in maintaining and promoting the health, hygiene and safety of the general public. This category includes: dental assistants, dietary aides, public health assistants, nurse's aides, institutional aides, health aides, orderlies, and kindred workers.
- **O22 Building Services:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. This category includes: custodians, cleaners, caretakers, maintainers, elevator operators and starters, exterminators, pest control aides and kindred workers.

- **O23 Personal Services:** Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort or convenience of the general public. This category includes: housekeepers, barbers, attendants, railroad porters, homemakers, matrons and kindred workers.
- **O24** Farming: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of agricultural/botanical/zoological facilities or grounds of public property. This category includes: herbarium aides, aquarium technicians, botanical gardening aides, gardeners, groundskeepers, pruners, hostlers, menagerie keepers, horseshoers and kindred workers.
- O25 Craft: Occupations in which employees perform duties which require special manual skill and a thorough and comprehensive knowledge of the processes involved in the work in which is acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: mechanics, equipment repairers, telephone line installers, small instrument repairers, brick masons, carpenters, electricians, plumbers, mining occupations, tool and die makers, sheet metal workers, tailors, butchers, bakers, machine operators, locksmiths, precision handworking occupations and kindred workers.
- Operators: Occupations in which employees perform duties which require specialized machine skills which are required through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: printing press operators, high pressure boiler operators, laundry workers and kindred workers.
- O27 Transportation: Occupations in which employees perform duties which require motor vehicle, bus, train, or other transportation operation skills which are acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through other formal training programs. This category includes: bus drivers, chauffeurs, motor vehicle operators, trainmasters, ferry terminal supervisors and kindred workers.
- **O28** Laborers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort, convenience, hygiene or safety of the general public, or which contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. There are no job qualification requirements for titles in this category. This category includes: skilled craft helpers and apprentices, construction laborers, stock handlers, garage and service station related occupations, car cleaners, seasonal park helpers, track workers, assistant highway repairers and kindred workers.
- **O29** Sanitation Workers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the cleanliness, hygiene and safety of the public domain. Qualification requirements, which include civil service examinations, exist for titles in this category. This category includes: sanitation workers, debris removers and kindred workers.
- O30 Teachers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of education and instructional methods, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: teachers, instructors, professors, lecturers, fitness instructors, graduate assistants, fellows, adjunct professors, substitute teachers, trade instructors, education/vocational counselors, education analysts, education officers, institutional instructors and kindred workers.
- O31 Paraprofessionals: Occupations in which employees perform some of the duties of a professional or technician in a supportive role, which usually requires less formal training and/or experience normally required for professional or technical status. Such positions may fall within an identified pattern of staff development and promotion. This category includes: administrative assistants, project associates, coordinators, community associates and assistants, community service aides, research associates, welfare service workers, child care workers and kindred workers.

### Appendix -2

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Composition Summary 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2017 (End of Period in Review)

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:22:21.9

EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL . . . . :

19.05

0.00

4.76

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) WORK FORCE COMPOSITION SUMMARY

PAGE:

0.00 0.00 19.05 33.33 0.00 19.05 0.00 0.00 0.00 100.00

REPORT: EBEPR210

OUARTER 2 YEAR 2017 AGENCY 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 001 ADMINISTRATORS TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER 10188 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR (NYC EM 0 0 0 10189 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR 0 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....: 0.00 0.00 100.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 100.00 AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 002 MANAGERS ----- MALE ----- FEMALE -----ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER EMP CODE DESCRIPTION 09774 DEPUTY DIRECTOR (FINANCE) 10001 ADMINISTRATIVE ACCOUNTANT 10003 ADMINISTRATIVE GRAPHIC ART 10010 ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGEMENT 10025 ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGER 10026 ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 10033 ADMINISTRATIVE PUBLIC INFO 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 10050 COMPUTER SYSTEMS MANAGER 16 82976 ADMINISTRATIVE PROCUREMENT 82986 ADMINISTRATIVE RETIREMENT 82994 ADMINISTRATIVE LABOR RELAT 19 0 95005 EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....: 13 28.86 1.92 7.69 0.00 1.92 0.00 100.00 7.69 9.62 0.00 15.38 25.00 1.92 0.00 AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 003 MANAGEMENT SPECIALISTS ------ FEMALE ------TITLE TITLE ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-CODE DESCRIPTION ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS 1002A ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 1002C ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGER NON 0 1002E ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 12627 ASSOCIATE STAFF ANALYST 0 0 0 0 0 40502 MANAGEMENT AUDITOR 0 0 0 0 0 40510 ACCOUNTANT 54736 CONFIDENTIAL STRATEGY PLAN

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:22:21.9

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS)
WORK FORCE COMPOSITION SUMMARY
2017 AGENCY 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 12 REPORT: EBEPR210

QUARTER 2 YEAR 2017

	MPLOYEES ICE PROFE	SSIONAL	S											
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	ALASK		WHITE	BLACK	FEM	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK		OTHER	TOTAL EMP
13611 COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (TECHNI 13631 COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (SOFTWA 13632 COMPUTER SPECIALIST (SOFTWA 13643 CERTIFIED IT DEVELOPER (AP 13644 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13651 COMPUTER PROGRAMMER ANALYS 13652 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13654 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13654 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13655 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13657 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13658 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13659 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR	14 47 11 11 11 00 0	020000200	0 1 0 1 0 0 0	013110400	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	0500000000	0001000010	0110000000	0003		000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000	1 14 16 2 3 1 8 1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	34.03	8.51	8.51	21.28	0.00	0.00	10.64	4.26	4.26	8.51	0.00	0.00	0.00	
AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC F EEO JOB GROUP : 008 LAWYE														
EEO JOB GROUP : 008 LAWYE TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION		DI ACY	MAI	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-		DINCK	FEN	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	OTHER	TOTAL
30087 AGENCY ATTORNEY			 0	PACIS	ALASK 0	0	0	1	1	0	0		OTHER	3
	1	0	0	0	0	0					0	. 0	0	3
BEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	33.34	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	33.33	33.33	0.00	0.00			100.00
AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC F EEO JOB GROUP : 010 TECHN	NICIANS								FFN	AT E				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WUITE	DIACK	UTCON	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	WUTTE	DIACK	UTCON	ASIAN	AM IND	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL
	WHILE				ADASK									
13615 COMPUTER SERVICE TECHNICIA 13616 SUPERVISING COMPUTER SERVI	00	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	00	0	0	0	000	1
40491 ASSISTANT RETIREMENT BENEF 40493 ASSOCIATE RETIREMENT BENEF	0 0 5 26	12	3	19	0	0	24	13	3	18	2	0	O	72 120
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	31	10.31	2.06	14.43	0.00	0.00	23.20	11.86	4.64	15.98	1.55	0.00		100.00
	MPLOYEES	DUTCODO	,						555					
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION					AM IND	UN- KNOWN		BLACK			AM IND	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
10124 PRINCIPAL ADMINISTRATIVE A	1	0	1	1	0	0	1	12	2	0	0	0	0	18

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
RUN TIME: 13:22:21.9 CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS)

QUARTER 2 YEAR 2017 AGENCY 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM PAGE: 13 REPORT: EBEPR210 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....: 1 0 1 1 0 0 1 12 2 0 0 0 18 5.54 0.00 5.56 5.56 0.00 0.00 5.56 66.67 11.11 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 100.00 AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 013 CLERICAL ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER EMP CODE DESCRIPTION 1022A LEGAL SECRETARIAL ASSISTAN 10250 CLERICAL AIDE 10251 CLERICAL ASSOCIATE 0 0 0 48 11702 OFFICE MACHINE AIDE 12 0 0 21 40526 BOOKKEEPER 0 0 0 0 60888 CUSTOMER INFORMATION REPRE 19 11 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....:  $2.1\overline{5}$   $8.7\overline{0}$   $1.0\overline{9}$   $7.6\overline{1}$   $0.0\overline{0}$   $0.0\overline{0}$   $3.2\overline{6}$   $58.7\overline{0}$   $11.\overline{9}\overline{6}$   $4.3\overline{5}$   $1.0\overline{9}$   $1.0\overline{9}$   $0.0\overline{0}$   $100.\overline{0}\overline{0}$ AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 031 PARA PROFESSIONAL OCCUPATIONS ----- MALE ------- FEMALE -----TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION ASIAN AM IND UN- TOTAL PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER EMP 56056 COMMUNITY ASSISTANT 0 1 0 2 0 0 1 2 1 1 0 0 0 8 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL . . . . :  $0.00 \quad 12.50 \quad 0.00 \quad 25.00 \quad 0.00 \quad 0.00 \quad 12.50 \quad 25.00 \quad 12.50 \quad 12.50 \quad 0.00 \quad 0.00$ 

### Appendix -3

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 1st Quarter of Fiscal Year 2015

PAGE: 12 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO1 ADMINISTRATORS PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05 AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	20000	0 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	22222	.5092 .1745 .1543 .1123 .0068	1.02 0.35 0.31 0.22 0.01	0.98 -0.35 -0.31 -0.22 -0.01	1.39 -0.65 -0.60 -0.50 -0.12 -0.23	0.083 0.258 0.273 0.307 0.453 0.411	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 2 0	2 0 2	2 2 2	.5906 .3841 .0046	1.18 0.77 0.01	-1.18 1.23 -0.01	-1.70 1.79 -0.10	0.045 0.037 0.462	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO 9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 13 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	22 17 2 9 0	28 33 48 41 50 50	50 50 50 50	.5133 .1889 .1297 .1017 .0018	25.67 9.45 6.49 5.09 0.09 2.01	-3.66 7.56 -4.49 3.92 -0.09 -2.01	-1.04 2.73 -1.89 1.83 -0.30 -1.45	0.150 <.01 0.030 0.033 0.382 0.074	O U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	23 27 0	27 23 50	50 50 50	.5345 .4206 .0197	26.73 21.03 0.99	-3.72 5.97 -0.99	-1.06 1.71 -1.00	0.145 0.044 0.158	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON MNGMNT SPECS

PAGE: 14 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	6 5 1 5 0	11 12 16 12 17	17 17 17 17 17 17	.4094 .2958 .1295 .1301 .0022 .0207	6.96 5.03 2.20 2.21 0.04 0.35	-0.96 -0.03 -1.20 2.79 -0.04 -0.35	-0.47 -0.02 -0.87 2.01 -0.19 -0.60	0.318 0.494 0.193 0.022 0.423 0.274	U-80%RUL O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	110	11 6 17	17 17 17	.5718 .4032 .0126	9.72 6.85 0.21	-3.72 4.15 -0.21	-1.82 2.05 -0.47	0.034 0.020 0.321	U-80%RUL O N-05%RUL

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO4 SCIENCE PROFNS

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 15 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	22 4 6 10 0	21 39 37 33 43 42	444444444444444444444444444444444444444	.4568 .1762 .1023 .2258 .0024	19.64 7.58 4.40 9.71 0.10 1.35	2.36 -3.58 1.60 0.29 -0.10 -0.35	0.72 -1.43 0.81 0.11 -0.32 -0.31	0.235 0.076 0.210 0.458 0.374 0.378	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	30 13 0	13 30 43	43 43 43	.6586 .3131 .0201	28.32 13.46 0.86	1.68 -0.46 -0.86	0.54 -0.15 -0.94	0.294 0.439 0.174	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OOS LAWYERS

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

EXTERNAL POOLS
OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

DEBCOME

PAGE: 16 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 0 1 2 0 0	3 4 3 2 4 4	4 4 4 4 4	.5889 .1310 .1020 .0721 .0011	2.36 0.52 0.41 0.29 0.00	-1.36 -0.52 0.59 1.71 -0.00	-1.38 -0.78 0.98 3.31 -0.07 -0.29	0.084 0.219 0.164 <.01 0.474 0.388	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 4 0	4 0 4	4 4 4	.4396 .4738 .0010	1.76 1.90 0.00	-1.76 2.10 -0.00	-1.77 2.11 -0.06	0.038 0.018 0.475	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O10 TECHNICIANS

PAGE: 17 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	69 49 12 57 3 0	121 141 178 133 187 190	190 190 190 190 190	.3514 .3293 .1923 .1005 .0027 .0182	66.77 62.57 36.54 19.09 0.51 3.46	2.23 -13.6 -24.5 37.91 2.49 -3.46	0.34 -2.09 -4.52 9.15 3.48 -1.88	0.367 0.018 <.01 <.01 <.01 0.030	U U O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	89 101 0	101 89 190	190 190 190	.6181 .3662 .0098	117.44 69.58 1.86	-28.4 31.42 -1.86	-4.25 4.73 -1.37	<.01 <.01 0.085	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O12 CLERICAL SUPS

PAGE: 18 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	13 2 1 0	16 5 16 17 18 18	18 18 18 18 18	.2238 .5619 .1348 .0511 .0038	4.03 10.11 2.43 0.92 0.07 0.44	-2.03 2.89 -0.43 0.08 -0.07 -0.44	-1.15 1.37 -0.29 0.09 -0.26 -0.67	0.126 0.085 0.384 0.466 0.397 0.251	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	160	16 2 18	18 18 18	.2093 .7769 .0138	3.77 13.98 0.25	-1.77 2.02 -0.25	-1.02 1.14 -0.50	0.153 0.127 0.308	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O13 CLERICAL

DEBCOME PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 19 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH	WHITE	6	85	91	.1867	16.99	-11.0	-2.96	<.01	0
ETH	BLACK	61	30	91	.5347	48.66	12.34	2.59	<.01	
ETH	HISPANIC	11	80	91	.1509	13.73	-2.73	-0.80	0.212	
ETH ETH ETH	ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 0	79 90 91	91 91 91	.0716 .0039 .0478	6.52 0.35 4.35	5.48 0.65 -4.35	2.23 1.08 -2.14	0.013 0.139 0.016	0 N-05%RUL
GEN	MALE	17	74	91	.2820	25.66	-8.66	-2.02	0.022	U
GEN	FEMALE	74	17	91	.6776	61.66	12.34	2.77	<.01	O
GEN	GENDER UNKNOWN	0	91	91	.0359	3.27	-3.27	-1.84	0.033	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON PARA PROFESSION

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 20 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 1 0 0 0	3 3 3 3 4 4	4 4 4 4 4	.3243 .2673 .2449 .0964 .0025	1.30 1.07 0.98 0.39 0.01 0.11	-0.30 -0.07 0.02 0.61 -0.01	-0.32 -0.08 0.02 1.04 -0.10 -0.33	0.375 0.469 0.491 0.149 0.460 0.370	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	2 2 0	2 2 4	4 4 4	.3798 .5812 .0011	1.52 2.32 0.00	0.48 -0.32 -0.00	0.50 -0.33 -0.07	0.310 0.371 0.474	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

### Appendix -4

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 2nd Quarter of Fiscal Year 2017 RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:18:37 FY2017 Q2

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D D S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO ADMINISTRATORS

PAGE: 11 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISI NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	200000	222222222222222222222222222222222222222	NNNNNN	.5092 .1745 .1543 .1123 .0068 .0247	1.02 0.35 0.31 0.22 0.01	0.98 -0.35 -0.31 -0.22 -0.01 -0.05	1.39 -0.65 -0.60 -0.50 -0.12 -0.23	0.083 0.258 0.273 0.307 0.453 0.411	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 2 0	2 0 2	2 2 2	.5906 .3841 .0046	1.18 0.77 0.01	-1.18 1.23 -0.01	-1.70 1.79 -0.10	0.045 0.037 0.462	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:18:37 FY2017 Q2

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL
OO2 MANAGERS RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 12 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	23 17 2 9	29 35 50 43 52 51	55555555555555555555555555555555555555	.5133 .1889 .1297 .1017 .0018 .0402	26.69 9.82 6.74 5.29 0.09	-3.69 7.18 -4.74 3.71 -0.09 -1.09	-1.02 2.54 -1.96 1.70 -0.31 -0.77	0.153 <.01 0.025 0.044 0.380 0.221	O U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	25 27 0	27 25 52	52 52 52	.5345 .4206 .0197	27.79 21.87 1.02	-2.79 5.13 -1.02	-0.78 1.44 -1.02	0.219 0.075 0.153	N-05%RUL

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:18:37 FY2017 Q2

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

DEPOSITE THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY AND ADDR

PAGE: 13 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	5110500	16 10 21 16 21 21	21 21 21 21 21	.4094 .2958 .1295 .1301 .0022 .0207	8.60 6.21 2.72 2.73 0.05 0.43	-3.60 4.79 -2.72 2.27 -0.05 -0.43	-1.60 2.29 -1.77 1.47 -0.22 -0.67	0.055 0.011 0.039 0.071 0.415 0.253	U-80%RUL 0 U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	150	15 6 21	21 21 21	.5718 .4032 .0126	12.01 8.47 0.26	-6.01 6.53 -0.26	-2.65 2.91 -0.52	<.01 <.01 0.302	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D D S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 14

PROGRAM: EBPPP961

EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

PERSONS WITH MISSING FEED NOT

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH	WHITE	21	26	47	.4568	21.47	-0.47	-0.14	0.445	
ETH ETH ETH ETH	BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN	6 6 14 0	41 41 33 47	47 47 47 47	.1762 .1023 .2258 .0024	8.28 4.81 10.61 0.11	-2.28 1.19 3.39 -0.11	-0.87 0.57 1.18 -0.34	0.191 0.283 0.119 0.368	N-05%RUL
ETH GEN	ETH UNKNOWN MALE	34	47	47	.0315	1.48	-1.48 3.05	0.94	0.108	N-05%RUL
GEN	FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	13	3 4 4 7	47 47	3131	14.72	-1.72 -0.94	-0.54 -0.98	0.295	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OOS LAWYERS

DEPOCATE

DE

PAGE: 15 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEC VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 1 0 0 0 0	22223333	помере	.5889 .1310 .1020 .0721 .0011	1.77 0.39 0.31 0.22 0.00 0.06	-0.77 0.61 0.69 -0.22 -0.00	-0.90 1.04 1.32 -0.48 -0.06 -0.25	0.184 0.149 0.093 0.315 0.477 0.402	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	1 2 0	2 1 3	3 3	.4396 .4738 .0010	1.32 1.42 0.00	-0.32 0.58 -0.00	-0.37 0.67 -0.05	0.355 0.252 0.478	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O10 TECHNICIANS

PAGE: 16 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	76 43 13 59 3	118 151 181 135 191 194	194 194 194 194 194 194	.3514 .3293 .1923 .1005 .0027 .0182	68.17 63.88 37.31 19.50 0.52 3.53	7.83 -20.9 -24.3 39.50 2.48 -3.53	1.18 -3.19 -4.43 9.43 3.43 -1.90	0.120 <.01 <.01 <.01 <.01 0.029	U U O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	83 111 0	111 83 194	194 194 194	.6181 .3662 .0098	119.91 71.04 1.90	-36.9 39.96 -1.90	-5.45 5.95 -1.39	<.01 <.01 0.083	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O12 CLERICAL SUPS

PAGE: 17

PROGRAM: EBPPP961

EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

PERSONS WITH MISSING DOCUMENTS OF THE PERSONS

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	12 3 1 0 0	16 6 15 17 18 18	18 18 18 18	.2238 .5619 .1348 .0511 .0038 .0245	4.03 10.11 2.43 0.92 0.07 0.44	-2.03 1.89 0.57 0.08 -0.07 -0.44	-1.15 0.90 0.40 0.09 -0.26 -0.67	0.126 0.185 0.346 0.466 0.397 0.251	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	15 0	15 3 18	18 18 18	.2093 .7769 .0138	3.77 13.98 0.25	-0.77 1.02 -0.25	-0.44 0.58 -0.50	0.328 0.283 0.308	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O13 CLERICAL

PAGE: 18 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	62 12 11 1	87 30 80 81 91	922 922 922 922 922 922	.1867 .5347 .1509 .0716 .0039 .0478	17.18 49.19 13.88 6.59 0.36 4.40	-12.2 12.81 -1.88 4.41 0.64 -3.40	-3.26 2.68 -0.55 1.78 1.07 -1.66	<.01 <.01 0.292 0.037 0.142 0.048	U O N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	18 74 0	74 18 92	92 92 92	.2820 .6776 .0359	25.94 62.34 3.30	-7.94 11.66 -3.30	-1.84 2.60 -1.85	0.033 <.01 0.032	U-80%RUL O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D D S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O31 PARA PROFESSION

DEBOOM

PAGE: 19 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	131300	7 5 7 5 8	8 8 8 8 8 8	.3243 .2673 .2449 .0964 .0025	2.59 2.14 1.96 0.77 0.02 0.22	-1.59 0.86 -0.96 2.23 -0.02 -0.22	-1.20 0.69 -0.79 2.67 -0.14 -0.47	0.114 0.246 0.215 <.01 0.444 0.319	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	3 5 0	5 3 8	8 8	.3798 .5812 .0011	3.04 4.65 0.01	-0.04 0.35 -0.01	-0.03 0.25 -0.09	0.489 0.401 0.463	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

### Appendix -5

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 3rd Quarter of Fiscal Year 2017

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO1 ADMINISTRATORS

PAGE: 11 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 0 0 0 0	0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1	.5092 .1745 .1543 .1123 .0068	0.51 0.17 0.15 0.11 0.01 0.02	0.49 -0.17 -0.15 -0.11 -0.01	0.98 -0.46 -0.43 -0.36 -0.08 -0.16	0.163 0.323 0.335 0.361 0.467 0.437	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 1 0	1 0 1	1 1 1	.5906 .3841 .0046	0.59 0.38 0.00	-0.59 0.62 -0.00	-1.20 1.27 -0.07	0.115 0.103 0.473	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PAGE: 12 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

CEEDSSYSTEM

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO2 MANAGERS

RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	24 18 2 9 0	30 36 52 45 54 53	54 54 54 54 54	.5133 .1889 .1297 .1017 .0018	27.72 10.20 7.00 5.49 0.10 2.17	-3.72 7.80 -5.00 3.51 -0.10 -1.17	-1.01 2.71 -2.03 1.58 -0.31 -0.81	0.156 <.01 0.021 0.057 0.378 0.209	0 U N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	27 27 0	27 27 54	54 54 54	.5345 .4206 .0197	28.86 22.71 1.06	-1.86 4.29 -1.06	-0.51 1.18 -1.04	0.306 0.119 0.149	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO3 MNGMNT SPECS

PAGE: 13 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH	WHITE BLACK	7	16 12	23 23	.4094	9.42	-2.42 4.20	-1.02 1.92	0.153	U-80%RUL
ETH	HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL	0	23 18	23 23	.1295	2.98	-2.98 2.01	-1.85	0.032	U-80%RUL
ETH	NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	0	23 23	23 23	.0022	0.05	-0.05	-0.23 -0.70	0.411	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	7 16 0	16 7 23	23 23 23	.5718 .4032 .0126	13.15 9.27 0.29	-6.15 6.73 -0.29	-2.59 2.86 -0.54	<.01 <.01 0.294	U O N-05%RUL

PAGE: 14 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO4 SCIENCE PROFNS

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	20 7 6 14 0	27 40 41 33 47 47	47 47 47 47 47	.4568 .1762 .1023 .2258 .0024 .0315	21.47 8.28 4.81 10.61 0.11 1.48	-1.47 -1.28 1.19 3.39 -0.11 -1.48	-0.43 -0.49 0.57 1.18 -0.34 -1.24	0.333 0.312 0.283 0.119 0.368 0.108	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	34 13 0	13 34 47	47 47 47	.6586 .3131 .0201	30.95 14.72 0.94	3.05 -1.72 -0.94	0.94 -0.54 -0.98	0.174 0.295 0.163	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OOS LAWYERS

OOS LAWYERS

PAGE: 15 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	0 1 1 0 0 0 1	300000000000000000000000000000000000000	припри	.5889 .1310 .1020 .0721 .0011 .0200	1.77 0.39 0.31 0.22 0.00 0.06	-1.77 0.61 0.69 -0.22 -0.00 0.94	-2.07 1.04 1.32 -0.48 -0.06 3.88	0.019 0.149 0.093 0.315 0.477	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 3 0	3 0 3	3 3 3	.4396 .4738 .0010	1.32 1.42 0.00	-1.32 1.58 -0.00	-1.53 1.83 -0.05	0.063 0.034 0.478	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

PAGE: 16 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O10 TECHNICIANS

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	74 42 13 59 3	117 149 178 132 188 191	191 191 191 191 191	.3514 .3293 .1923 .1005 .0027 .0182	67.12 62.90 36.73 19.20 0.52 3.48	6.88 -20.9 -23.7 39.80 2.48 -3.48	1.04 -3.22 -4.36 9.58 3.46 -1.88	0.148 <.01 <.01 <.01 <.01 0.030	U U O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	110	110 81 191	191 191 191	.6181 .3662 .0098	118.06 69.94 1.87	-37.1 40.06 -1.87	-5.52 6.02 -1.37	<.01 <.01 0.085	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OLERICAL

PAGE: 18 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	5 66 12 9 1	89 28 82 85 93 93	94 94 94 94 94	.1867 .5347 .1509 .0716 .0039 .0478	17.55 50.26 14.18 6.73 0.37 4.49	-12.5 15.74 -2.18 2.27 0.63 -3.49	-3.32 3.25 -0.63 0.91 1.05 -1.69	<.01 <.01 0.265 0.182 0.147 0.046	U O N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	17 77 0	77 17 94	94 94 94	.2820 .6776 .0359	26.51 63.69 3.37	-9.51 13.31 -3.37	-2.18 2.94 -1.87	0.015 <.01 0.031	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O12 CLERICAL SUPS

PAGE: 17 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	14 3 1 0 0	18 6 17 19 20 20	20 20 20 20 20	.2238 .5619 .1348 .0511 .0038 .0245	4.48 11.24 2.70 1.02 0.08 0.49	-2.48 2.76 0.30 -0.02 -0.08 -0.49	-1.33 1.24 0.20 -0.02 -0.28 -0.71	0.092 0.107 0.421 0.491 0.391 0.239	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	16 0	16 4 20	20 20 20	.2093 .7769 .0138	4.19 15.54 0.28	-0.19 0.46 -0.28	-0.10 0.25 -0.53	0.459 0.402 0.298	N-05%RUL

PAGE: 19 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON PARA PROFESSION AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 3 0 0	7 5 7 5 8 8	8 8 8 8 8	.3243 .2673 .2449 .0964 .0025	2.59 2.14 1.96 0.77 0.02 0.22	-1.59 0.86 -0.96 2.23 -0.02 -0.22	-1.20 0.69 -0.79 2.67 -0.14 -0.47	0.114 0.246 0.215 <.01 0.444 0.319	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	3 5 0	5 3 8	8 8 8	.3798 .5812 .0011	3.04 4.65 0.01	-0.04 0.35 -0.01	-0.03 0.25 -0.09	0.489 0.401 0.463	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8



Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 676.2724 fax

#### BY MAIL AND EMAIL

June 13, 2017

Karen Mazza Interim Executive Director New York City Employees' Retirement System 335 Adams Street, Suite 2300 Brooklyn, NY 11201

RE: Audit Resolution #2017/211-009: Final Determination Pursuant to the Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of New York City Employees' Retirement System's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

#### Dear Executive Director Mazza:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you and your agency for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit.

As the EEPC did not receive the New York City Employees' Retirement System's response to our May 16, 2017 Preliminary Determination within 14 days from the date of its issuance, and consistent with the audit protocol referenced therein, the attached Determination is now Final.

As indicated in our Preliminary Determination, this Commission has adopted uniform standards¹ to assess agencies' employment practices and programs for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. The attached Determination contains the Commission's findings and required corrective actions pertaining to the referenced review, evaluation and monitoring of your agency's employment practices and procedures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code, §§8-107.1(a) and 8-107.13(d)); New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7) and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter.



Chapter 36, Section 832.c of the New York City Charter requires that: 1) the EEPC assign a 6-month compliance period to monitor your agency's efforts to eliminate remaining required corrective actions; and 2) the agency provide a written response within 30 days from the date of this letter indicating corrective action taken.

The assigned compliance-monitoring period is: <u>JULY 2017 to DECEMBER 2017</u>.

If corrective actions remain: Your agency's response should indicate what steps your agency has taken, or will take, to implement the corrective actions during the designated period. Documentation which supports the implementation of each corrective action shall be uploaded to TeamCentral, the EEPC's Automated Compliance-Monitoring System. Your agency will be monitored monthly until all corrective actions have been implemented. Instruction on how to access and navigate TeamCentral is attached. Upon your agency's completion of the final corrective action, this Commission requires that your agency upload a final memorandum signed by the agency head which informs employees of the changes implemented pursuant to our audit and re-emphasizes commitment to the EEO program. Upon receipt of the final memorandum, the EEPC will issue a Determination of Compliance.

If no corrective actions remain: Your agency is exempt from the aforementioned monitoring period. However, this Commission requires a final memorandum signed by the agency head which informs employees of the changes implemented pursuant to our audit and re-emphasizes commitment to the EEO program. This will be considered your agency's final action. Upon receipt of the memo, a Determination of Compliance will be issued.

If there are further questions regarding this Final Determination or the compliance-monitoring process, please have the Principal EEO Professional call Nathan Conway at 212-615-8946.

Thank you and your staff for your continued cooperation.

Sincerely,

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

c: Craig Thornton, Principal EEO Professional/Director of Security & Facility Operations



Angela Cabrera
Malini Cadambi Daniel
Elaine S. Reiss, Esq.
Arva R. Rice
Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel/ Deputy Director

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

#### VIA MAIL AND EMAIL

May 18, 2017

Karen Mazza Interim Executive Director New York City Employees' Retirement System 335 Adams Street, suite 2300 Brooklyn, NY 11201

Re: Preliminary Determination for Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the New York City Employees' Retirement System's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

Dear Executive Director Mazza:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (Commission or EEPC), thank you and your agency for the cooperation extended to our staff during the course of this audit. This letter contains the Commission's findings and preliminary determinations pursuant to our audit and analysis of your agency's Employment Practices and Procedures for the period covering July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

The New York City Charter, Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(5), empowers this Commission to audit and evaluate city agencies' employment practices, programs, policies and procedures, and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for employees and applicants seeking employment with city agencies. Section 832.c provides that this Commission may, pursuant to an audit, make a preliminary determination that any plan, program or procedure utilized by any city agency does not provide equal employment opportunity and recommend all necessary and appropriate procedures, approaches, measures, standards and programs to be utilized by agencies in these efforts.

The New York City Employees' Retirement System, which may herein be referred to as "the agency," falls within the Commission's purview under Chapter 36, Section 831(a) of the New York City Charter, which delineates city agency as any "city, county, borough or other office, administration, board, department, division, commission, bureau, corporation, authority, or other agency of government where the majority of the board members of such agency are appointed by the mayor or serve by virtue of being city officers or the expenses of which are paid in whole or in part from the city treasury..."

The purpose of this audit and analysis is to evaluate the agency's employment practices and procedures, not to issue findings of discrimination pursuant to the New York City Human Rights Law. This



Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits*<sup>1</sup> and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for municipal government employees and job applicants. These standards are founded upon and consistent with federal, state and local laws, regulations, procedures and policies including, but not limited to, the Citywide Equal Employment Opportunity Policy - Standards and Procedures to be Utilized by City Agencies; the New York City Human Rights Law (NYC Administrative Code §§8-107(1)(a) and (d), 8-107.13, and 8-107.1); the New York State Civil Service Law §55-a; the Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (29 CFR §§1607.3 - 1607.7); the Americans with Disabilities Act and its Accessibility Guidelines; and the equal employment opportunity requirements of the New York City Charter. Prescribed corrective actions are consistent with the aforementioned parameters.

Since this Commission is empowered to review and recommend actions which each agency should consider including in its annual plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity (Annual EEO Plan), the audited agency should incorporate required corrective actions in its current EEO Program and prospective Annual EEO Plans.

### Scope and Methodology

This Commission's audit methodology includes collection and analysis of the documents, records and data the agency provides in response to the *EEPC Document and Information Request Form;* responses to the *EEPC Interview Questionnaires* for EEO professionals and others involved in EEO program administration; and, if applicable, review of the agency's *Annual EEO Plans* and *Quarterly EEO Reports* and analysis of workforce and utilization data from the *Citywide Equal Employment Database System* (CEEDS).

This Commission reviews the workforce statistics and utilization analysis information available via CEEDS to understand the concentrations of race and gender groups within an agency's workforce. (CEEDS may be unavailable for certain non-mayoral agencies. In such cases, the EEPC requests that the agency submit similar statistics and analysis.) EEO Program Analysts examine imbalances between the number of employees in a particular job category and the number that would reasonably be expected when compared to their availability in the relevant labor market. Personnel transactions are reviewed in order to ascertain the agency's employment practices. Where underutilization is revealed within an agency's workforce, EEO Program Analysts assess whether the agency has undertaken reasonable measures to address it.

EEO Professionals (including, but not limited to, past or current EEO Officers, Deputy or Co-EEO Officers, EEO Counselors, EEO Trainers, EEO Investigators, Disability Rights Coordinators, Career Counselors, 55-a Program Coordinators) and others involved in EEO program administration such as the Principal Human Resources Professional are given a two-week deadline to complete and return their individual questionnaires. The Commission's EEO Program Analysts also conduct additional research and follow-up discussions or interviews with EEO professionals, when appropriate.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Corresponding audit/analysis standards are numbered throughout the document.



### Description of the Agency

New York City Employees' Retirement System (NYCERS) is a defined benefit retirement plan. Defined benefit retirement plans for public sector employees offer benefits which are defined in law. Generally, retirement allowances payable from such plans are based on a member's years of service, age and compensation base. Other types of benefits such as loans, disability and death benefits are also offered and specified in law. All benefits payable are funded by employee and employer contributions and from earnings on the invested assets of the system. NYCERS performs many functions for active members and retirees alike. Among other things, each year NYCERS issues approximately 50,000 loans and processes thousands of refunds and buy-back applications. For retirees, NYCERS verifies retirement allowances, calculates cost-of-living-adjustments.

NYCERS had 437 employees at the end of the period in review. (See workforce composition, attached as Appendix 2.)

#### PRELIMINARY DETERMINATIONS AFTER AUDIT AND ANALYSIS

Following are the corresponding audit standards for each subject area along with the EEPC's findings and required corrective actions, where appropriate:

### I. ISSUANCE, DISTRIBUTION AND POSTING OF EEO POLICIES: Determination: The agency is in partial compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.
  - The agency did not demonstrate that there was issued an EEO policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, and advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #1</u>: Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.

 Distribute/Post a paper or electronic copy of the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies – or an agency EEO Policy that conforms to city, state and federal laws – for use by managers, supervisors, and legal, human resources and EEO professionals. Include, or attach as addenda: a policy against sexual harassment; uniform and



responsive procedures for investigating discrimination complaints and providing reasonable accommodations; an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws; and current contact information for the agency's EEO professionals, as well as federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination.

✓ The agency adopted the Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies (2014), the EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines (2016), and the EEO Handbook About EEO: What You May Not Know, which were distributed annually during individual units' EEO meetings. Additionally, the agency reported that a copy of the aforementioned documents, contact information for the agency's EEO professionals, contact information for federal, state and local agencies that enforce laws against discrimination, and reasonable accommodation procedures, were posted on the bulletin board of each copy/fax room. The EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines (2016), and the link to the EEO policy and addendum, contained an up-to-date list of protected classes under NYC and NYS Human Rights Laws. Furthermore, the EEO policy, complaint forms and procedures, and reasonable accommodation forms and procedures, were electronically accessible to all employees via the agency's intranet homepage and electronic shared drive.

### II. EEO TRAINING FOR AGENCY:

Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 3. Establish and implement an EEO training plan for new and existing employees to ensure that all individuals who work within the agency, including managers and supervisors, receive training on unlawful discriminatory practices under local, state and federal EEO laws; EEO rights and/or responsibilities; discrimination complaint and investigation procedures; prevention of sexual harassment; and reasonable accommodation procedures.
- ✓ During the period in review, 422 (95%) employees completed the DCAS EEO Computer Based Training. Additionally, during the period in review, the agency conducted annual in-house EEO training sessions for all employees in each unit; the training sessions included the following topics: General Anti-Discrimination Protections, Sexual Harassment Policy, Disabilities Policy, and Anti-Retaliation Policy. The agency also reported that new employees (as part of onboarding) participated in EEO training conducted by the principal EEO Professional, which included the following topics: EEO Protection Under Federal, State, and Local City Laws, Employment Discrimination and Retaliation, Sexual Harassment, and Specific Discrimination Prohibitions.

### III. <u>EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES (Recruitment, Hiring & Promotion)</u>: Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

4. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these



organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

➤ The agency did not assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impacted any particular group. Additionally, the CEEDS Report: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 1<sup>st</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2015 (first quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; this underutilization persisted through the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review). The 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups. (See Appendices #3-5.) Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #2</u>: Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.

- 5. The principal EEO Professional, HR Professional, and General Counsel review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required to correct deficiencies.
- ✓ The agency reported that the principal EEO Professional, principal HR Professional and General Counsel met with the Executive Director on an ad hoc basis to discuss HR and EEO-related issues.
  - The agency did not demonstrate that the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs were reviewed on an annual basis to identify whether there were barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required to correct deficiencies. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #3:</u> Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.



- 6. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment, to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
  - The agency did not assess the manner in which candidates were selected for employment to determine whether such efforts adversely impacted any particular group. Additionally, the CEEDS Report: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups. (See Appendices #4-5.) Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #4</u>: Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

- 7. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it reviewed relevant utilization data to determine whether underrepresentation existed in titles wherein the agency had discretion in hiring. Additionally, the CEEDS Report: Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups, which may include discretionary titles. (See Appendices #4-5.) Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #5</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

8. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service



Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

The agency did not demonstrate that it reviewed relevant utilization data to determine whether underrepresentation existed in *civil service* (list) titles. Additionally, the CEEDS Report Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools for the 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (last quarter of the period in review) indicated underutilization of Blacks and Hispanics in the Technicians job group; and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter of fiscal year 2017 (most recent quarter available) indicated underutilization of Blacks in the Technicians job group, and of Hispanics in the Managers and Technicians job groups. (See Appendices #4-5.) Corrective Action Required.

<u>Corrective Action #6</u>: If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in *civil service* (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- 9. Ensure that human resources professionals, managers, supervisors, and other personnel involved in recruiting and hiring are trained to consider EEO laws/policies and use uniform, job-related techniques to identify, interview and select the most capable candidates (e.g. structured interview training or guide).
- ✓ The agency reported that the Human Resources Professional is the individual responsible for recruiting and hiring. The Human Resources Professional completed the DCAS Structured Interviewing and Unconscious Bias training on October 29, 2015. Additionally, the agency adopted the DCAS Guide to Structured Interviewing; and established uniform questions for each position, the interviews were conducted by the HR Professional, a manager, and the unit supervisor, each of whom were provided the Guide to Structured Interviewing and uniform questions.
- 10. Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for advancement and transfer within the agency by: administering incentive programs; publicizing promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; and/or using other methods to communicate internal opportunities.
- ✓ The agency's principal HR Professional informed employees of each promotional opportunity via electronic mail. Additionally, the agency reported that all job postings were available via NYCAPS – Employee Self-Service, internal postings (on bulletin boards), and the agency's intranet page. The agency reported that all candidates were considered based on their skills and knowledge.



The agency did not demonstrate that it promoted employees' awareness of opportunities for promotion and transfer within the agency; or that it administered incentive programs; publicized promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; or used other methods to communicate internal opportunities. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #7</u>: Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for advancement and transfer within the agency by: administering incentive programs; publicizing promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; and/or using other methods to communicate internal opportunities.

- 11. Ensure that employees are considered internally for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer by: providing and encouraging training, development or mentorship programs to improve their performance and skills; establishing internal talent pools via cross-training, cross divisional assignments, job transfers, and/or job rotation; and identifying internal successors with applicable knowledge/skills/abilities.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it ensured that incumbent employees were considered for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer. <u>Corrective</u> action required.

<u>Corrective Action #8</u>: Ensure that employees are considered internally for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer by: providing and encouraging training, development or mentorship programs to improve their performance and skills; establishing internal talent pools via cross-training, cross divisional assignments, job transfers, and/or job rotation; and identifying internal successors with applicable knowledge/skills/abilities.

- 12. At minimum, indicate the agency is an equal opportunity employer in recruitment literature.
- ✓ During the period in review, the agency advertised for the several vacant positions including: Executive Agency Counsel, Computer Systems Manager, Customer Information Representative (part-time), Administrative Labor Relations Analyst, Community Assistant, and Computer Specialist (Software). Each job posting contained the EEO tagline "NYCERS is an Equal Opportunity Employer."
- 13. Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the hiring manager.
- ✓ The agency reported that NYCAPS e-Hire was used to maintain and track applicant/candidate information during the period in review. Additionally, the agency maintained an Interview & Selection Reporting Log for each position interviewed (see §III.12), which captured the following information: Civil Service Title, Job Vacancy Number, Job Opening ID Number, Name of Applicant,



Interviewed (reason why/why not the applicant was interviewed), Gender and Ethnicity, Current/Last Employer, Current and Last Salary, and Recruitment Source.

➤ The Interview & Selection Reporting Log did not capture disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, or reason selected/not selected (or disposition) for each candidate (information that NYCAPS eHire had the capability to capture). Additionally, the information captured in the agency's log was recorded by the Unit supervisor. Corrective action required.

<u>NOTE:</u> Executive Order 21 bans New York City employers from inquiring about a job applicant's wage or salary history, or considering a job applicant's salary history in determining the salary, compensation or other compensation in the offer of employment.

<u>Corrective Action #9</u>: Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the *position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the individuals involved in the hiring decision.* 

#### IV. CAREER COUNSELING:

Determination: The agency is in partial compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 14. Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that it designated a professional to provide career counseling to employees upon request. <u>Corrective action required.</u>

<u>Corrective Action #10</u>: Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.

15. The Human Resources Professional distributes the identity of the agency Career Counselor and ensures that all employees have access to information regarding job responsibilities, performance evaluation standards, examinations, training opportunities and job postings; ensures that all new employees are advised of the EEO policies, their rights and responsibilities under such policies and the discrimination complaint procedures; informs the principal EEO Professional of the number of 55-a program participants and efforts the agency has made to employ, promote or accommodate qualified individuals with disabilities; involves the principal EEO Professional in EEO-related matters; and promptly consults with the principal EEO Professional if informed of, or suspects that a violation of the EEO Policy has occurred.



✓ The principal HR Professional (Human Resources Director) informed employees of examinations, and job opportunities via electronic mail (see §III.10) and, upon hire, informed employees of their job responsibilities and performance evaluation standards, in person; and of the requirement to complete the DCAS EEO Computer Based Training (see §II.3). The agency reported no EEO policy violations and no 55-a program participants during the period in review. The agency also reported that the principal HR Professional met with the principal EEO Professional on an ad hoc basis to discuss HR and EEO-related issues.

### V. <u>EEO AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS FOR EMPLOYEES/</u> <u>APPLICANTS FOR EMPLOYMENT WITH DISABILITIES:</u>

Determination: The agency is in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 16. Ensure that information regarding employee rights and obligations, and the complaint, investigation and reasonable accommodation procedures is made available in appropriate alternative formats (i.e., large print, audio and/or Braille) upon request to employees and applicants for employment with disabilities.
- ✓ The agency reported that Equal Employment Opportunity Policy, Standards and Procedures to Be Utilized by City Agencies (2014), the EEO Complaint Procedural Guidelines (2016), the EEO Handbook About EEO: What You May Not Know, and reasonable accommodation procedures, were immediately available in large print; audio and Braille formats would be made available upon request.
- 17. Document reasonable accommodation requests and their outcomes.
- ✓ The agency reported that requests for reasonable accommodation, and their outcomes, were
  documented via Reasonable Accommodation Request Form, available to employees on the
  agency's intranet; and that it was the responsibility of the principal EEO Professional to process
  reasonable accommodation requests. The agency reported that there were no requests during the
  period in review.

### VI. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION - EEO PROFESSIONALS:</u> Determination: The agency is in <u>partial compliance</u> with the standards for this subject area.

- 18. Appoint a principal EEO Professional to implement EEO policies and standards within the agency. The principal EEO Professional is trained and knowledgeable regarding city, state, and federal EEO laws; the requirements of the agency's EEO policies, standards and procedures; and the prevention, investigation, and resolution of discrimination complaints.
- ✓ During the period in review the agency designated the *Director of Security & Facilities Operations* as the principal EEO Professional. The principal EEO Professional completed the following DCAS training: *Diversity and Equal Employment Opportunity Basic Training, Training on Effective Complaint Investigations and How to Handle Challenging Situations*, and EEO Computer Based



Training. Employees were informed of the name and contact information of the principal EEO Professional during the *Annual EEO Policy Meetings*.

- 19. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.
- ✓ In addition to the principal EEO Professional, the agency designated the Assistant General Counsel as an EEO Officer, to assist the principal EEO Professional with advising employees of their rights and responsibilities, and to conduct complaint intakes/interviews. The EEO Officer completed DCAS EEO Computer Based Training on August 31, 2016.
  - ➤ The agency did not demonstrate that the EEO Officer was adequately trained in EEO laws and procedures and knew how to carry out the responsibilities under the EEO Policy. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #11</u>: Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.

- 20. The principal EEO Professional reports directly to the agency head (or an approved direct report other than the General Counsel) in order to exercise the necessary authority and independent judgment to fulfill EEO responsibilities.
- ✓ The principal EEO Professional reported directly to the Executive Director in order to exercise the necessary authority and independent judgment to fulfill EEO responsibilities. This reporting relationship was reflected in the agency's organizational chart, dated January 5, 2017.
- 21. To ensure the integrity and continuity of the EEO Program, maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
- ✓ The agency reported that the Principal EEO Professional and the Executive Director met on at ad hoc basis in order to discuss HR and EEO related issues; the meetings were also attended by the Human Resources Director and General Counsel.
  - The agency did not maintain appropriate documentation of meetings or other communications between the agency head and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #12</u>: Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.



### VII. <u>RESPONSIBILITY FOR EEO PLAN IMPLEMENTATION – SUPERVISORS/MANAGERS:</u> Determination: The agency is in partial compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 22. Establish and administer an annual managerial/non-managerial performance evaluation program to be used for probationary periods, promotions, assignments, incentives and training.
- ✓ The agency established, and administered, an annual performance evaluation program for managerial and non-managerial employees for each year of the period in review. The agency's performance evaluation policy stated, "NYCERS' performance evaluation management system includes an annual (or more frequent if required), documented evaluation of employee or manager performance by their immediate supervisor. The employee appraisal process consists of individual tasks along with performance standards specifically designed to measure performance. Major tasks and performance evaluation standards serve as the primary basis in assessing the employee's ability to perform the day to day functions of their position."
- 23. The managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).
  - ➤ The Managerial Performance Evaluation Form does not contain a rating for EEO responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner. Corrective action required.

<u>Corrective Action #13</u>: Ensure that the managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).

### VIII. REPORTING STANDARD FOR AGENCY HEAD: Determination: The agency is not in compliance with the standards for this subject area.

- 24. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports<sup>2</sup> (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.
  - The agency did not submit to the EEPC Annual Plans of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity or quarterly reports for the years in the period in review. <u>Corrective action</u> required.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Submission of Quarterly Reports on EEO Activity is optional for non-Mayoral agencies.



<u>Corrective Action #14</u>: Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

### After implementation of the EEPC's corrective actions, if any:

 The agency head distributes a memorandum informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and re-emphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

<u>Final Action</u>: Distribute a memorandum signed by the agency head informing employees of the changes implemented in the EEO program pursuant to the EEPC's audit/analysis and reemphasizing the agency head's commitment to the EEO program.

#### Conclusion

The agency has <u>14</u> required corrective action(s) at this time.

Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter, your agency has the *option* to respond to this *preliminary determination*, but must respond to our Final Determination if corrective action is required.

Optional Response to preliminary determination: If submitted, your optional response should indicate, with attached documentation, what steps your agency has taken or will take to implement the prescribed corrective actions, and must be received in our office within 14 days from the date of this letter. No extensions will be granted for the option to respond to the preliminary determination.

(Optional Conference) During the Optional Conference, we will discuss the immediate steps your agency should take and address questions regarding your agency's implementation of the prescribed corrective action(s).

(No Response Option) If your agency does not respond to this preliminary determination within 14 days, it will become the EEPC's Final Determination.

Mandatory Response to Final Determination: Following this preliminary determination, the EEPC will issue a Final Determination where we may modify or eliminate the corrective actions based on verified information; identify remaining action which requires further monitoring in order to ensure implementation; and assign a mandatory compliance-monitoring period of up to 6 months for this purpose. Pursuant to Chapter 36 of the New York City Charter your agency must respond to our Final Determination within 30 days. Your response to the Final Determination will initiate the compliance monitoring period.



In closing, we want to thank you and your staff for the cooperation extended to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's EEO Program Analysts during the course of our audit and analysis.

Respectfully Submitted by,

Nathan P. Conway, EEO Program Analyst

Approved by,

Charise L. Terry, PHR Executive Director

c: Craig Thornton, Principal EEO Professional/Director of Security & Facility Operations

### Appendix-1

New York City Employees' Retirement System EEO Job Group Descriptions

### DESCRIPTION OF CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) JOB GROUP CATEGORIES

- OO1 Administrators: Occupations in which employees set broad policies and exercise overall responsibility for the execution of these policies. This category includes: elected officials, commissioners, executive directors, deputy commissioners, chairpersons, general counsels, controllers, chiefs of department, inspector generals and kindred workers.
- **Managers:** Occupations in which employees direct individual departments or special phases of the agency's operations, or provide specialized consultation on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: assistant commissioners, deputy directors, assistant directors, project managers, special assistants, superintendents, deputy counsels and kindred workers.
- OO3 Management Specialists: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of management, finance or personnel, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: accountants, underwriters, financial analysts, personnel analysts, staff analysts, program analysts, buyers, purchasing specialists, inspectors, research analysts, program officers, project coordinators and kindred workers.
- OO4 Science Professionals: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of various scientific or mathematical fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: architects, engineers (chemical, nuclear, civil, electrical, industrial, mechanical, marine), computer specialists, telecommunications specialists, actuaries, statisticians, physicists, chemists, geologists, biologists, foresters and kindred workers.
- 005 Health Professionals: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the medical or health fields, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: physicians, dentists, veterinarians, optometrists, podiatrists, registered nurses, pharmacists, dieticians, occupational therapists, physician's assistants and kindred workers.
- Oo6 Social Scientists: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the social sciences, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: librarians, archivists, economists, psychologists, sociologists, urban planners and kindred workers.
- OO7 Social Workers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of social work, youth and family counseling, addiction treatment and casework, which is usually acquired through college or training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: caseworkers, probation officers, correctional counselors, juvenile counselors, addiction treatment counselors, eligibility specialists, human rights specialists, community liaison workers, clergy and kindred workers.
- **008** Lawyers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of the law and the judicial process, which is usually acquired through college training. This category includes: attorneys, assistant district attorneys, counsels, assistant counsels, deputy counsels, law judges, and kindred workers.
- OO9 Public Relations: Occupations which require special knowledge or skills in public relations, journalism, modern language or the fine arts, which are usually acquired through college training, specialized post-secondary school education, or work experience or training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: technical writers, graphic designers, musicians, actors, directors, announcers, painters, illustrators, photographers, artists, editors, press officers, public relations specialists, public relations advisors, interpreters, customer service specialists and kindred workers.
- 010 Technicians: Occupations which require a combination of basic scientific or technical knowledge and manual skill which can be obtained through specialized post-secondary school education or through equivalent on-the-job training. This category includes: health technicians (clinical laboratory, dental hygienists, health records, radiologic

### FINAL DETERMINATION

06/09/2017 and licensed practical nurses), electrical and electronic technicians, engineering technicians (electrical, electronic, industrial, and mechanical), drafting occupations, surveying and mapping technicians, science technicians, airline pilots and navigators, air traffic controllers, broadcast equipment operators, computer programmers, legal assistants, investigators, and kindred workers.

- 011 Sales: Not applicable.
- 012 Clerical Supervisors: Occupations in which employees are responsible for overseeing and supervising the duties of clerical staff. This category includes: chief clerks, supervising clerks, principal administrative associates, supervising cashiers, telegraph superintendents, supervising stenographers and kindred workers.
- 013 Clerical: Occupations in which employees are responsible for internal and external communication, recording and retrieval of data and/or information and other paperwork required in an office. This category includes: cashiers, computer operators, word processors, secretaries, stenographers, typists, ticket agents, receptionists, clerks (information, personnel, file, library, records), bookkeepers, office machine operators, telephone operators, messengers, dispatchers, stock clerks, meter readers, office aides, general office clerks, bank tellers and kindred workers.
- 014 Household Services: Not applicable.
- 015 Police Supervisors: Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officers status set broad policies in the area of public safety and security, exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies, direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations, or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: sergeants, captains, lieutenants, inspectors, captains (correction), wardens and kindred workers.
- 016 Fire Supervisors: Occupations in which uniformed employees set broad policies in the area of public safety and protection; exercise overall responsibility for execution of policies; direct individual units or special phases of the agency's operations; or supervise on a regional, district or area basis. This category includes: lieutenants, captains, battalion chiefs, deputy chiefs, supervising fire marshals, supervising fire prevention inspectors and kindred workers.
- 017 Firefighters: Occupations in which uniformed employees are entrusted with public safety, security and protection from destructive forces. This category includes: firefighters, marine engineers (uniformed), fire prevention inspectors, fire protection inspectors and kindred workers.
- 018 Police and Detectives: Occupations in which uniformed employees with peace officer status are entrusted with public safety, security and protection. This category includes: police officer, detectives, correction officers. bridge and tunnel officers, sheriffs, special officers, enforcement agents (traffic, sanitation) and kindred workers.
- 019 Guards: Occupations in which employees are entrusted with public safety and security. This category includes: school crossing guards, housing guards, watch persons, lifeguards, park rangers, school guards and kindred workers.
- 020 Food Preparation: Occupations in which employees are responsible for the preparation and distribution of food, or management of food services, in City facilities (e.g. schools, correctional institutions, and concessions). This category includes: cooks, school lunch helpers, school lunch managers, food service managers, commissary managers and kindred workers.
- 021 Health Services: Occupations in which employees are responsible for assisting health professionals in maintaining and promoting the health, hygiene and safety of the general public. This category includes: dental assistants, dietary aides, public health assistants, nurse's aides, institutional aides, health aides, orderlies, and kindred workers.
- 022 Building Services: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. This category includes: custodians, cleaners, caretakers, maintainers, elevator operators and starters, exterminators, pest control aides and kindred workers.

### FINAL DETERMINATION

- 06/09/2017

  Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort or convenience of the general public. This category includes: housekeepers, barbers, attendants, railroad porters, homemakers, matrons and kindred workers.
- 024 Farming: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the upkeep and care of agricultural/botanical/zoological facilities or grounds of public property. This category includes: herbarium aides, aquarium technicians, botanical gardening aides, gardeners, groundskeepers, pruners, hostlers, menagerie keepers, horseshoers and kindred workers.
- 025 Craft: Occupations in which employees perform duties which require special manual skill and a thorough and comprehensive knowledge of the processes involved in the work in which is acquired through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: mechanics, equipment repairers, telephone line installers, small instrument repairers, brick masons, carpenters, electricians, plumbers, mining occupations, tool and die makers, sheet metal workers, tailors, butchers, bakers, machine operators, locksmiths, precision handworking occupations and kindred workers.
- 026 Operators: Occupations in which employees perform duties which require specialized machine skills which are required through on-the-job training and experience or through apprenticeship or other formal training programs. This category includes: printing press operators, high pressure boiler operators, laundry workers and kindred workers.
- 027 Transportation: Occupations in which employees perform duties which require motor vehicle, bus, train, or other transportation operation skills which are acquired through on-the- job training and experience or through other formal training programs. This category includes: bus drivers, chauffeurs, motor vehicle operators, trainmasters, ferry terminal supervisors and kindred workers.
- 028 Laborers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the comfort, convenience, hygiene or safety of the general public, or which contribute to the upkeep and care of buildings and facilities. There are no job qualification requirements for titles in this category. This category includes: skilled craft helpers and apprentices, construction laborers, stock handlers, garage and service station related occupations, car cleaners, seasonal park helpers, track workers, assistant highway repairers and kindred workers.
- 029 Sanitation Workers: Occupations in which employees perform duties which result in or contribute to the cleanliness, hygiene and safety of the public domain. Qualification requirements, which include civil service examinations, exist for titles in this category. This category includes: sanitation workers, debris removers and kindred workers.
- 030 Teachers: Occupations which require specialized and theoretical knowledge of education and instructional methods, which is usually acquired through college training or through work experience and other training which provides comparable knowledge. This category includes: teachers, instructors, professors, lecturers, fitness instructors, graduate assistants, fellows, adjunct professors, substitute teachers, trade instructors, education/ vocational counselors, education analysts, education officers, institutional instructors and kindred workers.
- 031 Paraprofessionals: Occupations in which employees perform some of the duties of a professional or technician in a supportive role, which usually requires less formal training and/or experience normally required for professional or technical status. Such positions may fall within an identified pattern of staff development and promotion. This category includes: administrative assistants, project associates, coordinators, community associates and assistants, community service aides, research associates, welfare service workers, child care workers and kindred workers.

# FINAL DETERMINATION 06/09/2017

## Appendix -2

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Composition Summary 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter of Fiscal Year 2017 (End of Period in Review)

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:22:21.9

EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL . . . . :

19.05

0.00

4.76

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS) WORK FORCE COMPOSITION SUMMARY

PAGE:

0.00 0.00 19.05 33.33 0.00 19.05 0.00 0.00 0.00 100.00

REPORT: EBEPR210

OUARTER 2 YEAR 2017 AGENCY 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 001 ADMINISTRATORS TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER 10188 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR (NYC EM 0 0 0 10189 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR 0 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....: 0.00 0.00 100.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 100.00 AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 002 MANAGERS ----- MALE ----- FEMALE -----ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER EMP CODE DESCRIPTION 09774 DEPUTY DIRECTOR (FINANCE) 10001 ADMINISTRATIVE ACCOUNTANT 10003 ADMINISTRATIVE GRAPHIC ART 10010 ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGEMENT 10025 ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGER 10026 ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 10033 ADMINISTRATIVE PUBLIC INFO 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 10050 COMPUTER SYSTEMS MANAGER 16 82976 ADMINISTRATIVE PROCUREMENT 82986 ADMINISTRATIVE RETIREMENT 82994 ADMINISTRATIVE LABOR RELAT 19 0 95005 EXECUTIVE AGENCY COUNSEL EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....: 13 28.86 1.92 7.69 0.00 1.92 0.00 100.00 7.69 9.62 0.00 15.38 25.00 1.92 0.00 AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 003 MANAGEMENT SPECIALISTS ------ FEMALE ------TITLE TITLE ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-CODE DESCRIPTION ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS 1002A ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 1002C ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGER NON 0 1002E ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF ANALY 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 12627 ASSOCIATE STAFF ANALYST 0 0 0 0 0 40502 MANAGEMENT AUDITOR 0 0 0 0 0 40510 ACCOUNTANT 54736 CONFIDENTIAL STRATEGY PLAN

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 RUN TIME: 13:22:21.9

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS)
WORK FORCE COMPOSITION SUMMARY
2017 AGENCY 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 12 REPORT: EBEPR210

QUARTER 2 YEAR 2017

	MPLOYEES ICE PROFE	SSIONAL	S											
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WHITE	BLACK	HISPN	ASIAN PACIS	ALASK		WHITE	BLACK	FEM	ASIAN PACIS	AM IND ALASK		OTHER	TOTAL EMP
13611 COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (TECHNI 13631 COMPUTER ASSOCIATE (SOFTWA 13632 COMPUTER SPECIALIST (SOFTWA 13643 CERTIFIED IT DEVELOPER (AP 13644 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13651 COMPUTER PROGRAMMER ANALYS 13652 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13654 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13654 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13655 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13657 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13658 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR 13659 CERTIFIED IT ADMINISTRATOR	14 47 11 11 11 00 0	020000200	0 1 0 1 0 0 0	013110400	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000000000000000000000000000000000	0500000000	0001000010	0110000000	0003		000000000000000000000000000000000000000	000000000	1 14 16 2 3 1 8 1
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	34.03	8.51	8.51	21.28	0.00	0.00	10.64	4.26	4.26	8.51	0.00	0.00	0.00	
AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC F EEO JOB GROUP : 008 LAWYE														
EEO JOB GROUP : 008 LAWYE TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION		DI ACY	MAI	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-		DINCK	FEN	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	OTHER	TOTAL
30087 AGENCY ATTORNEY			 0	PACIS	ALASK 0	0	0	1	1	0	ALASK		OTHER	3
	1	0	0	0	0	0					0	. 0	0	3
BEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	33.34	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	33.33	33.33	0.00	0.00			100.00
AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC F EEO JOB GROUP : 010 TECHN	NICIANS								FFN	ATE				
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION	WUITE	DIACK	UTCON	ASIAN	AM IND	UN-	WUTTE	DIACK	UTCON	ASIAN	AM IND	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL
	WHILE				ADASK									
13615 COMPUTER SERVICE TECHNICIA 13616 SUPERVISING COMPUTER SERVI	00	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	00	0	0	0	000	1
40491 ASSISTANT RETIREMENT BENEF 40493 ASSOCIATE RETIREMENT BENEF	0 0 5 26	12	3	19	0	0	24	13	3	18	2	0	O	72 120
EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL:	31	10.31	2.06	14.43	0.00	0.00	23.20	11.86	4.64	15.98	1.55	0.00		100.00
	MPLOYEES	DUTCODO	,						555					
TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION					AM IND	UN- KNOWN		BLACK			AM IND	UN- KNOWN	OTHER	TOTAL EMP
10124 PRINCIPAL ADMINISTRATIVE A	1	0	1	1	0	0	1	12	2	0	0	0	0	18

RUN DATE: 01/04/17 NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITYWIDE ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES
RUN TIME: 13:22:21.9 CITYWIDE EQUAL EMPLOYMENT DATABASE SYSTEM (CEEDS)

QUARTER 2 YEAR 2017 AGENCY 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM PAGE: 13 REPORT: EBEPR210 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....: 1 0 1 1 0 0 1 12 2 0 0 0 18 5.54 0.00 5.56 5.56 0.00 0.00 5.56 66.67 11.11 0.00 0.00 0.00 0.00 100.00 AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 013 CLERICAL ASIAN AM IND UN-ASIAN AM IND UN-WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER EMP CODE DESCRIPTION 1022A LEGAL SECRETARIAL ASSISTAN 10250 CLERICAL AIDE 10251 CLERICAL ASSOCIATE 0 0 0 48 11702 OFFICE MACHINE AIDE 12 0 0 21 40526 BOOKKEEPER 0 0 0 0 60888 CUSTOMER INFORMATION REPRE 19 11 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL ....:  $2.1\overline{5}$   $8.7\overline{0}$   $1.0\overline{9}$   $7.6\overline{1}$   $0.0\overline{0}$   $0.0\overline{0}$   $3.2\overline{6}$   $58.7\overline{0}$   $11.\overline{9}\overline{6}$   $4.3\overline{5}$   $1.0\overline{9}$   $1.0\overline{9}$   $0.0\overline{0}$   $100.\overline{0}\overline{0}$ AGENCY CODE : 009 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM EEO JOB GROUP : 031 PARA PROFESSIONAL OCCUPATIONS ----- MALE ------- FEMALE -----TITLE TITLE CODE DESCRIPTION ASIAN AM IND UN- TOTAL PACIS ALASK KNOWN WHITE BLACK HISPN PACIS ALASK KNOWN OTHER EMP 56056 COMMUNITY ASSISTANT 0 1 0 2 0 0 1 2 1 1 0 0 0 8 EEO JOB GROUP TOTAL . . . . :  $0.00 \ 12.50 \ 0.00 \ 25.00 \ 0.00 \ 0.00 \ 12.50 \ 25.00 \ 12.50 \ 12.50 \ 0.00 \ 0.00$ 

AGENCY TOTAL....:

# FINAL DETERMINATION 06/09/2017

### Appendix -3

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 1st Quarter of Fiscal Year 2015

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO1 ADMINISTRATORS

PAGE: 12 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	200000000000000000000000000000000000000	0 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	22222	.5092 .1745 .1543 .1123 .0068	1.02 0.35 0.31 0.22 0.01	0.98 -0.35 -0.31 -0.22 -0.01	1.39 -0.65 -0.60 -0.50 -0.12 -0.23	0.083 0.258 0.273 0.307 0.453 0.411	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 2 0	2 0 2	2 2 2	.5906 .3841 .0046	1.18 0.77 0.01	-1.18 1.23 -0.01	-1.70 1.79 -0.10	0.045 0.037 0.462	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO2 MANAGERS

OO2 MANAGERS

PAGE: 13 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	22 17 2 9 0	28 33 48 41 50 50	555555	.5133 .1889 .1297 .1017 .0018	25.67 9.45 6.49 5.09 0.09 2.01	-3.66 7.56 -4.49 3.92 -0.09 -2.01	-1.04 2.73 -1.89 1.83 -0.30 -1.45	0.150 <.01 0.030 0.033 0.382 0.074	0 U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	23 27 0	27 23 50	50 50	.5345 .4206 .0197	26.73 21.03 0.99	-3.72 5.97 -0.99	-1.06 1.71 -1.00	0.145 0.044 0.158	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON MNGMNT SPECS

PAGE: 14 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	6 5 1 5 0	11 12 16 12 17	17 17 17 17 17	.4094 .2958 .1295 .1301 .0022 .0207	6.96 5.03 2.20 2.21 0.04 0.35	-0.96 -0.03 -1.20 2.79 -0.04 -0.35	-0.47 -0.02 -0.87 2.01 -0.19 -0.60	0.318 0.494 0.193 0.022 0.423 0.274	U-80%RUL O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	110	11 6 17	17 17 17	.5718 .4032 .0126	9.72 6.85 0.21	-3.72 4.15 -0.21	-1.82 2.05 -0.47	0.034 0.020 0.321	U-80%RUL O N-05%RUL

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO4 SCIENCE PROFNS

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 15 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	22 4 6 10 0	21 39 37 33 43 42	444444444444444444444444444444444444444	.4568 .1762 .1023 .2258 .0024	19.64 7.58 4.40 9.71 0.10 1.35	2.36 -3.58 1.60 0.29 -0.10 -0.35	0.72 -1.43 0.81 0.11 -0.32 -0.31	0.235 0.076 0.210 0.458 0.374 0.378	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	30 13 0	13 30 43	43 43 43	.6586 .3131 .0201	28.32 13.46 0.86	1.68 -0.46 -0.86	0.54 -0.15 -0.94	0.294 0.439 0.174	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OOS LAWYERS

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

EXTERNAL POOLS
OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

DEBCOME

PAGE: 16 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 0 1 2 0 0	3 4 3 2 4 4	4 4 4 4 4	.5889 .1310 .1020 .0721 .0011	2.36 0.52 0.41 0.29 0.00	-1.36 -0.52 0.59 1.71 -0.00	-1.38 -0.78 0.98 3.31 -0.07 -0.29	0.084 0.219 0.164 <.01 0.474 0.388	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 4 0	4 0 4	4 4 4	.4396 .4738 .0010	1.76 1.90 0.00	-1.76 2.10 -0.00	-1.77 2.11 -0.06	0.038 0.018 0.475	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O10 TECHNICIANS

PAGE: 17 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	69 49 12 57 3 0	121 141 178 133 187 190	190 190 190 190 190	.3514 .3293 .1923 .1005 .0027 .0182	66.77 62.57 36.54 19.09 0.51 3.46	2.23 -13.6 -24.5 37.91 2.49 -3.46	0.34 -2.09 -4.52 9.15 3.48 -1.88	0.367 0.018 <.01 <.01 <.01 0.030	U U O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	89 101 0	101 89 190	190 190 190	.6181 .3662 .0098	117.44 69.58 1.86	-28.4 31.42 -1.86	-4.25 4.73 -1.37	<.01 <.01 0.085	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O12 CLERICAL SUPS

PAGE: 18 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	13 2 1 0	16 5 16 17 18 18	18 18 18 18 18	.2238 .5619 .1348 .0511 .0038	4.03 10.11 2.43 0.92 0.07 0.44	-2.03 2.89 -0.43 0.08 -0.07 -0.44	-1.15 1.37 -0.29 0.09 -0.26 -0.67	0.126 0.085 0.384 0.466 0.397 0.251	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	160	16 2 18	18 18 18	.2093 .7769 .0138	3.77 13.98 0.25	-1.77 2.02 -0.25	-1.02 1.14 -0.50	0.153 0.127 0.308	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O13 CLERICAL

DEBCOME PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 19 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH	WHITE	6	85	91	.1867	16.99	-11.0	-2.96	<.01	0
ETH	BLACK	61	30	91	.5347	48.66	12.34	2.59	<.01	
ETH	HISPANIC	11	80	91	.1509	13.73	-2.73	-0.80	0.212	
ETH ETH ETH	ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 0	79 90 91	91 91 91	.0716 .0039 .0478	6.52 0.35 4.35	5.48 0.65 -4.35	2.23 1.08 -2.14	0.013 0.139 0.016	0 N-05%RUL
GEN	MALE	17	74	91	.2820	25.66	-8.66	-2.02	0.022	U
GEN	FEMALE	74	17	91	.6776	61.66	12.34	2.77	<.01	O
GEN	GENDER UNKNOWN	0	91	91	.0359	3.27	-3.27	-1.84	0.033	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON PARA PROFESSION

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 20 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 09/30/14

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 1 0 0 0	3 3 3 3 4 4	4 4 4 4 4	.3243 .2673 .2449 .0964 .0025	1.30 1.07 0.98 0.39 0.01 0.11	-0.30 -0.07 0.02 0.61 -0.01	-0.32 -0.08 0.02 1.04 -0.10 -0.33	0.375 0.469 0.491 0.149 0.460 0.370	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	2 2 0	2 2 4	4 4 4	.3798 .5812 .0011	1.52 2.32 0.00	0.48 -0.32 -0.00	0.50 -0.33 -0.07	0.310 0.371 0.474	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

# FINAL DETERMINATION 06/09/2017

## Appendix -4

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 2nd Quarter of Fiscal Year 2017

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D D S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO ADMINISTRATORS

PAGE: 11 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISI NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	200000	222222222222222222222222222222222222222	NNNNNN	.5092 .1745 .1543 .1123 .0068 .0247	1.02 0.35 0.31 0.22 0.01	0.98 -0.35 -0.31 -0.22 -0.01 -0.05	1.39 -0.65 -0.60 -0.50 -0.12 -0.23	0.083 0.258 0.273 0.307 0.453 0.411	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 2 0	2 0 2	2 2 2	.5906 .3841 .0046	1.18 0.77 0.01	-1.18 1.23 -0.01	-1.70 1.79 -0.10	0.045 0.037 0.462	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL
OO2 MANAGERS RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 12 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	23 17 2 9	29 35 50 43 52 51	55555555555555555555555555555555555555	.5133 .1889 .1297 .1017 .0018 .0402	26.69 9.82 6.74 5.29 0.09	-3.69 7.18 -4.74 3.71 -0.09 -1.09	-1.02 2.54 -1.96 1.70 -0.31 -0.77	0.153 <.01 0.025 0.044 0.380 0.221	O U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	25 27 0	27 25 52	52 52 52	.5345 .4206 .0197	27.79 21.87 1.02	-2.79 5.13 -1.02	-0.78 1.44 -1.02	0.219 0.075 0.153	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

DEPOSITE THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON MICHAEL BENEAU AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY AND ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY ADDRESS OF THE AGENCY AND ADDR

PAGE: 13 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	510500	16 10 21 16 21 21	21 21 21 21 21	.4094 .2958 .1295 .1301 .0022	8.60 6.21 2.72 2.73 0.05 0.43	-3.60 4.79 -2.72 2.27 -0.05 -0.43	-1.60 2.29 -1.77 1.47 -0.22 -0.67	0.055 0.011 0.039 0.071 0.415 0.253	U-80%RUL O U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	150	15 6 21	21 21 21	.5718 .4032 .0126	12.01 8.47 0.26	-6.01 6.53 -0.26	-2.65 2.91 -0.52	<.01 <.01 0.302	U O N-05%RUL

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D D S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

PAGE: 14

PROGRAM: EBPPP961

EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

PERSONS WITH MISSING FEED NOT AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	21 6 6 14 0	26 41 41 33 47 47	47 47 47 47 47	.4568 .1762 .1023 .2258 .0024 .0315	21.47 8.28 4.81 10.61 0.11 1.48	-0.47 -2.28 1.19 3.39 -0.11 -1.48	-0.14 -0.87 0.57 1.18 -0.34 -1.24	0.445 0.191 0.283 0.119 0.368 0.108	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	34 13 0	13 34 47	47 47 47	.6586 .3131 .0201	30.95 14.72 0.94	3.05 -1.72 -0.94	0.94 -0.54 -0.98	0.174 0.295 0.163	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OOS LAWYERS

DEPOCATE

DE

PAGE: 15 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEC VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 1 0 0 0 0	22223333	помере	.5889 .1310 .1020 .0721 .0011	1.77 0.39 0.31 0.22 0.00 0.06	-0.77 0.61 0.69 -0.22 -0.00	-0.90 1.04 1.32 -0.48 -0.06 -0.25	0.184 0.149 0.093 0.315 0.477 0.402	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	1 2 0	2 1 3	3 3	.4396 .4738 .0010	1.32 1.42 0.00	-0.32 0.58 -0.00	-0.37 0.67 -0.05	0.355 0.252 0.478	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O10 TECHNICIANS

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

PAGE: 16 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	76 43 13 59 3	118 151 181 135 191 194	194 194 194 194 194 194	.3514 .3293 .1923 .1005 .0027 .0182	68.17 63.88 37.31 19.50 0.52 3.53	7.83 -20.9 -24.3 39.50 2.48 -3.53	1.18 -3.19 -4.43 9.43 3.43 -1.90	0.120 <.01 <.01 <.01 <.01 0.029	U U O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	83 111 0	111 83 194	194 194 194	.6181 .3662 .0098	119.91 71.04 1.90	-36.9 39.96 -1.90	-5.45 5.95 -1.39	<.01 <.01 0.083	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O12 CLERICAL SUPS

PAGE: 17

PROGRAM: EBPPP961

EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

PERSONS WITH MISSING DOCUMENTS OF THE PERSONS

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	12 3 1 0 0	16 6 15 17 18 18	18 18 18 18	.2238 .5619 .1348 .0511 .0038 .0245	4.03 10.11 2.43 0.92 0.07 0.44	-2.03 1.89 0.57 0.08 -0.07 -0.44	-1.15 0.90 0.40 0.09 -0.26 -0.67	0.126 0.185 0.346 0.466 0.397 0.251	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	15 0	15 3 18	18 18 18	.2093 .7769 .0138	3.77 13.98 0.25	-0.77 1.02 -0.25	-0.44 0.58 -0.50	0.328 0.283 0.308	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL

PAGE: 18 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O13 CLERICAL

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	62 12 11 1	87 30 80 81 91	922 922 922 922 922	.1867 .5347 .1509 .0716 .0039 .0478	17.18 49.19 13.88 6.59 0.36 4.40	-12.2 12.81 -1.88 4.41 0.64 -3.40	-3.26 2.68 -0.55 1.78 1.07 -1.66	<.01 <.01 0.292 0.037 0.142 0.048	U O N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	18 74 0	74 18 92	92 92 92	.2820 .6776 .0359	25.94 62.34 3.30	-7.94 11.66 -3.30	-1.84 2.60 -1.85	0.033 <.01 0.032	U-80%RUL O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E D D S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O31 PARA PROFESSION

DEBOOM

PAGE: 19 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 12/31/16

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	131300	7 5 7 5 8	8 8 8 8 8 8	.3243 .2673 .2449 .0964 .0025	2.59 2.14 1.96 0.77 0.02 0.22	-1.59 0.86 -0.96 2.23 -0.02 -0.22	-1.20 0.69 -0.79 2.67 -0.14 -0.47	0.114 0.246 0.215 <.01 0.444 0.319	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	3 5 0	5 3 8	8 8	.3798 .5812 .0011	3.04 4.65 0.01	-0.04 0.35 -0.01	-0.03 0.25 -0.09	0.489 0.401 0.463	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

# FINAL DETERMINATION 06/09/2017

## Appendix -5

New York City Employees' Retirement System Workforce Compared with Internal and External Pools 3rd Quarter of Fiscal Year 2017

PAGE: 11 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO1 ADMINISTRATORS

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 0 0 0 0	0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 1 1 1 1	.5092 .1745 .1543 .1123 .0068	0.51 0.17 0.15 0.11 0.01 0.02	0.49 -0.17 -0.15 -0.11 -0.01	0.98 -0.46 -0.43 -0.36 -0.08 -0.16	0.163 0.323 0.335 0.361 0.467 0.437	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 1 0	0	1 1 1	.5906 .3841 .0046	0.59 0.38 0.00	-0.59 0.62 -0.00	-1.20 1.27 -0.07	0.115 0.103 0.473	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PAGE: 12 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO2 MANAGERS

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

DEPARTMENT SYSTEM

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	24 18 2 9 0	30 36 52 45 54 53	54 54 54 54 54 54	.5133 .1889 .1297 .1017 .0018	27.72 10.20 7.00 5.49 0.10 2.17	-3.72 7.80 -5.00 3.51 -0.10 -1.17	-1.01 2.71 -2.03 1.58 -0.31 -0.81	0.156 <.01 0.021 0.057 0.378 0.209	0 U N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	27 27 0	27 27 54	54 54 54	.5345 .4206 .0197	28.86 22.71 1.06	-1.86 4.29 -1.06	-0.51 1.18 -1.04	0.306 0.119 0.149	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

C E E D S S Y S T E M

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO3 MNGMNT SPECS

PAGE: 13 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH	WHITE BLACK	7	16 12	23 23	.4094	9.42	-2.42 4.20	-1.02 1.92	0.153	U-80%RUL
ETH	HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL	0	23 18	23 23	.1295	2.98	-2.98 2.01	-1.85	0.032	U-80%RUL
ETH	NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	0	23 23	23 23	.0022	0.05	-0.05	-0.23 -0.70	0.411	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	7 16 0	16 7 23	23 23 23	.5718 .4032 .0126	13.15 9.27 0.29	-6.15 6.73 -0.29	-2.59 2.86 -0.54	<.01 <.01 0.294	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OO9 NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OO4 SCIENCE PROFNS

PAGE: 14 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	20 7 6 14 0	27 40 41 33 47 47	47 47 47 47 47	.4568 .1762 .1023 .2258 .0024	21.47 8.28 4.81 10.61 0.11 1.48	-1.47 -1.28 1.19 3.39 -0.11 -1.48	-0.43 -0.49 0.57 1.18 -0.34 -1.24	0.333 0.312 0.283 0.119 0.368 0.108	N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	34 13 0	13 34 47	47 47 47	.6586 .3131 .0201	30.95 14.72 0.94	3.05 -1.72 -0.94	0.94 -0.54 -0.98	0.174 0.295 0.163	N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OOS LAWYERS

OOS LAWYERS

PAGE: 15 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	0 1 1 0 0 0 1	300000000000000000000000000000000000000	припри	.5889 .1310 .1020 .0721 .0011 .0200	1.77 0.39 0.31 0.22 0.00 0.06	-1.77 0.61 0.69 -0.22 -0.00 0.94	-2.07 1.04 1.32 -0.48 -0.06 3.88	0.019 0.149 0.093 0.315 0.477	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	0 3 0	3 0 3	3 3 3	.4396 .4738 .0010	1.32 1.42 0.00	-1.32 1.58 -0.00	-1.53 1.83 -0.05	0.063 0.034 0.478	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

PAGE: 16 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

OF DECEMBERS OF DECEMBERS OF DECEMBERS OF DESCRIPTION OF DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OTHER TO THE PERSONNEL

OTHER TO THE PERSONNEL

DESCRIPTION OF DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

OTHER TO THE PERSONNEL

OTHER TO THE PERSONNEL

DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

OTHER TO THE PERSONNEL

DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

OTHER TO THE PERSON

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	74 42 13 59 3	117 149 178 132 188 191	191 191 191 191 191	.3514 .3293 .1923 .1005 .0027 .0182	67.12 62.90 36.73 19.20 0.52 3.48	6.88 -20.9 -23.7 39.80 2.48 -3.48	1.04 -3.22 -4.36 9.58 3.46 -1.88	0.148 <.01 <.01 <.01 <.01 0.030	U U O N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	110	110 81 191	191 191 191	.6181 .3662 .0098	118.06 69.94 1.87	-37.1 40.06 -1.87	-5.52 6.02 -1.37	<.01 <.01 0.085	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

OLERICAL

PAGE: 18 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	5 66 12 9 1	89 28 82 85 93 93	94 94 94 94 94	.1867 .5347 .1509 .0716 .0039 .0478	17.55 50.26 14.18 6.73 0.37 4.49	-12.5 15.74 -2.18 2.27 0.63 -3.49	-3.32 3.25 -0.63 0.91 1.05 -1.69	<.01 <.01 0.265 0.182 0.147 0.046	U O N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	17 77 0	77 17 94	94 94 94	.2820 .6776 .0359	26.51 63.69 3.37	-9.51 13.31 -3.37	-2.18 2.94 -1.87	0.015 <.01 0.031	U O N-05%RUL

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS
AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

O12 CLERICAL SUPS

PAGE: 17 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	14 3 1 0 0	18 6 17 19 20 20	20 20 20 20 20	.2238 .5619 .1348 .0511 .0038 .0245	4.48 11.24 2.70 1.02 0.08 0.49	-2.48 2.76 0.30 -0.02 -0.08 -0.49	-1.33 1.24 0.20 -0.02 -0.28 -0.71	0.092 0.107 0.421 0.491 0.391 0.239	U-80%RUL N-05%RUL N-05%RUL
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	16 0	16 4 20	20 20 20	.2093 .7769 .0138	4.19 15.54 0.28	-0.19 0.46 -0.28	-0.10 0.25 -0.53	0.459 0.402 0.298	N-05%RUL

PAGE: 19 PROGRAM: EBPPP961 EXTRACT DATE: 03/31/17

NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL

WORK FORCE COMPARED WITH INTERNAL & EXTERNAL POOLS

AT THE AGENCY/JOBGROUP LEVEL

ON NYC EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM

ON PARA PROFESSION AGENCY: JOB GROUP:

PERSONS WITH MISSING EEO DATA INCLUDED IN CNTS PROBABILITY CUT-OFF FOR IMBALANCE: 0.05

EEO VAR	EEO VAL	FOCAL GROUP	OTHER THAN FOCAL GROUP	TOTAL	AVAIL %	EXPECTED #	DIFFERENCE	Z-SCORE	PROBABILITY	IMBAL
ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH ETH	WHITE BLACK HISPANIC ASIAN / PAC ISL NATIVE AMERICAN ETH UNKNOWN	1 3 0 0	7 5 7 5 8 8	8 8 8 8 8	.3243 .2673 .2449 .0964 .0025	2.59 2.14 1.96 0.77 0.02 0.22	-1.59 0.86 -0.96 2.23 -0.02 -0.22	-1.20 0.69 -0.79 2.67 -0.14 -0.47	0.114 0.246 0.215 <.01 0.444 0.319	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8
GEN GEN GEN	MALE FEMALE GENDER UNKNOWN	3 5 0	5 3 8	8 8 8	.3798 .5812 .0011	3.04 4.65 0.01	-0.04 0.35 -0.01	-0.03 0.25 -0.09	0.489 0.401 0.463	N - N<=8 N - N<=8 N - N<=8

### EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES COMMISSION CITY OF NEW YORK

**RESOLUTION #2017/211-009:** Final Determination pursuant to the Audit: Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the New York City Employees' Retirement System's Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2) and (5) of the New York City Charter, the Equal Employment Practices Commission is authorized to audit and evaluate the employment practices, programs, policies, and procedures of city agencies and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women, and to make recommendations to city agencies to insure equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women; and

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2), this Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits* and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; and

Whereas, pursuant to its audit of the New York City Employees' Retirement System's (NYCERS) Employment Practices and Procedures, the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) issued a Preliminary Determination letter, dated May 16th, 2017, setting forth findings and the following required corrective actions:

- 1. Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.
- 2. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
- 3. Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race/ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.
- 4. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.
- 5. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations

serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.

- 6. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 7. Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for advancement and transfer within the agency by: administering incentive programs; publicizing promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; and/or using other methods to communicate internal opportunities.
- 8. Ensure that employees are considered internally for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer by: providing and encouraging training, development or mentorship programs to improve their performance and skills; establishing internal talent pools via cross-training, cross divisional assignments, job transfers, and/or job rotation; and identifying internal successors with applicable knowledge/skills/abilities.
- 9. Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the individuals involved in the hiring decision.
- 10. Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.
- 11. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.
- 12. Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
- 13. Ensure that the managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).
- 14. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

Whereas, the agency did not submit a response to the EEPC's Preliminary Determination letter within 14 days from the date of its issuance, and consistent with the audit protocol referenced therein, the Preliminary Determination became Final; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC issued the Final Determination on June 12, 2016, which indicated that corrective actions nos. 1 through 14 require compliance monitoring; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832 (c) of the City Charter, the EEPC is required to monitor the agency for a period not to exceed six months, from July through December, to determine whether it implemented the required corrective actions; and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832 (c) of the City Charter, the agency is required to respond in 30 days and make monthly reports thereafter to the Commission on the progress of implementation of such corrective actions; and

Whereas, all of the EEPC's corrective actions are required by, or are consistent with, federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; Now Therefore,

**Be It Resolved**, that the Commission approves issuance of this Final Determination to Karen Mazza, Interim Executive Director of the New York City Employees' Retirement System.

Approved unanimously on June 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2017.

Angela Cabrera Commissioner

eugela Calvera

Absent

Arva Rice Commissioner Malini Cadambi Daniel

Commissioner

Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Commissioner



Attention: Audit Coordinator Equal Employment Practices Commission 253 Broadway, Suite 602 New York, NY10007

July 10, 2017

Re: Response to Final Determination

Dear Audit Coordinator,

The New York City Employees' Retirement System (NYCERS) is in receipt of the Final Determination for the Audit conducted by the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC). NYCERS has carefully reviewed the determination and the Corrective Actions that are required. The following is NYCERS' response to the Final Determination and a summary of the Corrective Actions that will be taken by NYCERS.

## Corrective Action #1

On June 21, 2017, the agency Interim Executive Director sent out an agency-wide memo reiterating NYCERS' commitment to Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO), declaring NYCERS' position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and directing employees to the EEO Policy and Handbook. A copy of the memo is attached as Exhibit A.

## **Corrective Action #2**

NYCERS has identified the following community organizations serving women and minorities:

- 1. Women&Minority.com
- 2. EmployDiversity.com
- 3. El Diario

NYCERS will reach out to these organizations when provisional positions are available in order to reach a more diverse hiring pool.

Additionally, NYCERS has assigned a staff member to maintain records of recruitment logs and to conduct an analysis on whether NYCERS' recruitment efforts adversely affect any particular group. Further, NYCERS will conduct an annual meeting with the EEO Professional and HR Professional to assess recruitment efforts, review the analysis of whether any particular group is adversely affected, and to discuss corrective measures where necessary.

### Corrective Action #3

NYCERS will hold an annual meeting with the EEO Professional, HR Professional, and General Counsel to discuss and review the agency's statistical information, the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices. NYCERS will maintain minutes of these meetings. The first of such annual meetings will be held on August 1, 2017 and minutes will be taken.

## Corrective Action #4, #5, and #6

Beginning with calendar year 2017, the agency's EEO and HR professionals will meet twice yearly to review recruitment practices to determine whether the agency's recruitment practices adversely impact a particular group and to take steps for corrective action, if necessary. Additionally, beginning with summer 2017, NYCERS will participate in the Public Service Corps internship programs, and will participate in job fairs and open houses, as appropriate.

## **Corrective Action #7**

Going forward, NYCERS will send out agency-wide emails with job announcements regarding any internal opportunities for lateral transfers and advancement. NYCERS will also post notice of these opportunities on bulletin boards and in the agency's cafeteria.

### **Corrective Action #8**

NYCERS has engaged in several initiatives to develop the skills of its employees and to encourage training and development. The following are brief descriptions of these initiatives.

• NYCERS Leadership Development Program (LDP)
September 2016 – May 2017

This program was created and led by the Training and Organizational Development (TOD) division.

The LDP was a 9 month program focused on working with all of the Leaders at NYCERS (attendees included all employees who have supervisory responsibility) to develop their collective skills. The topics chosen provided for the critical few ideas and tools to be introduced and then practiced so that they became a habit and best practice. The program focused around four group-training sessions, which built on each other. Topics included Communication; Performance Evaluation; Delegation; Effective Time Management through Meetings; Learning Styles and Healthy Practices.

The closing session provided an opportunity for reflection, integration of learning, evaluation and recommendations for future trainings.

The four large group sessions were supplemented by smaller peer group sessions called "learning circles". These monthly groups reinforced the learnings and provided a space for peers to share their practices and learn with and from one another.

Additionally, participants were offered individual coaching support to augment their large and small group experience.

#### • Cornerstone

In 2015, employees representing all levels and divisions came together to develop the NYCERS 100 Strategic Vision. One of the key initiatives that came out of this exercise is the Workforce Excellence (WE) Initiative that looks to focus on one of our most important resources, the NYCERS staff.

Under this initiative we are:

- Analyzing our short term and long-term training needs.
- Identifying in-house knowledge and
- Developing a customized training program that supports the growth and development of our employees and ensures they are prepared for the future at our agency.

NYCERS recently procured Cornerstone, a tool that will be used to support the goals of the WE initiative. Cornerstone, when fully deployed, will be used to manage learning, the performance management process and succession planning. Our employees are our most valuable resource and we are taking steps to help them grow and develop to their full potential through their work and training at NYCERS.

#### Corrective Action #9

Currently, the Interview & Selection Reporting Log captures the applicants name, gender, race, date, and interviewer's name. NYCERS has revised the log to include veteran status, disability, result, and the reason a particular candidate was selected or not selected. A copy of the revised form is attached as Exhibit B.

## Corrective Action #10

Dietra Williams has been designated as NYCERS' Career Counselor. She is a highly trained professional with knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government. An email was sent to all staff informing them of the identity and type of guidance available. A copy of the email is attached as Exhibit C.

#### **Corrective Action #11**

The EEO Officer is registered for the Employee Internal Investigations: Part I course offered by the Cornell University ILR School on October 24, 2017 and October 25, 2017. Proof of registration is attached as Exhibit D.

## **Corrective Action #12**

The EEO Professional and HR Professional will hold bi-annual meetings with the Agency Head to discuss the EEO program and meeting minutes will be taken. The first of such meetings was held on June 13, 2017 and the meeting agenda is attached as Exhibit E.

## **Corrective Action #13**

NYCERS has amended the Managerial Performance Evaluation to include a rating for EEO compliance. The amended NYCERS Management Competencies document is attached as Exhibit F.

## Corrective Action #14

Going forward, NYCERS will commit to submitting an Annual Plan to the EEPC outlining measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity to NYCERS' staff. NYCERS' first Annual Plan will be submitted by September 29, 2017.



July 10, 2017

Attention: Audit Coordinator Equal Employment Practices Commission 253 Broadway, Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

Re: Response to Final Determination

Dear Audit Coordinator:

The New York City Employees' Retirement System has carefully reviewed the determination and the Corrective Actions required by the EEPC. The following is NYCERS' response to the Final Determination and a summary of the Corrective Actions that will be taken by NYCERS.

Sincerely,

Karen Mazza

Interim Executive Director



To: NYCERS Colleagues

From: Melanie Whinnery, Executive Director

**Date:** January 17, 2018

Subject: Equal Employment Practices Commission Audit

As the Executive Director of NYCERS, I reaffirm NYCERS' strong and continuing commitment to maintaining fair employment practices for all employees and job applicants. We are committed to preventing discrimination by ensuring that all employees are aware of their rights and obligations under the Equal Employment Practices policy and encouraging a work environment that respects and values the diversity of our workforce.

The Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) conducts audits of the Equal Employment policies and procedures of all City agencies. The most recent audit addressed a 24-month audit period from July 1, 2014 through December 31, 2016.

In cooperation with the EEPC, we implemented the Commission's recommended enhancements and updates:

- 1. In 2017, the Interim Executive Director issued an EEO policy statement reiterating NYCERS' commitment to EEO and advising all employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals.
- 2. Our Human Resources staff and EEO officers assessed the Agency's recruitment efforts and the way in which candidates are selected for employment to assess whether there is any adverse impact on a particular group. Although most positions at NYCERS are filled through civil service lists, wherever there is discretion in hiring, we will post vacancies broadly to encourage a diverse group to apply. To ensure that no group is negatively impacted by our recruitment efforts, we identified new recruitment sources.
- 3. The EEO officers and HR Director met with the General Counsel to review NYCERS' statistical information on workforce, recruitment, promotions, and separations by race, ethnicity and gender, as well as the annual number of EEO complaints. Going forward, such meetings will be held annually.
- 4. Dietra Williams was appointed NYCERS' Career Counselor. She can be reached at <a href="mailto:dwilliams@nycers.org">dwilliams@nycers.org</a>. You will be reminded at least annually of the availability of this service, how to contact the Career Counselor, and the type of guidance available.
- 5. To increase your awareness of job opportunities, we send email notifications of positions to be filled. We've also established a "Career Corner" on the intranet homepage, which includes internal and external position postings, CUNY-DCAS certificate programs, the

- DCAS yearly exam schedule, and resume preparation tips. There is also a Bulletin Board in lunchrooms and copy rooms where opportunities are also posted.
- 6. To give you opportunities to enhance your candidacy and consideration for new positions and promotions, we have launched a Career Development Program. This program is currently assessing the professional development needs of NYCERS' employees. Based on business needs and the information provided, we will develop training programs to help you achieve your professional goals and meet the needs of the Agency.
- 7. The interview and selection reporting log has been amended to include the name of the interviewers.
- 8. The managerial performance evaluation form was amended to include a rating for EEO compliance.
- 9. An EEO 2018 Annual Plan, which describes the agency's goals to promote EEO compliance, has been developed.

With the implementation of these enhancements, we continue to work together to ensure that NYCERS is a great place to work!

If you have any questions with regard to EEO policies and practices, please contact one of our EEO Officers:

Maya Khodos (347) 643-3612 or mkhodos@nycers.org Craig Thornton (347) 643-3430 or <a href="mailto:cthornton@nycers.org">cthornton@nycers.org</a>

## EQUAL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES COMMISSION CITY OF NEW YORK

RESOLUTION #2017AP/217-009-(2018)C3: Determination of Compliance (Monitoring Period Required) by the New York City Employees' Retirement System with the Equal Employment Practices Commission's required corrective actions pursuant to the Review, Evaluation and Monitoring of the Employment Practices and Procedures from July 1, 2014 to December 31, 2016.

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2) and (5) of the New York City Charter, the Equal Employment Practices Commission is authorized to audit and evaluate the employment practices, programs, policies, and procedures of city agencies and their efforts to ensure fair and effective equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women, and to make recommendations to city agencies to insure equal employment opportunity for minority group members and women; and

Whereas, pursuant to Chapter 36, Section 831(d)(2), this Commission has adopted *Uniform Standards for EEPC Audits* and *Minimum Equal Employment Opportunity Standards for Community Boards* to assess agencies' EEO programs and policies for compliance with federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; and

Whereas, pursuant to its audit and analysis of the New York City Employees' Retirement System's (NYCERS) Employment Practices and Procedures, the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC) issued a Preliminary Determination letter, dated May 16, 2017, setting forth findings and the following required corrective actions:

- Issue a general EEO Policy statement or memo reiterating commitment to EEO, declaring the agency's position against discrimination on any protected basis, advising employees of the names and contact information of EEO professionals, and attaching, or providing employees pertinent electronic links to, an EEO Policy/Handbook.
- 2. Assess recruitment efforts to determine whether such efforts adversely impact any particular group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, at a minimum, identify relevant professional and community organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups throughout the City, review and update listings of recruitment outreach sources, and contact these organizations when provisional positions become available or where the agency may otherwise use discretion in hiring.
- 3. Ensure that the principal EEO Professional, HR Professional and General Counsel, review the agency's statistical information (i.e. workforce, hires, promotions, and separations by race ethnicity and gender), the annual number of EEO complaints, and the agency's employment practices, policies and programs on an annual basis to identify whether there are barriers to equal opportunity within the agency and determine what, if any, corrective actions are required in order to correct deficiencies (e.g. underutilization or adverse impact). If necessary, consult with the Law Department, Division of Citywide Diversity and EEO, or another resource for guidance.
- 4. Assess the manner in which candidates are selected for employment to determine whether there is any adverse impact upon any particular racial, ethnic, disability, or gender group. To the extent that adverse impact is discovered, determine whether the selection criteria being utilized are job-related. Discontinue using criteria that are not job-related, and adopt methods which diminish adverse impact.

- 5. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in titles where there is discretion in hiring, advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications; contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs/open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 6. If women, minorities, or other protected groups are underrepresented in civil service (list) titles, review the competencies, skills and abilities required (as presented in job vacancy notices and notices of examination) for available positions to ensure that these standards are updated, job-related and required by business necessity. (This includes working with DCAS or the Civil Service Commission if applicable.) Then advertise in minority- or female-oriented publications, contact organizations serving women, minorities, and other protected groups; participate in career fairs or open houses; or use internships to attract interested persons and to develop and hire interested and qualified candidates.
- 7. Promote employees' awareness of opportunities for advancement and transfer within the agency by: administering incentive programs; publicizing promotions, including promotions into, or changes in, the managerial ranks; and/ or using other methods to communicate internal opportunities.
- 8. Ensure that employees are considered internally for career enhancement, development opportunities and transfer by: providing and encouraging training, development or mentorship programs to improve their performance and skills; establishing internal talent pools via cross-training, cross divisional assignments, job transfers, and/ or job rotation; and identifying internal successors with applicable knowledge/skills/abilities.
- 9. Use and maintain an applicant/candidate log or tracking system which, at minimum, includes the position, applicants'/candidates' names, identification number, ethnicity, gender, disability or veteran status, interview date, interviewers' names, result, reason selected/not selected (or disposition) of each applicant, and recruitment source. Ensure that the process avoids the appearance of bias by delegating the responsibility for recording and maintaining this information to an individual other than the individuals involved in the hiring decision.
- 10. Designate a professional (may be referred to as the Career Counselor) with appropriate training, knowledge and familiarity with career opportunities in City government to provide career counseling to employees upon request. Remind employees of the identity/type of guidance available from the Career Counselor at least once each year.
- 11. Ensure that EEO professionals are trained in EEO laws and procedures and know how to carry out their responsibilities under the EEO Policy.
- 12. Maintain appropriate documentation of meetings and other communications between the agency head (or a direct report other than the General Counsel) and the principal EEO Professional regarding decisions that impact the administration and operation of the EEO program.
- 13. Ensure that the managerial performance evaluation form contains a rating for EEO (which covers responsibilities and processes for assuring their ability to make employment decisions based on merit and equal consideration, or treat others in an equitable and impartial manner).
- 14. Submit to the EEPC an Annual Plan of measures and programs to provide equal employment opportunity, and quarterly reports (up to 30 days following each quarter) on efforts to implement the plan.

Whereas, the NYCERS did not submit a response to the EEPC's Preliminary Determination letter within 14 days from the date of its issuance, and, consistent with the audit protocol referenced therein, the Preliminary Determination became Final; and,

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC issued a Final Determination on June 13, 2017 which indicated that corrective action nos. 1 - 14 required compliance monitoring; and

Whereas, the NYCERS submitted its response to the EEPC's final determination letter, on July 10, 2017, and

Whereas, in accordance with Chapter 36, Section 832(c) of the New York City Charter, the EEPC monitored the agency's implementation of the corrective actions from July 2017 to December 2017 with no extension of the monitoring period;

Whereas, at the EEPC's request pursuant to Section 815.a.(15) of the New York City Charter, the NYCERS submitted a copy of the agency head's memorandum to staff dated January 17, 2018, which outlined the corrective actions implemented in response to the EEPC's audit and reiterated his commitment to the agency's EEO Program; and

Whereas, all of the EEPC's corrective actions are required by, or are consistent with, federal, state and local laws, regulations, policies and procedures which are designed to increase equality of opportunity for women, minorities, and other employees and job applicants identified for protection from discrimination in employment within municipal government; Now Therefore,

Be It Resolved, that the NYCERS has implemented the required corrective actions deemed necessary to ensure compliance with the equal employment opportunity standards of this Commission and requirements of Chapters 35 and 36 of the City Charter.

Be It Resolved, that the Commission will forward this Determination of Compliance to Executive Director Melanie Whinnery of the New York City Employees' Retirement System.

Approved unanimously on January 25, 2018.

Angela Cabrera Commissioner

Absent

Arva Rice Commissioner Malini Cadambi Daniel

Commissioner

Elaine S. Reiss, Esq.
Commissioner



Angela Cabrera Malini Cadambi Daniel Elaine S. Reiss, Esq. Arva R. Rice Commissioners

Charise L. Terry, PHR
Executive Director

Judith Garcia Quiñonez, Esq. Executive Agency Counsel

253 Broadway Suite 602 New York, NY 10007

212. 615. 8939 tel. 212. 615. 8931 fax

### BY MAIL AND EMAIL

January 25, 2018

Melanie Whinnery Executive Director New York City Employees' Retirement System 335 Adams Street, Suite 2300 Brooklyn, NY 11201

Re: Resolution #2017AP/217-009-(2018)C3: Determination of Agency Compliance

Dear Executive Director Whinnery:

On behalf of the members of the Equal Employment Practices Commission (EEPC or Commission), I want to inform you that the Commission has issued the attached Determination of Compliance to the New York City Employees' Retirement System. This Commission has determined that the New York City Employees' Retirement System has implemented the required corrective actions deemed necessary by this Commission for ensuring a fair and effective affirmative employment program of equal opportunity as required by the equal employment opportunity standards of this Commission and Chapters 35 and 36 of the New York City Charter.

On behalf of this Commission, I want to thank you and Principal EEO Professional Craig Thornton, for the cooperation extended to the EEPC during the compliance-monitoring period.

Sincerely,

Malini Cadambi Daniel

Commissioner

c: Principal EEO Professional, Craig Thornton, NYCERS

Cadami Janiel

This

## Determination of Compliance

is issued to the

# New York City Employees' Retirement

for successfully implementing 14 of 14 required corrective actions pursuant to the Equal Employment Practices Commission's Employment Practice and Procedures Audit From July 1,2014 to this date.

In care of Executive Director Melanie Whinnery and Principal EEO Professional Craig Thornton On this 25th day of January in the year 2018

a Cadanti-lame

Malini Cadambi Daniel, Commissioner

Charise L. Terry, PHR, Executive Director