



City of New York

OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER

John C. Liu
COMPTROLLER



IT Audit & Research

Tina Kim

Deputy Comptroller for Audit

Audit Report on the Maintenance and
Repairs of the City's Playgrounds by the
Department of Parks and Recreation

Queens Borough Office

7R12-142A

April 11, 2013

<http://comptroller.nyc.gov>



THE CITY OF NEW YORK
OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER
1 CENTRE STREET
NEW YORK, N.Y. 10007-2341

John C. Liu
COMPTROLLER

April 11, 2013

To the Residents of the City of New York:

My office has audited the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) to determine the timeliness of maintenance and repairs of the City's public playgrounds in Queens. We audit entities such as DPR as a mean of ensuring that the City's public playgrounds are properly maintained and safe for children to use.

The Queens Borough Commissioner's office routinely cleans and maintains borough playgrounds. It completed 87 percent of its work orders issued during the audit's scope period. However, the Queens Borough office does not complete remedial work in a timely manner. Specifically, 64 percent of the work orders issued and completed were completed within 30 days. The remaining 36 percent of work orders were completed beyond 30 days. Furthermore, of the 527 Immediate Attention (IA) conditions reported to the Borough Office, 58 IAs (11 percent) were not resolved within the required 30 days. In fact, some took from 72 days to 152 days. We also found that Queens Borough district offices lack guidelines that specify the timeframes for the repair of non-IA conditions.

Based on the work order descriptions provided by DPR, we found that 55 work orders may have been classified as requiring IAs if the conditions had been identified by Parks Inspection Program (PIP) inspectors. These items were not completed in a timely manner. Additionally, the District offices are not effectively monitoring the status of open work orders and the information in Asset Management Property System (AMPS) is often not correct.

The timeliness of DPR's resolution of IA repairs will be affected in the near term by the impact of Hurricane Sandy, resulting in the increased importance of prioritizing those items that represent IAs or hazardous conditions.

The audit contains nine recommendations that, if implemented, should improve the conditions and safety of the Queens playgrounds.

The results of the audit have been discussed with DPR officials, and their comments have been considered in preparing this report. Their complete written response is attached to this report.

If you have any questions concerning this report, please e-mail my audit bureau at audit@comptroller.nyc.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "JCL".

John C. Liu

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AUDIT REPORT IN BRIEF	1
Audit Findings and Conclusion	1
Audit Recommendations.....	2
Agency Response.....	2
INTRODUCTION	3
Background	3
Objective.....	4
Scope and Methodology Statement.....	4
Discussion of Audit Results	4
FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	6
Repairs Not Carried Out on a Timely Basis	6
Timeliness for Completion of Work Orders	6
Recommendations	7
Timeliness of IA Repairs	7
Recommendation	8
Lack of Standard Timeframe for Repairs	8
Recommendation	9
Inconsistent Categorizing of Repairs.....	9
Recommendations	9
Work Orders Not Completed	10
Open Work Orders Not Tracked.....	10
Recommendations	10
Other Issue	11
Recommendation	11
DETAILED SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	12

APPENDIX I

APPENDIX II

APPENDIX III

ADDENDUM

THE CITY OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER IT AUDIT & RESEARCH

Audit Report on the Maintenance and Repairs of the City's Playgrounds by the Department of Parks and Recreation

Queens Borough Office

7R12-142A

AUDIT REPORT IN BRIEF

The New York City Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) maintains a municipal parks system of more than 29,000 acres throughout the City, including more than 1,700 parks, 2,500 Greenstreet sites, and over 1,000 playgrounds. One of DPR's principal missions is to manage and care for all playgrounds and playground fixtures in the City.

To provide local parks services, a Borough Commissioner is appointed for each of the City's five boroughs. Each Borough commissioner oversees the management and operations of agency programs and is responsible for the administrative management of parks and green spaces within the borough, including the maintenance and repair of City parks and playgrounds. A Chief of Operations in each borough oversees the daily operations of all DPR facilities within the borough and ensures that playgrounds are properly maintained.

Audit Findings and Conclusion

The Queens Borough Commissioner's office routinely cleans and maintains borough playgrounds. It completed 87 percent of its work orders issued during the audit's scope period. However, the Queens Borough office does not complete remedial work in a timely manner. Specifically, only 64 percent of the work orders issued and completed were completed within 30 days. The remaining 36 percent of work orders were completed beyond 30 days. Furthermore, of the 527 "Immediate Attention" (IA) conditions reported to the Borough Office, 58 IAs (11 percent) were not resolved within the required 30 days. In fact, some took from 72 days to 152 days. We also found that Queens Borough district offices lack guidelines that specify the timeframes for the repair of non-IA conditions.

Based on work order descriptions provided by DPR, we found that 55 work orders may have been classified as requiring IA if the conditions had been identified by Parks Inspection Program (PIP) inspectors. These items were not resolved in a timely manner. Additionally, the District

offices are not effectively monitoring the status of open work orders and the information in the Asset Management Property System (AMPS)¹ is often not correct.

The timeliness of DPR's resolution of IA repairs will be affected in the near term by the impact of Hurricane Sandy, resulting in the increased importance of prioritizing those items that represent IAs or hazardous conditions.

Audit Recommendations

This report makes a total of nine recommendations, including that DPR should:

- Implement standards to ensure that supervisory inspections adhere to PIP standards for remediating IA conditions.
- Remediate all work orders with hazardous conditions within 30 days.
- Ensure that IAs are resolved within 30 days.
- Categorize work order repair types and assign specific timeframes for remediating repairs in each category. Categorize conditions identified by District Supervisors using the same criteria used by the PIP inspectors.
- Monitor open work orders that are identified as hazardous and resolve them promptly.
- Regularly monitor the status of open work orders and update them in AMPS.
- Follow up on work requests to ensure they have been processed.
- Create work orders before the repairs are completed.

Agency Response

In their response, DPR officials contended that the work orders were prioritized and completed in a timely manner and disagreed with "several findings in the reports regarding how Parks manages its maintenance program and its work orders." However, DPR officials agreed that the reports "raised some important issues regarding the maintenance and repair of the City's playgrounds which we appreciate" and "... We agree that a formal review process for all open work orders would ensure that all requests are managed appropriately."

The agency also said, "In addition, upon careful review of Parks operations and the recommendations in the report, we believe that current and action underway already address the issues raised."

¹ DPR uses AMPS to organize its work orders, daily cleaning work, and inventory related to the general maintenance of parks.

INTRODUCTION

Background

The New York City Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) maintains a municipal parks system of more than 29,000 acres throughout the City, including more than 1,700 parks, 2,500 Greenstreet² sites, and over 1,000 playgrounds. One of DPR's principal missions is to manage and care for all playgrounds and playground fixtures in the City.

To provide local parks services, a Borough Commissioner is appointed for each of the City's five boroughs. Each Borough commissioner oversees the management and operations of agency programs and is responsible for the administrative management of parks and green spaces within the borough, including the maintenance and repair of City parks and playgrounds. A Chief of Operations in each borough oversees the daily operations of all DPR facilities within the borough and ensures that playgrounds are properly maintained.

Borough parks are geographically organized into districts.³ Each district office is managed by a DPR supervisor who inspects the playgrounds in each district park at least once every two weeks. Supervisors are responsible for routine cleaning and maintenance of the playgrounds. The frequency of supervisor inspections and maintenance scheduling is dependent on the level of use for each playground. If a supervisory inspection found issues with cleanliness or maintenance, a supervisor can either correct the issues (if possible) during the inspection or initiate a work request to carry out corrective work. Work order requests are recorded in a computerized data management program called AMPS.

In addition to supervisory inspections, DPR's Office of Operations and Management Planning (OMP) oversees an inspection program known as the "Parks Inspection Program"⁴ (PIP). Depending on the severity of the condition cited by the PIP inspector, a serious condition is identified as requiring "immediate attention" (IA), which must be remediated within four weeks (i.e., 30 days). Conditions that are classified by PIP inspectors as IAs are considered hazardous and are forwarded to the Borough's officials for remediation. Subsequently, District offices will be notified and asked to assess the conditions. As a follow-up, district supervisors are required to re-inspect the playground's conditions that were cited by PIP inspectors.

According to AMPS, district offices in Queens issued 6,164 playground-related work orders during our 12-month audit scope period. (See Table I)

² Launched in 1996, the Greenstreets program began as a partnership between DPR and the New York City Department of Transportation (DOT). The program was created to change unused road areas into green spaces that beautify neighborhoods, improve air quality, reduce air temperatures, and calm traffic. Since its beginning, over 2,500 Greenstreets have been built citywide.

³ The Districts are closely correlated to the community districts in the Borough. Each District varies in size and may have more than one playground. The Borough of Queens is divided into 16 Districts and has a total of 252 playgrounds.

⁴ The Parks Inspection Program (PIP) is a comprehensive, outcome-based performance measurement system that generates frequent, random, and detailed inspections of our parks and playgrounds. This program provides DPR management, elected officials, and the public with a broad indicator of the condition of City parks. The program has been designed to reflect conditions encountered by the public when using DPR facilities.

Table I

Work Order Status as of May 29, 2012

Category	Number of Work Orders	Percentage
Completed ⁵	5,352	87%
Open	619	10%
Work Request	193	3%
Total	6,164	100%

The Comptroller’s Office previously conducted an audit to evaluate the PIP’s effectiveness in monitoring public playgrounds in Queens, entitled “Audit Report on the Effectiveness of the Department of Parks and Recreation’s Parks Inspection Program—Queens Playgrounds Report” (7R12-097A, issued March 8, 2012). That audit found that OMP officials inspect the playgrounds as required and forward the results of the inspections to DPR officials and borough officials, including the Borough Commissioner and Chief of Operations, for review and correction of deficient conditions. The audit also identified instances where the Queens Chief of Operations did not correct reportable conditions in a timely manner.

Objective

The objective of this audit is to determine the timeliness of maintenance and repairs of the City’s public playgrounds by the Queens Borough Commissioner’s Office.

Scope and Methodology Statement

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. This audit was conducted in accordance with the audit responsibilities of the City Comptroller as set forth in Chapter 5, §93 of the New York City Charter.

The scope of this audit was from April 1, 2011, through March 2012. Please refer to the Detailed Scope and Methodology at the end of this report for the specific procedures and tests that were conducted.

Discussion of Audit Results

The matters covered in this report were discussed with DPR officials during and at the conclusion of this audit. A preliminary draft report was sent to DPR officials and was discussed at an exit conference held on October 26, 2012. On January 11, 2013, we submitted a draft report to DPR officials with a request for comments. We received a written response on January 29, 2013. In their response, DPR officials contended that the work orders were prioritized and completed in a timely manner and disagreed with “several findings in the reports regarding how Parks manages its maintenance program and its work orders.” However, DPR

⁵ The category of completed work orders (5,352) included all work orders with a completion date and were closed out in AMPS. This included 83 cancelled work orders.

officials agreed that the reports “raised some important issues regarding the maintenance and repair of the City’s playgrounds which we appreciate” and “...We agree that a formal review process for all open work orders would ensure that all requests are managed appropriately.”

The agency also said, “In addition, upon careful review of Parks operations and the recommendations in the report, we believe that current and action underway already address the issues raised.”

The full text of the DPR response is included as an addendum to this final report.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The Queens Borough Commissioner's office routinely cleans and maintains borough playgrounds. It completed 87 percent of its work orders issued during the audit's scope period. However, the Queens Borough office does not complete remedial work in a timely manner. Specifically, only 64 percent of the work orders that were issued and completed were completed within 30 days. The remaining 36 percent of work orders were completed beyond 30 days. Furthermore, of the 527 IAs reported to the Borough Office, 58 IAs (11 percent) were not resolved within the required 30 days. In fact, some took from 72 days to 152 days. We also found that Queens Borough district offices lack guidelines that specify the timeframes for the repair of non-IA conditions.

Based on work order descriptions provided by DPR, we found that 55 work orders may have been classified as requiring IA if the conditions had been identified by PIP inspectors. These items were not resolved in a timely manner. Additionally, the District offices are not effectively monitoring the status of open work orders and the information in AMPS is often not correct.

The timeliness of DPR's resolution of IA repairs will be affected in the near term by the impact of Hurricane Sandy, resulting in the increased importance of prioritizing those items that represent IAs or hazardous conditions.

These matters are discussed below.

Repairs Not Carried Out on a Timely Basis

Timeliness for Completion of Work Orders

Unlike the IA work orders, there is no required timeframe for completion of work orders initiated by the District Office. Our review found that DPR did not complete remedial work in a timely manner for 1,884 (36 percent) of the work orders that were initiated between April 2011 to March 2012 by the Queens District Offices. According to information contained in AMPS, 5,269 work orders⁶ were completed as of May 29, 2012. The work orders were for routine maintenance items, repairs to play equipment and structures, and forestry. DPR completed 3,385⁷ work orders within 30 days, while the remainder --1,884-- were completed beyond 30 days. In those cases, work was completed between 31 and 402 days after the work order was initiated. (See Table II)

Table II

Timeliness of Completing Work Orders Initiated by the Queens District Offices

Days Resolved	Work Orders	Percentage
Within 30 days	3,385	64%
Within 60 days	661	13%
Within 90 days	391	7%
Over 90 days	832	16%
Total	5,269	100%

⁶ Of the 5,352 work orders, 83 were cancelled. Only 5,269 work orders had work that was actually completed by the district offices.

⁷ Of the 3,385 work orders, 96 had been completed prior to issuance of the work orders, according to AMPS.

Of the 1,884 work orders not resolved within 30 days, we identified 55 work orders pertaining to conditions that were similar to the description of IAs in the “Parks Inspection Program Standards.”⁸ Accordingly, we believe that these conditions may have been classified by PIP inspectors as IAs because of their potential to pose safety hazards to the public. Some of the conditions reported in the 55 work orders included trip hazards, ankle-turned gaps, and loose play equipment. Although supervisory inspections are not required to adhere to the same standards as PIP inspections, conditions that are similar to IAs and that pose a potential hazard to the public should be resolved within a timely basis, such as the 30-day requirement set by PIP.

Recommendations

DPR should:

1. Implement standards to ensure that supervisory inspections adhere to PIP standards for remediating IA conditions.

DPR Response: “IAs are only issued by specially trained and skilled Parks Inspectors. Parks will continue to treat conditions discovered by M&O field staff supervision with the same gravity as those found by PIP Inspectors. Supervisors will also continue to identify conditions using the same language and standards as per the PIP program.”

2. Remediate all work orders with hazardous conditions within 30 days.

DPR Response: “Parks has a system in place to manage and monitor IAs, which ensures that all IAs are properly resolved within a specified timeframe. However, Parks continuously close out any work orders within a reasonable time frame. If a work order is considered hazardous, Parks will ensure the work is done as soon as possible, and minimally, the area will be made safe for the general public.”

Auditor Comment: As acknowledged in our report, we understand supervisory inspections are not required to adhere to the same standards as PIP inspections; however, we are pleased that DPR’s supervisors use the same language and standards as per the PIP program to identify conditions in the playgrounds. Accordingly, we expect the work orders with descriptions of hazardous conditions to be resolved within the stipulated timeframe in PIP standards.

Timeliness of IA Repairs

District offices are responsible for ensuring that IA conditions are properly addressed and resolved. Conditions that are classified by PIP inspectors as IAs are forwarded to the Borough’s Chief of Operations and District offices for assessment and resolution. IA conditions are required to be resolved within two to four weeks. IAs are tracked by OMP and recorded in OMP’s own system as of the date of the inspection and IAs are “closed out” or deemed resolved by OMP when proof of repair and completion is submitted by the appropriate District office.

PIP inspectors in Queens identified 527 IA conditions between April 2011 and March 2012. Of the 527 conditions, 58 (11 percent) were not resolved within 30 days.⁹ Some took as long as 31 to 152 days to resolve and one remained unresolved¹⁰ as of April 8, 2012. Two of the 58 IA

⁸ See Appendix I for the list of 55 work orders.

⁹ See Appendix II for the list of IAs over 30 days.

¹⁰ This IA was resolved on July 12, 2012.

conditions were classified as priority 1, which is the most serious type of condition that, according to PIP standards, is a hazard that “presents the chance of a life-threatening or permanently debilitating injury.” However, one of the two priority 1 conditions (“dangling tree limb”) was not resolved until 34 days after the condition was noted; the other condition (“safety surface”) was not resolved until 74 days later. Conditions classified as IAs should be resolved in a timely manner to ensure that potentially hazardous conditions do not jeopardize public safety.

We requested additional documentation pertaining to 15 of the 58 conditions. We found four instances in which PIP inspectors identified IA conditions, but a corresponding work order was not issued until from one month to four months later. However, after work orders were issued for the four IAs, conditions were resolved within 30 days. According to DPR’s officials, the delay in resolving IA conditions may have been caused by the lack of available trade staff, materials, capital funding, or weather. However, we were not able to find any written justification for the District Offices’ failure to resolve the IAs within 30 days.

Recommendation

DPR should:

3. Ensure that IAs are resolved within 30 days.

DPR Response: “Parks policy is to resolve all IAs within 30 days and will continue to monitor and follow-up on all conditions that are hazardous. In order to ensure IAs are resolved promptly, we currently have the Daily Immediate Attention (“DIA”) System that manages and monitors the number of IAs as well as the resolution of these hazards...”

Auditor Comment: We are aware of the “DIA” System and our finding was based on the data extracted from the system. DPR officials claimed that the alleged delays were caused by various factors, but did not have sufficient documentation to support this. We urge DPR officials to document delays and inform OMP of any delays in remediation and resolve IAs promptly.

Lack of Standard Timeframe for Repairs

Routine maintenance and playground repairs are performed by DPR employees. According to DPR officials, work orders are prioritized¹¹ by the Supervisor of Mechanics or by DPR supervisors and managers. However, there is no standardized timeframe for each type of repair. During the course of our fieldwork, we noted a lack of standard timeframes and inconsistencies for remediating similar types of deficient conditions. For example, the timeframe to repair damaged benches ranged from one to 212 days and to replace damaged/worn juvenile swings from one to 225 days. DPR officials explained that the differences in the turnaround time could have been caused by availability of staff and material resources or weather.

DPR should organize work orders into repair categories (e.g., safety surface repairs, play equipment repairs, pave surfaces, tree-related, and comfort stations) and specify timeframes for remediating conditions in each category. DPR should also assign prioritizations within each category. This would allow borough offices to more effectively monitor, track, and allocate resources to repair hazardous conditions and would ultimately lessen the chance that minor conditions could become hazardous.

¹¹ Work orders are prioritized using a number system from 01 to 05, in which 01 has the lowest priority and 05 has the highest.

Recommendation

DPR should:

4. Categorize work order repair types and assign specific timeframes for remediating repairs in each category.

DPR Response: "Parks does categorize work orders, but it is based on the Borough Supervisor of Trades and/or the Deputy Chief of Operations to prioritize work orders and schedule the repair work. Furthermore, work order timeframes may also be dependent on capital work being scheduled and may result in extended periods for completion."

Auditor Comment: We are pleased that DPR does categorize and prioritize work orders. However, DPR should provide the supervisors with a standardized timeframe of completion for each category to ensure that the repairs are completed in a timely manner.

Inconsistent Categorizing of Repairs

As previously mentioned, DPR's Office of Operations and Management Planning (OMP) oversees an inspection program known as the "Parks Inspection Program" (PIP). The results of these inspections are forwarded to the Borough Commissioner and the Chief of Operations. Conditions that are classified by PIP inspectors as IAs are considered hazardous and must be remediated within four weeks (i.e., 30 days).

Of the 619 unresolved work orders listed in AMPS, we found 80 work orders generated by the District supervisors during their routine inspections that likely may have been classified as IAs if found by OPM during an inspection. However, these serious conditions are not classified as IAs because District supervisors do not use the "Parks Inspection Program Standards" to classify conditions. All 80 cases remained open in AMPS for periods ranging from 59 days to 412 days as of May 29, 2012.

After the exit conference, DPR officials provided documentation for these 80 work orders. Because the status of these work orders was not entered into AMPS, they were reported open as of May 29, 2012. Based on the documentation provided, we found that of the 80 cases, 15 were remediated prior to May 29, 2012. Of the remaining 65 work orders, seven were cancelled and 58 were completed and closed out in AMPS after May 29, 2012¹².

Recommendations

DPR should:

5. Categorize conditions identified by District Supervisors using the same criteria used by the PIP inspectors.

DPR Response: "A new mobile handheld inspection module is being implemented in AMPS to enhance inspections for M&O. This will allow Parks supervisors to conduct field inspections on their mobile hand held devices. Further, they will use standards to conduct these inspections from the PIP manual. Supervisors will also

¹² See Appendix III for the list of 80 work orders.

continue to identify conditions using the same language and standards as per the PIP program.”

6. Monitor open work orders that are identified as hazardous and resolve them promptly.

DPR Response: “All Supervisors have the ability to view work orders identified as being a hazardous condition and can ascertain the age of any work order generated. Parks will continue to resolve these issues as promptly as situations allow.”

Work Orders Not Completed

According to information contained in AMPS, District offices in Queens issued 6,164¹³ work orders within a 12-month period (April 2011 to March 2012). Of these, 619 work orders (10 percent) were listed as open as of May 29, 2012. Four hundred and eighty-seven (79 percent) were open for more than 100 days. These 487 work orders range from minor maintenance items (e.g., adding updated historic and routing signs, installing soap dispensers, and turning on water) to potentially hazardous conditions (e.g., damage to benches, raised safety surfaces, sharp edges on play equipment, and patching wide gaps between safety surfaces). (See Table III)

Table III

Outstanding Work Orders as of May 29, 2012

Days Open	Work Orders	Percentage
Over 300 days	109	18%
201-300 days	160	26%
101-200 days	218	35%
100 days & under	132	21%
Total	619	100%

Open Work Orders Not Tracked

We requested justification for 50 of the 619 open work orders. After our request, District offices revised the status of 26 out of the 50 work orders to “completed.” The remaining 24 work orders that remained open included cracked pavement repair/replacing safety surfaces, install window guards inside comfort station, and replacing bench slates. As of May 29, 2012, the 24 work orders were open between 68 and 406 days. Additionally, we identified 193 work requests (31 percent) that were initiated between April 2011 and March 2012, but these were neither processed as work orders nor cancelled. Some were outstanding for more than a year.

Recommendations

DPR should:

7. Regularly monitor the status of open work orders and update them in AMPS.

¹³ Of 6,164 work orders, 5,269 are shown as completed, 619 as open, 193 as work request, and 83 as cancelled.

DPR Response: “As the auditors are aware, in a number of instances work order conditions were corrected but their status in AMPS was not updated. As a result, District Supervision will be advised to assess the state of open work on a monthly basis, and make any required updates. Furthermore, the Borough Supervisor of Trades and/or the Deputy Chief of Operations prioritize repair work orders, depending on the nature of the work order, the hazardous nature of the condition, and the scheduling of repair work.”

8. Follow up on work requests to ensure they have been processed.

DPR Response: “District Supervision will be advised to assess the state of work that needs to be done on a monthly basis, and follow up with the appropriate parties in order to complete the work orders.”

Other Issue

As previously noted, DPR uses AMPS to organize work orders and to record supply inventories and the results of daily cleaning activities. Beginning June 2009¹⁴, AMPS replaced individual borough databases with a single unified system. Our review of the summary work order report generated by AMPS found data entry errors that were not corrected by AMPS. Specifically, of the 5,269 work orders that were reported as completed, we found that 96 (1.8 percent) work orders have inaccurate dates. The individual completion dates on the report generated by AMPS were earlier than the work order issuance dates. According to DPR’s official, these work orders were created subsequent to the completion of work. Because AMPS prevented users from backdating, the actual date was recorded as the work order issuance date.

Recommendation

DPR should:

9. Create work orders before the repairs are completed.

DPR Response: “With improvements to the AMPS handheld devices currently being implemented, trades workers will have the ability to create work orders in the field as necessary. Emergency situations will occasionally arise in the field, and emergency work will continue to be done in a timely nature regardless of the creation of a formal work request/order if the severity of the work dictates.”

Auditor Comment: One of AMPS’s major functions was to monitor the work progress via the creation of work orders. We understand emergency situations may arise from time to time, but we strongly encourage entering work orders in AMPS prior to repairs being completed to effectively monitor, track, and allocate resources.

¹⁴ The system was rolled out by borough starting with Queens in June 2009, Manhattan in April 2010, Staten Island in September 2010, the Bronx in November 2010, and Brooklyn in February 2011.

DETAILED SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. This audit was conducted in accordance with the audit responsibilities of the City Comptroller as set forth in Chapter 5, §93, of the New York City Charter.

The scope period of this audit was April 2011 through March 2012. To meet our objectives, we obtained and reviewed the 2004 edition of DPR's "Field Operations Book."

To gain an understanding of the Borough operation, we interviewed the Queens Borough Officials and the district supervisor.

To determine if the playgrounds are routinely cleaned, we requested one month of bi-weekly work schedules of the cleaning crew for March 2012 and a daily task routing slip that shows lists of playgrounds cleaned in March 2012 for each of the 16 District Offices in Queens.

To determine if the work orders were completed in a timely manner, we requested a summary report for all playground-related work orders issued from April 2011 to March 2012, and we analyzed the time lapse for these work orders based on the issuance date and the audit fieldwork procedure completion date of May 29, 2012. For those work orders that took longer than 30 days to be completed, we reviewed the descriptions of the repairs and determined whether some of these conditions should have been corrected earlier. To determine whether there are adequate justifications for the work orders that are still open, we randomly selected 50 out of 619 work orders and requested status and additional information from the Borough office for review.

To determine whether the IAs were resolved in a timely manner, we reviewed the Parks Inspection Program (PIP) IA summary report for Queens from April 2011 to March 2012, and analyzed the time lapse of the IAs based on when the IAs were issued and resolved. To determine the reasons why IAs were not resolved within 30 days, we randomly selected 15 of 58 IAs and requested additional information from DPR officials.

Possible Immediate Attention Conditions as of May 29, 2012

(Descriptions are unaltered from DPR's records and are therefore uncorrected for grammatical and spelling errors)*

	WO #	Description*	Location	Date Created	Date Completed	# Days Elapsed
1	585980	Replace and secure missing bricks on paths	Jhs 67 Playground (Louis Pasteur)	3/24/2012	4/24/2012	32
2	506150	MW (possbile PR 2) - Cold patch uplifted paver on 26 Ave.	Clearview Playground	6/30/2011	8/1/2011	33
3	567560	Replace rotten timbers on PE bridge	Triborough Bridge Playground B	2/8/2012	3/13/2012	34
4	530956	please replace bolt(collar top of a frame) j swings cautioned off	Hoover/Manton Playgrounds	9/27/2011	11/1/2011	35
5	457676	Repair 2 trip hazards on ramp to C/S	Linden Park	5/22/2011	6/27/2011	36
6	532188	Repalce rusty/worn shackles on k swings	Police Officer Edward Byrne Park	10/2/2011	11/7/2011	37
7	549299	SMW- fill gaps / uplifts and 2 3in holes along 25 Ave sidewalk	Flushing Fields-Leonardo Ingravallo Playground	12/4/2011	1/9/2012	37
8	548951	*MW- exposed metal on step of PG equip	Fresh Meadows Playground (PS 173)	12/2/2011	1/9/2012	38
9	429705	Hole in sidewalk to right of entrance on 17 Rd.	Jhs 194 Playground (clintonville)	4/24/2011	6/3/2011	40
10	562867	QBC/S -safety surface in front of k swing area 3 to 4 inch gaps	Cunningham Park-210th St Playground	1/24/2012	3/4/2012	40
11	559915	2-inch ankle turn on MPPA outfield btw west bbct and mppa	Glendale Playground	1/12/2012	2/21/2012	40
12	532992	Replace 4 J-strap swings and check loose A-frame	Fresh Meadows Playground (PS 173)	10/5/2011	11/14/2011	41
13	518415	Tree down inside of park, blocking street	George U Harvey Playground	8/10/2011	9/21/2011	43
14	480099	Concrete too high trip hazard	Triborough Bridge Playground B	6/14/2011	7/27/2011	43
15	453833	*Secure safety surface mats in old play area	Thomas J Travers Park	5/19/2011	7/1/2011	44
16	450983	Correct sidewalk trip hazard. (Uplifted flag 1.5" trip across)	Jhs 198 Playground (Cardozo)	5/15/2011	7/1/2011	47
17	556604	Safety surface/ cut high plugs all areas	Daniel M O'Connell Playground	1/1/2012	2/17/2012	47
18	512609	Trip hazard at tree pit & chess tables need cold patch	Lefferts Playground	7/22/2011	9/8/2011	49
19	510569	QBC/S missing piece of safety surface in-house	Frederick B Judge Mem Playground	7/15/2011	9/6/2011	53
20	566025	MW-repair uneven deteriorated paved sufaces-jf	Clement Clarke Moore Homestead	2/2/2012	3/26/2012	53
21	537057	Beach Channel PG - repair trip hazard at entrance to HBCT	Ps 183 Playground-HANDBALL	10/20/2011	12/13/2011	55
22	432395	Replace 7 splintered VR bench slats	Ps 42 Playground (almeda)	4/27/2011	6/24/2011	58
23	560834	Trip hazard near valve cover south of parkhouse	Andrew J Reiff Mem Park	1/16/2012	3/15/2012	59
24	514862	Repair loose safety surface in K-Swing area	Walter Crowley Playground	7/30/2011	9/27/2011	60
25	563229	SMW_trip H adj to df	James A Bland Houses Playground	1/25/2012	3/26/2012	61
26	548287	*Remove stump from playground (Hurricane Irene)	Pat Williams Playground-Hempstead Bench Stretch	11/30/2011	2/3/2012	66
27	519215	Trip hazard at entrance to HBC on 102 St. side (needs cold patch)	Police Officer Nicholas DeMutiis Park	8/13/2011	10/21/2011	70
28	548045	Repair ankle turn by k&j swings	Forest Park-Mary Whalen Plygd	11/29/2011	2/14/2012	78
29	544052	Remove tire swing tangle hazard	Det. Keith L Williams Park-173 St Playground (det. Williams)	11/13/2011	2/8/2012	87
30	542723	Forestry, 1 dead tree, by play equipment	Murray Hill Playground	11/7/2011	2/3/2012	89
31	544751	Repair trip hazard bball court	Forest Park-Sobelsohn Park	11/15/2011	2/14/2012	91
32	480281	Sunken paving stones all over playground area	A.R.R.O.W. Field House-Building	6/15/2011	9/19/2011	96
33	548353	Dangling hanging limb adjacent to sprinklers cautioned off	Forest Park (Jackson Pond Playground)-Jackson Pond Plygd	11/30/2011	3/5/2012	97

APPENDIX I

Page 2 of 2

	WO #	Description*	Location	Date Created	Date Completed	# Days Elapsed
34	520938	QBC/F please repair fence very sharp edges had to be cut open	Hallets Point Playground (area B)	8/18/2011	12/7/2011	111
35	536418	Repair ankle turns in exp joints of HBCT	Albert C Benniger Playground	10/18/2011	2/11/2012	116
36	535464	Trip hazard outside small PE areas.	The Painter's Playground	10/15/2011	2/11/2012	119
37	451005	QBC/S patch wide spaces between ss pieces under Adv. Equip.	Ps 195 Playground (hook Creek)	5/15/2011	9/18/2011	126
38	457686	Repair gaps in safety surface in plgd area	Linden Park	5/22/2011	9/29/2011	130
39	527237	Albert Mauro Trip Hazard by sprinkler Water valve	Flushing Meadows Park-Albert H. Mauro Playground	9/12/2011	1/23/2012	133
40	528315	sneakhole CLF MPPA on Madison St adj to HBCT, fall hazard	Rosemary's Playground (Jhs 93)	9/17/2011	1/28/2012	134
41	528817	Reinstall removed benches, bolts create trip hazard	Juniper Valley Park-Juniper North Playground Tennis	9/19/2011	1/31/2012	135
42	530035	Ankle turn ramp leading to PE area	Andrew J Reiff Mem Park	9/24/2011	2/11/2012	140
43	528030	Ankle turns in BBCT west hoop	Yellowstone Municipal Park-Katzman Playground	9/16/2011	2/3/2012	140
44	538717	Correct raised safety surface issues in swing area at Redfern Plgd	Redfern Houses Playground	10/25/2011	3/25/2012	152
45	480640	Raised conceret behind parkhouse by tree / trip hazard	Triborough Bridge Playground B	6/16/2011	11/21/2011	159
46	547980	QBC/S Trip Hazard fill gaps in saftey surface throughout pldg	Forest Park-Greenhouse Playground	11/29/2011	5/8/2012	161
47	494273	QBC/J ...J/Hammer out section of retaining wall under chain link fence-(hazard)	Crocheron Park-Buz O's; Rourke Playground	6/24/2011	12/3/2011	163
48	545080	QBC/S repair saftey surface uplifts at k-swing treeroot uplift	Forest Park-Greenhouse Playground	11/16/2011	5/8/2012	174
49	529628	QBC/S - fill 2" gaps throughout safety surface at Sandpiper PG	Rockaway Beach Boardwalk-Sandpiper Playground	9/22/2011	3/25/2012	185
50	533194	Repair PE bridge wood blank came loose	Rosemary's Playground (Jhs 93)	10/6/2011	4/9/2012	186
51	514787	Uncovered Manhole	Ps 42 Playground (almeda)	7/30/2011	2/12/2012	198
52	481889	Loose rail on both sides of monkey bar plat form	Glendale Playground	6/18/2011	1/12/2012	209
53	483482	Protruding CLF fencing at eye level to be removed in HBCT.	Leo Ehrenreich-Austin St. Playground	6/19/2011	1/20/2012	215
54	494462	QBC/A Please cold patch in front of water fountain ASAP	Astoria Park-Charybdis Playground	6/24/2011	3/14/2012	264
55	513125	QBC/S SEVERAL UPLIFTED CURLED EDGES OF SAFETY SURF	London Planetree Playground	7/24/2011	4/20/2012	272

Immediate Attentions that Required Over 30 Days to Resolve as of April 8, 2012

(Hazards are unaltered from DPR's records and are therefore uncorrected for grammatical and spelling errors)*

	Date Created	Site Name	Priority	Feature	Hazard*	Date Completed	# Days Elapsed
1	5/9/2011	HOWARD VON DOHLEN PLAYGROUND	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) at HBCT expansion joints	6/9/2011	31
2	9/29/2011	DELPHIN H GREENE PLGD (PS 176)	2	Trees	Branches at or near eye level	11/1/2011	33
3	8/1/2011	JOSEPH DEVOY PLAYGROUND	2	Safety Surface	Less than 1 sq ft of exposed PS in critical area	9/4/2011	34
4	8/15/2011	ROCKAWAY BEACH PLGD	2	Graffiti	Profanity	9/18/2011	34
5	12/15/2011	HARVARD PLGD	1	Trees	Large, dangling limb over	1/18/2012	34
6	5/9/2011	DELPHIN H GREENE PLGD (PS 176)	2	Benches	Sharp, protruding bolt(s)	6/14/2011	36
7	5/9/2011	DELPHIN H GREENE PLGD (PS 176)	2	Benches	Sharp, damaged or splintered slat(s)	6/14/2011	36
8	5/9/2011	DELPHIN H GREENE PLGD (PS 176)	2	Benches	Sharp, damaged or splintered slat(s)	6/14/2011	36
9	5/9/2011	CABELL PARK/CAMBRIA PLGD	2	Fences	Splintered	6/14/2011	36
10	8/15/2011	CONCH PLGD (PS 105)	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	9/21/2011	37
11	9/19/2011	MARIE CURIE PARK (JHS 158)	2	Sidewalks	Trip hazard due to	10/26/2011	37
12	4/21/2011	TRIBOROUGH BRIDGE PLAYGROUND B	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	5/29/2011	38
13	4/22/2011	BIG BUSH PARK	2	Benches	Sharp, damaged or splintered slat(s)	5/30/2011	38
14	4/21/2011	RAVENSWOOD PLGD	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	5/30/2011	39
15	4/28/2011	MARY WHALEN PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) in active area due to	6/6/2011	39
16	10/27/2011	LOCUST MANOR PLGD (PS 15)	2	Graffiti	Profanity	12/5/2011	39
17	4/21/2011	RAVENSWOOD PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	6/1/2011	41
18	12/19/2011	JUNIPER NORTH PLGD TENNIS	2	Safety Surface	Safety Surface uplifted 1.5" in accessible area	1/29/2012	41
19	4/4/2011	MAURICE A FITZGERALD PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Tree pit 4" off the grade of surrounding PS	5/16/2011	42
20	11/28/2011	157TH ST PLGD	2	Sidewalks	Trip hazard due to	1/10/2012	43
21	4/22/2011	LOU LODATI PLGD	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	6/6/2011	45
22	4/22/2011	LOU LODATI PLGD	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	6/6/2011	45
23	8/1/2011	JOSEPH DEVOY PLAYGROUND	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	9/15/2011	45
24	5/31/2011	MARCONI PARK	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	7/16/2011	46
25	5/31/2011	MARCONI PARK	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	7/17/2011	47
26	5/31/2011	MARCONI PARK	2	Safety Surface	2" Separations	7/17/2011	47
27	5/31/2011	MARCONI PARK	2	Safety Surface	Safety Surface uplifted 1.5" in accessible area	7/17/2011	47
28	5/31/2011	MARCONI PARK	2	Safety Surface	Less than 1 sq ft of exposed PS in critical area	7/17/2011	47
29	4/22/2011	LOU LODATI PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	6/9/2011	48
30	5/31/2011	NORTH ROCHDALE PLGD (PS 30)	2	Trees	Trip hazard created by tree stump	7/18/2011	48
31	10/13/2011	FARM PLGD	2	Trees	Large dead limbs above active area	11/30/2011	48

APPENDIX II

Page 2 of 2

	Date Created	Site Name	Priority	Feature	Hazard*	Date Completed	# Days Elapsed
32	4/12/2011	EVERGREEN PK (PS 68)	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	5/31/2011	49
33	4/21/2011	SPIRIT PLAYGROUND (PS 76)	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) at HBCT expansion joints	6/9/2011	49
34	10/17/2011	NORELLI-HARGREAVES PLGD	2	Trees	Large dead limbs above active area	12/5/2011	49
35	10/13/2011	HAGGERTY PARK	2	Benches	Sharp, exposed reinforcement bar(s)	12/5/2011	53
36	5/26/2011	JURASSIC PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	7/19/2011	54
37	5/26/2011	P.O. NICHOLAS DEMUTIS PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) at HBCT expansion joints	7/19/2011	54
38	4/5/2011	TRIBOROUGH BRIDGE PLAYGROUND A	2	Litter	Condom(s)	5/30/2011	55
39	4/22/2011	LOU LODATI PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) in active area due to	6/20/2011	59
40	10/17/2011	NORELLI-HARGREAVES PLGD	2	Benches	Sharp, damaged or splintered slat(s)	12/15/2011	59
41	10/17/2011	NORELLI-HARGREAVES PLGD	2	Benches	Sharp, damaged or splintered slat(s)	12/15/2011	59
42	4/4/2011	LONDON PLANETREE PLGD	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) at HBCT expansion joints	6/3/2011	60
43	4/5/2011	DUTCH KILLS PLGD (PS 112)	2	Graffiti	Profanity	6/6/2011	62
44	4/5/2011	DUTCH KILLS PLGD (PS 112)	2	Graffiti	Profanity	6/6/2011	62
45	10/11/2011	HALLETS POINT PLAYGROUND (AREA B)	2	Paved Surfaces	Trip hazard due to	12/13/2011	63
46	5/12/2011	WILD FLOWER MEADOW	2	Paved Surfaces	Tree pit 4" off the grade of surrounding PS	7/16/2011	65
47	4/28/2011	SUNRISE PLGD (PS 195)	2	Paved Surfaces	Ankle turn hazard(s) in active area due to	7/5/2011	68
48	5/9/2011	HOWARD VON DOHLEN PLAYGROUND	2	Trees	Large, dangling limb over	7/17/2011	69
49	9/22/2011	PLAYGROUND ONE FORTY	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	12/3/2011	72
50	9/22/2011	PLAYGROUND ONE FORTY	2	Trees	Dangling limb over	12/4/2011	73
51	8/1/2011	RAINEY PARK PLAYGROUND	1	Safety Surface	> 1 sq ft of exposed PS in critical area of SS	10/14/2011	74
52	8/1/2011	RAINEY PARK PLAYGROUND	2	Safety Surface	Less than 1 sq ft of exposed PS in critical area	10/14/2011	74
53	8/1/2011	RAINEY PARK PLAYGROUND	2	Safety Surface	Holes or missing sections in non-critical areas of	10/14/2011	74
54	4/25/2011	MARTINS FIELD PLGD	2	Trees	Trip hazard created by tree stump	7/15/2011	81
55	9/9/2011	SEVEN GABLES PLAYGROUND (IS 74)	2	Trees	Large dead limbs above active area	12/1/2011	83
56	8/26/2011	KENNEDY PLAYGROUND	2	Trees	Large dead limbs above active area	12/1/2011	97
57	8/18/2011	PS 135 PLGD	2	Trees	Large dead limbs above active area	1/17/2012	152
58	2/27/2012	REIFF PLGD	2	Athletic Field	Trip Hazard	Unresolved**	

Note: (**) This IA was resolved on July 12, 2012.

Inconsistent Categorization of Possible Immediate Attentions

(Descriptions are unaltered from DPR's records and are therefore uncorrected for grammatical and spelling errors)*

	Work Order	Description*	Location	Date Created	# Days Elapsed as of 5/29/12	Current Status as of 10/26/12
1	589003	PE cargo nets 2 units / top links worn	Newtown Playground	3/31/2012	59	Completed
2	588070	Forestry- remove (1) lg dangling limb in P/g adj. tp GCP sidewalk	Ps 196 Playground (grand Central)	3/28/2012	62	Completed
3	585703	Repair exposed metal around tree pit conected to ss marked w/caution tape	Walter Ward Playground	3/23/2012	67	Completed
4	582746	2 inch trip hazard from curb of SW near tree pit adj to park entry on 72 ave	Ps 196 Playground (grand Central)	3/18/2012	72	Cancelled
5	582925	M.W. PEPLACE THREE " K" SWINGS, SHARP EDGES.	Nathan Weidenbaum Park	3/18/2012	72	Completed
6	582917	M.W. REPLACE TWO "J" SWINGS, SHARP EDGES.	Brig Gen Jos T Hart Memorial	3/18/2012	72	Completed
7	582750	M/W trip hazard 2 inches base of tree pit inside MPPA south of entry	Ps 196 Playground (grand Central)	3/18/2012	72	Completed**
8	581789	check worn yokes on all J swings	Daniel A Haggerty Park	3/15/2012	75	Completed
9	579509	QBC/K -ankle turns 2 inch wide on infield of MPPA	Jhs 93 Playground (ridgewood)-BASEBALL	3/8/2012	82	Completed
10	577550	repair 3 Foot x 6 inch hole at bottom of CL fence at BF#3	Jerry M Tenney Park	3/4/2012	86	Completed
11	575783	fill trip hazard by entrance to BBC	Park (ditmars)	2/28/2012	91	Completed
12	575898	ioose cindablock on floor next to flagpole. TRIP HAZZARD*****	Playground	2/28/2012	91	Completed
13	573971	SMW_ sharp edge on J swing bracket	Kissena Corridor Park-Silent Springs Playground	2/23/2012	96	Completed
14	573970	SMW_2" raised curb @ SW @ Geranium Ave	Kissena Corridor Park-Silent Springs Playground	2/23/2012	96	Completed
15	573241	QBC/S - fill all gaps in sectional ss under PE esp near slide appr 2 in *	Flushing Fields-Leonardo Ingravallo Playground	2/21/2012	98	Completed
16	572701	ankle turns in MPPA 2 inches wide in 3 distinct areas, see comments	Joseph F Mafera Park	2/20/2012	99	Completed**
17	571846	QBC/S-uplifted SS small PE area next to ladder 1.5 inches high	Glendale Playground	2/18/2012	101	Completed
18	566779	FORESTRY_3 trees have hangers_marked with caution tape	Kiddy Playground	2/5/2012	114	Completed
19	566722	cut and remove 4 very large DEAD LIMBS , TREE IN 'j' SWING AREA.	George F Torsney Playground	2/5/2012	114	Completed
20	566766	SMW_trip haz at entrance to K swings	Kiddy Playground	2/5/2012	114	Completed
21	563985	Need manhole cover to replace stole one (SHOPS)	George F Torsney Playground	1/27/2012	123	Cancelled
22	563825	QBC/S Please fill multiple safety surface gaps throughtout playground	Astoria Park-Charybdis Playground	1/26/2012	124	Completed
23	563626	safety surface (trip hazard) (sector MM)	Ps 171 Playground (van Alst)	1/26/2012	124	Completed
24	560650	SMW- reset manhole cover to level opp sprinkler	Kissena Corridor Park-Silent Springs Playground	1/16/2012	134	Completed
25	559993	Please reset uplifted safety mats by J swing area	Ps 171 Playground (van Alst)	1/12/2012	138	Completed
26	559723	QBC/A-trip hazard on inner path north/ MPPA, west of parkhous due to tree root	Ps 68 Playground & Evergreen Park	1/11/2012	139	Completed
27	558145	QBC/S approximately 20 SS plugs throughout Hammel Plgd.	Hammel Houses Playground	1/5/2012	145	Completed
28	554958	SMW_sidewalk trip H opp 20-20 123 St	Poppenhusen Playground	12/25/2011	156	Completed
29	554956	SMW_sidewalk trip H opp 20-03 124 St	Poppenhusen Playground	12/25/2011	156	Completed
30	554955	SMW_sidewalk trip H_opp 20-17 124 St @ plgd entrance	Poppenhusen Playground	12/25/2011	156	Completed
31	554954	SMW_sidewalk trip H_opp 21-01 124 St	Poppenhusen Playground	12/25/2011	156	Completed

	Work Order	Description*	Location	Date Created	# Days Elapsed as of 5/29/12	Current Status as of 10/26/12
32	552940	(I)SS- PLS REPAIR SEVERAL LARGE CRACKS IN P/S IN MPPA.	London Planetree Playground	12/16/2011	165	Cancelled
33	552129	QBC/A -ankle turns in middle of MPPA	Juniper Valley Park-Juniper North Playground Tennis	12/13/2011	168	Completed**
34	551893	(I)SS- Repair large gaps in Safety surfacing & resecure approx 6 mats-mba	Ps 213 Playground (alley)	12/12/2011	169	Completed
35	550918	*Mason-patch 61st Ave perimeter wall where rebar is exposedl	Ps 187 Playground (251 St)	12/8/2011	173	Completed**
36	547986	QBC/S Trip Hazard repair gaps in safety surface throughout pldg	Forest Park-Mary Whalen Playground	11/29/2011	182	Completed**
37	547609	SMW - fill two 3 foot gaps in safety surface J swings	George U Harvey Playground	11/28/2011	183	Completed
38	547092	SMW_trip haz by DF at patch_raised water valve	Kissena Park-Four Winds Playground	11/25/2011	186	Completed
39	543149	QBC/S multiple safety surface gaps throughout play equipment area	Ravenswood Houses Playground	11/9/2011	202	Completed
40	541628	SMW_sidewalk trip haz mid-block on 21 Rd	Ps 184 Playground (flushing Manor)	11/3/2011	208	Completed
41	541600	SMW_cold patch_entrance to hbc_trip hazard	Ps 184 Playground (flushing Manor)	11/3/2011	208	Completed
42	541466	QBC/H - Fill gaps in expansion joints in H/B/C(World's Fair P/G)	Jhs 190 Playground (russell Sage)	11/2/2011	209	Completed
43	541462	QBC/H Fill gaps in expansion joints in H/B/C(World's Fair P/G)	Flushing Meadow Park-World's Fair Playground	11/2/2011	209	Completed
44	541383	QBC/S resecure 4 loose sections of ss & fill in large gaps(play eq near entrance	Ps 213 Playground (alley)	11/2/2011	209	Completed**
45	540204	QBC/S - Replace damaged ss - worn down to holes	Ps 20 Playground (bowne)	10/29/2011	213	Completed
46	537807	REPLACE 2 "J" swings, sharp edges.	Lt. Corporal Noonan Playground	10/23/2011	219	Completed
47	537744	REPLACE SIX "J" SWINGS, SHARP EDGES.	Windmuller Park	10/23/2011	219	Completed
48	537658	REPLACE SIX "J" SWINGS, SHARP METAL EDGES.	Brig Gen Jos T Hart Memorial	10/22/2011	220	Completed
49	535699	slide sharp edge on left side on bottome of single slide	Playground (broadway)	10/16/2011	226	Completed**
50	535696	slide edge is sharp smooth it as needed	Ps 17 Playground (thoreau)	10/16/2011	226	Completed
51	534880	sprial slide - caulk gaps underneath at slide joints sharp metal 1" gap	Forest Park-Greenhouse Playground	10/12/2011	230	Completed**
52	532983	SMW_cover exposed metal on worn steps	Ps 193 Playground (whitstone)	10/5/2011	237	Completed
53	532826	QBC/J Section of Safety surface uplifted by tree roots (see comments)	Judge Moses Weinstein Playground	10/5/2011	237	Completed
54	532940	QBC/H-Replace missing 15 ft long expansion joint caulking in handball court	Jhs 67 Playground (louis Pasteur-BUILDING	10/5/2011	237	Completed
55	532753	Repair Trip Hazard fence by sprinklers	Forest Park-Greenhouse Playground	10/4/2011	238	Completed**
56	532747	Repair-Replace Safety Surface lower pldg east end 1 1/2" gap 3'	Forest Park (Jackson Pond Playground	10/4/2011	238	Completed**
57	532209	BS weld/ replace worn top links to yellow cargo net	James A Bland Houses Playground	10/2/2011	240	Completed
58	531097	QBC/S Photo added /repair burned section of ss in pl equip area	Lefferts Playground	9/28/2011	244	Completed
59	530770	Mason - repair eroded concrete playing surface (floor) at handball cts	Ps 184 Playground (flushing Manor)	9/27/2011	245	Completed
60	529113	Please secure suspension bridge planks	Playground (35 Ave)	9/20/2011	252	Completed
61	529105	Please cover sharp edge of play equipment steps	Steinway Community Playground	9/20/2011	252	Completed
62	527843	safety surface, 3" gaps , trip hazard	Kissena Corridor Park-Captain Mario Fajardo Park	9/15/2011	257	Completed
63	525868	Hurricane Irene repair damaged plgd equipment	Hempstead Playground	9/7/2011	265	Cancelled

APPENDIX III

Page 3 of 3

	Work Order	Description*	Location	Date Created	# Days Elapsed as of 5/29/12	Current Status as of 10/26/12
64	519265	Please tighten loose bolts on hanging bridge planks	Jhs 10 Astoria Hgts Rec Park	8/13/2011	290	Completed
65	519240	QBC A middle entrance to HBC on left trip hazard 1/4 bag cold patch	Frederick B Judge Mem Playground-HANDBALL	8/13/2011	290	Completed**
66	518992	Safety Surface Collapsing at K-Slide by Play Equipment	St Albans Memorial Park	8/12/2011	291	Completed
67	514329	Please remove dead branches overhanging by benches	Playground (broadway)	7/28/2011	306	Completed
68	510836	QBC/S need 4 big pieces of black S.S.worn out	Harold Schneiderman Playground	7/16/2011	318	Completed
69	508416	*Mason-patch a 3 ft by 3 ft section of the cement wall that broke off	Ps 130 Playground (francis Lewis)	7/9/2011	325	Completed
70	506135	QBC/S replace missing plugs to sectional ss - all station appr 3 doz plugs	Francis Lewis Park-Francis Lewis Playground	6/30/2011	334	Completed
71	494457	DISTRICT FORCES dirt needed for tree pits ASAP	Hoyt Playground	6/24/2011	340	Cancelled
72	484484	QBC/S reset edge of safety surface closest to flagpole trip hazard	Electric Playground	6/19/2011	345	Completed
73	478480	2" inch gap on handball court by the right wall by fence	Richmond Park	6/12/2011	352	Completed
74	454472	MASON repair deteriorating HBCT wall between crevice.	The Painter's Playground	5/20/2011	375	Completed**
75	433018	QBC/A - repave 4' x 4' erroded area of sidewalk at plgd entrance *	Ps 184 Playground (flushing Manor)	4/28/2011	397	Completed**
76	432933	SMW- replace rusted hardware to all PE *	Ps 184 Playground (flushing Manor)	4/28/2011	397	Cancelled
77	432816	QBS/S patch wide gaps in between ss pieces	Jhs 158 Playground (marie Curie)	4/28/2011	397	Completed**
78	432799	QBC/S patch wide gaps between ss pieces under the J swings + adventure equipment	Ps 205 Playground (bell) Telephone Playground	4/28/2011	397	Completed**
79	431007	SECTOR M/W Cold Patch trip hazard by 21 street entrance	Triborough Bridge Playground B	4/25/2011	400	Cancelled
80	417591	Shops.... - investigate sinking pavement issue at hball portal & nr bball unit	James A Bland Houses Playground	4/13/2011	412	Completed

Note: (**) Represents work orders completed prior to May 29, 2012.



Liam Kavanagh
First Deputy Commissioner

T 212.360.1307
F 212.360.1347

E liam.kavanagh@parks.nyc.gov

ADDENDUM
Page 1 of 4

City of New York
Parks & Recreation

The Arsenal
Central Park
New York, NY 10065
www.nyc.gov/parks

January 29, 2013

Ms. Tina Kim
Deputy Comptroller for Audit
The City of New York
Office of the Comptroller
1 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007

Re: Audit Report on the Maintenance and Repairs of the City's Playgrounds by the Department of Parks and Recreation: the Bronx (7R13-068A); Brooklyn (7R13-066A); Manhattan (7R13-120A); Queens (7R12-142A); Staten Island (7R13-167A).

Dear Deputy Comptroller Kim:

Thank you for the opportunity to review and respond to the above referenced Draft Audit Reports. The New York City Department of Parks & Recreation ("Parks") is pleased that the reports found that the Parks Maintenance & Operations Division ("M&O") resolved a vast number of complicated and diverse work orders generated. At the time the preliminary draft reports were issued for all boroughs, 87.9% of work orders issued for playgrounds were completed. As of January 24, 2013, that number has risen to 97.2%. The reports also raised some important issues regarding the maintenance and repair of the City's playgrounds, which we appreciate. However, we disagree with several findings in the reports regarding how Parks manages its maintenance program and its work orders.

Parks M&O organizes its work orders carefully and takes the necessary steps to ensure that they are resolved. All work orders are prioritized by considering factors such as the nature of the condition, the severity of the work order, the availability of material resources and skilled labor, and the weather conditions. This gives us the flexibility to address critical safety and functional issues as they emerge, while balancing seasonal maintenance requirements and valid requests that are of a lower priority. However, the reports still cited that Parks failed to properly complete some work orders within a timeframe that was arbitrarily created by the auditors. Parks does not understand why the report continues to reference a 30 day timeframe as a benchmark when we have clearly explained that the timeframe only applies to our Immediate Attention ("IAs") identified by our Parks Inspection Program ("PIP") Inspectors. We share the reports' sentiment that all work orders should be corrected as soon as possible and prioritized by importance, and believe that we have managed this important and complicated workload in a time-sensitive manner, particularly considering the magnitude of work orders generated **(22,194)** for the audit period and completed **(21,569)** as of January 24, 2013.

The reports do not acknowledge the complexity of the workload nor the decision-making processes and procedures taken to ensure that the most important or critical work orders are prioritized and completed in a timely fashion. Indeed, the wide variety of work orders may include the following: plumbing, sidewalk repair, safety surface, play equipment, forestry, fencing, paved surfaces, mason work, etc. Therefore, we disagree with the way in which the information is presented. We agree that a formal review process for all open work orders would ensure that all requests are managed appropriately. However, we strongly

disagree with the finding that Parks did not resolve work orders in a timely manner. At the time the preliminary draft reports were issued for all boroughs, 88% of work orders were completed (18,600), and 87% of those completed work orders were closed out within 90-Days (16,099).

The reports also cited some work orders that are described by the auditors as hazardous conditions. Therefore, the reports contend that Parks should have treated these work orders as IAs, and resolved them within 30 days. As discussed with the audit staff, IAs are issued by OMP inspectors through PIP inspections, are tracked closely through the Daily Immediate Attention system and are expected to be closed within 30 days. We understand that many of the work orders may sound similar to IAs as written up by M&O staff, but the Borough Supervisor of Trades and/or the Deputy Chief of Operations make the determination of the severity of the work order, the hazardous nature of the condition, and the scheduling of repair work. They are familiar with both the Agency's safety and performance standards and prioritize work requests that rise to the level of an IA. However, Parks continues to issue work orders for conditions that need repair, fixes them as soon as possible, and closes them out in the Parks' Asset Management Parks System ("AMPS"). In addition, mobile handheld devices will be further integrated into our regular inspection process to allow M&O staff to issue work orders in the field and facilitate tracking of conditions reported.

Indeed, in FY12, 92 percent of playground safety surfaces and 92 percent of playground equipment were acceptable upon inspection. This underscores the fact that our well-planned procedures for timely addressing these issues are working.

We thank the Office of the Comptroller for your audit. In addition, upon careful review of Parks operations and the recommendation in the report, we believe that current and action underway already address the issues raised. Our responses to the report recommendations are attached.

Sincerely,



Liam Kavanagh
First Deputy Commissioner

cc: Veronica M. White, Commissioner
Robert Garafola, Deputy Commissioner for Management and Budget
David Stark, Assistant Commissioner for Budget
Frank D'Ercola, Deputy Chief Fiscal Officer
David Cerron, Chief Accountant
Jun Lee, Director, Operations and Management Planning
Vincent Liguori, Director, Financial Audit

Response to Recommendations for the Bronx (7R13-068A); Brooklyn (7R13-066A); Manhattan (7R13-120A); Queens (7R12-142A); Staten Island (7R13-167A).

Response to Section Recommendation 1: Implement standards to ensure that supervisory inspections adhere to PIP standards for remediating IA conditions.

IAs are only issued by specially trained and skilled Parks Inspectors. Parks will continue to treat conditions discovered by M&O field staff supervision with the same gravity as those found by PIP Inspectors. The Borough Supervisor of Trades and/or the Deputy Chief of Operations make the determination of the severity of the work order, the hazardous nature of the condition, and the scheduling of repair work. In addition, a new mobile handheld inspection module is being implemented in AMPS to enhance inspections for M&O. This will allow Parks supervisors to conduct field inspections on their mobile hand held devices, which will enhance the management of IA conditions. Supervisors will also continue to identify conditions using the same language and standards as per the PIP program.

Response to Section Recommendation 2: Remediate all work orders with hazardous conditions within 30 days.

Parks has a system in place to manage and monitor IAs, which ensures that all IAs are properly resolved within a specified timeframe. Please see the response to Recommendation 3, below, for further details. However, Parks continuously close out any work orders within a reasonable time frame. If a work order is considered hazardous, Parks will ensure the work is done as soon as possible, and minimally, the area will be made safe for the general public.

Response to Section Recommendation 3: Ensure that IAs are resolved within 30 days.

Parks policy is to resolve all IAs within 30 days and will continue to monitor and follow-up on all conditions that are hazardous. In order to ensure IAs are resolved promptly, we currently have the Daily Immediate Attention ("DIA") System that manages and monitors the number of IAs as well as the resolution of these hazards. In order to ensure proper resolution of an IA, only authorized staff members can resolve an IA with the required upload of pictures as documentation of corrected hazards. For quality assurance, we also have in place a follow-up review process that takes a sample of IAs resolved to *further* ensure these hazards are properly corrected. In addition, IAs identified are emailed to operations managers the same day to alert them of any items identified. Lastly, there are bi-weekly reports and analyses on IAs that are reported to the Borough Chief of Operations.

Response to Section Recommendation 4: Categorize work order repair types and assign specific timeframes for remediating repairs in each category.

Parks does categorize work orders, but it is based on the Borough Supervisor of Trades and/or the Deputy Chief of Operations to prioritize work orders and schedule the repair work. Furthermore, work order timeframes may also be dependent on capital work being scheduled and may result in extended periods for completion.

Response to Section Recommendation 5: Categorize conditions identified by District Supervisors using the same criteria used by the PIP inspectors.

A new mobile handheld inspection module is being implemented in AMPS to enhance inspections for M&O. This will allow Parks supervisors to conduct field inspections on their mobile hand held devices. Further, they will use standards to conduct these inspections from the **PIP** manual. Supervisors will also continue to identify conditions using the same language and standards as per the PIP program.

Response to Section Recommendation 6: Monitor open work orders that are identified as hazardous and resolve them promptly.

All Supervisors have the ability to view work orders identified as being a hazardous condition and can ascertain the age of any work order generated. Parks will continue to resolve these issues as promptly as situations allow.

Response to Section Recommendation 7: Regularly monitor the status of open work orders and update them in AMPS.

As the auditors are aware, in a number of instances work order conditions were corrected but their status in AMPS was not updated. As a result, District Supervision will be advised to assess the state of open work on a monthly basis, and make any required updates. Furthermore, the Borough Supervisor of Trades and/or the Deputy Chief of Operations prioritize repair work orders, depending on the nature of the work order, the hazardous nature of the condition, and the scheduling of repair work.

Response to Section Recommendation 8: Follow up on work requests to ensure they have been processed.

District Supervision will be advised to assess the state of work that needs to be done on a monthly basis, and follow up with the appropriate parties in order to complete the work orders.

Response to Section Recommendation 9: Install an edit check program in AMPS to ensure that proper dates are entered.

There is no need for an edit check to ensure proper dates are entered. When a work order is created a date is entered by the system. There are times that work was completed, prior to a work order created in the AMPS system, but these work orders were closed out later. In addition, these transactions make up a very small percentage of the overall number of work orders created in the system.

Response to Section Recommendation 10: Create work orders in AMPS before the repairs are completed.

With improvements to the AMPS handheld devices currently being implemented, trades workers will have the ability to create work orders in the field as necessary. Emergency situations will occasionally arise in the field, and emergency work will continue to be done in a timely nature regardless of the creation of a formal work request/order if the severity of the work dictates.